

## Master Thesis

Master in Language Analysis and Processing

---

# Grounding Language Models for Spatial Reasoning

---

*Julen Etxaniz*

### **Advisors**

Oier Lopez de Lacalle  
Aitor Soroa

2023



# Acknowledgements



# **Abstract**



# Contents

<b>Contents</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>List of Figures</b>	<b>vi</b>
<b>List of Tables</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>List of Algorithms</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2 Related Work</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>3 Datasets</b>	<b>5</b>
3.1 Winoground . . . . .	5
3.1.1 Dataset . . . . .	5
3.1.2 Metrics . . . . .	5
<b>4 Methods</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>5 Results</b>	<b>9</b>
5.1 Compared To Humans . . . . .	9
5.1.1 Baseline . . . . .	9
5.1.2 Ours . . . . .	12
5.2 Results By Linguistic Tag . . . . .	12
5.2.1 Baseline . . . . .	12
5.2.2 Ours . . . . .	12
5.3 Results By Visual Tag . . . . .	12
5.3.1 Baseline . . . . .	12
5.3.2 Ours . . . . .	12
<b>6 Discussion</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>7 Conclusions</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>19</b>

# List of Figures



# List of Tables

5.1	Results on the Winoground dataset across the text, image and group score and accuracy metrics. Results above random chance in <b>bold</b> . . . . .	9
5.2	Results on the Winoground dataset across the text, image and group score and accuracy metrics. Results above random chance in <b>bold</b> . . . . .	10
5.3	The results by linguistic tag. Results above chance are in <b>bold</b> . . . . .	10
5.4	The results by linguistic tag. Results above chance are in <b>bold</b> . . . . .	11
5.5	The results by visual tag. Results above chance are in <b>bold</b> . . . . .	11
5.6	The results by visual tag. Results above chance are in <b>bold</b> . . . . .	12



## List of algorithms



# 1 Introduction



## 2 Related Work





## 3 Datasets

This chapter introduces the datasets and metrics we used.

### 3.1 Winoground

#### 3.1.1 Dataset

#### 3.1.2 Metrics

##### 3.1.2.1 Score

Performance on Winoground is computed according to three different metrics that evaluate different aspects of the models' visio-linguistic reasoning abilities.

The first metric is the **text score**, which measures whether a model can select the correct caption, given an image. Given images  $I_0$  and  $I_1$  and captions  $C_0$  and  $C_1$ , the text score for an example  $(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1)$  is computed according to:

$$f(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } s(C_0, I_0) > s(C_1, I_0) \\ & \text{and } s(C_1, I_1) > s(C_0, I_1) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (3.1)$$

where  $s(\cdot)$  is the model's score for the image/caption pair.

The second metric is the **image score**, which measures whether a model can select the correct image, given a caption. Given images  $I_0$  and  $I_1$  and captions  $C_0$  and  $C_1$ , the image score for an example is computed according to:

$$g(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } s(C_0, I_0) > s(C_0, I_1) \\ & \text{and } s(C_1, I_1) > s(C_1, I_0) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (3.2)$$

The group score in our framework is computed according to:

$$h(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } f(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) \\ & \text{and } g(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (3.3)$$

##### 3.1.2.2 Accuracy

Given images  $I_0$  and  $I_1$  and captions  $C_0$  and  $C_1$ , the text accuracy for an example  $(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1)$  is computed according to:

$$f(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } s(C_0, I_0) > s(C_1, I_0) \\ & \text{and } s(C_1, I_1) > s(C_0, I_1) \\ 0.5 & \text{if } s(C_0, I_0) > s(C_1, I_0) \\ & \text{xor } s(C_1, I_1) > s(C_0, I_1) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (3.4)$$

where  $s(\cdot)$  is the model's score for the image/caption pair.

Given images  $I_0$  and  $I_1$  and captions  $C_0$  and  $C_1$ , the image accuracy for an example is computed according to:

$$g(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } s(C_0, I_0) > s(C_0, I_1) \\ & \text{and } s(C_1, I_1) > s(C_1, I_0) \\ 0.5 & \text{if } s(C_0, I_0) > s(C_0, I_1) \\ & \text{xor } s(C_1, I_1) > s(C_1, I_0) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (3.5)$$

The group score in our framework is computed according to:

$$h(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) = (f(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1) + g(C_0, I_0, C_1, I_1))/2 \quad (3.6)$$

## 4 Methods



## 5 Results

This chapter introduces baseline results and our results.

### 5.1 Compared To Humans

#### 5.1.1 Baseline

Model	Score			Accuracy		
	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group
MTurk Human	<b>89.50</b>	<b>88.50</b>	<b>85.50</b>	<b>93.75</b>	<b>93.88</b>	<b>93.81</b>
Random Chance	25.00	25.00	16.67	50.00	50.00	50.00
VinVL	<b>37.75</b>	17.75	14.50	<b>62.75</b>	<b>57.75</b>	<b>60.25</b>
UNITER <sub>large</sub>	<b>38.00</b>	14.00	10.50	<b>63.25</b>	<b>55.75</b>	<b>59.50</b>
UNITER <sub>base</sub>	<b>32.25</b>	13.25	10.00	<b>60.62</b>	<b>55.50</b>	<b>58.06</b>
ViLLA <sub>large</sub>	<b>37.00</b>	13.25	11.00	<b>62.62</b>	<b>55.25</b>	<b>58.94</b>
ViLLA <sub>base</sub>	<b>30.00</b>	12.00	8.00	<b>59.62</b>	<b>55.00</b>	<b>57.31</b>
VisualBERT <sub>base</sub>	15.50	2.50	1.50	<b>50.50</b>	49.88	<b>50.19</b>
ViLT (ViT-B/32)	<b>34.75</b>	14.00	9.25	<b>60.50</b>	<b>55.38</b>	<b>57.94</b>
LXMERT	19.25	7.00	4.00	<b>52.12</b>	<b>51.88</b>	<b>52.00</b>
ViLBERT <sub>base</sub>	23.75	7.25	4.75	<b>57.25</b>	<b>52.50</b>	<b>54.87</b>
UniT <sub>ITMFinetuned</sub>	19.50	6.25	4.00	<b>50.25</b>	<b>50.75</b>	<b>50.50</b>
FLAVA <sub>ITM</sub>	<b>32.25</b>	20.50	14.25	<b>62.75</b>	<b>59.13</b>	<b>60.94</b>
FLAVA <sub>Contrastive</sub>	<b>25.25</b>	13.50	9.00	<b>59.25</b>	<b>55.12</b>	<b>57.19</b>
CLIP (ViT-B/32)	<b>30.75</b>	10.50	8.00	<b>60.38</b>	<b>53.25</b>	<b>56.81</b>
VSE++ <sub>COCO</sub> (ResNet)	22.75	8.00	4.00	<b>51.38</b>	<b>50.88</b>	<b>51.12</b>
VSE++ <sub>COCO</sub> (VGG)	18.75	5.50	3.50	<b>50.38</b>	49.75	<b>50.06</b>
VSE++ <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (ResNet)	20.00	5.00	2.75	<b>51.50</b>	<b>50.25</b>	<b>50.88</b>
VSE++ <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (VGG)	19.75	6.25	4.50	<b>52.75</b>	<b>51.00</b>	<b>51.88</b>
VSRN <sub>COCO</sub>	17.50	7.00	3.75	<b>50.38</b>	<b>51.12</b>	<b>50.75</b>
VSRN <sub>Flickr30k</sub>	20.00	5.00	3.50	<b>53.25</b>	<b>51.75</b>	<b>52.50</b>

**Table 5.1:** Results on the Winoground dataset across the text, image and group score and accuracy metrics. Results above random chance in **bold**.

Model	Score			Accuracy		
	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group
MTurk Human	<b>89.50</b>	<b>88.50</b>	<b>85.50</b>	<b>93.75</b>	<b>93.88</b>	<b>93.81</b>
Random Chance	25.00	25.00	16.67	50.00	50.00	50.00
ViLT (ViT-B/32)	<b>27.50</b>	8.75	6.00	<b>56.88</b>	<b>53.12</b>	<b>55.00</b>
ViLT <sub>COCO</sub> (ViT-B/32)	<b>32.75</b>	13.50	11.25	<b>61.88</b>	<b>56.00</b>	<b>58.94</b>
ViLT <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/32)	<b>35.00</b>	11.50	9.75	<b>61.62</b>	<b>54.50</b>	<b>58.06</b>
FLAVA <sub>ITM</sub>	<b>32.25</b>	20.50	14.25	<b>62.75</b>	<b>59.13</b>	<b>60.94</b>
FLAVA <sub>ITC</sub>	<b>25.25</b>	13.50	9.00	<b>59.25</b>	<b>55.12</b>	<b>57.19</b>
CLIP (ViT-B/32)	<b>30.75</b>	10.25	8.25	<b>60.38</b>	<b>53.12</b>	<b>56.75</b>
CLIP (ViT-B/16)	25.00	10.25	7.00	<b>57.88</b>	<b>53.75</b>	<b>55.81</b>
CLIP (ViT-L/14)	<b>28.50</b>	11.00	8.00	<b>60.38</b>	<b>54.62</b>	<b>57.50</b>
CLIP (ViT-L/14-336)	<b>27.50</b>	12.00	8.00	<b>59.38</b>	<b>55.12</b>	<b>57.25</b>
BLIP <sub>ITM14M</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>39.25</b>	19.00	15.00	<b>65.88</b>	<b>58.25</b>	<b>62.06</b>
BLIP <sub>ITC14M</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>32.25</b>	13.75	10.50	<b>62.25</b>	<b>56.50</b>	<b>59.38</b>
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>40.50</b>	20.50	16.50	<b>66.25</b>	<b>59.00</b>	<b>62.62</b>
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>29.75</b>	14.50	9.50	<b>59.88</b>	<b>56.12</b>	<b>58.00</b>
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-B/16) (CapFilt-L)	<b>37.50</b>	18.50	14.00	<b>65.00</b>	<b>59.13</b>	<b>62.06</b>
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-B/16) (CapFilt-L)	<b>31.50</b>	10.50	8.50	<b>61.38</b>	<b>53.62</b>	<b>57.50</b>
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>42.50</b>	18.25	15.50	<b>66.88</b>	<b>57.25</b>	<b>62.06</b>
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>33.25</b>	12.00	9.00	<b>61.75</b>	<b>55.00</b>	<b>58.38</b>
BLIP <sub>ITMCOCO</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>48.00</b>	24.50	<b>20.00</b>	<b>69.88</b>	<b>61.25</b>	<b>65.56</b>
BLIP <sub>ITCCOCO</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>37.75</b>	15.75	12.75	<b>65.00</b>	<b>56.88</b>	<b>60.94</b>
BLIP <sub>ITMFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>46.25</b>	24.25	<b>21.25</b>	<b>69.25</b>	<b>60.62</b>	<b>64.94</b>
BLIP <sub>ITCFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>38.25</b>	15.00	12.25	<b>65.38</b>	<b>56.12</b>	<b>60.75</b>
BLIP <sub>ITMCOCO</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>46.75</b>	24.00	<b>20.50</b>	<b>68.88</b>	<b>61.00</b>	<b>64.94</b>
BLIP <sub>ITCCOCO</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>37.75</b>	13.75	10.50	<b>64.88</b>	<b>55.75</b>	<b>60.31</b>
BLIP <sub>ITMFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>45.00</b>	24.75	<b>20.50</b>	<b>68.62</b>	<b>60.50</b>	<b>64.56</b>
BLIP <sub>ITCFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>36.00</b>	16.25	13.50	<b>63.38</b>	<b>56.75</b>	<b>60.06</b>

**Table 5.2:** Results on the Winoground dataset across the text, image and group score and accuracy metrics. Results above random chance in **bold**.

Model	Object			Relation			Both			1 Main Pred			2 Main Preds		
	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group
MTurk Human	<b>92.20</b>	<b>90.78</b>	<b>88.65</b>	<b>89.27</b>	<b>90.56</b>	<b>86.70</b>	<b>76.92</b>	<b>57.69</b>	<b>57.69</b>	<b>87.33</b>	<b>85.62</b>	<b>82.53</b>	<b>95.37</b>	<b>96.30</b>	<b>93.52</b>
VinVL	<b>36.88</b>	17.73	14.18	<b>37.77</b>	17.60	14.16	<b>42.31</b>	19.23	<b>19.23</b>	<b>39.38</b>	21.23	<b>17.47</b>	<b>33.33</b>	8.33	6.48
UNITER <sub>large</sub>	<b>39.01</b>	12.77	9.93	<b>36.05</b>	14.16	9.87	<b>50.00</b>	19.23	<b>19.23</b>	<b>40.07</b>	16.44	13.36	<b>32.41</b>	7.41	2.78
UNITER <sub>base</sub>	<b>34.04</b>	11.35	9.22	<b>30.04</b>	14.16	10.30	<b>42.31</b>	15.38	11.54	<b>35.27</b>	14.73	11.99	24.07	9.26	4.63
ViLLA <sub>large</sub>	<b>36.88</b>	14.89	11.35	<b>37.34</b>	12.88	11.16	<b>34.62</b>	7.69	7.69	<b>39.73</b>	17.12	14.38	<b>29.63</b>	2.78	1.85
ViLLA <sub>base</sub>	<b>33.33</b>	15.60	9.93	<b>27.04</b>	9.01	6.01	<b>38.46</b>	19.23	15.38	<b>33.22</b>	14.04	10.27	21.30	6.48	1.85
VisualBERT <sub>base</sub>	19.15	2.13	0.71	12.88	2.15	1.72	19.23	7.69	3.85	16.44	2.74	1.71	12.96	1.85	0.93
ViLT (ViT-B/32)	<b>31.91</b>	15.60	9.22	<b>36.91</b>	11.59	8.15	<b>30.77</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>19.23</b>	<b>35.27</b>	17.12	11.64	<b>33.33</b>	5.56	2.78
LXMERT	22.70	9.22	6.38	17.60	5.58	2.58	15.38	7.69	3.85	19.18	8.56	5.14	19.44	2.78	0.93
ViLBERT <sub>base</sub>	<b>29.08</b>	10.64	7.09	19.31	3.00	1.72	<b>34.62</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>19.23</b>	23.97	8.90	5.82	23.15	2.78	1.85
UniT <sub>ITM finetuned</sub>	17.73	5.67	2.13	18.03	4.72	3.43	<b>42.31</b>	23.08	<b>19.23</b>	21.58	6.85	4.11	13.89	4.63	3.70
FLAVA <sub>ITM</sub>	<b>31.91</b>	23.40	14.89	<b>30.04</b>	16.31	12.02	<b>53.85</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>36.30</b>	24.66	<b>17.81</b>	21.30	9.26	4.63
FLAVA <sub>Contrastive</sub>	23.40	19.15	11.35	23.61	8.58	5.58	<b>50.00</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>26.37</b>	16.44	10.62	22.22	5.56	4.63
CLIP (ViT-B/32)	<b>34.75</b>	7.80	6.38	22.75	8.58	5.58	<b>80.77</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>38.46</b>	<b>35.27</b>	13.01	10.27	18.52	3.70	1.85
VSE++ <sub>COCO</sub> (ResNet)	21.99	6.38	1.42	23.61	9.01	5.58	19.23	7.69	3.85	25.00	9.59	4.79	16.67	3.70	1.85
VSE++ <sub>COCO</sub> (VGG)	17.73	2.13	2.13	18.45	7.30	3.86	<b>26.92</b>	7.69	7.69	18.49	4.79	2.74	19.44	7.41	5.56
VSE++ <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (ResNet)	20.57	6.38	3.55	18.88	4.29	2.15	<b>26.92</b>	3.85	3.85	21.58	6.51	3.42	15.74	0.93	0.93
VSE++ <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (VGG)	17.73	4.96	2.84	19.74	6.87	5.15	<b>30.77</b>	7.69	7.69	20.55	6.16	4.79	17.59	6.48	3.70
VSRN <sub>COCO</sub>	15.60	4.96	2.13	18.88	7.73	4.72	15.38	11.54	3.85	17.12	7.19	3.77	18.52	6.48	3.70
VSRN <sub>Flickr30k</sub>	16.31	4.96	2.13	21.03	4.29	3.86	<b>30.77</b>	11.54	7.69	20.89	5.82	3.77	17.59	2.78	2.78

**Table 5.3:** The results by linguistic tag. Results above chance are in **bold**.

Model	Object			Relation			Both			1 Main Pred			2 Main Preds		
	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group
MTurk Human	<b>92.20</b>	<b>90.78</b>	<b>88.65</b>	<b>89.27</b>	<b>90.56</b>	<b>86.70</b>	<b>76.92</b>	<b>57.69</b>	<b>57.69</b>	<b>87.33</b>	<b>85.62</b>	<b>82.53</b>	<b>95.37</b>	<b>96.30</b>	<b>93.52</b>
ViLT (ViT-B/32)	<b>29.08</b>	10.64	4.96	<b>26.18</b>	7.73	6.44	<b>30.77</b>	7.69	7.69	<b>30.14</b>	10.62	7.53	20.37	3.70	1.85
ViLT <sub>COCO</sub> (ViT-B/32)	<b>33.33</b>	15.60	12.77	<b>30.90</b>	10.73	9.01	<b>46.15</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>23.08</b>	<b>36.64</b>	15.75	14.04	22.22	7.41	3.70
ViLT <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/32)	<b>32.62</b>	14.89	11.35	<b>35.62</b>	8.15	7.73	<b>42.31</b>	23.08	<b>19.23</b>	<b>36.99</b>	14.38	11.99	<b>29.63</b>	3.70	3.70
FLAVA <sub>ITM</sub>	<b>31.91</b>	23.40	14.89	<b>30.04</b>	16.31	12.02	<b>53.85</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>36.30</b>	24.66	<b>17.81</b>	21.30	9.26	4.63
FLAVA <sub>ITC</sub>	23.40	19.15	11.35	23.61	8.58	5.58	<b>50.00</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>26.37</b>	16.44	10.62	22.22	5.56	4.63
CLIP (ViT-B/32)	<b>35.46</b>	7.80	6.38	22.32	7.73	5.58	<b>80.77</b>	<b>46.15</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>35.62</b>	13.01	10.62	17.59	2.78	1.85
CLIP (ViT-B/16)	<b>27.66</b>	10.64	5.67	19.31	6.44	4.29	<b>61.54</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>38.46</b>	<b>30.14</b>	11.99	8.90	11.11	5.56	1.85
CLIP (ViT-L/14)	<b>27.66</b>	8.51	5.67	<b>25.75</b>	9.87	6.44	<b>57.69</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>30.14</b>	13.01	9.93	24.07	5.56	2.78
CLIP (ViT-L/14-336)	<b>32.62</b>	12.77	9.22	21.03	8.15	4.29	<b>57.69</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>30.48</b>	14.04	10.62	19.44	6.48	0.93
BLIP <sub>ITM14M</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>41.84</b>	23.40	<b>17.73</b>	<b>36.05</b>	14.59	11.59	<b>53.85</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>43.84</b>	23.63	<b>18.49</b>	<b>26.85</b>	6.48	5.56
BLIP <sub>ITC14M</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>34.04</b>	13.48	9.93	<b>28.33</b>	12.02	9.44	<b>57.69</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>23.08</b>	<b>37.67</b>	16.44	13.01	17.59	6.48	3.70
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>46.10</b>	22.70	<b>17.73</b>	<b>35.62</b>	17.60	14.16	<b>53.85</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>45.89</b>	<b>25.34</b>	<b>20.55</b>	<b>25.93</b>	7.41	5.56
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>34.75</b>	14.18	9.22	<b>25.32</b>	13.73	8.58	<b>42.31</b>	23.08	<b>19.23</b>	<b>33.56</b>	16.10	10.62	19.44	10.19	6.48
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-B/16) (CapFilt-L)	<b>39.01</b>	19.86	12.77	<b>34.76</b>	15.88	12.45	<b>53.85</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>41.10</b>	22.60	<b>17.12</b>	<b>27.78</b>	7.41	5.56
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-B/16) (CapFilt-L)	<b>36.88</b>	12.77	9.22	<b>26.18</b>	8.58	7.30	<b>50.00</b>	15.38	15.38	<b>35.96</b>	13.36	10.96	19.44	2.78	1.85
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>41.84</b>	19.86	<b>17.02</b>	<b>40.77</b>	16.31	13.73	<b>61.54</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>23.08</b>	<b>45.55</b>	23.29	<b>20.21</b>	<b>34.26</b>	4.63	2.78
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>34.04</b>	14.18	11.35	<b>30.90</b>	9.01	6.01	<b>50.00</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>23.08</b>	<b>36.99</b>	14.04	10.96	23.15	6.48	3.70
BLIP <sub>ITMCOCO</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>42.55</b>	<b>26.95</b>	<b>19.15</b>	<b>49.79</b>	21.89	<b>19.31</b>	<b>61.54</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>48.97</b>	<b>29.79</b>	<b>24.66</b>	<b>45.37</b>	10.19	7.41
BLIP <sub>ITCCOCO</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>36.88</b>	19.15	14.18	<b>36.05</b>	11.59	10.30	<b>57.69</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>26.92</b>	<b>41.78</b>	18.84	15.07	<b>26.85</b>	7.41	6.48
BLIP <sub>ITMFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>49.65</b>	<b>28.37</b>	<b>22.70</b>	<b>42.49</b>	19.74	<b>18.45</b>	<b>61.54</b>	<b>42.31</b>	<b>38.46</b>	<b>51.03</b>	<b>28.42</b>	<b>26.03</b>	<b>33.33</b>	12.96	8.33
BLIP <sub>ITCFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>36.88</b>	17.02	10.64	<b>36.48</b>	12.02	11.16	<b>61.54</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>40.75</b>	17.12	13.70	<b>31.48</b>	9.26	8.33
BLIP <sub>ITMCOCO</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>48.94</b>	<b>25.53</b>	<b>20.57</b>	<b>44.64</b>	22.32	<b>20.60</b>	<b>53.85</b>	<b>30.77</b>	<b>19.23</b>	<b>51.03</b>	<b>28.42</b>	<b>23.97</b>	<b>35.19</b>	12.04	11.11
BLIP <sub>ITCCOCO</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>36.88</b>	14.18	11.35	<b>36.05</b>	11.16	7.30	<b>57.69</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>41.10</b>	16.44	13.36	<b>28.70</b>	6.48	2.78
BLIP <sub>ITMFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>46.10</b>	22.70	16.31	<b>42.06</b>	24.89	<b>21.46</b>	<b>65.38</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>34.62</b>	<b>50.34</b>	<b>29.11</b>	<b>24.66</b>	<b>30.56</b>	12.96	9.26
BLIP <sub>ITCFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>39.01</b>	19.86	15.60	<b>30.47</b>	11.59	9.44	<b>69.23</b>	<b>38.46</b>	<b>38.46</b>	<b>39.38</b>	20.55	<b>17.12</b>	<b>26.85</b>	4.63	3.70

Table 5.4: The results by linguistic tag. Results above chance are in **bold**.

Model	Symbolic			Pragmatics			Same Image Series		
	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group
MTurk Human	<b>96.43</b>	<b>92.86</b>	<b>92.86</b>	<b>58.82</b>	<b>41.18</b>	<b>41.18</b>	<b>95.65</b>	<b>91.30</b>	<b>91.30</b>
VinVL	25.00	17.86	14.29	<b>29.41</b>	5.88	5.88	<b>34.78</b>	17.39	13.04
UNITER <sub>large</sub>	<b>39.29</b>	<b>28.57</b>	<b>17.86</b>	<b>35.29</b>	0.00	0.00	4.35	8.70	0.00
UNITER <sub>base</sub>	<b>46.43</b>	14.29	14.29	<b>29.41</b>	17.65	11.76	8.70	8.70	0.00
ViLLA <sub>large</sub>	<b>39.29</b>	14.29	10.71	17.65	0.00	0.00	17.39	4.35	0.00
ViLLA <sub>base</sub>	<b>42.86</b>	17.86	14.29	<b>29.41</b>	5.88	5.88	13.04	8.70	4.35
VisualBERT <sub>base</sub>	<b>28.57</b>	0.00	0.00	5.88	0.00	0.00	13.04	0.00	0.00
ViLT (ViT-B/32)	<b>28.57</b>	17.86	10.71	<b>35.29</b>	0.00	0.00	<b>26.09</b>	0.00	0.00
LXMERT	<b>28.57</b>	3.57	3.57	17.65	5.88	0.00	8.70	4.35	0.00
ViLBERT <sub>base</sub>	<b>28.57</b>	10.71	7.14	<b>29.41</b>	5.88	5.88	13.04	0.00	0.00
UniT <sub>ITMfinetuned</sub>	14.29	10.71	7.14	17.65	5.88	5.88	21.74	4.35	4.35
FLAVA <sub>ITM</sub>	25.00	<b>28.57</b>	<b>17.86</b>	17.65	<b>29.41</b>	11.76	17.39	8.70	0.00
FLAVA <sub>Contrastive</sub>	17.86	10.71	10.71	11.76	23.53	5.88	17.39	4.35	4.35
CLIP (ViT-B/32)	<b>39.29</b>	3.57	3.57	<b>35.29</b>	5.88	5.88	8.70	0.00	0.00
VSE++ <sub>COCO</sub> (ResNet)	<b>32.14</b>	10.71	10.71	23.53	11.76	0.00	13.04	4.35	4.35
VSE++ <sub>COCO</sub> (VGG)	17.86	14.29	7.14	17.65	0.00	0.00	13.04	4.35	4.35
VSE++ <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (ResNet)	21.43	3.57	0.00	23.53	0.00	0.00	17.39	4.35	0.00
VSE++ <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (VGG)	<b>28.57</b>	10.71	10.71	11.76	0.00	0.00	13.04	4.35	0.00
VSRN <sub>COCO</sub>	7.14	3.57	0.00	11.76	0.00	0.00	13.04	0.00	0.00
VSRN <sub>Flickr30k</sub>	21.43	3.57	3.57	<b>35.29</b>	11.76	5.88	8.70	4.35	4.35

Table 5.5: The results by visual tag. Results above chance are in **bold**.

Model	Symbolic			Pragmatics			Same Image Series		
	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group	Text	Image	Group
MTurk Human	<b>96.43</b>	<b>92.86</b>	<b>92.86</b>	<b>58.82</b>	<b>41.18</b>	<b>41.18</b>	<b>95.65</b>	<b>91.30</b>	<b>91.30</b>
ViLT (ViT-B/32)	21.43	7.14	3.57	17.65	5.88	5.88	17.39	8.70	4.35
ViLT <sub>COCO</sub> (ViT-B/32)	21.43	10.71	10.71	<b>29.41</b>	17.65	5.88	21.74	8.70	4.35
ViLT <sub>Flickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/32)	<b>28.57</b>	7.14	7.14	23.53	0.00	0.00	<b>26.09</b>	4.35	4.35
FLAVA <sub>ITM</sub>	25.00	<b>28.57</b>	<b>17.86</b>	17.65	<b>29.41</b>	11.76	17.39	8.70	0.00
FLAVA <sub>ITC</sub>	17.86	10.71	10.71	11.76	23.53	5.88	17.39	4.35	4.35
CLIP (ViT-B/32)	<b>35.71</b>	3.57	3.57	<b>35.29</b>	5.88	5.88	13.04	0.00	0.00
CLIP (ViT-B/16)	21.43	3.57	3.57	<b>29.41</b>	11.76	11.76	4.35	4.35	0.00
CLIP (ViT-L/14)	<b>28.57</b>	10.71	3.57	23.53	17.65	11.76	13.04	8.70	4.35
CLIP (ViT-L/14-336)	<b>28.57</b>	14.29	7.14	17.65	17.65	5.88	13.04	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITM14M</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>46.43</b>	17.86	<b>17.86</b>	<b>35.29</b>	11.76	11.76	17.39	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITC14M</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>32.14</b>	14.29	10.71	<b>29.41</b>	0.00	0.00	13.04	0.00	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>50.00</b>	17.86	<b>17.86</b>	<b>29.41</b>	5.88	5.88	13.04	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>39.29</b>	10.71	7.14	5.88	11.76	0.00	4.35	8.70	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-B/16) (CapFilt-L)	<b>42.86</b>	17.86	14.29	23.53	17.65	<b>17.65</b>	17.39	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-B/16) (CapFilt-L)	<b>42.86</b>	0.00	0.00	17.65	0.00	0.00	4.35	0.00	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITM</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>53.57</b>	25.00	<b>25.00</b>	<b>29.41</b>	5.88	0.00	<b>26.09</b>	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITC</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>39.29</b>	17.86	14.29	<b>41.18</b>	11.76	11.76	8.70	4.35	4.35
BLIP <sub>ITMCOCO</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>53.57</b>	17.86	<b>17.86</b>	<b>58.82</b>	17.65	<b>17.65</b>	<b>39.13</b>	8.70	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITCCOCO</sub> (ViT-B/16)	25.00	10.71	7.14	<b>35.29</b>	5.88	5.88	17.39	8.70	4.35
BLIP <sub>ITMFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>53.57</b>	21.43	<b>21.43</b>	<b>35.29</b>	11.76	11.76	<b>26.09</b>	4.35	4.35
BLIP <sub>ITCFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-B/16)	<b>35.71</b>	10.71	10.71	23.53	17.65	11.76	17.39	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITMCOCO</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>39.29</b>	<b>35.71</b>	<b>25.00</b>	<b>58.82</b>	23.53	<b>17.65</b>	<b>26.09</b>	4.35	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITCCOCO</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>46.43</b>	14.29	14.29	17.65	5.88	5.88	13.04	0.00	0.00
BLIP <sub>ITMFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>39.29</b>	<b>28.57</b>	<b>25.00</b>	<b>47.06</b>	11.76	5.88	<b>30.43</b>	8.70	4.35
BLIP <sub>ITCFlickr30k</sub> (ViT-L/16)	<b>39.29</b>	14.29	14.29	<b>47.06</b>	5.88	5.88	21.74	13.04	13.04

Table 5.6: The results by visual tag. Results above chance are in **bold**.

### 5.1.2 Ours

## 5.2 Results By Linguistic Tag

### 5.2.1 Baseline

### 5.2.2 Ours

## 5.3 Results By Visual Tag

### 5.3.1 Baseline

### 5.3.2 Ours



## **6 Discussion**



## 7 Conclusions



# Appendix



# Bibliography