Opening the Black Box on Intl Aid Data Section

Jack Hasler

August 3, 2018

So this is the document for preparing and presenting results. Moving things over from various other files. The goal of this is to be a working document that can eventually become an appendix to the paper. We'll pull our main models from here and keep the others as robustness checks.

Importing the libraries that we'll need for all of the following projects.

Gonna break this into three big sections for now. (1) Analysis by Recipient (target?) country, (2) Analysis by donor-recipient dyad, and (3) Subnational analysis. If there are not some descriptive statistics in every section, there should be!

Analysis by Recipient-Year

Here are some descriptive statistics on the recipient-year data.

- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:11:47 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:11:48 PM
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:12:44 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:12:53 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:02 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:11 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:20 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:26 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:31 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:36 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:41 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:47 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:13:52 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

Table 1: Summary Statistics By Year

mean_ngo	0.08	0.14	0.09	0.10	0.11	0.13	0.12	0.11	0.13	0.11	0.11	0.10	0.11
mean_igo	0.13	0.38	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.13	0.11	0.13	0.11	0.14	0.13	0.12	0.13
mean_corp	0.001	0	0.001	0.0003	0.002	0.01	0.01	0.005	0.01	0.005	0.004	0.004	0.04
mean_gov_o	0.55	0.39	0.67	0.75	0.69	0.61	0.65	0.61	0.59	0.54	0.54	0.56	0.52
mean_gov_3	0	0	0	0	0.02	0.01	0.19	0.23	0.36	0.35	0.37	0.42	0.45
mean_gov_r	0	0.01	0	0.47	0.43	0.41	0.63	0.60	0.60	0.57	0.62	0.64	0.64
mean_gov_d	0	0	0	0	0	0.26	0.63	0.60	0.59	0.56	0.62	0.64	0.63
mean_disbursement	53.95	15.97	89.40	144.86	188.45	234.46	279.03	291.10	325.79	364.90	379.88	393.81	365.76
sum_total	7,499.22	1,820.44	13,409.64	21,729.55	28,455.76	36,106.27	42,692.21	43,374.11	48,542.23	54,370.00	56,222.27	58,283.85	54,132.60
Year	2,005	2,004	2,006	2,007	2,008	2,000	2,010	2,011	2,012	2,013	2,014	2,015	2,016
	1	2	က	4	2	9	7	∞	6	10	11	12	13

Table 2: Summary Statistics by Recipient

		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	mary Statistics by	receipient				
	RecipientName	sum_total	mean_disbursement	mean_gov_d	mean_gov_r	mean_gov_3	mean_gov_o	mean_co
1 2	Philippines Mozambique	7,369.37 $5,282.54$	566.87 406.35	0.47 0.39	$0.53 \\ 0.57$	0.37 0.39	0.62 0.72	0.002 0.002
3	Democratic Republic of the Congo	5,887.42	452.88	0.28	0.41	0.28	0.55	0.002
4 5	South Africa Peru	5,466.98 $4,054.22$	420.54 311.86	0.22 0.40	$0.22 \\ 0.36$	0.18 0.33	0.51 0.56	$0.01 \\ 0.003$
6 7	India Indonesia	14, 990.88 19, 285.61	1, 153.14 1, 483.51	0.46 0.50	0.60 0.60	0.28 0.50	0.69 0.68	0.002 0.002
8	Bolivia	2,793.59	214.89	0.38	0.51	0.33	0.61	0.01
9 10	Kenya China (People's Republic of)	5,568.76 8,770.72	428.37 674.67	$0.31 \\ 0.52$	$0.41 \\ 0.62$	0.27 0.20	$0.52 \\ 0.74$	0.003 0.002
11	West Bank and Gaza Strip	10,277.16	790.55	0.37	0.31	0.31	0.54	0.01
12 13	$egin{array}{c} { m Iraq} \\ { m Afghanistan} \end{array}$	15, 645.93 28, 969.05	1, 203.53 2, 228.39	$0.38 \\ 0.22$	$0.34 \\ 0.31$	0.25 0.18	0.51 0.38	0.001 0.01
14 15	$ar{ ext{Viet Nam}}$ Ethiopia	9,976.78 8,735.94	767.44 672.00	$0.54 \\ 0.44$	0.66 0.57	0.41 0.32	$0.79 \\ 0.72$	0.003 0.002
16	Brazil	13,826.61	1,063.59	0.49	0.45	0.21	0.66	0.001
17 18	Nicaragua Rwanda	2, 278.05 3, 339.81	175.23 256.91	$0.36 \\ 0.44$	$0.50 \\ 0.55$	0.36 0.39	0.62 0.71	0.002 0.001
19	Serbia	6,723.25	517.17	0.24	0.40	0.24	0.48	0.03
20 21	Angola Ecuador	1,983.90 3,386.97	152.61 260.54	0.34 0.39	0.48 0.39	0.15 0.22	0.58 0.58	0.001 0.0004
22 23	Uganda Tanzania	4,785.75 7,782.94	368.13 598.69	0.36 0.42	$0.47 \\ 0.55$	0.30 0.36	$0.64 \\ 0.71$	0.004 0.002
24	Nigeria	8, 131.23	625.48	0.25	0.42	0.25	0.56	0.005
25 26	Colombia Cambodia	13, 138.53 2, 847.03	1,010.66 219.00	$0.50 \\ 0.31$	$0.45 \\ 0.39$	0.44 0.28	$0.67 \\ 0.49$	0.001 0.01
27	Egypt	8,836.83	679.76	0.44	0.58	0.39	0.74	0.002
28 29	Bosnia and Herzegovina Guatemala	3,113.25 $3,464.82$	239.48 266.52	0.26 0.33	$0.37 \\ 0.33$	0.26 0.28	$0.44 \\ 0.48$	$0.02 \\ 0.01$
30 31	Senegal Bangladesh	2,742.63 8,348.09	210.97 642.16	0.40 0.41	$0.60 \\ 0.51$	0.27 0.37	0.75 0.59	$0.01 \\ 0.002$
32	Sri Lanka	2,679.32	206.10	0.43	0.53	0.23	0.63	0.001
33 34	$egin{array}{c} egin{array}{c} egin{array}$	8,561.81 15,023.60	658.60 1, 155.66	$0.41 \\ 0.44$	0.62 0.58	0.27 0.38	0.84 0.66	0.004 0.004
35	Burundi	1,678.80	129.14	0.39	0.50	0.35	0.56	0.002
36 37	Ghana Burkina Faso	5,078.56 $2,523.04$	390.66 194.08	$0.42 \\ 0.44$	$0.62 \\ 0.64$	$0.42 \\ 0.44$	0.81 0.80	$0.01 \\ 0.002$
38 39	Nepal Thailand	3, 418.67 1, 481.31	262.97 113.95	0.30 0.42	$0.43 \\ 0.54$	0.30 0.11	0.49 0.69	0.002 0.001
40	Zambia	2,441.11	187.78	0.26	0.43	0.26	0.60	0.005
41 42	$egin{array}{c} \mathbf{Mexico} \\ \mathbf{Benin} \end{array}$	15,639.73 1,672.33	1, 203.06 128.64	$0.53 \\ 0.41$	0.53 0.61	0.48 0.17	0.77 0.78	0.01 0.003
43	Mali	3,095.53	238.12	0.33	0.52	0.33	0.68	0.003
44 45	Ukraine Honduras	7,773.42 $2,875.79$	647.78 221.21	0.30 0.38	$0.32 \\ 0.54$	0.28 0.14	0.48 0.67	$0.05 \\ 0.01$
46 47	Cabo Verde Sudan	580.64 3, 294.08	44.66 253.39	0.47 0.15	0.68 0.18	0.14 0.07	0.88 0.21	0.0004 0.01
48	El Salvador	2,055.64	158.13	0.39	0.53	0.24	0.62	0.01
49 50	Georgia Zimbabwe	3,874.80 1,872.91	298.06 144.07	0.31 0.11	$0.45 \\ 0.11$	0.26 0.07	0.50 0.23	$0.01 \\ 0.002$
51	Chile	1,204.55	92.66	0.38	0.33	0.03	0.66	0.004
52 53	Namibia Madagascar	649.81 $1,545.99$	49.99 118.92	$0.37 \\ 0.38$	$0.37 \\ 0.52$	0.24 0.29	0.59 0.71	$0.0001 \\ 0.004$
54 55	Lao People's Democratic Republic Mongolia	1,297.63 2,305.95	99.82 177.38	$0.46 \\ 0.32$	$0.61 \\ 0.43$	0.23 0.19	$0.74 \\ 0.54$	0.002 0.02
56	Malawi	2,529.49	194.58	0.32	0.48	0.32	0.60	0.002
57 58	Niger Kyrgyzstan	1,679.42 $1,755.00$	129.19 135.00	0.40 0.26	$0.59 \\ 0.42$	0.40 0.18	0.78 0.51	$0.001 \\ 0.003$
59 60	Jordan Timor-Leste	5,040.64 1,265.05	387.74 97.31	0.38 0.32	0.49 0.39	0.26 0.22	0.54 0.46	0.003 0.001
61	Kazakhstan	4,352.10	334.78	0.30	0.31	0.24	0.47	0.07
62 63	Haiti Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	3, 472.96 1, 520.19	267.15 116.94	0.26 0.28	$0.34 \\ 0.40$	0.20 0.16	$0.37 \\ 0.46$	0.01 0.02
64	Argentina Cameroon	4, 918.34 1, 473.22	378.33 113.32	0.49 0.42	0.49 0.59	0	0.74	0.01
65 66	Albania	1,671.87	128.61	0.28	0.42	0.36 0.28	0.77 0.48	0.0003 0.02
67 68	Turkey Moldova	20,651.38 1,671.64	1,588.57 128.59	$0.32 \\ 0.27$	$0.47 \\ 0.39$	0.20 0.27	$0.57 \\ 0.45$	$0.02 \\ 0.01$
69	Uzbekistan	1,497.88	115.22	0.48	0.60	0.20	0.68	0.001
70 71	Europe, regional Yemen	3,875.60 $2,097.65$	298.12 161.36	0.16 0.35	0.13 0.48	0.09 0.10	0.24 0.59	$0.01 \\ 0.04$
72 73	Dominican Republic Venezuela	3, 411.15 387.33	262.40 29.79	0.47 0.31	$0.47 \\ 0.31$	0.37 0.18	$0.75 \\ 0.45$	$0.004 \\ 0.0002$
74	Azerbaijan	1,836.86	141.30	0.33	0.43	0.16	0.47	0.01
75 76	Armenia Sao Tome and Principe	2,025.93 139.61	155.84 10.74	0.30 0.38	0.46 0.60	0.22 0.19	0.50 0.80	$0.02 \\ 0.0002$
77	Jamaica	1,730.40	144.20	0.52	0.52	0.22	0.71	0.001
78 79	Croatia Malaysia	812.15 278.04	116.02 21.39	0.05 0.35	0.10 0.29	0 0	$0.49 \\ 0.64$	$0.01 \\ 0.005$
80 81	Guinea-Bissau Syrian Arab Republic	360.22 1, 204.94	27.71 92.69	0.29 0.30	$0.46 \\ 0.24$	0.05 0.11	$0.63 \\ 0.59$	$0.001 \\ 0.01$
82	Guinea	1,029.68	79.21	0.35	0.49	0.25	0.65	0.001
83 84	Paraguay Papua New Guinea	1,369.63 $2,592.54$	105.36 199.43	0.39 0.21	$0.53 \\ 0.28$	0 0.09	0.64 0.35	$0.002 \\ 0.002$
85 86	Algeria Iran	713.33 173.08	54.87 13.31	0.43 0.19	0.36 0.19	0.26 0	$0.78 \\ 0.46$	$0.01 \\ 0.002$
87	Cuba	317.58	24.43	0.11	0.11	0.07	0.23	0.002
88 89	Panama Tunisia	2,981.86 $5,429.37$	229.37 417.64	$0.41 \\ 0.42$	$0.41 \\ 0.64$	$0.34 \\ 0.35$	0.73 0.86	$0.001 \\ 0.01$
90 91	Fiji Belarus	339.70 871.44	26.13 72.62	0.20 0.12	$0.17 \\ 0.12$	0 0.09	0.37 0.23	$0.0004 \\ 0.02$
92	Bhutan	440.30	33.87	0.47	0.67	0	0.74	0.0002
93 94	Chad Tajikistan	816.85 986.69	62.83 75.90	0.36 0.30	$0.51 \\ 0.43$	$0.26 \\ 0.14$	$0.71 \\ 0.47$	0.001 0.02
95	Myanmar	2,740.79	210.83	0.22	0.20	0.18	0.37	0.003
96 97	Liberia Sierra Leone	2,574.60 1,653.78	198.05 127.21	0.23 0.23	$0.35 \\ 0.34$	0.13 0.11	0.35 0.51	$0.01 \\ 0.0002$
98 99	Eritrea Cote d Ivoire	269.95 1,946.27	$20.77 \\ 149.71$	0.44 0.38	0.56 0.58	$0.22 \\ 0.17$	0.64 0.68	$0.001 \\ 0.01$
100	Mauritania	1,003.16	77.17	0.37	0.55	0.31	0.75	0.0005
$101 \\ 102$	Costa Rica Togo	892.71 774.69	74.39 59.59	$0.37 \\ 0.40$	$0.37 \\ 0.53$	0 0.28	0.63 0.67	$0.001 \\ 0.01$
103	Gambia	252.06	19.39	0.35	0.53	0	0.74	0.01
$\frac{104}{105}$	Botswana Uruguay	1,309.71 994.70	$100.75 \\ 76.52$	0.42 0.39	0.61 0.39	0.27	0.71 0.70	$0.01 \\ 0.001$
106 107	Lesotho Lebanon	426.08 1,830.89	32.78 4 40.84	0.44 0.28	$0.57 \\ 0.25$	0.15 0.16	$0.76 \\ 0.44$	0.0001 0.01
108	Turkmenistan	126.10	$\mathbf{o}_{9.70}$	0.15	0.15	0.02	0.36	0.02
109 110	Somalia Djibouti	1,866.73 374.43	143.59 28.80	$0.04 \\ 0.37$	$0.04 \\ 0.51$	0.04	0.06 0.72	$0.01 \\ 0.002$
111 112	Gabon	310.07	23.85	0.46	0.46	0.38	0.84	0.01 0.001
113	Tonga Solomon Islands	237.47 $1,772.13$	19.79 147.68	$0.50 \\ 0.44$	0.61 0.56	$0.07 \\ 0.15$	0.73 0.63	0.002
114 115	Mauritius Vanuatu	519.87 359.63	39.99 29.97	0.38	0.53	0	0.74	0 002

Table 3: Recipient-Year: VDEM Polyarchy

Donor Gov Recip Gov Third Gov	Base 0.001	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls BE
Donor Gov Recip Gov Third Gov Other Gov	0.001				
Recip Gov Third Gov Other Gov	(0.008)	-0.005 (0.009)		0.002 (0.009)	-0.003 (0.009)
Third Gov Other Gov	0.001 (0.009)	-0.002 (0.009)		0.001	-0.003 (0.009)
Other Gov	0.004 (0.009)	0.0002 (0.009)		0.004 (0.009)	0.002 (0.009)
	0.003 (0.013)	0.008 (0.014)		0.004 (0.014)	0.008 (0.014)
All Gov			-0.001 (0.003)		
NGO	0.005 (0.023)	-0.005 (0.025)	-0.010 (0.023)	-0.0004 (0.023)	-0.003 (0.025)
IGO	0.023 (0.019)	0.027 (0.020)	0.019 (0.016)	0.020 (0.019)	0.028 (0.020)
Corporation	0.009 (0.115)	-0.001 (0.117)	-0.012 (0.116)	0.006 (0.116)	-0.018 (0.119)
$\log(\text{total})$	0.009*** (0.002)	0.007*** (0.003)	0.007***	0.009*** (0.002)	0.008*** (0.003)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.006 (0.010)	0.006 (0.010)		0.012 (0.008)
Urban		0.001 (0.002)	0.001 (0.001)		0.002^{**} (0.001)
$\log({ m Population})$		0.044 (0.046)	0.037 (0.045)		-0.020^{**} (0.009)
Constant				0.419^{***} (0.023)	0.563^{***} (0.161)
Observations \mathbb{R}^2	1,348	1,318	1,318	1,348	1,318
Adjusted \mathbb{R}^2 F Statistic 4.	-0.077 $4.675^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1213)}$	-0.077 3.785^{***} (df = 11; 1181)	-0.075 5.141^{***} (df = 8; 1184)	0.023 4.966^{***} (df = 8; 1339)	0.030 4.628^{***} (df = 11; 1306)

 * p<0.1; * p<0.05; *** p<0.01

Table 4: Recipient-Year: VDEM LibDem

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.0002 (0.007)	-0.001 (0.007)		0.001 (0.007)	-0.002 (0.007)
Recip Gov	-0.0003 (0.007)	-0.001 (0.007)		-0.0004 (0.007)	-0.003 (0.007)
Third Gov	0.005 (0.007)	0.005 (0.007)		0.005 (0.007)	0.004 (0.007)
Other Gov	0.001 (0.011)	0.001 (0.011)		0.002 (0.011)	0.004 (0.011)
All Gov			0.001 (0.003)		
NGO	0.005 (0.019)	0.004 (0.020)	0.003 (0.019)	0.001 (0.019)	0.001 (0.020)
IGO	0.019 (0.015)	0.019 (0.016)	0.018 (0.013)	0.016 (0.015)	0.020 (0.016)
Corporation	-0.023 (0.092)	-0.026 (0.094)	-0.027 (0.093)	-0.026 (0.093)	-0.041 (0.096)
$\log(ext{total})$	0.007*** (0.002)	0.007*** (0.002)	0.006*** (0.002)	0.007*** (0.002)	0.006^{***} (0.002)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.001 (0.008)	0.001 (0.008)		0.008 (0.007)
Urban		0.0002 (0.001)	0.0002 (0.001)		0.002^{**} (0.001)
$\log({ m Population})$		0.010 (0.037)	0.012 (0.036)		-0.023^{***} (0.009)
Constant				0.293^{***} (0.021)	0.529*** (0.148)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,348 \\ 0.026 \\ -0.081 \\ 4.089^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1213)} \end{array} $	1,318 0.027 -0.086 2.930*** (df = 11; 1181)	1,318 0.026 -0.083 3.991^{***} (df = 8; 1184)	1,348 0.026 0.020 4.407*** (df = 8; 1339)	1,318 0.035 0.027 4.304*** (df = 11; 1306)
Note:				·ď	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 5: Recipient-Year: VDEM PartipDem

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.001 (0.005)	-0.003 (0.005)		0.001 (0.005)	-0.003 (0.005)
Recip Gov	-0.002 (0.005)	-0.004 (0.005)		-0.002 (0.005)	-0.005 (0.005)
Third Gov	0.003 (0.005)	0.001 (0.005)		0.003 (0.005)	0.002 (0.005)
Other Gov	0.001 (0.008)	0.004 (0.008)		0.001 (0.008)	0.004 (0.008)
All Gov			-0.002 (0.002)		
NGO	0.008 (0.013)	0.002 (0.014)	-0.002 (0.013)	0.006 (0.013)	0.003 (0.014)
IGO	0.018^* (0.011)	0.021^* (0.011)	0.016^* (0.009)	0.017 (0.011)	0.021^* (0.011)
Corporation	-0.056 (0.065)	-0.062 (0.066)	-0.067 (0.065)	-0.058 (0.066)	-0.070 (0.067)
$\log(ext{total})$	0.006^{***} (0.001)	0.006*** (0.002)	0.005^{***} (0.001)	0.006*** (0.001)	0.006^{***} (0.002)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.004 (0.006)	0.004 (0.006)		0.007
Urban		0.001 (0.001)	0.0005 (0.001)		0.002^{***} (0.001)
$\log({ m Population})$		0.031 (0.026)	0.029 (0.025)		-0.009 (0.007)
Constant				0.245^{***} (0.016)	0.268** (0.115)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ²	1,348 0.040 -0.066	1,318 0.045 -0.065	1,318 0.044 -0.063	1,348 0.037 0.031	1,318 0.048 0.040
F Statistic	6.297^{***} (df = 8; 1213)	5.054^{***} (df = 11; 1181)	6.840^{***} (df = 8; 1184)	6.405^{***} (df = 8; 1339)	5.897^{***} (df = 11; 1306)

 * p<0.1; * p<0.05; *** p<0.01

Table 6: Recipient-Year: VDEM DelibDem

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.002 (0.007)	0.004 (0.008)		0.002 (0.008)	-0.0004 (0.008)
Recip Gov	-0.005 (0.008)	-0.004 (0.008)		-0.005 (0.008)	-0.007 (0.008)
Third Gov	-0.002 (0.008)	-0.001 (0.008)		-0.002 (0.008)	-0.003 (0.008)
Other Gov	0.005 (0.012)	0.002 (0.013)		0.007 (0.012)	0.009 (0.013)
All Gov			-0.0001 (0.003)		
NGO	0.018 (0.020)	0.020 (0.022)	0.018 (0.021)	0.013 (0.021)	0.014 (0.022)
091	0.033^{**} (0.017)	0.032* (0.018)	0.031** (0.014)	0.031^* (0.017)	0.035* (0.018)
Corporation	0.011 (0.102)	0.008 (0.103)	0.008 (0.103)	0.007 (0.103)	-0.005 (0.105)
log(total)	0.009*** (0.002)	0.009*** (0.002)	0.009*** (0.002)	0.009*** (0.002)	0.008*** (0.002)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.001 (0.009)	0.001 (0.009)		0.006
Urban		-0.002 (0.001)	-0.002 (0.001)		0.001^* (0.001)
log(Population)		0.009 (0.041)	0.011 (0.040)		-0.016^* (0.009)
Constant				0.308*** (0.021)	0.461^{***} (0.152)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,347 \\ 0.024 \\ -0.084 \\ 3.755^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1212)} \end{array} $	1,317 0.025 -0.087 2.807^{***} (df = 11; 1180)	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,317 \\ 0.025 \\ -0.084 \\ 3.822^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1183)} \end{array} $	1,347 0.022 0.017 3.838*** (df = 8; 1338)	$1,317 \\ 0.025 \\ 0.016 \\ 2.940^{***} \text{ (df} = 11; 1305)$
Note:				·d *	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 7: Recipient-Year: VDEM EgalDem

			$Dependent \ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.002 (0.005)	0.0002 (0.005)		0.002 (0.005)	-0.001 (0.005)
Recip Gov	0.0004 (0.005)	0.00004 (0.005)		0.001 (0.005)	-0.001 (0.005)
Third Gov	-0.0002 (0.005)	-0.001 (0.005)		-0.001 (0.005)	-0.001 (0.005)
Other Gov	0.003 (0.008)	0.002 (0.008)		0.003 (0.008)	0.004 (0.008)
All Gov			0.0002 (0.002)		
NGO	0.011 (0.014)	0.010 (0.015)	0.009 (0.014)	0.007 (0.014)	0.008 (0.015)
ODI	0.017 (0.011)	0.017 (0.012)	0.016 (0.010)	0.014 (0.011)	0.018 (0.012)
Corporation	0.021 (0.067)	0.015 (0.068)	0.013 (0.068)	0.021 (0.068)	0.008
log(total)	0.006*** (0.001)	0.006*** (0.002)	0.006*** (0.002)	0.005*** (0.001)	0.005*** (0.002)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.002 (0.006)	0.002 (0.006)		0.007
Urban		-0.0001 (0.001)	-0.0001 (0.001)		0.001*** (0.001)
$\log({ m Population})$		0.010 (0.027)	0.008 (0.026)		-0.025*** (0.007)
Constant				0.292*** (0.016)	0.574^{***} (0.119)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,347 \\ 0.033 \\ -0.074 \\ 5.188^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1212)} \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,317 \\ 0.035 \\ -0.077 \\ 3.861^{***} \text{ (df = 11; 1180)} \end{array} $	1,317 0.035 -0.074 5.312^{***} (df = 8; 1183)	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,347 \\ 0.032 \\ 0.026 \\ 5.443^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1338)} \end{array} $	$1,317 \\ 0.047 \\ 0.039 \\ 5.868^{***} \text{ (df = 11; 1305)}$

 * p<0.1; * p<0.05; *** p<0.01

Table 8: Recipient-Year: Polity

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.089 (0.212)	0.168 (0.232)		0.074 (0.213)	0.111 (0.223)
Recip Gov	-0.202 (0.235)	-0.045 (0.244)		-0.237 (0.236)	-0.145 (0.245)
Third Gov	0.402^* (0.214)	0.480^{**} (0.225)		0.400* (0.216)	0.482^{**} (0.223)
Other Gov	-0.504 (0.349)	-0.706^{*} (0.368)		-0.486 (0.351)	$-0.608* \ (0.364)$
All Gov			0.060 (0.092)		
NGO	-0.209 (0.656)	-0.096 (0.715)	0.255 (0.692)	-0.321 (0.657)	-0.042 (0.715)
IGO	0.975 (0.623)	1.141^* (0.662)	1.736^{***} (0.621)	0.845 (0.625)	1.046 (0.670)
Corporation	2.012 (2.791)	2.341 (2.805)	3.192 (2.793)	1.789 (2.804)	1.924 (2.855)
$\log(ext{total})$	0.320^{***} (0.072)	0.350^{***} (0.081)	0.339***	0.347^{***} (0.072)	0.381*** (0.079)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		-0.398 (0.269)	-0.423 (0.269)		-0.292 (0.236)
Urban		-0.061 (0.042)	-0.036 (0.041)		0.021 (0.021)
$\log({ m Population})$		1.180 (1.251)	2.176^* (1.207)		-0.583^{**} (0.281)
Constant				1.274^{**} (0.647)	11.831^{**} (4.813)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	1,168 0.054 -0.062 7.463^{***} (df = 8; 1039)	1,141 0.060 -0.061 5.819^{***} (df = 11; 1010)	1,141 0.050 -0.069 6.732^{***} (df = 8; 1013)	1,168 0.051 0.044 7.771*** (df = 8; 1159)	1,141 0.054 0.045 5.848^{***} (df = 11; 1129)
Note:				·d*	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 9: Recipient-Year: FH Civil Liberties

			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.143*** (0.049)	0.040 (0.051)		0.138*** (0.049)	0.137*** (0.051)
Recip Gov	0.085*	0.023 (0.051)		0.083 (0.051)	0.071 (0.053)
Third Gov	0.003 (0.050)	-0.104^{**} (0.051)		0.003 (0.051)	-0.033 (0.052)
Other Gov	-0.056 (0.078)	0.065 (0.080)		-0.062 (0.079)	-0.034 (0.081)
All Gov			0.003 (0.019)		
NGO	0.278^{**} (0.134)	0.082 (0.140)	0.053 (0.132)	0.319^{**} (0.135)	0.271^* (0.143)
IGO	0.008 (0.110)	-0.013 (0.112)	-0.063 (0.092)	0.038 (0.111)	0.015 (0.116)
Corporation	1.389** (0.664)	1.365^{**} (0.656)	1.298^{**} (0.651)	1.383^{**} (0.674)	1.347^{**} (0.683)
$\log(ext{total})$	-0.019 (0.013)	-0.051^{***} (0.015)	-0.047^{***} (0.015)	-0.016 (0.013)	-0.033^{**} (0.015)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.018 (0.055)	0.020 (0.055)		0.064 (0.050)
Urban		-0.00 <i>6</i> (0.009)	-0.007 (0.008)		-0.009^{**} (0.005)
$\log({ m Population})$		1.866*** (0.261)	1.778^{***} (0.253)		0.338*** (0.062)
Constant				4.001*** (0.147)	-1.393 (1.049)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	1,345 0.034 -0.073 5.276*** (df = 8; 1210)	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,315 \\ 0.080 \\ -0.026 \\ 9.288^{***} \text{ (df = 11; 1178)} \end{array} $	$1,315 \\ 0.075 \\ -0.029 \\ 12.046^{***} (df = 8; 1181)$	$1,345 \\ 0.034 \\ 0.028 \\ 5.904^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1336)}$	1,315 0.072 0.065 9.142*** (df = 11; 1303)

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 10: Recipient-Year: FH Personal Autonomy

			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	-0.168^{**} (0.081)	-0.128 (0.082)		-0.154^* (0.083)	-0.235^{***} (0.082)
Recip Gov	-0.096 (0.088)	-0.026 (0.086)		-0.103 (0.091)	-0.107 (0.089)
Third Gov	-0.087 (0.083)	0.030 (0.081)		-0.094 (0.085)	-0.039 (0.083)
Other Gov	0.260^{*} (0.135)	0.044 (0.132)		0.271^* (0.139)	0.182 (0.135)
All Gov			-0.034 (0.033)		
NGO	0.086 (0.254)	-0.223 (0.259)	-0.257 (0.250)	-0.024 (0.261)	-0.386 (0.266)
ODI	0.013 (0.236)	0.090 (0.233)	0.026 (0.217)	-0.103 (0.243)	-0.053 (0.244)
Corporation	0.707 (1.100)	0.344 (1.033)	0.242 (1.025)	0.758 (1.134)	0.271 (1.084)
$\log(ext{total})$	0.069^{**} (0.028)	0.038 (0.028)	0.034 (0.027)	0.068**	0.026 (0.029)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.298^{***} (0.097)	0.299*** (0.096)		0.356***
Urban		-0.052^{***} (0.015)	-0.055^{***} (0.015)		0.004 (0.009)
$\log({ m Population})$		-0.521 (0.452)	-0.607 (0.436)		-0.409^{***} (0.113)
Constant				7.402^{***} (0.277)	11.414^{***} (1.908)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,235 \\ 0.017 \\ -0.103 \\ 2.330^{**} \text{ (df = 8; 1100)} \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,207\\0.030\\-0.093\\3.044^{***}\text{ (df = 11; 1070)} \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,207 \\ 0.029 \\ -0.092 \\ 3.953^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1073)} \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,235 \\ 0.019 \\ 0.013 \\ 2.988^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1226)} \end{array} $	1,207 0.036 0.027 3.877*** (df = 11; 1195)
Note:				·ď*	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 11: Recipient-Year: FH Proportional Rep

			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.084 (0.075)	0.063 (0.082)		0.076	0.113 (0.079)
Recip Gov	0.135* (0.078)	0.146^* (0.081)		0.132^* (0.079)	0.175^{**} (0.081)
Third Gov	-0.105 (0.078)	-0.140^* (0.081)		-0.104 (0.078)	-0.101 (0.081)
Other Gov	-0.040 (0.121)	-0.034 (0.126)		-0.050 (0.122)	-0.088 (0.126)
All Gov			0.024 (0.031)		
NGO	0.210 (0.207)	0.184 (0.222)	0.241 (0.209)	0.271 (0.208)	0.322 (0.221)
ODI	-0.254 (0.170)	-0.400** (0.178)	-0.353^{**} (0.147)	-0.215 (0.171)	-0.367^{**} (0.180)
Corporation	0.913 (1.031)	0.979 (1.041)	1.010 (1.035)	0.950 (1.039)	1.072 (1.057)
$\log(ext{total})$	-0.053*** (0.021)	-0.073^{***} (0.025)	-0.060^{**} (0.024)	-0.050^{**} (0.021)	-0.068*** (0.024)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		-0.070 (0.088)	-0.065 (0.088)		-0.047 (0.075)
Urban		-0.025* (0.014)	-0.024^* (0.013)		-0.013^{**} (0.007)
log(Population)		1.350^{***} (0.414)	1.273^{***} (0.402)		0.272*** (0.080)
Constant				4.388*** (0.201)	1.107 (1.403)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	$1,345$ 0.011 -0.098 $1.750^* \text{ (df} = 8; 1210)$	1,315 0.026 -0.087 2.842^{***} (df = 11; 1178)	1,315 0.020 -0.090 3.024^{***} (df = 8; 1181)	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,345 \\ 0.014 \\ 0.008 \\ 2.418^{**} \text{ (df = 8; 1336)} \end{array} $	1,315 0.043 0.035 5.231*** (df = 11; 1303)
Note:				ď.	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 12: Recipient-Year: FH Rule of Law

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	-0.242^{**} (0.108)	-0.074 (0.118)		-0.227^{**} (0.110)	-0.223^* (0.114)
Recip Gov	-0.267^{**} (0.119)	-0.195 (0.123)		-0.262^{**} (0.120)	-0.288^{**} (0.124)
Third Gov	-0.169 (0.111)	-0.020 (0.117)		-0.174 (0.113)	-0.124 (0.116)
Other Gov	0.264 (0.181)	0.080 (0.190)		0.284 (0.184)	0.261 (0.189)
All Gov			-0.072 (0.047)		
NGO	-1.273*** (0.342)	-1.224^{***} (0.372)	-1.314^{***} (0.359)	-1.387^{***} (0.345)	-1.499^{***} (0.373)
IGO	-0.666^{**} (0.317)	-0.461 (0.335)	-0.536^* (0.311)	-0.767^{**} (0.321)	-0.636^* (0.341)
Corporation	-2.156 (1.483)	-2.163 (1.485)	-2.276 (1.472)	-2.108 (1.500)	-2.221 (1.517)
$\log(ext{total})$	0.024 (0.037)	0.064 (0.041)	0.049	0.017 (0.037)	0.052 (0.041)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.029 (0.139)	0.020 (0.138)		0.033 (0.123)
Urban		-0.030 (0.022)	-0.033 (0.021)		0.007 (0.012)
log(Population)		-2.058*** (0.650)	-2.070^{***} (0.626)		-0.778^{***} (0.150)
Constant				6.360*** (0.358)	18.113*** (2.547)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	1,235 0.063 -0.052 9.189^{***} (df = 8; 1100)	1,207 0.079 -0.038 8.391^{***} (df = 11; 1070)	1,207 0.078 -0.036 11.358*** (df = 8; 1073)	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,235 \\ 0.061 \\ 0.055 \\ 9.994^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 1226)} \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{c} 1,207 \\ 0.078 \\ 0.070 \\ 9.177^{***} \text{ (df = 11; 1195)} \end{array} $
Note:				d _*	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 13: Recipient-Year: FH Status

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.074^{**} (0.034)	0.048 (0.037)		0.069** (0.034)	0.082^{**} (0.036)
Recip Gov	0.026 (0.035)	0.019 (0.036)		0.024 (0.035)	0.037 (0.037)
Third Gov	-0.012 (0.035)	-0.038 (0.037)		-0.011 (0.035)	-0.011 (0.036)
Other Gov	-0.022 (0.054)	0.002 (0.057)		-0.027 (0.055)	-0.036 (0.057)
All Gov			0.012 (0.014)		
NGO	0.060 (0.093)	0.004 (0.100)	0.011 (0.094)	0.093 (0.094)	0.089 (0.100)
OĐI	-0.019 (0.077)	-0.047 (0.080)	-0.036 (0.066)	0.004 (0.077)	-0.028 (0.081)
Corporation	1.199^{***} (0.464)	1.247^{***} (0.469)	1.263^{***} (0.466)	1.212^{***} (0.468)	1.268^{***} (0.476)
log(total)	-0.018^* (0.009)	-0.023^{**} (0.011)	-0.021^* (0.011)	-0.015^{*} (0.009)	-0.018^* (0.011)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		-0.053 (0.040)	-0.052 (0.040)		-0.026 (0.033)
Urban		-0.009 (0.006)	-0.008 (0.006)		-0.005^* (0.003)
log(Population)		0.812*** (0.187)	0.810^{***} (0.181)		0.107^{***} (0.033)
Constant				2.122^{***} (0.084)	0.839 (0.578)
Observations R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	1,345 0.014 -0.095 2.215** (df = 8; 1210)	1,315 0.031 -0.081 3.387*** (df = 11; 1178)	1,315 0.029 -0.081 4.361*** (df = 8; 1181)	1,345 0.018 0.013 3.143*** (df = 8; 1336)	1,315 0.044 0.036 5.366*** (df = 11; 1303)
Note:				·d	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Analysis by Dyad-Year

Here are some descriptive statistics on the recipient-year data. "`{, message = FALSE, results='asis'} crs_by_types $RecipientName < -ifelse(crs_by_typesRecipientCode==247,$ "Cote d Ivoire",crs_by_types\$RecipientName)

crs by types <- crs by types %>% filter(round(total disbursement)!= 0) %>% filter(Year>2003)

tmp <- crs_by_types %>% select(Year,RecipientName,DonorName,total_disbursement,gov_d_percent,gov_r_percent,gov_3 %>% unique() %>% group_by(Year) %>% mutate(sum_total = sum(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_d = mean(gov_d_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_r = mean(gov_r_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_3 = mean(gov_3_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_o = mean(gov_o_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_corp = mean(corp_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_ngo = mean(ngo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_igo = mean(igo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_other = mean(other_percent, na.rm = TRUE)) %>% select(Year, sum_total, mean_disbursement, mean_gov_d, mean_gov_r, mean_gov_3, mean_gov_o, mean_gov_mean_igo, mean_ngo, mean_other) %>% unique()

stargazer(as.data.frame(tmp), digits = 2, type = 'latex', summary = FALSE, title = "Dyadic Summary Statistics By Year")

tmp <- crs_by_types %>% select(Year,RecipientName,DonorName,total_disbursement,gov_d_percent,gov_r_percent,gov_3 %>% unique() %>% group_by(RecipientName,DonorName) %>% mutate(sum_total = sum(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_disbursement = mean(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_d = mean(gov_d_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_r = mean(gov_r_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_o = mean(gov_o_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_o = mean(gov_o_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_ligo = mean(corp_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_ngo = mean(ngo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_ligo = mean(igo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_other = mean(other_percent, na.rm = TRUE)) %>% select(RecipientName,DonorName, sum_total, mean_disbursement, mean_gov_d, mean_gov_r, mean_gov_3, mean_gov_o, mean_corp, mean_igo, mean_ngo, mean_other) %>% unique() stargazer(as.data.frame(tmp),digits = 2, font.size = 'small', type = 'latex', summary = FALSE, title = 'Summary Statistics by Dyad')

"

- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:18:06 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:19:30 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:20:40 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:21:24 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:22:27 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:23:46 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:24:58 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:25:50 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:26:59 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

Table 14: Dyadic Year: VDEM Polyarchy

			$Dependent \ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.006***	0.001		0.006*** (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)
Recip Gov	0.001 (0.003)	_0.002 (0.003)		0.002 (0.003)	-0.003 (0.003)
Third Gov	0.003 (0.007)	0.002 (0.007)		0.002 (0.007)	0.001 (0.007)
Other Gov	-0.005** (0.002)	_0.003 (0.002)		-0.004** (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)
All Gov			-0.001 (0.002)		
NGO	0.001 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	-0.0003 (0.002)	0.001 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)
IGO	-0.001 (0.003)	-0.001 (0.003)	-0.001 (0.003)	-0.002 (0.003)	-0.003 (0.003)
Corporation	0.011 (0.010)	0.001 (0.010)	0.002 (0.010)	0.009 (0.010)	-0.002 (0.010)
log(total)	0.003***	0.002*** (0.0004)	0.002*** (0.0004)	0.003 *** (0.0004)	0.002*** (0.0004)
log(GDP)		0.029*** (0.003)	0.030***		0.023*** (0.002)
Urban		-0.001* (0.0005)	-0.001 (0.0004)		0.002*** (0.0002)
log(Population)		-0.027** (0.012)	-0.024** (0.012)		-0.017^{***} (0.002)
Constant				0.467*** (0.004)	0.504*** (0.037)
Observations	17,749	17,410	17,410	17,749	17,410
R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	$0.006 \\ -0.179 \\ 11.895*** (df = 8; 14962)$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.016 \\ -0.169 \\ 21.965^{***} \text{ (df} = 11; 14650) \end{array}$	$ \begin{array}{c} 0.016 \\ -0.169 \\ 29.799^{***} & (df = 8; 14653) \end{array} $	$0.061 \\ 0.061 \\ 144.408^{***} (df = 8; 17740)$	$0.091 \\ 0.090 \\ 156.146*** (df = 11; 17398)$

Table 15: Dyadic Year: VDEM LibDem

			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.005*** (0.002)	0.002 (0.002)		0.005*** (0.002)	-0.0003 (0.002)
Recip Gov	0.001 (0.002)	-0.0002 (0.002)		0.002 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)
Third Gov	0.0002 (0.006)	-0.001 (0.006)		-0.001 (0.006)	0.001 (0.006)
Other Gov	-0.004** (0.002)	-0.004** (0.002)		-0.003** (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)
All Gov			0.0001 (0.001)		
NGO	0.0005 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	0.0005 (0.002)	0.0001 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)
IGO	0.001 (0.002)	0.001 (0.002)	0.002 (0.002)	-0.0002 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)
Corporation	0.008)	0.003 (0.008)	0.004 (0.008)	0.007	-0.001 (0.008)
log(total)	0.002*** (0.0003)	0.002*** (0.0003)	0.002*** (0.0003)	0.002 *** (0.0003)	0.002*** (0.0003)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.018*** (0.002)	0.019*** (0.002)		0.017*** (0.002)
Urban		-0.002*** (0.0004)	-0.001*** (0.0004)		0.001*** (0.0002)
log(Population)		-0.008 (0.010)	-0.003 (0.010)		-0.020*** (0.002)
Constant				0.327*** (0.004)	0.457*** (0.035)
Observations R2	17,749	17,410 0.011	17,410	17,749	17,410
Adjusted R F Statistic	10.172^{***} (df = 8; 14962)	14.872*** (df = 11; 14650)	19.119^{***} (df = 8; 14653)	84.686*** (df = 8; 17740)	101.845*** (df = 11: 17398)

Table 16: Dyadic Year: VDEM PartipDem

			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.004*** (0.001)	0.0004		0.004*** (0.001)	0.001 (0.001)
Recip Gov	-0.0004 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)		-0.00003 (0.002)	-0.003** (0.002)
Third Gov	0.002 (0.004)	0.001 (0.004)		0.002 (0.004)	0.001 (0.004)
Other Gov	-0.004*** (0.001)	-0.003*** (0.001)		-0.004*** (0.001)	-0.002* (0.001)
All Gov			-0.001 (0.001)		
NGO	0.0002 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)	0.0002 (0.001)	-0.002 (0.001)
IGO	-0.002 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)	-0.003 (0.002)
Corporation	0.007	0.001 (0.006)	0.002 (0.006)	0.006 (0.006)	-0.001 (0.006)
log(total)	0.002*** (0.0002)	0.002 *** (0.0002)	0.002*** (0.0002)	0.002 *** (0.0002)	0.002*** (0.0002)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.016*** (0.002)	0.017*** (0.001)		0.013*** (0.001)
Urban		-0.001*** (0.0003)	-0.001*** (0.0003)		0.001*** (0.0001)
log(Population)		-0.002 (0.007)	0.001		-0.009*** (0.002)
Constant				0.279*** (0.003)	0.265*** (0.026)
Observations R2	17,749	17,410	17,410 0.019	17,749	17,410
Adjusted R ² F Statistic	-0.175 17.227*** (df = 8; 14962)	-0.165 26.768^{***} (df = 11; 14650)	-0.165 35.787*** (df = 8; 14653)	0.042 98.352^{***} (df = 8; 17740)	121.056^{***} (df = 11; 17398)
Note:					*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 17: Dyadic Year: VDEM DelibDem

	Base	Controls	Dependent variable: Gov Toxether	Base BE	Controls RE
	Dase	Controls	GOV LOGETHER	Dase nd	Controls ME
Donor Gov	0.003 (0.002)	0.003 (0.002)		0.003 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)
Recip Gov	-0.003 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.003)		-0.002 (0.002)	-0.005** (0.003)
Third Gov	-0.005 (0.006)	-0.006 (0.007)		-0.006 (0.006)	-0.008 (0.007)
Other Gov	-0.003* (0.002)	-0.004** (0.002)		-0.003 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)
All Gov			-0.001 (0.001)		
NGO	-0.0003 (0.002)	-0.0004 (0.002)	0.0005 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)
ODI	0.0003 (0.003)	0.001 (0.003)	0.002 (0.003)	-0.001 (0.003)	-0.001 (0.003)
Corporation	0.018**	0.014 (0.009)	0.015* (0.009)	0.017* (0.009)	0.010 (0.009)
log(total)	0.003*** (0.0004)	0.003*** (0.0004)	0.003*** (0.0004)	0.003*** (0.0003)	0.003*** (0.0004)
$\log(\text{GDP})$		0.024*** (0.002)	0.025***		0.012*** (0.002)
Urban		-0.004*** (0.0004)	-0.003*** (0.0004)		0.001*** (0.0002)
log(Population)		-0.041*** (0.012)	-0.036*** (0.011)		-0.013*** (0.002)
Constant				0.358*** (0.004)	0.417*** (0.036)
Observations R2	17,733	17,394	17,394	17,733	17,394
Adjusted R ² F Statistic	-0.179 -0.179 12.455*** (df = 8: 14946)	22.136^{***} (df = 11; 14634)	28.936^{***} (df = 8; 14637)	0.039 $0.683*** (df = 8; 17724)$	0.054 0.960^{***} (df = 11; 17382)

Table 18: Dyadic Year: VDEM EgalDem

			$Dependent\ variable:$		
•	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.003**	0.001		0.003** (0.001)	_0.002 (0.001)
Recip Gov	-0.0002 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)		0.0002 (0.002)	-0.003 (0.002)
Third Gov	-0.002 (0.004)	-0.002 (0.004)		-0.002 (0.004)	-0.003 (0.004)
Other Gov	-0.003** (0.001)	-0.003** (0.001)		-0.003** (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)
All Gov			-0.001 (0.001)		
NGO	0.0004 (0.001)	-0.0004 (0.001)	0.0002 (0.001)	0.00003 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)
IGO	-0.0005 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	0.0003 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)
Corporation	0.007	0.002 (0.006)	0.003 (0.006)	0.006	-0.0003 (0.006)
log(total)	0.002*** (0.0002)	0.002*** (0.0002)	0.002*** (0.0002)	0.002 *** (0.0002)	0.001*** (0.0002)
log(GDP)		0.016*** (0.002)	0.017*** (0.002)		0.014*** (0.001)
Urban		-0.001*** (0.0003)	-0.001*** (0.0003)		0.001*** (0.0001)
log(Population)		-0.016** (0.008)	-0.013* (0.007)		-0.025*** (0.002)
Constant				0.320*** (0.003)	0.554*** (0.027)
Observations R ²	17,733	17,394 0.014	17,394 0.013	17,733	17,394
Adjusted R ² F Statistic	-0.180 10.294^{***} (df = 8; 14946)	-0.172 -8.457^{***} (df = 11; 14634)	24.314^{***} (df = 8; 14637)	0.054 127.051^{***} (df = 8; 17724)	0.094 $163.633*** (df = 11; 17382)$

Table 19: Dyadic Year: Polity

ţ		Dependent variable:	t	
Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
0.263*** (0.053)	0.141** (0.055)		0.265*** (0.053)	0.152*** (0.055)
0.127* (0.068)	0.032 (0.069)		0.142** (0.068)	0.070 (0.068)
0.110 (0.176)	-0.057 (0.176)		0.104 (0.176)	0.015 (0.177)
-0.200*** (0.053)	-0.122** (0.054)		-0.189*** (0.053)	-0.129** (0.054)
		0.041 (0.038)		
0.144*** (0.053)	0.112** (0.053)	0.157*** (0.052)	0.143*** (0.053)	0.121** (0.053)
0.134* (0.075)	0.167** (0.077)	0.224*** (0.075)	0.116 (0.075)	0.144* (0.077)
0.414* (0.242)	0.282 (0.240)	0.337 (0.240)	0.397* (0.241)	0.245 (0.240)
0.063*** (0.010)	0.052*** (0.010)	0.050***	0.066***	0.064*** (0.010)
	0.397*** (0.069)	0.452*** (0.068)		0.444*** (0.056)
	-0.043*** (0.012)	-0.037** (0.012)		0.021*** (0.005)
	1.797*** (0.319)	2.022*** (0.314)		-0.351*** (0.065)
			2.807*** (0.116)	4.272*** (1.097)
16,654	16,333	16,333	16,654	16,333
-0.176 -0.176 23.475^{***} (df = 8; 13970)	-0.167 -0.167 $28.919*** (df = 11; 13676)$	-0.169 36.871^{***} (df = 8; 13679)	0.012 0.012 $25.319^{***} (df = 8; 16645)$	0.023 35.692*** (df = 11; 16321)

Table 20: Dyadic Year: FH Civil Liberties

			$Dependent \ variable:$		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.049***	_0.029** (0.012)		0.048*** (0.012)	0.025* (0.013)
Recip Gov	0.036** (0.016)	-0.033** (0.016)		0.030*	0.015 (0.016)
Third Gov	0.070* (0.041)	0.002 (0.040)		0.074* (0.041)	0.052 (0.041)
Other Gov	-0.053*** (0.012)	0.004 (0.012)		-0.056*** (0.012)	-0.040*** (0.012)
All Gov			-0.021** (0.008)		
NGO	0.046*** (0.012)	0.018 (0.012)	0.011 (0.012)	0.049***	0.038*** (0.012)
IGO	0.001 (0.017)	-0.006 (0.017)	-0.016 (0.016)	0.012 (0.017)	0.011 (0.017)
Corporation	-0.017 (0.056)	-0.061 (0.054)	-0.069 (0.054)	-0.014 (0.056)	-0.037 (0.056)
log(total)	-0.005** (0.002)	-0.014*** (0.002)	-0.013*** (0.002)	-0.005** (0.002)	-0.009*** (0.002)
log(GDP)		-0.095*** (0.015)	-0.101*** (0.015)		0.053*** (0.012)
Urban		0.012*** (0.003)	0.011*** (0.003)		-0.007*** (0.001)
log(Population)		1.671*** (0.070)	1.638***		0.306*** (0.015)
Constant				4.043*** (0.029)	-1.018*** (0.253)
Observations R2 Adjusted R2 F Statistic	17,686 0.011 -0.174 19.976*** (df = 8; 14901)	17,347 0.073 0.073 103,764*** (df = 11; 14589)	$ \begin{array}{c} 17,347 \\ 0.072 \\ -0.103 \\ 141.321^{***} (df = 8; 14592) \end{array} $	17,686 0.106 0.106 262.507*** (df = 8; 17677)	17,347 0.147 0.447 269.351*** (df = 11; 17335)
Note:					*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 21: Dyadic Year: FH Personal Autonomy

			Dependent variet		
•	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	-0.022 (0.021)	$0.015 \\ (0.021)$		-0.017 (0.021)	-0.071*** (0.021)
Recip Gov	-0.018 (0.027)	0.043* (0.026)		-0.011 (0.027)	-0.026 (0.027)
Third Gov	0.057 (0.070)	0.076 (0.066)		0.047 (0.071)	0.049 (0.069)
Other Gov	0.060*** (0.021)	0.010 (0.020)		0.065*** (0.021)	0.081*** (0.021)
All Gov			0.027* (0.014)		
NGO	-0.020 (0.021)	-0.003 (0.020)	0.004 (0.020)	-0.028 (0.021)	-0.040* (0.021)
IGO	-0.015 (0.030)	0.001 (0.029)	0.009 (0.028)	-0.034 (0.030)	-0.029 (0.030)
Corporation	-0.014 (0.098)	-0.029 (0.091)	-0.020 (0.091)	-0.008 (0.098)	-0.081 (0.095)
log(total)	0.003 (0.004)	0.009**	0.009** (0.004)	0.001	0.005 (0.004)
log(GDP)		0.355*** (0.026)	0.357*** (0.026)		0.250*** (0.022)
Urban		-0.079*** (0.004)	-0.078*** (0.004)		0.008***
log(Population)		-0.669*** (0.120)	-0.645*** (0.119)		-0.424** (0.028)
Constant				7.740*** (0.058)	12.398*** (0.472)
Observations R ²	17,355	17,017 0.036	17,017 0.036	17,355 0.083	17,017 0.124
Adjusted R ² F Statistic	-0.189 3.657^{***} (df = 8; 14572)	-0.150 48.371^{***} (df = 11; 14261)	-0.150 66.222^{***} (df = 8; 14264)	0.083 197.100^{***} (df = 8; 17346)	0.123 215.644^{***} (df = 11; 17005)

Table 22: Dyadic Year: FH Proportional Rep

1			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	-0.014 (0.019)	-0.031 (0.020)		-0.016 (0.019)	0.014 (0.020)
Recip Gov	0.031 (0.025)	0.005 (0.025)		0.021 (0.025)	0.039 (0.025)
Third Gov	0.018 (0.064)	-0.023 (0.065)		0.026 (0.064)	0.027 (0.065)
Other Gov	0.015 (0.019)	0.036* (0.020)		0.008 (0.019)	_0.004 (0.020)
All Gov			-0.005 (0.014)		
NGO	0.001	-0.002 (0.019)	-0.014 (0.019)	0.005 (0.019)	0.012 (0.020)
IGO	-0.023 (0.027)	-0.022 (0.027)	-0.037 (0.027)	-0.006 (0.027)	-0.003 (0.028)
Corporation	0.069 (0.088)	0.099	0.087	0.078 (0.088)	0.124 (0.089)
log(total)	-0.011*** (0.004)	-0.014^{***} (0.004)	-0.013^{***} (0.004)	-0.011*** (0.003)	-0.012*** (0.004)
log(GDP)		-0.228*** (0.024)	-0.240*** (0.024)		-0.095*** (0.019)
Urban		-0.005 (0.004)	-0.007 (0.004)		-0.011*** (0.002)
log(Population)		1.637 ** * (0.115)	1.582*** (0.113)		0.218*** (0.019)
Constant				4.211*** (0.037)	1.908*** (0.326)
Observations R ²	17,686	17,347	17,347	17,686	17,347
Adjusted R ² F Statistic	-0.186 2.038^{**} (df = 8; 14901)	-0.169 $22.269*** (df = 11; 14589)$	-0.170 29.265^{***} (df = 8; 14592)	0.073 174.133^{***} (df = 8; 17677)	$0.100 \\ 175.084^{***} \text{ (df} = 11; 17335)$

- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:28:06 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating
- % Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
- % Date and time: Tue, Aug 07, 2018 8:28:53 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

Subnational Stuff

Table 23: Dyadic Year: FH Rule of Law

1			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	-0.109*** (0.027)	0.072*** (0.028)		-0.106*** (0.027)	-0.034 (0.028)
Recip Gov	-0.090*** (0.034)	0.061* (0.034)		-0.077** (0.034)	-0.025 (0.035)
Third Gov	-0.241*** (0.089)	-0.136 (0.088)		-0.250*** (0.090)	-0.204** (0.090)
Other Gov	0.157*** (0.027)	$0.025 \\ (0.027)$		0.165*** (0.027)	0.116*** (0.028)
All Gov			0.046** (0.019)		
NGO	-0.070*** (0.027)	-0.009 (0.027)	-0.005 (0.026)	-0.079*** (0.027)	-0.051* (0.027)
IGO	-0.033 (0.038)	-0.015 (0.038)	-0.010 (0.037)	-0.056 (0.038)	-0.054 (0.039)
Corporation	-0.075 (0.123)	0.046 (0.121)	0.050 (0.121)	-0.080 (0.124)	-0.011 (0.124)
log(total)	0.001 (0.005)	0.015*** (0.005)	0.014*** (0.005)	-0.001 (0.005)	0.009* (0.005)
$\log(\mathrm{GDP})$		0.013 (0.034)	0.024 (0.034)		-0.184*** (0.029)
Urban		-0.047*** (0.006)	-0.045*** (0.006)		0.013*** (0.003)
log(Population)		-2.588*** (0.160)	-2.559*** (0.158)		-0.804*** (0.036)
Constant				6.011*** (0.068)	19.946*** (0.594)
Observations	17,355	17,017	710,71	17,355	17,017
Adjusted R ² F Statistic	0.014 -0.174 $25.783*** (df = 8; 14572)$	0.000 -0.115 $91.208*** (df = 11; 14261)$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.005 \\ -0.115 \\ 124.470^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 14264)} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.051 \\ 0.050 \\ 115.712^{***} \text{ (df} = 8: 17346) \end{array}$	0.084 0.083 139.686^{***} (df = 11; 17005)

26

Table 24: Dyadic Year: FH Status

,			Dependent variable:		
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.024*** (0.009)	-0.001 (0.009)		0.023***	0.027*** (0.009)
Recip Gov	0.018* (0.011)	-0.006 (0.011)		0.013 (0.011)	$0.015 \\ (0.011)$
Third Gov	0.009 (0.028)	-0.016 (0.029)		0.013 (0.029)	0.010 (0.029)
Other Gov	-0.022** (0.008)	_0.003 (0.009)		-0.025*** (0.008)	-0.026*** (0.009)
All Gov			-0.004 (0.006)		
NGO	0.011 (0.008)	0.003 (0.009)	0.002 (0.008)	0.013 (0.008)	0.012 (0.009)
IGO	0.001 (0.012)	0.001 (0.012)	0.0001 (0.012)	0.010 (0.012)	0.012 (0.012)
Corporation	0.052 (0.039)	0.046 (0.039)	0.045 (0.039)	0.056 (0.039)	0.062 (0.040)
log(total)	0.002 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.002)	0.002 (0.002)	0.0005 (0.002)
log(GDP)		-0.077*** (0.011)	-0.076*** (0.011)		-0.006 (0.008)
Urban		0.004**	0.004** (0.002)		-0.004*** (0.001)
log(Population)		0.791*** (0.051)	0.789***		0.089***
Constant				2.097*** (0.015)	0.898*** (0.133)
Observations	17,686	17,347	17,347	17,686	17,347
R ² Adjusted R ² F Statistic	0.004 -0.182 $7.006*** (df = 8: 14901)$	0.026 -0.158 $35.876*** (df = 11; 14589)$	$0.026 \\ -0.157 \\ 49.292^{***} \text{ (df = 8; 14592)}$	0.109 0.108 269.341^{***} (df = 8: 17677)	0.133 0.132 0.132 239.778*** (df = 11: 17335)