

## Formalized Argument Reconstructions

=== Formal Logic Reconstruction ===

(1) The meaning of the word chivalry has evolved over time.

Formal: Evolve(chivalry)

(2) Chivalry is an ideal distinct from other ideals.

Formal: Ideal(chivalry)  $\wedge \neg(\text{Ideal}(x) \wedge x \neq \text{chivalry})$

(2) There is a particular conception of man associated with chivalry that was a special contribution of the Middle Ages.

Formal:  $\exists x(\text{ConceptionOfMan}(x) \wedge \text{AssociatedWith}(x, \text{chivalry}) \wedge \text{Contribution}(x, \text{MiddleAges}))$

(3) Launcelot is characterized as the meekest man.

Formal: Meekest(Launcelot)

(4) The duality of character in human nature.

Formal: Duality(Character(human))

(4) A person can embody contrasting traits such as meekness and sternness.

Formal:  $\exists y(\text{Person}(y) \wedge \text{EmbodyContrastingTraits}(y, \text{meekness}, \text{sternness}))$

(5) The ideal makes a double demand on human nature.

Formal: DoubleDemand(Ideal)  $\wedge$  On(humanNature)

(6) The knight embodies a duality of nature.

Formal: EmbodiesDuality(knight)

(7) He is not a compromise between ferocity and meekness.

Formal:  $\neg \text{Compromise}(\text{ferocity}, \text{meekness})$

(8) Launcelot is recognized as the best knight in the world.

Formal: BestKnight(Launcelot)

(10) The subject matter is of great significance.

Formal: Significant(subjectMatter)

(11) The principle discussed is practical, even if it may not be practicable in all contexts.

Formal: Practical(Principle)  $\wedge \neg(\text{PracticallyInAllContexts})$

(11) The failure of the Middle Ages to adhere to this principle demonstrates its challenges.

Formal: Failure(MiddleAges, Principle)  $\rightarrow$  Challenges(Principle)

(12) The medieval ideal combines two disparate elements.

Formal: Combine(MedievalIdeal, Element1, Element2)  $\wedge$  Disparate(Element1, Element2)

(13) Connection or unity arises from shared reasons or circumstances.

Formal:  $\text{Connection} \rightarrow \exists z(\text{SharedReasons}(z) \vee \text{SharedCircumstances}(z))$

(14) Humility and forbearance are valuable lessons for even the greatest warriors.

Formal:  $\text{ValuableLessons}(\text{humility}, \text{forbearance}) \wedge \text{For}(\text{EvenGreatestWarriors})$

(15) Valour is demanded of individuals who embody urbanity and modesty.

Formal:  $\text{Demand}(\text{Valour}, \text{Individuals} \wedge \text{Embody}(\text{Urbanity}, \text{Modesty}))$

(16) The Middle Ages held a significant hope for the world.

Formal:  $\text{SignificantHope}(\text{MiddleAges}, \text{world})$

(17) It may or may not be possible to produce individuals combining two contrasting characteristics.

Formal:  $\text{Possibility}(\text{Individuals} \wedge \text{Combine}(\text{Characteristic1}, \text{Characteristic2}))$

(19) Humanity can be divided into two sections based on their capabilities in peace and war.

Formal:  $\text{Divide}(\text{Humanity}, \text{Section1}, \text{Section2}) \wedge \text{BasedOn}(\text{Capabilities}(\text{peace}), \text{Capabilities}(\text{war}))$

(20) The disassociation of the two halves of Launcelot leads to a simplification of history.

Formal:  $\text{Disassociate}(\text{halves}(\text{Launcelot})) \rightarrow \text{Simplification}(\text{history})$

(21) The ancient history of the Near East can be compared to other contexts or phenomena.

Formal:  $\text{Comparable}(\text{AncientHistory}(\text{NearEast}), \text{OtherContextsOrPhenomena})$

(22) Barbarians can diminish or destroy established civilizations.

Formal:  $\text{DiminishOrDestroy}(\text{Barbarians}, \text{EstablishedCivilizations})$

(23) Civilization leads to a loss of toughness or resilience.

Formal:  $\text{Civilization} \rightarrow \text{Loss}(\text{Toughness}) \vee \text{Loss}(\text{Resilience})$

(24) The knight is a combination of two characters (barbarian and civilized).

Formal:  $\text{Combine}(\text{knight}, \text{barbarian}, \text{civilized})$

(24) The knight is not a product of nature, but rather of human art.

Formal:  $\neg \text{ProductOfNature}(\text{knight}) \wedge \text{ProductOfHumanArt}(\text{knight})$

(25) The combative side of man's nature is seen as a pure, atavistic evil.

Formal:  $\text{CombativeSide}(\text{Nature}(\text{man})) = \text{PureAtavisticEvil}$

(25) The chivalrous sentiment associated with war is regarded as a false glamour.

Formal:  $\text{FalseGlamour}(\text{ChivalrousSentiment}, \text{War})$

(26) There is a neo-heroic tradition.

Formal:  $\exists x(\text{NeoHeroicTradition}(x))$

(27) The ferocity of Achilles in pre-Christian times is significant.

Formal: Significant(Ferocity(Achilles), PreChristianTimes)

(31) There is still life in the tradition inaugurated by the Middle Ages.

Formal:  $\exists x(\text{Life}(\text{InauguratedTradition}(x, \text{MiddleAges})))$

(32) The knightly character is art, not nature.

Formal:  $\text{KnightlyCharacter} = \text{Art} \wedge \neg \text{KnightlyCharacter} = \text{Nature}$

(32) The knightly character needs to be achieved.

Formal: NeedsAchieved(KnightlyCharacter)

(33) Knowledge is necessary for a democratic society.

Formal: Necessary(Knowledge, DemocraticSociety)

(34) The vestiges of chivalry were maintained by a specialized class.

Formal: Maintained(Vestiges(chivalry), SpecializedClass)

(35) The people must be chivalrous or else face brutality and softness.

Formal:  $\text{MustBe}(\text{Chivalrous}(\text{People})) \vee \text{Face}(\text{Brutality}, \text{Softness})$

(39) The ideal embodied in Launcelot is escapism.

Formal: EmbodiedIdeal(Launcelot) = Escapism

(39) Chivalry offers the only possible escape from a divided world.

Formal:  $\text{OffersEscape}(\text{Chivalry}, \text{DividedWorld}) \wedge \text{OnlyPossible}(\text{Escape})$

=== English Reconstruction of the Argument ===

- The meaning of the word chivalry has evolved over time.
- Chivalry is an ideal distinct from other ideals.
- There is a particular conception of man associated with chivalry that was a special contribution of the Middle Ages.
- Launcelot is characterized as the meekest man.
- The duality of character in human nature.
- A person can embody contrasting traits such as meekness and sternness.
- The ideal makes a double demand on human nature.
- The knight embodies a duality of nature.
- He is not a compromise between ferocity and meekness.
- Launcelot is recognized as the best knight in the world.

- The subject matter is of great significance.
- The principle discussed is practical, even if it may not be practicable in all contexts.
- The failure of the Middle Ages to adhere to this principle demonstrates its challenges.
- The medieval ideal combines two disparate elements.
- Connection or unity arises from shared reasons or circumstances.
- Humility and forbearance are valuable lessons for even the greatest warriors.
- Valour is demanded of individuals who embody urbanity and modesty.
- The Middle Ages held a significant hope for the world.
- It may or may not be possible to produce individuals combining two contrasting characteristics.
- Humanity can be divided into two sections based on their capabilities in peace and war.
- The disassociation of the two halves of Launcelot leads to a simplification of history.
- The ancient history of the Near East can be compared to other contexts or phenomena.
- Barbarians can diminish or destroy established civilizations.
- Civilization leads to a loss of toughness or resilience.
- The knight is a combination of two characters (barbarian and civilized).
- The knight is not a product of nature, but rather of human art.
- The combative side of man's nature is seen as a pure, atavistic evil.
- The chivalrous sentiment associated with war is regarded as a false glamour.
- There is a neo-heroic tradition.
- The ferocity of Achilles in pre-Christian times is significant.
- There is still life in the tradition inaugurated by the Middle Ages.
- The knightly character is art, not nature.
- The knightly character needs to be achieved.
- Knowledge is necessary for a democratic society.
- The vestiges of chivalry were maintained by a specialized class.
- The people must be chivalrous or else face brutality and softness.
- The ideal embodied in Launcelot is escapism.
- Chivalry offers the only possible escape from a divided world.