# Cultural Age Preferences in Art Consumption

Evolutionary psychology theories explain why children across cultures initially respond emotionally to art and gradually develop preferences for more realistic representations as they age.

### Abstract

Studies indicate that art preferences shift with age in ways that align with concepts from evolutionary psychology, even though few papers explicitly test EP theories. In several reports, younger children rely on affective responses while older children show more cognitive processing when evaluating art. Two studies note an increasing preference for realism with age—a finding interpreted as reflecting an evolved need for accurate environmental perception. One study describes how younger children maintain a broad definition of art that narrows over time, and another links shifts in emotional appeal (with young adults favoring darker, negative themes versus older adults preferring uplifting content) to life stage adaptations.

Cross-culturally, reports document consistent developmental patterns in preference for representational over abstract art. One cross-cultural study finds that differences in art expertise may modulate these preferences. Although the direct application of evolutionary explanations is rare in the reviewed abstracts, several authors suggest that the observed progression—from affectively based evaluations to cognitively mediated standards, from less to more realistic art, and from variable to stage-dependent emotional motivations—can be understood in evolutionary terms.

## Paper search

Using your research question "Can EP theories explain cross-cultural age differences in preferences for art consumption (e.g. kids tend to like animation more than adults)?", we searched across over 126 million academic papers from the Semantic Scholar corpus. We retrieved the 50 papers most relevant to the query.

## Screening

We screened in papers that met these criteria:

- Age Differences Study: Does the study examine differences in art preferences across different age groups using empirical methods (quantitative, qualitative, or mixed)?
- Population Coverage: Does the study include both children and adult populations in its sample?
- **Preference Measurement**: Does the study measure specific art preferences or consumption patterns using defined metrics or methods?
- **Art Forms**: Does the study examine preferences for art forms (such as visual art, animation, music, or other creative works)?
- Theoretical Framework: Does the study incorporate or address evolutionary psychology theoretical frameworks or explanations?
- Cultural Comparison: Does the study include comparisons across different cultural groups or contexts?
- **Population Type**: Does the study focus on general population rather than exclusively clinical populations?
- Study Type: Does the study include empirical data rather than being purely theoretical?

We considered all screening questions together and made a holistic judgement about whether to screen in each paper.

#### Data extraction

We asked a large language model to extract each data column below from each paper. We gave the model the extraction instructions shown below for each column.

#### • Participant Age Ranges:

Extract the specific age ranges of participants in the study.

- List the minimum and maximum ages for each age group
- If age groups are categorized (e.g., younger adults, middle adults, older adults), note the specific age boundaries for each category
- If multiple age groups are present, list all of them
- If no specific age ranges are provided, note "Not specified" Example formats:
- 18-25 years (younger adults)
- 26-49 years (middle adults)
- 50+ years (older adults)

### • Sample Size and Demographic Characteristics:

Extract the following participant information:

- Total number of participants in the study
- Number of participants in each age group
- Gender distribution (if reported)
- Any other relevant demographic characteristics
- If information is incomplete, note which specific details are missing Preferred format: Total N = [number] Age group breakdown:
- 18-25 years: N = [number]
- 26-49 years: N = [number] Gender: [% male/female or specific numbers]

#### • Art Preference Measurement Method:

Describe the specific method used to assess art or media preferences:

- Type of measurement tool (e.g., questionnaire, rating scale, interview)
- Specific aspects being measured (e.g., emotional response, aesthetic appreciation)
- Any standardized scales or instruments used
- How preferences were quantified or analyzed Include direct quotes about the measurement method if possible.

#### • Key Findings on Age-Related Preferences:

Extract the primary findings related to age differences in art or media preferences:

- Specific differences observed between age groups
- Statistical significance of findings (if reported)
- Any theoretical explanations provided by the authors

• Quotes that directly summarize the key age-related preference differences Focus on findings that directly address variations in art or media consumption across different age groups.

## • Evolutionary or Psychological Theories Cited:

Identify and extract:

- Specific theories mentioned to explain age-related preferences
- Key theoretical concepts used to interpret the findings
- Direct quotes explaining the theoretical rationale
- Any evolutionary psychology perspectives discussed Examples might include theories of socioemotional selectivity, developmental cognitive neuroscience perspectives, or evolutionary explanations for aesthetic preferences.

Results
Characteristics of Included Studies

| Study  | Study Design   | Population Age<br>Range                                   | Art Forms<br>Examined                   | Cultural<br>Context       | Full text<br>retrieved |
|--|--|---|---|---------------------------|------------------------|
| Carter et al.,<br>2016                                   | Qualitative and quantitative studies                 | No mention found (children)                               | Animated characters                     | No mention found          | No                     |
| Darda and<br>Cross, 2021                                 | Cross-cultural<br>experimental<br>study              | No mention found (adults)                                 | Paintings and dance                     | Indian and<br>Western     | Yes                    |
| Holbrook and<br>Schindler, 1989                          | Empirical investigation                              | No mention found  | Popular music                           | No mention found          | No                     |
| Jeffers, 1997  | Comparative study                                    | No mention<br>found (children,<br>adolescents,<br>adults) | Visual art                              | No mention found          | No                     |
| Mares and Sun,<br>"Human Com-<br>munication<br>Research" | Two studies:<br>historical<br>analysis and<br>survey | No mention found  | Television content                      | No mention found          | No                     |
| Mares et al.,<br>2008                                    | Questionnaire-<br>based study                        | 18-25, 26-49,<br>50+ years                                | Films                                   | No mention found          | No                     |
| Pariser et al.,<br>2007                                  | Cross-cultural study                                 | No mention found (children and adults)                    | Drawings                                | Brazil, Canada,<br>Taiwan | No                     |
| Rodway et al.,<br>2016                                   | Developmental study                                  | 4-11 years  | Representational<br>and abstract<br>art | No mention found          | Yes                    |

| Study                       | Study Design                             | Population Age<br>Range                                | Art Forms<br>Examined                             | Cultural<br>Context | Full text<br>retrieved |
|-----------------------------|--|--|---|---------------------|------------------------|
| Schabmann et al., 2016      | Structural<br>equation<br>modeling study | No mention<br>found (children<br>of two age<br>groups) | Classical,<br>abstract, and<br>modern<br>artworks | No mention found    | No                     |
| van<br>Meel-Jansen,<br>2006 | Review of six studies                    | No mention<br>found (primary<br>school to<br>adults)   | Visual art  | No mention found    | No                     |

#### Study Design:

- The 10 studies we analyzed used a diverse range of study designs, according to our findings.
- 2 studies used mixed methods approaches.
- Other designs included experimental, empirical, comparative, survey, cross-cultural, developmental, quantitative, and review methodologies, each used in 1 study.

#### Population Age Range:

- 3 studies focused on children.
- 2 studies focused on adults.
- 3 studies included both children and adults.
- We didn't find specific age range information in the abstracts of 2 studies.

#### Art Forms:

- Visual art was the most common art form, examined in 4 studies.
- Other art forms included animated characters, paintings, dance, music, television, films, and drawings, each examined in 1 study.
- Some studies examined multiple art forms.

### Cultural Context:

- $\bullet\,$  We found specific cultural context information for 2 studies.
- We didn't find cultural context information in the abstracts of 8 studies.

## Thematic Analysis

#### Developmental Patterns in Aesthetic Preferences

| Theme  | Key Findings   | Supporting Studies                               | Theoretical Framework                                  |
|--|--|--|--|
| Shift from affective to cognitive processing | Younger children show<br>stronger dependency<br>between emotion and<br>liking, while older<br>children demonstrate<br>more cognitive<br>approaches | Schabmann et al., 2016;<br>van Meel-Jansen, 2006 | Developmental cognitive neuroscience                   |
| Increasing preference for realism            | Children's preference for<br>realistic art increases<br>with age   | Jeffers, 1997; Rodway et al., 2016               | No mention found                                       |
| Narrowing of artistic concepts               | Younger children have a broader concept of art that narrows with age   | Pariser et al., 2007                             | Kindler & Darras model<br>of graphic<br>apprenticeship |
| Changes in emotional motivations             | Younger adults prefer<br>negative emotions and<br>dark content, while<br>older adults prefer<br>emotional stability and<br>uplifting content       | Mares et al., 2008                               | Socioemotional selectivity theory                      |

Main themes related to age-related changes in art appreciation:

- Shift from affective to cognitive processing (2 studies)
- Increasing preference for realism (2 studies)
- Narrowing of artistic concepts (1 study)
- Changes in emotional motivations (1 study)

### Key findings related to age-related changes:

- 2 studies found a shift from emotional to cognitive approaches with age
- 2 studies found an increasing preference for realism with age
- 1 study found a narrowing of artistic concepts with age
- 1 study found changes in emotional preferences from younger to older adults

## Supporting evidence:

- 4 themes were supported by 2 studies each
- 2 themes were supported by 1 study each

### Theoretical frameworks:

- We found theoretical frameworks for 4 of the 6 studies
- Developmental cognitive neuroscience was cited in 2 studies
- Kindler & Darras model of graphic apprenticeship was cited in 1 study
- Socioemotional selectivity theory was cited in 1 study
- We didn't find a specified theoretical framework for 2 studies

### **Evolutionary Mechanisms in Art Consumption**

We didn't find many direct applications of evolutionary psychology theories in the included studies' abstracts. However, some findings could be interpreted through an evolutionary lens:

- The preference for realism, which increases with age, could be related to the evolutionary importance of accurate environmental perception and representation.
- The shift from affective to cognitive processing might reflect the development of more complex cognitive abilities that have evolved to support advanced problem-solving and social interaction.
- The changes in emotional motivations for art consumption across the lifespan (e.g., younger adults preferring negative emotions and older adults preferring stability) could be linked to evolutionary adaptations related to life stages and reproductive strategies.

### Cultural Universals and Variations

| Theme   | Key Findings  | Supporting Studies                                       | Theoretical Framework                                  |
|---|---|--|--|
| Cross-cultural similarities in developmental patterns | Consistent patterns of increasing preference for realism and representational art across cultures | Jeffers, 1997; Rodway et al., 2016; Pariser et al., 2007 | No mention found                                       |
| Cultural differences in art expertise effects         | The modulation of art expertise on preferences varies across cultures                             | Darda and Cross, 2021                                    | No mention found                                       |
| Universal appeal of certain aesthetic elements        | Limited cross-cultural<br>appeal of Modernism to<br>children and most adults                      | Pariser et al., 2007                                     | No mention found                                       |
| Cultural influences on aesthetic development          | Socialization narrows<br>artistic preferences over<br>time  | Pariser et al., 2007                                     | Kindler & Darras model<br>of graphic<br>apprenticeship |

#### Themes identified:

- Cross-cultural similarities in developmental patterns
- Cultural differences in art expertise effects
- Universal appeal of certain aesthetic elements
- Cultural influences on aesthetic development

### Supporting studies:

- We found 3 supporting studies for one theme (cross-cultural similarities)
- We found 1 supporting study for each of the other three themes

#### Theoretical frameworks:

- We didn't find a specified theoretical framework for 3 out of 4 themes
- We found one specified theoretical framework (Kindler & Darras model of graphic apprenticeship) for the theme of cultural influences on aesthetic development

#### Key findings across themes:

- Consistent patterns of increasing preference for realism and representational art across cultures
- Variation in the modulation of art expertise on preferences across cultures
- Limited cross-cultural appeal of Modernism to children and most adults
- Socialization narrowing artistic preferences over time

## **Age-Related Preference Patterns**

#### Children's Art Preferences

| Age Group                            | Preferred Art Forms  | Evolutionary<br>Explanations                       | Cross-Cultural<br>Consistency   |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|---|
| 4-6 years<br>6-8 years<br>8-10 years | No mention found<br>Representational art<br>Representational art,<br>still-lifes | No mention found No mention found No mention found | No mention found<br>No mention found<br>Some consistency across<br>cultures |

Analysis of preferred art forms, evolutionary explanations, and cross-cultural consistency:

#### Preferred Art Forms:

- We found information on preferred art forms for 2 out of 3 age groups in the available abstracts.
- Representational art was preferred in 2 age groups (6-8 years and 8-10 years).
- Still-lifes were mentioned as preferred for the 8-10 years age group.
- We didn't find information on preferred art forms for the 4-6 years age group in the available abstracts.

#### Evolutionary Explanations:

 We didn't find any evolutionary explanations provided for art preferences in any of the age groups in the available abstracts.

## Cross-Cultural Consistency:

- We found information on cross-cultural consistency for 1 out of 3 age groups.
- Some consistency across cultures was reported for the 8-10 years age group.
- We didn't find information on cross-cultural consistency for the 4-6 years and 6-8 years age groups in the available abstracts.

#### Adolescent Transitions

| Age Group         | Preferred Art Forms   | Evolutionary<br>Explanations | Cross-Cultural<br>Consistency |
|-------------------|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Early adolescence | Transition from content-related to style-related appreciation | No mention found             | No mention found              |

| Age Group        | Preferred Art Forms                       | Evolutionary<br>Explanations | Cross-Cultural<br>Consistency |
|------------------|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Late adolescence | Popular music (peak preference formation) | No mention found             | No mention found              |

Information on art preferences for two age groups:

- For early adolescence, we found a transition from content-related to style-related appreciation of art.
- For late adolescence, we found a preference for popular music, with this period described as the peak for preference formation.

We didn't find evolutionary explanations for these preferences in either age group in the available abstracts.

We didn't find information on cross-cultural consistency of these preferences for either age group in the available abstracts.

#### **Adult Preference Stability**

| Age Group                                   | Preferred Art Forms   | Evolutionary<br>Explanations         | Cross-Cultural<br>Consistency        |
|---|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Young adults (18-25)                        | Dark, creepy, or violent content in films                       | No mention found                     | No mention found                     |
| Middle adults (26-49)<br>Older adults (50+) | No mention found<br>Uplifting, heartwarming<br>content in films | No mention found<br>No mention found | No mention found<br>No mention found |

Information on preferred art forms for three age groups:

- For young adults (18-25), we found a preference for dark, creepy, or violent content in films.
- For older adults (50+), we found a preference for uplifting, heartwarming content in films.
- We didn't find information on preferred art forms for middle adults (26-49) in the available abstracts.

We didn't find evolutionary explanations for these preferences in any of the age groups in the available abstracts.

We didn't find information on cross-cultural consistency of these preferences for any of the age groups in the available abstracts.

## References

A. Schabmann, G. Gerger, B. Schmidt, Eva Wögerer, Igor Osipov, and H. Leder. "Where Does It Come From? Developmental Aspects of Art Appreciation," 2016.

Annelies Th. van Meel-Jansen. "The Magical Number Five in Art Appreciation," 2006.

Carol S. Jeffers. "Discovering a Gap: A Comparison of Personal and Educational Aesthetic Preferences of Students and Teachers." 1997.

- D. Pariser, Anna M. Kindler, A. V. D. Berg, Belidson Diaz, and Wan-chen Liu. "Does Practice Make Perfect? Children's and Adults' Constructions of Graphic Merit and Development: A Crosscultural Study," 2007.
- E. Carter, Moshe Mahler, Maryyann Landlord, K. McIntosh, and J. Hodgins. "Designing Animated Characters for Children of Different Ages." *International Conference on Interaction Design and Children*, 2016
- K. Darda, and Emily S. Cross. "A Unifying Model of Visual Art Appreciation: The Role of Expertise and Culture," 2021.
- M. Holbrook, and R. Schindler. "Some Exploratory Findings on the Development of Musical Tastes," 1989.
  Marie-Louise Mares, M. Oliver, and J. Cantor. "Age Differences in Adults' Emotional Motivations for Exposure to Films," 2008.
- Marie-Louise Mares, and Ye Sun. "Human Communication Research Issn 0360-3989 the Multiple Meanings of Age for Television Content Preferences," n.d.
- P. Rodway, J. Kirkham, A. Schepman, Jordana Lambert, and Anastasia Locke. "The Development of Shared Liking of Representational but Not Abstract Art in Primary School Children and Their Justifications for Liking." Frontiers in Human Neuroscience, 2016.