

P3 Checklist

Exhibit - Is the exhibit ambivalent? Can it be interpreted in many ways?

- Does the exhibit produce an intriguing research question and claim? - Does the writer sufficiently describe the exhibit? Does he/she provide too much unnecessary description?

Research Question - Will the question allow the researcher to develop her own claim, a claim that could be debated? (As opposed to a question with an obvious or already settled answer) - Is the question too broad? Too narrow? - Does the question lead to specific and dynamic research?

Claim - Does the writer have a single overarching claim (thesis)? - Does the claim answer the research question?

- Is the claim analytical rather than evaluative? - Is the claim original? - By the end of the paper, has the claim been reiterated enough for you to fully understand it? - Are there counter-arguments the writer should take into account?

Research - Is there a mix of sources and source types (books, scholarly journal articles, etc)? - Is there a mix of source function (authorizing, illustrating, borrowing, extending)? - Has the writer conducted enough research to add his/her own claims to this conversation?

Evidence - Does the writer incorporate sources seamlessly into his/her paper? Does he/she introduce, cite, and engage with each quote? - Do he/she use each source to either provide critical background necessary to understand the eventual claim or to directly develop the claim? - Are sources used throughout the paper or mostly collected in one section? - Do sources all seem directly relevant to the writer's question/claim? - Are more sources needed for evidence/support of certain claims? - Does the writer close read the exhibit? Do these close readings complicate and develop the claims? - Does the writer rely too heavily on quotations? Does the writer need more quotations?

Structure - Does the current progression of the essay make sense to you? - Does each paragraph have a specific purpose (background, exhibit analysis, etc)? Is that purpose signaled early on in the paragraph? - Are paragraphs organized analytically or categorically? That is, are they organized around claims, or are they simply a collection of information? - Do paragraphs clearly build up to or develop a larger claim (even if the claim isn't explicitly mentioned until later in the essay)? - Are transitions between paragraphs clear? - Are transitions between sentences clear?

Motive - Does the writer identify a motive for his/her essay in the introduction? That is, does he/she make it clear why the reader should keep reading the essay? - Is the motive too extreme (stakes so high they are unbelievable) or too minimal (stakes so low they do not warrant further reading)?

Implications - Does the writer move beyond his main claim (thesis) in the conclusion to discuss the larger implications of that claim? - Are those implica-

tions believable? Are they too much of a leap? Are they interesting, exciting, or surprising? Do they leave you with a new appreciation of the writer's argument?

Citations - Does the writer use properly formatted in-text citations? - Does the writer include a properly formatted works cited page?

Introduction and Claims - Does the introduction engage the reader and encourage him/her to keep reading? - Does the conclusion leave the reader with a lasting impression of the essay?