



Yale University Department of Music

Binary Variants of Early Classic Sonata Form

Author(s): R. M. Longyear

Source: *Journal of Music Theory*, Vol. 13, No. 2 (Winter, 1969), pp. 162-185

Published by: Duke University Press on behalf of the Yale University Department of Music

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/842985>

Accessed: 15/12/2009 04:00

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=duke>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Duke University Press and Yale University Department of Music are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of Music Theory*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Binary Variants

of

The essentially binary origins of Classic-era sonata form have been recognized by legions of writers. Yet their attention has been principally focused on the normative sonata-form movement with exposition, development, and recapitulation, and on the numerous possible variations within such a structure. The purely binary movement, comprised of two complementary if not always equal sections, has received less attention.*1

Newman has indicated that the binary-ternary question is "one of the most fluid and flexible aspects of 'sonata form' throughout the classic Era", and describes the typical simple form:

. . . Each "half" is marked off by repeat signs and the two halves are roughly complementary, both thematically and tonally. That is, the first half usually presents an initial

Early Classic

Sonata Form

R. M. LONGYEAR

idea, an extension through phrase groupings, passage work, and sequential modulations to the dominant or relative key, continues with transpositions and sequential modulations that return circuitously to the home key from its underside, as it were, then literally repeats the corresponding dominant or relative measures and closing figures of the first half, in the home key.*2

Kamien, avoiding the differentiation between "binary" and "ternary" sonata-form movements, divides the classification of the second part of the movement into two categories: the first, usually described as having a "development" and a "complete recapitulation", and distinguished by having the first measure of the exposition returning on the tonic chord seven or more measures after the beginning of the second part, with

no perfect cadence to the tonic preceding this return, and a second type in which these phenomena do not occur. Of the 70 sonatas published between 1742 and 1774 in his sample, 57% are in the first category. The remaining 43% show a variety of approaches, but only 17% contain no return of the exposition in the home tonic. We can thus infer that only 17% of the first sonata-form movements in the keyboard sonatas in the period under discussion will be in truly binary form.*3

Kamien has also shown that throughout the period of the sonatas he has examined there is no significant divergence in binary or ternary procedure between early and later examples comparable to the differing treatments of the exposition.*4 In the most recent detailed investigation of the views on sonata form by Classic-era theorists, Ritzel concluded that "the investigation of the second part of a [movement] is dissatisfying in Classic-era theory".*5 In the principal primary source that Ritzel overlooked, Francesco Galeazzi's *Elementi Teorico-Prattici di Musica* (Volume II, 1796), the emphasis is on the conventional "exposition-development-recapitulation" idea with the admission that the recapitulation can be curtailed by being begun with what we would call the "second theme" in order to avoid a composition which would be too long.*6

The most common variant of sonata form which would fit a mathematical definition of "binary" is not a true binary sonata form at all. Prout has defined this form as "abridged sonata form", in which after the close of the exposition in the dominant or related key the exposition is recapitulated in the tonic, with no development or, at the most, a few measures to serve as a bridge passage from exposition to recapitulation, from dominant to tonic.*7 A representative early Classic illustration of this "abridged sonata form" is the first movement of Domenico Alberti's F major cembalo sonata, II₁ in Wörmann's thematic catalogue.*8 Three measures (22-24), based on the opening of the first theme, serve to lead from the exposition, ending in the dominant, to the recapitulation, beginning in the tonic. There are interesting subsidiary tonal axes in this movement: supertonic in the transition (mm. 10-11) balanced by major and minor forms of the subdominant in the recapitulation (mm. 29-30); tonic minor in the "second theme area" (mm. 15-17; 41-43) and the flatted submediant of the new key (m. 14) balanced by flatted submediant of the tonic (mm. 37, 39).

The true binary sonata form is identifiable by the following characteristics which supplement the descriptions cited above

by Newman and Kamien:

(1) The second half of the movement features first-theme material at its opening, but not in the home tonic. The chief variant occurs when the movement is in minor with its first half closing in major; the major form of the first theme begins the second half of the movement.

(2) The return of the tonic coincides with the reprise of second-theme material. Often this return is prepared by the coincidence of the transition motive of the exposition with the beginning of a retransition to the home tonic.

(3) Several sonata-form movements contain no return of the opening of the exposition of the home tonic where it would be expected and show, in the first part of the second half of the movement, several traits typical of binary forms, yet are not binary forms themselves. Such movements include the following types:

(a) Movements with a recapitulation of the opening of the exposition in a tonality other than the tonic, usually the subdominant (C. P. E. Bach, fourth "Prussian" sonata, first movement; François Martin, Symphony in G minor Op. 4 No. 2, third movement);

(b) Movements containing a "mirror" recapitulation. A good illustration of this procedure can be seen in the first movement of Mozart's Symphony No. 20, K. 133, the structure of which can be outlined as first theme – transition – second theme (dominant) – development, with transitional material emphasized – second theme (tonic) – first theme (tonic).

(c) A recapitulation, after an extensive development, that begins with second-theme material in the tonic. A good early Classic example is the first movement of J. C. Bach's Sinfonia in G minor, Op. 6 No. 6, and other instances from both the early and High Classic periods will be subsequently discussed in this study. This is also true of several 19th-century sonata-form movements, such as the first movements of Chopin's B \flat minor, B minor, and G minor sonatas, and several similar movements by Brahms such as the first movements of his A major Serenade, Op. 16, and C major Trio, Op. 87 as well as the finale of his first symphony.

(4) A surprisingly high proportion of binary sonata-form movements and the non-binary movements as described in (3) above are in the minor mode. This cannot be explained as archaism, with the minor mode and binary form representing the late Baroque (Domenico Scarlatti, Carlos Seixas) and the major mode representing "galant" elements with a concomitant sonata-form structure that embraces exposition, development, and recapitulation. A study of the sonatas of Giovanni Benedetto Platti (ca.1700-1763)*9 shows that ternary sonata form is clearly distinguishable in those fast sonata movements in minor that occur within the framework of the Baroque sonata da chiesa and its slow-fast-slow-fast order of movements: the fourth sonata in Torrefranca's collection shows this most clearly, for its first fast movement is in ternary sonata form although its texture is quasi-fugal. On the other hand, the only sonata in minor with both its movements in binary form is the "advanced" tenth sonata in A minor, with its order of movements fast-slow-fast. The same lack of correlation between binary form, the minor mode, and Baroque archaism is evident in the suite-like D minor sonata, Op.3 No. 4, by Francesco Maria Rutini (1723-1797), wherein the first movement is in ternary sonata form (albeit with its recapitulation in the subdominant) and is connected to a giga which is followed by a minuet, and all the movements are in D minor. Binary form is strikingly evident, however, in the "progressive" (as shown by its use of the Alberti bass) first movement of Rutini's Op.3 No. 5: in this movement new motivic material is substituted for what should be the reprise of the second theme in the tonic.

*10

Four questions present themselves in an examination of the true binary sonata form:

(1) In the first half of the movement, is there a thematic-tonal hierarchy analogous to the exposition of the sonata form, and how is this reproduced in the second part?

(2) To what extent is the second part of the movement a repetition, albeit transposed, of the first part? This question is particularly interesting in discussing minor-mode movements when the first part ends in the mediant and the second part in tonic minor.

(3) To what extent can the first part of the second half of the movement be construed as a development?

(4) In addition to the customary axis of tonic – dominant (or mediant) of the first half balanced by dominant (mediant) – sub-dominant – tonic of the second half, are there subsidiary tonal axes which contribute to the tonal balance of the movement as a whole? Such axes have been already cited in the discussion of Alberti's F major cembalo sonata.

In discussing the first question, I do not intend to revive the outmoded terminology of "principal" and "subordinate" themes. Thematic-tonal hierarchy rather implies the presence or absence of the process that occurs in the customary sonata-form exposition, and whether the themes, motives, or thematic or motivic units fill some kind of function within the exposition. Quite easily discernible in the early Classic sonata form are initial and closing ideas in each section, but what takes place between the ideas often radically varies from one work to another. Students of sonata form well know the problems of identifying a "second theme", of finding where the transition stops and the second theme begins *11, or in assigning functions to all the motives and motive-complexes in the musical structure of the work. One cannot even trace with certainty a chronological development of the sonata-form exposition, for thematic hierarchies can be clearly evident in some movements and not in others in sonata forms written in the same year or even in the same sonata.*12

The overture to Gluck's *Alceste* (1767) is one of the best examples of a non-hierarchic binary form, for it is made up of groups of thematic or motivic complexes. Choron and LeFage *13 distinguished the Gluckian overture by its contrasting ideas rather than by its adherence to sonata form. Excluding the section beginning at measure 123, which serves as a transition directly into Act I, the overture is in two nearly equal halves with neither double bar nor caesura separating them. (See Figure 1.) The absence of thematic hierarchy is further shown by the abruptness of the modulations to the sections (4A) in mediant major. Two portions of separate motive-complexes are related (see Example 1), but the second of these is a complementary statement of the former rather than a mere transposition. In Section 3 of the overture, too independent to be called a transition, the new tonic (A minor) is implied by its dominant, and even in the concluding section 5 the effect of the tonic needs to be reinforced with a pedal point. The statements of section 4a also show the mediant axes between the two halves and interrupt the expected tonal progression tonic to dominant in the first part and dominant to tonic in the second.

FIGURE

1

GLUCK: OVERTURE TO ALCESTE

FIRST PART (60 mm.)

Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center
1a (1-5)	d: i
1b (6-8)	i
1c (9-11)	V
2a (12-17)	iv-i
2b (18-23)	i-v ₆
2c (24-28)	mod. to a
3 (29-38)	a: $\frac{i}{V}$ (E pedal)
4A (39-42)	III
4B (43-53)	III-V
5 (54-60)	$\frac{iv-V-i}{i}$ (A pedal)

SECOND PART (62 mm.)

Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center
1a (61-65)	a: i
1b (66-68)	i
1c (69-71)	V
2a (72-77)	i-V
2b (78-85)	V-V of iv
2c (86-90)	mod. to d
3 (91-100)	d: $\frac{i}{V}$ (A pedal)
4A (101-104)	III
4B (105-115)	III-V
5 (116-122)	$\frac{iv-V-i}{i}$ (D pedal)

3 as transition to opening of
Act I (123-128)

NB. In this and subsequent illustrations, capital letters indicate the major mode, lower case letters the minor mode.

EXAMPLE

1

GLUCK: OVERTURE TO ALCESTE

2b (mm. 18-21)

4B (mm. 43-46)

A developing stage of sonata-form hierarchy is shown in the third movement of C. P. E. Bach's sonata in F minor, Wq 57/6, published in 1781,*14 (See Figure 2.) The opening idea is a theme, though continued by Fortspinnung rather than by phrase-construction, and theme 5 (mm. 30-36) is a definite closing idea tonally and thematically. However, themes 2, 3, and 4 are motivic, disjoint, juxtaposed independent ideas separated by definite cadences and can be considered a "second theme-group" only by position and tonality. There is a definite transition, beginning with the statement of the first two measures of the opening theme (mm. 9-10) and ending with a rhythmically and tonally significant figure (m. 16). The goal of the exposition is mediant major. At the beginning of the second part of the movement, the opening idea is stated in F major*15 (which serves as V of subdominant minor), is spun out rather than developed, and arrives at the dominant of F minor (m. 46) with the rhythmic figure of the close of the transition (m. 50) firmly establishing tonic minor. The remainder of the movement is virtually the same as the corresponding portion of the first part, but in tonic minor rather than mediant major. In this movement there is a submediant axis: the deceptive cadence, emphasized by a fermata, which demarcates ideas 2 and 3 is vi of A^b major in the exposition, VI of F minor in the second part, a minor triad mirrored by a major triad.*16

More unusual procedures occur in one of C. P. E. Bach's most harmonically interesting sonata movements, the first movement of the sonata in B minor, Wq 55/3, published in 1779. (See Figure 3.) Like Haydn's two string quartets in B minor, the opening is ambiguous and seems at the outset as if it were in D major, yet this ambiguity is in contrast with the tonal decisiveness of the closing idea (mm. 16-20; 38-42). Nothing between the opening and closing ideas can be called a "second theme"; an abortive thematic idea (mm. 8-9, 30-31) soon breaks off into modulatory passage work, with the eventual goal of the exposition the minor dominant. Within the passage-work sections an interesting tonal axis is evident: submediant in the first half (mm. 5-9), Neapolitan (lowered supertonic, ^bII) in the second (mm. 26-31).*18 An even more unusual tonal axis occurs between the two brief tonal plateaux (mm. 10, 32) which immediately precede a chord of the augmented sixth which serves as a pivot to the dominants of the two halves: minor subdominant (iv) in the first, subtonic (vii, A minor) in the second. This movement shows another developmental type leading to the hierarchic sonata-form exposition: opening idea — abortively independent thematic-tonal ideas — transition — closing idea. As with many sonata-form movements in minor

FIGURES

2

C. P. E. BACH: SONATA IN F MINOR, Wq 57/6, III

FIRST PART (36 mm.)		SECOND PART (34 mm.)	
Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center	Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center
1 (1-8)	f: i-V	1 (37-50)	f: V of iv-V
1' (trans.)(9-16)	i-mod. to Ab m. 13		
Cadence m. 16	Ab: I ₆	Cadence m. 50	i ₆
2 (17-21)	I	2 (51-55)	i
Fermata (m. 21)	vi	Fermata (m. 55)	VI
3 (22-25)	V of V-V	3 (56-59)	V of V-V
4 (26-29)	I	4 (60-63)	i
5 (Close)(30-36)	I	5 (Close)(64-70)	i

3

C. P. E. BACH: SONATA IN B MINOR, Wq 55/3, I

FIRST PART (20 mm.)		SECOND PART (22 mm.)	
Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center	Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center
1 (1-7)	b: III-i	1 (21-29)	A-D-G
"2" (8-15)	VI-iv-V of V	"2" (30-37)	C-a-V of b
Pivot to f# m. 10		Pivot to b m. 32	
Close (16-20)	f#: i	Close (38-42)	b: i

NB. Here, as in figure 8, the figure representing the second theme-group is placed in quotation marks, since it is a second theme group by position and tonality rather than by thematic independence.

where the ultimate goal of the exposition is the minor dominant, there is considerable ambiguity as to the tonal goal, even more so than in such a highly organized movement as the first movement of Haydn's Symphony No. 45. Thematically the repetition scheme of C.P.E. Bach's sonata movement is quite exact between the two halves, with the "seam" showing in the differences between mm. 2-4 and 23-26, but tonally there is much greater freedom and variety, with considerable emphasis on the subdominant side of B minor and a corresponding avoidance of F# minor, the tonality in which the exposition closed.

A final example from C. P. E. Bach shows that equality in length of the two halves of a sonata-form movement does not automatically entail a binary sonata form, for the second half can contain a true recapitulation even when the two portions are exactly or nearly equal in length. The incipient sonata form of the prelude in G# minor from Book II of J.S. Bach's Well-Tempered Clavier is offered as one example; an even clearer illustration, with the two halves exactly equal in length, is the third "Probestück" of C. P. E. Bach's second "Essay" sonata (Wq 63/2), published in 1753. (See Figure 4.) The second half opens with the first part of the first theme in mediant major; the second part of this theme is then expanded and developed to modulate from the mediant to the dominant of the original tonic (m. 26), with a chord of the augmented sixth over the submediant in the preceding measure serving as the pivot. Though the first theme is stated in the recapitulation, its second part, as well as the first part of the second theme, is omitted.

The next illustration, the first movement of Rutini's F minor sonata, Op. 5 No. 5 (ca. 1759), shows a hierarchical exposition and the possibility of combining related thematic material into one theme in the recapitulation. As shown in Example 2, the opening of the first theme and the first part of the second theme are closely related.

The first part of the movement ends in the minor dominant and is separated from the second part by a cadence and caesura rather than a double bar. In the second half of the movement the first theme, stated in dominant minor, is expanded and developed to a climax (mm. 18-29), cadencing on the dominant of the home tonic. As is customary with most early Classic sonatas, the second half of the second theme and the closing theme are aggregations of formulae with more harmonic than melodic import. The tonal axes are simple: dominant minor in the first half balanced by subdominant minor in the second

FIGURE

4

C. P. E. BACH: THIRD "PROBESTÜCK", SECOND "ESSAY SONATA", Wq 63/2

Exposition (1-18)				Development (19-26)		Recapitulation (27-36)	
Themes							
1a	1b	2A	2B	2B'	Close	1A	1B
(1-2)(3-6)(7-10)(10-12)(12-14)(14-18)				(19-20)(20-26)(27-28)(28-30)(30-32)(32-36)		1a	
g:i				V-i		g: VI ⁺ 6-V i	
Bb:I				IV-I IV-V-I		IV ⁺ 6	
						(pivot)	

half, and the dominants of the two keys over which theme 2b is stated serving as tonal counterweights. (See Figure 5.)

An excellent example of the binary sonata form as slow movement is the second movement of the second of the *Symphonies périodiques* by Anton Filtz (ca. 1730-1760), one of the leading composers of the Mannheim school.*19 The exposition is simple and hierarchic. In the second part of the movement Filtz replaces the original transition (mm. 9-18) with a much longer section (mm. 43-64), consisting of basically sequential passages which lead from the supertonic of the dominant tonality which opens this second part of the movement to the subdominant of the original tonality, D major (mm. 43-54), then a long retransition over a pedal point on A, the dominant (mm. 55-64). The Mozartean second theme and the sectional close are identical, save for their transposition, with their statement in the exposition. (See Figure 6.)

The next example, the finale of Johann Christian Bach's sonata in C minor, Op. 17 No. 2 (published ca. 1779), contains complex tonal and thematic relationships in a hierarchical framework proper to a composition on the threshold of the High Classic period. This exciting prestissimo finale is in binary sonata form with a hierarchic exposition that is intensified by the customary modulation to mediant major and the close family relationship between the openings of the first and second theme-groups (See Example 3). The second part of the exposition begins in the mediant and modulates to G minor, the key in which a thematic recapitulation of the first part of the second theme-group begins (mm. 65-68); this is subsequently modified and expanded, finally cadencing on the dominant of the home tonic (m. 78). Yet a firm statement of the original tonic in root position is delayed until the recapitulation of the closing theme in measure 91. Two internal tonal axes occur: one between mediant major and dominant minor which has already been described, and one between tonic minor in the mediant as part of a diminished seventh chord acting as V of V (A-C-E \flat -G \flat) at mm. 38-42, and a chord of the Neapolitan sixth at the corresponding recapitulation (mm. 93, 97). (See Figure 7.)

The final illustration, the first movement of Franz Beck's *Sinfonia* in D minor, Op. 3 No. 5 (published 1762)*20, stands on the borderline between binary and ternary sonata form. The non-hierarchic exposition has a definite opening theme and a strong forte unison idea that serves as an emphatic closing subject (motive H in Figure 8). In the exposition the mediant is firmly established in measure 32, attained through sequential

EXAMPLE

2

RUTINI: SONATA OP. 5/5, I

1 (mm. 1-3)

2a (mm. 7-10)

FIGURES

5

F. M. RUTINI: SONATA IN F MINOR, Op. 5 No. 5, I

FIRST PART (17 mm.)		SECOND PART (19 mm.)	
Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center	Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center
1 (1-6)	f: i-V	1 expanded (19-29)	c: i-iv (pivot to f)
2a (7-10)	c: i		V of f mm. 28-29
2b (11-15)	V-i	2b (30-34)	f: V-i
Close (15-17)	i	Close (34-36)	i

6

ANTON FILTZ: SYMPHONIE PERIODIQUE No. 2, A MAJOR, II

FIRST PART (34 mm.)		SECOND PART (46 mm.)	
Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center	Theme and measure numbers	Tonal center
1 (1-8)	D: I	1 (35-42)	A: I
Trans. (9-18)		Replacement of trans. (43-54)	modulates to IV-V of D (51-54)
		Retransition (55-64)	A pedal as dominant
2 (19-34)	A: I	2 (65-80)	D: I

EXAMPLE

3

J.C. BACH: SONATA OP. 17/2, III

a (mm. 1-4)

D¹ (mm. 14-18)

FIGURE

7

J. C. BACH: SONATA IN C MINOR, Op. 17 No. 2, III

FIRST PART (47 mm.)

SECOND PART (55 mm.)

Theme-Groups	Motives	Tonal center	Theme-Groups	Motives	Tonal center
1 (1-13)	a (1-8)	c: i	1 (48-64)	A (48-55)	E \flat : I
	b (8-10)	i		B (55-61)	I-V of g
	c (11-12)	V		C (62-64)	g: V
2 (14-36)	D ¹ (14-18)	E \flat : I	2 (65-91)	d ¹ (64-68)	v
	D ² (19-23)	I-V		d ² (69-77)	mod. to V of c thru iv of c
	E (23-26)	V		e (78-81)	V
	F (27-30)	V-I		f (82-85)	V-i
	G (31-36)	IV-V-I		g (86-91)	ii ^o ₆ -i ₆ -iv-V-i
Closing (36-47)	H (36-44)	I	Closing (91-102)	h (91-99)	i
	I (44-46)	I-vi		i (99-101)	i-VI
	J (46-47)	I		j (101-102)	i

FIGURE

8

FRANZ BECK: SINFONIA IN D MINOR, Op. 3 No. 5, I

FIRST PART (87 mm.)			SECOND PART (114 mm.)		
Theme-groups	Component motives	Tonal center	Theme-groups	Component motives	Tonal center
1 (1-16)	a (1-8)	d:i	1 (88-102)	A (88-95)	F:I
	a (9-16)	i-V		a (95-102)	V of ii
Transition (16-44)	b ¹ (16-21)	V of iv	Development (102-122) Tonal fluctuation: goal a minor.		
	b ² (21-26)	iv			
	B ¹ (26-31)	F:V		g ¹ (123-31)	a:V-VI
	B ² (31-44)	V-I-IV-I ₆		h (131-37)	VI-V-i
	C (42-44)	ii-V	New material (138-169). Tonal flux: goal V of d minor		
"2" (45-81)	D (45-53)	I			
	E (54-57)	V-I	"2" (169-191)	d (169-180)	d:i
	F (58-70)	IV-V ₉ ⁰ -V/V			
	Fermata(70)	V ₂ ⁴		Fermata(191)	VI
	G (71-81)	I ₆ -iv ₆ -V-vi		g ¹ (181-191)	i-V-VI
Closing (81-87)	H (81-87)	I	Closing (191-201)	h (191-201)	i

NB. Here, as in Figure 3, the figure representing the second theme-group is placed in quotation marks, since it is a second theme group by position and tonality rather than by thematic independence.

passages through the subdominant of the opening tonic (iv of D minor = ii in F major) in a large-scale ii-V-I progression in F major. The second part of the movement, not demarcated by a double bar, begins (m. 88) with the opening idea which is repeated (mm. 96-103) in G minor, the subdominant of the original key. Then a true development, defined as "[working] the ideas in some motivic or organic fashion, by dissecting, re-forming, compounding, or interchanging them"*21, and incorporating modulation, motivic play, and contrapuntal treatment, replaces the transitional sequences of mm. 17-31. The eventual goal of the development is A minor and is rounded out by the statements of first the distinctive cadential pattern of motive G (mm. 78-81 corresponding to mm. 128-31) and then the closing motive H (mm. 132-37). Yet this movement cannot be called ternary, for new material then ensues, beginning in G minor and proceeding to the original tonic through its submediant side (B \flat major), which also provides a mediant-submediant tonal axis with the exposition. A tonal recapitulation begins with motive D (m. 169) which corresponds to a second theme. An extended cadence (mm. 178-191) reaches the deceptive cadence to the submediant which preceded other statements of motive H. This motive, followed by a cadence-defining section, completes the movement. The ratio between the two sections can be expressed in round numbers as 7:10, or in percentages, the second part is 131% as long as the first.

This movement can be contrasted with four "ternary" sonata-form movements in minor, three by Haydn and one by J.B. Vanhal (the third movement of the *Sinfonia* in A minor, listed in the 1772 supplement of the *Breitkopf Thematic Catalogue*), in which the recapitulation begins with musical material other than the first theme in tonic minor. All of these four movements have true developments, and in two of them (Haydn, *Symphony* No. 80, first movement, and the finale of the Vanhal *sinfonia*) the development is longer than the exposition. The following table also includes the finale of J. C. Bach's C minor sonata for purposes of comparison:

COMPOSITION	PROPORTION OF SECOND TO FIRST PART
J. C. Bach, <i>Sonata</i> Op. 17 No. 2, III	117%
Beck, <i>Sinfonia</i> Op. 3 No. 5, I	131%
Haydn, <i>Symphony</i> No. 44, IV	153%
Vanhal, <i>Sinfonia</i> in A minor, III	206%
Haydn, <i>Quartet</i> Op. 55 No. 2, II	238%
Haydn, <i>Symphony</i> No. 80, I	293%

Kamien states that in the sonata-movement type lacking the conventional "development" and "recapitulation" the average length of the second part is 137% of the exposition, with the true population average between 124% and 150%. Equal halves are not common.*22

The determinants of the binary or ternary character of a sonata-form movement are the proportions of the two parts of the movement and the location of the beginning of the tonal recapitulation. The finale of Haydn's Symphony No. 44 has its tonal recapitulation in the area corresponding to the transition in the exposition (mm. 19, 119); the first movement of Haydn's Symphony No. 80 recapitulates with the second theme in tonic major indicated by a change in key signature, but its development is 40% of the total length of the movement; and the second movement of Haydn's Op. 55 No. 2 quartet and the finale of Vanhal's *A minor sinfonia* have second themes in the expositions which are versions in major of the first theme in minor, with the recapitulations beginning with the appearance of the major mode version in the tonic. Though Haydn's development section in the finale of Symphony No. 44 is only 20% of the length of the movement, proportionately shorter than in the previously cited examples by J. C. Bach and Beck, this movement is given a decidedly ternary quality by its beginning the recapitulation within an area (the transition) belonging to the first theme-group and motivically related thereto.

The greatest differences in proportions between the exposition and the return of expositional material in the tonic **are not** between the binary and ternary extremes, but between the two works which lie on each side of the boundary between binary and ternary: the Beck *sinfonia* movement (56 mm. of exposition, 33 mm. of recapitulation in tonic minor) and the finale of Haydn's Symphony No. 44 (24 mm. of exposition, 48 mm. of recapitulation without coda).

The coda's existence is a major determinant, also, of a ternary movement, even when it is separated from the recapitulation by a double bar indicating that development and recapitulation are to be repeated. The one exception I have found is the finale of Jiri Antonin Benda's F major sonata, a binary movement with a coda only eight measures long.*23 In the four ternary movements previously discussed, the second movement of Haydn's Op. 55 No. 2 quartet is the only one lacking a coda, but its development is extensive and even contains a fugue. Vanhal's coda is of great importance to the movement, and in its proportion to the rest of the movement and its new treatment

of previously stated thematic material, it anticipates Beethoven's codas.

This investigation of several binary sonata forms from the early Classic period (approximately demarcated by the years 1740 to 1780) disclose several characteristics which serve to identify the form as binary:

- (1) Equality in length between the two halves is not a prime determinant, for the second portion can contain restatement of the exposition in the tonic with no preceding development (abridged sonata form) or even a rudimentary development and recapitulation. A few binary sonata forms occur whose second part is shorter than the first part, but the second part is very rarely more than approximately 30% longer than the first.
- (2) There must be thematic coincidence between the opening, the close, and at least one intervening idea between the two portions of the movement. The chief exception is the first movement of Rutini's sonata Op. 3 No. 5 (A major), in which both transitional and second-theme materials are replaced by new ideas in the second part yet are framed with the opening and close of the first part.
- (3) In the binary movement one expects the second part of the movement to begin with the same thematic material with which the exposition opened, usually in the same key as the close of the exposition — dominant major, dominant minor, or mediant.
- (4) Between the restatement of the first theme and the reprise of the second theme or its equivalent in the home tonic several different procedures are possible. Transitional material may be retained or replaced altogether with new material; a development section can even take place. The discrepancies in length between the two parts of the movement most commonly occur in this section, for as a general rule composers of this time felt that more musical time-space was needed to return to the tonic than to leave it. Customarily the home tonic will be approached through its subdominant; in major-mode binary movements this is the principal tonal axis between the two sections of the form.
- (5) Especially in binary movements in the minor mode, tonal axes are established in the areas corresponding to the second theme-groups, usually with some kind of mediant relationship present. The musical elements defining these axes range from

the single prominent chord or cadence to well-defined tonal plateaux. These tonal axes in minor are also frequently present in ternary sonata-form movements (the transition sections, especially when a well-defined theme is also present as in the first movement of Mozart's G minor symphony, K. 550, are a favorite location in ternary forms), since these axes are necessary to compensate for the inherent relative instability of the minor mode.

(6) Statement of any thematic material belonging properly to the first theme-group immediately before the "tonal recapitulation", whether in the home key (J.C. Bach, *sinfonia* in G minor Op. 6 No. 6, third movement, mm. 57-60 corresponding to mm. 4-5 of the exposition) or the subdominant (J. A. Benda, sonata in C minor, first movement, mm. 45-49 corresponding with mm. 1-3 and 29-31 and forming a grand iv-V cadence)*24, vitiates the binary character implied hitherto in the movement and creates in retrospect the impression of an essentially ternary form even though the first theme in its original form and tonic is not restated. The tonal recapitulation must begin with material associated with the second theme or its equivalent, and must not be immediately preceded by first-theme material.

(7) The binary sonata form movement fell into disuse first as an opening movement, next as a finale, and survived longest as a slow movement but was replaced here by the abridged sonata form. Yet many of its characteristics, especially the beginning of the tonal recapitulation with the second theme, were subsequently to be encountered in several sonata-form movements by, among others, Chopin and Brahms.

R E F E R E N C E S

- 1 The principal discussion of this topic is by Ralph Kirkpatrick in his *Domenico Scarlatti* (Reprint: New York, 1968), pp. 251-79. He deals with tonal rather than with thematic-motivic relationships and his subject is a stylistically earlier type of sonata than those investigated in this study.
- 2 William S. Newman, *The Sonata in the Classic Era* (Chapel Hill, 1963), pp. 143-44.
- 3 Roger Kamien, *The Opening Sonata-Allegro Movements in a Randomly Selected Sample of Solo Keyboard Sonatas Published in the Years 1742-1774 (Inclusive)* (Dissertation: Princeton, 1964) pp. 65-66.
- 4 *Ibid.*, p. 53. The only significant difference between the second parts of earlier and later sonatas Kamien finds is that in later sonatas the second parts tend to open with material other than that of the first measure of the exposition.
- 5 Fred Ritzel, *Die Entwicklung der 'Sonatenform' im musiktheoretischen Schrifttum des 18. und 19. Jahrhunderts* (Wiesbaden, 1968), p. 154.
- 6 Bathia Churgin, "Francesco Galeazzi's Description (1796) of Sonata Form", *Journal of the American Musicological Society* XXI (1968), p. 186; her commentary pp. 186-87. Miss Churgin is in error (her footnote 19 on p. 186) in her description of the recapitulation of the finale of Haydn's Symphony No. 44, which occurs with the equivalent of Galeazzi's "secondo Motivo" rather than as she implies, with the "Passo Caratteristico".
- 7 Ebenezer Prout, *Applied Forms* (London, 1895), pp. 195-202.
- 8 Wilhelm Wörmann, "Die Klaviersonaten Domenico Albertis", *Acta Musicologica* XXVII (1955), p. 97. The sonata discussed is published in Franz Giegling, *Die Solosonate* (Cologne, 1959), pp. 78-82.
- 9 Eighteen of these sonatas are published in Fausto Torrefranca, *Giovanni Benedetto Platti e la sonata moderna* (Milan, 1963), pp. 215-403.
- 10 Rutini's Op. 3 has been republished as Vol. XXX in *Musiche vocale e strumentali sacre e profane* (Rome, 1965).
- 11 On some occasions, as in Haydn's C minor piano sonata, third movement, and Symphony No. 80, first movement, this second theme becomes definite only in the recapitulation.

- 12 Rutini's Op. 5 No. 5 sonata (*Musiche vocale e strumentali sacre e profane XXXIII*) (Rome, 1967) is an excellent example. The first movement is hierarchically and clearly organized whereas the second consists of motivic complexes in which the second section begins like a development with the opening two motives in major (albeit tonic major) after which material ensues which corresponds to a second theme-group in the mediant, and the third section is a compressed recapitulation of both preceding sections in tonic minor.
- 13 Alexandre-Etienne Choron and J. Adrien de LaFage, *Manuel complet de musique vocale et instrumentale*, 5 vols. (Paris, 1836-38), IV, pp. 253-55.
- 14 Reference (Wq) to Alfred Wotquenne, *Thematisches Verzeichnis der Werke von C. P. E. Bach* (Reprint, Wiesbaden, 1964). The sonata under discussion is from the third of the *Sechs Sammlungen von Sonaten, freien Fantasien, und Rondos für Kenner und Liebhaber*.
- 15 An exception to the customary procedure of stating the opening theme in the same key as the close of the exposition.
- 16 One of the most striking illustrations of the mirroring of minor with major, and the reverse, occurs in Electra's aria in Act I of Mozart's *Idomeneo*, an aria in a quite unusual binary form. The section stated originally in the mediant (F major, mm. 48-73) contains surprising uses of F minor (mm. 53-54, 67-68, for example) which are strikingly mirrored with tonic major in the reprise of this section in the home key of D minor (m. 113, 128-31); many interesting tonal axes abound in this aria.
- 17 From the first volume of the *Sechs Sammlungen von Sonaten, freien Fantasias, und Rondos für Kenner und Liebhaber*.
- 18 See a similar tonal axis, with an ingenious treatment in the recapitulation, in the first movement of Mozart's violin sonata in E minor, K. 304. In the exposition the progression is repeated, but in the recapitulation the thematic material is retained with appropriate changes while the underlying harmonic progression is first bII-VI, then iv-i.
- 19 Published in Hugo Riemann, ed., *Mannheim Symphonists: A Collection of 24 Orchestral Works*, 2 vols. (New York, n.d.), I, pp. 235-37.
- 20 Edited by H. C. Robbins Landon and published in *Nagels Musik-Archiv*, Vol. 193 (Kassel, 1958).
- 21 Newman, op. cit., p. 155.
- 22 Kamien, op. cit., pp. 69-70.
- 23 Published in V. J. Sýkora and Jan Racek, eds., *Jiri Antonin Benda, Sonate I - XVI, Musica Antiqua Bohemica XXIV* (Prague, 1956), pp. 99-102.
- 24 Ibid., pp. 54-57.