

Special cases and equivalent form of Katznelson's problem on recurrence

John Griesmer

Colorado School of Mines

jtgriesmer@gmail.com

Crossroads: ergodic theory, harmonic analysis, and
combinatorics

2022 Spring Eastern AMS Sectional Meeting

Sunday, March 20, 2022

Slides:

<https://github.com/jtgriesmer/slides/blob/main/Crossroads.pdf>

Let G be a countable abelian group.

A **probability measure preserving G -system** (or MPS) is a triple (X, μ, T) where (X, μ) is a probability measure space and T is an action of G on X by transformations T_g preserving μ :

$$\mu(T_g A) = \mu(A) \quad \text{for all measurable } A \subset X$$

A **topological G -system** (X, T) is a compact metric space X together with an action of G on X by invertible homeomorphisms T_g .

We say (X, T) is **minimal** if the only nonempty closed T -invariant subset of X is X .

Group rotations

A **group rotation** (K, R_α) is a topological G -system where K is a compact abelian group, $\rho : G \rightarrow K$ is a homomorphism, and $R_g x := x + \rho(g)$.

Writing m for Haar probability measure on K , we get a MPS (K, m, R) .

Ex: $G = \mathbb{Z}$. $K = \mathbb{T} := \mathbb{R}/\mathbb{Z}$. Fix $\alpha \in \mathbb{T}$, and let $R_n(x) = x + n\alpha$. Then (K, R_α) is a group rotation.

Definition

Let $S \subset G$. We say that S is a set of

- 1 measurable recurrence if $\forall (X, \mu, T), A \subset X$ with $\mu(A) > 0$, there exists $g \in S$ such that $\mu(A \cap T_g A) > 0$.
- 2 **topological recurrence** if \forall minimal (X, T) , nonempty open $U \subset X$ there exists $g \in S$ such that $U \cap T_g U \neq \emptyset$.
- 3 **Bohr recurrence** if for \forall minimal group rotations (K, R) , non- \emptyset open $U \subset K$, $\exists g \in S$ such that $U \cap R_g U \neq \emptyset$.

The definitions easily yield:

$$\begin{aligned} S \text{ is a set of measurable rec.} &\implies S \text{ is a set of topological rec.} \\ &\implies S \text{ is a set of Bohr rec.} \end{aligned}$$

Kriz [Kri87]: S is a set of topological rec. $\not\Rightarrow$ S is a set of measurable rec. (in \mathbb{Z})

Actually: if $E \subset \mathbb{Z}$ is infinite, then there is a set $S \subset E - E$ which is a set of topological rec. but not measurable rec. [Gri21a]

Katznelson's and Veech's problem

Conjecture 1 (Katznelson [Kat01], Veech [Vee68])

Let G be a countable abelian group. Every subset of G which is a set of Bohr recurrence is also set of topological recurrence.

This is never stated as a **conjecture**; we do so for convenience. See [GKR21] for exposition.

Katznelson asked this question for \mathbb{Z} , but the answer is not known in any countable abelian group.

The natural intuition is **no**: topological systems can be much more complicated than group rotations.

Lemma ([GK03], Lemma 3.3, cf [Giv03])

$S := \{7^{n+2d} + 7^{n+d} - 2 \cdot 7^n : n, d \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is a set of Bohr recurrence.

Is S a set of topological recurrence?

Is S a set of measurable recurrence?

For $x \in \mathbb{T} := \mathbb{R}/\mathbb{Z}$, let $\tilde{x} \in [0, 1)$ represent x .

$$\|x\| := \min_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} |\tilde{x} - n|.$$

For $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \dots, x_d) \in \mathbb{T}^d$, $\|\mathbf{x}\| := \max_{j \leq d} \|x_j\|$.

Given a homomorphism $\psi : G \rightarrow \mathbb{T}^d$ and $\varepsilon > 0$, the **basic Bohr neighborhood of 0 in G** determined by ψ and ε is

$$\text{Bohr}(\psi, \varepsilon) := \{g \in G : \|\psi(g)\| < \varepsilon\}.$$

Ex: $G = \mathbb{Z}$, $\psi(n) := n(1/2) \bmod 1$, $\varepsilon = 1/4$. $\text{Bohr}(\psi, \varepsilon) = 2\mathbb{Z}$.

Lemma (Equivalent definitions of Bohr recurrence)

Let $S \subset G$. The following are equivalent.

- 1** \forall minimal group rotations (K, R) , non- \emptyset open $U \subset K$,
 $\exists g \in S$ such that $U \cap R_g U \neq \emptyset$.
- 2** For all $d \in \mathbb{N}$, every homomorphism $\psi : G \rightarrow \mathbb{T}^d$, and all $\varepsilon > 0$, there is a $g \in S$ such that $\|\psi(g)\| < \varepsilon$.
- 3** For every Bohr neighborhood U of 0, $S \cap U \neq \emptyset$.

In \mathbb{Z} : S is a set of Bohr recurrence iff for all $d \in \mathbb{N}$, $\alpha \in \mathbb{T}^d$, and all $\varepsilon > 0$, $\exists m \in S$ such that $\|m\alpha\| < \varepsilon$.

Lemma ([GK03], Lemma 3.3, cf [Giv03])

$S := \{7^{n+2d} + 7^{n+d} - 2 \cdot 7^n : n, d \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is a set of Bohr recurrence.

Proof.

Fix $d \in \mathbb{N}$ and $\alpha \in \mathbb{T}^d$. We must find $m \in S$ such that $\|m\alpha\| < \varepsilon$. Cover \mathbb{T}^d with sets U_1, \dots, U_k of diameter $< \varepsilon/2$. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, let

$$f(n) := \min\{j : 7^n \alpha \in U_j\}$$

This is a finite coloring of \mathbb{N} . By van der Waerden's theorem on arithmetic progressions, there are $n, d \in \mathbb{N}$, $j \leq k$ so that $7^n \alpha, 7^{n+d} \alpha, 7^{n+2d} \alpha$ all lie in U_j . Thus

$$\|7^{n+d} \alpha - 7^n \alpha\| < \varepsilon/2 \quad \text{and} \quad \|7^{n+2d} \alpha - 7^n \alpha\| < \varepsilon/2,$$

so $\|(7^{n+2d} + 7^{n+d} - 2 \cdot 7^n) \alpha\| < \varepsilon$ (triangle inequality). □

A special case of Katznelson's problem in \mathbb{Z}

Proposition ([Gri21b], Proposition 2.2)

If $S \subset \{2^n - 2^m : n, m \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is a set of Bohr recurrence, then S is a set of topological recurrence.

This is not vacuous: the ambient set $\{2^n - 2^m\}$ has the form $E - E$, where E is infinite. So $E - E$ is a set of measurable recurrence (and therefore a set of topological recurrence and a set of Bohr recurrence), by the Poincaré recurrence theorem.

It is not trivial: $\exists S \subset E - E$ which is a set of topological recurrence and not a set of Bohr recurrence (Kriz).

It might be useless.

An equivalent form of Katznelson's problem

\mathbb{Z}^ω := the countable direct sum of countably many copies of \mathbb{Z} .

Write $\mathbf{n} \in \mathbb{Z}^\omega$ as (n_1, n_2, \dots) , only finitely many n_i nonzero.

$\mathbf{e}_1 = (1, 0, 0, \dots)$, $\mathbf{e}_2 = (0, 1, 0, 0, \dots)$, \dots

$\mathcal{E}_1 := \{\mathbf{e}_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

$\mathcal{E}_4 := \{(\mathbf{e}_i - \mathbf{e}_j) - (\mathbf{e}_k - \mathbf{e}_l) : i, j, k, l \text{ mutually distinct}\}$

$(0, -1, 1, 0, 0, -1, 1, 0, \dots) \in \mathcal{E}_4$.

Conjecture 2

Every subset of \mathcal{E}_4 which is a set of Bohr recurrence is also a set of topological recurrence.

Conjecture 1 (Katznelson's problem)

Let G be a countable abelian group. If $S \subset G$ is a set of Bohr recurrence, then S is a set of topological recurrence.

Conjecture 2

Every subset of \mathcal{E}_4 which is a set of Bohr recurrence is also a set of topological recurrence.

Conjecture 1 (Katznelson's problem)

Let G be a countable abelian group. If $S \subset G$ is a set of Bohr recurrence, then S is a set of topological recurrence.

Proposition 3.3 of [Gri21b] says Conjecture 2 implies Conjecture 1.

Lemma 1

Let $\rho : \mathbb{Z}^\omega \rightarrow G$ be a homomorphism such that $\rho(\mathcal{E}_1) = G$. If $S \subset G \setminus \{0\}$ is a set of Bohr recurrence in G , then $\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4$ is a set of Bohr recurrence in \mathbb{Z}^ω .

Lemma 2

Let $\rho : H \rightarrow G$ be a homomorphism. If $S \subset H$ is a set of topological rec., then $\rho(S)$ is a set of topological rec. in G .

Lemma 1

*Let $\rho : \mathbb{Z}^\omega \rightarrow G$ be a homomorphism such that $\rho(\mathcal{E}_1) = G$.
If $S \subset G$ is a set of Bohr recurrence in G , then $\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4$ is a set of Bohr recurrence in \mathbb{Z}^ω .*

We need:

Theorem (Bogoliouboff, [Bog39])

Let G be a countable abelian group. If $k \in \mathbb{N}$ and $G = A_1 \cup A_2 \cup \cdots \cup A_k$, then for some i , the iterated difference set

$$\{(a - b) - (c - d) : a, b, c, d \in A_i \text{ mut. distinct}\} \cup \{0\}$$

contains a basic Bohr neighborhood of 0.

Proof of Lemma 1.

Let $\rho : \mathbb{Z}^\omega \rightarrow G$, $\rho(\mathcal{E}_1) = G$. Let $S \subset G \setminus \{0\}$ be Bohr rec. To prove $\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4$ is Bohr rec. in \mathbb{Z}^ω , we prove: If $\psi : \mathbb{Z}^\omega \rightarrow \mathbb{T}^d$ is a hom. and $\varepsilon > 0$, then \exists mut. dist. $\mathbf{e}_p, \mathbf{e}_q, \mathbf{e}_r, \mathbf{e}_t$ such that

- (1) $\|\psi((\mathbf{e}_p - \mathbf{e}_q) - (\mathbf{e}_r - \mathbf{e}_t))\| < \varepsilon$ and
- (2) $\rho((\mathbf{e}_p - \mathbf{e}_q) - (\mathbf{e}_r - \mathbf{e}_t)) \in S$.

Cover \mathbb{T}^d by $U_i, i \leq k$, $\text{diam} < \frac{\varepsilon}{2}$. $B_i := \mathcal{E}_1 \cap \psi^{-1}(U_i)$ covers \mathcal{E}_1 . Let $A_i = \rho(B_i)$. These cover G , since $\rho(\mathcal{E}_1) = G$. Bogoliouboff:

$$V := \{(\mathbf{a}_p - \mathbf{a}_q) - (\mathbf{a}_r - \mathbf{a}_t) : \mathbf{a}_p, \mathbf{a}_q, \mathbf{a}_r, \mathbf{a}_t \in A_i \text{ mut. dist.}\} \cup \{0\}$$

contains a Bohr nhood of 0 in G . Since $S \subset G \setminus \{0\}$ is Bohr rec., $S \cap V \neq \emptyset, \neq \{0\}$. So $\exists \mathbf{e}_p, \mathbf{e}_q, \mathbf{e}_r, \mathbf{e}_t \in B_i$ satisfying (2).

$\psi(B_i)$ has diam. $< \varepsilon/2$, so

$$\begin{aligned} \|\psi((\mathbf{e}_p - \mathbf{e}_q) - (\mathbf{e}_r - \mathbf{e}_t))\| &\leq \|\psi(\mathbf{e}_p) - \psi(\mathbf{e}_q)\| + \|\psi(\mathbf{e}_r) - \psi(\mathbf{e}_t)\| \\ &< \varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$



Lemma 1

Let $\rho : \mathbb{Z}^\omega \rightarrow G$ be a homomorphism such that $\rho(\mathcal{E}_1) = G$. If $S \subset G \setminus \{0\}$ is a set of Bohr recurrence in G , then $\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4$ is a set of Bohr recurrence in \mathbb{Z}^ω .

Lemma 2

Let $\rho : H \rightarrow G$ be a homomorphism. If $S \subset H$ is a set of topological rec., then $\rho(S)$ is a set of topological rec. in G .

Let G be a ctbl. abel. group and assume that every Bohr recurrent subset of $\mathcal{E}_4 \subset \mathbb{Z}^\omega$ is a set of topological recurrence (Conjecture 2). We'll prove that every set of Bohr recurrence in G is a set of topological recurrence.

Let $\rho : \mathbb{Z}^\omega \rightarrow G$ such that $\rho(\mathcal{E}_1) = G$. Let $S \subset G$ be a set of Bohr recurrence. If $0 \in S$, then S is already a set of topological recurrence, so assume $0 \notin S$. Then $\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4$ is a set of Bohr recurrence (Lemma 1). Assuming Conjecture 2, we have that $\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4$ is a set of topological recurrence in \mathbb{Z}^ω . By Lemma 2, $\rho(\rho^{-1}(S) \cap \mathcal{E}_4)$ is a set of topological recurrence in G . So S is, too.

Conjecture 2

Every subset of \mathcal{E}_4 which is a set of Bohr recurrence is also a set of topological recurrence.

Examples:

$$S_1 := \{\mathbf{e}_n - \mathbf{e}_{n+d} - \mathbf{e}_{n+2d} + \mathbf{e}_{n+3d} : n, d \in \mathbb{N}\} \subset \mathcal{E}_4$$

is a set of Bohr recurrence. So is

$$S_2 := \{\mathbf{e}_n - \mathbf{e}_{n+d^2} - \mathbf{e}_{n+2d^2} + \mathbf{e}_{n+3d^2} : n, d \in \mathbb{N}\}$$

Are these sets of topological recurrence?

I haven't proved any nontrivial special cases, beyond what can be done using the results on the next three slides.

We say $S \subset \mathbb{Z}$ is an I_0 -set if for all bounded $f : S \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ and $\varepsilon > 0$ there is a trigonometric polynomial p such that $|f(s) - p(s)| < \varepsilon$ for all $s \in S$.

We say $S = \{s_1 < s_2 < s_3 < \dots\}$ is lacunary if $\inf s_{n+1}/s_n > 1$.

Theorem (Strzelecki [Str63])

If $S \subset \mathbb{N}$ is lacunary, then S is an I_0 set.

For example, $\{2^n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is an I_0 set.

cf. [Le20], [KR99].

Proposition ([Gri21b], Proposition 2.2)

Let $E \subset \mathbb{Z}$ be an I_0 set. If $S \subset E - E$ and S is a set of Bohr recurrence, then S is a set of topological recurrence.

We need two standard equivalences.

Lemma

Let $S \subset \mathbb{Z}$. The following are equivalent.

- (i) S is a set of topological recurrence.*
- (ii) For all $k \in \mathbb{N}$ and every $f : \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \{1, \dots, k\}$, there exists $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $b - a \in S$ and $f(b) = f(a)$.*

The following are equivalent:

- (iii) S is a set of Bohr recurrence.*
- (iv) For all trigonometric polynomials $p : \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$, $\varepsilon > 0$, there exists $m \in S$ such that $|p(n + m) - p(n)| < \varepsilon$ for all $n \in \mathbb{Z}$.*

Lemma

Let $E \subset \mathbb{Z}$ be an I_0 set. If $S \subset E - E$ and S is a set of Bohr recurrence, then S is a set of topological recurrence.

Proof.

Let $S \subset E - E$ be Bohr recurrent. To prove S is topologically recurrent, we fix $k \in \mathbb{N}$ and an arbitrary $f : \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \{1, \dots, k\}$, and will prove $\exists a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $f(b) = f(a)$ and $b - a \in S$.

E is I_0 , so let p be a trig. poly. with $|f(n) - p(n)| < \frac{1}{3} \forall n \in E$.

S is Bohr recurrent, so fix $m \in S$ with

$$|p(n+m) - p(n)| < \frac{1}{3} \forall n \in \mathbb{Z}.$$

Since $S \subset E - E$, write $m = b - a$, where $a, b \in E$.

Then $|p(b) - p(a)| = |p(a+m) - p(a)| < \frac{1}{3}$, so

$$\begin{aligned} |f(b) - f(a)| &= |f(b) - p(b) + p(b) - p(a) + p(a) - f(a)| \\ &\leq |f(b) - p(b)| + |p(b) - p(a)| + |p(a) - f(a)| < 1, \end{aligned}$$

so $f(b) = f(a)$. Since $b - a \in S$, we are done.



Separating recurrence properties

Question (Katznelson [Kat01], Veech [Vee68])

Is every set of Bohr recurrence also a set of topological recurrence?

If there is a set of Bohr recurrence which is not a set of topological recurrence, it **cannot** be a subset of a difference set of an I_0 set.

Lemma (Non-separation)

If $E \subset \mathbb{Z}$ is an I_0 set and $S \subset E - E$ is a set of Bohr recurrence, then S is a set of topological recurrence.

Question

Can the hypothesis “ E is an I_0 set” be weakened?

Theorem (Kriz, [Kri87])

If $S \subset \mathbb{Z}$ is infinite, then there is a set $E \subset S - S$ which is a set of topological recurrence but not of measurable recurrence.

Conjecture

If $S \subset \mathbb{Z}$ is a set of measurable recurrence, then $\exists S' \subset S$ which is a set of topological recurrence and not a set of measurable recurrence.

No such result is known for “local” recurrence properties.
We say S is **dense in the Bohr topology** on \mathbb{Z} if for all $m \in \mathbb{Z}$, $S + m$ is a set of Bohr recurrence.

Theorem ([Gri20])

If $S \subset \mathbb{Z}$ is dense in the Bohr topology then there is a subset $S' \subset S$ such that S' is dense in the Bohr topology and S' is not a set of measurable recurrence.

This answers (negatively) a question by Ruzsa [GR09], Bergelson and Ruzsa [BR09], Hegyvári and Ruzsa [HR16], and G. [Gri12]:

Question

Is every set which is dense in the Bohr topology also a set of measurable recurrence?






Sets with unknown recurrence properties

The following are known to be sets of Bohr recurrence, but not known to be sets of topological recurrence.





- 1 $\{7^{n+2d} + 7^{n+d} - 2 \cdot 7^n : n, d \in \mathbb{N}\}$
B. N. Givens PhD thesis [Giv03], Givens and Kunen [GK03].
- 2 Grivaux and Roginskaya's examples [GR13]
- 3 Translates of the IP set generated by the Erdős-Taylor sequence [Kat73], [GM79]
- 4 $\{n!2^m3^k : n, m, k \in \mathbb{N}\}$ (said to be Bohr recurrent in [FM12])
- 5 The sets constructed in [Gri20]: S is dense in the Bohr topology, not a set of measurable recurrence.

The first four could possibly be sets of measurable recurrence.

References I

-  N. Bogoliouboff, *Sur quelques propriétés arithmétiques des presque-périodes*, Ann. Chaire Phys. Math. Kiev **4** (1939), 185–205. MR 20164
-  Vitaly Bergelson and Imre Z. Ruzsa, *Sumsets in difference sets*, Israel J. Math. **174** (2009), 1–18. MR 2581205
-  Dikran Dikranjan, *Continuous maps in the Bohr topology*, Appl. Gen. Topol. **2** (2001), no. 2, 237–270. MR 1890040
-  Lorenzo de Leo and Dikran Dikranjan, *Straightening theorem for bounded abelian groups*, Topology Appl. **155** (2008), no. 17-18, 2158–2176. MR 2458001
-  Dikran Dikranjan and Stephen Watson, *A solution to van Douwen's problem on Bohr topologies*, J. Pure Appl. Algebra **163** (2001), no. 2, 147–158. MR 1846658

References II

-  Nikos Frantzikinakis and Randall McCutcheon, *Ergodic theory: recurrence*, Mathematics of complexity and dynamical systems. Vols. 1–3, Springer, New York, 2012, pp. 357–368. MR 3220681
-  Berit Nilsen Givens, *Hypergraphs and chromatic numbers, with applications to the Bohr topology*, ProQuest LLC, Ann Arbor, MI, 2003, Thesis (Ph.D.)—The University of Wisconsin - Madison. MR 2704616
-  Berit Nilsen Givens and Kenneth Kunen, *Chromatic numbers and Bohr topologies*, Topology Appl. **131** (2003), no. 2, 189–202. MR 1981873
-  Daniel Glasscock, Andreas Koutsogiannis, and Florian K. Richter, *On Katznelson's Question for skew product systems*, arXiv:2106.11393, to appear in Bulletin AMS (2021).

References III



Colin C. Graham and O. Carruth McGehee, *Essays in commutative harmonic analysis*, Grundlehren der Mathematischen Wissenschaften [Fundamental Principles of Mathematical Science], vol. 238, Springer-Verlag, New York-Berlin, 1979. MR 550606








Alfred Geroldinger and Imre Z. Ruzsa, *Combinatorial number theory and additive group theory*, Advanced Courses in Mathematics. CRM Barcelona, Birkhäuser Verlag, Basel, 2009, Courses and seminars from the DocCourse in Combinatorics and Geometry held in Barcelona, 2008.











Sophie Grivaux and Maria Roginskaya, *Some new examples of recurrence and non-recurrence sets for products of rotations on the unit circle*, Czechoslovak Math. J. **63(138)** (2013), no. 3, 603–627. MR 3125645

References IV

-  John T. Griesmer, *Sumsets of dense sets and sparse sets*, Israel J. Math. **190** (2012), 229–252.
-  John T. Griesmer, *Separating bohr denseness from measurable recurrence*, 2020, arxiv:2002.06994.
-  John T. Griesmer, *Separating topological recurrence from measurable recurrence: exposition and extension of Kriz's example*, arxiv:2108.01642 (2021).
-  ———, *Special cases and equivalent forms of Katznelson's problem on recurrence*, arXiv e-prints (2021), arXiv:2108.02190.
-  Norbert Hegyvári and Imre Z. Ruzsa, *Additive structure of difference sets and a theorem of Følner*, Australas. J. Combin. **64** (2016), 437–443.

References V

-  Y. Katznelson, *Sequence of integers dense in the bohr group*, Proc. Royal. Inst. Techn. Stockholm (1973), 79–86.
-  ———, *Chromatic numbers of Cayley graphs on \mathbb{Z} and recurrence*, vol. 21, 2001, Paul Erdős and his mathematics (Budapest, 1999), pp. 211–219. MR 1832446
-  Kenneth Kunen and Walter Rudin, *Lacunarity and the Bohr topology*, Math. Proc. Cambridge Philos. Soc. **126** (1999), no. 1, 117–137. MR 1681658
-  Igor Kriz, *Large independent sets in shift-invariant graphs: solution of Bergelson's problem*, Graphs Combin. **3** (1987), no. 2, 145–158. MR 932131
-  Kenneth Kunen, *Bohr topologies and partition theorems for vector spaces*, Topology Appl. **90** (1998), no. 1-3, 97–107. MR 1648302

-  Anh N. Le, *Interpolation sets and nilsequences*, Colloq. Math. **162** (2020), no. 2, 181–199. MR 4128459
-  E. Strzelecki, *On a problem of interpolation by periodic and almost periodic functions*, Colloq. Math. **11** (1963), 91–99. MR 160080
-  William A. Veech, *The equicontinuous structure relation for minimal Abelian transformation groups*, Amer. J. Math. **90** (1968), 723–732. MR 232377