

= United States Senate election in New York , 2000 =

The United States Senate election in New York in 2000 was held on November 7 , 2000 . First Lady of the United States Hillary Rodham Clinton , the first First Lady to run for political office , defeated Congressman Rick Lazio . The general election coincided with the presidential election .

The race began in November 1998 when four @-@ term incumbent New York Senator Daniel Patrick Moynihan announced his retirement . Both the Democratic Party and Republican Party sought high @-@ profile candidates to compete for the open seat . By early 1999 Clinton and Mayor of New York City Rudolph Giuliani were the likely respective nominees . Clinton and her husband , President Bill Clinton , purchased a house in Chappaqua , New York , in September 1999 ; she thereby became eligible for the election , although she faced characterizations of carpetbagging since she had never resided in the state before . The lead in statewide polls swung from Clinton to Giuliani and back to Clinton as the campaigns featured both successful strategies and mistakes as well as dealing with current events . In late April and May 2000 , Giuliani 's medical , romantic , marital , and political lives all collided in a tumultuous four @-@ week period , culminating in his withdrawing from the race on May 19 .

The Republicans chose lesser @-@ known Congressman Rick Lazio to replace him . The election included a record \$ 90 million in campaign expenditures between Clinton , Lazio , and Giuliani and national visibility . Clinton showed strength in normally Republican upstate areas and a debate blunder by Lazio solidified Clinton 's previously shaky support among women . Clinton won the election in November 2000 with 55 percent of the vote to Lazio 's 43 percent .

= = An open seat draws high @-@ profile candidates = =

When four @-@ term New York Senator Daniel Patrick Moynihan announced his retirement in November 1998 , his previously safe Senate seat became open in the 2000 U.S. Senate election . Both parties tried to find high @-@ profile candidates to run for it .

New York City Mayor Rudy Giuliani , who was prevented by term limits from running for mayoral reelection in 2001 , immediately indicated interest . Due to his high profile and visibility , Giuliani was supported by the state Republican Party , even though he had irritated many by endorsing incumbent Democratic Governor Mario Cuomo over Republican George Pataki in 1994 . Giuliani became the presumptive Republican nominee , and by April 1999 had formed a formal exploratory committee for a Senate run . There were still possible Republican primary opponents . Rick Lazio , a Congressman representing Suffolk County on Long Island , was raising money and had a candidacy announcement scheduled for August 16 ; he had openly discussed a primary against Giuliani , believing his more conservative record would be appealing to Republican primary voters . In early August , under pressure from state and national Republican figures , Pataki endorsed Giuliani . Pataki prevailed upon Lazio to forgo his candidacy , which Lazio agreed to despite frustration that Giuliani had still not officially announced that he was running ; Lazio said , " If the mayor wants to be a candidate , I think he needs to get into this race . It 's time to put the soap opera aside and step up to the plate . " Nassau County Congressman Pete King also considered running and had raised some funds .

New York Congresswoman Nita Lowey was the candidate first expected to be the Democratic nominee , while other mentioned possible candidates included Secretary of Housing and Urban Development Andrew Cuomo , New York State Comptroller Carl McCall , and New York Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney . State Democratic figures were concerned that neither Lowey nor the others had the star power to rival Giuliani , and that the seat would be lost . Late in 1998 , prominent Democratic politicians and advisors , including New York Representative Charles Rangel , urged First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton to run for the New York Senate seat . An unprecedented action if she did it , Clinton spent considerable time mulling over the idea while Lowey waited in the wings . Her political advisors told her the race would be difficult and some of them told her she would lose . She waited for the impeachment proceedings of Bill Clinton to conclude , which it did with his acquittal on February 12 , 1999 .

= = Clinton 's early campaign = =

On February 16 , 1999 , the First Lady 's office announced that she was considering running for the Senate position . Once it was clear Clinton was going to run , Lowey stepped aside , although she would be disappointed at the lost opportunity . On July 7 , 1999 , Clinton formally announced an exploratory committee for the Senate run ; the setting was Moynihan 's farm in Pindars Corners , in rural Delaware County . Bill Clinton was less than enthusiastic about her candidacy . The staging of the event was brokered by the Clintons ' political consultant Mandy Grunwald . Hillary Clinton embarked upon a " listening tour " of all parts of New York after her entrance into the race . She planned to visit all 62 counties in New York , talking to New Yorkers in small @-@ group settings according to the principles of retail politics . During the race , she spent considerable time campaigning in traditionally Republican upstate regions . Clinton faced charges of carpetbagging , since she had never resided in the State of New York nor directly participated in state politics prior to her Senate race .

Meanwhile , in September 1999 , the Clintons purchased a \$ 1 @. @ 7 million , 11 @-@ room , Dutch Colonial style home in Chappaqua , New York , north of New York City . Even the commonplace activity of house hunting leading up to this was the subject of considerable media attention ; coverage of personal lives would be the norm in this contest of two " electrifying and polarizing figures " (as one reporter put it) . In November 1999 , Hillary Clinton announced that she would set aside most of her official duties as First Lady in order to take up residency in New York and pursue her campaign . Her move @-@ in took place in January 2000 , with the house furnished with many of the couple 's possessions from their Arkansas days . It became the first time since Woodrow Wilson 's first wife died in 1914 that a president lived in the White House without a spouse .

The early stages of her campaign were not without mistakes , and as she later wrote , " Mistakes in New York politics aren 't easily brushed aside . " In a much @-@ publicized move , Clinton donned a New York Yankees baseball cap at a June 1999 event when she had been a lifelong fan of the Chicago Cubs . This brought her much criticism , and Thomas Kuiper would later write an anti @-@ Clinton book titled : I 've Always Been a Yankees Fan : Hillary Clinton in Her Own Words . Clinton said she had to develop an American League rooting interest , since fans of the Cubs were not expected to root for the American League Chicago White Sox . In her 2003 autobiography , she said that putting on the hat had been a " bad move " , but reiterated what had been reported in the press prior to the incident , that she had been " a die @-@ hard Mickey Mantle fan ; " the book included a photograph of her with a Yankees cap on from 1992 .

More seriously , on November 11 , 1999 , at the dedication of a U.S.-funded health program in the West Bank , she exchanged kisses with Suha Arafat , wife of Palestinian President Yasser Arafat , after Suha Arafat had delivered a speech claiming that Israel had deliberately poisoned Palestinians through environmental degradation and the use of " poisonous gas " . Some Israeli supporters said that Clinton never should have kissed the wife of the Palestinian leader , especially after such inflammatory remarks . The following day , Clinton denounced Suha Arafat 's allegations , and said that Palestinian negotiator Saeb Erekat had told her Suha Arafat had been referring to ' tear gas ' and not ' poison gas ' . The kiss became a campaign issue , especially with Jewish voters . Clinton said it as a formality akin to a handshake , saying that to not have done so would have caused a diplomatic incident . Clinton later wrote that the live Arabic @-@ to @-@ English translation had failed to convey the accurate nature of her remarks : " Had I been aware of her hateful words , I would have denounced them on the spot . "

Somewhat surprisingly , Clinton faced an erosion of support from women voters during her campaign , with her numbers declining throughout 1999 . This was partly a typical pattern seen with women candidates where they have an early surge of female support , which then wears off , and it was partly due to her early campaign stumbles . But it also reflected the particular set of mixed feelings that women had towards Clinton 's marriage and the ambition and the power she derived from it . The problem was especially acute among some female demographics ; one of her longtime

advisers later said , " Women in the educated professional class ? They fucking couldn 't stand her . We could never figure out why . We had psychologists come in . "

Clinton 's campaign to all counties , carried by a Ford conversion van , helped to defuse the carpetbagger issue , with many New York residents saying that Clinton " seems like one of us . " She discussed local issues such as price supports for the dairy industry , fares for air travel , college tuition levels , and the brain drain in parts of the state . Her political positions were well matched to the different constituencies in the state that she targeted . In a January 2000 appearance on the Late Show with David Letterman , she established a rapport with the host that would continue throughout her Senate years and into her 2008 presidential campaign . Clinton formally announced her official candidacy in Purchase , New York in February 2000 , adopting the simple name " Hillary " for her campaign literature .

Distrustful of the press since her husband 's 1992 presidential campaign and her early days as First Lady , she imposed limits on her availability to the press van following her . Associated Press reporter Beth Harpaz later recounted a typical day from this time : " But we 'd been told there 'd be no ' avail ' today , and we 'd accepted it . That didn 't prevent me from feeling slightly humiliated . I was so worn down and so exasperated by the lack of access and the lack of news in this campaign that I 'd given up fighting . "

= = Early campaign of Giuliani = =

An early January 1999 Marist Institute of Public Opinion poll showed Giuliani trailing Clinton by 10 points . By January 2000 , the Marist poll showed Giuliani up by 9 points . Giuliani 's tactics involved intentionally baiting the Clinton campaign with deliberate overstatements , keeping them off balance and behind in the response cycle . Giuliani emphasized his depiction of Clinton as a carpetbagger . He made a one @-@ day visit to Little Rock , Arkansas , where he announced he would fly the Arkansas state flag over New York 's City Hall . When Hillary Clinton visited New York from Washington , he said , ? I hope she knows the way . I hope she doesn 't get lost on one of the side streets . ? Giuliani 's campaign prepared a 315 @-@ page opposition research dossier that went back to her time at Wellesley College ; it included eleven pages of what they termed " Stupid Actions and Remarks " . The Giuliani campaign had no problems raising money , getting over 40 percent of its funds from out @-@ of @-@ state and out-raising Clinton overall two @-@ to @-@ one .

The Giuliani campaign showed some structural weaknesses . So closely identified with New York City , he had somewhat limited appeal to naturally Republican voters in Upstate New York . The Farmersville Garbage Scandal was indicative of his lower levels of support upstate . By late December 1999 , Clinton adapted to Giuliani 's psychological warfare , saying in response to one such gambit , " I can ? t be responding every time the mayor gets angry . Because that ? s all I would do . " A February 2000 attempt by Giuliani to capitalize on a Clinton campaign event 's accidental playing of Billy Joel 's suburban drug tale " Captain Jack " led to more ridicule for him than for her .

On March 11 , 2000 , Giuliani and Clinton met face @-@ to @-@ face for the first time since the campaigning began , at the New York Inner Circle press dinner , an annual event in which New York politicians and the press corps stage skits , roast each other and make fun of themselves , with proceeds going to charity . Giuliani was on stage in male disco garb spoofing John Travolta in Saturday Night Fever , but also appeared in drag in taped video clips that reworked the " Rudy / Rudia " theme of a past Inner Circle dinner , as well as in an exchange with Joan Rivers that sought to make fun of Clinton . Other performers ' skits made fun of Clinton 's Yankees claim and the infidelity of her husband .

The New York Police Department 's fatal shooting of Patrick Dorismond on March 15 , 2000 inflamed Giuliani 's already strained relations with the city 's minority communities , and Clinton seized on it as a major campaign issue . By April , reports showed Clinton gaining upstate and generally outworking Giuliani , who stated that his duties as mayor prevented him from campaigning more . He gave priority to city duties over campaign activities . Some Giuliani aides and national Republican figures concluded that his interest in the campaign was flagging , as although he was

desirous of winning in political combat against a Clinton , he was by nature an executive personality and the prospect of serving as one of a hundred legislators was unappealing to him .

By this time , Clinton was 8 to 10 points ahead of Giuliani in the polls . In retrospect , The New York Times would write that the battle so far between the two had comprised " a blistering year of mental gamesmanship , piercing attacks , contrasts in personalities and positions , and blunders , played out by two outsize political figures in a super @-@ heated atmosphere . "

= = A tumultuous four weeks = =

Giuliani 's marriage to his wife , broadcast journalist and actress Donna Hanover , had been distant since 1996 , and the two were rarely seen in public together . There had been no formal announcement of any change in their relationship , although Hanover had indicated that she and their children would not move to Washington if Giuliani won the race . Beginning in October 1999 , a new woman was being spotted at mayoral functions . By March 2000 , Giuliani had stopped wearing his wedding ring and was being seen more in the company of this other woman , including at the Inner Circle press dinner , the St. Patrick 's Day parade , and town hall meetings , but it was not yet fully clear whether the relationship was personal or professional . While this woman had become a frequent subject of insider talk among the New York political circle , she had not been mentioned in the press .

On April 20 Hanover announced that she would soon be taking over the lead role in Eve Ensler 's controversial play The Vagina Monologues . Political observers speculated that Hanover was partly engaging in a political act against her husband , as Ensler was a friend and supporter of Hillary Clinton and the role would not go over well with social conservatives within the Republican Party . Giuliani declined to say whether he would attend one of her performances . On April 22 , the New York Post obtained photographs of Giuliani openly strolling on a Manhattan street with the other woman after they left a restaurant , but did not have more than a first name for her ; the Post sat on the story , but it was clear the relationship was a personal one .

On April 26 , television channel NY1 reported that Giuliani had undergone a second round of tests for prostate cancer at Mount Sinai Medical Center ; the same disease had led to the death of his father . On April 28 , Giuliani held a news conference to announce that he did in fact have prostate cancer , but it was in an early stage . He was unsure of which of several types of treatment he might undergo , and that decision would impact whether he could stay in the senate race or not . Hanover was not present at the conference , but issued a note saying she would support him in his decision process .

As Giuliani mulled over his medical options , on May 1 Hanover announced that she was postponing her appearance in The Vagina Monologues due to " personal family circumstances . " On May 2 the New York Daily News published a brief item about Giuliani 's other woman , without name or description . On May 3 the New York Post finally published its photographs of Giuliani and the woman , now identified as Judith Nathan , leaving a restaurant together , under the front page headline " Rudy 's Mystery Brunch Pal is Upper East Side Divorcée " . (Some observers felt that Giuliani , known for his ability to manipulate the New York media , had been eager for news of the relationship to come out .) Later that day , Giuliani responded to a barrage of questions on the subject at a news conference by acknowledging Judith Nathan publicly for the first time , calling her " a very good friend " and expressing his annoyance that her privacy was being invaded . The next days were filled with New York media coverage on Nathan 's background and on the relationship . On May 6 Hanover held an unusually @-@ located news conference at the back of St. Patrick 's Cathedral before the funeral of Cardinal John O 'Connor ; visibly trembling , she said , " I will be supportive of Rudy in his fight against his illness , as this marriage and this man have been very precious to me . " The following day half the press tried to stake out Nathan 's known locations while the rest pestered Nathan 's hometown relatives in Hazleton , Pennsylvania ; Giuliani looked weak in a public appearance .

On May 10 , Giuliani held what The New York Times described as an " extraordinary , emotional news conference " in Bryant Park to announce that he was seeking a separation from Hanover ,

saying , " This is very , very painful . For quite some time it 's probably been apparent that Donna and I lead in many ways independent and separate lives . " Regarding Nathan , Giuliani said " I 'm going to need her now more than maybe I did before , " making reference to his battle with cancer and her background in nursing . Regarding the senate race , he again did not commit to a decision , saying , " I don 't really care about politics right now . I 'm thinking about my family , the people that I love and what can be done that 's honest and truthful and that protects them the best . I 'm not thinking about politics . Politics comes at least second , maybe third , maybe fourth , somewhere else . It 'll all work itself out some way politically . " Giuliani had , however , neglected to inform Hanover in advance of his announcement ; her reaction was described as distraught . Three hours later , she held her own news conference at Gracie Mansion , where she said , " Today 's turn of events brings me great sadness . I had hoped to keep this marriage together . For several years , it was difficult to participate in Rudy 's public life because of his relationship with one staff member . " In this , she was making reference to Cristyne Lategano , the former communications director for Giuliani ; Vanity Fair had reported in 1997 that Lategano and Giuliani were having an affair , which both of them had denied . Hanover continued , " Beginning last May , I made a major effort to bring us back together . Rudy and I re @-@ established some of our personal intimacy through the fall . At that point , he chose another path . "

State Republican leaders , who until now had avoided talk of replacements for Giuliani should he not run , now gave more attention to the matter , with the state party convention coming up on May 30 . Former possible contenders Rick Lazio and Pete King immediately indicated they were available ; other names mentioned included Wall Street financier Theodore J. Forstmann and Governor Pataki , although the latter indicated no interest . Giuliani continued to ponder his senate race decision ; when he had dinner with Nathan on May 12 , they were trailed by a flock of photographers . Giuliani canceled campaigning and fundraising trips to upstate New York and California on May 13 , suggesting he would not run , but then resumed fundraising and suggested he was inclined towards running on May 15 . Two Republican county chairmen became upset at the indecision , saying , " Like Waiting for Godot , we have Waiting for Rudy , " and , " We need a decision . Like tomorrow would be nice . Because this is getting ridiculous . " A top state Republican said , " He seem [s] to like the attention . He seems to be going through some sort of catharsis in public . And we 're like psychiatrists watching it . I can 't quite figure it out . I don 't think anybody can . " Clinton , meanwhile , said as little as possible about the situation , preferring to let Giuliani 's drama play out on its own ; on May 17 , as he huddled with his doctors over whether to choose surgery or radiation as his treatment while facing conflicting political advice from his aides , she won the unanimous approval of delegates to the Democratic Party state convention at the Pepsi Arena in Albany , New York , giving a constrained acceptance speech because she did not know her general election opponent .

Finally , on May 19 , Giuliani held what The New York Times again described as " an emotional , riveting news conference " that " reached a new level of introspection " to announce that he was dropping out of the senate race : " This is not the right time for me to run for office . If it were six months ago or it were a year from now or the timing were a little different , maybe it would be different . But it isn 't different and that 's the way life is . " He added that , " I used to think the core of me was in politics , probably . It isn 't . When you feel your mortality and your humanity you realize that , that the core of you is first of all being able to take care of your health . " He said that he would instead devote the remainder of his mayoralty trying to overcome the hostile relations he had with many of the city 's minority groups .

= = A change of Republicans : Lazio = =

While previous Republican nominee candidates and fellow Long Island Congressmen Rick Lazio and Pete King had both indicated an interest in replacing Giuliani , upon Giuliani 's withdrawal the state party quickly rallied around Lazio , who had more campaign funds and who was viewed as a potentially strong candidate . In particular , Governor Pataki ? who never cared much for Giuliani to begin with ? was strongly in favor of Lazio , and praised him as " fresh , unencumbered challenger "

to Clinton . This also caused a shuffle in New York 's unique third @-@ party ballot @-@ line alignments : the Liberal Party of New York , which was previously set to run Giuliani (whom they had supported in all three of his mayoral races) , now switched to Clinton , while the Conservative Party of New York , which had previously been loath to endorse the socially liberal Giuliani (and was set to nominate former Westchester Congressman Joe DioGuardi) lined up behind Lazio . Lazio accepted the unanimous approval of delegates to the Republican Party state convention at a hotel ballroom in Buffalo on May 30 .

Clinton now faced a lesser @-@ known candidate in Lazio . While a relative moderate among House Republicans , Lazio had frequently supported former House Speaker Newt Gingrich , a largely despised figure among many New Yorkers . Lazio did bring to the table an ethnic suburban background familiar to many New Yorkers , and had a reputation as an energetic campaigner .

One formality left were New York 's late @-@ in @-@ the @-@ season primary elections on September 12 , which in this case merely served to ratify the state party conventions ' choices . Lazio won unopposed , while Clinton won 82 percent of the vote in easily defeating unknown Manhattan doctor Mark McMahon , who ran on the grounds that " the Clintons have tried to hijack the Democratic Party . " For her part , Clinton said that she was " surprised , in a way [to see her name in the voting booth] . I stood there for a minute , staring at my name . " In any case , the general election was already well underway .

= = Democratic primary results = =

= = Republican primary = =

= = = Polling = = =

= = General election = =

= = = Polling = = =

= = General election campaign = =

The contest drew considerable national attention and both candidates were well @-@ funded . By the end of the race , Democrat Clinton and Republicans Lazio and Giuliani had spent a combined \$ 90 million , the most of any U.S. Senate race in history . Lazio outspent Clinton \$ 40 million to \$ 29 million , with Clinton also getting several million dollars in soft money from Democratic organizations . Among Clinton antagonists circles , direct mail @-@ based fundraising groups such as the Emergency Committee to Stop Hillary Rodham Clinton sprung up , sending out solicitations regarding the " carpetbagging " issue : just as one Clinton leaves office , another one runs .

Clinton secured a broad base of support , including endorsements from conservation groups and organized labor , but notably not the New York City police union which endorsed Lazio while firefighters supported Hillary . While Clinton had a solid base of support in New York City , candidates and observers expected the race to be decided in upstate New York where 45 percent of the state 's voters live . During the campaign , Clinton vowed to improve the economic picture in upstate New York , promising that her plan would deliver 200 @,@ 000 New York jobs over six years . Her plan included specific tax credits with the purpose of rewarding job creation and encouraging business investment , especially in the high @-@ tech sector . She called for targeted personal tax cuts for college tuition and long @-@ term care . Lazio faced a unique tactical problem campaigning upstate . The major issue there was the persistently weak local economy , which Lazio

hoped to link to his opponent 's husband 's tenure in office . Attacks on the state of the upstate economy were frequently interpreted as criticism of incumbent Republican governor George Pataki , however , limiting the effect of this line of attack .

Opponents continued to make the carpetbagging issue a focal point throughout the race and during debates . Talk radio hammered on this , with New York @-@ based Sean Hannity issuing a daily mantra , " Name me three things Hillary Clinton has ever done for the people of New York ! " Clinton 's supporters pointed out that the state was receptive to national leaders , such as Robert F. Kennedy who was elected to the Senate in 1964 despite similar accusations . In the end , according to exit polls conducted in the race , a majority of the voters dismissed the carpetbagging issue as unimportant .

During the campaign , Independent Counsel Robert Ray filed his final reports regarding the long @-@ running Whitewater , " Travelgate " , and " Filegate " investigations of the White House , each of which included specific investigations of Hillary Clinton actions . The reports exonerated her on the files matter , said there was insufficient evidence regarding her role in Whitewater , and said that she had made factually false statements regarding the Travel Office firings but there was insufficient evidence to prosecute her . Although The New York Times editorialized that the release of the reports seemed possibly timed to coincide with the Senate election , in practice the findings were not seen as likely to sway many voters ' opinions .

A September 13 , 2000 debate between Lazio and Clinton proved important . Lazio was on the warpath against soft money and the amounts of it coming from the Democratic National Committee into Clinton 's campaign , and challenged Clinton to agree to ban soft money from both campaigns . He left his podium and waved his proposed paper agreement in Clinton 's face ; many debate viewers thought he had invaded her personal space and as a result Clinton 's support among women voters solidified .

Late in the campaign Lazio criticised Clinton for accepting campaign donations from various Arab groups in the wake of the USS Cole attack . This issue caused former New York Mayor Ed Koch to take out ads telling Lazio to " stop with the sleaze already , " and did not change the dynamic of the race .

= = Results = =

Per New York State law , Clinton and Lazio totals include their minor party line votes : Liberal Party of New York and Working Families Party for Clinton , Conservative Party for Lazio .

= = = Analysis = = =

Clinton won the election on November 7 with 55 % of the vote to Lazio 's 43 % , a difference larger than most observers had expected . Clinton won the traditionally Democratic base of New York City by large margins , and carried suburban Westchester County , but lost heavily populated Long Island , part of which Lazio represented in Congress . She won surprising victories in Upstate counties , such as Cayuga , Rensselaer , and Niagara , to which her win has been attributed .

In comparison with other results , this 12 % margin was smaller than Gore 's 25 % margin over Bush in the state Presidential contest , was slightly larger than the 10 % margin by which fellow New York senator Charles Schumer defeated incumbent Republican Al D 'Amato in the hotly contested 1998 race , but was considerably smaller than the 47 % margin by which Senator Schumer won reelection in 2004 against little @-@ known Republican challenger Howard Mills . The victory of a Democrat in the Senate election was not assured , because in recent decades the Republicans had won about half the elections for governor and senator .

Lazio 's bid was handicapped by the weak performance of George W. Bush in New York in the 2000 election , but it is also clear Hillary Clinton had made substantial inroads in upstate New York prior to Lazio 's entry into the race . Exit polls also showed a large gender gap with Clinton running stronger than expected among moderate women and unaffiliated women .

= = Post @-@ election charges = =

= = = Hasidic pardons = = =

In January 2001 , two months after Hillary Clinton 's election to the Senate , President Clinton pardoned four residents of the New Square Hasidic enclave in Rockland County , New York , who had been convicted of defrauding the federal government of \$ 30 million by establishing a fictitious religious school . New Square had voted almost unanimously for Hillary Clinton in the New York Senate race . A lawyer following the matter stated that even if Hillary Clinton had promised to lobby her husband for clemency in exchange for the town 's votes ? a claim for which there was no proof ? it would be difficult to establish a crime had taken place : " Politicians make promises all the time . That 's nothing new ? or illegal . " Hillary Clinton acknowledged sitting in on a post @-@ election meeting discussing possible clemency for the four , but said she had played no part in her husband 's decision .

A federal investigation launched to investigate various Clinton pardons , closed its investigation of the New Square matter in June 2002 by taking no action against Bill Clinton , Hillary Clinton , or any residents of New Square .

= = = Hollywood fundraiser = = =

Hillary Clinton 's former finance director , David Rosen , was indicted on January 7 , 2005 on campaign finance charges related to a fund @-@ raising event produced by Peter F. Paul . Paul , a convicted drug dealer who would soon after be convicted on stock fraud charges after being extradited from Brazil , stated that he spent \$ 1 @.@ 2 million to produce the August 12 , 2000 Hollywood Gala Salute to President William Jefferson Clinton event , which was both a tribute to honor President Clinton and a fundraiser for the First Lady 's 2000 Senate campaign . The Justice Department indictment charged Rosen with filing false reports with the Federal Election Commission by reporting only \$ 400 @,@ 000 in contributions . On May 27 , 2005 , the jury acquitted Rosen on all counts . On January 5 , 2006 it was reported that Clinton 's campaign group agreed to pay a \$ 35 @,@ 000 fine related to the underreporting of the fundraiser 's expenses .

Peter Paul has also filed a civil suit in this matter , Paul v. Clinton . On April 10 , 2006 , the judge in charge of the case removed Hillary Clinton as a defendant , citing a lack of evidence . However , she may still be called to testify as a witness in the case . The removal was upheld by the California Second District Court of Appeal on October 16 , 2007 .

Meanwhile , by the time of Hillary Clinton 's 2008 presidential campaign , a 13 @-@ minute video produced by Paul and describing his various allegations against Hillary Clinton had become quite popular on the Internet , gaining 1 @.@ 4 million hits on Google Video and about 350 @,@ 000 on YouTube in a single week in October 2007 .

= = Legacy = =

Clinton 's victory would establish her as an effective campaigner and an electoral force on her own , able to capture Republican and independent votes and overcome her polarizing image . She would easily win re @-@ election in 2006 , and in 2007 began her presidential campaign for 2008 .

Lazio gave up his House seat to run for Senate . Following his defeat , which set a record for the most money spent in a losing Senate effort , he took positions in the corporate world and avoided electoral politics until becoming a candidate in New York 's 2010 gubernatorial election . However , he was defeated by a wide margin in the Republican primary .

Giuliani would undergo treatment for his cancer and eventually recover ; he would also divorce Donna Hanover and eventually marry Judith Nathan . After his campaign withdrawal , his political future looked uncertain at best . But less than a year after the senate general election , the September 11 , 2001 terrorist attacks took place , with Giuliani still mayor . Giuliani 's performance in

the aftermath of September 11 earned him many accolades and resurrected his political prospects . After a successful stint in the private sector , in 2007 he also began his presidential campaign for 2008 .

Throughout much of 2007 , Clinton and Giuliani led in national polls for their parties ' respective nominations , and media reports often looked back to the 2000 " race that wasn 't " as a preview of what might lie in wait for the entire nation in 2008 . Such extrapolating ended with the Giuliani campaign 's precipitous decline and January 2008 withdrawal . Clinton as well failed to gain the 2008 nomination and , in June 2008 , she finished in a close second place to Illinois Senator Barack Obama .

In December 2008 , Lowey would have another chance at the Senate seat , when Clinton was nominated for U.S. Secretary of State by President @-@ elect Obama and Lowey was considered a front @-@ runner to be named as her appointed replacement . But Lowey withdrew from consideration , as in the intervening years she had gained enough seniority to become one of the powerful " cardinals " on the House Appropriations Committee and did not want to relinquish that position . When Caroline Kennedy announced her interest in the vacancy , comparisons were drawn to Clinton in 2000 , with both being famous people seeking to hold elective office for the first time . Others pointed out that Clinton had won election to the office while Kennedy would first be appointed . In any case , Kennedy 's effort soon faltered , in part due to not having the same desire or willingness to work for the seat as Clinton had had , and she soon withdrew as abruptly as she had entered .

Kirsten Gillibrand received the appointment , and attention then turned to who would run against her in the 2010 Senate special election . By November 2009 , Giuliani was seriously considering a run for his old would @-@ have @-@ been Senate seat , but the following month he announced he was not running for it or anything else in 2010 , possibly signalling an end to his political career .