Table 1: Results obtained by integrating understandability estimations within retrieval methods on CLEF 2016. Baseline runs are reported at table indices 1-3 (the index column is labelled Idx). Re-ranking experiments are reported at indices 4-21. Fusion experiments are reported at indices 22-30. Learning to rank experiments are reported at indices 31-35. All measures were calculated up to rank n=10. P-values are rounded to the third decimal digit and reported w.r.t ECNU run (P_e) and the BM25 baseline (P_{bl}) . The highest result of each set of experiments is reported in bold face.

| Idx | Rerank | Run | Official CLEF 2015 Measures | | | | | | | New Measures to Evaluate Understandability in Retrieval | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|---|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|---|--|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|---|---------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | | | RBP | P_{bl} | P_e | Res. | uRBP | P_{bl} | P_e | Res. | RBP_u | P_{bl} | P_e | Res. | H_{rtp} | P_{bl} | P_e | Res. | Unj | RBP_r^* | P_{bl} | P_e | RBP_u^* | P_{bl} | P_e | H_{rbp}^{\star} | P_{bl} | P_e |
| 1 2 3 | No Rerank | ECNU (Best Run) KISTI (2nd Best) Plain BM25 Baseline | 51.57 36.72 31.20 | : | .036 .000 | 8.95 8.06 8.76 | 50.51 35.92 30.51 | : | .035 .000 | 8.95 7.32 7.65 | 59.55 64.50 67.60 | - | .237 .066 | 10.09 11.54 12.20 | 46.22 37.56 35.75 | : | .028 .009 | 8.62 7.89 8.76 | .00 .03 .03 | 51.57 37.07 31.57 | : | .049 .000 | 59.55 65.31 68.94 | - | .156 0.021 | 46.22 37.96 36.42 | : | .037 .015 |
| 4 5 6 7 8 | SMOG Top 15 SMOG Top 20 | Based on ECNU Based on KISTI Based on BM25 Based on ECNU Based on KISTI | 38.16 31.28 24.39 34.88 28.01 | .000 .005 .001 .000 .002 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 20.09 10.21 11.46 25.96 11.05 | 37.36 30.59 23.83 34.13 27.39 | .000 .005 .001 .000 .002 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 8.95 7.48 7.16 8.95 7.32 | 55.11 67.05 67.69 54.15 66.61 | .013 .260 .962 .025 .356 | .013 .126 .104 .025 .170 | 22.14 13.95 17.66 27.91 15.44 | 37.59 34.23 28.97 35.34 30.93 | .000 .132 .000 .000 | .000 .001 .000 .000 | 18.98 10.05 11.46 25.02 10.82 | .14 .05 .10 .20 .08 | 45.45 33.12 26.28 44.87 30.87 | .005 .020 .005 .004 .015 | .005 .000 .000 .004 | 62.58 69.10 72.82 66.20 69.99 | .161 .085 .018 .005 | .161 .037 .001 .005 | 43.65 36.02 31.53 44.88 33.81 | .167 .337 .008 .519 .074 | .167 .008 .001 .519 .002 |
| 10 11 12 13 | SMOG Top 50 | Based on BM25 Based on ECNU Based on KISTI Based on BM25 Based on ECNU | 22.83 21.83 21.00 15.20 39.77 | .000 .000 .000 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 13.48 36.63 18.67 18.73 21.59 | 22.31 21.34 20.53 14.86 38.90 | .000 .000 .000 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 7.32 8.95 7.32 6.51 9.11 | 63.61 41.71 59.72 49.87 34.84 | .065 .076 .076 .000 | .546 .000 .523 .005 .021 | 22.44 46.89 26.67 36.41 24.22 | 26.52 23.65 24.88 17.79 38.35 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 13.48 36.63 18.67 18.73 20.72 | .15 .23 .32 .15 | 26.22 39.88 27.20 21.22 47.00 | .005 .000 .002 .002 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 72.72 71.61 72.47 73.17 64.28 | .018 .001 .004 .069 | .000 .001 .004 .001 | 30.87 43.86 31.90 25.78 45.22 | .008 .278 .041 .000 | .000 .278 .000 .000 |
| 14 15 16 17 18 | Top 15 XGB Top 20 | Based on KISTI Based on BM25 Based on ECNU Based on KISTI Based on BM25 | 31.36 23.38 34.91 29.04 21.83 | .017 .001 .000 .017 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 8.95 11.36 27.19 10.10 12.88 | 30.63 22.84 34.12 28.35 21.32 | .016 .001 .000 .017 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 6.83 7.16 9.11 6.51 6.51 | 68.63 66.79 52.69 69.10 64.16 | .065 .700 .010 .073 .167 | .042 .194 .010 .033 .550 | 13.63 19.43 30.19 15.86 25.29 | 33.78 27.60 34.89 32.00 25.47 | .055 .000 .000 .022 .000 | .001 .000 .000 .000 | 8.78 11.36 25.95 9.94 12.88 | .05 .10 .25 .07 .16 | 32.80 26.35 46.71 31.82 26.56 | .043 .007 .003 .086 .023 | .001 .000 .003 .000 | 70.87 73.48 67.26 73.19 76.26 | .010 .009 .001 .000 | .010 .001 .001 .001 | 35.24 31.35 45.81 34.84 31.45 | .144 .003 .705 .134 .026 | .005 .000 .705 .004 .001 |
| 20 21 22 | XGB Top 50 | Based on ECNU Based on KISTI Based on BM25 Based on ECNU | 22.75 18.69 17.47 47.81 | .000 .001 .004 | .000 .000 .000 | 33.65 17.21 20.95 | 722.22 18.25 17.00 46.78 | .000 .001 .004 | .000 .000 .000 | 8.79 6.67 6.02 8.95 | 43.36 56.87 47.21 | .000 .032 .000 | .000 .255 .003 | 49.18 33.37 43.81 | 24.90 21.82 19.22 | .000 .000 .000 | .000 .000 .000 | 33.65 17.21 2.98 | .45 .29 .41 | 40.69 27.69 27.09 50.09 | .000 .007 .463 | .000 .000 .000 | 74.39 76.44 79.77 | .000 .000 .000 | .000 .000 .000 | 44.65 44.65 31.35 46.85 | .421 .421 .090 | .421 .066 .001 |
| 23 K 24 | RF (XGB & Orig.) Top 15 | Based on KISTI Based on BM25 Based on ECNU | 33.78 26.85 46.49 | .033 | .002 .000 | 7.71 12.13 15.16 | 33.02 26.23 45.48 | .032 | .002 .000 | 6.83 7.48 9.11 | 68.57 66.64 59.95 | .006 .464 .981 | .023 166 981 | 12.02 15.98 17.12 | 35.72 31.52 43.69 | .096 .000 .074 | .005 .000 .074 | 7.55 12.13 14.54 | .03 07 12 | 34.34 - 28.35 - 49.95 | .038 .004 .153 | .004 .000 .153 | 69.67 70.65 64.30 | .002 .144 .000 | .005 | 36.26 33.70 47.01 | .105 .007 .543 | .010 .002 .543 |
| 29 | Top 20 RRF (XGB & Orig.) Top 50 | Based on KISTI Based on BM25 Based on ECNU Based on KISTI | 32.72 25.64 38.97 27.78 | .000 .000 .001 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 8.45 12.51 21.40 11.24 | 31.97 25.05 38.08 27.13 | .000 .000 .001 | .000 .000 .000 | 7.00 7.16 8.79 6.83 | 69.06 66.55 57.37 67.83 | .007 .434 .272 .188 | .020 .174 .272 .089 | 12.77 17.31 25.44 16.75 | 35.14 30.14 39.54 31.07 | .070 .000 .002 .006 | .003 .000 .002 .000 | 8.28 12.51 19.83 11.24 | .04 .09 .24 .09 | 33.83 27.64 47.00 31.33 | .028 .002 .010 .007 | .002 .000 .010 .000 | 70.83 71.79 67.95 73.06 | .001 .017 .000 .000 | .005 .002 .000 .001 | 36.29 32.96 47.12 34.85 | .173 .011 .715 | .011 .002 .715 .003 |
| 31 32 33 34 | XGB LeToR | Based on BM25 LTR 1 on BM25 LTR 2 on BM25 LTR 3 on BM25 LTR 4 on BM25 | 24.86 30.72 28.92 25.65 | .000 .003 .880 .186 | .000 .000 .000 | 17.11 17.39 21.25 24.35 25.72 | 24.32 30.08 28.32 25.09 | .000 .003 .868 .190 | .000 .000 .000 | 7.00 7.81 8.46 8.46 8.30 | 57.40 55.60 48.87 49.02 49.00 | .000 .000 .000 | .048 .000 .000 | 27.02 24.11 28.82 32.11 33.39 | 28.89 31.76 30.14 27.45 | .000 .002 .096 .033 | .000 .000 .000 .000 | 17.11 17.39 18.99 23.83 24.40 | .19 .22 .26 .31 .33 | 25.06 29.67 37.09 37.32 35.82 | .000 .247 .065 .199 .190 | .000 .000 .000 | 71.56 66.41 61.89 63.86 66.14 | .181 .332 .004 .015 .313 | .008 .155 .824 .576 .163 | 30.26 34.76 39.17 39.84 38.21 | .003 .316 .265 .234 .577 | .000 .001 .023 .039 |
| 35 | | LTR 5 on BM25 | 30.21 | .554 | .000 | 20.79 | 29.59 | .567 | .000 | 8.62 | | .000 | .000 | 27.88 | 30.95 | .039 | .000 | 19.99 | .25 | 37.11 | .055 | .000 | 61.25 | .006 | .888 | 39.15 | .169 | .040 |