Glider Optimization with Lifting Line Theory and Airfoil Wind Tunnel Data

Jean de Becdelievre

March 26, 2020

1 Nomenclature

W : glider weight L, C_L : lift, lift coefficient

 $D, Di, D_0, C_D, C_{Di}, C_{D_0}$: drag, induced drag, friction drag, and respective coefficients

 $\begin{array}{cccc} b & & : & \text{wing span} \\ M & & : & \text{wing area} \end{array}$

 \mathcal{R} : wing aspect ratio

y : span-wise coordinate, ranging from -b/2 to b/2 emapped span-wise coordinate ranging from 0 to π

 N_{theta} : Number of span-wise sections $\Gamma(y)$ or $\Gamma(\theta)$: span-wise strength of vortex sheet

 A_n : nth coefficient of the Fourier expansion of Γ N_A : Number of Fourier coefficients considered for Γ

M: matrix of size N_{θ} , N_A such that: $\forall k, n \ M_{k,n} = \sin(n\theta_k)$

M': matrix of size N_{θ} , N_A such that: $\forall k, n$ $M'_{k,n} = n \sin(n\theta_k) / \sin(\theta_k)$

A : vector of size N_A containing all the A_n : span-wise angle of attack distribution

 $\alpha_i(y)$ or $\alpha_i(\theta)$: span-wise lift-induced angle of attack distribution

c(y) or $c(\theta)$: span-wise chord distribution

 $c_l(y)$ or $c_l(\theta)$: span-wise lift coefficient distribution $c_d(y)$ or $c_d(\theta)$: span-wise drag coefficient distribution

V : airspeed

 C_L^{2D} and $C_{D_0}^{2D}$: fit of 2D airfoil data Re : Reynolds number

 $y_k, \theta_k, \alpha_k, \alpha_{i_k}, c_k, c_{l_k}$: $y, \theta, \alpha, \alpha_i, c, c_l$ at the kth span section

2 Optimization Problem

This code aims at optimizing the wing planform and airspeed of a glider of a given weight W and fixed airfoil section for maximum L/D. 2D wind tunnel data of the airfoil is available, i.e. the functions $C_L^{2D}(\alpha, Re)$ and $C_{D_0}^{2D}(\alpha, Re)$ are provided.

The optimization problem reads:

$$\begin{aligned} & \underset{V,b,c,\alpha,A}{\text{minimize}} \\ & V_{L,c,\alpha,A} \\ & \text{subject to} \end{aligned} \qquad \begin{aligned} & C_L = \frac{W}{1/2\rho V^2 S} \\ & c_l(y) = C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha(y) + \alpha_i(y), Re(y)\right) \\ & c_{d_0}(y) = C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha(y) - \alpha_i(y), Re(y)\right) \\ & C_L = \frac{1}{S} \int_{-b/2}^{b/2} c(y') c_l(y') dy' \\ & C_{D_0} = \frac{1}{S} \int_{-b/2}^{b/2} c(y') c_{d_0}(y') dy' \\ & C_{D_i} = \frac{C_L^2}{\pi \mathcal{R} \epsilon} \\ & \mathcal{R} = \frac{b^2}{S} \\ & \epsilon = \left(\sum_{n=1}^{N_A} n \left(\frac{A_n}{A_1}\right)^2\right)^{-1} \\ & \alpha_i(\theta) = -\frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} n A_n \frac{\sin(n\theta)}{\sin(\theta)} \\ & \forall \theta \in [0, \pi] \end{aligned} \qquad \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} A_n \sin(\theta) = \frac{1}{c(\theta)} C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta) - \alpha_i(\theta), Re(\theta)\right) \end{aligned}$$

where θ is a span parametrization such that:

$$\forall y \in \left[\frac{-b}{2}, \frac{b}{2}\right], \quad \exists \theta \in [0, \pi], \quad y = \frac{b}{2}\cos\theta$$

We discretize the span into N_{theta} span-wise sections, and perform several simplifications detailed in the rest of this document. The final optimization problem is:

minimize
$$\frac{V^{2}\pi}{8} \sum_{n=1}^{N_{A}} nA_{n}^{2} + V^{2}b \sum_{k=1}^{N_{\theta}} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c_{k} C_{D_{0}}^{2D} \left(\alpha_{k} + \alpha_{i_{k}}, Re(c_{k}, v_{k})\right)$$
subject to
$$\sum_{n=1}^{N_{A}} M_{k,n} A_{n} = c_{k} C_{L}^{2D} \left(\alpha_{k} - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_{A}} M'_{k,n} A_{n}, Re(c_{k}, v_{k})\right)$$
 for $k \in 1, \dots, N_{\theta}$

$$A_{1} = \frac{8W}{\rho V^{2}b\pi}$$

Or, in an even more compact form by plugging in the last constraint for A_1 in both other equations:

minimize
$$\frac{W}{\rho b} + \frac{V^2 \pi}{8} \sum_{n=2}^{N_A} n A_n^2 + V^2 b \sum_{k=1}^{N_\theta} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c_k C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha_k - \frac{1}{4b} M_{k,1}' \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b \pi} - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} M_{k,n}' A_n, Re(c_k, v_k) \right)$$
subject to
$$M_{k,1} \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b \pi} + \sum_{n=2}^{N_A} M_{k,n} A_n =$$

$$c_k C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha_k - \frac{1}{4b} M_{k,1}' \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b \pi} - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=2}^{N_A} M_{k,n}' A_n, Re(c_k, v_k) \right)$$
 for $k \in 1, \dots, N_\theta$

3 Lifting Line Theory

From Kutta-Joukovsky theorem:

$$\Gamma(y) = \frac{l(y)}{\rho V} = \frac{1/2\rho V^2 c(y)c_l(y)}{\rho V} = \frac{1}{2}Vc(y)c_l(y)$$

The strength of the vortex sheet Γ is defined on a closed interval [-b/2, b/2], which we remap to $[\pi, 0]$. On this interval, a Fourier series expansion can be written:

$$y = \frac{b}{2}\cos(\theta)$$

$$\Gamma(\theta) = \frac{1}{2}V \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} A_n \sin(n\theta), \ c_l(\theta) = \frac{1}{c(y)} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} A_n \sin(n\theta)$$

Using Biot and Savart law, the induced angle of attack on at each span-wise coordinate

can be written as:

$$\alpha_{i}(y) = \frac{-1}{4\pi V} \int_{-b/2}^{b/2} \frac{\frac{d\Gamma(t)}{dt}}{y - t} dt$$

$$\alpha_{i}(\theta) = \frac{-1}{4\pi V} \int_{\pi}^{0} \frac{\left(\frac{d\Gamma(\Theta)}{d\Theta} \frac{d\Theta}{dt}\right)}{b/2 \cos(\theta) - b/2 \cos(\Theta)} \frac{dt}{d\Theta} d\Theta$$

$$= \frac{1}{2b\pi V} \int_{0}^{\pi} \frac{\frac{d\Gamma(\Theta)}{d\Theta}}{\cos(\theta) - \cos(\Theta)} d\Theta$$

$$\frac{d\Gamma(\Theta)}{d\Theta} = \frac{d}{d\Theta} \frac{1}{2} V \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} A_{n} \sin(n\Theta) = \frac{1}{2} V \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} n A_{n} \cos(n\Theta)$$

$$\alpha_{i}(\theta) = \frac{1}{2b\pi} \int_{0}^{\pi} \frac{\frac{1}{2} V \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} n A_{n} \cos(n\Theta)}{\cos(\theta) - \cos(\Theta)} d\Theta$$

$$= \frac{1}{4b\pi} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} n A_{n} \int_{0}^{\pi} \frac{\cos(n\Theta)}{\cos(\theta) - \cos(\Theta)} d\Theta$$

Directly plugging in the solution of the Glauert integral:

$$\alpha_i(\theta) = \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} n A_n \frac{\sin(n\theta)}{\sin(\theta)}$$

The value of the lift coefficient on each section is given by the fit of the 2D airfoil data:

$$c_l(\theta) = C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta) - \alpha_i(\theta), Re(\theta) \right)$$

Plugging in the value of c_l in terms of the Fourier coefficients of Γ , we obtain the general equation that needs to be solved to find the $A_{1:+\infty}$ is:

$$\sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} A_n \sin(n\theta) = c(\theta) C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta) - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} n A_n \frac{\sin(n\theta)}{\sin(\theta)}, Re(\theta) \right)$$

If we only compute A_n for $n \in [0, N_A]$, we can choose a discrete set of θ_k for $k \in [0, N_\theta]$:

$$MA = cC_L^{2D} \left(\alpha - \frac{1}{4b} M'A, Re(c, V) \right)$$
 (1)

with:

c and α two vectors of size N_{θ} containing the chord and angle of attack at each θ_k M and a M' two matrices of size N_{θ} , N_A such that:

$$\forall k \in \{0, \dots, N_{\theta}\}, \forall n \in \{0, \dots, N_A\} \quad M_{k,n} = \sin(n\theta_k) \quad M'_{k,n} = n\sin(n\theta_k)/\sin(\theta_k)$$

A a vector of size N_A containing all the A_n

4 Lift To Drag Ratio

$$\frac{L}{D} = \frac{C_L}{C_D} = \frac{C_L}{C_{Di} + C_{D0}}$$

Let us start with C_L :

$$C_{L} = \frac{1}{S} \int_{b/2}^{b/2} c(y)c_{l}(y)dy$$

$$= \frac{b}{2S} \int_{0}^{\pi} \sum_{n=1}^{+N_{A}} A_{n} \sin(n\theta) \sin(\theta)d\theta$$

$$= \frac{b}{2S} \sum_{n=1}^{+N_{A}} A_{n} \int_{0}^{\pi} \sin(n\theta) \sin(\theta)d\theta$$
(2)

Since the Fourier basis is orthogonal, we have for any k, n:

$$\int_0^{\pi} \sin(n\theta) \sin(k\theta) d\theta = \begin{cases} 0 & k \neq n \\ \frac{\pi}{2} & k = n \end{cases}$$

Therefore:

$$C_L = \frac{b\pi A_1}{4S} \tag{3}$$

Now, to get C_{Di} , we look at it's span-wise distribution c_{di} :

$$c_{d_i}(\theta) = c_l(\theta)\alpha_i(\theta)$$

$$= \frac{1}{4bc(\theta)} \sum_{n_a=0}^{+\infty} n_a A_{n_a} \frac{\sin(n_a \theta)}{\sin(\theta)} \sum_{n_b=0}^{+\infty} A_{n_b} \sin(n_b \theta)$$

Integrating to get C_{Di} :

$$C_{Di} = \frac{b}{2S} \int_{0}^{\pi} c_{d_{i}}(\theta) c(\theta) d\theta$$

$$C_{Di} = \frac{b}{2S} \int_{0}^{\pi} \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n_{a}=0}^{N_{A}} n_{a} A_{n_{a}} \frac{\sin(n_{a}\theta)}{\sin(\theta)} \sum_{n_{b}=0}^{N_{A}} A_{n_{b}} \sin(n_{b}\theta) \sin(\theta) d\theta$$

$$C_{Di} = \frac{1}{8S} \int_{0}^{\pi} \sum_{n_{a}=0}^{N_{A}} \sum_{n_{b}=0}^{N_{A}} n_{a} A_{n_{a}} \sin(n_{a}\theta) \sin(n_{b}\theta) d\theta$$
(4)

Using again that the Fourier basis functions are orthogonal, we obtain:

$$C_{Di} = \frac{\pi}{16S} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} nA_n^2 \tag{5}$$

Finally, C_{D_0} is also obtained by integration:

$$c_{d_0}(\theta) = C_{D_0}^{2D} (\alpha(\theta) - \alpha_i(\theta), Re(\theta))$$

$$C_{D_0}(\theta) = \frac{b}{2S} \int_0^{\pi} c(\theta) C_{D_0}^{2D} (\alpha(\theta) - \alpha_i(\theta), Re(\theta)) \sin(\theta) d\theta$$

$$C_{D_0}(\theta) = \frac{b}{2S} \int_0^{\pi} c(\theta) C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta) - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} n A_n \frac{\sin(n\theta)}{\sin(\theta)}, Re(\theta) \right) \sin(\theta) d\theta$$

If $C_{D_0}^{2D}$ has an analytic expression, this can be simplified further. In the our case however, it is a general function fitted from wind tunnel data, therefore the integration is performed numerically with Clenshaw–Curtis quadrature.

Calling $w_{\theta}^{(k)}$ and θ_k respectively the weights and the points of this quadrature, we get:

$$C_{D_0}(\theta) = \frac{b}{2S} \sum_{k=1}^{N_{\theta}} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c(\theta_k) C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta_k) - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} n A_n \frac{\sin(n\theta_k)}{\sin(\theta_k)}, Re(\theta_k) \right)$$
(6)

Finally:

$$\frac{L}{D} = \frac{C_L}{C_{Di} + C_{D0}}$$

$$\frac{L}{D} = \frac{\frac{b\pi A_1}{4S}}{\frac{\pi}{16S} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} nA_n^2 + \frac{b}{2S} \sum_{k=1}^{N_{\theta}} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c(\theta_k) C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta_k) - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} nA_n \frac{\sin(n\theta_k)}{\sin(\theta_k)}, Re(\theta_k)\right)}{\frac{L}{D}} = \left(\frac{1}{4bA_1} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} nA_n^2 + \frac{2}{\pi A_1} \sum_{k=1}^{N_{\theta}} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c(\theta_k) C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta_k) - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} nA_n \frac{\sin(n\theta_k)}{\sin(\theta_k)}, Re(\theta_k)\right)\right)^{-1}$$
(7)

5 Optimization Problem

We start with:

minimize
$$(C_L/(C_{D_i} + C_{D_0}))^{-1}$$
 subject to
$$C_L = \frac{W}{1/2\rho V^2 S}$$

$$c_l(y) = C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha(y) + \alpha_i(y), Re(y)\right)$$

$$c_{d_0}(y) = C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha(y) - \alpha_i(y), Re(y)\right)$$

$$C_L = \frac{1}{S} \int_{-b/2}^{b/2} c(y') c_l(y') dy'$$

$$C_{D_0} = \frac{1}{S} \int_{-b/2}^{b/2} c(y') c_{d_0}(y') dy'$$

$$C_{D_i} = \frac{C_L^2}{\pi \mathcal{R} \epsilon}$$

$$\mathcal{R} = \frac{b^2}{S}$$

$$\epsilon = \left(\sum_{n=1}^{N_A} n \left(\frac{A_n}{A_1}\right)^2\right)^{-1}$$

$$\alpha_i(\theta) = -\frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} n A_n \frac{\sin(n\theta)}{\sin(\theta)}$$

$$\forall \theta \in [0, \pi]$$

$$\sum_{n=1}^{N_A} A_n \sin(\theta) = \frac{1}{c(\theta)} C_L^{2D} \left(\alpha(\theta) - \alpha_i(\theta), Re(\theta)\right)$$

Discretizing, and using equations 3, 5, 6, 7, we get:

minimize
$$V_{V,b,c,\alpha,A}$$

$$\frac{1}{4bA_1} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} nA_n^2 + \frac{2}{\pi A_1} \sum_{k=1}^{N_\theta} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c_k C_{D_0}^{2D} \left(\alpha_k - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} nA_n \frac{\sin(n\theta_k)}{\sin(\theta_k)}, Re(\theta_k) \right)$$
(8) subject to
$$MA = cC_L^{2D} \left(\alpha - \frac{1}{4b} M'A, Re(c, V) \right)$$
(9)
$$A_1 = \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b\pi}$$
(10)

Using 10 to simplify 8 further, we obtain:

minimize
$$V^{2}\pi \sum_{n=1}^{N_{A}} nA_{n}^{2} + V^{2}b \sum_{k=1}^{N_{\theta}} w_{\theta}^{(k)} c_{k} C_{D_{0}}^{2D} \left(\alpha_{k} - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_{A}} nA_{n} \frac{\sin(n\theta_{k})}{\sin(\theta_{k})}, Re(\theta_{k}) \right)$$
subject to
$$MA = cC_{L}^{2D} \left(\alpha_{k} - \frac{1}{4b} M' A_{n}, Re(\theta_{k}) \right)$$

$$A_{1} = \frac{8W}{\rho V^{2}b\pi}$$

$$(13)$$

because:

$$\frac{1}{4bA_1} = \frac{\rho V^2 \pi}{8W}$$
$$\frac{\pi}{2A_1} = \frac{\rho V^2 b}{W}$$

Finally, we incorporate 13 into the objective function and the constraint.

$$\begin{aligned} & \underset{V,b,c,\alpha,A}{\text{minimize}} & & \frac{W}{\rho b} + \frac{V^2 \pi}{8} \sum_{n=2}^{N_A} n A_n^2 + V^2 b \sum_{k=1}^{N_\theta} w_\theta^{(k)} c_k C_{D_0}{}^{2D} \left(\alpha_k - \frac{1}{4b} M_{k,1}' \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b \pi} - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=1}^{N_A} M_{k,n}' A_n, Re(c_k, v_k) \right) \\ & \text{subject to} & & M_{k,1} \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b \pi} + \sum_{n=2}^{N_A} M_{k,n} A_n = \\ & & c_k C_L{}^{2D} \left(\alpha_k - \frac{1}{4b} M_{k,1}' \frac{8W}{\rho V^2 b \pi} - \frac{1}{4b} \sum_{n=2}^{N_A} M_{k,n}' A_n, Re(c_k, v_k) \right) & \text{for } k \in 1, \dots, N_\theta \end{aligned}$$