Reassessing Atoll Resilience: A Critical Appraisal of Kench et al. (2015) and the Impacts of Flooding and Cyclones on Tuvalu

Kealalani Giblin

Student ID: 14781955

I acknowledge the use of ChatGPT (https://chat.openai.com/) to outline and guide me through the writing of this essay. On 26 February 2025 I submitted my own notes and relevant quotes from various research papers with the instructions to “order into an outline based on my assignment details”. Which I then used and modified to assist in the writing of this essay.

Introduction

The study conducted by Kench et al. (2015) examines the response of atoll islands in Tuvalu to sea-level rise over the past century. A common assumption is that low-lying coral islands are highly vulnerable to rising seas, leading to their inevitable submersion. However, this research challenges that perception by demonstrating that many atolls have remained stable or even increased in land area. By providing empirical evidence of island dynamism, the study questions widespread narratives about the existential threat to atoll nations and influences policy decisions regarding climate adaptation and migration (Kench et al., 2015).

Significance

Sea-level rise is one of the most pressing consequences of climate change, disproportionately affecting small island developing states (SIDS). The western tropical Pacific has experienced sea-level rise rates up to three times the global mean, raising concerns over the long-term viability of atoll nations such as Tuvalu (Becker et al., 2012). Traditional climate projections predict widespread land loss and displacement of populations, fueling discussions about “climate refugees” (Bhat & Wani, 2025). However, Kench et al. (2015) suggest that atolls are naturally dynamic and capable of adapting to environmental changes by accumulating sediment and shifting in shape. This finding is crucial as it challenges deterministic views of atoll disappearance and emphasizes the need for nuanced climate adaptation strategies. Understanding whether atolls can keep pace with accelerating sea-level rise is essential for developing policies that either support in-place adaptation or justify large-scale relocation efforts. The study’s conclusions have implications for global climate discourse, policy-making, and scientific research on coastal resilience. However, while the study provides valuable insights into past atoll behavior, its applicability to future scenarios remains uncertain, necessitating further examination of its evidence, assumptions, and limitations (Kench et al., 2015).

Evaluation

This research offers a comprehensive historical dataset, analyzing 118 years of atoll changes using a combination of historical maps, aerial photographs, and satellite imagery. By integrating multiple data sources, the study provides a robust long-term perspective on how atoll islands have evolved, making it a valuable contribution to the discourse on climate change impacts. One of the most significant strengths of this research is its ability to challenge conventional climate narratives. By demonstrating that many atolls have remained stable or expanded despite rising sea levels, the study questions the assumption that sea-level rise will inevitably lead to their disappearance. This provides a more nuanced understanding of the resilience of low-lying islands. Additionally, the research employs a variety of analytical

techniques, including geospatial analysis and comparative shoreline mapping, to track the expansion and persistence of island areas. This multifaceted approach strengthens the validity of the study's conclusions regarding the dynamism of atoll islands. Moreover, the findings carry essential policy implications, advocating for adaptation strategies that leverage natural island-building processes rather than focusing solely on land loss and potential displacement (Kench et al., 2015).

Despite its strengths, the study has notable limitations. While it focuses on horizontal land area changes, it does not account for potential vertical movement of atolls, such as subsidence, which could make expanded islands uninhabitable due to increased flooding (Becker et al., 2012). Furthermore, the study's geographic scope is limited to Funafuti Atoll, raising concerns about whether the findings are generalizable to other atolls with different environmental conditions (McLean & Kench, 2015). Another major oversight in the study is its failure to account for the significant impact of flooding on Tuvalu's habitability. This severe flood risk questions the long-term sustainability of atoll habitation and highlights a major gap in the study's analysis of island stability and resilience. While horizontal land expansion suggests a degree of adaptability, it does not necessarily translate to improved livability or reduced vulnerability to climate hazards (Moritz Wandres et al., 2024). Additionally, the study does not fully address the implications of accelerating sea-level rise, with projections indicating much higher rates of increase in the future, potentially exceeding the adaptive capacity of atolls (Becker et al., 2012). While the research acknowledges the role of extreme weather events, such as cyclones, in contributing to island expansion through sediment deposition, it does not sufficiently explore the destructive potential of these events. Intense storms may lead to substantial coastal erosion, undermining the long-term stability of atoll islands. The potential for increasing cyclone intensity due to climate change raises further uncertainty about whether the observed land accretion will continue or if long-term erosion will dominate (Chowdhury & Yang, 2023).

Alternative Views

Increased Flooding Threatens Atoll Stability and Habitability

One alternative perspective argues that flooding, rather than gradual sea-level rise alone, poses an immediate and severe threat to atoll stability and human habitation. A national-scale coastal flood hazard assessment using high-resolution LiDAR topography and bathymetry data has shown that Tuvalu is highly vulnerable to extreme flooding events. With a mean elevation of just 1.55 meters above mean sea level, more than 25% of Tuvalu's land area is inundated at least once every five years, and over 50% floods in a 1-in-100-year event. By 2060, present-day 1-in-50-year floods will occur more than once every five years, even under moderate sea-level rise projections. These statistics highlight an immediate crisis: even if atolls are expanding horizontally, their habitability is increasingly threatened by frequent and severe flooding. This challenges the assumption that atoll expansion equates to climate resilience, as increasing

inundation events will likely make these islands unlivable long before they are submerged (Moritz Wandres et al., 2024).

Intensified Cyclones Pose Long-Term Erosion Risks

Another significant challenge to the notion of island resilience comes from the increasing intensity of tropical cyclones. While Kench et al. (2015) argue that gravel islands benefit from storm-driven sediment deposits, recent research suggests that intensified cyclones pose a far greater risk to island stability. Historical cyclone records indicate that Tuvalu has been increasingly impacted by high-intensity tropical cyclones, with storm surges and high wave energy contributing to rapid coastal erosion. The same processes that deposit sediment can also remove large portions of island shorelines, reshaping and even fragmenting islands over time. Cyclone Pam (2015), for example, caused severe coastal damage across Tuvalu, eroding shorelines and displacing entire communities. As climate change leads to stronger and more frequent cyclones, the net effect may be increased instability and erosion rather than long-term expansion. This challenges the argument that storms contribute positively to atoll resilience and suggests that future cyclone patterns may accelerate land loss rather than counteracting sea-level rise (Chowdhury & Yang, 2023).

Conclusion

The research conducted by Kench et al. (2015) provides a compelling counterargument to prevailing narratives that frame atolls as inherently doomed to submersion due to rising sea levels. By demonstrating that these islands are dynamic systems capable of accumulating sediment and adjusting to environmental change, the study shifts the conversation around climate adaptation for atoll nations (Kench et al., 2015). However, the findings do not fully address key uncertainties regarding vertical land movement, accelerated sea-level rise, and long-term sustainability (McLean & Kench, 2015). While historical data suggest resilience, it remains unclear whether these patterns will persist under future conditions (Becker et al., 2012). While horizontal land expansion may suggest some adaptability, it does not equate to long-term habitability. Rising sea levels, increased flooding, and intensifying cyclones pose serious threats to the stability and livability of these islands. The assumption that atoll expansion mitigates the risks of climate change overlooks the broader reality that growing land area does not necessarily mean improved conditions for human habitation. Policymakers should use these findings to inform adaptation strategies while simultaneously preparing for the possibility that atoll nations may eventually exceed their adaptive limits. Continued monitoring and further research are necessary to determine whether the observed patterns of island expansion will persist in the face of intensifying climate change.

References

Becker, M., Meyssignac, B., Letetrel, C., Llovel, W., Cazenave, A., & Delcroix, T. (2012). Sea level variations at tropical Pacific islands since 1950. *Global and Planetary Change, 80-81*, 85-98. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2011.09.004

Bhat, R. A., & Wani, K. A. (2025). Climate Change and Refugees in South Asia: An Integrated-Relational Approach. *Environmental Claims Journal*, 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/10406026.2025.2459761

Chowdhury, S. J. K., & Yang, C.-S. (2023). Long-Term Analysis of Tropical Cyclones in the Southwest Pacific and Influences on Tuvalu from 2000 to 2021. *Korean Journal of Remote Sensing*, *39*(4), 441–458. https://doi.org/10.7780/kjrs.2023.39.4.5

Kench, P. S., Thompson, D., Ford, M. R., Ogawa, H., & McLean, R. F. (2015). Coral islands defy sea-level rise over the past century: Records from a central Pacific atoll. *Geology*, *43*(6), 515–518. https://doi.org/10.1130/g36555.1

McLean, R., & Kench, P. (2015). Destruction or persistence of coral atoll islands in the face of 20th and 21st century sea-level rise? *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change*, *6*(5), 445–463. https://doi.org/10.1002/wcc.350

Moritz Wandres, Espejo, A., Tomasi Sovea, Sapolu Tetoa, Faatasi Malologa, Webb, A., Lewis, J., Lee, G., & Hervé Damlamian. (2024). A National-Scale Coastal Flood Hazard Assessment for the Atoll Nation of Tuvalu. *Earth's Future*, *12*(4). https://doi.org/10.1029/2023ef003924