

# Midsem Solutions

(2024) CS 207M

March 21, 2024

**Problem 2:** Let  $R_1, R_2$  be symmetric relations on a set  $X$ . Show that  $R_1 \circ R_2$  is symmetric if and only if  $R_1 \circ R_2 = R_2 \circ R_1$

We have to prove both directions:

(a) If  $R_1 \circ R_2$  is symmetric then  $R_1 \circ R_2 = R_2 \circ R_1$  (2 marks).

We will show that  $R_1 \circ R_2 \subseteq R_2 \circ R_1$ , and vice-versa, which will prove that  $R_1 \circ R_2 = R_2 \circ R_1$ .

Let  $(a, c)$  be an arbitrary element in  $R_1 \circ R_2$ . By symmetry of  $R_1 \circ R_2$ ,  $(c, a) \in R_1 \circ R_2$ . By definition of composition, there exists  $b \in X$  such that  $(c, b) \in R_1$  and  $(b, a) \in R_2$ . By symmetry of  $R_1$  and  $R_2$ ,  $(b, c) \in R_1$  and  $(a, b) \in R_2$ . Therefore by definition of composition  $(a, c) \in R_2 \circ R_1$ . This shows that  $R_1 \circ R_2 \subseteq R_2 \circ R_1$ .

Other side can be done similarly.

(b) If  $R_1 \circ R_2 = R_2 \circ R_1$  then  $R_1 \circ R_2$  is symmetric (2 marks).

Let  $(a, c)$  be an arbitrary element in  $R_1 \circ R_2$ . Since  $R_1 \circ R_2 = R_2 \circ R_1$ ,  $(a, c) \in R_2 \circ R_1$ . By definition of composition, there exists  $b \in X$  such that  $(a, b) \in R_2$  and  $(b, c) \in R_1$ . By symmetry of  $R_1$  and  $R_2$ ,  $(b, a) \in R_2$  and  $(c, b) \in R_1$ . By definition of composition,  $(c, a) \in R_1 \circ R_2$  and we are done.

**Problem 3:** Let  $f : X \rightarrow X$  be a function. We define a relation  $\sim_f$  on  $X$  as follows:  $x \sim_f y$  if  $\exists m \geq 0$  such that either  $f^m(x) = y$  or  $f^m(y) = x$ .

$\sim_f$  is not an equivalence relation as it need not be transitive, although it is trivially reflexive and symmetric. We will show that  $\sim_f$  is not transitive by giving a counter-example. Consider  $X = \{1, 2, 3\}$  and the constant function  $f(x) = 2$ . By definition  $1 \sim_f 2$  since  $f(1) = 2$  and  $2 \sim_f 3$  since  $f(3) = 2$ . But  $(1, 3) \notin \sim_f$  since regardless of any number of applications of  $f$ , there is no way to reach 3 from 1 or vice-versa.