Hi Zhiyu and Kentaro,

I really enjoyed reading your paper, and I learned a lot from the way you validated the claims made by the authors of the paper you replicated. For example, I appreciated how you tackled some of the taken-for-granted assumptions made by the authors, such as connecting discourse similarity to vote share change despite the lack of an intrinsic correlation between the two. Examining this under-validated connection indeed seems like a valuable approach, and you did find something new!

What I particularly liked about this paper is your main argument, and I think you could highlight this even more. Your main argument—that public discourse did not shift to the right after a series of immigration-related terrorist attacks but rather became polarized—feels very novel, as it contradicts the common assumption that terrorist attacks would push public discourse to the right. As you finalize your draft, you might benefit from discussing in more detail how your findings challenge this widespread assumption, how current literature has not yet provided similar findings (or, if it has, how your work adds further meaningful evidence), and what real-world implications your findings could have.

I do have a few questions, which arise from my limited knowledge of the original article you replicated and some of the methods you used in this paper. Since I reviewed your paper without reading the original article or having much familiarity with some of the methods (though I understand this is still a draft and you will likely clarify as you go), certain parts were not fully clear to me.

I think you may benefit from elaborating on:

- How each model works (e.g., discontinuous growth model, state space model, synthetic control methods), and;
- What exactly your y-axis ("similarity") in Figure 1 refers to. Simply put, similarity between what? It might be helpful to indicate this information directly within the figure so readers don't have to go back to find it (although it wasn't too hard since it was mentioned in the same section).

Unfortunately, I wasn't able to replicate the figures using your code due to an error that occurred during the package and data installation phase. I tried to fix this myself, but I couldn't. I believe it's just a technical issue with my PC environment.

Overall, great work! I look forward to reading the final version once it's completed.