Studies citing ESC-DAG method

Indoor dust bacterial and fungal microbiota composition and allergic diseases: a scoping review

Javier Mancilla Galindo, MSc student
Supervisors: Inge Wouters and Alex Bossers
Examiner: Lidwien Smit

2024-05-29

Table of contents

Packages and session information

```r
if (!require("pacman", quietly = TRUE)) {
  install.packages("pacman")
}

pacman::p_load(
  tidyverse,    # Used for basic data handling and visualization.
  table1,       # Used for column labeling.
  readxl,       # Import data in xlsx format.
  gt,           # Print and save html tables.
  report        # Used to generate package citations in markdown format.
)
```

```
R version 4.4.0 (2024-04-24 ucrt)
Platform: x86_64-w64-mingw32/x64
Running under: Windows 11 x64 (build 22631)

Matrix products: default


locale:
[1] LC_COLLATE=Spanish_Mexico.utf8  LC_CTYPE=Spanish_Mexico.utf8
[3] LC_MONETARY=Spanish_Mexico.utf8 LC_NUMERIC=C
[5] LC_TIME=Spanish_Mexico.utf8

time zone: Europe/Berlin
tzcode source: internal

attached base packages:
[1] stats     graphics  grDevices utils     datasets  methods   base

other attached packages:
 [1] report_0.5.8    gt_0.10.1       readxl_1.4.3    table1_1.4.3
 [5] lubridate_1.9.3 forcats_1.0.0   stringr_1.5.1   dplyr_1.1.4
 [9] purrr_1.0.2     readr_2.1.5     tidyr_1.3.1     tibble_3.2.1
[13] ggplot2_3.5.1   tidyverse_2.0.0 pacman_0.5.1
```

Description

A list of papers citing the ESC-DAG method (Ferguson et al., 2020) were retrieved from PubMed on 25/05/2024, yielding a total of 48 records. Of these, only 22 papers published between 2023 and 2024 were assessed in order to focus on the most recent applications of this method.

Only 15 studies that explicitly declared having used this method were included for analysis. Thus, 7 studies were excluded for the following reasons:

Exclude	n
ESC-DAG not used	3
protocol	1
review	3

Studies included: (Antonsen et al., 2024; Campbell and Cullen, 2023; Corona et al., 2024; Ghazal and Soyiri, 2023; Guivarch et al., 2023; Lewis et al., 2023; Li et al., 2023; Liao et al., 2024; Liu et al., 2023; Lock et al., 2023; Peng et al., 2024; Prieto, 2024; Riseberg et al., 2023; Xiang et al., 2024; Zhu et al., 2023)

The full text, including main manuscript, supplementary material, and associated repositories were reviewed for the following characteristics which were assessed and recorded:

Characteristic	Definition	Possible values
Used DAG	Explicit mention of having used a DAG to guide study design/analysis	no; yes
Showed DAG	Presentation of a visual graphic or code for reproduction of graph in a visual display program.	no; yes
DAG code	Presentation of code for reproduction of DAG	no; yes
Documentation of DAG	Documentation of all steps for the production of DAG, as suggested by (Ferguson et al., 2020)	no; partial; yes
PICO/PECO question followed	Explicit mention of having followed a PICO/PECO question for retrieving papers for DAG construction	unknown; yes; other (i.e., PO question)

Results

Used DAG

Used DAG	n	Percentage
yes	15	100

Showed DAG

Showed DAG	n	Percentage
no	3	20
yes	12	80

Studies that presented a DAG: (Antonsen et al., 2024; Campbell and Cullen, 2023; Ghazal and Soyiri, 2023; Lewis et al., 2023; Li et al., 2023; Liu et al., 2023; Lock et al., 2023; Peng et al., 2024; Prieto, 2024; Riseberg et al., 2023; Xiang et al., 2024; Zhu et al., 2023)

DAG code

DAG code	n	Percentage
no	12	80
yes	3	20

Studies presenting DAG code: (Antonsen et al., 2024; Peng et al., 2024; Riseberg et al., 2023)

Documentation of DAG

Documentation of DAG	n	Percentage
no	6	40.0
partial	5	33.3
yes	4	26.7

Studies fully documenting DAG: (Antonsen et al., 2024; Campbell and Cullen, 2023; Lock et al., 2023; Riseberg et al., 2023)

Studies with partial documentation: (Lewis et al., 2023; Li et al., 2023; Peng et al., 2024; Prieto, 2024; Zhu et al., 2023)

PICO/PECO question followed

PICO/PECO question followed	n	Percentage
PO	1	6.7
unknown	11	73.3
yes	3	20.0

Studies explicitly using a PICO/PECO question: (Campbell and Cullen, 2023; Riseberg et al., 2023; Zhu et al., 2023)

Studies using a PO question: (Peng et al., 2024)

Package references

- Grolemund G, Wickham H (2011). "Dates and Times Made Easy with lubridate." *Journal of Statistical Software*, *40*(3), 1-25. https://www.jstatsoft.org/v40/i03/.
- Iannone R, Cheng J, Schloerke B, Hughes E, Lauer A, Seo J (2024). *gt: Easily Create Presentation-Ready Display Tables*. R package version 0.10.1, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=gt.
- Makowski D, Lüdecke D, Patil I, Thériault R, Ben-Shachar M, Wiernik B (2023). "Automated Results Reporting as a Practical Tool to Improve Reproducibility and Methodological Best Practices Adoption." *CRAN*. https://easystats.github.io/report/.
- Müller K, Wickham H (2023). *tibble: Simple Data Frames*. R package version 3.2.1, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=tibble.
- R Core Team (2024). *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing*. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. https://www.R-project.org/.
- Rich B (2023). *table1: Tables of Descriptive Statistics in HTML*. R package version 1.4.3, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=table1.
- Rinker TW, Kurkiewicz D (2018). *pacman: Package Management for R*. version 0.5.0, http://github.com/trinker/pacman.
- Wickham H (2016). *ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis*. Springer-Verlag New York. ISBN 978-3-319-24277-4, https://ggplot2.tidyverse.org.
- Wickham H (2023). *forcats: Tools for Working with Categorical Variables (Factors)*. R package version 1.0.0, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=forcats.
- Wickham H (2023). *stringr: Simple, Consistent Wrappers for Common String Operations*. R package version 1.5.1, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=stringr.
- Wickham H, Averick M, Bryan J, Chang W, McGowan LD, François R, Grolemund G, Hayes A, Henry L, Hester J, Kuhn M, Pedersen TL, Miller E, Bache SM, Müller K, Ooms J, Robinson D, Seidel DP, Spinu V, Takahashi K, Vaughan D, Wilke C, Woo K, Yutani H (2019). "Welcome to the tidyverse." *Journal of Open Source Software*, *4*(43), 1686. doi:10.21105/joss.01686 https://doi.org/10.21105/joss.01686.
- Wickham H, Bryan J (2023). *readxl: Read Excel Files*. R package version 1.4.3, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=readxl.
- Wickham H, François R, Henry L, Müller K, Vaughan D (2023). *dplyr: A Grammar of Data Manipulation*. R package version 1.1.4, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=dplyr.
- Wickham H, Henry L (2023). *purrr: Functional Programming Tools*. R package version 1.0.2, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=purrr.
- Wickham H, Hester J, Bryan J (2024). *readr: Read Rectangular Text Data*. R package version 2.1.5, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=readr.
- Wickham H, Vaughan D, Girlich M (2024). *tidyr: Tidy Messy Data*. R package version 1.3.1, https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=tidyr.

Study references

Antonsen, E., Reynolds, R.J., Charvat, J., Connell, E., Monti, A., Petersen, D., Nartey, N., Anton, W., Abukmail, A., Marotta, K., Van Baalen, M., Buckland, D.M., 2024. Causal diagramming for assessing human system risk in spaceflight. npj Microgravity 10, 32. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41526-024-00375-7

Campbell, T., Cullen, B., 2023. Estimating the effect of physical activity on cognitive function within the UK Biobank cohort. International Journal of Epidemiology 52, 1592–1611. https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dyad009

Corona, K., Yang, T., Dunton, G., Toledo-Corral, C., Grubbs, B., Eckel, S.P., Johnston, J., Chavez, T., Lerner, D., Lurvey, N., Al-Marayati, L., Habre, R., Farzan, S.F., Breton, C.V., Bastain, T.M., 2024. The Role of Social Support and Acculturation Factors on Postpartum Mental Health Among Latinas in the MADRES Pregnancy Cohort. Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health 26, 72–80. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10903-023-01542-w

Ferguson, K.D., McCann, M., Katikireddi, S.V., Thomson, H., Green, M.J., Smith, D.J., Lewsey, J.D., 2020. Evidence synthesis for constructing directed acyclic graphs (ESC-DAGs): a novel and systematic method for building directed acyclic graphs. International Journal of Epidemiology 49, 322–329. https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dyz150

Ghazal, S., Soyiri, I.N., 2023. The effect of geographical variation in income measures on measles-mumps-rubella uptake and coverage in England; a protocol for an ecological study. PLOS ONE 18, e0280008. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0280008

Guivarch, C., Cissé, A.H., Charles, M.-A., Heude, B., Lauzon-Guillain, B. de, 2023. Parental feeding practices as potential moderating or mediating factors in the associations between children's early and later growth. International Journal of Obesity 47, 190–196. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41366-023-01255-y

Lewis, K.M., De Stavola, B.L., Cunningham, S., Hardelid, P., 2023. Socioeconomic position, bronchiolitis and asthma in children: counterfactual disparity measures from a national birth cohort study. International Journal of Epidemiology 52, 476–488. https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dyac193

Li, Y., Wen, H., Xiong, C., Lin, C., Yang, X., Wang, D., Fan, R., Liu, J., Zhao, X., Liu, Y., Liu, X., 2023. Medication Nonadherence and Risk of Violence to Others Among Patients With Schizophrenia in Western China. JAMA Network Open 6, e235891. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2023.5891

Liao, R., Hu, L., Yu, J., Chen, Y., Chen, M., Yan, J., Li, X., Han, X., Jike, C., Yu, G., Wang, J., Liao, Q., Xia, L., Bai, X., Shi, J., Jiang, T., Du, L., Zhang, T., 2024. Association between TB delay and TB treatment outcomes in HIV-TB co-infected patients: a study based on the multilevel propensity score method. BMC Infectious Diseases 24, 457. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12879-024-09328-7

Liu, L., Wu, Y., Xian, X., Feng, J., Mao, Y., Balakrishnan, S., Weber, A.M., Darmstadt, G.L., Chen, Y., Sylvia, S., Zhou, H., Rozelle, S., 2023. In-Hospital Formula Feeding Hindered Exclusive Breastfeeding: Breastfeeding Self-Efficacy as a Mediating Factor. Nutrients 15, 5074. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu15245074

Lock, S.K., Legge, S.E., Kappel, D.B., Willcocks, I.R., Helthuis, M., Jansen, J., Walters, J.T.R., Owen, M.J., O'Donovan, M.C., Pardiñas, A.F., 2023. Mediation and longitudinal analysis to interpret the association between clozapine pharmacokinetics, pharmacogenomics, and absolute neutrophil count. Schizophrenia 9, 74. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41537-023-00404-6

Peng, Z., Apfelbacher, C., Brandstetter, S., Eils, R., Kabesch, M., Lehmann, I., Trump, S., Wellmann, S., Genuneit, J., 2024. Directed acyclic graph for epidemiological studies in childhood food allergy: Construction, user's guide, and application. Allergy 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/all.16025

Prieto, L., 2024. Exploring the Influence of Social Class and Sex on Self-Reported Health: Insights from a Representative Population-Based Study. Life 14, 184. https://doi.org/10.3390/life14020184

Riseberg, E., Melamed, R.D., James, K.A., Alderete, T.L., Corlin, L., 2023. Development and application of an evidence-based directed acyclic graph to evaluate the associations between metal mixtures and cardiometabolic outcomes. Epidemiologic Methods 12, 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1515/em-2022-0133

Xiang, Y., Xu, H., Chen, H., Tang, D., Huang, Z., Zhang, Y., Wang, Z., Wang, Z., Yangla, Han, M., Yin, J., Xiao, X., Zhao, X., 2024. Tea consumption and attenuation of biological aging: a longitudinal analysis from two cohort studies. The Lancet Regional Health - Western Pacific 42, 100955. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lanwpc.2023.100955

Zhu, X., Qucuo, N., Zhang, N., Tang, D., Hu, Y., Xie, X., Zhao, X., Meng, Q., Chen, L., Jiang, X., Zhuoma, D., Zeng, Q., Xiao, X., 2023. Dietary patterns and metabolic dysfunction-associated fatty liver disease in China's multi-ethnic regions. Journal of Health, Population and Nutrition 42, 141. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41043-023-00485-0