- 10. Farmland Sprawl 2 (HB 2807) Oppose. Allowed up to 20% of farmland to be developed in exchange for labeling 80% of the owner's land as Important Agricultural Land (IAL), Vote 3/4/08, Failed.
- 11. Development oversight (HB 2522) Oppose. Reduced public input and development decision deliberation by eliminating Land Use Commission approval for reclassifications up to 50 acres. Vote 2/29/08. Became law.

### Senate Bills (Bills 1 – 5 same as House)

- 6. GMO taro (SB 958) Support. Placed a 10-year moratorium on genetically modifying taro in Hawai'i. Vote 2/8/07. Failed.
- Peter Young DLNR (GM 276) Support. Nomination of Peter Young as Director of the Department of Land and Natural Resources. Young made many pro-environment decisions in the second half of his first term. Vote 4/24/07. Failed.
- 8. Recycling (SB 2841) Support. Makes recycling beverage containers more convenient by requiring large retailers to operate redemption centers. Vote 2/20/08. Failed.
- 9. Corporate donations (SB 2204) Oppose. Lifted the corporate contribution cap, increasing the amount of special interest money in local campaigns. Vote 3/4/08. Failed.
- 10. E-waste recycling (SB 2843) Support. Establishes an electronic waste recycling program to reduce the amount of toxic materials in island landfills and incinerators. Vote 4/29/08. Became law.

Photos by Nathan Yuen, www.hawaiianforest.com

### **July 2008**

### Sierra Club, Hawai'i Chapter



P.O. Box 2577 Honolulu, HI 96803

Phone: 808.538.6616 808.537.9019

Email: Hawaii.chapter@sierraclub.org

www.hi.sierraclub.org





# Who's advocating a sustainable Hawai'i at the State Capitol? The Sierra Club is keeping score.

This scorecard serves as a measure by which to compare the relative environmental actions of Hawaii's lawmakers. While the environmental record of any one legislator can only be judged by all of his or her actions, a scorecard provides a rough guide of each legislator's level of environmental stewardship as compared with other legislators. The scores were calculated based on a combination of floor votes on the Sierra Club's priority environmental bills an index of "other actions" taken by a legislator (bill introductions, committee votes, caucus advocacy, etc.). These "other actions" are separate from the recording of floor votes and are represented on the chart as turtles (\*\*). Each legislator's



score is a percentage of the maximum points (14 Senate; 15 House). Letter grades were then assigned based on the spread of scores. Bills and actions were selected based on breadth of issues, distinctions among legislators, and consis-SIERRA tency in actions. Senate and House scores are based on different measures, so comparisons between the two are not valid.

## "+" represents the pro-environment position

ab = absent	е рго-ептионне	iii p	osition		ans	,	1150	50e	cies	temp	/55	rawi	ino	DIM	. / kecking kecking
SENATE	District		Rating	Other A	dio	Green'	not asi	Super	solar solar	k arral	GMO	Poter	Secal	Corp	NOTES Strong environmental and good government advocate;
hara, Les, Jr. (D)	9 - Kaimuki - Palolo	Α	93%	****	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	Strong environmental and good government advocate; Introduced bill to allow use of clotheslines (SB 2933)
Hooser, Gary (D)	7 - Kauai and Niihau	Α-	86%	****	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	Strong and effective environmental advocate; used leadership role to forward significant green measures; introduced and advocated for numerous sustainability bills
Gabbard, Mike (D)	19 - Makakilo - Kapolei	Α-	86%	***	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	Generally supportive of environmental initiatives
Menor, Ron (D)	17 - Mililani	Α-	85%	****	+	+	-	+	+	+	ab	+	-	+	Strong clean energy, energy efficiency, and recycling advocate; effectively used Energy and Environment Chairmanship to forward major sustainability measures; prevented a bill to weaken the endangered species act from passing (SB 3103)
English, J. Kalani (D)	6 - Lanai - Molokai - Hana	Α-	85%	***	+	+	+	+	+	+	ab	+	-	+	Generally strong advocate; introduced measures to test for and examine the effects of depleted uranium.
Tsutsui, Shan (D)	4 - Waihee - Paia	B+	79%	***	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	Generally an environmental advocate
Hee, Clayton (D)	23 - Kahuku - Haiku Valley	B+	77%	***	+	+	-	+	+	+	1	ab	+	+	As Judiciary Chair, held a bill to allow catch inspections (HB 1499 "Finding Nemo" bill) but resurrected a shoreline protection bill (HB 1037) to increase development setbacks in anticipation of sea level rise; introduced and advocated for a measure to protect opihl from over-harvesting and helped fight bad land use bills
Fukunaga, Carol (D)	11 - Tantalus - Punchbowl	В	71%	***	+	+	-	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	Generally supportive of environmental initiatives
Kokubun, Russell (D)	2 - Keeau - Volcano - Kahuku	В	71%	**	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	As chair of Consumer Protection, didn't hear bills to increase the renewable energy standard (SB 2909) and to prohibit the expansion of coal in Hawaii (SB 1247); as Water Land Chair (2007), didn't forward bill to increase shoreline setback (HB 1037) and amended strong ag bill (HB 257); but vocal advocate against bad land use bill (SB 2646)
ge, David (D)	16 - Aiea Heights - Waimalu	B-	69%	***	+	+	-	+	ab	+	-	+	-	+	Generally supportive, but no distinguishing actions
∃aker, Rosalyn (D)	5 - Lahaina - Kihei	B-	64%	***	+	+	+	+	-	-	-	+	-	+	As Ways and Means Chair, supported key environmental items in the state budget and supported greenhouse gas cap (HB 226) at critical time, but didn't forward measures to reduce fossil fuel subsidy (HB 3213), provide clean energy funding from a carbon fee (HB 3444), or restrict the use of foam containers (SB 2629).
Nishihara, Clarence (D)	18 - Waipahu - Pearl City	B-	64%	***	+	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	Sympathetic to sustainability concerns, but not always priority
nouye, Lorraine (D)	1 - Hilo - Waimea	C+	62%	**	+	ab	-	+	-	-	+	+	+	+	No distinguishing actions
Kim, Donna Mercado (D)	14 - Kalihi - Halawa Valley	C+	58%	**	+	ab	-	+	+	+	-	ab	-	+	Pushed for food waste recycling measure.
Chun Oakland, Suzanne (D)	13 - Sand Island - Nuuanu	С	57%	**	+	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	Generally supportive of environmental initiatives, but did not distinguish
Hanabusa, Colleen (D)	21 - Nanakuli - Makaha	С	57%	**	+	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	As Senate President, cleared path for significant energy legislative (HB 226, SB 644), but also allowed bad land use bill to pass and pushed lifting corporate donation cap
Sakamoto, Norman (D)	15 - Moanalua - Pearl Harbor	С	57%	**	+	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	No distinguishing actions
Fokuda, Jill (D)	24 - Kaneohu MCAB - Kailua	С	57%	**	+	+	-	+	1	+	ı	+	ı	+	Introduced bill to create a "cooling off" period on farmland development (SB 2641), but sacrificed green credentials in advocating farmland urbanization bill (SB 2646) knowingly without necessary safeguards
Espero, Will (D)	20 - Waipahu - Ewa	C-	50%	**	+	+	-	+			1	+	-	+	No distinguishing actions
Taniguchi, Brian (D)	10 - Manoa - portion of Makiki	C-	50%	**	+	+	-	+	-	-	-	+	-	+	As chair of Consumer Protection in 2007, didn't hear measure to prohibit the expansion of coal in Hawali (SB 1247)
Bunda, Robert (D)	22 - Central, N. Shore Oahu	C-	46%	*	+	-	-	+	-	ab	+	+	-	+	No distinguishing actions
Hemmings, Fred (R)	25 - Lanikai - Hawaii Kai	D+	43%	**	+	-	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	-	Voted against measures to require that stores redeem beverage containers (SB 1702), conduct depieted uranium testing at Schofield Barracks (HB 1452), and increase carbon fee for environmental programs (SB 2932)
Whalen, Paul (R)	3 - Kona Coast	F	15%		-	ab	-	+	-	-	+	-	-	-	Voted against measures to expand bottle law (SB 1026), require that stores redeem beverage containers (SB 1702), allow use of clothesilines (SB 2933), and increase carbon fee for environmental programs (SB 2932)  Sole vote against net energy metering expansion (HB 2550);
Slom, Sam (R)	8 - Hawaii Kai - Kahala	F	14%		-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	-	voted against measures to expand bottle law (SB 1026), require that stores redeem beverage containers (SB 1702, HB 639), allow use of clotheslines (SB 2933), increase the efficiency of lights (SB 2842), increase carbon fee for environmental programs (SB 2932), and use recycling receptacles in state buildings (SB 651)
Trimble, Gordon (R)	12 - Ala Moana - Iwilei	F	14%		-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	-	Voted against measures to expand bottle law (SB 1026), require that stores redeem beverage containers (SB 1702, HB 639), increase the efficiency of lights (SB 2842), increase carbon fee for environmental programs (SB 2932), and place recycling receptacles in state buildings (SB 651)
	·	_		· <u></u>		_			_			_			

///st////st//st//st/

at strist /2	Nego /st		//	//	//										
high stant	Compro	S Lecter	Trittie	COTON	10,	S Liter	Secie	GE CO							
grand desperation of the control of	A Confidence	uperier's	Servitus S	d Solow	arman	odat Re	Specie Superie	Juge Ga	iteenho		Other Actions	Rating		District	HOUSE
1+1	+ +	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	****	100%	A+	14 - Hanalei - Kapaa	Morita, Hermina (D)
					•							87%	A	13 - Lanai- Molokai - Hana	Carroll, Mele (D)
1 1		+	•	+		+	+	+	+	+	****				
-		+	+	+	+	+	+	+	ab	+	****	86% 86%	A A	22 - Moiliili - McCully 18 - Kahala - Kullouou	Saiki, Scott K. (D)
+  _		+	+	-	+	+	+	+	ab	+	***				Berg, Lyla (D)
	+   +	+	-	ab	ab	+	+	-	+	+	****	85%	Α-	50 - Kaneohe MCAB - Kallua	Thielen, Cynthia (R)
	+   +	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	***	80%	Α-	25 - Tantalus - Makiki	Bellatti, Della Au (D)
- SHIMAE	- -	+	+	+	ab	+	+	+	+	+	***	79%	Α-	45 - Walanae - Makaha	Shimabukuro, Maile (D)
-	- -	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	***	73%	B+	6 - Kallua-Kona - Keauhou	Green, Josh (D)
+ HAN	-   +	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	**	73%	B+	4 - Keeau - Kalapana	Hanohano, Faye (D)
-		+	ab	+	-	+	+	+	ab	+	***	69%	В	36 - Pearl City - Manana 26 - Dowsett Highlands -	Takumi, Roy (D)
	.	+	+	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	***	67%	В	Makiki 31 - Moanalua Valley - Salt	Luke, Sylvia (D)
+		+	+	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	***	67%	В	Lake 11 - Keoneolo - portion of	Wakal, Glenn (D)
-   BE		+	+	+	ab	ab	ab	-	+	ab	***	64%	B-	Kihei	Bertram, Joe, III (D)
	.	+	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	***	60%	B-	38 - Mililani Mauka	Lee, Marilyn (D)
-  F		+	-	+	+	-	+	-	+	+	***	60%	B-	28 - Kakaako, Iwilei, Honolulu	Rhoads, Karl (D)
	ab -	ab	ab	ab	-	+	+	-	ab	+	***	60%	B-	34 - Pearl City	Takai, K. Mark (D)
- TA	-   -	+	+	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	**	60%	B-	1 - Hawi - Hilo	Takamine, Dwight (D)
		+	ab	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	57%	C+	42 - Portion of Walpahu - Ewa 39 - Wahlawa - Whitmore	Cabanilla, Rida (D)
-		+	-	-	-	<del>-</del>	+	+	+	+	***	53%	C+	Village	Oshiro, Marcus (D)
-  v		+	-	-	- -	ab	+	<u>-</u>	+	+	***	50%	C+	51 - Lanikai - Walmanalo	Waters, Tommy (D)
-   T		+	-	-	ab	-	+	+	+	+	**	50%	C+	15 - Hanamaulu - Lihue	Tokioka, James (D)
-		+	-	-	-	Ī.	+	-	+	+	***	47%	С	33 - Alea - Halawa Valley	Oshiro, Blake (D)
-		+	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	**	47%	С	7 - Makalawena - Walmea	Evans, Cindy (D)
- MCI		+	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	**	47%	С	10 - Kapalua - Kihel	McKelvey, Angus (D)
- NIS	_	+	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	**	47%	С	21 - Kalmuki - Kapahulu	Nishimoto, Scott (D)
-		+	-	-	ab	-	+	-	+	+	**	43%	C-	44 - Nanakuli - Lualualei	Awana, Karen (D)
- CAL	-   -	+	-	-	ab	-	+	-	+	+	**	43%	C-	24 - Manoa	Caldwell, Kirk (D)
- KARA	- -	+	-	-	ab	-	+	-	+	+	**	43%	C-	41 - Village Park - Waikele	Karamatsu, Jon Riki (D)
-	-   -	-	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	40%	C-	27 - Nuuanu, Puunui, Liliha	Ching, Corinne (R)
-  MA	- -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	40%	C-	29 - Sand Island - Kapalama	Manahan, Joey (D)
-	- -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	40%	C-	20 - St. Louis - Palolo	Say, Calvin (D)
-  Y	-   -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	40%	C-	37 - Waipahu - Mililani	Yamane, Ryan (D)
- YAM	_	+	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	40%	C-	12 - Pukalani - Ulupalakua	Yamashita, Kyle (D)
-  MA	-   -	ab	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	36%	D+	46 - North Shore Oahu 30 - Alewa Heights - Fort	Magaoay, Michael (D)
-	-   -	ab	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	36%	D+	Shafter	Mizuno, John (D)
-	- -	+	ab	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	36%	D+	2 - Portion of Hilo - Keaukaha	Chang, Jerry (D)
-   B		-	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	**	33%	D+	23 - Part Walkiki, Ala Moana	Brower, Tom (D)
-		+	-	-	-	-	+	-	-	+	**	33%	D+	17 - Hawaii Kai 49 - Enchanted Lake -	Ward, Gene (R)
-	- -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	33%	D+	Kaneohe	Chong, Pono (D)
-	- -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	33%	D+	40 - Makakilo - Kapolei	Har, Sharon (D)
-	- -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	33%	D+	5 - Mountain View - Kainaliu	Herkes, Robert (D)
-	-   -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	33%	D+	48 - Heeia - Halku Valley	Ito, Ken (D)
-	-   -	+	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	*	33%	D+	3 - Portion of Hilo - Puna	Tsuji, Clift (D)
-   s	-   -	+	-	-	-	ab	ab	+	+	-	*	31%	D+	35 - Pearl City - Walpahu	Sonson, Alex (D)
ab NAK	ab al	ab	-	-	-	ab	ab	-	+	+	*	30%	D+	9 - Kahului - Pala	Nakasone, Bob (D)
-	- -	ab	-	ab	-	-	ab	-	-	+	**	25%	D	16 - Nilhau - Walmea - Kokee	Sagum, Roland (D)
- MAR	-   -	-	ab	-	-	-	+	ab	+	+		23%	D	19 - Walalae Iki - Kalmuki	Marumoto, Barbara (R)
-	ab -	ab	-	-	-	-	+	-	+	+		23%	D	8 - Waihee - Wailuku	Souki, Joseph (D)
ab <b>FIN</b>	- al	-	-	-	-	-	+	-	-	+	*	21%	D-	32 - Lower Alea - Pearl Harbor	Finnegan, Lynn (R)
-	-   -	-	-	-	-	-	+	-	-	+	*	20%	D-	43 - Ewa Beach - Iroquois Point	Pine, Kimberly (R)
+							+			-		7%	F	47 - Laie - Hauula	Meyer, Colleen (R)

SAIKI: An environmental advocate

MORITA: Strong advocate for sustainability, used her Energy and Environment Chair to forward bold clean energy and energy efficiency measures; voted against measure to weaken controls on gill netting (HB 1578)

CARROLL: Environmental champion; The lone no vote against a bad bill to allow mining in the ag district without a land use permit (HB 3286); introduced measures to test for and examine the effects of depleted uranium

BERG: Voted against measure that reduced the ability to control plastic bags (SB 651)

THIELEN: Staunch advocate for clean energy bills; voted against measure to weaken controls on gill netting (HB 1578); the lone "no" vote on measures to increase the corporate donation cap (HB 2455) and to weaken the endangered species act (SB 3103)

BELLATTI: Environmental advocate; voted against measures to weaken controls on gill netting (HB 1578) and that reduced the ability to control plastic bags (SB 651)

HIMABUKURO: An advocate; voted against measures to weaken controls on gill netting (HB 1578) and that reduced the ability to control plastic bags (SB 651)

GREEN: Generally supportive; introduced measure to regulate greenhouse gas emissions (HB 226)

HANOHANO: Supportive of green bills

TAKUMI: Generally supportive of environmental initiatives

LUKE: Generally an environmental champion

WAKAI: Usually an ally on environmental initiatives

BERTRAM: Bikeway advocate; voted against measure to weaken controls on gill netting (HB 1578)

LEE: Leans green, but no distinguishing actions

RHOADS: Generally green; no distinguishing actions

TAKAI: Helpful on environmental issues; Voted against measure that reduced the ability to control plastic bags (SB 651)

TAKAMINE: No distinguishing actions

CABANILLA: No distinguishing actions

OSHIRO: Introduced bill to create a "cooling off" period on farmland development (HB 2684): forwarded numberous good bills from his Finance Committee

WATERS: Generally supportive of environmental initiatives

TOKIOKA: No distinguishing actions

OSHIRO: Leans green but made some disappointing decisions in his leadership capacity

EVANS: No distinguishing actions

MCKELVEY: No distinguishing actions

NISHIMOTO: Introduced measure to reduce public oversight on airport approvals (HB 416); no distinguishing actions

AWANA: No distinguishing actions

**CALDWELL:** While an advocate for many of the priority energy measures (HB 226, SB 644, others), Caldwell used his leadership role to push bad land use, corporate contribution, and Superferry exception measures

KARAMATSU: Introduced measure to weaken the state water code (SB 2820)

CHING: Occasionally supportive, but voted against bill to increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

MANAHAN: No distinguishing actions

SAY: As Speaker of the House, cleared path for significant energy legislative (HB 226, SB 644), but also advocated for bad land use bill

YAMANE: No distinguishing actions

YAMASHITA: As Economic Development Chair, repeatedly refused to hear measures to increase recycling convenience for consumers (SB 1702)

MAGAOAY: No distinguishing actions

MIZUNO: No distinguishing actions

CHANG: Generally not supportive of environmental initiatives

BROWER: Voted against measures to expand bottle law (SB 1026) and increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

WARD: Voted against measure to increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

CHONG: Used leadership position to orchestrate dangerous land use measures and other questionable bills

HAR: Introduced and advocated pro-development measures, including one to decrease LUC oversight over reclassifications (HB 2522); worked to prevent veto override of "Right

HERKES: As Consumer Protection Chair, didn't hear a measures to fix Hawaii's renewable portfolio standard law to require classic clean energy sources only (HB 3068) or require store take-back of bottles and cans for large retailers (HB 2508)

Tro: As Water Land Chair, didn't hear measures to require supplemental environmental review when conditions have changed (SB 642), establish a "use it or lose it" policy for land reclassifications (SB 1368), or ensure public access when new permits are issued (SB 2835)

TSUJI: Introduced measures to weaken state water code (HB 2808 and HB 407); as Ag Chair, forwarded a measure (SB 958) to severely restrict the ability to protect against genetically modified organisms (GMOs)

SONSON: Voted against measure to increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

NAKASONE: Generally not supportive of environmental initiatives

SAGUM: Introduced bill to allow mining in the ag district without a land use permit (HB 3286)

MARUMOTO: Voted against measures to expand bottle law (SB 1026), tighten restrictions on farmland development (HB 257), increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252), and assign liability for GMO damages (HB 1453)

Introduced measure to reduce public oversight on airport approvals (HB 416); refused to hear measure to allow Superferry to operate while completing environmental review SOUKI: (SB 1276)--a measure which would have prevented the Superferry shutdown and special session; voted against measure to increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HR 252)

FINNEGAN: Voted against measures to allow use of clotheslines (SB 2933), establish an electronic waste recycling program (SB 2843), and increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

PINE: Voted against good measures to fence off game management areas (HB 1831) and increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

MEYER: Voted against measures to expand bottle law (SB 1026), require stores to redeem bottles and cans (SB 2841), establish an electronic waste recycling program (SB 2843), increase the efficiency of lights sold in Hawaii (SB 2842), and increase Legacy Lands funding from speculative home purchases (HB 252)

## SCORECARD BILLS

#### **House Bills**

- 1. Greenhouse Gas (HB 226) Support. Global Warming Solutions Act created an enforceable, binding cap on Hawaii's greenhouse gas emissions. Vote 5/3/07. Became law.
- Invasive Species (SB 1066) Support. Established a \$1 per cargo container fee to fund invasive species inspection and prevention. Vote 7/10/07. Became law.
- Superferry exemption (SB1) Oppose. Allowed the Superferry to circumvent Hawaii's three-decade-old environmental review law and start operating before complete mitigation was in place. Vote 10/29/07. Became law.
- Solar roofs (SB 644) Support. Requires that all new homes starting 2010 come equipped with money- and greenhouse gas-saving solar water heaters. Vote 5/1/08. Became law.
- Farmland sprawl (SB 2646) Oppose. Allows large landowners to fast-track reclassification of 15% of ag lands to the Urban or Rural districts in exchange for labeling 85% of lands as Important Ag Land. Vote 5/1/08. Became law.
- Airport permitting (HB 416) Oppose. Reduced public input and county oversight in airport expansion plans. Vote 2/21/07. Failed.
- 7. Marine protected areas (HB 1848) Oppose. Prevented the state from effectively manage and sustain Hawaii's marine resources by reducing their ability to create marine protected areas. Vote 3/6/07. Failed.
- 8. Superferry compromise (HB1 FA1) Support. Floor amendment to the Superferry exemption bill, offered by Rep. Hermina Morita, was a compromise to preserve some critical environmental protections before Superferry operated. Vote 10/26/07. Failed.
- Carbon fund (HB 3444) Support. Established the energy security fund for clean energy and efficiency funded by an increase in the oil barrel fee. Vote 3/4/08. Failed.