Please consider the environment before printing



Terence Eden's Blog









Regular Expressions make me feel like a powerful wizard - and that's not a good thing

By @edent on 2023-02-06 · #Computer Science #programming #regex · 14 comments · 600 words · Read ~278 times.



(This is a rant because I'm exhausted after debugging something. If you've made RegEx your whole personality, I'm sorry.)

The other day I had to fix a multi-line Regular Expression (RegEx). After a few hours of peering at it with a variety of tools, I finally understood the problem. Getting that deep into the esoteric mysteries made me feel like a powerful wizard with complete mastery of my domain. And I think that's dangerous.

I'm sure we've all read a story about a witch or wizard who distractedly substitutes eye-of-newt with iron-ute with disastrous consequences. Humans are easily confused. And confusion leads to unexpected mistakes.

Look, most humans are very bad at reading compiled code. Without any external tools - can you tell me what the following code does?

No. Of course not¹. That's why we write code in a more human readable language and then compile it to computer readable instructions.

Regular Expressions are a sort-of halfway house. They're *slightly* readable by humans - but written in such a terse vocabulary as to be mostly unintelligible without concentration. There's no space for comments. Different engines have variable support for all their functions. They are a symbolic language with unhelpfully indecipherable and inconsistent symbols.

As a result, once the RegEx becomes more than trivially complex they're hard for most humans to understand. That makes them difficult to debug. It also makes it difficult to add or remove functionality.

I genuinely - and possibly misguidedly - believe that even something like $\w+([-+.']\w+)*@\w+([-.]\w+)*$ might just as well be written in BrainFuck.

My contention is that *almost all* RegExs would be better served by more human readable code and that the very existence of RegEx101.com ought to bring shame on our industry.

Here are some positive use-cases for RegEx:

- You want to show off how smart you are.
- ⇒ You need maximum efficiency when combing through a billion lines of text.
- → You have a desire to build something hard to debug.
- ⇒ You don't have lots of printer paper and need to make your code as terse as possible.
- ⇒ You think if/else and switch/case statements are the mark of a diseased mind.
- You don't trust compilers.

I know what you're thinking: "This guy's too stupid to get regular expressions!" Yes. Yes I am. So are most people.

What I'm getting at is that source code is designed to be read and edited by busy and distracted humans. We should be writing intelligible code for each other and letting computers do the boring work of making it more efficient.

You don't have to agree with me. That's fine. But, perhaps you'll take note of the famous maxim from the "Wizard" book:



a computer language is not just a way of getting a computer to perform operations but rather that it is a novel formal medium for expressing ideas about methodology. Thus, programs must be written for people to read, and only incidentally for machines to execute.

Structure and Interpretation of Computer Programs

We are not wizards. Nor should we strive to be. The alchemists fell.



01. You can read the original code which is MIT Licenced. ←



14 thoughts on "Regular Expressions make me feel like a powerful wizard - and that's not a good thing"

mate of taboo to ays:

2023-02-06 12:39

@Edent regex are a total pain for adhd brains

Reply



y Steven Pears says:

2023-02-06 12:53

I wrote Perl for a year at uni before I found ASP

Pro: I'm the guy who is asked to write a regex in 2 minutes that saves someone an hour of writing code just to search GBs of logs.

Con: I'm the guy who is asked to translate regexes when they're found without a comment attached.

<u>Reply</u>

▽ barubary@infosec.exchange says:

<u>2023-02-06 12:55</u>

<u>@Edent</u>There's no space for comments.... unless you're using Perl, in which case you can use spaces, indentation, comments, etc in your regexes as you like.<u>#perl</u>

Reply

Emily S says:

<u>2023-02-06 13:05</u>

<u>@Edent</u> I'm pretty sure this one of those lessons that one must learn on the road to becoming a senior engineer.

Reply





Not that I disagree with you, but I find that:

https://regex101.com/

helps - not least because it gives you a human-readable version of your regex in an adjacent pane.

<u>Reply</u>

Evgeny Kuznetsov says:

2023-02-06 13:54

Wow! Had I known about that <u>RegEx101</u> thing, my life would have been much simpler. Then again, in that case I would probably not think Regular Expressions were *write-only code*, which they of course are.

<u>Reply</u>

James O'Malley says:

2023-02-06 14:06

Couldn't agree more with this. And it's for this reason, rather than my being an idiot whose brain can't learn them, why my code always contain dozens of str_replace()s and explode()s.

<u>Reply</u>

y Neil Young says:

<u>2023-02-06 14:28</u>

Agree with this. There's a use case for "immediate" regular expressions as sort of keyboard shortcuts, but if they're going to be read by anyone else, they're obtuse.

<u>Reply</u>

泽 AP says:

<u>2023-02-06 14:42</u>

Perl introduced the possibility (through the /x and /xx modifiers) to ignore spaces, tabs, linefeeds and even comments in the regular expression body. It allows to "unconvolute" what would have been an unreadable mess into something understandable and maintainable. Every programming language should allow this in its regular expressions.

Reply

Sam J Sharpe says:

<u>2023-02-06 15:07</u>

<u>@Edent</u> is it bad that I can read that regex and I think it's attempting to validate an email address?

Richard Morton says:

2023-02-06 16:06

Thinking off the top of my head, is there a way to have a plain language style code that then gets compiled to a regex, and then include the plain language in the code comments or documentation?

Reply

Alan says:

2023-02-06 17:10

Wholeheartedly agree! I shudder every time I come across a RegEx that *might* be the problem, even worse if it has no unit tests,

<u>Reply</u>



2023-02-06 19:02

"if/else and switch/case statements are the mark of a diseased mind."

Indeed!

While loops and gotos+labels are completely sufficient.

<u>Reply</u>

m chessmango says:

2023-02-07 14:55

<u>@Edent</u> I agree that a dedicated, less-clunky solution should be used where possible, but the sheer ubiquity of RegEx is what makes it invaluable as far as I'm concerned. Means I can toss a string into vscode to check for specifics, or use the same in some 'find' type box in a browser even (in some cases). It's awful to write and read, but it's there <u>u</u>

<u>Reply</u>

Leave a Reply

Your email address will not be published. Required fields are marked *

Comment *

Name *
Email *
Website
□ Notify me of follow-up comments by email.
□ Notify me of new posts by email.
Post Comment
To respond on your own website, enter the URL of your response which should contain a link to this post's permalink URL. Your response will then appear (possibly after moderation) on this page. Want to update or remove your response? Update or delete your post and re-enter your post's URL again. (Learn More)
URL/Permalink of your article
Ping me!

Found this post useful? Click the icons to support this blog











More ways to support my blog

Get new posts by email

Enter your email address to subscribe to this blog and receive brand new posts by email. (Or subscribe to this Atom Feed.)

Email Address

Free Sign Up

Join 427 other subscribers.

Search Blog Posts

Search

Explore The Archives

2023				2022	
<u>January</u> <u>31 posts</u>	February 9 posts	March	January 30 posts	February 23 posts	March 15 posts
April	May	June	<u>April</u> 19 posts	May 19 posts	<u>June</u> 19 posts
July	August	September	<u>July</u> 19 posts	August 18 posts	September 12 posts
October	November	December	October 8 posts	November 30 posts	December 31 posts

	2021			2020	
January	February	March	<u>January</u>	February	March
31 posts	28 posts	31 posts	<u>31 posts</u>	29 posts	31 posts
April	May	June	April	May	June
30 posts	31 posts	30 posts	30 posts	31 posts	30 posts
<u>July</u>	August	September	<u>July</u>	August	September
<u>31 posts</u>	31 posts	30 posts	<u>31 posts</u>	31 posts	30 posts
October	November	<u>December</u>	October	November	<u>December</u>
31 posts	30 posts	31 posts	31 posts	30 posts	31 posts

2019			2018		
January	February	March	<u>January</u>	February	March
31 posts	12 posts	17 posts	<u>8 posts</u>	4 posts	6 posts
<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>	<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>
12 posts	12 posts	10 posts	14 posts	<u>5 posts</u>	<u>6 posts</u>
<u>July</u>	August	September	<u>July</u>	August	September
7 posts	5 posts	6 posts	<u>6 posts</u>	13 posts	14 posts
October	November	<u>December</u>	October	November	<u>December</u> <u>4 posts</u>
14 posts	30 posts	<u>17 posts</u>	8 posts	30 posts	

2017				2016	
January	February	March	January	February	March
12 posts	9 posts	8 posts	10 posts	10 posts	11 posts
<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>	<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>
4 posts	10 posts	<u>5 posts</u>	9 posts	<u>8 posts</u>	9 posts
<u>July</u>	August	September	<u>July</u>	August	September 4 posts
<u>5 posts</u>	6 posts	3 posts	<u>6 posts</u>	9 posts	
October	November	December	October	November	<u>December</u>
4 posts	30 posts		2 posts	30 posts	<u>14 posts</u>

2015			2014		
<u>January</u>	February	March	January	February	March
<u>8 posts</u>	11 posts	10 posts	13 posts	13 posts	14 posts
April	May	<u>June</u>	April	May	<u>June</u>
4 posts	9 posts	<u>3 posts</u>	14 posts	8 posts	7 posts
<u>July</u>	August	September	July	August	September
7 posts	9 posts	10 posts	9 posts	5 posts	5 posts
October	November	<u>December</u>	October	November	December
2 posts	30 posts	<u>4 posts</u>	1 post	30 posts	20 posts

2013			2012		
<u>January</u>	<u>February</u>	March	<u>January</u>	February	March
<u>25 posts</u>	<u>17 posts</u>	15 posts	14 posts	8 posts	13 posts
<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>	<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>
18 posts	11 posts	14 posts	15 posts	10 posts	16 posts
<u>July</u>	August	September	<u>July</u>	August	September
<u>6 posts</u>	14 posts	6 posts	<u>8 posts</u>	8 posts	6 posts
October	November	<u>December</u>	October	November	<u>December</u>
4 posts	30 posts	<u>14 posts</u>	6 posts	30 posts	31 posts

2011				2010	
January	<u>February</u>	March	<u>January</u>	<u>February</u>	March
13 posts	<u>11 posts</u>	11 posts	<u>6 posts</u>	15 posts	12 posts
<u>April</u>	May	<u>June</u>	<u>April</u>	May	<u>June</u>
12 posts	8 posts	<u>8 posts</u>	13 posts	4 posts	<u>3 posts</u>
<u>July</u>	August	September	<u>July</u>	August	September
<u>6 posts</u>	5 posts	11 posts	15 posts	8 posts	11 posts
October	November	<u>December</u>	October	November	<u>December</u>
7 posts	30 posts	<u>17 posts</u>	9 posts	30 posts	<u>9 posts</u>

	2009			2008		
January	<u>February</u>	March	January	February	March	
1 post	<u>5 posts</u>	3 posts	2 posts		2 posts	
April	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>	<u>April</u>	May	June	
7 posts	12 posts	<u>8 posts</u>	3 posts	2 posts		
July	August	September	<u>July</u>	August	September	
10 posts	10 posts	12 posts	1 post	3 posts	1 post	
October	November	<u>December</u>	October	November 2 posts	December	
22 posts	31 posts	<u>15 posts</u>	3 posts		1 post	

2007				2006	
January	February	March	January	February	March
April	May	June	<u>April</u> 1 post	May	June
July	August	September	July	August	September
October	November 4 posts	December 5 posts	October	November 1 post	December

	2005			2004		
January	February	March 1 post	January	February	March	
April	May	June	April	<u>May</u> 5 posts	June 3 posts	
July	August	September 1 post	<u>July</u> 1 post	August	September	
October	November	December	October	November	December	

	2003			2002		
January	February	March 2 posts	January	February 1 post	March	
April	May	June	April 3 posts	May	June	
July	August	September	July	August	September	
October	November	December	October	November	December	

2001			2000		
January	February	March	January	February	March 1 post
April	May	June	April	May	June
<u>July</u> 1 post	August	September	July	August	September
October 1 post	November	December	October	November 1 post	December

1999			1997		
January	February	March	<u>January</u> <u>1 post</u>	February	March
April	May	June	April	May	June
July	August	September 1 post	July	August	September
October	November	December 1 post	October	November	December

1995			1987		
January	February	March 1 post	January	February	March
April	May	June	April	May	June
July	August	September	July	August	September
October	November	December	October	November	December 1 post

© Terence Eden Contact Me Subscribe Citations Support My Blog

Bespoke Computing Consultancy About Me

ISSN 2753-1570

