

Criteria	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1
[10%] Motivation of this work	10 points - Clearly identifies the motivation: the importance of this work, why it is conducted.	7 points - Partially identifies motivation	2 points - Does not identify motivation
[10%] What are the assumptions this paper makes?	10 points - Identifies distinct assumptions included and/or ignored by the authors.	7 points - Identifies some assumptions	2 points - Does not identify any assumptions
[15%] What is the proposed solution?	15 points - Identifies the main idea and all key components of the proposed solution.	10 points - Identifies some components of the solution	2 points - Does not identify solution
[15%] How is solution evaluated?	15 points - Clearly describes the evaluation methods of the work.	10 points - Partially identifies evaluation	2 points - Does not identify evaluation
[15%] What elements might threaten the validity of this work?	15 points - Makes salient observations on factors that might jeopardize the validity.	10 points - Makes some observations on factors that jeopardize the validity.	2 points - Makes no observations
[20%] Limitations or extensions for this work	supported by evidence or logical inference. Engages personal background and future directions. Introduces creative or provocative	12 points - Draws conclusions supported by vague rationale. Introduce some ideas	4 points - Offers limited opinions or accepts conclusions of paper as facts
[15%] Major takeaway message	15 points - Has insightful takeaway messages, incorporating key ideas in own word.	10 points - Has take-aways message in own word	2 points - Has regurgitated message only