

P3 Checklist

Exhibit

- Is the exhibit ambivalent? Can it be interpreted in many ways?
- Does the exhibit produce an intriguing research question and claim?
- Does the writer sufficiently but not excessively describe the exhibit?

Research Question

- Will the question allow the researcher to develop her own claim, a claim that could be debated? (As opposed to a question with an obvious or already settled answer)
- Is the question manageable in scope (neither too broad nor too narrow)?
- Does the question lead to specific and dynamic research?

Claim

- Does the writer have a single overarching claim (thesis)?
- Does the claim answer the research question?
- Is the claim analytical rather than evaluative?
- Is the claim original?
- By the end of the paper, has the claim been reiterated enough for you to fully understand it?
- Are there counter-arguments the writer should take into account?

Research

- Is there a mix of sources and source types (books, scholarly journal articles, etc)?
- Is there a mix of source function (authorizing, illustrating, borrowing, extending)?
- Has the writer conducted enough research to add his/her own claims to this conversation?

Evidence

- Does the writer incorporate sources seamlessly into his/her paper? Does he/she introduce, cite, and engage with each quote?
- Do he/she use each source to either provide critical background necessary to understand the eventual claim or to directly develop the claim?
- Are sources used throughout the paper (rather than collected in one section)?
- Do sources all seem directly relevant to the writer's question/claim?
- Are there enough sources to support the writer's claims?
- Does the writer close read the exhibit? Do these close readings complicate and develop the claims?
- Does the writer use quotations sufficiently but not excessively?

Structure

- Does the current progression of the essay make sense to you?
- Does each paragraph have a specific purpose (background, exhibit analysis, etc)? Is that purpose signaled early on in the paragraph?
- Are paragraphs organized analytically rather than categorically? That is, are they organized around claims?
- Do paragraphs clearly build up to or develop a larger claim (even if the claim isn't explicitly mentioned until later in the essay)?
- Are transitions between paragraphs clear?
- Are transitions between sentences clear?

Motive

- Does the writer identify a motive for his/her essay in the introduction? That is, does he/she make it clear why the reader should keep reading the essay?
- Is the motive believable?

Implications

- Does the writer move beyond his main claim (thesis) in the conclusion to discuss the larger implications of that claim?
- Are those implications believable? Are they interesting, exciting, or surprising? Do they leave you with a new appreciation of the writer's argument?

Citations

- Does the writer use properly formatted in-text citations?
- Does the writer include a properly formatted works cited page?

Introduction and Claims

- Does the introduction engage the reader and encourage him/her to keep reading?
- Does the conclusion leave the reader with a lasting impression of the essay?