ARTS EDUCATION POLICY REVIEW, 112: 79–88, 2011

ISSN: 1063-2913
DOI: 10.1080/10632913.2011.546694

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group

Exploring the Benefits of Music-Making as Professional Development for Music Teachers

Kristen Pellegrino
Christopher Newport University, Newport News, Virginia, USA

Although much has been written about professional development in general education and music education literature, little has addressed the benefits of music-making as meaningful professional development for music teachers. For music teachers, music-making and meanings of music-making have been connected with teachers' identity, well-being, beliefs, and effectiveness, as well as being a powerful pedagogical tool and a way to develop presence in teaching. Presence in teaching is linked with self-awareness, attentiveness, and pedagogical knowledge. The purpose of this article is to explore the benefits of music-making for music teachers in order to convince policymakers of the value of music-making as a professional development activity for music teachers. This article explores theories from psychology and education that link engagement, well-being, and identity to lay the foundation for a justification of broadening professional development policies. Then, literature is presented that connects teachers' art-making experiences (past and present), identity, teaching, and student learning. The third section draws on my previous work to illustrate the intersections between teachers' music-making and teaching. Then, suggestions for implementing professional development programs with music-making components are made. Although there are many ways music-making could be included as professional development, I offer four suggestions: including music-making in departmental or district-wide meetings, granting professional development credit to music teachers who make music outside of the classroom, setting up in-classroom reflection opportunities/action research based on integrating music-making and music teaching, and initiating a collaborative teacher study group that includes chamber music collaboration.

Keywords: music and well-being, music-making, music teacher identity, music teacher professional development, presence in teaching, teacher effectiveness

Professional development is a topic of concern for all teachers. Numerous articles and books have been written about professional development, with one of the most cited being Guskey's *Evaluating Professional Development* (1999). In the foreword, Dennis Sparks suggests that although policymakers and educational leaders often ask whether staff development improves student learning, approaches to improving student learning can vary widely.

Over the past three decades, attention has been increasingly directed toward helping teachers understand the connections between their personal and professional lives and student learning. These connections include such issues as the influence of teachers' beliefs on their practices and the development of presence in teaching (Beijaard et al. 2005; Day 2010; Day and Gu 2010; Day et al. 2006; Korthagen 2004; Meijer, Korthagen, and Vasalos 2009; Rodgers and Raider-Roth 2006; Sammons et al. 2007).

For music teachers, the area of music-making and its meanings can be connected with teachers' beliefs, identity, well-being, social connections, and presence in teaching, and can serve as a powerful pedagogical tool (Dolloff 2006; Dolloff 2007; Fredrickson 2006; Isbell 2006; Jorgensen 2006, 2008; Pellegrino 2010; Russell 2009; Scheib 2006; Stephens 2007; Stanley 2009). Music education researchers have begun to consider the potential of music-making as a valuable professional development activity (Fredrickson 2006; Scheib 2006; Stanley 2009; Pellegrino 2010).

The purpose of this article is to explore the benefits of music-making for music teachers in order to convince policymakers of the value of music-making as a professional

Correspondence should be addressed to Kristen Pellegrino, Christopher Newport University, 1 University Place, Newport News, VA 23606, USA. E-mail: kristen.pellegrino@cnu.edu

development activity for music teachers. In an educational climate in which the president has initiated the Race to the Top program calling for "relevant coaching, induction, and/or professional development," this article argues that professional development that includes music-making is relevant for music teachers (U.S. Department of Education 2009). I first present theories from psychology and education that explore the connections among engagement, well-being, and identity to lay the foundation for a justification of broadening professional development policies. The next section addresses the intersections among teachers' art-making experiences (past and present), identity, teaching, and student learning. The third section draws on my previous work to illustrate these intersections between teachers' music-making and teaching. The fourth section provides suggestions for implementing professional development programs with music-making components.

COMPLETE ENGAGEMENT, WELL-BEING, AND PRESENCE IN TEACHING

Drawing on research in the field of psychology, this section describes the theory of "flow" (Csíkszentmihályi 1991), psychological presence at work (Kahn 1990; 1992), positive psychology (Lyubomirsky, Sheldon, and Schkad 2005; Seligman and Csíkszentmihályi 2000), and the theory of presence in teaching (Rodgers and Raider-Roth 2006). Finally, I will present research that connected teachers' personal lives and teacher effectiveness/student learning.

Theory of Flow

In numerous studies, Csíkszentmihályi examined hundreds of "artists, athletes, musicians, chess masters, and surgeons . . . people who seemed to spend their time in precisely those activities they preferred" (Csíkszentmihályi 1991, 4). These studies formed the basis for his theory of "flow" that he developed to describe "optimal experience." Flow is a psychological state of intense interest, a time when someone becomes fully engaged in a challenging activity that causes them to lose sense of time and self and results in feelings of satisfaction and well-being. In this state, "concentration is so intense that there is no attention left over to think about anything irrelevant, or to worry about problems. Self-consciousness disappears, and the sense of time becomes distorted" (71).

Csíkszentmihályi claimed that understanding this theory would help people improve their quality of life. He also suggested the possibility of turning "all of life into a unified flow experience," explaining that:

> If a person sets out to achieve a difficult enough goal, from which all other goals logically follow, and if he or she invests all energy in developing skills to reach that goal, then actions and feelings will be in harmony, and the separate parts of life will fit together—and each activity will "make sense" in the present, as well as in view of the past and of the future. In such a way, it is possible to give meaning to one's entire life. (Csíkszentmihályi 1991, 214–15)

In brief, the theory of flow presents a holistic approach to life, in which one's actions and feelings are aligned.

Psychological Presence at Work

Within the field of organizational behavior, Kahn (1990; 1992) explored the concept of psychological presence, a state in which one draws on one's personal, authentic self (thoughts, feelings, beliefs, identities, and skills) while at work. The concept of presence is linked to the idea of personal engagement, which entails the ability to use and express oneself in multiple ways—physically, cognitively, and emotionally—and connect work with individual interests and self-image. In the same vein, workers need to feel valued by and connected to their coworkers.

In his 1990 study, Kahn found that people become engaged in or disengaged from their work as a result of three psychological conditions: meaningfulness, safety, and availability. Psychological meaningfulness is higher when a person is engaged in tasks that are challenging and varied and have clear expectations and creative aspects, as well as when workers are allowed a level of autonomy. The availability of opportunities to demonstrate competence using previous skills and to learn and grow by developing new skills can also positively affect meaningfulness. The condition of psychological availability is dependent on physical and emotional energy, feelings of security or insecurity, and stability in the individual's outside life.

Kahn's 1992 study builds on his prior work and describes the elements and benefits of presence. He defines the four dimensions of presence as attentiveness, connection, integration, and focus. When combined, these dimensions contribute to one's ability to (*a*) continue learning; (*b*) question assumptions, imagine solutions, and implement change; and (*c*) be productive. By understanding oneself, others, and the situation, the present worker can formute solutions without becoming tangled in emotions of panic. From an organization's standpoint, the benefits of employing individuals who are present at work include increased job performance and job satisfaction.

Some physical signs of being present include the maintenance of eye contact; appearing physically grounded: the use of speech that includes inflection, variety (e.g., laugh, varied dynamics, speech patterns), and words that fit one's personality; and the ability to stay on track with the conversation. This ability is demonstrated by the types of questions asked and the display of appropriate nonverbal reactions such as facial expressions, nodding, and other body language.

The development of the theories of flow and presence marked a different avenue of inquiry than had been previously

followed in psychology. In the next section, I provide a brief overview of the linked area of positive psychology.

Positive Psychology

Positive psychology is dedicated to better understanding both the ability to be in the moment and the benefits of flow. According to Seligman and Csíkszentmihályi, this field aims to study:

> Valued subjective experiences: wellbeing, contentment, and satisfaction (in the past); hope and optimism (for the future); and flow and happiness (in the present). At the individual level, it is about positive individual traits; the capacity for love and vocation, courage, interpersonal skill, aesthetic sensibility, perseverance, forgiveness, originality, future mindedness, spirituality, high talent, and wisdom. At the group level, it is about civic virtues and the institutions that move individuals toward better citizenship: responsibility, nurturance, altruism, civility, moderation, tolerance, and work ethic. (2000, 5)

Working off the premise that being happy is a catalyst for better health; better social relationships; and increased work outcomes, energy, coping skills, and citizen dispositions, Lyubomirsky, Sheldon, and Schkad (2005) present a theory of sustained happiness. This theory takes into account three components: genetic set point range, intentional activity, and circumstances. For the purposes of this article, I focus on intentional activity.

Intentional activity is defined as "actions or practices in which people can choose to engage . . . [and which] require some degree of effort to enact" (Lyubomirsky, Sheldon, and Schkad 2005, 118); the researchers suggest that this concept might contribute to an individual's discovery of sustainable happiness. More closely examining aspects of intentional activity, one key idea that appears is "person-activity fit," which refers to choosing an activity that fits an individual's "strengths, interests, values, and inclinations that undoubtedly predispose them to benefit more from some strategies than others" (122). Two important features of maintaining an activity on an ongoing basis are finding meaning and value in the activity and varying its practice.

These interrelated psychological theories form the foundation for my justification of policymakers including music-making in professional development activity. They also form the basis for the theory of presence found in education literature. "Presence from the teacher's point of view is the experience of bringing one's whole self to full attention so as to perceive what is happening in the moment" (Rodgers and Raider-Roth 2006, 267).

Theory of Presence in Teaching

Rodgers and Raider-Roth (2006) present a theory of presence in teaching that combines the aspects of self-awareness, connection to students, connection to subject matter, and pedagogical knowledge. The authors view teaching as "engaging in an authentic relationship with students where teachers know and respond with intelligence and compassion to students and their learning" (265–66). They define presence as:

> [A] state of alert awareness, receptivity and connectedness to the mental, emotional and physical workings of both the individual and the group in context of their learning environments and the ability to respond with a considered and compassionate best next step. . . . Reflective teaching cannot be reduced to a series of behaviors or skills, but is a practice that demands presence. As such, it involves self-knowledge, trust, relationship and compassion. (266)

Rodgers and Raider-Roth connect classroom life—"the relationships, the affective and cognitive interactions between students and teachers, the construction of genuine learning experiences and a hospitable school climate" with past research suggesting that the teacher/student relationship is a "keystone in student achievement, motivation and engagement and in their capacity to trust what they know." They argue that "what allows this relationship to flourish is complex and calls upon the mental, physical, emotional, and relational resources of the teacher" (2006, 266).

After exploring each of the four aspects of psychological presence, the authors conclude that being present in the context of education means "to be awake to one's self, to one's students and to their learning in such a way that learning is served through skillful and compassionate analysis and access to both subject matter knowledge and pedagogical strategies" (Rodgers and Raider-Roth 2006, 284). They suggest that teachers should pay more attention to how students interact with the subject matter, even if the teacher must slow the classroom pace and possibly lose the opportunity to cover everything. From Rodgers and Raider's perspective, a teacher's presence is directly connected to observing and understanding student learning and letting student learning drive the teaching.

Research Connecting Teachers' Personal Lives and Teacher Effectiveness/Student Learning

The merging of the personal and professional lives of teachers has been connected with identity, job satisfaction, and student learning. Two recent studies (Day et al. 2006; Sammons et al. 2007) have considered the influence of a teacher's identity on job satisfaction. Both studies drew on an existing database involving three hundred teachers from one hundred British schools over a four-year period and worked from the assumption that a teacher's identity influences factors such as commitment, motivation, self-efficacy, job satisfaction, and sense of purpose. Datasets were generated from interviews, teacher and pupil surveys, and national student assessment data (Sammons et al. 2007, 684). Linkages were found among identity, well-being, and effectiveness.

In a literature review, Smith and Gillespie (2007) also linked professional development, teachers' personal self-efficacy, teacher knowledge, and teacher effectiveness/student learning. In addition, they recommended job-embedded professional development: "site-based learning communities where professional development is woven into the fabric of the school community, balanced at times with the cross-fertilization of new ideas from outside the school. . . . The focus is on developing teacher knowledge in the content area, analyzing student thinking, and identifying how that knowledge can be applied to changes in instructional practices" (219). Based on research, they suggested that these job-embedded professional development programs are more effective when they also include: (a) a focus on helping teachers to study their students' thinking, (b) collaborative learning activities among teachers, (c) activities in which teachers make use of student performance data, and (d) help from facilitators to organize job-embedded professional development.

Meijer, Korthagen, and Vasalos's (2009) mixed-methods case study followed the experiences of a secondary social studies teacher in The Netherlands. The authors built on the concept that teachers need to have "total encounters" with their students to influence them educationally. This study was also based partially on Rodgers and Raider-Roth's (2006) theory of presence in teaching and the theories of positive psychology.

Meijer, Korthagen, and Vasalos developed an approach to professional development that sought to support teachers as they developed necessary teaching competencies in a way that would be aligned with "who they are and what motivated them to become a teacher" (2009, 298). The goals of this approach include connecting or integrating a teacher's personal and professional lives and "promoting the teacher's awareness and actualization of personal strengths," which would optimally lead to "developing more optimism and hope" (306–07).

Data collection for this study occurred over the course of a single school year and was drawn from two semi-structured interviews with the teacher; two semi-structured interviews with the teacher's supervisor; seven hour-long meetings with teacher and supervisor; the teacher's journal; and the Questionnaire on Core Qualities (QCQ), completed by both teacher and supervisor in October and June of the same year. The questionnaire measured thinking (creativity, structuredness, clarity, accuracy), feeling (commitment, empathy, compassion, trust, tolerance, care), and wanting (decisiveness, perseverance, courage). The purpose of the study was to better understand "core reflection approach" as professional development for teachers.

Over the course of the year, the teacher involved in this professional development program showed an increase in QCQ scores, especially in the thinking and feeling categories. The authors believed that a shift in awareness was responsible for the integration of her personal and professional lives. The teacher's work on reflection helped her shift her focus from her problems and issues to her strengths, presence, and conception of how she wanted to teach. Meijer, Korthagen, and Vasalos attributed this shift to her increased ability to work with more meaningful layers of her teaching, which they named identity and mission. These layers helped the teacher develop behaviors that brought her personal self into her job and improved her ability to be in the moment and both notice and react to students' needs in more meaningful and effective ways. The teacher described her new focus as "being-while-teaching."

Finally, Day and Gu (2010) wrote a book based on previous research conducted by Day et al. (2006) and Sammons et al. (2007). This book included unused data from those studies to develop portraits of eighteen teachers. In-depth exploration of these teachers' experiences allowed the authors to summarize five qualities of good teachers and good teaching. They concluded that teaching resulting in successful learning requires: (*a*) the combination of technical competencies, deep subject knowledge, and empathy for learners; (*b*) care for and about learning and learners; (*c*) the maintenance of a strong sense of identity and agency; (*d*) an emotional understanding of self and others; and (*e*) hopefulness and resilience. However, these five qualities are not widely supported in educational systems or policies. The authors offer several suggestions to increase support for the development of these qualities. First, teachers need to review, refine, and update their subject and pedagogical knowledge "through combinations of formal development programmes and in-school learning through mentorship, coaching and critical friendship" (Day and Gu 2010, 183). In addition, professional development programs should find a way to support a teacher's identity because "these findings suggest that a secure sense of professional identity, commitment and well being are central to teachers' capacity to be and remain effective" (Day 2010).

ARTS AND MUSIC LITERATURE

Similar issues have been explored in arts and music in-service teacher/professional development literature. This literature links art-making to identity issues, teacher effectiveness, job satisfaction, and student learning. In the following sections, I explore the literature on (*a*) holistic sense of identity; (*b*) music-making and well-being; (*c*) the connections among music-making and job satisfaction, retention, recruitment, and student learning; and (*d*) music-making linked to presence in teaching.

Holistic Sense of Identity

Scheib has argued that "if fine arts teachers hold and value their identities as artists, then it stands to reason that to keep them holistically fulfilled with their arts teaching career,

professional development should not only include support of their arts teacher identity, but also their identity as artists" (2006, 8–9). Thornton defines an artist teacher as "an individual who both makes and teaches art and is dedicated to both activities as a practitioner" (2005, 167). He explores an inherent identity issue for the artist-teacher in depth:

> In art and art education there are tensions and debates regarding the roles and identities of artists and teachers that present practitioners in these fields with problems to be negotiated. . . . Teachers of art, particularly in the secondary and tertiary sectors, will usually have developed an identity as an artist or art specialist of one kind or another before embarking on a career in teaching. . . . The artist teacher is one in which three worlds must be straddled or interrelated: the world of art; the world of education; and the world of art education. (167)

However, although Thornton articulates the potential problems of an identity split for artist teachers, Ball (1990) has written about the ways that her artist identity has informed her teaching. Heck (1991) and Elliott (1995) observe the connections between art-making and knowing that also inform teaching. Heck, especially, portrays artist-teachers as those educators who have developed a sense of presence in their personhood and teaching. Heck describes an artist-teacher as a "whole, awake, and compassionate person" concerned with the "development of self, active and meaningful teaching and learning experiences, [and] authentic engagement with others" (1991, 142). This description is congruent with the ideas of merging personal and professional lives and developing presence in teaching.

Music teacher identity and socialization have long been topics of interest within the profession, but have garnered a lot of attention in the past two decades (Pellegrino 2009; Pellegrino 2010; Woodford 2002). Although discussion has primarily focused on the identity conflicts of musicians and music teachers, a more recent trend has explored how the musician and music-maker identity are part of the music teacher (Bernard 2004; Bernard 2005; Dust 2006; Dolloff 2006; Nielsen 2006; Ruud 2006; Stålhammar 2006; Bouij 2007; Dolloff 2007; Regelski 2007; Roberts 2007; Stephens 2007).

In her dissertation, Stanley (2009) describes how the experiences of a collaborative teacher study group (CTSG) consisting of three elementary music teachers and herself led to transformative professional development that impacted their teaching and learning, as well as student learning. She does question, however, whether her CTSG could have been more musical and suggests centering a future CTSG on chamber music performance "to see if the added layer of making music would add further dimension to . . . interactions" (308). She further suggests "incorporat[ing] some type of musicianship building exercises within a CTSG to see if the experience of being music learners together changes [the] dialogue" (308–09). Her reasons for including music-making in her professional development CTSG mirrors Heck's understanding of an artist-teacher as a compassionate person concerned with meaningful teaching and learning experiences. Remembering what it is like to be a music learner has the potential to impact one's teaching and student learning.

Music-Making and Well-Being

> We should always remember the importance of music itself in the lives of the (music) teachers. I am coming to the conclusion that reintroducing teachers to the things about the study of music that captivated them when they were students might be a better way to reinvigorate those who are straining under the weight of the educational system. (Fredrickson 2006, 7)

Fredrickson suggests that encouraging music teachers to engage in music-making might offer a way to enhance music teachers' sense of well-being. The concept of finding well-being through engaging in music-making appears in the literature of a variety of fields. In the field of music therapy, Ruud has found:

1. Music may increase feelings of vitality and awareness of feelings.
2. Music provides opportunities for increased sense of agency.
3. Music-making provides a sense of belonging and communality.
4. Music experiences create a sense of meaning and coherence in life. (1999, 86)

Three music education scholars have addressed the connections between music-making and well-being in different ways. Stefanakis has written about music as a "holistic way in which we come to know ourselves and our relationship with the world" (2005, 14). Dolloff (2006) believes that musicians often experience powerful emotional affects by participating in intense, moving musical experiences. She describes feelings of "utter joy" while music-making, observing that "music and music making [are] ripe with emotions and emotional potential" that are "an important feature in why we came to music and music teaching in the first place" (127).

Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) have found that group music-making can help participants create a strong sense of social unity and can foster uplifting, exhilarating, and motivating feelings. Participants in their study commented on "enhanced moods whilst performing," "exhilaration while in 'flow'—almost like a drug at its best," "getting lost in a sense of timelessness in the musical act," and a feeling of "escapism" during performances (99). Social benefits noted by participants included a sense of belonging, satisfaction, and flow experiences. Personal benefits included increased

motivation, concentration, stamina, self-confidence, self-efficacy, and a stronger sense of identity (107).

All of these outcomes can be beneficial to music teachers. Although some may argue that helping teachers feel a sense of well-being is not a concern for professional development programs, the literature suggests that connections exist among music-making; well-being; and increased vitality, awareness, motivation, concentration, stamina, self-confidence, and self-efficacy. These outcomes would be worthwhile benefits of a professional development program.

Music-Making Linked to Recruitment, Retention, Job Satisfaction, and Student Learning

Isbell's (2006) study investigated the socialization and occupational identity of undergraduate music education majors and offered suggestions for attracting future music teachers to the profession similar to those of of Gillespie and Hamann (1999): "Performance- and teaching- related experiences may have a mutually reinforcing effect on the socialization of young music students, particularly in situations where the student perceives the school music teacher as being both a strong musician and excellent educator" (Isbell 2006, 151). Russell found that "string teachers who saw themselves as equal teacher and musician were more satisfied with their job than teachers who saw themselves as more teacher than musician" and suggested that "teachers who remain active as a musician are more likely to be more satisfied than string teachers who have not remained as active as a musician outside of their K–12 position" (2009, 54). All of these studies link music-making to recruitment of future music teachers, the socialization of preservice music teachers, and job satisfaction for in-service string teachers.

Combining music-making with teaching seems a common practice in string teacher culture, as many teachers are encouraged to teach with "instrument in hand." In *Strategies for Teaching Strings: Building a Successful String and Orchestra Program*, Hamann and Gillespie suggest twenty-one "keys to the development of playing technique in the string class," with the second being:

> Use modeling in your teaching. It is an excellent practice to teach with an instrument in your hands, showing them, through demonstration, what you want. Modeling provides for a nonverbal or at least a limited verbal teaching event, and it is effective and efficient and tends to keep students on task. (2003, 139)

In the second edition (2009) of this work, the authors also suggest modeling as a strategy to help students with different learning styles (e.g., visual, tactile, auditory) and efficiently teach playing skills. Although they note that "research suggests that students in early instrumental classes learn the most efficiently by watching teachers model skills and then attempting to imitate on their instruments," (38) they do not explicitly cite this research. However, some scholars who have suggested modeling as an efficient tool for instrumental teaching include Dickey (1991), Goolsby (1996), and Haston (2007).

The concept of modeling has also been addressed in philosophical writings. Jorgensen (2008) writes that "the musician-teacher" acts as an exemplar who does not merely tell, but also shows. She situates this approach in the idea of enculturation and how musicians can learn that music can be a way of life and not just an activity. In this way, modeling is used for more than teaching skills.

Music-Making Linked to Presence in Teaching

Jorgensen (2008) also explores the importance of engagement in activities that bring happiness to one's life for music teachers. She claims that "the closer our lived lives are to our own desires and the closer we are to what makes us happiest, the more joyful our lives can be and the greater blessing we may be to others" (106) and asserts that music is connected to both teaching and who we are. She defines a musician as:

> A vocation, or a deeply spiritual calling . . . a way of life. . . . We can have the sense that our work as musicians is merged with the rest of lived life rather than apart from it. A spiritual sense of the wholeness of our lives arises out of the imperative and calling we sense to participate in a life of music and enrich the lives of others through music. Viewed in this way, life is invested with meaning and a sense of profound importance. Our passion about our art involves mind, soul, and body, and we live in its service and in service for others. (103)

In this context, Jorgensen stresses the importance of being "in the moment" and points to earlier philosophers and the different terms they used to refer to this experience in slightly different ways: Whitehead's "religious moments," Langer's "virtual time," and Maslow's "peak experience." Csíkszentmihályi's concept of flow is included in this discussion as a way of describing the magical moments that evoke "sheer joy, relaxation, and quietness of mind—a sense that one has come face-to-face with transcendence and imminence," defined as "a sense of things beyond or above oneself, and . . . a deeply felt sense of things within oneself (23).

Connecting these ideas with music, Jorgensen avers that musicians "create rehearsals and performances that are captivating and entrancing, beyond normal and lived experience yet one with it, where the various elements combine to create pieces of music or performances that are more than the sum of their parts" (2008, 98). When these performances are successful, she claims that "the result of this endeavor may be seen to be art—a deeply spiritual and sensual process and product that is recognized as artful and crafty by musicians and their publics" (98).

Lastly, she submits that all teachers have the responsibility to find balance and bring a refreshed and enriched self

to their students both to sustain their teaching careers and to possess "things of significance to pass on to [their] students" (Jorgensen 2008, 187). For all of these reasons, current music education policies should be examined to recognize and perhaps even establish programs that promote music-making as a professional development approach.

DISSERTATION FINDINGS

For my dissertation (Pellegrino 2010), I worked with four string teacher participants who echoed many of the ideas presented previously, including the benefits of modeling (music-making inside the classroom), the benefits of conducting music-making activities both alone and in groups outside of the classroom, and the connections between music-making and well-being. They also added another reason for including music-making in the professional development curriculum: the benefits of expanding their knowledge of and experience with repertoire and different genres through music-making.

One participant recommended that "working specifically on repertoire that might lend itself to being performed" would be a worthwhile reason to include music-making in professional development (300). All participants worked with music of different genres and introduced these to their students; however, only those genres of music with which the participants were familiar were brought into their classrooms. Therefore, offering professional development programs that focus on listening, understanding, and playing music from a variety of styles would likely result in teachers introducing more genres of music to their students.

My dissertation was designed to explore the intersections between music-making and teaching. Datasets included interviews, classroom observations, and a focus group interview that included a music-making session. Participants used music-making inside the classroom to model playing technique and musicality, believing it to be an efficient teaching tool that benefits student learning. They were also modeling their love and values of music-making. Reasons for music-making outside the classroom included nurturing themselves, gaining credibility with students, and remembering what it was like to be a musical learner. One participant said that two advantages of music-making are to develop "the relationship you have as a doer with the person and understanding both sides of the podium" (263).

Music-Making Aids Presence in Teaching

One participant described how treating her students like members of a chamber music group was able to elevate her teaching:

> I feel like I'm a member of their quartet and so we're all playing together and I can show much more—and I teach better. I teach and, at the same time, I am a musician. . . . I stop thinking about how I'm going to teach it when I'm playing music with them. . . . I just treat them as if we are all music colleagues together making music together and talk to them how I would talk to my quartet members instead of talking to them like the teacher who knows everything. (Pellegrino 2010, 229)

This participant had previously described "letting go" and "losing [her]self" while music-making. I interpreted these statements as descriptions of flow. In this state, her worries about classroom management, pacing, and content delivery receded. When music-making with her students, she was also able to "let go" and be in the present again.

Music-making brought part of the participants' personal lives into their teaching and provided them with inspiration. In the classroom, music-making captured students' interest and attention and served as a tool for proactive classroom management and inspiring students. Music-making became a way for participants to share what they loved and influence the next generation of music-makers.

My findings point to music-making's potential as a transformative professional development activity. Music-making can be inspirational and return excitement to a teacher who has been feeling burned-out; it can also elevate teaching and help teachers be more present in the classroom. Therefore, as Day and Gu (2010) suggest, helping music teachers refine, review, and update their subject matter, and integrating their musician/performer and teacher identities with the goal of promoting presence in teaching could form the basis of advocacy for music-making as a professional development activity.

SUMMARY

In this article, I have presented research and theories developed over two decades that link teacher engagement in meaningful, challenging activities with well-being. The state of feeling intellectually challenged and safe and being physically and emotionally available is connected with continuing learning, questioning assumptions, imagining solutions, implementing change, and being productive. Finding meaning and value in an activity and varying its practice are connected to the ability to find sustained happiness; in turn, happiness acts as a catalyst for better health, better social relationships, and increased work outcomes, energy, coping skills, and citizen dispositions.

Presence in teaching is linked to self-awareness, teachers' ability to connect to students and the subject matter, and pedagogical knowledge. Links have also been found among identity, well-being, and teacher effectiveness. Finally, music-making is linked to music teachers' identity, well-being, and effectiveness, and serves as a way for music teachers to find presence in teaching. All of these connections

have been explored in order to present data-informed support for including music-making in professional development.

SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPLEMENTING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT WITH A MUSIC-MAKING COMPONENT

Although there are many ways that music-making could be included as a professional development component, I offer four suggestions here: including music-making in departmental or districtwide meetings, granting professional development credit to music teachers who make music outside of the classroom, creating in-class reflection opportunities or action research through the integration of music-making into music teaching, and initiating a collaborative teacher study group that includes chamber music collaboration.

The recent Race to the Top initiative calls for "increased learning time . . . to include additional time for . . . teachers to collaborate, plan, and engage in professional development within and across grades and subjects" (U.S. Department of Education 2009). Schools and districts often offer professional development opportunities for teachers that have little pertinence for music teachers' professional development needs or interests. Offering music-making professional development opportunities that allow teachers to share music arrangements that they have used with success would be both beneficial and inexpensive. Such an approach would also fulfill the goal of focusing professional development around subject matter or content knowledge (see Conway 2007; Darling-Hammond et al. 2009; Day and Gu 2010).

Another idea for including music-making in departmental or districtwide meetings would be to share different teachers' expertise in a variety of styles. For instance, a music teacher in the district might play jazz, rock, or fiddling music. This teacher could bring in snippets of music and teach some of the foundational skills and techniques associated with that genre, as well as offer suggestions for other pieces or artists that might spark interest. Many general music teachers incorporate music from around the world into their curricula. Sharing literature and background information about the genre or style could be helpful. If the music teacher chose to teach rote songs from different countries, each music teacher could choose to sing or play the song on his or her instrument of choice. Each could experience the music and then discuss appropriate additions to the melody to make an arrangement specific to different ensembles. Music-making in these ways could increase teachers' interest and confidence in sharing new arrangements and genres with their students.

For professional development, a music-making approach might be adopted through either formal programs or more individual, informal ways. I suggest that districts and schools approve and encourage music-making outside of the classroom as an acceptable professional development activity. Rehearsing and performing in a community orchestra, band, choir, or chamber music group could be counted toward development if documentation such as concert programs and videotaped portions of rehearsals and concerts were submitted. If a music teacher formed a small chamber ensemble, performing for students in the district's schools could demonstrate the value that music teachers assign to music-making in their lives. This example might inspire students by showing the levels of music-making that are achievable, and might help recruit ensemble music students, enrich the general population of students, and encourage other music teachers who are interested in engaging in music-making.

There are a multitude of music-making possibilities to consider. Should practicing one's own instrument or sight-reading music alone or with others count toward development if videotaped evidence is provided? Should written reflection about the value of these music-making activities be required? How many hours would be acceptable? Each state's department of education would undoubtedly have its own opinion on these subjects.

Professional development programs could be created to provide opportunities for teachers to better understand and refine the ways in which they integrate music-making and teaching. Standerfer (2008) suggests that meaningful professional development consists of five elements: it is voluntary, it is long-term, it occurs in the teachers' classroom contexts, it is reflective, and teachers have collegial support while engaging in it. These five elements should be incorporated into future professional development programs designed to help teachers better understand and refine how they integrate music-making into their classrooms. In-classroom reflection opportunities and action research should be encouraged within the community of music teachers. For instance, a year-long program could be developed that includes such activities as asking teachers to videotape themselves in the process of music-making in the classroom with their students. A reflection protocol might ask teachers to answer questions about why they chose to play their instruments at that moment, what they thought their students were learning at that moment, and what they noticed about student reactions. Both videotaped segments and these reflections could form the basis for more in-depth discussion within a group of music teachers.

Protocols and discussion could also be designed to help teachers better understand the role of music-making in their own and their students' lives. Discussions could be based around questions such as: Describe what made music-making meaningful to you as an elementary, middle, or high school student. Describe what makes music-making meaningful to you now. Are these reasons different? Describe obstacles to continuing your music-making. Why do you think your students want to make music? Are these reasons similar to the reasons you had for making music? In my experience, participants in such groups

are able to come to new realizations about themselves as they engage in conversations about their music-making and teaching.

Teachers might then ask their students: What do you like about music-making? What is you favorite piece and why? What is your favorite part of this class? Why do you continue to make music in this class? Do you make music in other ways? How do you think you will continue making music in the future?

This process of reflective questioning can help teachers better understand how music-making and teaching intersect. Such discussion also provides an opportunity for teachers to observe students, reflect on their own practice, and learn from other music teachers' experiences. This approach could be adopted through a separate professional development program or incorporated into a collaborative teacher study group. In-classroom reflection and sharing might constitute a portion of the sessions, but a significant part of each session should be devoted to music-making of both music that students are already playing and music that is chosen for the purpose of enjoyment.

CONCLUSION: MUSIC-MAKING AS A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITY FOR MUSIC TEACHERS

Conway, Albert, Hibbard, and Hourigan (2005) have questioned whether it is possible for arts teachers to have a voice in designing and implementing their own professional development. Professional development policies vary from state to state, but recent efforts have shown the possibility of creating professional development requirements that are relevant for each teacher. In Rhode Island, for instance, teachers have "individual professional development plans," known as "I-Plans," which are intended to help teachers focus on "personal and professional goals, student achievement, teaching and learning, and school improvement initiatives" (Rhode Island Department of Elementary and Secondary Education 2010).

Policymakers in other states may need to be convinced of music-making's connection to music teaching and student learning. Instead of portraying an individual teacher's music-making as unrelated to the job of teaching music, this activity should be framed as a source of inspiration for both the teacher involved in the music-making and his or her students. Three benefits of this approach for students might be cited as: (*a*) the ability to see as role models those teachers who balance engagement with their art forms and teaching; (*b*) the presence of excellent instrumental models in the classroom, fostering more efficient student learning; and (*c*) the presence of inspired and passionate teaching about playing and performing. Reasons for using music-making as a professional development activity might include teachers' ability to (*a*) learn literature and new genres of music to bring back to students; (*b*) develop strategies for helping students through engagement in personal music-making; (*c*) maintain their listening and playing skills at high levels to provide excellent models for students, as well as support their own identity as musicians, increasing their sense of efficacy and agency; (*d*) relate to students as learners and become more empathetic to the challenges these learners are facing; and (*f*) combat burn-out.

As Hammel (2007) notes, it is not beneficial to have a one-size-fits-all approach to professional development. I am not suggesting that there is one way to be a successful music teacher or that all music teachers must devote significant time to music-making. However, many music teachers do not think of music-making and music teaching as two separate aspects of being music teachers. Instead, in my experience, they describe music-making and teaching as two essential aspects of their identities that intersect to form and inform the music teacher and positively influence student learning in a multitude of ways (Pellegrino 2010). Therefore, I argue that music-making is a powerful personal and pedagogical tool in music education for many music teachers, and I urge policymakers to recognize the benefits explored in this article and provide opportunities for music teachers to engage in professional development that includes a music-making component.

REFERENCES

Ball, L. 1990. What role: Artist or teacher? *Art Education* 43 (1): 54–59.

Beijaard, D., P. C. Meijer, G. Morine-Dershimer, and H. Tillema, eds. 2005. *Teacher professional development in changing conditions*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Bernard, R. J. 2004. Striking a chord: Elementary general music teachers' expressions of their identities as musician-teachers. Ph.D. diss., Harvard University.

———. 2005. Music-making, making selves, making it right: A call for reframing music teacher education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 4 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bernard4_2.pdf.

Bouij, C. 2007. A comment to Rhoda Bernard: Reframing or oversimplification? *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 6 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bouji6_2.pdf.

Conway, C. 2007. Setting an agenda for professional development, policy, practice and research in music education. *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 17 (1): 56–61.

Conway, C., D. Albert, S. Hibbard, and R. Hourigan, 2005. Voices of music teachers regarding professional development. *Arts Education Policy Review* 107 (1): 11–14.

Csíkszentmihályi, M. 1991. *Flow: The psychology of optimal experience*. New York: Harper Perennial.

Darling-Hammond, L., R. Wie, A. Andree, N. Richardson, and S. Orphanos. 2009. Professional learning in the learning profession: A status report on teacher development in the United States and abroad. Dallas: National Staff Development Council.

Day, C. 2010. *Associations between identity, well-being, and effectiveness*. Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association's Annual Meeting, Denver, CO, April 30–May 4.

Day, C., and Q. Gu. 2010. *The new lives of teachers*. New York: Routledge.

Day, C., A. Kington, G. Stobart, and P. Sammons. 2006. The personal and professional selves of teachers: Stable and unstable identities. *British Educational Research Journal* 32 (4): 601–16.

Dickey, M. R. 1991. A comparison of verbal instruction and nonverbal teacher-student modeling in instrumental ensembles a comparison of verbal instruction and nonverbal teacher student modeling in instrumental ensembles. *Journal of Research in Music Education* 39 (2): 132–42.

Dolloff, L. 2006. Celebrating and nurturing the identity of the musician/teacher. In *Music and human beings: Music and identity*. ed. B. Stålhammar, 123–36. Orebro, Sweden: Universitetsbiblioteket.

———. 2007. All the things we are: Balancing our multiple identities in music teaching. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 6 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Dolloff6_2.pdf.

Dust, L. J. 2006. The negotiation and reconciliation of musician and teacher identities. Ph.D. diss., University of Alberta.

Elliott, D. J. 1995. *Music matters: A new philosophy of music education*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Fredrickson, W. E. 2006. Commentary: Music matters. *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 15 (2): 6–7.

Gillespie, R., and D. Hamann. 1999. Career choices among string music education students in American colleges and universities. *Journal of Research in Music Education* 47 (3): 266–78.

Goolsby, T. W. 1996. Time use in instrumental rehearsals: A comparison of experienced, novice, and student teachers. *Journal of Research in Music Education* 44 (4): 286–303.

Guskey, T. R. 1999. Evaluating professional development. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, Inc.

Hamann, D. L., and R. Gillespie. 2003. *Strategies for teaching strings: Building a successful string and orchestra program.* New York: Oxford University Press.

———. 2009. *Strategies for teaching strings: Building a successful string and orchestra program*. 2nd ed. New York: Oxford University Press.

Hammel, A. M. 2007. Professional development research in general education. *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 17 (1): 22–32.

Haston, W. 2007. Teacher modeling as an effective teaching strategy. *Music Educators Journal* 93 (4): 26–30.

Heck, M. L. 1991. Teacher as artist: A metaphor drawn from the paradigms of M.C. Richards, Maxine Greene and Eleanor Duckworth. Ph.D. diss., University of North Carolina, Greensboro.

Isbell, D. S. 2006. Socialization and occupational identity among preservice music teachers enrolled in traditional baccalaureate degree programs. Ph.D. diss., University of Colorado, Boulder.

Jorgensen, E. 2006. Toward a social theory of musical identities. In *Music and human beings: Music and identity*, ed. B. Stålhammar, 27–44. Orebro, Sweden: Universitetsbiblioteket.

———. 2008. *The art of teaching music.* Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Kahn, W. A. 1990. The psychological conditions of personal engagement and disengagement at work. *Academy of Management Journal* 33 (4): 692–724.

———. 1992. To be fully there: Psychological presence at work. *Human Relations*. 45 (4): 321–50.

Kokotsaki, D., and S. Hallam. 2007. Higher education music students' perceptions of the benefits of participative music making. *Music Education Research* 9 (1): 93–109.

Korthagen, F. A. J. 2004. In search of the essence of a good teacher: Towards a more holistic approach in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education* 20:77–97.

Lyubomirsky, S., K. M. Sheldon, and D. Schkad. 2005. Pursuing happiness: The architecture of sustainable change. *Review of General Psychology* 9 (2): 111–31.

Meijer, P. C., F. A. J. Korthagen, and A. Vasalos. 2009. Supporting presence in teacher education: The connection between the personal and professional aspects of teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education* 25:297–308.

Nielsen, F. V. 2006. On the relation between music and man: Is there a common basis, or is it altogether individually and socially constructed? In *Music and human beings: Music and identity*, ed. B. Stålhammar, 163–82. Orebro, Sweden: Universitetsbiblioteket.

Pellegrino, K. 2009. Connections between performer and teacher identities in music teachers: Setting an agenda for research. *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 19 (1): 39–55.

———. 2010. The meanings and values of music-making in the lives of string teachers: Exploring the intersections of music-making and teaching. Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan.

Regelski, T. 2007. Music teacher—meaning and practice, identity, and position. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 6 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/php/archives_v6.php#6_2.

Rhode Island Department of Elementary and Secondary Education. 2010. Individual professional development plans "I-Plans." Office of Educator Quality and Certification. http://www.ride.ri.gov/educatorquality/iplans.aspx.

Roberts, B. A. 2007. Music-making, making selves, making it right: A counterpart to Rhoda Bernard. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 6 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Roberts6_2.pdf.

Rodgers, C. R., and M. B. Raider-Roth. 2006. Presence in teaching. *Teachers and Teaching* 12 (3): 265–87.

Russell, J. A. 2009. String music educators' job satisfaction: Underlying structures and relationships with various factors. *Journal of String Research* 4:39–58.

Ruud, E. 1999. Music and the quality of life. *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 6 (2): 86–97.

———. 2006. The role of music in the development of identity. In *Music and human beings: Music and identity*. ed. B. Stålhammar, 59–69. Orebro, Sweden: Universitetsbiblioteket.

Sammons, P., C. Day, A. Kington, Q. Gu, G. Stobart, and R. Smees. 2007. Exploring variations in teachers' work, lives and their effects on pupils: Key findings and implications from a longitudinal mixed-method study. *British Educational Research Journal* 33 (5): 681–701.

Scheib, J. W. 2006. Policy implications for teacher retention: Meeting the needs of the dual identities of arts educators. *Arts Education Policy Review* 107 (6): 5–10.

Seligman, M. P., and M. Csíkszentmihályi. 2000. Positive psychology: An introduction. *American Psychologist* 55 (1): 5–14.

Smith, C., and M. Gillespie. 2007. Research on professional development and teacher change: Implications for adult basic education. *Review of Adult Learning and Literacy* 7:205–44.

Stålhammar, B., ed. 2006. *Music and human beings: Music and identity*. Orebro, Sweden: Universitetsbiblioteket.

Standerfer, S. L. 2008. Learning from the national board for professional teacher certification (NBPTS) in music. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education* 176:77–88.

Stanley, A. M. 2009. The experiences of elementary music teachers in a collaborative teacher study group. Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan.

Stefanakis, M. 2005. How music might impact on us and the implications for music education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 4 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Stefanakis4_2.pdf.

Stephens, J. 2007. Different weather. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 6 (2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Stephens6_2.pdf.

Thornton, A. 2005. The artist teacher as reflective practitioner. *International Journal of Art and Design Education* 24 (2): 166–74.

U.S. Department of Education. 2009. Race to the top program executive summary. Washington, DC. http://www2.ed.gov/programs/racetothetop/executive-summary.pdf.

Woodford, P. G. 2002. The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music education majors. In *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning*, ed. R. Colwell, and C. Richardson, 675–94. New York: Oxford University Press.