Opening the Black Box on Intl Aid Data Section

Jack Hasler

August 3, 2018

So this is the document for preparing and presenting results. Moving things over from various other files. The goal of this is to be a working document that can eventually become an appendix to the paper. We'll pull our main models from here and keep the others as robustness checks.

Importing the libraries that we'll need for all of the following projects.

Gonna break this into three big sections for now. (1) Analysis by Recipient (target?) country, (2) Analysis by donor-recipient dyad, and (3) Subnational analysis. If there are not some descriptive statistics in every section, there should be!

Analysis by Recipient-Year

Analysis by Dyad-Year

Here are some descriptive statistics on the recipient-year data. "'{, message = FALSE, results='asis'} crs_by_types$RecipientName <- $ifelse(crs_by_types$RecipientCode==247,"Cote d Ivoire",crs_by_types$RecipientName)

crs_by_types <- crs_by_types %>% filter(round(total_disbursement) != 0) %>% filter(Year>2003)

tmp <- crs_by_types %>% select(Year,RecipientName,DonorName,total_disbursement,gov_d_percent,gov_r_percent,gov_3 %>% unique() %>% group_by(Year) %>% mutate(sum_total = sum(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_disbursement = mean(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_d = mean(gov_d_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_r = mean(gov_r_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_3 = mean(gov_3_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_o = mean(gov_o_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_corp = mean(corp_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_ngo = mean(ngo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_igo = mean(igo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_other = mean(other_percent, na.rm = TRUE)) %>% select(Year, sum_total, mean_disbursement, mean_gov_d, mean_gov_r, mean_gov_3, mean_gov_o, mean_corp, mean_igo, mean_ngo, mean_other) %>% unique()

stargazer(as.data.frame(tmp), digits = 2, type = 'latex', summary = FALSE, title = "Dyadic Summary Statistics By Year")

tmp <- crs_by_types %>% select(Year,RecipientName,DonorName,total_disbursement,gov_d_percent,gov_r_percent,gov_3 %>% unique() %>% group_by(RecipientName,DonorName) %>% mutate(sum_total = sum(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_disbursement = mean(total_disbursement, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_d = mean(gov_d_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_r = mean(gov_r_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_3 = mean(gov_3_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_gov_o = mean(gov_o_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_corp = mean(corp_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_ngo = mean(ngo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_igo = mean(igo_percent, na.rm = TRUE), mean_other = mean(other_percent, na.rm = TRUE)) %>% select(RecipientName,DonorName, sum_total, mean_disbursement, mean_gov_d, mean_gov_r, mean_gov_3, mean_gov_o, mean_corp, mean_igo, mean_ngo, mean_other) %>% unique() stargazer(as.data.frame(tmp),digits = 2, font.size = 'small', type = 'latex', summary = FALSE, title = 'Summary Statistics by Dyad')

"'

% Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu % Date and time: Tue, Aug 14, 2018 - 1:09:33 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

Table 1: Dyadic Year: VDEM Polyarchy

	Dependent variable:				
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.056^{***}	0.036^{**}		0.059^{***}	0.033^{*}
	(0.017)	(0.018)		(0.018)	(0.018)
Recip Gov	-0.014	-0.018		-0.011	-0.018
	(0.020)	(0.020)		(0.020)	(0.020)
Third Gov	0.038	0.037		0.032	0.034
	(0.034)	(0.034)		(0.034)	(0.034)
Other Gov	0.061^{***}	0.071^{***}		0.063^{***}	0.084^{***}
	(0.013)	(0.014)		(0.013)	(0.014)
All Gov			0.056^{***}		
			(0.012)		
NGO	0.098^{***}	0.048^{***}	0.041^{**}	0.094^{***}	0.047^{***}
	(0.017)	(0.018)	(0.018)	(0.017)	(0.018)
IGO	0.003	-0.005	-0.004	-0.005	-0.009
	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)
Corporation	0.066	0.052	0.042	0.058	0.066
	(0.165)	(0.165)	(0.164)	(0.165)	(0.166)
Other	0.067^{***}	0.076^{***}	0.073^{***}	0.064^{***}	0.075^{***}
	(0.018)	(0.018)	(0.018)	(0.018)	(0.018)
log(GDP)		0.320^{***}	0.315^{***}		0.228^{***}
		(0.029)	(0.029)		(0.022)
Urban		-0.010^{**}	-0.011^{**}		0.016^{***}
		(0.005)	(0.005)		(0.002)
log(Population)		-0.266^{*}	-0.326^{**}		-0.152^{***}
		(0.137)	(0.136)		(0.024)
Constant				4.605^{***}	4.595^{***}
				(0.042)	(0.400)
Observations	14,098	13,874	13,874	14,098	13,874
R^2	0.008	0.022	0.021	0.068	0.101
Adjusted R^2	-0.188	-0.174	-0.174	0.067	0.100
F Statistic	12.510^{***} (df = 8; 11768)	23.513^{***} (df = 11; 11563)	31.347^{***} (df = 8; 11566)	127.551^{***} (df = 8; 14089)	139.137^{***} (df = 11; 13862)

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

% Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
% Date and time: Tue, Aug 14, 2018 - 1:09:50 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

% Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
% Date and time: Tue, Aug 14, 2018 - 1:10:08 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

% Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
% Date and time: Tue, Aug 14, 2018 - 1:10:25 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

% Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
% Date and time: Tue, Aug 14, 2018 - 1:10:43 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

% Table created by stargazer v.5.2.2 by Marek Hlavac, Harvard University. E-mail: hlavac at fas.harvard.edu
% Date and time: Tue, Aug 14, 2018 - 1:11:01 PM % Requires LaTeX packages: rotating

Subnational Stuff

Table 2: Dyadic Year: VDEM LibDem

	Dependent variable:				
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.050^{***}	0.039^{***}		0.051^{***}	0.033^{**}
	(0.014)	(0.015)		(0.015)	(0.015)
Recip Gov	0.004	0.002		0.007	0.001
	(0.016)	(0.016)		(0.016)	(0.017)
Third Gov	0.027	0.022		0.022	0.021
	(0.028)	(0.028)		(0.028)	(0.029)
Other Gov	0.050^{***}	0.054^{***}		0.051^{***}	0.065^{***}
	(0.011)	(0.011)		(0.011)	(0.011)
All Gov			0.053^{***}		
			(0.010)		
NGO	0.063^{***}	0.034^{**}	0.030^{**}	0.060^{***}	0.025^{*}
	(0.014)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.014)	(0.015)
IGO	0.029^{**}	0.025^{*}	0.025^{*}	0.023^{*}	0.020
	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.014)
Corporation	0.097	0.084	0.086	0.091	0.098
	(0.136)	(0.137)	(0.137)	(0.137)	(0.138)
Other	0.042^{***}	0.046^{***}	0.045^{***}	0.040^{***}	0.047^{***}
	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.015)
log(GDP)		0.207^{***}	0.203^{***}		0.167^{***}
		(0.024)	(0.024)		(0.019)
Urban		-0.016^{***}	-0.016^{***}		0.014^{***}
		(0.004)	(0.004)		(0.002)
log(Population)		-0.082	-0.109		-0.174^{***}
		(0.114)	(0.113)		(0.022)
Constant				3.206^{***}	4.117^{***}
				(0.040)	(0.374)
Observations	14,098	13,874	13,874	14,098	13,874
R^2	0.008	0.015	0.015	0.040	0.066
Adjusted R^2	-0.189	-0.181	-0.181	0.039	0.066
F Statistic	11.442^{***} (df = 8; 11768)	16.323^{***} (df = 11; 11563)	22.699^{***} (df = 8; 11566)	72.608^{***} (df = 8; 14089)	88.395^{***} (df = 11; 13862)

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 3: Dyadic Year: VDEM PartipDem

	Dependent variable:				
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.035^{***}	0.022^{**}		0.036^{***}	0.019^{*}
	(0.010)	(0.010)		(0.010)	(0.010)
Recip Gov	-0.014	-0.017		-0.013	-0.019^{*}
	(0.011)	(0.011)		(0.011)	(0.011)
Third Gov	0.027	0.022		0.025	0.022
	(0.019)	(0.020)		(0.019)	(0.020)
Other Gov	0.031^{***}	0.038^{***}		0.032^{***}	0.045^{***}
	(0.008)	(0.008)		(0.008)	(0.008)
All Gov			0.030^{***}		
			(0.007)		
NGO	0.067^{***}	0.033^{***}	0.029^{***}	0.066^{***}	0.031^{***}
	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)
IGO	0.003	-0.002	-0.002	-0.001	-0.005
	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)
Corporation	0.033	0.023	0.015	0.031	0.037
	(0.094)	(0.094)	(0.094)	(0.095)	(0.095)
Other	0.034^{***}	0.038^{***}	0.037^{***}	0.032^{***}	0.038^{***}
	(0.010)	(0.011)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.011)
log(GDP)		0.196^{***}	0.193^{***}		0.142^{***}
		(0.017)	(0.017)		(0.013)
Urban		-0.010^{***}	-0.011^{***}		0.013^{***}
		(0.003)	(0.003)		(0.001)
log(Population)		-0.030	-0.064		-0.076^{***}
		(0.078)	(0.078)		(0.017)
Constant				2.744^{***}	2.299^{***}
				(0.032)	(0.284)
Observations	14,098	13,874	13,874	14,098	13,874
R^2	0.010	0.026	0.025	0.045	0.079
Adjusted R^2	-0.186	-0.169	-0.170	0.045	0.078
F Statistic	14.414^{***} (df = 8; 11768)	27.531^{***} (df = 11; 11563)	36.654^{***} (df = 8; 11566)	82.802^{***} (df = 8; 14089)	105.918^{***} (df = 11; 13862)
Note:					*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 4: Dyadic Year: Polity

	Dependent variable:				
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.090**	0.031		0.092**	0.038
	(0.045)	(0.045)		(0.045)	(0.045)
Recip Gov	0.075	0.035		0.083	0.058
	(0.051)	(0.050)		(0.051)	(0.050)
Third Gov	0.139	0.068		0.127	0.084
	(0.087)	(0.087)		(0.087)	(0.088)
Other Gov	0.052	0.105***		0.058	0.104***
	(0.035)	(0.036)		(0.035)	(0.035)
All Gov			0.095***		
			(0.030)		
NGO	0.355***	0.224***	0.212***	0.352***	0.255***
	(0.045)	(0.046)	(0.046)	(0.045)	(0.046)
IGO	0.173***	0.146***	0.148***	0.159***	0.150***
	(0.047)	(0.047)	(0.047)	(0.047)	(0.047)
Corporation	0.031	0.028	0.018	−0.008	0.020
	(0.416)	(0.411)	(0.410)	(0.416)	(0.412)
Other	0.180***	0.195***	0.192***	0.177***	0.191***
	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.049)
log(GDP)		0.529***	0.519***		0.547***
		(0.076)	(0.076)		(0.060)
Urban		−0.036***	−0.037***		0.023***
		(0.013)	(0.013)		(0.006)
log(Population)		1.641***	1.585***		−0.331***
		(0.347)	(0.344)		(0.071)
Constant				2.765***	3.055***
				(0.117)	(1.180)
Observations	13,186	12,980	12,980	13,186	12,980
R^2	0.013	0.026	0.026	0.011	0.027
Adjusted R^2	−0.188	−0.174	−0.174	0.011	0.026
F Statistic	18.527*** (df = 8; 10952)	26.525*** (df = 11; 10764)	36.491*** (df = 8; 10767)	18.394*** (df = 8; 13177)	31.772*** (df = 11; 12968)

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 5: Dyadic Year: FH Rule of Law

	Dependent variable:				
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	−0.032	0.027		−0.031	−0.003
	(0.022)	(0.022)		(0.022)	(0.022)
Recip Gov	−0.039	−0.005		−0.033	−0.021
	(0.025)	(0.024)		(0.025)	(0.025)
Third Gov	−0.060	−0.037		−0.064	−0.050
	(0.043)	(0.042)		(0.043)	(0.043)
Other Gov	0.117***	0.053***		0.120***	0.096***
	(0.017)	(0.017)		(0.017)	(0.017)
All Gov			0.035**		
			(0.015)		
NGO	−0.143***	−0.036	−0.040*	−0.149***	−0.072***
	(0.022)	(0.023)	(0.023)	(0.022)	(0.023)
IGO	−0.092***	−0.064***	−0.065***	−0.105***	−0.089***
	(0.022)	(0.021)	(0.021)	(0.022)	(0.022)
Corporation	0.141	0.101	0.087	0.132	0.144
	(0.207)	(0.202)	(0.202)	(0.208)	(0.208)
Other	0.064***	0.043*	0.038	0.061**	0.050**
	(0.024)	(0.024)	(0.023)	(0.024)	(0.024)
log(GDP)		−0.022	−0.028		−0.260***
		(0.038)	(0.038)		(0.031)
Urban		−0.035***	−0.036***		0.018***
		(0.006)	(0.006)		(0.003)
log(Population)		−2.379***	−2.433***		−0.768***
		(0.175)	(0.173)		(0.039)
Constant				5.998***	19.688***
				(0.070)	(0.639)
Observations	13,743	13,522	13,522	13,743	13,522
R^2	0.016	0.068	0.067	0.055	0.092
Adjusted R^2	−0.184	−0.124	−0.124	0.055	0.091
F Statistic	22.637*** (df = 8; 11423)	73.983*** (df = 11; 11220)	100.974*** (df = 8; 11223)	100.424*** (df = 8; 13734)	122.935*** (df = 11; 13510)

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 6: Dyadic Year: FH Status

	Dependent variable:				
	Base	Controls	Gov Together	Base RE	Controls RE
Donor Gov	0.018^{**}	0.009		0.017^{**}	0.017^{**}
	(0.007)	(0.007)		(0.007)	(0.007)
Recip Gov	-0.008	-0.016^{**}		-0.010	-0.011
	(0.008)	(0.008)		(0.008)	(0.008)
Third Gov	0.037^{***}	0.032^{**}		0.039^{***}	0.038^{***}
	(0.014)	(0.014)		(0.014)	(0.014)
Other Gov	-0.026^{***}	-0.016^{***}		-0.028^{***}	-0.029^{***}
	(0.005)	(0.006)		(0.005)	(0.006)
All Gov			-0.007		
			(0.005)		
NGO	0.011	-0.003	-0.001	0.012^{*}	0.008
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)
IGO	0.019^{***}	0.014^{**}	0.014^{**}	0.024^{***}	0.023^{***}
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)
Corporation	0.029	0.034	0.036	0.031	0.025
	(0.067)	(0.067)	(0.067)	(0.067)	(0.068)
Other	0.001	0.004	0.007	0.001	0.001
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)
log(GDP)		-0.070^{***}	-0.068^{***}		0.014
		(0.012)	(0.012)		(0.009)
Urban		0.003	0.003		-0.006^{***}
		(0.002)	(0.002)		(0.001)
log(Population)		0.766^{***}	0.789^{***}		0.082^{***}
		(0.056)	(0.055)		(0.008)
Constant				2.098^{***}	0.916^{***}
				(0.014)	(0.144)
Observations	14,051	13,827	13,827	14,051	13,827
R^2	0.006	0.029	0.028	0.131	0.154
Adjusted R^2	-0.191	-0.165	-0.167	0.130	0.154
F Statistic	9.470^{***} (df = 8; 11722)	31.673^{***} (df = 11; 11517)	41.345^{***} (df = 8; 11520)	263.399^{***} (df = 8; 14042)	227.199^{***} (df = 11; 13815)
Note:					*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01