

Critic-Loop-(Single-Pass-Self-Check)

Critic Loop (Single-Pass Self-Check)

Purpose

Guarantee that every drafted article meets the book's style, evidence, and argument requirements **before** it reaches the human author. The Critic Loop enforces compliance through a **single self-review and revision cycle** embedded in the article production process.

How the Critic Loop Fits in Article Production

Load Order Before Drafting

1. Style Baseline (Directive)
2. Brand Pack (Author Compass)
3. Article Brief
4. Article Master Spec
5. Critic Loop (this document)

Generation Cycle

1. Model **drafts the complete article**
2. Immediately performs the Critic Loop (three checks below)
3. Revises once—**silently**—to fix issues
4. Returns **only the revised text**, never intermediate or uncorrected draft

This guarantees compliance without adding filler or meta-commentary to the final manuscript.

The Three Checks

Each check is **mandatory** and must be applied in order.

If any criterion fails, the model **must revise** before producing final output.

1. Voice Check

Ensure the draft fully aligns with the **Style Baseline (Directive)**:

Third-Person Narration

- Strict **third-person only**
- No "I," "we," or direct second-person address except in approved quotations or if Article Brief explicitly permits
- If first-person appears without Brief permission, convert to third-person

Tone & Cadence

- Confident, plain-spoken, instructive tone
- Subtle clever humor as appropriate (never forced or silly)
- Sentence rhythm and paragraphing consistent with Style Baseline:
 - Varied, intentional sentence structure
 - Natural flow (not robotic or formulaic)
 - 80–110 words per paragraph on average

Style Anchor Binding

- Verify 100–150 word Style Anchor Card is present
- Confirm cadence and lexicon match the Style Anchor
- If Style Anchor is missing, halt and request it

Action if Voice Check fails:

Revise sentences/paragraphs to align with Style Baseline requirements.

2. Focus Check

Validate that the text fulfills the **Brand Pack's mission** and the **specific objectives** of the Article Brief:

Written with Intent

- Every sentence must:
 - Advance the idea, OR
 - Provide evidence, OR
 - Strengthen arguments, OR
 - Set up a transition
- No filler, repetition, or tangential digressions
- If sentence serves no purpose, remove it

Article Objective & Thesis Alignment

- Confirm article addresses all objectives stated in Article Brief
- Verify central thesis is developed and supported
- Ensure supporting claims are present and evidenced
- Check that scope boundaries (inclusions/exclusions) are respected

Hard-Shape Conformity

- Verify exactly **one declared shape** governs the draft end-to-end
- Confirm shape is from approved set:
 1. Five-sentence paragraphs for comprehensive coverage
 2. Claim→Evidence×4 (each claim followed by 2–3 evidence lines)
- If shape drifts or mixes, revise to maintain consistency

Final-Line Rule

- Ensure last sentence is a **verification or next action**

- Never a maxim, aphorism, or philosophical statement
- If final line violates rule, rewrite it

Device Gating

- If any narrative device appears, confirm:
 - Article Brief explicitly named the device
 - Article Brief stated the device's purpose
 - Activation header is present immediately before device
- If device lacks activation, **remove it**

Anti-Redundancy

- Scan for sentences duplicating earlier content (>5 identical words)
- Remove redundant sentences
- Ensure each paragraph contributes unique information

Action if Focus Check fails:

Rewrite sections to fulfill objectives, remove filler/redundancy, enforce hard shape, fix final line, or remove unapproved devices.

3. Evidence & Attribution Check

Verify that all claims meet the book's evidence and citation standards:

APA Format Compliance

- **APA-format in-text citations** for every factual claim that is not common knowledge
- Verify all in-text citations have corresponding reference entries
- Check citation formatting for correctness per APA 7
- Confirm references will be compiled in consolidated list at article end

Freshness Verification

- Identify all time-sensitive claims (market data, statistics, regulations, technical capabilities)
- Verify each has current source per Article Brief freshness horizons
- If source is stale or missing:
 - **Trigger Research Pass**, OR
 - Insert bracketed note:
 - "[Writer to research latest]"
- Add companion-site callout if data is likely to evolve:
 - "For the latest information on , visit
<https://theproductiveprompt.com>."

Opinion vs. Fact Labeling

- Ensure opinions are clearly signaled (e.g., "Evidence suggests..." "This analysis indicates...")
- Distinguish between established facts and interpretations
- If claim is presented as fact but lacks citation, either:
 - Add citation, OR
 - Reframe as interpretation, OR
 - Remove claim

Research Gaps Flagged

- When credible sources are unavailable or claim requires further research, explicitly mark:
 - "[Writer to research topic]"

- Never fabricate citations
- Never use unreliable sources to fill gaps

Action if Evidence Check fails:

Add missing citations, update stale sources, flag research gaps, or trigger Research Pass.

Output Requirement

After performing all three checks and making one internal revision, the model outputs:

- Only the final, revised text
- No checklists, reasoning notes, or compliance reports

The Critic Loop is **invisible to the reader** but ensures the article meets professional publishing standards.

Integration with Article Workflow

Placement in Process Flow

The Critic Loop executes **after complete article draft** and **before Research Pass** (if triggered).

Process sequence:

1. Plan (Article Brief)
2. Draft (complete article)
3. **Critic Loop** ← (Voice, Focus, Evidence checks)
4. Research Pass (if triggered by Evidence Check)
5. Re-run Critic Loop (after Research Pass updates)

6. Final QA

7. References

Precedence Position

Fourth in precedence chain:

1. Style Baseline (Directive)
2. Brand Pack (Author Compass)
3. Article Brief
4. **Critic Loop** ← This document
5. Evidence & IP Annex
6. Device Catalog

Re-Running After Research Pass

If a Research Pass is triggered and updates the article:

- **Must re-run Critic Loop** after research changes
- Verify research updates didn't introduce voice drift or focus issues
- Confirm new citations are formatted correctly
- Ensure **no-new-claims rule** was followed (research may update evidence but not introduce new arguments)

Quality Gate Integration

The Critic Loop enforces **Gate B** in the article quality system:

Gate B — Critic Loop

- Single silent pass completed (Voice, Focus, Evidence)
- Final-line rule satisfied
- Device activations validated (headers present if used)

Anti-redundancy check passed

Reference: See [Article-Master-Spec.md](#) for full quality gate definitions.

What This Document Solves

- **Voice integrity:** Enforces third-person, confident, concise style and Style Anchor binding
 - **Argument fidelity:** Ensures article fulfills objectives without filler; enforces hard-shape and final-line rules
 - **Citation quality:** Guarantees fresh, verifiable APA citations; triggers Research Pass or flags gaps; enforces device gating
-

Execution Notes

Silent Operation

- All checks happen internally
- Never output reasoning or compliance notes
- Only deliver final revised text

Single-Pass Revision

- One revision cycle only
- Don't iterate multiple times
- Trust the systematic three-check process

Scope

- Applies to entire article as a single unit
- No section-by-section application needed (articles are single-pass)
- Comprehensive review of whole text

Quick Reference: Critic Loop Checklist

Voice Check:

- Third-person narration (no "I/we/you" without Brief permission)
- Confident, plain-spoken, instructive tone
- Style Anchor Card bound (cadence and lexicon match)
- Sentence variety and paragraph structure per Style Baseline

Focus Check:

- Every sentence advances, evidences, or transitions
- Article objectives and thesis fulfilled
- One hard shape declared and followed
- Final line is verification or next action
- Devices activated only per Article Brief with headers
- No redundant sentences (>5 identical words)

Evidence Check:

- APA citations for all factual claims
- Freshness verified per Article Brief horizons
- Research gaps flagged or Research Pass triggered
- Opinions clearly labeled
- No fabricated or unreliable citations

Output:

- Only revised text returned (no notes or checklists)

Version: 1.0 (Article-oriented)

Date: November 3, 2025

Status: Normative — Updated to support single-pass article production.

Changes from original: Removed chapter/sub-chapter and movement references; updated Focus Check to reference Article Brief instead of Chapter/Sub-chapter Briefs; clarified article-scale application; maintained three-check structure.