

Homework 3

1. (Questions on Page 8 of Lecture 8 slide)

- (i) Let Y_i be i.i.d. Bernoulli(p) variables. Then $\frac{1}{n}X_n \stackrel{d}{=} \bar{Y}_n$, the sample mean of Y_i 's. Letting

$$\tilde{g}(x) = \log \frac{x + b/n}{1 - x + a/n}, \quad \text{and}$$

$$g(x) = \log \frac{x}{1 - x} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n},$$

we have

$$\begin{aligned} \log \frac{p + \frac{b}{n}}{q + \frac{a}{n}} &= \log \frac{p + bh}{q + ah} \Big|_{h=1/n} = \log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) h + O(h^2) \Big|_{h=1/n} \\ &= \log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} + O(n^{-2}), \\ \tilde{g}(x) - g(x) &= \log \frac{x + \frac{b}{n}}{1 - x + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{x}{1 - x} - \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} \\ &= \log \frac{x + \frac{b}{n}}{1 - x + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{p + \frac{b}{n}}{q + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{x}{1 - x} + \log \frac{p}{q} + O(n^{-2}). \end{aligned}$$

Near $x = p$,

$$\begin{aligned} \log \frac{x + \frac{b}{n}}{1 - x + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{p + \frac{b}{n}}{q + \frac{a}{n}} &= \left(\frac{1}{p + \frac{b}{n}} + \frac{1}{q + \frac{a}{n}} \right) (x - p) \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{1}{(p + \frac{b}{n})^2} - \frac{1}{(q + \frac{a}{n})^2} \right) (x - p)^2 + O((x - p)^3), \\ \log \frac{x}{1 - x} - \log \frac{p}{q} &= \left(\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} \right) (x - p) - \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{1}{p^2} - \frac{1}{q^2} \right) (x - p)^2 + O((x - p)^3), \\ \therefore \log \frac{x + \frac{b}{n}}{1 - x + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{p + \frac{b}{n}}{q + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{x}{1 - x} + \log \frac{p}{q} & \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \left(\frac{1}{p + \frac{b}{n}} - \frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q + \frac{a}{n}} - \frac{1}{q} \right) (x - p) \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{2} \left[\left(\frac{1}{(p + \frac{b}{n})^2} - \frac{1}{p^2} \right) - \left(\frac{1}{(q + \frac{a}{n})^2} - \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \right] (x - p)^2 + O((x - p)^3) \\
&= -\frac{1}{n} \left(\frac{b}{p(p + \frac{b}{n})} + \frac{a}{q(q + \frac{a}{n})} \right) (x - p) \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{1}{n} \left(\frac{2bp + \frac{b^2}{n}}{p^2(p + \frac{b}{n})^2} - \frac{2aq + \frac{a^2}{n}}{q^2(q + \frac{a}{n})^2} \right) (x - p)^2 + O((x - p)^3) \\
&= O(n^{-1})(x - p) + O(n^{-1})(x - p)^2 + O((x - p)^3)
\end{aligned}$$

so that

$$\begin{aligned}
\tilde{g}(x) - g(x) &= \log \frac{x + \frac{b}{n}}{1 - x + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{p + \frac{b}{n}}{q + \frac{a}{n}} - \log \frac{x}{1 - x} + \log \frac{p}{q} + O(n^{-2}) \\
&= O(n^{-1})(x - p) + O(n^{-1})(x - p)^2 + O((x - p)^3) + O(n^{-2}).
\end{aligned}$$

Note the CLT implies that $\sqrt{n}(\bar{Y}_n - p)$ has $\mathcal{N}(0, pq)$ as the asymptotic distribution, which implies $\bar{Y}_n - p = O_p(n^{-1/2})$. Thus,

$$\begin{aligned}
&\tilde{g}(\bar{Y}_n) - g(\bar{Y}_n) \\
&= O(n^{-1})O_p(n^{-1/2}) + O(n^{-1})O_p(n^{-1}) + O_p(n^{-3/2}) + O(n^{-2}) \\
&= O_p(n^{-3/2}),
\end{aligned}$$

which is $o_p(1/n)$. Now we have

$$\begin{aligned}
g(\bar{Y}_n) &= \left[\log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} \right] + \frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{n}} \left(\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} \right) Z_n \\
&\quad + \frac{\sigma^2}{2n} \left(-\frac{1}{p^2} + \frac{1}{q^2} \right) Z_n^2 + o_p(1),
\end{aligned}$$

where $\sigma^2 = pq$ and $Z_n = \sqrt{n}(\bar{Y}_n - p)/\sigma$. Thus, using $\tilde{g}(\frac{1}{n}X_n) - g(\frac{1}{n}X_n) \stackrel{d}{=} \tilde{g}(\bar{Y}_n) - g(\bar{Y}_n) = o_p(1)$,

$$\begin{aligned}
\log \frac{X_n + b}{n - X_n + a} &= \left[\log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} \right] \\
&\quad + \frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{n}} \left(\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} \right) \tilde{Z}_n + \frac{\sigma^2}{2n} \left(-\frac{1}{p^2} + \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \tilde{Z}_n^2 + o_p(1)
\end{aligned}$$

where $\sigma^2 = pq$ and $\tilde{Z}_n := \sqrt{n}(\frac{1}{n}X_n - p)/\sigma$. Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} W_n &= \left[\log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} \right] + \frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{n}} \left(\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} \right) \tilde{Z}_n + \frac{\sigma^2}{2n} \left(-\frac{1}{p^2} + \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \tilde{Z}_n^2 \\ &= \left[\log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} \right] \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} \right) \left(\frac{1}{n}X_n - p \right) + \frac{1}{2} \left(-\frac{1}{p^2} + \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \left(\frac{1}{n}X_n - p \right)^2 \end{aligned}$$

could be an answer.

- (ii) Using the limit theorem (7-i) in the lecture note to $g(\bar{Y}_n) \stackrel{d}{=} g(\frac{1}{n}X_n) = W_n + o_p(n^{-1})$,

$$\begin{aligned} EW_n &= g(p) + \frac{\sigma^2}{2n} g''(p) \\ &= \log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b}{p} - \frac{a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n} + \frac{pq}{2n} \left(-\frac{1}{p^2} + \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \\ &= \log \frac{p}{q} + \left(\frac{b - \frac{1}{2}}{p} + \frac{\frac{1}{2} - a}{q} \right) \frac{1}{n}, \\ \text{Var } W_n &= \frac{1}{n} (g'(p))^2 \sigma^2 + o_p(n^{-1}) \\ &= \frac{pq}{n} \left(\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} \right)^2 + o_p(n^{-1}) \\ &= \frac{pq}{n} \left(\frac{p+q}{pq} \right)^2 + o_p(n^{-1}) \\ &= \frac{1}{n} \cdot \frac{1}{pq} + o_p(n^{-1}). \quad (\because p+q=1) \end{aligned}$$

- 2.** As in the lecture material, with the initial unbiased estimator $T_0 = \mathbf{1}_{(X_1 \leq u)}$, the Rao-Blackwellization of T_0 given the CSS $(\bar{X}, \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})^2)'$ is:

$$\begin{aligned} &T_1 \left(\bar{x}, \sum_i (x_i - \bar{x})^2 \right) \\ &= P \left(X_1 \leq u \mid \bar{X} = \bar{x}, \sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2 = \sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2 \right) \\ &= P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} \leq \frac{u - \bar{x}}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \mid \bar{X} = \bar{x}, \sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2 = \sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2 \right) \\ &= P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} \leq \frac{u - \bar{x}}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right). \quad (\text{Basu's theorem}) \end{aligned}$$

First of all, since $(X_1 - \bar{X})(\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2)^{-1/2}$ does not depend on the values of μ and σ^2 , without loss of generality, we may assume $\mu = 0$ and $\sigma^2 = 1$. Here, $X_1 - \bar{X}$ follows a normal distribution, where the mean is $E(X_1 - \bar{X}) = 0$ and the variance is

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Var}(X_1 - \bar{X}) &= \text{Var}\left(\frac{n-1}{n}X_1 - \frac{1}{n}\sum_{j=2}^n X_j\right) \\ &= \left(\frac{n-1}{n}\right)^2 + \sum_{j=2}^n \frac{1}{n^2} = \frac{n-1}{n}.\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, $\sqrt{\frac{n}{n-1}}(X_1 - \bar{X}) \sim \mathcal{N}(0, 1)$, and hence $\Xi_1 := \frac{n}{n-1}(X_1 - \bar{X})^2 \sim \chi_1^2$. Since

$$\Xi_1 + \Xi_2 := \sum_{j=1}^n (X_j - \bar{X})^2 \sim \chi_{n-1}^2,$$

we have

$$\frac{\frac{n}{n-1}(X_1 - \bar{X})^2}{\sum_{j=1}^n (X_j - \bar{X})^2} = \frac{\Xi_1}{\Xi_1 + \Xi_2} \sim \text{Beta}\left(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{n-2}{2}\right)$$

since $\Xi_2 = -\frac{1}{n-1}(X_1 - \bar{X})^2 + \sum_{j=2}^n (X_j - \bar{X})^2 \sim \chi_{n-2}^2$.

Note that $-X_1, \dots, -X_n$ has the same property as X_1, \dots, X_n , yielding

$$\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}} \stackrel{d}{=} \frac{(-X_1) - (-\bar{X})}{\sqrt{\sum((-X_i) - (-\bar{X}))^2}} = -\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}}.$$

Hence,

$$\begin{aligned}&P\left(\left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}}\right)^2 > \left(\frac{u - \bar{x}}{\sqrt{\sum(x_i - \bar{x})^2}}\right)^2\right) \\ &= P\left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}} > \frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum(x_i - \bar{x})^2}}\right) + P\left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}} < -\frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum(x_i - \bar{x})^2}}\right) \\ &= P\left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}} > \frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum(x_i - \bar{x})^2}}\right) + P\left(-\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}} > \frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum(x_i - \bar{x})^2}}\right) \\ &= 2P\left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum(X_i - \bar{X})^2}} > \frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum(x_i - \bar{x})^2}}\right)\end{aligned}$$

$$= 2P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} < -\frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right).$$

The probability in the first line of the equation above can be evaluated as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} & P \left(\left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} \right)^2 > \left(\frac{u - \bar{x}}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right)^2 \right) \\ &= P \left(\frac{\frac{n}{n-1} (X_1 - \bar{X})^2}{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2} > \frac{\frac{n}{n-1} (u - \bar{x})^2}{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2} \right) \\ &= 1 - \text{cdf}_{\text{Beta}(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{n-2}{2})} \left(\frac{\frac{n}{n-1} (u - \bar{x})^2}{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2} \right), \end{aligned}$$

When $u \geq \bar{x}$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} & P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} \leq \frac{u - \bar{x}}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right) \\ &= 1 - P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} > \frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \text{cdf}_{\text{Beta}(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{n-2}{2})} \left(\frac{\frac{n}{n-1} (u - \bar{x})^2}{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2} \right). \end{aligned}$$

When $u \leq \bar{x}$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} & P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} \leq \frac{u - \bar{x}}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right) \\ &= P \left(\frac{X_1 - \bar{X}}{\sqrt{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2}} < -\frac{|u - \bar{x}|}{\sqrt{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2}} \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2} \text{cdf}_{\text{Beta}(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{n-2}{2})} \left(\frac{\frac{n}{n-1} (u - \bar{x})^2}{\sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2} \right). \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$T_1 = \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \text{sgn}(u - \bar{X}) \cdot \text{cdf}_{\text{Beta}(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{n-2}{2})} \left(\frac{\frac{n}{n-1} (u - \bar{X})^2}{\sum (X_i - \bar{X})^2} \right)$$

and T_1 is the unique UMVUE of $P(X_1 \leq u)$ due to Lehmann–Scheffé theorem.

6.17. Note that

$$P_\theta(X_1 = x_1, \dots, X_n = x_n) = \prod_{j=1}^n \theta(1-\theta)^{x_j-1} = \theta^n(1-\theta)^{\sum_j x_j - n}.$$

Therefore, by the factorization theorem, $\sum X_i$ is sufficient for θ .

$\sum X_i$ follows the following distribution:

$$P\left(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i = k\right) = \binom{k-1}{k-n} \theta^n (1-\theta)^{k-n} \quad (k = n, n+1, \dots).$$

When $n = 1$, the equation holds with $P(X_1 = k) = \theta(1-\theta)^{k-1}$. The induction step is proceeded as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} P\left(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i = k\right) &= \sum_{r=1}^{k-n+1} P\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n-1} X_i = k-r, X_n = r\right) \\ &= \sum_{r=1}^{k-n+1} \binom{k-r-1}{k-r-n+1} \theta^{n-1} (1-\theta)^{k-r-n+1} \theta(1-\theta)^{r-1} \\ &= \theta^n (1-\theta)^{k-n} \sum_{r=1}^{k-n+1} \binom{k-r-1}{k-r-n+1} \\ &= \theta^n (1-\theta)^{k-n} \binom{k-1}{k-n}. \end{aligned}$$

Now, denote $T = \sum_{i=1}^n X_i$. Assume for any $0 < \theta < 1$,

$$E_\theta[g(T)] = \sum_{k=n}^{\infty} g(k) \binom{k-1}{k-n} \theta^n (1-\theta)^{k-n} = 0.$$

This implies $g(k) \binom{k-1}{k-n} (1-\theta)^k = 0$ for any $k \geq n$, i.e., $g(k) = 0$ for any $k \geq n$. Thus, $T = \sum X_i$ is complete.

6.30. (a) The sufficiency is proven using the factorization theorem:

$$f(x_1, \dots, x_n | \mu) = \prod_{j=1}^n e^{-(x_j - \mu)} \mathbf{1}_{(\mu < x_j)} = e^{n\mu} \mathbf{1}_{(\mu < x_{(1)})} \cdot \exp\left(-\sum_{j=1}^n x_j\right)$$

where $x_{(1)} = \min_{1 \leq j \leq n} x_j$.

To see the completeness, assume for any μ ,

$$Eg(X_{(1)}|\mu) = \int_{\mu}^{\infty} g(x) n e^{-n(x-\mu)} dx = 0.$$

Then we have $g(x) n e^{-n(x-\mu)} = 0$ a.e., that is, $g(x) = 0$ a.e. Thus $g(X_{(1)}) = 0$ a.s., for any μ . This shows the completeness.

- (b) Since the common distribution of X_i 's is in a location parameter family, S^2 is an ancillary statistic, as $X_j - \bar{X} = (X_j + a) - (\bar{X} + a)$ is independent of μ . Therefore, since $X_{(1)}$ is a CSS and S^2 is ancillary, they are independent due to Basu's theorem.

7.37. (a)

$$\begin{aligned} d_P^r(cx_1, \dots, cx_n) &= \frac{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+r-1} \prod_{i=1}^n f(tc x_i) dt}{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+2r-1} \prod_{i=1}^n f(tc x_i) dt} \\ &= c^r \frac{\int_0^{\infty} (ct)^{n+r-1} \prod_{i=1}^n f(ct \cdot x_i) c dt}{\int_0^{\infty} (ct)^{n+2r-1} \prod_{i=1}^n f(ct \cdot x_i) c dt} \\ &= c^r \frac{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+r-1} \prod_{i=1}^n f(tx_i) dt}{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+2r-1} \prod_{i=1}^n f(tx_i) dt} \\ &= c^r d_P^r(x_1, \dots, x_n). \end{aligned}$$

- (b) In this case, $f(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp(-x^2)$ with $r = 2$. Since $\int_0^{\infty} t^{z-1} e^{-st} dt = s^{-z} \Gamma(z)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} d_P^2(x_1, \dots, x_n) &= \frac{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+1} (2\pi)^{-n/2} \exp(-t^2 \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2) dt}{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+3} (2\pi)^{-n/2} \exp(-t^2 \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2) dt} \\ &= \frac{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+1} \exp(-t^2 \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2) dt}{\int_0^{\infty} t^{n+3} \exp(-t^2 \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2) dt} \\ &= \frac{\int_0^{\infty} u^{n/2} \exp(-u \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2) du}{\int_0^{\infty} u^{(n/2)+1} \exp(-u \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2) du} \\ &= \frac{(\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2)^{-(n/2)-1} \Gamma((n/2) + 1)}{(\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2)^{-(n/2)-2} \Gamma((n/2) + 2)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2}{(n/2) + 1} = \frac{2}{n+2} \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2. \end{aligned}$$

(c) In this case, $f(x) = \exp(-x)$ with $\sigma = \beta$ and $r = 1$.

$$\begin{aligned} d_P^1(x_1, \dots, x_n) &= \frac{\int_0^\infty t^n \prod_{i=1}^n \exp(-tx_i) dt}{\int_0^\infty t^{n+1} \prod_{i=1}^n \exp(-tx_i) dt} \\ &= \frac{\int_0^\infty t^n \exp(-t \sum x_i) dt}{\int_0^\infty t^{n+1} \exp(-t \sum x_i) dt} \\ &= \frac{(\sum x_i)^{-n-1} \Gamma(n+1)}{(\sum x_i)^{-n-2} \Gamma(n+2)} \\ &= \frac{1}{n+1} \sum_i x_i. \end{aligned}$$

(d) In this case, $f(x) = \mathbf{1}_{(0 < x < 1)}$ with $\sigma = \theta$ and $r = 1$.

$$\begin{aligned} d_P^1(x_1, \dots, x_n) &= \frac{\int_0^\infty t^n \prod_{i=1}^n \mathbf{1}_{(0 < tx_i < 1)} dt}{\int_0^\infty t^{n+1} \prod_{i=1}^n \mathbf{1}_{(0 < tx_i < 1)} dt} \\ &= \frac{\int_0^{1/\max_i x_i} t^n dt}{\int_0^{1/\max_i x_i} t^{n+1} dt} \\ &= \frac{n+2}{n+1} \max_i x_i. \end{aligned}$$

7.50. (a) $E[a\bar{X} + (1-a)cS] = aE\bar{X} + (1-a)E(cS) = a\theta + (1-a)\theta = \theta$.

(b) Note that the sample mean \bar{X} and the sample variance S^2 are independent provided the normality of the distribution. Thus, so are \bar{X} and S . Thus,

$$\text{Var}(a\bar{X} + (1-a)cS) = a^2 \text{Var}(\bar{X}) + (1-a)^2 c^2 \text{Var}(S).$$

Note that $(n-1)S^2/\theta^2 \sim \chi_{n-1}^2$, so that the mean of $\sqrt{(n-1)S^2/\theta^2}$ is as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} E \left[\sqrt{\frac{(n-1)S^2}{\theta^2}} \right] &= \int_0^\infty \sqrt{x} \frac{x^{(n-1)/2-1} e^{-x/2}}{2^{(n-1)/2} \Gamma((n-1)/2)} dx \\ &= \int_0^\infty \frac{x^{n/2-1} e^{-x/2}}{2^{n/2} \Gamma(n/2)} \frac{2^{n/2} \Gamma(n/2)}{2^{(n-1)/2} \Gamma((n-1)/2)} dx \\ &= \sqrt{2} \frac{\Gamma(n/2)}{\Gamma((n-1)/2)}. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Var}[S] &= \text{E}[S^2] - (\text{E}S)^2 \\ &= \theta^2 - \left(\sqrt{\frac{2}{n-1}} \theta \frac{\Gamma(n/2)}{\Gamma((n-1)/2)} \right)^2 \\ &= \theta^2 - (\theta/c)^2. \\ \therefore \text{Var}(a\bar{X} + (1-a)cS) &= a^2 \frac{\theta^2}{n} + (1-a)^2(c^2-1)\theta^2.\end{aligned}$$

At the value of a minimizing the variance of $a\bar{X} + (1-a)cS$, we have $2a \frac{\theta^2}{n} - 2(1-a)(c^2-1)\theta^2 = 0$, i.e.,

$$a = \frac{c^2 - 1}{\frac{1}{n} + c^2 - 1}.$$

(c) As the joint pdf of X_i 's is

$$\begin{aligned}f_\theta(x_1, \dots, x_n) &= (2\pi)^{-n/2} \theta^{-n} \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2\theta^2} \sum_i (x_i - \theta)^2 \right] \\ &= (2\pi)^{-n/2} \theta^{-n} \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2\theta^2} \sum x_i^2 + \frac{1}{\theta} \sum x_i - \frac{n}{2} \right] \\ &= (2\pi)^{-n/2} \theta^{-n} \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2\theta^2} ((n-1)s^2 + n\bar{x}^2) + \frac{1}{\theta} n\bar{x} - \frac{n}{2} \right]\end{aligned}$$

where $\bar{x} = \sum x_i$ and $s^2 = (n-1)^{-1} \sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2 = (n-1)^{-1} (\sum x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2)$, \bar{X}, S^2 is sufficient for θ . However, for

$$g(\bar{x}, s^2) = \frac{1}{n} s^2 - \frac{1}{n+1} (\bar{x})^2 \neq 0 \quad (\text{in an almost sure sense}),$$

we have

$$\text{E}_\theta[g(\bar{X}, S^2)] = \frac{1}{n} \text{E}S^2 - \frac{1}{n+1} \text{E}(\bar{X}^2) = \frac{1}{n} \theta^2 - \frac{1}{n+1} \left(\frac{\theta^2}{n} + \theta^2 \right) = 0.$$

This proves that (\bar{X}, S^2) is not a complete sufficient statistic for θ .