**Packaging and streaming assets to decrease the memory footprint in video games**

Jarryd Hall, Taher Odeh

Table of Contents

1. Introduction And Motivation 2

2. Related Work And Literature Review 3

2.1 Virtual Memory Based Data Streaming In Video Games 3

2.1.1 Texture Streaming 3

2.1.2 MegaTexture 3

2.1.3 Virtual Texturing 4

2.2 Memory Enhancements for Embedded Systems 4

2.3 File Systems And Archived File Types For Video Games 4

2.4 OSX and iOS Bundles 4

3 Method 4

3.1 The constructive research method 4

3.2 Work process 5

3.3 Data Collection 6

3.4 Analysis: 7

4.1 Bundle and Automatic Reference Counting 8

5. Bundle Design 9

5.1 Design Principles 9

5.2 Design Overview 9

5.2.1 File Format 9

5.2.2 Packaging Tool 9

5.2.3 API 10

6. Bundle Implementation 10

6.1 Tool and Pak File Creation 10

6.2 The API 10

6.2.1 Bundle Standard API Functions 11

6.2.2 Memory Mapping with the POSIX mmap Function 11

6.2.3 Hash table 11

6.2.4 Objective-C Wrapper 12

6.2.5 Static Libraries 12

6.2.6 Installation 13

6.2.7 Debugging and testing 13

7. Future Research and Development 13

7.1 Compression of all assets and “hooking” in to FILE IO while decompressing on the fly. 13

7.2 Virtual memory based script execution 14

7.3 Wrappers for various frameworks 14

7.4 Gui Packaging Tool for various platforms 14

7.5 Automated iOS project conversion 14

8. Discussion & Conclusion 14

9. Acknowledgements 17

References: 17

**ABSTRACT**

Memory related issues such as memory management, limited memory and memory related application crashes, etc. often affect video games. Private game development companies have created solutions to these kinds of issues, however there are no open source solutions available for developers to utilize. This paper presents a solution to solve some of these memory issues using a constructive research approach. Solid State Drives are becoming more common especially in mobile devices. Utilizing the power of SSDs we are able to virtual memory to power the game asset data. The types of gaming systems are diverse and targeting multiple platforms is important for an open source solution. C was used to develop the software as it allows the targeting of multiple platforms. The developed solution is called Bundle and consists of a packaging tool and an Application Programming Interface for developers to use the packaging tool’s output file. Although the solution targets multiple platforms, for the scope of this paper the focus was on the iOS and Mac OSX platforms

**Keywords**

Video Games, Memory Management, Cross-Platform, Game Performance, Virtual Memory, mmap, Packaging Tool, API, RAM, SSD, File-System

# 1. Introduction And Motivation

Almost all video games are bound by memory constraints. The system running the game can only allocate a certain amount of usable RAM for the game’s process and this is usually less than what an advanced game needs. The system’s kernel running the game will allocate memory for the game on RAM as well as on disk, which is where the virtual memory is located. A processes’ virtual memory space is numerous times larger than the processes’ available RAM, e.g. on an iPhone 4 there is around 40MB of RAM space, while the virtual memory available to a process is around 700MB.

Large data sizes for game data and assets force developers to spend development time on managing assets in RAM. Game assets need to be dynamically loaded and unloaded as needed when available RAM space runs low. This can lead to the creation of more complex and repetitive code that makes the project harder to manage.

These memory constraints can cause various effects during the development process.  
These effects could range from longer development cycles due to bug fixing and memory management to the far worse scenario of decreasing game asset quality to reduce the RAM footprint. The development cycle is usually guided by budget and cost, and especially within indie projects and smaller game development projects, the budget could force drastic changes to be made to the project.

There are techniques used to solve these memory constraints, but they are privately owned and there exists little documentation surrounding how the memory problems are solved.

The software market has seen positive changes within the last few years with the rise of smart phones and their capabilities to run complex applications. Software developers have observed the user’s needs transform around the mobile operating systems and applications. Apple and Microsoft have considered these mobile-based characteristics and incorporated them into their new operating systems, Apple’s OSX Mountain Lion (Viticci, 2012) and Windows 8.

The reason this is relevant is that the mobile software sale platforms such as Apple’s App Store, Android’s Marketplace and Windows Marketplace is also targeting desktop computing, e.g. Apple’s App Store, Google Apps, etc. These sales platforms have created a new age of software development opportunities where anyone is able to develop a product and sell it through these platforms.

Apple’s App Store currently has around 111 000 active games and around 635 000 active applications across all categories. (App Store Metrics, 2012) There are currently around 157 000 active publishers on the App Store. (ibid)

With no open source solution for utilizing virtual memory to manage assets within games or asset-driven applications and the amount of developers now developing for various platforms, Bundle was created as a solution to this problem. A further motivation for the need for such a solution was the fact that many developers might not be aware of the possibilities of utilizing a systems virtual memory to enhance performance of the apps when using their assets and resources.

Solid state drives are becoming the standard on computing systems and are already present on smartphones. Solid state drives have numerous advantages over magnetic based disks, such as lower latency and faster read/write times, especially with random access, as data can be fetched directly rather than waiting for the hardware to adjust the magnetic disks during retrieval.

Virtual memory is stored on disk and these aforementioned advantages of solid state drives are important if asset data and resources are to be streamed from virtual memory.

This increasing popularity of solid state drives combined with the amount of developers now developing for the various app sales platforms was a strong motivator for creating such a solution.

Game development is a dynamic process with numerous techniques available to develop a product for targeting a variety of platforms. Implementing a solution for this problem and licensing it as an open-source project will allow anyone to be able to increase their game performance as well as improve the overall game design and development by using or modifying Bundle to their custom needs.  
The problem above was pointed out during an initial interview with Johan Knutzen, a founder of Senri and Phobic Games, mobile application and game development companies based in Gothenburg, Sweden.

The solution developed includes a number of elements. The packaging tool compresses all the assets for a game into a single pak file. The pak file format is a file format that contains archived data, with each packaged file stored in either compressed or uncompressed format. The API allows developers to use the generated pak file, handles the virtual memory allocation, file retrieval and removes itself from the system.

The question researched and the results presented in this paper was:

* How can the memory footprint of video games be decreased?

This paper presents Bundle, the open-source solution created to solve these memory related issues and presents the results.

# 2. Related Work And Literature Review

The literature on the subject of utilizing virtual memory to enhance memory performance on a gaming system is limited because the concept is usually developed for high quality video games. These solutions are kept private for obvious reasons.

## 2.1 Virtual Memory Based Data Streaming In Video Games

ID Software has done the most notable implementation using a similar concept. John Carmack is the lead developer for ID Software and discusses how he used memory mapping to enhance the iOS version of the game called Rage (John Carmack, 2010).

### 2.1.1 Texture Streaming

“Texture streaming is a facility mostly used in computer games to reduce memory usage. Instead of loading all textures at once, they are loaded and unloaded on a per-need basis.“ (Mayer, 2010)

### 2.1.2 MegaTexture

A MegaTexture is the creation by id Software’s technical director John Carmack. A megatexture holds a large number of smaller textures. John Carmack revised the original version to work on arbitrary geometry and was confirmed in 2006 to work on any geometry. (Mayer, 2010)

### 2.1.3 Virtual Texturing

“Virtual texturing generalizes previous approaches by adding a level of indirection, i.e., a pagetable, similar to virtual memory subsystems in modern operating systems. The pagetable (texture) allows each fragment to access a suitable tile depending on the re- quired resolution according to standard OpenGL mipmapping calculations, instead of relying on heuristics like distance to viewpoint (as used in clipmapping).” (Mayer, 2010)

van Waveren, (2009) mentions a number of issues, related to the use of texture virtualization, that were faced during the development of the id Tech 5 game engine, such as:

* *Texture Filtering*
* *Thrashing*
* *Level OF Detail (LOD) Transitions Under High Latency*

## 2.2 Memory Enhancements for Embedded Systems

CRAMES is a system to enhance memory on embedded systems. (Lekatsas et al., 2005) ‘Compressed RAM for Embedded Systems’ uses efficient algorithms as a RAM compression technique. CRAMES can double the amount of memory space on an embedded system.(ibid)

“CRAMES takes advantage of an operating system’s virtual memory infrastructure by storing swapped-out pages in compressed format. It dynamically adjusts the size of the compressed RAM area, protecting applications capable of running without it from performance or energy consumption penalties. In addition to compressing working data sets, CRAMES also enables efficient in-RAM filesystem compression, thereby further increasing RAM capacity.” (ibid)

CRAMES targets low-power embedded systems and offers read and write data access.

Cramfs aka. Cram a filesystem onto a small ROM, (add reference to https://github.com/wendal/cramfs) is a compression library to compress files to be used on ROMs. It uses zlib to compress one page at a time and allows random access to these pages. Cramfs targets systems that have a maximum filesystem size of 256MB and offers read only data access. (add reference <https://github.com/wendal/cramfs>)

## 2.3 File Systems And Archived File Types For Video Games

The pak file is a file that is packaged with many files and works as an archived file. There are numerous games that use pak files as a means of holding game data files in an archived manner (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/PAK\_%28file\_format%29). The pak file serves as a means to hide asset data files from extraction as the game assets are archived into a single file and not left inside a resource folder.

McCormick (n.d) wrote a description of the Quake Pak format explaining an example structure for its header and directory information.

id Software released Doom 3’s source code (add reference to <https://github.com/TTimo/doom3.gpl>) and the file system’s implementation is available. Doom 3’s file system uses .pk4 files, which hold the game’s resource data. “To save disk space and speed up file loading, directory trees can be collapsed into zip files. The files use a ".pk4" extension to prevent users from unzipping them accidentally, but otherwise they are simply normal zip files. A game directory can have multiple zip files of the form "pak0.pk4", "pak1.pk4", etc. Zip files are searched in descending order from the highest number to the lowest, and will always take precedence over the filesystem. This allows a pk4 distributed as a patch to override all existing data.“ (add reference to <https://github.com/TTimo/doom3.gpl/blob/master/neo/framework/FileSystem.cpp>)

Id Software games use a number of archived file types for handling game assets. Quake 3 uses PK3 files (File Extensions Library, 2008), Doom 3 and Quake 4 uses PK4 files (File Extension Guide, 2012).

## 2.4 OSX and iOS Bundles

“A **bundle** is a directory with a standardized hierarchical structure that holds executable code and the resources used by that code.” (Apple, 2010).

# 3 Method

### 3.1 The constructive research method

Crnkovic, (2009) describes the constructive research method as a way to turn existing knowledge into novelty or innovation.

This may involve creating artifact design solutions, for example: plans, diagrams, charts and software implementation.

Kasanen, et al. (1991) summarizes the constructive method as a solution oriented method where innovative step-by-step solutions are taken into account, followed by testing the solution and using the data within the testing phase for analysis purposes.

Additionally, Lindholm (2008), provides three category examples of knowledge gaps to be filled using the constructive research method:

* Feasibility, where a solution to a common problem has not been done yet;
* Novelty, where a unique and new solution is provided to an already solved problem;
* An improvement, where the goal of the research focuses on a preexisting solution and aims to produce better results than the ones available.

The principles of the constructive method are the most suitable for this research as a solution to a problem to be solved during this research. By turning pre-existing knowledge to artifact solutions.

In addition, Caplinskas (2004) argues that the constructive research method befits computer science and IT related problems in a usual manner.

According to Lindholm (2008), There are crucial steps to be followed to order to conduct a constructive research:

1. Finding a research problem.
2. Involving an organization in the solution.
3. Obtaining a detailed understanding of the topic researched.
4. Constructing a theoretical solution.
5. Implementing a practical solution and test its usefulness.
6. Examining the applicability of the solution.
7. Showing the theoretical connection and the solution’s contribution.

### 3.2 Work process

The constructive method was adapted to meet the needs of this research.

The fundamental steps above have been borrowed and minimized to best fit a three-phased framework that shall bring a clearer image of the mix of method attributes used within this research.

The framework describes the development process involved within this research; with the use of qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis methods in different stages. (See figure 1)

The first phase of the theoretical framework uses step one of the constructive method steps. A problem is identified and evaluated as one that has no “acceptable” solutions available for. Ellis and Levy (2008) argue that for a solution to be “accepted” it must not only exist, it should be, as well, documented and mentioned in literature.

This phase requires background knowledge about the problem and the systems involved within the problem’s scope. Thus detailed knowledge has to be gained while planning the development, prior to the technical process, which is bolder in the next phase.

In phase 2 of the framework, an understanding of the problem is obtained in details. Data relevant to the problem or its solution are collected and analyzed qualitatively then interpreted into a set of requirements for a software solution.

The design and implementation of the software is developed and tested for bugs. Thus, covering steps 3, 4 and 5 of a constructive method.

Phase 2 is based on an iterative process. New data is collected during each iteration and the knowledge scope is enlarged. A set of requirements is defined as an addition to the existing ones, resulting in additional features being expected from the product or optionally, a need to modify previous tasks to better suit the new constraints.

The goals of the constructive approach are shared with many other similar approaches. The “Action Research” and the “Design Research” both aim to creating a link between theory and practice. Nevertheless, several attributes that exist in the previously mentioned approaches do not seem to appear in the constructive approach steps.

The iterative nature that exists in the Design and Action research approaches enables knowledge gaps to be filled iteratively by reflected lessons learned during the implementation phase. (Suhonen

, 2009)

Borrowing this special property from sibling approaches adds flexibility to the working process followed in the framework.

In the third and final phase, validation, profiling and memory benchmark tests are run against the software implemented to show the established link between the theory and the solution provided, as well as to point out the level of feasibility, efficiency the application provides. Data in this phase are collected and analyzed quantitatively. Multiple final steps are taken into account in this stage of the process, as the implementation should assumingly be ready and bug free, covering all the base functionalities deriving from the requirements set during the beginning steps.



**Figure 1. The work process phases (The circle shows the iterative process in phase 2).**

### 3.3 Data Collection

The focus of this research lies on the constructed solution being implemented (Lindholm, 2008). Data is collected during all phases of the development process. Enough kno§wledge must be gained about topics addressing constructing a solution. A good knowledge base about these topics, which may be theoretical or technical, is necessarily needed in order to initiate a design, and then proceed with the implementation steps. Crnkovic, (2009)

A combination of qualitative methods and quantitative ones were used in this research. Qualitative data was collected through semi-structured interviews with Johan Knutzen as well as via related literature and software manuals. Data of this type is collected mainly during phase 1 and 2 of the development model.

Quantitative data is collected using software profilers and memory benchmarking tools [1]. Tests to determine the usefulness of the implementation in practice are run after the software is constructed (phase 3).

#### 3.3.1 Semi structured interviews

Qualitative data in this research is collected using in-depth semi-structured interviews, which are described by [http://www.sagepub.com/upm-data/15565\_Chapter\_4.pdf ] as a useful and efficient way to find literature about hypothesis or claims heard or read by the interviewee.

Harrell and Bradley (2009), argue that interviews are a useful approach in data collection since there is a chance to discuss past experiences regarding subjects surrounding the research scope to bring out personal feedbacks to be further researched.

In a semi-structured interview, [http://www.comp.dit.ie/dgordon/Podcasts/Interviews/chap15.pdf] argues that the meeting is set to answer a list of questions that are used as the interview guidance.

“In-depth interviewing allows the interviewer to better understand the details associated with the lives of the individuals interviewed. This knowledge can lead to increased understanding of how experience relates to individual interactions with others resulting in the discovery of similarities amongst everyone.” (McClure, 2002)

The interviews mentioned are run with , Johan Knutzen, founder and a senior software enigineer in Senri. Several ways of data gathering are taken during the interview sessions which are estimated as approximately one hour at a time: dialogues, questions and answers, development guidelines, discussions and suggestions about sources to research further for a better understanding about a specific topic that is relevant to the research.

In phase 1 of the framework, where a problem is identified and a plan to solve it is initiated, qualitative data play an important role. The first semi-structured interview is led by Knutzen, who is a senior in the field, to describe the problem existing in the field. During the first meetings an understanding of why the problem exists is reached in details covering the scope of it, subjects related to the problem and its solution are noted down to be researched later.

Semi-structured meetings are scheduled when there is a need to discuss the next steps in the iteration. Problems faced during previous iterations are discussed and more research-worthy topics are laid out for a further investigation. Eventually possibilities of their integration with the developed product are taken into account.

Meetings contribute in conducting the next steps of the implementation process as discussions focused on deciding the next steps. Before the end of each meeting, the decision to follow a specific technique in the next levels of the plan is agreed on between the participants, considering the time scope of the solution and the technical abilities participants have or are able to produce for the research.

Internet based meetings are held as well during the implementation phase (mostly in phase 2) when there is a need for more information regarding current tasks. These meetings are text based and aiming to cover mostly technical questions where the topic to be discussed is broader and requires more knowledge than what could be gained during the research.

#### 3.3.2 Literature and manuals

Research papers and other literature addressing topics related to computer gaming, packaging assets in games, operation systems, memory and virtual memory management, disks and their types and more, were covered throughout the implementation process. Adding to the above, software manuals are used as the product is getting developed.

Constructivism approaches allow problem-based learning, since an iterative guidance is needed to exist. (Holton, 2010)

Phase 1 of the working model focuses on building a knowledge base in order to initiate a design plan. During this phase, literature and researches about similar areas of interest are red, covering s topics mentioned in these researches in more details.

In phase 2, as the iterative work beings, knowledge is gained from literature and software manuals to carry on with the development.

There is never enough information when it comes to this category of data. With more data collected, there is a better understanding of what is building the research blocks. Thus, more ideas arrive concerning more literature to study about new topics. (Crnkovic, 2009)

#### 3.3.3 Observation

Nunamaker, et. al. (1990) gives an example of virtual memory techniques that were developed by the help of previous implementations.

Within this research, a large deal of time is spent on testing different similar implementations, and observing their behavior. design documents, manuals and source code were also taken in consideration if available.

#### 3.3.4 Tests

### 3.4 Analysis:

Information collected during interviews and literature reviews is seen as pieces of information about things that exist, when combined and properly structured, it may bring a clearer view about the bigger system. In this research, it is the product constructed as a solution. (Crnkovic, 2009)

One way to understand how information is transformed into building blocks of a constructive research like this kind is using an approach similar to Information Realism (IR), where objects in reality are seen as informational resources. Nevertheless, interaction with these resources is possible by observing and understanding them and then testing their possible integration. (Floridi, 2004)

Information, be it verbal or written, is studied, discussed and understood, and a possibility of turning it into software requirements is considered. Depending on the information’s usefulness and on the current state of development, it is evaluated as data to be turned into software design diagrams, models, programming tasks or future work for an improvement.

4. Bundle

Bundle was created as a result of using the previously described framework. Bundle is an archiving tool as well as an API for using the produced archive files and allowing the packaged assets to be retrieved by filename. The archiving tool can be used to create pak files and minor enhancements will allow for unpacking of such files.

Bundle can also be applied to asset heavy applications other than games. Media driven applications can greatly benefit from Bundle, especially if video or sound files are read during runtime because the data can be streamed directly from virtual memory and processed byte by byte.

The solution developed was planned from the start to be an open source project. (add reference to github here) Bundle is licensed under the BSD license. (add reference to Bsd License here). The reason for this decision was the fact that memory management is something every game developer has to deal with and offering an open source solution could help other developers and possibly gains the interest of the game development community to evolve the project. The focus of Bundle is to target as many platforms as possible because games run a wide range of systems. The focus of this research paper is on the iOS and Mac OSX platforms, although the code itself is C, which allows multiplatform support. Understanding how the current hardware and software operating systems work was crucial in developing Bundle..

Bundle can aid game development projects that are already under development or at any other time during the development phase.

Bundle works by compressing a game’s assets into a single archived file, having each file compressed and pushed to the end of the Pak. A header is constructed to keep track of files in the archive. Then using the API, one may load the file into a hash table for efficient retrieval of information about the files. Lastly the archive is mapped to virtual memory. The files within the archived file are accessible using the filename itself. The file is retrieved and returned to the game process as a range of bytes, using a pointer and a file size variable.

Game developers can encounter various bugs and issues related to their memory management. Memory also highly affects the performance of games, especially on mobile devices where the available hardware resources are limited.

These memory issues are experienced with manually allocated memory in RAM. A system also allocates a block of virtual memory to a process. Virtual memory resides on disk and acts similar to a swap file. iOS does not use a swap file. (add reference to apple docs here). The storage of memory on disk and using this virtual memory during a game’s process is important for performance.

Mobile devices such as the iPhone and iPad, which run iOS, have Solid State Drives. This is a reason why they were chosen as the target of this papers research.

Once the file is mapped to virtual memory the addresses are translated as the data is paged in from virtual memory. A MMU(add MMU reference here) is used by the CPU to translate virtual memory addresses.

As Apple’s iOS and OSX platforms were the focus of this research, the memory management was researched on Apple’s self- published documentation.

The kernel manages RAM and Virtual Memory segments. When an application launches the kernel allocates a block of memory in RAM, e.g. around 40MB on the iPhone 4 and also assigns a virtual memory data segment, e.g. around 700MB on the iPhone 4. (add profiling diagrams? Or some reference). The RAM and Virtual Memory work together by means of paging data segments or pages, in and out, between each other. When a data segment is needed that resides in virtual memory, the kernel pages in the page that holds that data into RAM. (add virtual memory reference to apple’s site here) . Data is paged into RAM from virtual memory until the calculated max RAM size is reached. Once this occurs the kernel will page out data that is not currently needed, and replace it with the page from virtual memory that holds the currently needed data.

Data allocated to virtual memory rather than strictly allocated to RAM using objective C’s alloc method would allow larger segments of data to be allocated due to the size of the virtual memories data block.

## 4.1 Bundle and Automatic Reference Counting

ARC aka. Automatic Reference Counting is a new LLVM (Low Level Virtual Machine) compiler feature for compiling Objective – C and was introduced in iOS 5 and OSX.

“**Automatic Reference Counting (ARC)** is a compiler-level feature that simplifies the process of managing the lifetimes of Objective-C objects. Instead of you having to remember when to retain or release an object, ARC evaluates the lifetime requirements of your objects and automatically inserts the appropriate method calls at compile time.” (About Bundle, 2012)

Although ARC removes the need to use the retain and release method calls, it still works on objects allocated to RAM directly. “Automatic Reference Counting implements automatic memory management for Objective-C objects and blocks, freeing the programmer from the need to explicitly insert retains and releases. It does not provide a cycle collector; users must explicitly manage the lifetime of their objects, breaking cycles manually or with weak or unsafe references.” (Automatic Reference Counting. 2012)

This does not affect the use of Bundle within an iOS or OSX project because the objects used for the game assets within this type of application are not strictly allocated to RAM, but have their data retrieved from virtual memory. A game can run on iOS and OSX using Bundle for handling asset data and files, as well as ARC for non-asset data objects.

# 5. Bundle Design

## 5.1 Design Principles

The goal of Bundle is to increase memory performance when using assets in games and media driven applications, while supporting multiple platforms. Bundle also has to be easy for developers to use at any stage of the development process.

The following principles achieve this goal:

1. *Use a low level language to target multiple platforms.* Using C allows Bundle to be integrated into many projects that run on different platforms.
2. *Package assets according to the user’s needs.* The command line tool allows users to specify which files they need compressed within the pak file.
3. *Provide a simple API to use the generated pak files within an application.* Bundle’s API provides three easy methods for starting Bundle, retrieving files within the pak file and also stopping Bundle.
4. *Allow file retrievals in a random access manner.* A memory mapped pak file will contain a number of files throughout the data block. These files need to be accessed in a random manner according to the execution of the application process. Random access of these data segments should not cause unwanted overhead for the CPU.

## 5.2 Design Overview

Video games can run on many different platforms so targeting as many platforms as possible was a design decision from early on. Using C to develop Bundle would allow this as it supports multiple platforms. C compiles correctly with Objective-C, the language used in iOS and OSX, which is a C superset.

Integrating Bundle into an existing project or a fresh project has been made as easy as possible for the developers using it.

Bundle consists of three parts.

1. File Format with .pak extension
2. Packaging Tool
3. API for using the pak file

### 5.2.1 File Format

As mentioned before, the pak file format is an archive file type without a standardized content format. Bundle’s pak file contains a header of variable size depending on the number of assets to be archived, as well as a data section that holds the files. The files that are placed within the data section include byte padding, which is sized depending on the architecture of the system e.g. 32 bit or 64 bit. The header contains the index information for the contents of the data section. Each archived file is indexed with the following data:

* The hash value of the filename \*
* The file’s offset within the pak file
* The size of the file within the pak file
* A compression flag. 1 if the file is compressed and 0 if it is not compressed.

\* using *khash’s \_\_ac\_X31\_hash\_string(key)* function.

### 5.2.2 Packaging Tool

The packaging tool is a command line tool. The following arguments need to be supplied:

* Source Folder Path
* Destination Path with .pak extension
* File types to be compressed

The flagged file types to be compressed are sent to the packaging process and stored. The tool iterates through the source folder and counts the number of files, ignoring non-asset file types, such as the .DS\_Store. The asset file count is used to calculate the header length for the pak file being created. The tool checks if the destination file exists, if it does, the user is asked if they would like to overwrite it, otherwise the pak file is created. The tool packages each individual file into the pak file, compressing the file if the user specified compression for the file type. Each file added to the pack is indexed with the file information into the header segment.

When the packaging process is complete the pak is located at the destination path and ready for use.

Figure 1 shows the packaging process to create a pak file.



Figure 1.

### 5.2.3 API

Bundle’s API is simple and easily extendable. The core API is C based like the rest of Bundle’s source code. The goal was to create an easy to use solution for developers by abstracting the inner workings and providing the least amount of functions as possible.

It was also important to allow the extendibility of Bundle, as the project is open source and targets many platforms.

# 6. Bundle Implementation

## 6.1 Tool and Pak File Creation

The pak file format is an archive file format that is not standardized on its contents. Pak files are usually used for games, where game assets are archived into a single file.

The tool takes the source folder, traverses the entire directory to count the files, ignoring DS\_Store files that are present on Apple’s platforms. Once the file count is obtained, the value is used to calculate the variable header length.

The pak file header consists of offsets holding information about the files compressed within the pak, in addition to an integer in the beginning of the file representing the number of files compressed. Each offset in the header holds 20 bytes of information needed to be used to locate files in the archive, the first 4 bytes in an offset holds the hash value of the filename, the next 8 bytes hold the index of the beginning of the data of the that file within the archive, the remaining 8 bytes in an offset hold the size of the that file in bytes. The above information is stored in a binary form in the header of the pak file to allow the data compressed to be located by the filename of the original file.

The tool outputs a pak file at the user specified destination path. Once this pak file is created it is ready to be used within the application.

## 6.2 The API

The base API was developed in C allowing for future evolution of the product, which is especially needed for an open source project where many people might have ideas to evolve the product.

For the focus of this research paper, the operating systems being Apple’s iOS and Mac OS X, wrapper methods were needed to support Apple’s Objective-C language, which forms the basis of the Cocoa and Cocoa Touch frameworks.(add reference here to objc and cocoa/touch) Objective-C is a superset of C, allowing it to integrate seamlessly.

Usability was always an important attribute of the solution as it is an open source project to be used my many developers.

The usage of the API is split into 3 important functions.

1. *int bundle\_start(char \*pakFile, struct mappedData \*mData)*
2. *offset\_p bundle\_getIndexDataFor(char \*fileName)*
3. *int bundle\_stop(struct mappedData \*mData)*

The *bundle\_start* function starts Bundle by loading a given pak file, memory mapping the file to virtual memory, creates a hash table holding the offsets and returns success or failure.

The *bundle\_getIndexDataFor* function retrieves the file offset , the size ad the compression flag for a developer with the ease of only needing a filename as an argument.

The *bundle\_stop* function stops Bundle by destroying the hash table and removing the mapped file from virtual memory.

Allowing such ease of use of the Bundle system developers do not need to lose valuable development time, which adheres to an important attribute of Bundle, to improve the development process in various ways. Developers can integrate Bundle quickly into existing games. Including the bundle.h file and linking the static library allows the user to use the interface functions available, for loading a Pak file, retrieving offsets by filename and freeing the memory used by Bundle.

The offsets type retrieved is defined in the *header.h* file:

“ struct{

khint\_t hash;

long int offset\_start;

size\_t size;

char compressed;

} header\_offset “

The variable *hash*, holds the hash value of the filename in the archive, offset\_start holds the address of the data in the the virtual memory, size is the size of the fle before compression in bytes and compressed is a flag corresponding to whether the file is compressed in the pak or not.

Using the above offset, one may access the data in VM and use it freely, uncompress it if it is compressed, save it to a file, view or play it using a higher level language, etc.

### 6.2.1 Bundle Standard API Functions

EXPLAIN bundle\_start, The retrieval function and Bundle\_Stop

### 6.2.2 Memory Mapping with the POSIX mmap Function

A POSIX function called mmap (reference mmap here) is a low-level virtual memory mapping technique that allows one to allocate a file on disk into virtual memory addresses. The mmap function provides a number of ways to map a file to virtual memory.

Bundle assumes that the mapped file is read-only. The PROT\_READ macro was used to provide this read-only feature. Bundle also maps the file using the MAP\_PRIVATE macro. This private mapping disables the mapped file from being accessed within other processes, a feature which is needed on an operating system that supports multitasking. Bundle calls the mmap function as follows:

* *mmap(NULL, mData->fileSize, PROT\_READ, MAP\_PRIVATE, fileDescriptor, offset);*

It is important to note that developers needing to bundle scripts into their pak file and allow those scripts to be executed directly from virtual memory can use the PROT\_EXEC macro as an argument for the mmap function call.

Bundle also uses the madvise(2) function, which advises the kernel on how to use the memory. Using the madvise function with the MADV\_RANDOM argument notifies the kernel that the virtual memory mapped pak file is to be accessed randomly with readahead turned off. This was chosen as one of the previously mentioned design principles is to provide random access to the archived data within the memory mapped pak file without unwanted overhead to the CPU. Disabling readahead avoids this unwanted CPU overhead. (add reference to <http://man.he.net/man2/madvise>)

### 6.2.3 Hash table

The hashmap implementation is developed as a wrapper for khash(C)(add reference) to hold offsets red from the header of the pak file, thus allowing easy and fast access to information about packed files in the archive. The hashmap is initialized globally on the stack and is structured to hold the hash values of the filename (add reference to hashing function) as the key, and the offset copied from the header as the value.

The hashmap provides the following functions:

* int hash\_init(char \*filename
* offset\_p get\_offset(char \*filename)
* void hash\_read()
* void hash\_destroy()

The first function takes a filename and initializes a hahs table with the header offsets existing in the header. The keys of the hasmap being the hash value[1] of the filename, and the value points to a *header\_struct[2]* type representing the offset.

The *get\_offset* fuction returns the offset corresponding to the the hash value of the filename passed.

The *hash\_read* function, iterates through the elements stored in the hash table and returns an array of offsets.

The *hash\_desotroy* function frees the created table from the stack.

### 6.2.4 Objective-C Wrapper

Bundle provides an Objective-C wrapper class called *BundleCocoaWrapper.m.* This class contains two methods:

* *(NSData \*) bundle\_useFile:(NSString \*) filename*
* *(NSNumber) isFileCompressed:(NSString \*) filename*

The *useFile* method converts the NSString based filename to a C based char \*. The char \* is then used with Bundle’s C based function.

offset\_p *bundle\_getIndexDataFor(char \*fileName)*

An NSData object is created and the offset\_p data is passed to an Objective-C method.

The Objective-C NSData class has a method for passing a pointer to an address as well as the length of bytes to process, with the alternative option of freeing the data when done or not. (add reference here to the NSData class)

*+ (id)dataWithBytesNoCopy:(void \*)*bytes *length:(NSUInteger)*length *freeWhenDone:(BOOL)*freeWhenDone

(add reference to the method on apple docs here.)

The data object is assigned with offset\_p’s data using the following method call:

*data = [NSData*

*dataWithBytesNoCopy:offset->offset\_start length:offset->size*

*freeWhenDone:NO];*

Each object that requires asset data to execute will thus have an associated NSData object that is not copied from virtual memory and allocated to RAM. The NSData pointers created by the developer will point to the memory segment in virtual memory and be paged in and out by the kernel.

This allows an object to be created using the virtual memory pointer and size of bytes of the segment, without the need to allocate memory in RAM for the object. This perfectly integrated with the developed base C API that allowed retrieval of a file’s index data within the pak file, using the filename itself.

This *useFile* method then returns the NSData object pointer for further use by the developer.

This feature would make it as simple as possible for developers to use the API as they can use their filenames as usual.

The second method provided within the *BundleCocoaWrapper* class allows a developer to determine whether or not a file is compressed within the memory mapped pak file. Developers can then use this data appropriately.

### 6.2.5 Static Libraries

Bundle also provides a static library for developers to link to within their projects. This simplifies the process for developers using Bundle and adheres to the design principle of providing a cross platform solution.

The following options are available to build the static libraries and use Bundle’s functions in a C compatible environment:

* Using the *make* command from src/:
  + make header\_lib: to create a static library for the header functions.
  + make hash\_lib: to create a static library for the the hashmap functions.
  + make mmap\_lib: to create a static library for the memory mapping functions.
* Manually, By compiling the .c files in the src/ folder and use a library tool like *ar* to create the libraries.

Including the appropriate .h files and linking the libraries when building the code is one way of using Bundle’s libraries.

### 6.2.6 Installation

Installation of Bundle is done by the use of Makefiles. A main Makefile exists in the root directory and contains the following rules:

- all: Compling the packaging tool and API source files.

- install: Builds the packaging tool and creates a static library for inclusion in other programs.

- static:: Similar to install, skipping building the packaging tool.

Another Makefile resides in the src/ directory and contains more abstract rules to separately compile, build and install the different components creating Bundle.

### 6.2.7 Debugging and testing

Debugging and testing of the code during the development process urges the use of the tools:

* gdb [\*]: For debugging purposes, using break and trace points in order to validate data held in memory.
* hexdump [\*]: For opening binary files to view its hex values.



# 7. Future Research and Development

Bundle was developed within a short time frame and although developed for multiple platforms, the focus was on the iOS and OSX platforms. There are a number of possible directions for the Bundle project.

## 7.1 Compression of all assets and “hooking” in to FILE IO while decompressing on the fly.

Zlib offers stream-based decompression. In some cases decompressing on the fly and reading the data byte by byte is faster than decompressing the entire file first. Bundle includes a function that creates another file when decompressing the source. Currently this decompressed file will reside in RAM, either on the stack or heap. Solving this issue by storing the file in virtual memory was considered, however both techniques store an extra version of the source file, the compressed source and the decompressed additional file. Zlib streams would allow this data to be used as it is being compressed rather than writing all decompressed data to a separate file first. Researching how to “hook in” to C’s File IO functions would allow for the single copy of the asset data to reside in virtual memory and due to the data being executed as a stream, maintain a low RAM based memory usage for compressed files.

(add section on C File IO hookin)

Compressing all the game assets into the archived file would decrease the pak file size. It is important to note that Bundle currently offers compression support for user selected file types because certain file types such as image and sound files that are already optimized in size, e.g. png, ogg, mp3 etc. will not benefit from further compression. Implementing these research findings would also speed up the pak file creation, as the user does not need to enter all the file types needed for compression.

## 7.2 Virtual memory based script execution

The POSIX mmap function, which was used for memory mapping in Bundle, offers the *PROT\_EXEC* option to allow memory-mapped data to be executed. Scripts archived within the pak file could be executed directly from virtual memory.

Extending the Bundle API to allow execution of various script types existing in virtual memory during runtime is a possible future research direction.

## 7.3 Wrappers for various frameworks

Bundle targets multiple platforms that support C. Currently developers using Bundle can obtain a pointer to a memory location, the size of the file segment and a compression flag. Extending Bundle by creating wrappers for various frameworks would attract more developers to the project.

Wrappers for the following frameworks could be considered for future research.

* + openGL
  + openAL
  + Cocos2d
  + Android

Extending iOS wrappers is a highly recommended future research area.

## 7.4 Gui Packaging Tool for various platforms

Research and development of Graphical User Interfaces for the packaging tool is an important extension, as it will speed up the archive file creation process.

Developing the GUI as a cross platform solution is the most suitable direction for this research direction.

## 7.5 Automated iOS project conversion

A useful extension to be researched is an automated process of detecting asset usage within an iOS project. A script could scan the source code of a project and look for filenames that match files within the archived pak file. The script could then replace the native language’s methods passed in argument with the wrapper function for retrieving the file data from virtual memory, with the return of the wrapper function as the argument to the native method.

Researching the different methods that use asset filenames as arguments is necessary to achieve effective automation of this process.

# 8. Discussion & Conclusion

An important characteristic of Bundle was to allow the developers who use it to have the freedom to develop games as usual, with the difference that Bundle would handle their asset memory management. Offering the memory address pointer and file size of the requested filename allowed this to be maintained as a characteristic of Bundle.

Bundle offers developers the following:

> Reduced memory management

> Compression of selected game assets

> File name based data retrieval

> Lower memory footprint

> Larger memory size available

> Selected file types are compressed

> Open source project allows modifications for custom changes

Reduced memory management is achieved by removing the need for developers to strictly allocate and deallocate memory for the game assets. The game assets are mapped to virtual memory as a single file, and the individual game assets are located within this single memory mapped pak file. All memory management after mapping the file to virtual memory is handled by the kernel. The kernel will page data in and out as needed by the game's process.

File name based retrieval works by passing the given filename to the Bundle API and retrieving the data offset and file size to the developer for an intended use. Simplifying this process hides the implementation from developers and does not waste development time due to complications.

Lower memory footprint is due to the game assets being stored in virtual memory that resides on disk. The kernel will manage the RAM usage of game asset data as it pages data in and out whenever the process demands data on a given page. Strict game asset based object allocation and deallocation of memory by the developer during runtime is removed and handled by the kernel.

Larger memory size is available because of the allocated virtual memory data segment done by the kernel. On the iPhone 4, the physical memory is around 40MB depending on what other applications are running on the device, such as e.g. Apple's Mail, Safari, Address book applications as well as other applications with live processes on the device. The virtual memory on the iPhone 4 is around 700MB. Utilizing this memory space directly means the application can allocate a substantially larger data amount, which can be used as needed, which the kernel will page the data in and out of RAM.

Selected file types are compressed during the packaging stage. This has been made easily extendable to allow for any file types to either be compressed or left as is during the packaging process. Certain game development APIs offer various functions that could either work with compressed files or uncompressed files for highest efficiency. Allowing the developer to customize what file types can be compressed or not allows Bundle to integrate with the project under development.

Open source projects allows for custom modifications depending on developer needs. Game development is a very dynamic topic and there are numerous ways of developing games. Maintaining the freedom to work according to the project at hand is important and releasing Bundle as an open source project allows this. Developers can extend, modify, extract parts of the Bundle source code and use it to their custom needs.

Bundle is intended for use on systems with solid state drives and the growing availability of Solid State Drives at affordable prices will see the number of devices using Solid State Drives increase. This increase in SSDs allows Bundle to be used on more devices. Systems that do not use Solid State Drives are not ideal targets for Bundle as these systems’ drives would have a longer latency and loading times and have negative effects on game performance.

It is important to note that Bundle works with game assets such as image files, sound files, textures, stage data, video files etc. These assets are stored within virtual memory and the objects using this data do not need to allocate memory for these objects. The developer might allocate E.g. A UIImageView object that can hold a UIImage to display is manually allocated by the developer and resides on RAM. The UIImage object to be placed within the UIImageView for display will have its data backed by the virtual memory segment for the named file.

Once the tool was packaging assets correctly into a pak file and the API could correctly place the pak file’s header info into a hashmap and memory map the file to virtual memory, the focus was on reading this data and making it available to the caller. An issue arose regarding what to do with the needed compressed data. The issue was that if a number of compressed files are within the pak file, and mapped to virtual memory, when using this data for objects, the data should be used directly from virtual memory, rather than copying the data temporarily to the stack, whether it was decompressed or not. A number of options were considered.

1. Package the game assets into the pak file without compression.
2. Package the compressed assets into the pak file, and decompress the entire file to virtual memory, re indexing an internal structure.
3. Package the compressed assets into the pak file, and decompress data as needed.
4. Package the compressed assets into the pak file, and decompress and memory map individual files on demand.

All of the above had side effects for the solution such as loading times or decreased memory size. The main issue with the mentioned options was the fact that they all forced a temporary duplicate of the virtual memory mapped data to be placed somewhere else in memory, either the stack or the heap. Keeping with the focus of reducing strictly allocated RAM usage to a minimum.

Android uses apk files to deliver content to an application. “Android application package file (APK) is the file format used to distribute and install application software and middleware onto Google's Android operating system. To make an APK file, a program for Android is first compiled, and then all of its parts are packaged into one file. This holds all of that program's code such as (.dex files), resources, assets, certificates, and manifest file. As is the case with many file formats, APK files can have any name needed, but must end with the four character, three letter extension, .apk.” (reference <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/APK_%28file_format%29>)

This allows Bundle to package a file and give it the apk extension. This apk can then be hosted on Google’s server which an android game or media driven application that will use Bundle can retrieve the apk file and use it with Bundle’s API.

Android uses a Java based virtual machine known as the Dalvik Virtual Machine, which is a JVM enhanced for mobile devices. Android developers can use the Android Native Development Kit (NDK) to run Bundle within their android game or application. “The NDK allows you to implement parts of your applications using native-code languages such as C and C++.” (add reference to <http://developer.android.com/sdk/ndk/overview.html>

CRAMES works on a lower level than the target of Bundle. CRAMES registers itself with the kernel as a memory block and offers a function by which the kernel can access the compressed data whenever there is a read or a write operation. (add reference to CRAMES paper) Both of these mentioned systems use compression of file systems themselves and target small memory systems.

Apple’s bundles allow the assets and files to be retrieved and used to allocate data to RAM. This differs to how Bundle maps the pak file, which is similar to an OSX or iOS Bundle, to virtual memory and allows similar retrieval of files within that pak file, using a filename based system. Another difference is that an OSX and iOS bundle “ is a directory with a standardized hierarchical structure that holds executable code and the resources used by that code.” (add reference [https://developer.apple.com/library/mac/#documentation/CoreFoundation/Conceptual/CFBundles/AboutBundles/AboutBundles.html#//apple\_ref/doc/uid/10000123i-CH100-SW1](https://developer.apple.com/library/mac/#documentation/CoreFoundation/Conceptual/CFBundles/AboutBundles/AboutBundles.html))

and is not a system where the data is made readily available to the developer within memory by using filename retrieval. The pak file created by the archiving tool will be added to an Xcode project and will be placed within the projects bundle. Retrieving the pak file by name using its filename will fetch the pak file within the bundle during runtime and allow the Bundle API to memory map it and use its archived files.

It should be noted that iOS allows multitasking which keeps applications threads alive in a suspended state. These suspended applications retain their processes’ memory blocks within RAM and virtual memory. This retained memory can decrease the amount of memory available to a launched application. If an active application requests memory within the allowed amount and it is not available the kernel will deallocate the suspended applications as needed. Using Bundle to retrieve the needed data from the virtual memory block and using that data as a stream would minimize the RAM usage. RAM usage would only be as large as the data buffer used for streaming.

van Waveren, (2009) mentioned a number of issues experienced when using texture virtualization. They were the following:

* *Texture Filtering*

Texture filtering is a technique that uses nearby texels (pixels of a texture) to determine the color for the current texture pixel being rendered. Texture filtering is related to computational complexity and the quality of the rendered image.

* *Thrashing*

Thrashing occurs when a system’s physical memory is completely occupied and the virtual memory subsystem is continuously paging data in and out of physical memory. This causes the performance of the system to decrease or can lead to a system crash.

* *Level OF Detail (LOD) Transitions Under High Latency*

When streaming texture data from virtual memory, high latency can cause the detail of the rendered texture area to fluctuate depending on the latency level.

Although the above-mentioned issues relate to a large texture file, the same lessons can be applied to a project that uses Bundle, as the pak file can hold numerous files of various types, all of which can be streamed.

Insufficient Memory Addresses within virtual memory is also an issue to be aware of. In order for a file to be memory mapped to virtual memory there needs to be enough address space available for the file to fit. A file will not be successfully mapped to virtual memory if there are not enough memory addresses available within a continuous data block, even if the total amount of free virtual memory is larger than the size of the file to be mapped.

Another caveat regarding memory mapping is that memory mapping files smaller than the page size on a system wastes space. A page size is usually 4kb in size. A file smaller than 4kb will still consume 4kb of RAM space when paged in by the kernel.

Theory discussions

The constructive research method contributed greatly to this research. It’s principles were found suitable for this kind of study, as it focuses on the solution and fills the learning gap throughout the process of development. (Crnkovic, 2009)

The flexibility provided by the constructive approach allows mixing social and scientific approaches, (bid). On the other hand, freedom in interpreting knowledge during the construction of the solution made it harder to try to adopt to a suitable research method or framework that describes the exact development process.

A different view of the constructive research method is described by (Nunamaker et al. 1990), and reflected in steps which might somewhat look more stabile to this research. The steps structured seem to lack social data collection methods, which are necessary steps in the development of this research.

The Semi structured interviews contributed in gaining knowledge in a continuous and a flexible manner. Topics related were discovered iteratively during every meeting as open discussions were taken place.

The Semi structured interviews contributed in gaining knowledge in a continuous and a flexible manner. Topics related were discovered iteratively during every meeting as open discussions were taken place.

One of the goals of quantitative data collection methods used in a mix is to show whether statistical outcomes validates or invalidates variables. [http://documents.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/ko/mekb\_module\_13.pdf]

Analysis of data is continuous as more meeting sessions are set and more topics are outlined. Interviews are limited in time thus resources cannot be covered fully during meetings. Topics that may contribute to the implementation were discussed in depth, though leaving detailed specifications and further knowledge to be gained individually from written literature about these topics, observations from experiments, questions and answers during the meetings.

As the constructivism used in this research requires knowledge to be translated into novelty (Crnkovic, 2009). Knowledge collected was interpreted as software requirements for the implementation process.

The transformation from data collected to software requirements specifications is done by understanding the data using the search of building technical knowledge about the topics involved, and using the existing knowledge and technical skills, then build diagrams, setup a development strategy using scheduled milestones tied to programming tasks.

In the first steps of the research, an understanding of an unsolved problem in the field of computer gaming is achieved, and a solution to this problem is also proposed by the interviewee. The solution is not discussed in details; several techniques to solve the problem were discussed rather than a provided detailed list of implementation steps.

# 9. Acknowledgements

This work was done with guidance from Senri. We would like to thank Johan Knutzen for his guidance and support throughout the research and development of Bundle.

# References:

Federico Viticci. (2012). *OS X Mountain Lion: The iOS-ification Continues This Summer .* Available: http://www.macstories.net/stories/os-x-mountain-lion-the-ios-ification-continues-this-summer/. Last accessed 18th May 2012.

App Store Metrics. (2012)*.* Available: http://148apps.biz/app-store-metrics/. Last accessed 10th May 2012.

John Carmack. (2010). *John Carmack discusses RAGE on iPhone/iPad/iPod.* Available: http://www.bethblog.com/2010/10/29/john-carmack-discusses-rage-on-iphoneipadipod-touch/. Last accessed 16th March 2012.

Mayer, J, A 2010, ‘Virtual Texturing’, M.A. thesis, Technischen Universität Wien, Wein

Lekatsas, H.; Dick, R.P.; Chakradhar, S.; Lei Yang; , "CRAMES: compressed RAM for embedded systems," *Hardware/Software Codesign and System Synthesis, 2005. CODES+ISSS '05. Third IEEE/ACM/IFIP International Conference on* , vol., no., pp.93-98, Sept. 2005

Van Waveren, J.M.P, “From Texture Virtualization to Massive Parallelization” SIGGRAPH 2009, New Orleans, pp. 1 – 18.

Pete McCormick. (n.d). *Quake PAK Format.* Available: http://debian.fmi.uni-sofia.bg/~sergei/cgsr/docs/pak.txt. Last accessed 1st May 2012.

File Extensions Library, 2008, “File extension pk3 information”. Available: <http://pk3.file-extension-library.com/>. Last accessed 19th May 2012.

File Extension Guide, 2012, “File extension pk4“. Available: http://pk4.fileextensionguide.com/. Last accessed 19th May 2012.

About Bundles. (2010). Available: https://developer.apple.com/library/mac/#documentation/CoreFoundation/Conceptual/CFBundles/AboutBundles/AboutBundles.html#//apple\_ref/doc/uid/10000123i-CH100-SW1. Last accessed 24th April 2012.

*Core Services Layer*. (2012)*.* Available: https://developer.apple.com/library/mac/#documentation/MacOSX/Conceptual/OSX\_Technology\_Overview/CoreServicesLayer/CoreServicesLayer.html. Last accessed 19th May 2012.

*Automatic Reference Counting*. (2012)*.* Available: http://clang.llvm.org/docs/AutomaticReferenceCounting.html. Last accessed 8th March 2012.

[ref2 = Kasanen et al. (1991)]

Lindholm, A., L. 2008. *A constructive study on creating core business relevant CREM strategy and performance measures.*

Crnkovic, G., D. 2009. *Constructivist Research and Info-Computational Knowledge Generation*

Caplinskas, A., and Vasilecas, O. 2004.I *nformation systems research methodologies and models*

<http://www.inform.nu/Articles/Vol11/ISJv11p017-033Ellis486.pdf>

Android Developers, “What is the NDK?,” Available: <http://developer.android.com/sdk/ndk/overview.html>.

Holton, D., L. 2010. *Constructivism + Embodied Cognition = Enactivism: Theoretical and Practical Implications for Conceptual Change*

Floridi, L. 2004. *Informational Realism.*

Ellis, T., J., and Levy, Y. 2008*. Framework of Problem-Based Research: A Guide for Novice Researchers on the Development of a Research-Worthy Problem*. Fort Lauderdale, Florida, USA.

Suhonen, J. 2009. *Week 5: R&D methods in computing: action research, development research, design research and constructive research*.

Harrell, M. C., and Bradley, M. A. 2009. *Data Collection Methods: Semi-Structured Interviews and Focus Groups.* .

McClure, R., D. 2002. *Common data connection strategies effective in qualitative studies using action research in technical/operational training programs.*

Nunamaker, J., F.,Chen, M., and Purdin, D., M., T. 1990. Systems development in information systems research. .