# Dear Dr. Ravichandran,

I am writing in order to respond to a number of comments which appeared in the reviews of my F32-NRSA application, in the hope that this information is useful before the funding council.

In particular, one reviewer stated a concern that my sponsor holds tenure at a foreign university, but not at Columbia, and therefore may intend to leave before my project is complete. In fact, none of this is accurate. Dr Sella’s only position is at Columbia University, and he currently holds tenure here. Further, this sort of speculation by a reviewer is inappropriate, and should not play a role in funding decisions at the NIH.

Another issue raised was that my recent publication record has been sparse. In the intervening time, I have posted three preprints, all of which are now under journal review:

* Paul Bilinski, Patrice S Albert, **Jeremy J Berg**, et al., Jeff Ross-Ibarra. Parallel Altitudinal Clines Reveal Adaptive Evolution Of Genome Size In Zea mays. doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/134528
* Fernando Racimo, **Jeremy J Berg** and Joseph K Pickrell. Detecting Polygenic Adaptation in Admixture Graphs. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/146043>
* **Jeremy J Berg**, Xinjun Zhang and Graham Coop. Polygenic Adaptation has Impacted Multiple Anthropometric Traits. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/167551>

Reviewers also raised a concern that my application did not identify the specific datasets that would be analyzed. In general the current standard practice is for GWAS summary statistics are to be made publicly available and reanalysis of these sort of data is essentially routine in the field at this point (e.g. two of my above preprints make extensive use of publicly available GWAS data). At the current pace the field is moving, it is likely that a substantial fraction of the datasets which I eventually end up analyzing as a part of this project have not even been published yet. It seemed unnecessary to list specific datasets which would be analyzed when in all likelihood many of them will be superseded by the time the analysis is done.

Reviewers also expressed a concern that while my training would benefit from interactions Molly Przeworski and Joe Pickrell’s groups, with whom we hold joint lab meetings, my application did not include any statement of a commitment to my training from either of them. In addition to this letter I have attached a short note from Molly Przeworski expressing her commitment to support my training through our joint group meetings and through semi-regular informal meetings, and I also note that I have already completed one collaboration with Joe Pickrell’s group (see preprint citation above).

Finally, some reviewers indicated that my training could benefit from some additional math coursework. I concur, and am planning to take the Columbia University Math Department’s graduate level sequence in Analysis and Probability.

Thank you for your time,

Jeremy J Berg