Structural Empirical Methods for Labor Economics and Industrial Organization

Joan Llull
IDEA PhD Program

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Rivers (2020), Goldsmith-Pinkham, Sorkin and Swift (2019), Llull (2020), Albert, Glitz and Llull (2020)

Chapter 2: Applications of discrete and dynamic choice models

  I. Introduction

  II. Spatial equilibrium: Diamond (2016)

  III. Married woman's labor force participation

  IV. Human capital accumulation: Heckman, Lochner and Taber (1998)

References: Rosen (1979), Roback (1982), Katz and Murphy (1992), Heckman, Lochner and Taber (1998), Card and Lemieux (2001), Adda and Cooper (2003), Keane, Todd and Wolpin (2011), Jeong, Kim and Manovskii (2015), Diamond (2016)

PART II: DYNAMIC DISCRETE CHOICE MODELS

Chapter 3: Dynamic discrete choice models: full solution approaches

  I. Introduction

  II. General framework

      A. Model primitives and decision problem

      B. Baseline assumptions

      C. Value functions, conditional choice probabilities, and log-likelihood

  III. Motivational example: Rust's engine replacement model

  IV. Estimation using full solution techniques

  V. Extensions: unobserved heterogeneity and equilibrium

      A. Unobserved permanent heterogeneity

      B. Estimation of competitive equilibrium models

      C. Using randomized experimental data to validate structural models

  VI. Application: Llull (2018)

References: Berndt, Hall, Hall and Hausman (1974), Miller (1984), Wolpin (1984), Heckman and Singer (1984), Pakes (1986), Rust (1987), Eckstein and Wolpin (1989), Hotz and Miller (1993), Rust (1994), Keane and Wolpin (1994, 1997), Miller (1999), Adda and Cooper (2003), Lee and Wolpin (2006), Todd and Wolpin (2006), Aguirregabiria and Mira (2010), Keane, Todd and Wolpin (2011), Llull (2018)

Chapter 4. Conditional choice probability (CCP) estimation

I. Introduction

II. Conditional choice probability (CCP) representation

    A. Models requiring only one-period-ahead choice probabilities

    B. Finite dependence

    C. Infinite-horizon stationary settings

III. Estimation methods

    A. CCPs and transition functions

    B. Estimating the structural parameters

    C. Forward simulation methods

    D. Aguirregabiria and Mira's iterative approach

IV. Extensions: unobserved heterogeneity and competitive equilibrium models

    A. Unobserved heterogeneity

    B. Competitive equilibrium models and aggregate shocks

V. Application: Llull (2020)

References: Dempster, Laird and Rubin (1977), Heckman and Singer (1984), Hotz and Miller (1993), Hotz, Miller, Sanders and Smith (1994), Altuğ and Miller (1998), Miller (1999), Aguirregabiria and Mira (2002, 2010), Arcidiacono and Jones (2003), Arcidiacono and Ellickson (2011), Arcidiacono and Miller (2011), Keane, Todd and Wolpin (2011), Llull (2020)

PART III: GAMES AND AUCTIONS

Chapter 5. Dynamic discrete games with incomplete information

I. Introduction

II. Motivating example: market entry and exit

III. General structure

IV. Identification

V. Estimation

    A. Maximum-likelihood estimation

    B. Two-step methods

    C. Recursive estimation

    D. Estimation using moment inequalities

E. Extensions: unobserved heterogeneity and multiple equilibria

VI. Application: Ryan (2012)

References: Hotz and Miller (1993), Hotz, Miller, Sanders and Smith (1994), Ericson and Pakes (1995), Bajari, Benkard and Levin (2007), Pakes, Ostrovsky and Berry (2007), Aguirregabiria and Mira (2007, 2010, 2019), Pesendorfer and Schmidt-Dengler (2008, 2010), Kasahara and Shimotsu (2009), Arcidiacono and Ellickson (2011), Ryan (2012), Aguirregabiria (2019)

Chapter 6. Auctions

I. Introduction

II. Equilibrium bid functions

    A. Second price sealed bid auctions

    B. First price sealed bid auctions

    C. English auctions

III. Identification

    A. Second price sealed bid auctions

    B. First price sealed bid auctions

    C. English auctions

IV. Estimation

    A. Parametric methods

    B. Non-parametric estimation

V. Application: Barkley, Groeger and Miller (2020)

References: Paarsch (1992), Donald and Paarsch (1993, 1996, 2002), Laffont, Ossard and Vuong (1995), Hendricks and Paarsch (1995), Guerre, Perrigne and Vuong (2000), Hong and Shum (2000, 2003), Haile and Tamer (2003), Bajari and Hortaçsu (2004) Paarsch and Hong (2006), Hendricks and Porter (2007), Athey and Haile (2007), Hickman, Hubbard and Sağlam (2012), Barkley, Groeger and Miller (2020)

GRADING

Problem sets: 40%. Research proposal/term paper: 60%.

RESEARCH PROPOSAL

As a part of the evaluation process (35% of the final grade), students need to elaborate a research proposal. The research proposal consists of a novel research project. The expected development stage of the project is less than that of a standard "term paper", but its ambition is expected to be larger. The proposals can be carried individually or in teams of max 2 people. Proposals should include motivation, related literature, a structural model, and a detailed description of identification, estimation, and proposed counterfactual/policy exercises. The format of the proposal is expected to be that of the first few sections of a standard Structural Microeconometrics paper (i.e., all typically included sections except the results). The expected length is 8-12 pages, even though different lengths are acceptable subject to pre-approval. While all topics covered in the course are allowed, the proposals that use simpler modeling frameworks will be discounted, and further creativity will be expected in exchange, everything else constant. Each team will prepare a 20 minute presentation of the project, which will be delivered in class in the last few sessions. The order of presentations will be determined randomly in class.

REFERENCES

Acemoglu, Daron and David H. Autor, "Skills, Tasks and Technologies: Implications for Employment and Earnings," in Orley C. Ashenfelter and David E. Card, eds., *Handbook of Labor Economics*, Vol. 4B, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 2011, chapter 12, pp. 1043–1171.

Ackerberg, Daniel A., Kevin Caves, and Garth Frazer, "Identification Properties of Recent Production Function Estimators," *Econometrica*, November 2015, *83* (6), 2411–2451.

Adda, Jérôme and Russell Cooper, *Dynamic Economics: Quantitative Methods and Applications*, Cambridge: MIT Press, 2003.

Aguirregabiria, Victor, *Empirical Industrial Organization: Models, Methods, and Applications*, mimeo, University of Toronto, 2019.

_ **and Pedro Mira**, "Swapping the Nested Fixed Point Algorithm: a Class of Estimators for Discrete Markov Decision Models," *Econometrica*, July 2002, *70* (4), 1519–1543.

_ **and** _ , "Sequential Estimation of Dynamic Discrete Games," *Econometrica*, January 2007, *75* (1), 1–53.

_ **and** _ , "Dynamic Discrete Choice Structural Models: A Survey," *Journal of Econometrics*, May 2010, *156* (1), 38–67.

_ **and** _ , "Identification of Games of Incomplete Information with Multiple Equilibria and Unobserved Heterogeneity," *Quantitative Economics*, November 2019, *10* (4), 1659–1701.

Albert, Christoph, Albrecht Glitz, and Joan Llull, "Labor Market Competition and the Assimilation of Immigrants," mimeo, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, January 2020.

Altuğ, Sumru and Robert A. Miller, "The Effect of Work Experience on Female Wages and Labor Supply," *Review of Economic Studies*, January 1998, *65* (1), 45–85.

Antràs, Pol, "Is the U.S. Aggregate Production Function Cobb-Douglas? New Estimates of the Elasticity of Substitution," *Contributions to Macroeconomics*, January 2004, *4* (1), 1–34.

Arcidiacono, Peter and John Bailey Jones, "Finite Mixture Distributions, Sequential Likelihood and the EM Algorithm," *Econometrica*, May 2003, *71* (3), 933–946.

_ **and Paul B. Ellickson**, "Practical Methods for Estimation of Dynamic Discrete Choice Models," *Annual Review of Economics*, September 2011, *3* (1), 363–394.

_ **and Robert A. Miller**, "Conditional Choice Probability Estimation of Dynamic Discrete Choice Models with Unobserved Heterogeneity," *Econometrica*, November 2011, *79* (6), 1823–1867.

Arellano, Manuel and Olympia Bover, "Another Look at the Instrumental Variable Estimation of Error-Components Models," *Journal of Econometrics*, July 1995, *68* (1), 29–51.

_ **and Stephen Bond**, "Some Tests of Specification for Panel Data: Monte Carlo Evidence and an Application to Employment Equations," *Review of Economic Studies*, April 1991, *58* (2), 277–297.

Athey, Susan and Philip A. Haile, "Nonparametric Approaches to Auctions," in James J. Heckman and Edward E. Leamer, eds., *Handbook of Econometrics*, Vol. 6A, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 2007, chapter 60, pp. 3849–3965.

Bajari, Patrick and Ali Hortaçsu, "Economic Insights from Internet Auctions," *Journal of Economic Literature*, June 2004, *42* (2), 457–486.

_ , **C. Lanier Benkard, and Jonathan Levin**, "Estimating Dynamic Models of Imperfect Competition," *Econometrica*, September 2007, *75* (5), 1331–1370.

Barkley, Aaron, Joachim R. Groeger, and Robert A. Miller, "Bidding Frictions in Ascending Auctions," *Journal of Econometrics*, 2020, *forthcoming*.

Bartik, Timothy J., *Who Benefits from State and Local Economic Development Policies*, Kalamazoo, MI: W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, 1991.

Berndt, Ernst R., Bronwyn H. Hall, Robert E. Hall, and Jerry A. Hausman, "Estimation and Inference in Nonlinear Structural Models," *Annals of Economic and Social Measurement*, October 1974, *3* (4), 653–666.

Blundell, Richard and Stephen Bond, "Initial Conditions and Moment Restrictionsin Dynamic Panel Data Models," *Journal of Econometrics*, August 1998, *87* (1), 115–143.

_ **and** _ , "GMM Estimation with Persistent Panel Data: An Application to Production Functions," *Econometric Reviews*, March 2000, *19* (3), 321–340.

Borjas, George J., "The Labor Demand Curve Is Downward Sloping: Reexamining the Impact of Immigration on the Labor Market," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, November 2003, *118* (4), 1335–1374.

Card, David E. and Thomas Lemieux, "Can Falling Supply Explain The Rising Return To College For Younger Men? A Cohort-Based Analysis," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, May 2001, *116* (2), 705–745.

Dempster, Arthur P., Nan M. Laird, and Donald B. Rubin, "Maximum Likelihood from Incomplete Data via the EM Algorithm," *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series B (Methodological)*, 1977, *39* (1), 1–38.

Diamond, Peter A., Daniel McFadden, and Miguel Rodríguez, "Measurement of the Elasticity of Substitution and Bias of Technical Change," in Melvyn Fuss and Daniel McFadden, eds., *Production Economics*, Vol. 2, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 1978, chapter IV.2, pp. 125–147.

Diamond, Rebecca, "The Determinants and Welfare Implications of US Workers' Diverging Location Choices by Skill: 1980-2000," *American Economic Review*, March 2016, *106* (3), 479–524.

Donald, Stephen G. and Harry J. Paarsch, "Piecewise Pseudo-Maximum Likelihood Estimation in Empirical Models of Auctions," *International Economic Review*, February 1993, *34* (1), 121–148.

_ **and** _ , "Identification, Estimation, and Testing in Parametric Empirical Mod-

els of Auctions within the Independent Private Values Paradigm," *Econometric Theory*, August 1996, *12* (3), 517–567.

_ **and** _ , "Superconsistent Estimation and Inference in Structural Econometric Models using extreme Order Statistics," *Journal of Econometrics*, August 2002, *109* (2), 305–340.

Eckstein, Zvi and Kenneth I. Wolpin, "The Specification and Estimation of Dynamic Stochastic Discrete Choice Models: A Survey," *Journal of Human Resources*, Autumn 1989, *24* (4), 562–598.

Ericson, Richard and Ariel Pakes, "Markov-Perfect Industry Dynamics: A Framework for Empirical Work," *Review of Economic Studies*, January 1995, *62* (1), 53–82.

Gandhi, Amit, Salvador Navarro, and David A. Rivers, "On the Identification of Gross Output Production," *Journal of Political Economy*, August 2020, *128* (8), 2973–3016.

Goldsmith-Pinkham, Paul, Isaac Sorkin, and Henry Swift, "Bartik Instruments: What, When, Why, and How," NBER working papers, n 24408, November 2019.

Guerre, Emmanuel, Isabelle Perrigne, and Quang Vuong, "Optimal Nonparametric Estimation of First-Price Auctions," *Econometrica*, May 2000, *68* (3), 525–574.

Haile, Philip A. and Elie Tamer, "Inference with an Incomplete Model of English Auctions," *Journal of Political Economy*, February 2003, *111* (1), 1–51.

Heckman, James J. and Burton S. Singer, "A Method for Minimizing the Impact of Distributional Assumptions in Econometric Models for Duration Data," *Econometrica*, March 1984, *52* (2), 271–320.

_ **, Lance Lochner, and Christopher Taber**, "Explaining Rising Wage Inequality: Explorations with a Dynamic General Equilibrium Model of Labor Earnings with Heterogeneous Agents," *Review of Economic Dynamics*, January 1998, *1* (1), 1–58.

Hendricks, Ken and Robert H. Porter, "An Empirical Perspective on Auctions," in Mark Amstrong and Robert H. Porter, eds., *Handbook of Industrial Organization*, Vol. 3, Amsterdam: North Holland Publishing Company, 2007, chapter 32, pp. 2073–2143.

Hendricks, Kenneth and Harry J. Paarsch, "A Survey of Recent Empirical Work concerning Auctions," *Canadian Journal of Economics*, May 1995, *28*

(2), 403–426.

Hickman, Brent R., Timothy P. Hubbard, and Yiğit Sağlam, "Structural Econometric Methods in Auctions: A Guide to the Literature," *Journal of Econometric Methods*, August 2012, *1* (1), 67–106.

Hong, Han and Matthew Shum, "Structural Estimation of Auction Models," in Fioravante Patrone, Ignacio García-Jurado, and Stef Tijs, eds., *Game Practice: Contributions from Applied Game Theory*, Boston: Springer, 2000, chapter 10, pp. 123–142.

_ **and** _ , "Econometric Models of Asymmetric Ascending Auctions," *Journal of Econometrics*, February 2003, *112* (2), 327–358.

Hotz, V. Joseph and Robert A. Miller, "Conditional Choice Probabilities and the Estimation of Dynamic Models," *Review of Economic Studies*, July 1993, *60* (3), 497–529.

_ , _ , **Seth Sanders, and Jeffrey Smith**, "A Simulation Estimator for Dynamic Models of Discrete Choice," *Review of Economic Studies*, April 1994, *61* (2), 265–289.

Jeong, Hyeok, Yong Kim, and Iourii Manovskii, "The Price of Experience," *American Economic Review*, February 2015, *105* (2), 784–815.

Kasahara, Hiroyuki and Katsumi Shimotsu, "Nonparametric Identification of Finite Mixture Models of Dynamic Discrete Choices," *Econometrica*, January 2009, *77* (1), 135–175.

Katz, Lawrence F. and Kevin M. Murphy, "Changes in Relative Wages, 1963-1987: Supply and Demand Factors," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, February 1992, *107* (1), 35–78.

Keane, Michael P. and Kenneth I. Wolpin, "The Solution and Estimation of Discrete Choice Dynamic Programming Models by Simulation and Interpolation: Monte Carlo Evidence," *Review of Economics and Statistics*, November 1994, *76* (4), 648–672.

_ **and** _ , "The Career Decisions of Young Men," *Journal of Political Economy*, June 1997, *105* (3), 473–522.

_ , **Petra E. Todd, and Kenneth I. Wolpin**, "The Structural Estimation of Behavioral Models: Discrete Choice Dynamic Programming Methods and Applications," in Orley C. Ashenfelter and David E. Card, eds., *Handbook of Labor Economics*, Vol. 4A, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 2011, chapter 4, pp. 331–461.

Krusell, Per, Lee E. Ohanian, José-Víctor Ríos-Rull, and Giovanni L. Violante, "Capital-Skill Complementarity and Inequality: A Macroeconomic Analysis," *Econometrica*, September 2000, *68* (5), 1029–1054.

Laffont, Jean-Jacques, Herve Ossard, and Quang Vuong, "Econometrics of First-Price Auctions," *Econometrica*, July 1995, *63* (4), 953–980.

Lee, Donghoon and Kenneth I. Wolpin, "Intersectoral Labor Mobility and the Growth of the Service Sector," *Econometrica*, January 2006, *74* (1), 1–46.

León-Ledesma, Miguel A., Peter McAdam, and Alpo Willman, "Identifying the Elasticity of Substitution with Biased Technical Change," *American Economic Review*, September 2010, *100* (4), 1330–1357.

Levinshon, James and Amil Petrin, "Estimating Production Functions Using Inputs to Control for Unobservables," *Review of Economic Studies*, April 2003, *70* (2), 317–341.

Llull, Joan, "Immigration, Wages, and Education: A Labor Market Equilibrium Structural Model," *Review of Economic Studies*, July 2018, *85* (3), 1852–1896.

_ , "Selective Immigration Policies and the U.S. Labor Market," mimeo, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, June 2020.

Miller, Robert A., "Job Matching and Occupational Choice," *Journal of Political Economy*, December 1984, *92* (6), 1086–1120.

_ , "Estimating Models of Dynamic Optimization with Microeconomic Data," in M. Hashem Pesaran and Peter Schmidt, eds., *Handbook of Applied Econometrics*, Vol. 2, New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1999, chapter 6, pp. 227–274.

Olley, G. Steven and Ariel Pakes, "The Dynamics of Productivity in the Telecommunications Equipment Industry," *Econometrica*, November 1996, *65* (6), 1263–1297.

Ottaviano, Gianmarco I. P. and Giovanni Peri, "Rethinking the Effect of Immigration on Wages," *Journal of the European Economic Association*, February 2012, *10* (1), 152–197.

Paarsch, Harry J., "Deciding between the Common and Private Value Paradigms in Empirical Models of Auctions," *Journal of Econometrics*, January-February 1992, *51* (1-2), 191–215.

_ **and Han Hong**, *An Introduction to the Structural Econometrics of Auction Data*, Cambridge: MIT Press, 2006.

Pakes, Ariel, "Patents as Options: Some Estimates of the Value of Holding

European Patent Stocks," *Econometrica*, July 1986, *54* (4), 755–784.

_ , **Michael Ostrovsky, and Steven Berry**, "Simple Estimators for the Parameters of Dynamic Discrete Games (with Entry/Exit Examples)," *RAND Journal of Economics*, Summer 2007, *38* (2), 373–399.

Pesendorfer, Martin and Philipp Schmidt-Dengler, "Asymptotic Least Squares Estimators for Dynamic Games," *Review of Economic Studies*, July 2008, *75* (3), 901–928.

_ **and** _ , "Sequential Estimation of Dynamic Discrete Games: A Comment," *Econometrica*, March 2010, *78* (2), 833–842.

Reiss, Peter C. and Frank A. Wolak, "Structural Econometric Modeling: Rationales and Examples from Industrial Organization," in James J. Heckman and Edward E. Leamer, eds., *Handbook of Econometrics*, Vol. 6A, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 2007, chapter 64, pp. 4277–4415.

Roback, Jennifer, "Wages, Rents, and the Qality of Life," *Journal of Political Economy*, December 1982, *90* (6), 1257–1278.

Rosen, Sherwin, "Wage-Based Indexes of Urban Quality of Life," in Peter M Mieszkowski and Mahlon R. Straszheim, eds., *Current Issues in Urban Economics*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1979, chapter 3, pp. 74–104.

Rust, John, "Optimal Replacement of GMC Bus Engines: An Empirical Model of Harold Zurcher," *Econometrica*, September 1987, *55* (5), 999–1033.

_ , "Structural Estimation of Markov Decision Processes," in Robert F. Engle and Daniel L. McFadden, eds., *Handbook of Econometrics*, Vol. 4, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 1994, chapter 51, pp. 3081–3143.

Ryan, Stephen P., "The Costs of Environmental Regulation in a Concentrated Industry," *Econometrica*, May 2012, *80* (3), 1019–1061.

Todd, Petra E. and Kenneth I. Wolpin, "Assessing the Impact of a School Subsidy Program in Mexico: Using a Social Experiment to Validate a Dynamic Behavioral Model of Child Schooling and Fertility," *American Economic Review*, December 2006, *96* (5), 1384–1417.

Wolpin, Kenneth I., "An Estimable Dynamic Stochastic Model of Fertility and Child Mortality," *Journal of Political Economy*, October 1984, *92* (5), 852–874.