

P1 Checklist

Passage Selection - Has the writer selected a passage or pattern that lends itself to different interpretations? - If the writer has selected a single passage, has he/she quoted the passage in a way (or place) that enables the reader to follow his/her interpretation? - If the writer has selected a pattern throughout several passages, has he/she fully described that pattern and shown sufficient evidence that it exists? Is there too little or too much context around each individual occurrence? - Does the writer provide sufficient description of the text's larger project, and explain the position of the passage(s) in relation to that project?

Close Reading - Does the writer engage with the specific language and/or form of the passage(s)? Does he/she pay close attention to things like words, images, rhetorical devices, argument progression, etc? - Do the writer's close readings build towards specific claims, or do they just examine various, unconnected aspects of the passage? - Do the close readings complicate and develop the claims? - Do the close readings connect the language of the essay to the meaning of the essay?

Argument - Does the writer have a single overarching claim (thesis)? - Is the claim evaluative or analytical? That is, does the claim simply seek to prove/disprove the examined text, or is it instead developing a new claim *about* the text? - Is the claim original? That is, does the writer read the text in a way that surprises you? - By the end of the paper, has the claim been reiterated enough for you to fully understand it? - Are there counter-arguments the writer should take into account?

Structure - Does the current progression of the essay make sense to you? - Does the writer state his/her main claim (thesis) in the beginning of the essay? If so, do the body paragraphs clearly signal that they are building towards that claim? - Does the writer instead state his/her main claim (thesis) at the end of essay? If so, do the body paragraphs guide the reader logically to that claim? - Does each paragraph have a specific purpose? Is that purpose signaled early on in the paragraph? - Are paragraphs organized analytically or categorically? That is, are they organized around claims, or are they simply a collection of information? - Are transitions between paragraphs clear? - Are transitions between sentences clear?

Evidence - Does the writer provide ample evidence (textual support) to prove him/her claim? - Does the writer rely too heavily on quotations? Does the writer need more quotations? - Does the writer engage with every quotation? Or does he/she simply drop in a quote and move on?

Motive - Does the writer identify a motive for his/her essay in the introduction? That is, does he/she make it clear why the reader should keep reading the essay? - Is the motive too extreme (stakes so high they are unbelievable) or too minimal (stakes so low they do not warrant further reading)?

Implications - Does the writer move beyond his/her main claim (thesis) in the conclusion to discuss the larger implications of that claim? - Are those implications believable? Are they too much of a leap? Are they interesting, exciting, or surprising? Do they leave you with a new appreciation of the writer's argument?