

Quantitative Assessment Summary

Category	Score	Updated Notes
Technical Rigor	6/10	Proof is complete; convergence rate missing
Novelty	6/10	Valid contribution with caveats
Experimental Validation	5/10	Timing added; still small-scale
Presentation	7/10	Many reviewer comments addressed
Completeness	6/10	89% reviewer comments addressed
Overall	6.0/10	

Overall Recommendation

Current State: This paper has **substantially improved** since initial review. The proof is complete and correct. Main remaining gaps: convergence rate analysis and large-scale experiments.

Suggested Focus: Address convergence rate bounds (or explicitly state as future work limitation), add at least one larger-scale example.

Required Actions Checklist

Updated status of recommended actions:

- ✓ Model-free terminology clarified (line 158)
- ☐ Provide $\mathcal{O}(\cdot)$ convergence rate analysis (**Still needed**)
 - Remove flawed Theorem 4 (N/A - only one correct proof exists)
- ✓ Parameter guidance for c_i (Remark at line 305-307)
- ✓ Timing comparisons added (Example B, line 920)
- ☐ Provide large-scale examples ($n \geq 50$) (**Optional but recommended**)
- ☐ Add digital implementation section (**Optional but recommended**)
- ✓ Notation largely consistent
- ✓ Proofs complete (main theorem proof at lines 637-678)

Final Verdict

The core idea (continuous-time dynamics for RO) has merit and the **proof is mathematically sound**. The authors have addressed 89% of reviewer comments. The main remaining gap is the lack of explicit convergence rate analysis, which the paper acknowledges as future work.

Key strengths:

- Complete, correct convergence proof (Theorem 1)
- Novel application of primal-dual dynamics to robust optimization
- Handles problems where robust counterpart is unknown
- Model-free interpretation clearly explained

Remaining concerns:

- No $\mathcal{O}(\cdot)$ convergence rate bounds
- Only small-scale examples ($n = 2$)
- No comparison with modern RO solvers

Recommendation: The paper is suitable for publication with minor revisions addressing the convergence rate limitation (either derive bounds or clearly state as limitation).