

Quarterback Analysis and Why Tom Brady is one of the Most Overrated Players of All-Time

Jarrett Markman



Intro

I have grown up my whole life with football fans telling me that Tom Brady is the greatest of all time. As an avid viewer of the NFL, I grew to hate Tom Brady because he kept on getting credit for team accomplishments. He was a part of the Patriots dynasty and he profited off one of the greatest coaches and some of the greatest teams of all time. He consistently underperformed in big playoff games, yet his team made up for his poor performances yet he gets praised as this amazing player who carries his team to victory. Throughout his career, he's had top 10 defenses that helped his teams strive for success and help get him his 7 rings. To me, football is the epitome of a team sport, especially due in part to the fact that you have something like 40 players playing in a game on your team making an impact, and the slightest misstep on their part could make or break the game. Not to mention the countless coaches that can influence certain players and other members of the organization. Tom Brady is someone who has profited on extremely successful coaches, special team players, defenses, and overall organizational management. The differences between Tom Brady and other QBs like Aaron Rodgers and Peyton Manning haven't had the benefits of playing with an extremely successful defensive scheme, special teams, and coaching. The statistics and data tell the tale of how these Quarterbacks outperform Brady yet their teams aren't as successful as his so they don't get the credit Brady doesn't deserve. For my project, I looked at a variety of statistics such as Passer Rating, TD%, INT%, EPA/play, CPOE, DYAR, DVOA and others. I compared Brady to other QBs like Rodgers, Manning, Drew Brees, Patrick Mahomes and Russell Wilson, and I used EPA/play, CPOE, DYAR and DVOA with different weights (in addition to a playoff weight) to create a composite score to evaluate these 6 QBs.

PSA

SUPER BOWL IS A TEAM AWARD, yes QB is important, but football is the epitome of a team sport and is a team award. As seen in a paper written by Steven Vu given positional correlation coefficients QB isn't as valuable as people make it out to be. Tom Brady should not be the sole benefactor of the patriots success and their 6 wins. There are hundreds of other players that played a big role in their success. Like, Randy Moss, Rob Gronkowski, Devin White, Mike Evans, Chris Godwin, Tristan Wirfs, Shaq Barrett, Rob Ninkovich, Wes Welker, Julian Edelman, James White, Dion Lewis, Stephon Gilmore. The names are countless and I could probably come up with at least 100 household names that Tom Brady played with and won a super bowl with. The amount of rings a player has should not be what defines them as the "greatest." **The only argument for Tom Brady being the GOAT is his rings. He's not the best quarterback based on any measure of statistics. He shouldn't be called "the best" if the only argument for him is a team accomplishment instead of his own statistics or accomplishments.** While it is impossible to say whether he would find success on other teams or if other quarterbacks would maintain the same level of success. It is clear based on data that other quarterbacks perform better than him and have much more of an impact on how well the team performs instead of Tom Brady exploiting his team's success. He does not become better in the playoffs as silly people believe for some reason. Tom Brady plays quarterback in the National Football league. He does not play cornerback, or wide receiver, or defensive end or special teams. His team impact comes from his role as the quarterback, not as another offensive player or as a defensive player or as a special teams player. Hypothetically, Brady could throw an interception every single time he has a pass attempt, yet his team could still win the game, or even blow out the opponent if the other 52 players on the team play their role and find their own success.

TOM BRADY: THE MOST OVERRATED PLAYER IN SPORTS HISTORY

Let's sum up the video on his performance with the Patriots from 2001-2019 →

- The following data does not contain stats from his time with the Tampa Bay Buccaneers



Brady Gets way too Much Credit for Team Accomplishments

- **The 2008 Patriots went 11-5, 2nd place in the division, without Brady.**
 - Did not make the playoffs.
 - One of only 2 teams ever to miss the playoffs with 11 wins.
 - 8th in points for, 5th in yards.
- **The 2009 Patriots went 10-6, 1st in the division, with Brady.**
 - Made the playoffs.
 - 6th in points for, 3rd in yards.
- **In his career Brady with the Patriots had on average:**
 - A Top 8 in the league average starting field position. (7.9)
 - A Top 8, nearly top 7 defense in terms of points allowed (7.1)
 - In his six super bowls Brady has had the 1st, 1st, 2nd, 6th, 7th and 8th best defense in terms of points allowed
 - In 16/18 seasons his defense has been top 10 in terms of points allowed.
 - The beautiful thing about Brady is that he wills his defenses to perform so well, because without him their performance would DEFINITELY be worse.
- **As of June 22, 2020, the Patriots special teams units have been very successful.**
 - Since 2001 the Patriots have the second highest field goal % of ~ 86.25%, but their opponents field goal % since 2001 is ~76.83%, which happens to be the lowest % AND is 3.5% lower than the next closest team.
 - Total field goal efficiency is ~ 9.42%, which is ~5.61% higher than the next closest team.
 - The Patriots are ridiculously successful when kicking field goals.
- From 2001- 2019, the Bills, Dolphins and Jets respectively were 26th, 23rd and 21st in team win %.

Analysis

The contrast between Matt Cassel's Patriots and Tom Brady's Patriots with basically the same exact teams highlights the success of the Patriots system and team finding success over Tom Brady being this amazing player who made the Patriots successful. Is Matt Cassel better than Tom Brady? The Cassel led offense is not much different from the Brady led offense. Additionally, over his tenure with the Patriots it can be seen that Brady has extremely good offensive field position and defensive performance given points allowed. In all of his Super Bowls won with the Patriots Brady had a top 8 defense. In 16 out of his 18 seasons he's had a top 10 defense. Simply if we look at the last 5 seasons of Aaron Rodgers' career, he's had a top 10 defense once. In the past 5 years he's had more defenses out of the top 10 than Brady has had in his ENTIRE career. Furthermore, Tom Brady has excellent special teams units, as in his career with the Patriots he's had a top 8 average starting field position in addition to ridiculously amazing field goal operations. As in his career the Patriots have the best field goal efficiency (fg % - ofg%) of almost TEN percent. The next closest team is over 5% from the Patriots field goal unit. All of this evidence shows that without including Tom Brady's statistics, the Patriots team as a unit in their entire dynasty with Belichick is extremely successful in all facets of the game, especially defense and special teams. Not to mention that in just a small 5 year sample of Aaron Rodgers's past 5 years his defense is objectively so much worse than Brady's.

Playoff Performance

- **Most games and highest numerical postseason stats**
 - To say that he's the GOAT because of numerical postseason accomplishments is like saying:
 - Total yards > yards/game or yards/attempt.
 - Just because he's had the most yards in the most games doesn't make him better than someone with less opportunity to do the same.
- **Regular Season versus Playoff Stats:**
 - Regular season: COMP: 63.8%, 3.02 TD/INT, 97.0 rating, 5.4 TD%, 1.8 INT%.
 - Postseason: COMP: 63.0%, 2.09 TD/INT, 89.8 rating, 4.5 TD%, 2.2 INT%.
- **In his 6 Super Bowl wins Brady has a passer rating of:**
 - 77.3, 84.5, 109.4, 100.3, 97.7 and 85.8 (in order of Super Bowl).
- **Brady versus Aikman, Montana and Bradshaw:**
 - All QBs with at least 3 SBs
 - **Postseason Passer Rating and adjusted net yards per attempt (increase from regular season):**
 - Montana = 95.6 (+3.3) & 7.00 (+0.40)
 - Brady = 89.8 (-7.2) & 6.42 (-0.66)
 - Aikman = 88.3 (+6.7) & 6.41 (+1.64)
 - Bradshaw = 83.0 (+12.1) & 6.21 (+0.55)
 - **Super Bowl Winning passer rating and adjusted net yards per attempt (increase from regular season):**
 - Montana = 111.4 (+19.1) & 8.46 (+1.86)
 - Aikman = 112.6 (+31.0) & 8.41 (+2.75)
 - Bradshaw = 93.0 (+22.1) & 7.52 (+2.75)
 - Brady = 92.3 (-4.7) & 6.57 (-0.51)
 - While Brady was still obviously better in the regular season he was by far the worst QB for these QBs in these Super Bowl postseasons.

Analysis

Mostly every single quarterback does worse in the postseason, however a lot of people think that Brady gets better for some reason and that he's really amazing in the postseason. That is extremely false. For one, he's played the most games so obviously the total numerical postseason data goes to him. However, if you look at per game data, and if you look at things like passer rating, interception rate and touchdown rate, you can see that Brady extremely underperforms his regular season performances (which by the way, aren't even that good). He literally performs worse in any stat in the postseason, obviously he's playing better defenses and better teams but the narrative that he's the GOAT because of his postseason performance is stupid, he literally performs worse than he does in the regular season, and his postseason performances aren't just a little bit worse and still good, they just are not that good, and are not better if even close to other postseason performances. In his 6 super bowl wins it can be seen that Brady has 1 very good postseason, 2 good postseasons, 2 subpar postseasons, and 1 bad postseason.

Tom Brady Playoff “Luck”

- 2001 AFC Divisional Round
 - “Tuck Rule” - should have been a fumble.
- 2001 AFC Championship Game
 - 3 total Patriots touchdowns:
 - Drew Bledsoe TD pass, 55 yard punt return, 49 yard field goal block return.
 - Brady did not contribute to the win, the TEAM did.
- Super Bowl 36
 - Led the team to 13 total points.
- 2007 AFC Championship Game
 - 3 interceptions and a 66.4 passer rating.
 - Brady performed very badly yet still won because the team played well enough.
- 2011 AFC Championship Game
 - 2 interceptions and a 57.5 passer rating.
 - Brady performed very badly yet still won because the team played well enough.
- Super Bowl 49
 - Malcolm Butler intercepting the ball with less than 30 seconds to go with the opponent down 4 with 2nd and goal on the Patriots 1-yard line, and 1 timeout left.
- Super Bowl 51
 - Falcons historically blowing a 25 point lead due to horrible play calling and clock management..
 - Robert Alford dropped a near game clinching interception - for example it could change his final passer rating of 95.2 to 81.65.
- 2018 AFC Championship Game
 - 2 interceptions and a 77.1 passer rating.
 - Dee Ford was offside which eliminated a possible season ending interception by Brady.
 - Ford's offside didn't even add any pressure or effect the play.
- Super Bowl 53
 - Scored 13 team points and had a 71.4 passer rating.
- Fun Fact about Tom Brady: he is the only quarterback EVER to win a super bowl he started when his offense contributed 13 or fewer points, every other quarterback in NFL history is 0-25, but Tom Brady is 2-0.
 - This just shows how good Brady is at telling his defense to prevent the offense from scoring more points.

Analysis

Obviously randomness and luck are a part of football, but this just goes to show that tom Brady gets credit as the “GOAT” while he consistently underperforms. Selecting specific games is extremely biased and flawed because all possible “GOATs” have bad performances, however this is just some conceptual evidence that Brady’s TEAMs find success in spite of him performing poorly, yet this kind of Super Bowl and playoff runs highlight that he’s not that good of a performer. Later on you can see that Aaron Rodgers actually performs better and still loses because the circumstances are different. Brady wins because his TEAMs win, not him.

Disproving his Super Bowl win with the Bucs

The 2019 Tampa Bay Buccaneers were:

- 3rd in points and yards per game, 32nd in Turnovers, 29th in points allowed per game, 15th in yards allowed per game AND 20th in average offensive field position.

The 2020 Tampa Bay Buccaneers were:

- 3rd in points per game, 7th in yards per game and turnovers, 8TH in POINTS ALLOWED PER GAME, 6TH IN YARDS ALLOWED PER GAME AND 4th in average offensive field position.

The Buccaneers improved by 21 teams in points allowed/game, 9 teams in yards allowed per game, and 16 teams in average offensive field position. Those are 3 things that Tom Brady literally has no objective role in improving. Being a motivator can only go so far. Something Brady did do was improve the turnover situation, but the season before was just a historic turnover filled season by Jameis Winston. The Buccaneers defense and field position drastically improved over the seasons, which played the largest role in their success not Tom Brady. The Bucs won because they majorly improved in a variety of areas.

Adding on to his success with the Patriots

Two years removed from the Tom Brady era, the Patriots are somehow currently 8-4, led by rookie quarterback Mac Jones. Mac Jones was the fifth quarterback taken in the 2021 NFL draft, behind other rookie quarterbacks such as Trevor Lawrence, Zach Wilson, Trey Lance and Justin Fields. The consensus amongst multiple NFL fans is that the four other quarterbacks are better than Mac Jones. That is because, despite Mac Jones winning the most, most fans believe that the other quarterbacks are on subpar teams which is playing a large role in why the team is so bad. The thing with Brady is that fans have attached themselves to this belief that he's the reason why New England is winning. That is simply not true. He was just the quarterback for the most successful franchise in the past 2 decades.

Tom Brady led 2019-2020 Patriots versus Mac Jones led 2021-2022 Patriots

The Tom Brady 2019-2020 Patriots had :

- The 7th and 15th best offense in terms of points for and yards gained, respectively
 - The 3rd best average field position
- The best defense in terms of points allowed and yards gained

Through week 11 the Mac Jones Patriots are:

- The 6th and 17th best offense in terms of points for and yards gained, respectively
 - The best average field position
- The best defense in terms of points allowed and 3rd best in terms of yards gained

The 2019-2020 Patriots were 10-1 through week 12 and finished 12-4, the 2021-2022 Patriots are 8-4 through week 12. Is Mac Jones a possible GOAT? It's certainly possible, but Brady's patriots and Mac Jones' Patriots aren't all that different.

Tom Brady Super Bowl Wins with the Patriots

2001-2002 Super Bowl

- 77.3 Passer Rating
- 1.0 TD%
- 1.0 INT%
- 5.01 ANY/A

2003-2004 Super Bowl

- 84.5 Passer Rating
- 4.0 TD%
- 1.6 INT%
- 6.37 ANY/A

2004-2005 Super Bowl

- 109.4 Passer Rating
- 6.2 TD%
- 0.0 INT%
- 7.16 ANY/A

2014-2015 Super Bowl

- 100.3 Passer Rating
- 7.4 TD%
- 3.0 INT%
- 6.60 ANY/A

2016-2017 Super Bowl

- 97.7 Passer Rating
- 4.9 TD%
- 2.1 INT%
- 7.28 ANY/A

2018-2019 Super Bowl

- 85.8 Passer Rating
- 1.6 TD%
- 2.4 INT%
- 7.49 ANY/A

Why he shouldn't be credited as much for some of these performances

In the 2001-2002 Playoffs Tom Brady had a 77.3 Passer Rating. The league average was 78.5, meaning that during the playoffs Brady was a below league average quarterback. He additionally had a terrible TD% of 1%, which is extremely low, in addition to having an extremely low 5.01 ANY/A. In his next super bowl win, he was again, not the “greatest of all time” in the playoffs with a barely above league average of passer rating of 84.5, and a somewhat low TD% of 4.0. In his next 2 Super Bowls he was very good. In the 2016-2017 playoffs, Brady had a solid passer rating of 97.7, but a slightly low TD% of 4.9, and a decent INT% of 2.1. Not to say he performed poorly, he just did not perform that well. In his last Super Bowl with the Patriots in the 2018-2019 Super Bowl. Brady was terrible yet again, but for some reason the greatest quarterback of all times’ argument is based on terrible performances like these. He had a passer rating of 85.8, which was 6.9 points lower than league average. Do you know how below average that is? For whatever reason the greatest Quarterback of all times’ legacy is founded based on this. In addition to being below league average in passer rating he had a horrible TD% of 1.6 and a mediocre 2.4 INT%. He threw 3 interceptions and 2 touchdowns. In this horrible Super Bowl performance he had his best career Super Bowl win ANY/A of 7.49. Overall, Tom Brady doesn’t even deserve half the credit he gets for his team’s super bowl accomplishments. He only has 2 “good” playoff performances in a Super Bowl win with the Patriots. In 3 of them he is a below league average and borderline “bad” quarterback. Tom Brady deserves absolutely NONE of the credit he gets for these 3 super bowls. People make these distinctions that he’s the greatest quarterback of all time mostly in part because of his super bowls, but he’s been bad and below league average in HALF OF THEM. It makes no sense for him to be called the greatest of all time.

Aaron Rodgers playoff losses

2009-2010 Playoffs

- 121.4 Passer Rating
- 9.5 TD%
- 2.4 INT%
- 9.34 ANY/A

2011-2012 Playoffs

- 78.5 Passer Rating
- 4.3 TD%
- 2.2 INT %
- 4.72 ANY/A

2012-2013 Playoffs

- 97.6 Passer Rating
- 4.2 TD%
- 1.4 INT%
- 6.75 ANY/A

2013-2014 Playoffs

- 97.8 Passer Rating
- 3.8 TD%
- 0.0 INT%
- 5.90 ANY/A

2014-2015 Playoffs

- 91.1 Passer Rating
- 5.8 TD%
- 2.9 INT%
- 6.72 ANY/A

2015-2016 Playoffs

- 84.9 Passer Rating
- 5.0 TD%
- 1.3 INT%
- 5.99 ANY/A

2016-2017 Playoffs

- 103.8 Passer Rating
- 7.0 TD%
- 1.6 INT%
- 7.36 ANY/A

2019-2020 Playoffs

- 104.9 Passer Rating
- 6.1 TD%
- 3.0 INT%
- 7.34 ANY/A

2020-2021 Playoffs

- 104.4 Passer Rating
- 6.0 TD%
- 1.2 INT%
- 7.47 ANY/A

Analysis

Just by looking at these 9 losses, Aaron Rodgers performs well a majority of the time, with passer ratings above 100 in 4 out of the 9 losses. With an above average passer rating in 7 out of 9 losses. In most of these performances, Rodgers has a fairly high TD% and a fairly low INT%. In his last 5 appearances his TD% has been at least 5% or higher. That only occurred 2 times in Brady's 6 super bowl win appearances with the Patriots. Aaron Rodgers had a poor ANY/A in the 2011-2012 playoffs, however, outside of that performance, he had good ANY/A numbers. He had an INT% below 1.7% in 5 out of the 9 losses. With mediocre %s of 2.2 and 2.4% in 2 other appearances, with 2 slightly poor INT% numbers of 2.9 and 3.0%.

Why Aaron Rodgers deserves more credit than Brady

To start, in Rodgers' first career postseason performance he had a: ridiculous 121.4 passer rating, absurd 9.5 TD%, and otherworldly 9.34 ANY/A. Those numbers are amazing, and are better than anything that Brady ever did in his Super Bowl wins. However his team didn't win the game like Brady's. His team actually gave up 51 points, which is something that has NEVER happened to Brady. Let me repeat, in Aaron Rodgers first playoff start, his defense performed so poorly, so poorly yet it has NEVER happened to the greatest of all time Tom Brady, because I guess he just motivates his defense so much to not do that terrible. In Rodgers' 3 worst playoff loss postseason performances, they are objectively better than Brady's 3 worst super bowl wins. The difference between Brady and Rodgers is that Brady's teams are good enough to win in spite of his horrible performances, while Rodgers can perform exceptionally well yet still lose.

PSA about Passer Rating

In a Sports Illustrated article: [Kerry J. Byrne: In defense of passer rating - Sports Illustrated](#). Passer Rating and its correlation to success is discussed. “Teams that posted a higher passer rating went 203-53 (.793) in 2010.” This doesn’t necessarily mean that Passer Rating is definitively an effective stat, because there are still plenty of variables that are prevalent, in addition to the possibility of low passer ratings (examples of inefficient quarterbacking) winning games, which would mean that the low rating is somewhat connected to success, when obviously Byrne doesn’t want to defend a low passer rating.

Comparisons

I decided to look at Aaron Rodgers, Peyton Manning, Drew Brees, and Patrick Mahomes in comparison to Brady..

Look at:

- Passer Rating (A metric used to evaluate overall qb passing performance incorporating: yards, completion %, touchdowns and interceptions)
- Passing yards/game
- TD % (Touchdowns/attempt)
- INT % (Interceptions/attempt)
- Comp % (completed passes/attempt)
- TD/INT (touchdown to interception ratio)

Tom Brady

Career season and playoff stats:

Year	Tm	G	GS	QBrec	Cmp	Att	Cmp%	Yds	TD	TD%	Int	Int%	Lng	Y/A	AY/A	Y/C	Y/G	Rate
2000-2020	NWE,TAM	301	299	230-69-0	6778	10598	64.0	79204	581	5.5	191	1.8	99	7.5	7.8	11.7	263.1	97.3

NAME	GP	CMP	ATT	PCT	YDS	AVG	YDS/G	TD	TD%	INT	INT%	SCK	SCKY	RATE
 Tom Brady	45	1,106	1,764	62.7	12,449	7.1	276.6	83	4.7	38	2.2	72	446	90.4

Aaron Rodgers

Career season and playoff stats:

Year	Tm	G	GS	QBrec	Cmp	Att	Cmp%	Yds	TD	TD%	Int	Int%	Lng	Y/A	AY/A	Y/C	Y/G	Rate
2005-2020	GNB	197	190	126-63-1	4285	6587	65.1	51245	412	6.3	89	1.4	93	7.8	8.4	12.0	260.1	103.9

NAME	GP	CMP	ATT	PCT	YDS	AVG	YDS/G	TD	TD%	INT	INT%	SCK	SCKY	RATE
 Aaron Rodgers	21	481	745	64.6	5,669	7.6	270.0	45	6.0	13	1.7	50	338	100.5

Peyton Manning

Career (minus his rookie season) season and playoff stats:

Year	Tm	G	GS	QBrec	Cmp	Att	Cmp%	Yds	TD	TD%	Int	Int%	Lng	Y/A	AY/A	Y/C	Y/G	Rate
1999-2015	CLT,DEN	250	249	183-66-0	5799	8805	65.9	68201	513	5.8	223	2.5	86	7.7	7.8	11.8	272.8	98.1

NAME	GP	CMP	ATT	PCT	YDS	AVG	YDS/G	TD	TD%	INT	INT%	SCK	SCKY	RATE
 Peyton Manning	27	649	1,027	63.2	7,339	7.1	271.8	40	3.9	25	2.4	40	298	87.4

Drew Brees

Career (with New Orleans) season and playoff stats:

Year	Tm	G	GS	QBrec	Cmp	Att	Cmp%	Yds	TD	TD%	Int	Int%	Lng	Y/A	AY/A	Y/C	Y/G	Rate
2006-2020	NOR	228	228	142-86-0	6017	8742	68.8	68010	491	5.6	190	2.2	98	7.8	7.9	11.3	298.3	101.5

NAME	GP	CMP	ATT	PCT	YDS	Avg	Yds/G	TD	TD%	INT	INT%	SCK	SCKY	Rate
 Drew Brees	18	481	721	66.7	5,366	7.4	298.1	37	5.1	15	2.1	29	206	97.1

Patrick Mahomes

Career and playoff stats:

Year	Tm	G	GS	QBrec	Cmp	Att	Cmp%	Yds	TD	TD%	Int	Int%	Lng	Y/A	AY/A	Y/C	Y/G	Rate
2018-2020	KAN	45	45	37-8-0	1092	1652	66.1	13868	114	6.9	23	1.4	89	8.4	9.1	12.7	308.2	109.3

NAME	GP	CMP	ATT	PCT	YDS	Avg	YDS/G	TD	TD%	INT	INT%	SCK	SCKY	RATE
 Patrick Mahomes	8	191	301	63.5	2,324	7.7	290.5	17	5.6	4	1.3	18	118	100.4

Regular Season and Postseason Stats & Ranks

1. Passer Rating
 - 1.1. Mahomes 109.3
 - 1.2. Rodgers 103.9
 - 1.3. Brees 101.5
 - 1.4. Manning 98.1
 - 1.5. Brady 97.3
2. TD %
 - 1.1. Mahomes 6.9
 - 1.2. Rodgers 6.3
 - 1.3. Manning 5.8
 - 1.4. Brees 5.6
 - 1.5. Brady 5.5
2. INT %
 - 2.1. Rodgers 1.4
 - 2.2. Mahomes 1.4
 - 2.3. Brady 1.8
 - 2.4. Brees 2.2
 - 2.5. Manning 2.5

1. Passer Rating
 - 1.1. Rodgers 100.5 (-3.4)
 - 1.2. Mahomes 100.4 (-8.9)
 - 1.3. Brees 97.1 (-4.4)
 - 1.4. Brady 90.4 (-6.9)
 - 1.5. Manning 87.4 (-10.7)
2. TD %
 - 2.1. Rodgers 6.0 (-0.3)
 - 2.2. Mahomes 5.6 (-1.3)
 - 2.3. Brees 5.1 (-0.5)
 - 2.4. Brady 4.7 (-0.8)
 - 2.5. Manning 3.9 (-1.9)
3. INT %
 - 3.1. Mahomes 1.3 (+0.1)
 - 3.2. Rodgers 1.7 (-0.3)
 - 3.3. Brees 2.1 (+0.1)
 - 3.4. Brady 2.2 (-0.4)
 - 3.5. Manning 2.4 (+0.1)

Regular Season and Postseason Stats & Ranks

1. TD/INT
 - 1.1. Mahomes 4.96
 - 1.2. Rodgers 4.63
 - 1.3. Brady 3.04
 - 1.4. Brees 2.58
 - 1.5. Manning 2.30
2. Comp %
 - 2.1. Brees 68.8
 - 2.2. Mahomes 66.1
 - 2.3. Rodgers 65.1
 - 2.4. Manning 64.0
 - 2.5. Brady 64.0
3. TD/game
 - 3.1. Mahomes 2.53
 - 3.2. Brees 2.15
 - 3.3. Rodgers 2.09
 - 3.4. Manning 2.05
 - 3.5. Brady 1.93
4. Yards/game
 - 4.1. Mahomes 308.2
 - 4.2. Brees 298.3
 - 4.3. Manning 272.8
 - 4.4. Brady 263.1
 - 4.5. Rodgers 260.1

1. TD/INT
 - 1.1. Mahomes 4.25 (-0.71)
 - 1.2. Rodgers 3.46 (-1.17)
 - 1.3. Brees 2.47 (-0.11)
 - 1.4. Brady 2.18 (-0.86)
 - 1.5. Manning 1.60 (-0.70)
2. Comp %
 - 2.1. Brees 66.7 (-2.1)
 - 2.2. Rodgers 64.6 (-0.5)
 - 2.3. Mahomes 63.5 (-2.6)
 - 2.4. Manning 63.2 (-0.8)
 - 2.5. Brady 62.7 (-1.3)
3. TD/game
 - 3.1. Rodgers 2.14 (+0.05)
 - 3.2. Mahomes 2.13 (-0.40)
 - 3.3. Brees 2.06 (-0.09)
 - 3.4. Brady 1.84 (-0.09)
 - 3.5. Manning 1.48 (-0.57)
4. Yards/game
 - 4.1. Brees 298.1 (-0.2)
 - 4.2. Mahomes 290.5 (-17.7)
 - 4.3. Brady 276.6 (+13.5)
 - 4.4. Manning 271.8 (-1.0)
 - 4.5. Rodgers 270.0 (+9.9)

Observations of Regular Season Stats & Ranks

For the data just listed, I organized it into what I felt was most important in evaluating any quarterback. From this data collected, Mahomes seems to be the best quarterback out of the bunch. While I could make the argument for Mahomes to be the best, I consider that invalid because he has absolutely no form of longevity. This data has only been collected 3 seasons into his career. The next player who has found the most success other than Patrick Mahomes is Aaron Rodgers. Aaron Rodgers has a very good argument for the greatest quarterback of all time based on these statistics in addition to his longevity. He ranks second behind Mahomes in Passer Rating, TD%, INT% and TD/INT. While Tom Brady has the most passing touchdowns of all time, his TD% is the lowest out of all these other QBs. Which is why counting statistics don't tell the whole story. Patrick Mahomes and Aaron Rodgers stats are better than Brady's in every single category except for passing yards/game for Rodgers. While Tom Brady has a better INT% and TD/INT than both Drew Brees and Peyton Manning, he has the worst Passer Rating, TD%, Comp%, TD/game and second-to-last in yards/game. Based on this data there is no statistical evidence that provides an argument for Tom Brady being the best Quarterback of all time. In fact, this evidence suggests that Brady is the worst Quarterback out of these 5.

Observations of Postseason Stats & Ranks

There is a narrative for the argument that Tom Brady is the greatest is because of his playoff success; which is why I decided to compare the postseason success of these 5 quarterbacks, in addition to their performance relative to the regular season. In addition to my hypothesis based on regular season performance, Aaron Rodgers is the best quarterback in terms of playoff performance. Even including Patrick Mahomes. Rodgers has the best passer rating, TD%, and the highest TD/game, in addition to the second best INT%, Comp% and TD/INT. Out of the 5 QBs, Peyton Manning is the worst quarterback in the postseason and has the largest drop-off in production from the regular season. Both Patrick Mahomes and Drew Brees have better statistics than Brady for every single category.

Sources |

Steven Vu. (2015, Fall). *The Era of Analytics in the NFL: Application of Modern Portfolio Theory*. California State University, Long Beach.
<https://scholarworks.calstate.edu/downloads/z603qz23h>

Unknown. (n.d.). *NFL Pass Attempts Career Leaders*. Pro Football Reference. https://www.pro-football-reference.com/leaders/pass_att_career.htm

[Barry McCockiner]. (2020, June 22). *TOM BRADY: THE MOST OVERRATED PLAYER IN SPORTS HISTORY* [Video]. YouTube.
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1SxpiE0_FNY

Unknown. (n.d.). *2008 New England Patriots Statistics & Players*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/nwe/2008.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *2009 New England Patriots Statistics & Players*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/nwe/2009.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *New England Patriots Franchise Encyclopedia*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/nwe/>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Baltimore/Indianapolis Colts Franchise Encyclopedia*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/clt/>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Green Bay Packers Franchise Encyclopedia*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/gnb/>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Tom Brady*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/players/B/BradTo00.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Tom Brady Game Winning Drives*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/players/comeback.cgi?player=BradTo00>

Unknown. (n.d.). *AFC Championship - New England Patriots at Pittsburgh Steelers - January 27th, 2002*. Pro Football Reference.
<https://www.pro-football-reference.com/boxscores/200201270pit.htm>

Sources Part II

Unknown. (n.d.). *Super Bowl LI - New England Patriots vs. Atlanta Falcons - February 5th, 2017*. Pro Football Reference.

<https://www.pro-football-reference.com/boxscores/20170205atl.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Patriots vs. Falcons - Game Summary - February 5, 2017*. ESPN. https://www.espn.com/nfl/boxscore/_/gameId/400927752

[Barry McCockiner]. (2021, March 15). TOM BRADY: STILL OVERRATED [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DJh9lQ8x7qQ>

Unknown. (n.d.). *2019 Tampa Bay Buccaneers Statistics & Players*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/tam/2019.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *2020 Tampa Bay Buccaneers Statistics & Players*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/tam/2020.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *2019 New England Patriots Statistics & Players*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/nwe/2019.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *2021 New England Patriots Statistics & Players*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/teams/nwe/2021.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Average QB Passer Rating 2001*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/averageqb-passerrating-2001>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Average QB Passer Rating 2003*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/averageqb-passerrating-2003>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Average QB Passer Rating 2018*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/averageqb-passerrating-2018>

Kerry J. Byrne. (August 3, 2011). *Defending traditional passer rating*. Sports Illustrated. <https://www.si.com/more-sports/2011/08/03/defendingqb-rating>

Sources Part III

Unknown. (n.d.). *Aaron Rodgers*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/players/R/RodgAa00.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Aaron Rodgers Career Playoff Game Stats*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/aaron-rodgers-career-playoff-game-stats>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Tom Brady Career Playoff Game Stats*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/tom-brady-career-playoff-game-stats>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Peyton Manning*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/players/M/MannPe00.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Peyton Manning Career Playoff Stats*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/peyton-manning-playoff-stats>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Drew Brees*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/players/B/BreeDr00.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Drew Brees Career Playoff Stats*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/drew-brees-playoff-stats>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Patrick Mahomes*. Pro Football Reference. <https://www.pro-football-reference.com/players/M/MahoPa00.htm>

Unknown. (n.d.). *Patrick Mahomes Career Playoff Stats*. StatMuse. <https://www.statmuse.com/nfl/ask/patrick-mahomes-playoff-stats>

Another PSA

Obviously counting statistics aren't the best measure of whether someone is the best or not, which is why I conducted my research on a per game basis, however things like yards/game and TD/game are flawed because they still have the effects of a counting stat. Taking things on a per game basis is extremely flawed because someone could throw 50 passes per game and average 350 yards per game, whereas another person could throw 30 passes per game and average 300 yards per game. In hindsight yards/pass would be a better metric to use. Something like completion percentage can also be ineffective because a quarterback could be throwing inaccurate balls to his receivers and get carried by his skilled receivers finding success. Who knows if there are other quarterbacks who are statistically better than Brady, such as Dan Marino, Steve Young, Joe Montana or even Russell Wilson. While arguments are certainly possible for older quarterbacks, it is harder to compare them against Brady because there is hardly any advanced data to argue for or against these quarterbacks. I decided to conduct more research using more advanced metrics and data such as EPA/Play, CPOE, ANY/A, DYAR and DVOA, comparing Brady to the same 4 other quarterbacks in addition to Russell Wilson. I also decided to compare team situation, such as team defensive epa/play.