

# HW 7 - solutions

1

(1) The joint probability distribution table:

(a)

$P(V,T)$	T					$P(V)$
$\checkmark$ *	1/16	1/16	1/16	1/16	sum rows $\rightarrow$	1/4
cloudy/dry	1/16	1/8	1/32	1/32		1/4
cloudy/rain	1/8	1/16	1/32	1/32		1/4
cloudy/snow	1/4	0	0	0		1/4

Entropy  $H(V) = 2$  bits

↓ sum columns

$P(T)$	1/2	1/4	1/8	1/8
--------	-----	-----	-----	-----

Entropy = 7/4 bits

$$\text{Joint entropy} = - \sum_{v,t} P(V=v, T=t) \log_2 P(V=v, T=t) = 27/8 \text{ bits.}$$

(b) The conditional distributions: (= rows, renormalized to sum to 1)

For  $V = \text{"sunny"}$   $P(T | V=\text{sunny}) = \{1/4, 1/4, 1/4, 1/4\} \Rightarrow$  Entropy 2 bits

$P(T | V=\text{cloudy \& dry}) = \{1/4, 1/2, 1/8, 1/8\} \Rightarrow$  7/4 bits

$P(T | V=\text{cloudy \& rain}) = \{1/2, 1/4, 1/8, 1/8\} \Rightarrow$  7/4 bits

$P(T | V=\text{cloudy \& snow}) = \{1, 0, 0, 0\} \Rightarrow$  0 bits

So learning that  $V=\text{sunny}$  actually increases our uncertainty about  $T$ .

(c) But on average,  $H(T|V) = \frac{2 + 7/4 + 7/4 + 0}{4} = \frac{11}{8} \text{ bits} < H(T) = \frac{7}{4}$

$\nearrow P(V=v) = 1/4 \text{ for all } v$

(d) Similarly:  $P(V | T = \text{Miserably cold}) = \begin{pmatrix} 1/8 \\ 1/8 \\ 1/4 \\ 1/2 \end{pmatrix}$  (renormalized columns)  $\nearrow H = 7/4$

$P(V | T = \text{Very cold}) = \begin{pmatrix} 1/4 \\ 1/2 \\ 1/4 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$   $\nearrow H = 3/2$

$P(V | T = \text{Cold}) = \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 \\ 1/4 \\ 1/4 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$   $\nearrow H = 3/2$

$P(V | T = \text{Chilly}) = \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 \\ 1/4 \\ 1/4 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$   $\nearrow H = 3/2$

$\Rightarrow H(V|T) = \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{7}{4} + \frac{1}{4} \cdot \frac{3}{2} + \frac{2}{8} \cdot \frac{3}{2} = \frac{17}{16}$

(e)  $I(V, T) = H(V) - H(V|T) = 2 - 13/8 = 3/8$  bits.

Reassuringly:  $H(T) - H(T|V) = 7/4 - 11/8 =$  also  $3/8$  bits.

② (a) Applying the definition:  $\int_{\mathbb{R}} \equiv \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}$

$$H\left(p(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2}}\right) \equiv - \int_{\mathbb{R}} p(x) \ln p(x) dx$$

$$= - \int_{\mathbb{R}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2}} \cdot \left\{ -\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2} + \ln \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2} \right\} dx$$

$$= \ln \sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2 \underbrace{\int_{\mathbb{R}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2}} dx}_1 + \frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \underbrace{\int_{\mathbb{R}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2}} x^2 dx}_{\sigma^2}$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} + \ln \sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2 = \ln \sqrt{2\pi e}\sigma^2$$

(which can easily be negative if  $\sigma$  is small enough).

(b) For independent random variables, variances add.

$$\Rightarrow \text{var}(Y) = \text{var}(X) + \text{var}(\xi) = \sigma_X^2 + \sigma_\xi^2$$

(c) Consider a discrete version of this problem.

Let  $X$  take values  $\{1, 2, 3\}$  and  $\xi$  take values  $\{5, 6, 7\}$

What is  $P(Y \equiv X + \xi \text{ takes value } 8) = ?$

$$\begin{aligned} P(Y=8) &= P(X=1, \xi=7) + P(X=2, \xi=6) + P(X=3, \xi=5) \\ &= P_X(1) \cdot P_\xi(7) + P_X(2) \cdot P_\xi(6) + P_X(3) \cdot P_\xi(5) \\ &= \sum_z P_\xi(z) \cdot P_X(8-z) \end{aligned}$$

This problem is the continuous analog.  $P_Y(y) = \int dz P_\xi(z) P_X(y-z)$ .



(d) Specifically for Gaussians: let's take the integral in (c).

Gaussian integrals are a useful skill. Here is how it works.

$\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2}}$  is a normalized probability distribution

$$\Rightarrow \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma^2}} dx = \sqrt{2\pi}\sigma^2$$

Let's write this as:  $\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{ax^2}{2}} dx = \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{a}}$ . (for any  $a > 0$ ).

Now let's compute  $\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{ax^2}{2} + bx + c} dx$

(complete the square)  $= \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{a}{2}\left(x^2 - \frac{2b}{a}x + \frac{b^2}{a^2}\right) + \frac{b^2}{2a} + c} dx$

$$= e^{\frac{b^2}{2a} + c} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{a}{2}\left(x - \frac{b}{a}\right)^2} dx$$

( $\tilde{x} \equiv x - b/a$ )  $= e^{\frac{b^2}{2a} + c} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{a}{2}\tilde{x}^2} d\tilde{x} = \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{a}} e^{\frac{b^2}{2a} + c}$

In our case:

$$P_Y(y) = \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma_x^2} e^{-\frac{(y-z)^2}{2\sigma_x^2}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma_f^2} e^{-\frac{z^2}{2\sigma_f^2}} dz$$

$$= \frac{1}{2\pi\sigma_x\sigma_f} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} e^{-\frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{y^2 - 2yz + z^2}{\sigma_x^2} + \frac{z^2}{\sigma_f^2}\right)} dz$$

The exponent:  $-\frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{y^2 - 2yz + z^2}{\sigma_x^2} + \frac{z^2}{\sigma_f^2}\right) = -\frac{az^2}{2} + bz + c$  with:

$$a = \frac{1}{\sigma_x^2} + \frac{1}{\sigma_f^2} = \frac{\sigma_f^2 + \sigma_x^2}{\sigma_x^2\sigma_f^2} \quad b = \frac{y}{\sigma_x^2} \quad c = -\frac{y^2}{2\sigma_x^2}$$

# HW7-solutions.

(4)

Plugging this into the formula derived above:

$$\begin{aligned}
 p_Y(y) &= \frac{1}{2\pi\sigma_x\sigma_y} \cdot \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{a}} e^{b^2/2a+C} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2\pi\sigma_x\sigma_y} \sqrt{\frac{2\pi\sigma_x^2\sigma_y^2}{\sigma_y^2+\sigma_x^2}} e^{\frac{1}{2} \frac{y^2}{\sigma_x^4} \frac{\sigma_x^2\sigma_y^2}{\sigma_x^2+\sigma_y^2} - \frac{y^2}{2\sigma_x^2}} \\
 &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi(\sigma_y^2+\sigma_x^2)}} e^{-\frac{y^2}{2\sigma_x^2} \left(1 - \frac{\sigma_y^2}{\sigma_x^2+\sigma_y^2}\right)} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi\sigma_y^2}} e^{-\frac{y^2}{2\sigma_y^2}}
 \end{aligned}$$

with  $\sigma_y = \sqrt{\sigma_x^2 + \sigma_f^2}$ , exactly as expected. //

(e)  $I(X,Y) = H(Y) - H(Y|X) \equiv H(Y) - \langle H(Y|X=x_0) \rangle_{x_0}$

$\uparrow$  Gaussian of width  $\sigma_x$        $\uparrow$  For any  $x_0$ , this distribution is a Gaussian of width  $\sigma_f$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= \ln \sqrt{2\pi e \sigma_y^2} - \ln \sqrt{2\pi e \sigma_f^2} \\
 &= \ln \frac{\sigma_y}{\sigma_f} = \ln \frac{\sqrt{\sigma_x^2 + \sigma_f^2}}{\sigma_f} = \ln \sqrt{1 + \left(\frac{\sigma_x}{\sigma_f}\right)^2}
 \end{aligned}$$

As  $\sigma_f \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $I(X,Y) \rightarrow 0$  (an infinitely noisy measurement  $\rightarrow$  no information).

If  $\sigma_f \ll \sigma_x$ :  $I(X,Y) \sim \ln \frac{\sigma_x}{\sigma_f}$

(3) (a)  $\log m(n) = \log(N b_{i_n} m(n-1)) = \log m(n-1) + \log(N b_{i_n})$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= \log m(n-2) + \log(N b_{i_{n-1}}) + \log(N b_{i_n}) = \dots \\
 &= \log m_0 + \sum_{k \in \text{races}} \log(N \cdot b_{i_k}) \quad \text{where } i_k = \text{index of the horse that won the race \#k.}
 \end{aligned}$$

$\uparrow$  well defined



# HW7 - solutions.

LS

So over many races  $n$ , horse 1 wins  $p_1 \cdot n$  times, etc., and we find  $\log m(n) = \log m_0 + n \sum_i p_i \log(N b_i)$

(b) We seek to maximize  $\sum_i p_i \log(N b_i)$  over all possible choices of  $b_i$  subject to condition  $\sum_i b_i = 1$ .

Let's change our bets by small amounts:  $b_i \rightarrow b_i + \delta b_i$

The extremum condition requires that  $\sum_i p_i \log(N b_i)$  does not change. (To maximize  $f(x)$  we require that  $\frac{d}{dx} \big|_{x=\text{optimum}} f(x) = 0$ )

$$\sum_i p_i \log(N(b_i + \delta b_i)) - \sum_i p_i \log(N b_i) = \sum_i p_i \log\left(1 + \frac{\delta b_i}{b_i}\right) \approx \sum_i p_i \frac{\delta b_i}{b_i}$$

This must be zero for any  $\delta b_i$  such that  $\sum_i \delta b_i = 0$ .

$$\text{Take } \delta b_i = \{\epsilon, -\epsilon, 0, 0, \dots, 0\} \Rightarrow \frac{p_1}{b_1} = \frac{p_2}{b_2}$$

$\Rightarrow$  The optimal  $b_i$  must satisfy  $\frac{p_i}{b_i} = \text{const.} \Rightarrow \underline{\underline{b_i = p_i}}$   
 $\epsilon$  must be 1 to satisfy  $\sum_i b_i = 1$

For this optimal strategy, the growth rate of your capital is

$$\sum_i p_i \log N b_i = \log N + \sum_i p_i \log p_i = \log N - H(p).$$

(c) If  $b_i = q_i$  (the would-be optimum if probabilities were  $q_i$ )

our capital grows as  $\sum_i p_i \log(N q_i)$  instead of  $\sum_i p_i \log(N p_i)$

(the optimum).  $\Rightarrow$  We are losing out by:  ~~$\sum_i p_i \log$~~

$$m(n) \approx m_0 e^{n \sum_i p_i \log(N q_i)} = \underbrace{m_0 e^{n \sum_i p_i \log(N p_i)}}_{(a)} e^{n \sum_i p_i \log q_i / p_i} =$$



# HW7 - solutions

$$= m_{\max}(n) e^{-n \sum_i (-p_i \log \frac{q_i}{p_i})} \equiv m_{\max}(n) e^{-n D_{KL}(p||q)} \quad \boxed{6}$$

(d) With the adjusted odds, long-term capital growth is

$$\sum_i p_i \log \left( \underbrace{\frac{1}{p_i}}_{\text{previously } N} \cdot b_i \right) \text{ maximized at } b_i = p_i \Rightarrow 0.$$

(e) Just as in (a), if race  $k$  is won by horse  $i_k$ :

$$\log m(n) = \log m(n-1) + \log \left( \frac{1}{p_i} \cdot b_{i_n} \right)$$

multiplication coefficient that comes from the bookmakers' payout upon our win. ~~we do not~~ The payout structure does not change from race to race.

But our bets now change from race to race: adjusted each time according to the information  $H_n$  we received. So what is our expected win? For a particular race  $\#k$ , given the information we received, horse  $i$  wins with probability  $p(i \text{ wins} | H_k)$ .

$$\Rightarrow \langle \log m(n) \rangle = \langle \log m(n-1) \rangle + \sum_i p(i \text{ wins} | H_n) \cdot \log \left( \frac{b_i}{p_i} \right)$$

And we are using  $b_i = p(i \text{ wins} | H_n)$  ← the optimal strategy, given the information we have.

$$\Rightarrow \langle \log m(n) \rangle = \langle \log m(n-1) \rangle + \sum_i p(i \text{ wins} | H_n) \log \frac{p(i \text{ wins} | H_n)}{p_i}$$

$$\Rightarrow \langle \log m(n) \rangle = \log m_0 + \left\langle \sum_i -p(i \text{ wins} | H_n) \log \frac{p_i}{p(i \text{ wins} | H_n)} \right\rangle_{\text{races}}$$

$$= \log m_0 + \langle D_{KL}(P(i \text{ wins} | H_n) \parallel P(i \text{ wins})) \rangle_{\text{races}}$$

$$\left\langle D_{KL}(P(X|Y) \parallel P(X)) \right\rangle_Y$$

$$= \left\langle - \sum_x P(X=x | Y=y) \log \frac{P(X=x)}{P(X=x | Y=y)} \right\rangle_y$$

$$= \sum_y P(Y=y) \cdot \left\{ - \sum_x P(X=x | Y=y) \log \frac{P(X=x)}{P(X=x | Y=y)} \right\}$$

$$= - \sum_{x,y} \underbrace{P(X=x | Y=y)}_{\text{conditional}} \underbrace{P(Y=y)}_{\text{joint}} \log \frac{P(X=x) \cdot P(Y=y)}{P(X=x | Y=y) P(Y=y)}$$

$$= - \sum_{x,y} P(X=x, Y=y) \log \frac{P(X=x) \cdot P(Y=y)}{P(X=x, Y=y)}$$

$$\equiv I(X, Y)$$