

**GLBL 392a-7535a: Intelligence, Espionage, and American Foreign Policy
Fall 2024**

**Tuesday and Thursday, 11:35am-12:50pm
WLH Room 201, Sudler Hall**

Edward M. Wittenstein

46 Hillhouse Ave.

edward.wittenstein@yale.edu

Assistant: enit.colon@yale.edu

Office hours on Fridays, 11:00am-3:00pm, and by appointment

Teaching Fellows & Section Times:

Section A: Monday, 10:30am-11:20am (richard.peay@yale.edu)
Section B: Monday, 5:00-5:50pm (sarah.myers@yale.edu)
Section C: Tuesday, 10:30-11:20am (hojoon.kim@yale.edu)
Section D: Tuesday, 2:30-3:20pm (sinclair.im@yale.edu)
Section E: Tuesday, 3:30-4:20pm (sinclair.im@yale.edu)
Section F: Wednesday, 3:30-4:20pm (jarek.neczypor@yale.edu)
Section G: Thursday, 4:30-5:20pm (hojoon.kim@yale.edu)
Section H: Wednesday, 10:30-11:20am (jessica.tomlinson@yale.edu)

Note: Sections begin the week of September 9. Additional sections may be added, or alterations made to the times, based on enrollment demand.

Course Description:

This course examines the discipline, theory, and practice of intelligence, as well as its contribution to American foreign policy and national security decision-making. Drawing from a variety of academic and declassified government sources in the fields of history, law, political science, and psychology, the course aims to equip students with an understanding of the tools available to analyze international affairs and to effectively communicate that analysis to senior policymakers. After exploring the definition of intelligence and enduring principles gleaned from historical accounts, the class will focus on the development, organization, and function of the eighteen agencies and organizations within the Executive Branch that comprise the U.S. Intelligence Community (IC). Case studies of intelligence “successes” and “failures” from World War II to the present highlight both the capabilities and limits of intelligence collection, analysis, dissemination, covert action, and counterintelligence. Particular attention will be paid to the reorganization of the IC that followed the 9/11 attacks and the failure to find weapons of mass destruction (WMD) in Iraq, as well as the intelligence challenges posed by terrorism, cyberattacks, WMD proliferation, great power competition, and other emerging threats. This course also will reflect on the legal and ethical dimensions of intelligence; the role of congressional oversight; and the tensions between government secrecy, transparency, and personal privacy in a democracy.

Expectations:

This course meets in-person. On occasion, lectures, slides, and other media may be pre-recorded and uploaded to Canvas as required homework prior to in-person class. To the extent possible, class-time will be devoted to live discussion, as well as special sessions with guest visitors. All live class sessions also will be recorded and shared on Canvas afterwards.

Academic Honesty and Artificial Intelligence Tools:

Students who engage in plagiarism or other forms of academic dishonesty will be referred to the Yale University Executive Committee. This includes submission of the same material for a grade in more than one course, or using an artificial intelligence tool such as ChatGPT without proper acknowledgement. You are committing plagiarism if you copy the work of another person and turn it in as your own, or if you pass off AI-generated text as your own. The source of the material does not matter – a book, an article, material off the web, another student's paper – all constitute plagiarism unless the source of the work is fully identified and credited. It is important when using a phrase, a distinct idea, concept, a sentence, or sentences from another source to credit explicitly that source either in the text, a footnote, or endnote. Plagiarism is a violation of academic and personal integrity, and carries extremely serious consequences. **Students in this course consent to have their work checked against plagiarism and AI detection software.**

Course Requirements and Grading:

1. ***Intelligence Memorandum (15%):*** Each student will be assigned to write a short (1000-word) intelligence memorandum requested by a senior official, and to discuss the memo and its relation to assigned readings during section. The subject of the memorandum will be determined by world events taking place during the semester, and should incorporate key concepts from the assigned readings. **Students will be informed of their topic the prior Sunday, one week in advance, and they will be required to submit the memo via email by no later than 5:00pm Sunday, prior to discussion section during the following week.** The memo will then be posted online to read before section. The drafter should be prepared to briefly present the memo and answer questions during section.
2. ***Take Home Mid-Term Essays (30%):*** A 72-hour take-home, open-book, mid-term will be available at 1:00pm on Saturday, October 12, and due at 1:00pm on Tuesday, October 15, in lieu of class. The mid-term will consist of a series of short essays, and students can access online course materials.
3. ***Take Home Final Essays or Final Paper (35%):*** Students have the option of either (1) a 72-hour, open-book, take-home final exam, which will consist of a series of short essays; or (2) a 4000-word final paper. **The exam will be available on Thursday, December 12 at 2:00pm, and due on Sunday, December 15 at 2:00pm.** The paper should address some aspect of intelligence and its relationship to national security, drawing upon class materials as well as outside sources. A mandatory research session with the Yale Library will be scheduled prior to fall break, in order for students to consider whether they wish to pursue

the paper option. For those opting for the paper, **a paper (800-1000 words, accounting for 10% of your final paper grade) is due at 11:00pm on Sunday, November 10. The final paper is due by Friday, December 15 at 2:00pm. Note that graduate students taking the course must choose the paper option and submit a final paper of 5000 words in length.**

4. ***Attendance, Participation, Practicum & Canvas Questions (20%):*** Active participation is essential to successful completion of the course, and student attendance is essential. In addition to the intelligence memo assignment, **students will be assigned to a day during the semester when, by 11:00pm two days prior to section, they post to Canvas three questions they have in reaction to lectures and the assigned readings.** Students are expected not only to complete the assigned readings but also to read the intelligence memoranda and Canvas questions of their peers. In addition, students are expected to participate and contribute to in class practicums, including simulation exercises. **Students with subpar attendance and/or participation will not receive an “A” in this course.**

Core Readings:

The following books should be bought from either the Yale Bookstore, an online vendor, or accessed online at the links provided. Items on the syllabus marked ‘**’ will be posted on Canvas. The Yale Bookstore links can be viewed here:

- Richards Heuer, *The Psychology of Intelligence Analysis* (Center for the Study of Intelligence, 1999)**
- Mark M. Lowenthal, *Intelligence: From Secrets to Policy* (9th ed., Thousand Oaks.: CQ Press, 2022) [**Note: Lowenthal’s 8th Edition is an acceptable, less expensive substitute**]
- *Report of the Commission on the Intelligence Capabilities of the United States Regarding Weapons of Mass Destruction* (Washington, D.C.: Mar. 31, 2005), available at <http://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/GPO-WMD/content-detail.html> [“WMD Commission Report”]
- *The 9/11 Commission Report: Final Report of the National Commission on Terrorist Attacks Upon the United States* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2004), available at <http://www.9-11commission.gov/report/911Report.pdf> [“9/11 Commission Report”]
- Roberta Wohlstetter, *Pearl Harbor: Warning and Decision* (California: Stanford University Press, 1962), available online at <http://orbis.library.yale.edu/vwebv/holdingsInfo?searchId=6198&recCount=50&recPointer=5&bibId=6211202>

Other Intelligence Resources

- The Yale Library has created an online research guide for our course, which can be accessed here: <http://guides.library.yale.edu/content.php?pid=518596&sid=4267378>.

- *The Literature of Intelligence: A Bibliography of Materials, with Essays, Reviews, and Comments* (J. Ransom Clark, Ed.). This excellent, wide-ranging online bibliography of intelligence literature is available at <http://intellit.muskingum.edu/index.html>.
- The CIA's Center for the Study of Intelligence publishes unclassified articles at www.cia.gov/csi.
- The Federation of American Scientists (www.fas.org/irp), the National Security Archive (www.gwu.edu/nsarchiv), www.intelligence.gov, and the Intelligence and National Security Alliance (<http://www.insaonline.org/>) also maintain useful websites on intelligence topics.

Part I. Definitions & Enduring Principles

Thursday, August 29, Lecture #1: What Is "Intelligence?" Reflecting on Ukraine and Russia's Interference in the 2016 American Presidential Election

- Plato, "Allegory of the Cave," in *The Republic* VII, 514a-518d (G.M.A. Grube, Trans.) (Indianapolis: Hackett, 1992), 186-190**
- "Assessing Russian Activities and Intentions in Recent US Elections," Intelligence Community Assessment (January 6, 2017)**
- John Negroponte and Edward Wittenstein, "We Need a New Intelligence Agenda to Navigate a Post Coronavirus World," *USA Today* (March 30, 2020)**
- Greg Miller and Catherine Belton, "Russia's Spies Misread Ukraine and Mislead Kremlin as War Loomed," *The New York Times* (August 19, 2022)**

Tuesday, September 3, Lecture #2, Why Do We Have Intelligence Agencies? What is the "Intelligence Community," the "Intelligence Process," & "Intelligence Failure"?

- Lowenthal, *Intelligence*, Chapters 1-4**
- Richard Betts, "Analysis, War & Decision: Why Intelligence Failures Are Inevitable," *World Politics* 31(2) (October 1978), 61-89**

Part II. Strategic Warning & Surprise Attack

Thursday, September 5, Lecture #3: The Trojan Horse & Pearl Harbor

- Roberta Wohlstetter, *Pearl Harbor: Warning and Decision* (California: Stanford University Press, 1962), **Read only:** Introduction, Chapters 1, 3-4 & 7**
- Charles Hill, *Grand Strategies: Literature, Statecraft, and World Order* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), Chapter 1, "The Trojan Horse: From Stratagem to World System," 29-41**

Tuesday, September 10, Lecture #4: 9/11, the 9/11 Commission, and the Collapse of Afghanistan

- 9/11 Commission Report, Chapters 2-8, 11**
- Douglas London, "Afghanistan, Not an Intelligence Failure: Something Worse," *Just Security* (August 18, 2021)**

Thursday, September 12, Lecture #5: The Cuban Missile Crisis & Future Strategic Surprise

- Roberta Wohlstetter, “Cuba and Pearl Harbor: Hindsight and Foresight,” *Foreign Affairs* (43)(4) (July 1965), 691-707**
- Amy Zegart, “The Cuban Missile Crisis as an Intelligence Failure,” *Hoover Institution* (October 2, 2012)**

Part III. The Iraq Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMD) Fiasco & The Road to “Intelligence Reform”

Tuesday, September 17, Lecture #6: The Iraq WMD Debacle and the Creation of the Director of National Intelligence, 20 Years Later, Part I

- WMD Commission Report, Chapter 1 (Iraq)**
- Malfrid Braut-Hegghammer, “Cheater’s Dilemma: Iraq, Weapons of Mass Destruction, and Path to War,” *International Security* (45)(1) (2020), 51-89**
- CIA Studies in Intelligence Special Issue (article forthcoming)

Thursday, September 19, Lecture #7: The Iraq WMD Debacle and the Creation of the Director of National Intelligence, 20 Years Later, Part II (*Continued*)

Tuesday, September 24, Lecture #8: The Post-9/11 CIA: Special Conversation with The Honorable [Andrew Makridis](#), Former CIA Chief Operating Officer and Schmidt Senior Fellow, Yale Jackson School of Global Affairs

- William Burns, “[Spycraft and Statecraft](#),” *Foreign Affairs* (Jan. 30, 2024)
- William Burns and Richard Moore, “[Intelligence Partnership Helps the US and UK Stay Ahead in an Uncertain World](#),” *Financial Times* (Sept. 7, 2024)

Thursday, September 26, Lecture #9: Class Does Not Meet: Optional Virtual Observation of the AI+Energy Summit

- Registration: <https://web.cvent.com/event/b4d8d16b-46bb-401b-b686-fb2ec4e19466/summary?RefId=Waitlist>

Tuesday, October 1, Lecture #10: Legal Challenges Confronting the Intelligence Community: Special Conversation with the Honorable [Kate Heinzelman](#), General Counsel of the Central Intelligence Agency

- William Burns, “[Spycraft and Statecraft](#),” *Foreign Affairs* (Jan. 30, 2024)
- William Burns and Richard Moore, “[Intelligence Partnership Helps the US and UK Stay Ahead in an Uncertain World](#),” *Financial Times* (Sept. 7, 2024)

Part IV. Challenges in Intelligence Analysis

Thursday, October 3, Lecture #11: (Mis)Understanding Iran: From the Iranian Revolution to the Nuclear Deal

- Robert Jervis, *Why Intelligence Fails* (“Failing to See that the Shah Was in Danger”)**
- Kali Robinson, “[What is the Iran Nuclear Deal?](#)” *Council on Foreign Relations* (Last updated April 28, 2022)

- Eric Brewer, "[Iran on the Nuclear Brink](#)," *Foreign Affairs* (June 17, 2022)

Tuesday, October 8, Lecture #12: "Hard Targets," Denial & Deception: Syria & North Korea

- Richards Heuer, *The Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*, Parts I (Chapters 1-3)**
- David Makovsky, "The Silent Strike," *New Yorker* (September 17, 2012)**
- Joint Statement of President Donald J. Trump of the United States of America and Chairman Kim Jong Un of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea at the Singapore Summit (June 12, 2018)**
- Intelligence Matters Podcast, "Former CIA Analyst and Weapons Expert Maja Lehnus on Thwarting Syria's Nuclear Program," *available at* <https://podcasts.apple.com/us/podcast/former-cia-analyst-weapons-expert-maja-lehnus-on-thwarting/id1286906615?i=1000524113340>.
- Sue Mi Terry and Stephen Sestanovich "[Russia Struck a Defense Pact With North Korea. What Does It Mean?](#)," *Council on Foreign Relations* (June 19, 2024)
- *The Soufan Center* "[IntelBrief: Axis of Anxiety: Russia and North Korea's New Treaty Stirs Regional Tensions](#)," (June 27, 2024)

Thursday, October 10, Lecture #13: Reflections on Israel and Strategic Surprise

- Amy Zegart, "[Israel's Intelligence Disaster: How the Security Establishment Could Have Underestimated the Hamas Threat](#)," *Foreign Affairs* (October 11, 2023)
- Ronen Bergman and Patrick Kingsley, "[How Israel's Feared Security Services Failed to Stop Hamas's Attack](#)," *The New York Times* (October 10, 2023)
- Daniel Byman, "[Experts React: Assessing the Israeli Intelligence and Potential Policy Failure](#)," *Center for Strategic and International Studies* (October 25, 2023)

[Take-Home Mid-Term Essays Available at 1:00pm Saturday, October 12]

Tuesday, October 15, Lecture #14: 72-Hour Take-Home Mid-Term Essays Due at 1:00pm

[FALL RECESS]

Part V. Intelligence Implications of Great Power Competition

Tuesday, October 22, Lecture #15: Artificial Intelligence and Great Power Technology Competition

- **Special Competitive Studies Project**, [Intelligence Innovation: Repositioning for Future Technology Competition](#) (April 2024)
- Hanna Dohmen and Jacob Feldgoise "[A Bigger Yard, A Higher Fence: Understanding BIS's Expanded Controls on Advanced Computing Exports](#)," *Center for Security and Emerging Technology* (December 2024)
- Ana Swanson and Claire Fu "[With Smugglers and Front Companies, China Is Skirting American A.I. Bans](#)," *The New York Times* (August 4, 2024)

Thursday, October 24, Lecture #16: Defense and Diplomacy in the Indo-Pacific: Special Conversation with [Dr. Victor Cha](#), Senior Vice President for Asia and Korea Chair, Center for Strategic and International Studies

Part VI. Human Intelligence, Covert Action & Targeted Killings

Tuesday, October 29, Lecture #17: Paramilitary Operations, Clandestine Operations & Counterinsurgency

- Lowenthal, *Intelligence*, Chapter 8
- Authorization for the Use of Military Force (“AUMF”), Pub. L. 107-40, 115 Stat. 224 (September 18, 2001)**
- Video: *The Road To Abbottabad: Ten Years After* (September 11, 2020)**
- Nicholas Schmidle, “Getting Bin Laden: What Happened that Night in Abbottabad,” *New Yorker* (August 8, 2011)**

Thursday, October 31, Lecture #18: The Rise of the Drones: Implications for Ukraine & Beyond

- President Barak Obama, Remarks at the National Defense University (May 23, 2013)**
- Ben Aris, “[Ukraine is losing the drone war,](#)” *Intellinews*, (27th May 2024)
- Mark Milley and Eric Schmidt, “[America Isn’t Ready for the Wars of the Future,](#)” *Foreign Affairs* (Sept./Oct. 2024)

Tuesday, November 5, Lecture #19: Senate Torture Report: CIA’s Rendition, Detention & Interrogation Program

- Senate Select Committee on Intelligence, *Committee Study on the Central Intelligence Agency’s Detention and Interrogation Program* (2015)** [[Read Only Overview and Key Findings](#)]
- CIA Response to the Senate Committee’s Report** [[Read Only Overview and Key Findings](#)]
- “Ex-CIA Directors: Interrogations Saved Lives,” *Wall Street Journal* (December 10, 2014)**
- Bob Kerrey, “Partisan Torture Report Fails America,” *USA Today* (December 10, 2014)**

Part VII. Technical & Cyber Intelligence

Thursday, November 7, Lecture #20: Understanding the NSA & Snowden Revelations

- Lowenthal, *Intelligence*, Chapter 13
- *Report and Recommendations of the President’s Review Group on Intelligence and Communications Technologies* (December 2013) ([Executive Summary & Recommendations Only](#))**
- Senator Ron Wyden, “[Facts about Electronic Surveillance Reform,](#)” *Just Security* (2024).
- Office of the Director of National Intelligence, “[Section 702 Overview,](#)” (2024)

[REMINDER: Paper Proposal Due at 11:00pm on Sunday, November 10, for students pursuing paper option]

Tuesday, November 12, Lecture #21: Special Conversation with [Nand Mulchandani](#), Chief Technology Officer, Central Intelligence Agency

Thursday, November 14, Lecture #22: Understanding the NSA & Snowden Revelations (Continued)

- Lowenthal, *Intelligence*, Chapter 13
- *Report and Recommendations of the President's Review Group on Intelligence and Communications Technologies* (December 2013) (**Executive Summary & Recommendations Only**)**
- Senator Ron Wyden, "[Facts about Electronic Surveillance Reform](#)," *Just Security* (2024).
- Office of the Director of National Intelligence, "[Section 702 Overview](#)," (2024)

Tuesday, November 19, Lecture #23: Cyberwarfare, Disinformation, and Influence Operations

- Ralph Langner, "[To Kill a Centrifuge: A Technical Analysis of What Stuxnet's Creators Tried to Achieve](#)," (November 2013)
- Gary P. Corn, "[Cyber Conflict: From Apathy to Action](#)," *American Bar Association* (January 2023)
- Josh Baughman and Peter Singer, "[China's Social Media Attacks are Part of a Larger 'Cognitive Warfare Campaign'](#)," *Defense One* (Oct. 17, 2023)
- Graphika, [DeepFake It Till You Make It](#) (Feb. 7, 2023)

Part VIII. Domestic Intelligence and Homeland Security

Thursday, November 21, Lecture #24: An American Mi-5? Encryption, "Going Dark" & Apple vs. FBI

- Leaner Kahney, "The FBI Wanted a Back Door to the iPhone. Tim Cook Said No," *Wired* (April 16, 2019)**
- Jim Baker, "Rethinking Encryption," *Lawfare* (October 22, 2019)**
- Ryan Tate-Mosley, "[The Fight Over the Future of Encryption](#)," *MIT Technology Review* (October 16, 2023)

[THANKSGIVING BREAK]

Tuesday, December 3, Lecture #25: DHS, State & Local Law Enforcement: "Homegrown" / Lone-Wolf" Terrorism & The Rise of White Nationalism

- Allison Smith, "How Radicalization to Terrorism Occurs in the United States," *National Institute of Justice* (June 2018)**
- FBI Director Christopher Wray, "The January 6 Insurrection, Domestic Terrorism, and Other Threats," Statement Before the Senate Judiciary Committee (March 2, 2021)**
Nathan Sales, Testimony Before the U.S. Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs, "[Domestic Extremism in America](#)" (Jun. 9, 2022)

- Joshua Kaplan, “[Armed and Undergrad: Inside the Turbulent, Secret, World of an American Militia](#),” *ProPublica* (August 2024)

Part X. The Trump Administration and the Intelligence Community

Thursday, December 5, Lecture #26: The Russia and Ukraine Investigations

- “The Steele Dossier”**
- U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Special Counsel, *Report on the Investigation into Russian Interference in the 2016 Presidential Election* (March 2019) [**READ ONLY Volume I, Introduction & Executive Summary**]**
- House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence, *The Trump Ukraine Impeachment Inquiry Report* (Dec. 2019)** [**READ ONLY Preface, Executive Summary & Key Findings of Fact**]**

[REMINDER: 72-Hour take-home final exam starts on Thursday, December 12, at 2:00pm, and is due on Sunday, December 15 at 2:00pm. The final paper option also is due on Sunday, December 15 at 2:00pm]