> Recoverability for optimized quantum *f*-divergences

Referee Affiliation
Slovak Academy of Sciences, Mathematical institute
Manuscript ID:
JPhysA-115040.R1
Manuscript Type
Paper
Article Keywords
Relative entropy, Data processing inequality, quantum *f*-divergence, Recoverability, quantum sufficiency, Rényi divergence
Date Assigned:
06-Jul-2021
Date Review Returned:
26-Jul-2021
M-Score for this manuscript:
24.00

GUIDE TO REVIEWER
Papers published in Journal of Physics A: Mathematical and Theoretical should contain novel results that substantially advance their relevant field. Articles that repeat or add only incrementally to already published work will not be acceptable.

QUALITY RATING
Please rate the manuscript for the originality, significance and clarity of the content. Guidance is available here

	Very Low Not publishable	Low Publishable only in an archival journal	Medium Would require major improvement to be publishable in this journal	High Likely to be publishable in this journal	Very High (Top 10%) Definitely publishable in this journal
req Originality				✓	
req Significance				✓	
req Clarity				✓	

QUESTIONS
Please answer these questions, which are for the benefit of the Editors (the answers will not normally be transmitted to the authors). If you have any explanatory comments, please add them to the "Comments to the Editor(s)" box below.

req **Please rate the scientific rigour**

High

Has the author adequately taken into account all the points made in the previous report(s)?

Yes

Thank you for reviewing this article for Journal of Physics A: Mathematical and Theoretical.

This article should be treated as CONFIDENTIAL and the information contained therein should not be cited until the article is published. The report should not be communicated directly to the author.

Recommendation

Amendments required before acceptance

COMMENTS TO THE EDITOR(S)

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR(S)

The authors addressed all of my comments in a suitable way and the revisions increased readability of the paper.
I only have two additional comments, that I did not notice in the previous report:

- (a very minor comment) p. 11, lines 1-5: to be very precise, [Pet86a] and [Pet88] proved the statement only for some specific operator convex functions. But it can be easily extended to all regular op. convex functions, from the proof there.

- I am a bit confused by the argument used for the proof of Eq. (80) on p. 46-47. The first displayed equation on p. 47 seems to suggest that
lim_{\epsilon to 0} \tilde Q_f(rho||sigma+ epsilon rho)= inf_{epslion >0} \tilde Q_f(rho||sigma+ epsilon rho).

But for example in the case of sandwiched Renyi relative entropy for alpha>1 \tilde Q_\alpha is -decreasing- in the second argument (e.g. Thm. 3.16 (7) in Hiai's new monograph Quantum f-divergences in von Neumann algebras). Also the infimum in the second line of the equation may not be attained at epsilon=0, as f is operator -anti- monotone?

With these comments clarified, the paper can be recommended for publication.

Files attached

Do you want to get recognition for this review on Publons?

No

Author's Response
Files attached