

Discrete Structures Lab01: Hints

Lemma 1: For all propositions a , $\neg\neg a \rightarrow a$.

Proof:

- Assume that $\neg\neg a$ is true.
- We sort two cases by “classic” axiom (Excluded Middle): either a or $\neg a$ must be true.
- If a is true, we are happy.
- Otherwise $\neg a$ is true (along with $\neg\neg a$ obtained before). This is a contradiction.
- Therefore a must be true in all cases (it is either trivial, or a contradiction).

Lemma 2: For all propositions a and b , $\neg(a \rightarrow b) \rightarrow a$.

Proof:

- Assume that $\neg(a \rightarrow b)$ is true.
- We have to prove that a is true. By Lemma 1, we will prove instead that $\neg\neg a$ is true, then it will also imply a .
- We will assume that $\neg a$ is true, and attempt to get a contradiction (this means that $\neg\neg a$ must be true).
- Let’s prove now that $a \rightarrow b$ is true - this would be an immediate contradiction with $\neg(a \rightarrow b)$.

- To prove $a \rightarrow b$, assume that a is true and let’s prove b . But earlier we assumed that $\neg a$.
- a and $\neg a$ cannot be simultaneously true. This is a contradiction.

Pierce Lemma: For all propositions a and b , $((a \rightarrow b) \rightarrow a) \rightarrow a$.

Hint. Just use Lemma 1 and 2 for this. And also the “classic” axiom: Sort 2 cases when $(a \rightarrow b)$ or $\neg(a \rightarrow b)$ are true.

Lemma 4: For all propositions a and b , $(\neg b \rightarrow \neg a) \rightarrow (a \rightarrow b)$.

This is the opposite direction from a well-known contrapositive ($\neg b \rightarrow a$ and $a \rightarrow b$ mean the same thing.)

Hint. Use “classic” axiom (Excluded middle) on b .

Lemma 5: For all propositions a, b, c, d, e ,

$((((a \rightarrow b) \rightarrow (\neg c \rightarrow \neg d)) \rightarrow c) \rightarrow e) \rightarrow \neg a \rightarrow (d \rightarrow e)$.

Hint. Indeed, assume that $((((a \rightarrow b) \rightarrow \neg c \rightarrow \neg d) \rightarrow c) \rightarrow e)$; also assume $\neg a$ and d . Then you can prove $((a \rightarrow b) \rightarrow \neg c \rightarrow \neg d) \rightarrow c$ which is similar to what you need.

After all this, you can do Sample20 from the Coq lab.