

Motivating the Unmotivated

Final Instructional Design Project

Team Members: Jared Cooley, Jennifer McKenna, Ross Nicol, Laura Rini

University of Akron

April 24, 2019

Analysis Phase

Introduction:

This is an analysis report for the fifth-grade class at Huntington Elementary located in Brunswick, Ohio. The SME is Linda Romph, a fifth grade English Language Arts teacher who has taught in the BCSD for 25 years, and has been a fifth-grade teacher for 17 years. Linda serves on many different building teams such as D.L.T, B.L.T etc. She is a highly respected educator in the district and has recently won Teacher of the Year. The four-person team for this instructional design project consists of the University of Akron graduate students Ross Nicol, Laura Rini, Jared Cooley, and Jennifer McKenna.

The objective of this report is to design instruction to increase motivation in reading and writing for the fifth grade students of Huntington Elementary School. There are 72 fifth grade students from three different classrooms. They are one to one with Chromebooks and every teacher has a Smart board. They participate in the subjects of reading and writing for 75 minutes per day. There is a wide range of learning abilities among these students including students that are gifted, students that are a part of the special education program, and students that are ED (emotional disturbance). A number of these students show very little effort and motivation toward their learning in the subjects of reading and writing. As a result, the state test scores for this group have been below average. The goal of this analysis is to find ways to improve students' mindsets, motivate them toward stronger effort, and increase test scores.

Instructional Problem:

The purpose of this project is to implement classroom strategies aimed at helping students who lack motivation towards reading and writing in the classroom. It is the SME's goal to show growth in this year's MAPs assessments and end of year state tests. She has observed students frequently turning in writing assignments that reflect minimal effort. The students do not seem engaged by the writing and, even when offered the opportunity to research or write on topics of their own choosing, they show little enthusiasm. Many students react in a frustrated manner when asked to expand on their writing or correct their mistakes. They will often ask what the required number of sentences is and limit themselves to that number. The sentences they write are often short and choppy. Students struggle with understanding why written communication is an important skill.

The SME has noticed a similar pattern with reading assignments. The students will complete their assignments just to finish them, with little regard for making sure their answers are correct. Reading comprehension is a large part of their testing scores, and the SME tries to help prepare students by exposing them to varied informational texts, and asking them to identify main ideas, evidence, author's purpose, etc. Unfortunately, the students will often choose an answer, but be unable to explain why, which makes it difficult to identify areas of weakness; the SME says students will even sometimes admit to choosing an answer at random, simply to be done with the work faster.

In both sections of language arts, the SME is contending with missing assignments and lack of class participation. She's looking for ways to encourage students to put forth their best effort, so that she can better assess where they actually need more help and then plan meaningful lessons accordingly.

Needs Analysis:

Test scores at Huntington Elementary are above the state average. However, the greatest need for growth is seen in the data for language arts. When looking at percentages, 84% scored proficient in math, 95% in social studies, 80% in science, and 68% in reading. Our SME is looking to close this gap and achieve greater gains. Linda shared that the fifth grade students lack motivation to perform their best with reading and writing. She observes careless work habits and poor attitudes with some of her students. She knows these students are not working to their full potential, but is struggling with ways to reach them. She would like to see an improvement in class participation. She would also like the quality of her students' writing and reading work to improve.

When looking at what motivational supports are already in place, Huntington Elementary participates in PBIS (Positive Behavior Interventions and Support) which is a proactive approach to providing support for all students in achieving social, emotional, and academic success. This system involves classroom clip charts and other school rewards. For these fifth graders however, these supports are not having the desired motivational impact in her classroom. Her concern is not that their performance is a result of acting out or misbehaving (no more than the norm), but rather that they are disengaged and have a somewhat negative energy about the assignments and their own abilities. Linda feels she has nothing to lose and hopefully much to gain in trying additional strategies that could make a difference in her students' attitudes and effort. For her, it's not just about test scores. She is a positive educator and recognizes the value of connecting with her students. She knows how critical reading and writing skills are to her students' success in middle school and beyond.

Learner Analysis: [Google Form Survey given to 5th graders](#)

72 Fifth Grade ELA Students at Huntington Elementary	
Boys	52%
Girls	48%
10 years old	61%
11 years old	39%
Interests Outside of School	hanging out with friends, video games, sports, art, YouTube, pets
Future Career Interests	professional athletes, chefs, vets, video game streamers/designers, teacher, engineer, police officer, nurse, architects

Fifth Graders' Feelings about School and Learning	
What do they like best about school?	Seeing friends, recess, teachers, having fun, gym, leaning new things
When is learning fun and interesting?	Doing projects, playing games, science experiments, having fun teachers
How can teachers motivate students to do their best?	Play games, give rewards, praise, offer more help, give time to talk with friends

When looking at learning preferences, we found

- The preferred ways students want to learn new information are by
 - watching a video
 - discussing information with classmates
 - listening to someone give the information
- The majority of students' favorite subjects are math and science.
- 82% of students rated their technology skills above average, needing little help.
- Most students rated their writing assignments in the middle range, not too challenging or too easy.

How often the 5th Graders feel they give their best effort to their ELA subjects			
	Not very often	Sometimes	Often
Writing	6%	37%	57%
Reading	4%	22%	74%

Design Phase

Task Analysis

Since students will be reflecting on their own performance, setting personal goals, and participating in activities to build their focus and motivation, the following knowledge and skills are required -

- Recognize traits of an active participant
- Recognize features of quality effort- focus, persistence, applying strategies, etc.
- Know how to write a personal weekly goal
- Understand how to provide meaningful feedback
- Recognize the benefits of being mindful
- Practice mindful strategies
- Apply the above positive work habits to increase reading and writing performance

Learning Theory

We have applied an eclectic approach to learning theory in this instructional design. Since the learners are already familiar with the content and generally have the academic skills in place, we need to look beyond the instructional approach to learning.

The greatest need is with application and effort in using their skills. Therefore, in implementing both the WOW goals and mindfulness activities to build motivation, this design applies a constructivist approach. The content is not prespecified, direction is determined by the learner and assessment is much more subjective because it does not depend on specific quantitative measures, but rather the process and self-evaluation of the learner. In utilizing the mindfulness strategies, the learner is better able to deal with real life situations as well.

Goal orientation theory and intrinsic motivation theory are useful frameworks for understanding students' engagement in schoolwork. They center on achievement-related behavior and the meanings students ascribe to that behavior. A mastery goal orientation refers to wanting to gain understanding or skill. In an effort to motivate the fifth-grade ELA classes at Huntington, the students will identify WOW (Within one Week) goals for themselves. Students are given a handout every Monday that says "Within one week I will _____. I will work toward this goal by _____. I will support other classmates by _____." Having students complete this task will lead to positive discussions about participation, effort, and performance amongst all students. WOW goals can be something small like turning in homework on time or raising a hand in class to contribute more. For the students who show little effort in the areas of reading and writing, the fifth grade teacher can have a discussion with each student about what their goal is for the week and cooperatively create a goal to help motivate their growth in that area. An example of this goal could be "Within one week I want to do well on my spelling test. I will work on this goal by practicing my spelling words for fifteen minutes every night. I will support my classmates by quizzing each other to help prepare for the test". Students add post-its to the bulletin board on Wednesday. By sharing if they are making progress towards their goal and sharing why or why not, students are taking ownership. Having a class discussion about ways to help those that are falling short of their goal builds a sense of community and support. By teaching these WOW goal techniques, the 5th grade ELA students will show better achievement, self-confidence, and learn the value and enjoyment that comes from reading and writing.

In addition to this motivation, the learners must show quality performance with their skills. To address this need, our design is also driven by cognitivism. This theoretical approach

seeks to train learners to do a task with consistency. By implementing a weekly instructional game, the students process information and exercise recall of content skills. This plan aims to strengthen the routine of students applying those skills and showing what they know.

Lastly, this plan incorporates behaviorism. The instruction is designed to modify students' lack of effort based on consequences of behavior. Students who show evidence that they've reached their WOW goal can join in the class game on Fridays. The positive behaviors of participation and effort are more likely to occur based on the reward.

Performance/Learning Objectives

- *Objective:* Given a WOW goal template, the fifth grader will compose a weekly personal goal related to improving learning/effort/performance with reading and writing. The student will work toward his/her goal during the week, receive feedback from peers and the teacher, and self evaluate progress at the end of the week.
- *Objective:* With guidance from the ELA teacher, the fifth grade student will participate in daily mindfulness activities to strengthen focus, self awareness, and self motivation.
- *Objective:* Given the opportunity to join in a weekly game with classmates, the fifth grade student will be motivated to achieve a personal goal by displaying traits of an active participant and giving quality effort to their reading/writing performance..

Instructional Strategies-

- Whole group direct instruction- explaining and modeling WOW goal writing
- Whole group direct instruction- teacher facilitates mindful minutes activity
- Cooperative Learning- students work together during weekly instructional game.
- Providing feedback- teacher directed: teacher conferences with students on WOW goals. Also when teacher reveals responses during game
- Providing feedback- student centered: they give peers feedback on WOW goals

These instructional strategies are designed to meet the interests and needs shown in our learner analysis. Based on survey results of what motivates students do their best, students replied receiving feedback from the teacher and earning a reward. To make learning fun and engaging, they enjoy working with peers and playing games. Therefore, the above strategies are in place to increase the students' motivation to participate and perform.

Instructional Sequence-

Instructional Procedures for WOW Goals:

1. Teacher guides students in creating descriptions for an active class participant. Students list these traits on poster. Teacher also leads discussion about quality effort. Student list these traits on poster.
2. Teacher explains WOW goals and models goal writing activity by making her own specific goal. She explains process of posting goals on Mondays and how students will self-assess (with teacher guidance when needed) on Fridays.

3. Teacher uses first week of WOW goals as modeling week, providing much direction and support. As weeks continue, she scaffolds support to foster greater student ownership and develop more personalized goals.
4. Teacher facilitates discussion on giving feedback- what makes it meaningful? Class creates lists of examples and non-examples to make expectations clear.
5. Teacher provide specific feedback to students throughout the week and peers give each other feedback.
6. Teacher provides mini lessons as needed to keep student on track with their goal writing. Use student examples to showcase/celebrate success and on track achievements.
7. Teacher implements a class game on Fridays as a reward for those students who've met their WOW goal.
8. Continue the above routine until students are consistently achieving their goals and making progress with their participation, effort, and performance.

Instructional Procedures for Mindfulness:

1. Teacher explains purpose of mindful moments each day to better ourselves- manage stress, focus our minds, etc. Teacher goes over expectations for this time.
2. Teacher uses Smartboard and given resources to guide students through a short mindfulness activity at the start of each class.
3. Throughout the weeks, teacher observes students' responses to the mindful minutes and periodically seeks feedback from students on their feelings/preferences for these activities in order to best meet the students' needs.
4. Teacher facilitates occasional class discussions on benefits of mindfulness and its connection to their learning.

Development Phase

Media Selection Rationale-

The following choices are age appropriate, endorsed by the SME, and familiar to our upper elementary audience. These media sources allow for student and teacher feedback, as well as peer interactions and instructional games, all of which were important to our learners in motivating them to give their best effort (as noted in our learner analysis survey).

- WOW (Within One Week) goal template: Pear Deck
- Mindful activities: guided by a digital resource that teacher shares on Smart board (GoNoodle, Discovery Education)
- Weekly Content Knowledge game: Kahoot, Smart Exchange

Issues of Message Design-

To support student understanding and motivation, as well as assist SME with organization, the following designs are in place:

- Digital resources are teacher and student friendly. They provide clear navigation and engaging features. All technology integration is familiar to participants and can be used on classroom devices.
- Resources are organized in a logical sequence of instruction.
- Presentations have written, visual, and auditory components.

Instructional Resources-

- [Pear Deck activity](#)
- [Mindfulness Resource Page](#), SME uses Discovery Education and GoNoodle account to access these links

Functional Instructional Product- (Lesson Plan)

- Teacher guides students in discussions of what it means to be an active class participant. Students list these traits on a poster.
- Teacher leads discussion about quality effort. Students create a poster with these traits.
- Teacher explains WOW goals and models goal writing activity by making her own specific goal. She explains process of creating goals on Mondays and how students will self-assess (with teacher guidance when needed) on Fridays. To build motivation, she explains how they'll be practicing their skills with a class game on Fridays.
- Teacher uses first week of WOW goals as modeling week, providing much direction and support. In following weeks, she scaffolds support to foster greater student ownership and development of more personalized goals.
- Teacher facilitates discussion on giving feedback- what makes it meaningful? Class creates lists of examples and non-examples to make expectations clear.

- Teacher explains purpose of mindful moments each day to better ourselves- manage stress, focus our minds, etc. Teacher goes over expectations for this time.

Once above instruction has been given, teacher follows a weekly plan to foster positive attitudes, self awareness, and effort in performance. Monday through Thursday it is integrated at the start of ELA class. Greater time is devoted on Fridays to allow for teacher student conferencing and class game.

- Monday:
 - Teacher shares and guides students through Pear Deck activity.
 - Students set Wow goal.
- Tuesday:
 - Guided Mindful activity whole group on Smart Board
 - As needed, teacher conferences 1:1 with student(s) on their WOW Goal, offering feedback, encouragement, making personal connection, reinforcing expectations.
- Wednesday:
 - Guided Mindful activity whole group on Smart Board
 - Peer conferencing on goals, peers give meaningful feedback
- Thursday:
 - Guided Mindful activity whole group on Smart Board
 - As needed, teacher conferences one on one with student(s) on their WOW Goal, offering feedback, encouragement, making personal connection
- Friday:
 - Students self reflect/assess achievement of weekly goal, prepare to discuss evidence with teacher
 - Teacher/student conferencing on WOW goals: Look at assignments from week (homework, classwork), reflect on active learner traits, participation and effort.
 - Teacher discusses progress & accomplishments, class celebrates successes.
 - Play ELA content knowledge class game

Assessment Plan-

The following ongoing formative evaluation strategies will be used by the SME to determine students' growth in motivation, effort and performance:

- *Analyzing Student Work:* Information can be learned from student's homework, classwork, and quizzes, especially if students are required to explain their thinking. By taking the time to analyze students' work, the SME gains knowledge about students' attitudes, effort, strengths, or need for further support, as well as the effectiveness of the instructional design.
- *Strategic Questioning:* In whole group or small group setting, SME asks students higher order questions such as "why" and "how" as it relates to their goal setting and effort

discussions. These require more in depth thinking from students and can help teacher discern extent of students' understanding.

- *Student Responses* to the self reflective Pear Deck questions give the SME data.
- *Teacher Observation:* Teacher observes students throughout WOW goal process, during feedback activities, mindfulness moments, and weekly game, as well as during the above mentioned strategies. Students' participation and effort level can be noted, which will in turn evaluate the effectiveness of the instructional materials and design.

Implementation Phase

Implementation of Project with the Target Audience-

The implementation was rolled out for the members of the target audience, the fifth-grade ELA students at Huntington Elementary. A trial period with only one of the three classes was conducted before the program was fully implemented. This allowed the SME, Linda Romph, and the design team a chance to evaluate and better anticipate any future challenges to the mindfulness portion of the plan. The full implementation is being put into place in stages (detailed in the timeline below) for the fifth grade ELA students. This implementation will include a focus on increasing participation and effort in meeting the WOW goals students will be setting for themselves and increasing mindfulness.

Implementation Timeline-

Time frame	Implementation Plan
April 2-5	SME, Linda Romph conducts a trial of the mindfulness portion of the lesson plan with one of the three fifth grade ELA (English Language Arts) classes. (See formative assessment report for details)
April 8-12	SME starts implementation of the entire design project with the full targeted audience- the three 5th grade ELA classes of Huntington Elementary. She begins with discussions and class posters on participation and effort, and follows the daily procedures for mindfulness. At end of week, she introduces the WOW goals concept to prep for following week.
April 15-18	SME implements the WOW goal part of the design project with all 5th grade classes and continues daily mindfulness activities. SME shares observations/feedback with design project team.
April 23-26	SME continues to follow design plan with WOW goals and mindfulness. She implements Friday game day reward. Students complete survey to evaluate project. SME shares observations and feedback with design project team.
April 29-May 17	Although our time for data collection has ended, SME continues to implement our plans with ELA classes to determine full potential of this motivational design project on reading and writing performance.
Fall 2019	Pending successful results in spring, project is implemented in the 2019-20 school year to foster student motivation and achievement.

Description of Implementation Process-

At this time, because of short school weeks, our implementation process is in the early stages. Over the upcoming weeks, our SME will fully implement our plan.

Possible upcoming Challenges:

- During April 15-18, the WOW goal writing process may need much guidance as it is their first experience. Also, a shorter four day week with two days of state testing makes for inconsistent schedules. Not all classes may have time for peer and teacher feedback of WOW goals. No school on Friday means the game day is not a possibility this week.

Successes:

- Technology tools and resources are running smoothly.
- Based on brief conversations with SME, during April 8-12, the students responded positively to the discussions on participation and effort. The mention of a Friday game day was well-received.

Evaluation Phase

Conducting a Formative Evaluation:

Prior to the full implementation of our project, we conducted a trial run with our SME. She agreed to work through some of our design- the mindfulness activities-with one of the three fifth grade classes. Using her homeroom group, she followed the mindfulness portion of the lesson plan for one week- introducing the concept, spending a few minutes on a mindful activity at the start of ELA class, and leading brief discussions with students as needed.

Because our expert had considerable input in the development of the WOW goal task, she did not feel a formative session was necessary for that part of the project. She looked over the plan and felt comfortable starting full implementation of WOW goals with all three classes at once. She agreed to let us know if any needs arise.

Recommendations for Changes-

The following adjustments are a result of information gained in our formative assessment-

We will include additional mindfulness links. By providing more options, we will ensure our SME has a variety of tools to keep students' engaged and meet the project's objectives. We will also include question starters to help her facilitate discussions as needed on goal setting, effort, and/or motivation. In addition, because we are using observational data as part of our assessment, we requested our expert take short anecdotal notes while she observes students' involvement in the activities. She agreed to do this additional step, and we feel it will be valuable part of our summative evaluation and reflection process.

Implementation of Summative Evaluation-

Now that our materials and processes have been put to use, we must evaluate their effectiveness. Currently, our summative evaluation plan is ongoing. Part of our evaluation, observational feedback from our SME, has been collected and discussed among our team. The additional key part of our evaluation however, data collection from our target audience, is still in progress because of schedule constraints and the need for quality implementation time. The plan for our final step of evaluation is to conduct another Google form survey with the fifth grade classes. This learner validation piece will reflect students' feelings and attitudes about their classroom participation and effort as a result of the weekly goal setting and mindfulness activities. Keeping in communication with our SME as she analyzes students' classwork, as well as their end of the year MAPS testing results, will provide further evidence of the effectiveness of our motivational plan. The student survey, along with their ELA classroom performance and testing data, will provide critical information to guide any further changes or additions to our design.

Collection of Evaluation Data-

- SME's anecdotal notes while observing students' involvement in the activities and analyzing student's classwork and performance.
- Interviews/discussions with SME via in-person meetings with one team member and Skype meetings with all team members.
- End of year ELA MAP assessment data to provide evidence of growth in performance
- Google form survey with target audience, fifth grade ELA students, comparing results from survey prior to implementation to post implementation.

Assessment and Interpretation of Evaluation Data-

As our expert implements our instructional design, she has shared valuable findings and suggestions with us -

- Our SME notes interest in the mindful activities from her classes. The students benefit from reminders about focus. The comfort level grows each day.
- The connection of the mindfulness activity to increased effort isn't evident yet, but the overall design of the daily plan is manageable.
- The mindfulness resource page is effective and sharing it on the smart board goes well.
- The Discovery Education video is a good starting point. Additional links may be needed to ensure a variety over time.
- Adding question stems will help guide discussions throughout the projects' lessons.
- Thus far, weekly WOW goal writing is very guided by teacher. With increased practice and time, students will hopefully attach greater meaning and ownership.
- There are changes in schedules due to state testing, but SME is moving forward with full implementation as best she can.

Recommendations for Changes-

Although our team has a wealth of teaching experience, we are novices to the instructional design process and have learned valuable knowledge through this ADDIE model. The fifth grade audience and content is not familiar to all of our team members, but we can all relate to the challenging topic of motivation in education. Through the steps of this design process, we have grown in our understanding of the analysis, instruction, technology, and tasks needed to meet our SME's expectations and address the instructional problem. This understanding brings plans for revisions to our design based on our current evaluation data.

- The following resource will be added to provide support in helping students write meaningful WOW goals- <https://www.scholastic.com/teachers/blog-posts/genia-connell/setting-almost-smart-goals-my-students/>
- After mindfulness activity, plan time for students to recall/reread Wow goal to themselves. SME feels this quick goal reference helps students focus and attach meaning to their daily actions in the classroom.
- Include additional mindfulness resource links. By providing more options, we ensure our design has a variety of tools to keep students' engaged and meet the objectives.
- Include question starters to facilitate discussions as needed on goal setting, effort, and/or motivation. [Mindfulness Resource Page](#)
- Further recommendations for changes may be added after review of additional learner data. We understand that evaluation is an ongoing part of quality instructional design.