

Second Round Reviews

Juliano Palacios Abrantes

17/05/2020

Recommendation Submitted by: David VanderZwaag

The authors have now responded to my last comments and most importantly they have largely clarified the relationship of NAFO and Canada-USA fisheries management in the Gulf of Maine. Just three additional comments:

1. Line 23... United Nations Law of the Sea Convention... not Seas
 - Corrected in text
2. Lines 118-120... the authors might refer to more recent TRAC proposals (2018, 2019) and it might be useful to show how the distributions have actually varied from 2010-2019.
 - We changed the text to include the quota average from 2010 to 2020 (rather than an specific year) and included a table with the historic TRAC proposals from the same time period, plus a four-years historic average of before the weighted method implementation (2006 to 2009) It now reads:

Since its introduction, the average quota allocation for each species proposed by the GoMA has been; Atlantic cod 77% Canada and 23% US, haddock 55% Canada and 45% US, and yellowtail flounder 34% Canada and 66% US (Table 1, TRAC 2015a, 2015b, 2015c, 2018a, 2018b, 2018c; Lake 2019, Table 1). However, because this is an unofficial agreement, Canada and the US ultimately take single management decisions (Soboil and Sutinen 2006).

3. Lines 95 and 161... the term NAFO regulatory areas should be replaced with NAFO divisional zones. This is more accurate as the NAFO Regulatory Area is the high seas area where NAFO actually does regulate.
 - Corrected in text

Lake, Tara Trinko. 2019. "2019 TRAC Status Reports. NEFMC Meeting Gloucester, MA September 25, 2019." https://s3.amazonaws.com/nefmc.org/3c-2019TRAC_NEFMC.pdf.

Soboil, Mark Lucas, and Jon G Sutinen. 2006. "Empirical analysis and transboundary management for Georges Bank multispecies fishery." *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* 63 (4): 903–16.

TRAC. 2015a. "Eastern Georges Bank Cod. TRAC Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC) Status Update 2015/01."

———. 2015b. "Eastern Georges Bank Haddock. Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC) Status Report 2015/02."

———. 2015c. "Georges Bank Yellowtail Flounder. Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC) Status Update 2015/03."

———. 2018a. "Eastern Georges Bank Cod. Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC) Status Update 2018/01."

———. 2018b. "Eastern Georges Bank Haddock. Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC) Status Update 2018/02."

———. 2018c. "Georges Bank Yellowtail Flounder. Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC) Status Update 2018/xx."