VOL. CLXXIII No. 60,133

breezy, high 64. Tonight, increasing

low 51. Tomorrow, showers, windy, high 66. Weather map, Page A16.

© 2024 The New York Times Company

TUESDAY, APRIL 23, 2024

Prices in Canada may be higher

\$4.00



The southern Gaza city of Khan Younis on Monday. Palestinians have been confronted by catastrophic scenes after Israel's attacks.

In War's Ruin, A Stark Reality Is Taking Form

This article is by Julian E. Barnes, Adam Goldman, Eric Schmitt and Adam Rasgon.

WASHINGTON - Israel's military operations in Gaza have weakened Hamas. Most Hamas battalions have been degraded and are scattered. Thousands of its members have been killed, and at least one senior military leader has been eliminated

Yet Israel has not achieved its primary goals of the war: freeing hostages and fully destroying Ha-

The war and the tactics of the Israel Defense Forces have come at a great cost. Vast numbers of Palestinian civilians have been killed in the Israeli campaign; hunger is widespread in Gaza; and deaths around relief efforts have generat-

ed condemnation. Six months into the conflict, the question of what Israel has achieved — and when and how the fighting could come to an end — is creating ever more intense global strains around a war that has cost Israel support from even close al-

Israel's own military casualties have begun to climb, with about 260 killed and more than 1,500 injured since its pulverizing ground assault began in the weeks after the Hamas-led terrorist attacks on Oct. 7.

Israeli officials say that about 133 of the hostages taken remain in Gaza. But talks to secure the return of at least some of them in exchange for a halt in the fighting and the release of Palestinian prisoners have hit a snag. Hamas has rebuffed the latest proposal and claims it does not have 40 hostages who meet the terms of the first part of the proposed deal, raising questions about how many are still alive and how many are held by other groups.

The war has settled into a deadly pattern of skirmishes and airstrikes as Israeli forces continue to operate in Gaza, targeting Hamas and Palestinian Islamic Jihad fighters. Last week, with tensions between Israel and Iran increased, the Israeli military said it struck more than 100 targets and killed dozens of fighters in the central part of the enclave, including a Hamas security officer who served in the group's intelligence

Continued on Page A8

Why Israel Decided to Pare Down Attack on Iran

By RONEN BERGMAN and PATRICK KINGSLEY

TEL AVIV - Israel abandoned plans for a much more extensive counterstrike on Iran after concerted diplomatic pressure from the United States and other foreign allies and because the brunt of an Iranian assault on Israel soil had been thwarted, according to three senior Israeli officials.

Israeli leaders originally discussed bombarding several military targets across Iran last week, including near Tehran, the Iranian capital, in retaliation for the Iranian strike on April 13, said the officials, who spoke on the condition of anonymity to describe the senFlaunting Its Arsenal Without Forcing an Escalation

sitive discussions.

Such a broad and damaging attack would have been far harder for Iran to overlook, increasing the chances of a forceful Iranian counterattack that could have brought the Middle East to the

brink of a major regional conflict. In the end — after President Biden, along with the British and German foreign ministers, urged Prime Minister Benjamin Netan-

yahu of Israel to prevent a wider war - Israel opted for a more limited strike on Friday that avoided significant damage, diminishing the likelihood of an escalation, at least for now.

Still, in the view of Israeli officials, the attack showed Iran the breadth and sophistication of Israel's military arsenal.

Instead of sending fighter jets into Iranian airspace, Israel fired a small number of missiles from aircraft positioned several hundred miles west of it on Friday, according to the Israeli officials and senior Western officials briefed on the attack. Israel also sent small attack drones, known

Continued on Page A9

Outlining Trump's Past, Prosecutors Open Trial Beneath a Global Glare

Defense Tells Jury to Use 'Common Sense'

By JONAH E. BROMWICH and BEN PROTESS

Manhattan prosecutors delivered a raw recounting of Donald J. Trump's seamy past on Monday as they debuted their case against him to jurors, the nation and the world, reducing the former president to a co-conspirator in a plot to cover up three sex scandals that threatened his 2016 election win.

Their opening statement was a pivotal moment in the first prosecution of an American president, a sweeping synopsis of the case against Mr. Trump, who watched from the defense table, occasion-ally shaking his head. Moments later, Mr. Trump's lawyer delivered his own opening, beginning with the simple claim that "President Trump is innocent," then noting that he is once again the presumptive Republican nominee and concluding with an exhorta-tion for jurors to "use your common sense.'

The jury of 12 New Yorkers who will weigh Mr. Trump's legal fate before millions of voters decide his political future also heard brief testimony from the prosecution's leadoff witness, David Pecker, a former tabloid publisher who was close with Mr. Trump. Mr. Pecker, who ran The National Enquirer, testified that his supermarket tabloids practiced "checkbook journalism." In this case, prosecutors say, he bought and buried stories that could have imperiled Mr. Trump's 2016 campaign.

The flurry of activity on the landmark trial's first formal day captivated jurors, many of whom jotted notes as they followed

And it sent nervous energy through a Lower Manhattan courthouse as bomb-sniffing dogs, the U.S. Secret Service and the police patrolled the dingy building. The spectacle was a vivid reminder of the proceeding's unprecedented nature: A courthouse accustomed to cycling through trials of murderers, fraudsters and felons of all types

now had its first former president. On Monday, the proceedings ended early and with little fanfare, to accommodate the Passover holiday and a juror's emergency dental appointment.

But it began in striking fashion, with the judge, Juan M. Merchan, determining what prosecutors could ask of Mr. Trump should he take the witness stand in his own defense. In a victory for the prosecution, the judge ruled that they could question him about three civil trials he lost over the last year - including a fraud case in which a different judge found him liable for conspiring to inflate his net worth, and penalized him hundreds of millions of dollars.

Matthew Colangelo, a senior aide to the Manhattan district attorney, Alvin L. Bragg, then seized on what he called a conspiracy in the criminal case. Over the course of a 45-minute opening, as Mr. Bragg watched from the front row, Mr. Colangelo calmly walked the jury through the prosecution's argument that Mr. Trump orches-

Continued on Page A17



Donald J. Trump outside court in Manhattan on Monday.

Teen Girls Spur | Justices Appear Push to Outlaw | **Set to Authorize** Fake A.I. Nudes

By NATASHA SINGER

Caroline Mullet, a ninth grader at Issaquah High School near Seattle, went to her first homecoming dance last fall, a James Bondthemed bash with blackiack tables attended by hundreds of girls dressed up in party frocks.

A few weeks later, she and other female students learned that a male classmate was circulating fake nude images of girls who had attended the dance, sexually explicit pictures that he had fabricated using an artificial intelligence app designed to automatically "strip" clothed photos of real

girls and women. Ms. Mullet, 15, alerted her father, Mark, a Democratic Washington State senator. Although she was not among the girls in the pictures, she asked if something could be done to help her friends, who felt "extremely uncomfortable" that male classmates had seen simulated nude images of them. Soon, Senator Mullet and a colleague in the State House proposed legislation to prohibit the sharing of A.I.-generated sexually explicit depictions of real minors.

"I hate the idea that I should have to worry about this happening again to any of my female friends, my sisters or even myself," Ms. Mullet told state lawmakers during a hearing on the bill in January.

The State Legislature passed Continued on Page A19

Homeless Bans

By ABBIE VANSICKLE

WASHINGTON — A majority of the Supreme Court appeared inclined on Monday to uphold a series of local ordinances that allowed a small Oregon city to ban homeless people from sleeping or

camping in public spaces. The justices seemed split along ideological lines in the case, which has sweeping implications for how the country deals with a growing homelessness crisis.

In a lengthy and, at times, fiery argument that lasted almost two and a half hours, questioning from the justices reflected the complexity of the homelessness debate. They weighed the status of poverty and the civil rights of homeless people against the ability of cities to clear public spaces like parks and sidewalks to address concerns about health and safety. They wrestled with what lines could be drawn to regulate homelessness - and, crucially, who

should make those rules. The conservative majority appeared sympathetic to arguments by the city of Grants Pass, Ore., that homelessness is a complicated issue best handled by local lawmakers and communities, not judges. The liberal

strongly resisted that notion. Chief Justice John G. Roberts Jr. calmly cut to the central point that seemed to resonate with the conservative wing: "Why would

Continued on Page A13



Protesters at Columbia University on Monday. Classes moved online "to de-escalate the rancor."

Universities Try to Quell Pro-Palestinian Protests

By ALAN BLINDER

At New York University, the police swept in to arrest protesting students on Monday night and to end a standoff with the school's administration.

At Yale, the police placed protesters' wrists into zip ties on Monday morning and escorted them onto campus shuttles to receive summonses for trespassing.

Columbia kept its classroom doors closed on Monday, moving Weighing Free Speech and Student Safety

lectures online and urging students to stay home.

Harvard Yard was shut to the public. Nearby, at campuses like Tufts and Emerson, administrators weighed how to handle encampments that looked much like the one that the police dismantled

at Columbia last week - which protesters quickly resurrected. And on the West Coast, a new encampment bubbled at the University of California, Berkeley.

Less than a week after the arrests of more than 100 protesters at Columbia, administrators at some of the country's most influential universities were struggling, and largely failing, to calm campuses torn by the conflict in Gaza and Israel.

Continued on Page A14

BUSINESS B1-7 The Tax Benefits of Embryos

Some people may consider donating leftovers to researchers in light of Alabama's I.V.F. ruling and in advance of other state actions. Would it be considered a charitable gift?

What Lies Beyond Ozempic

Novo Nordisk's factories have been working nonstop to meet the overwhelming demand for its blockbuster weight-loss drugs, but the Danish company has far bigger ambitions. PAGE B1

OPINION A22-23

Mike Pence





Changing His Critics' Minds With the help of an innovative coach,

Rudy Gobert of the Minnesota Timberwolves, a longtime target, aims to convince his legion of skeptics.





NATIONAL A12-19

A Little Dirt Won't Hurt

From mood to microbes, scientists suggest that getting dirty can have a range of health benefits.

New York City Fell Short

A comptroller's office report said poor communication and offline equipment aided a storm's destruction. PAGE A16 **INTERNATIONAL A4-11**

U.K. Passes Deportation Bill

Parliament approved an immigration policy allowing the government to put some asylum seekers on one-way flights to Rwanda. PAGE A11

Fighting Climate Change

Paris is turning to bikes. Across China, people are buying \$5,000 electric cars. A look at emission reductions. PAGE A4

ARTS C1-6

A Director's Met Opera Debut Lileana Blain-Cruz explained why

staging an oratorio like "El Niño" is both challenging and liberating. PAGE C1



Clearer View of Milky Way

A new map, painted in infrared wavelengths, provides new details of a

stretch of our galactic home. PAGE D8 Revising Yellowstone's History

New research questions the long-held

idea that reintroduction of wolves had led to a revival of the park.

PAGE A23