

## [Saṅkhitta-pātimokkh'uddesa]

[Uddiṭṭhaṃ kho āyasmanto nidānaṃ, uddiṭṭhā cattāro pārājikā dhammā. Sutaṃ kho panāyasmantehi terasa saṅghādisesā dhammā, dve aniyatā dhammā, tiṃsa nissaggiyā pācittiya dhammā, dvenavuti pācittiya dhammā, cattāro pāṭidesaniyā dhammā, pañcasattati sekhiyā dhammā, satta adhikaraṇasamathā dhammā, ettakaṃ tassa bhagavato suttāgataṃ suttapariyāpannaṃ anvaddhamāsaṃ uddesaṃ āgacchati, tattha sabbeheva samaggehi sammodamānehi avivadamānehi sikkhitabban-ti.]<sup>157</sup>

### [The Pātimokkha Recitation in Brief]

[Venerables, the introduction has been recited, the four cases involving disqualification have been recited. Heard, by the venerables, have been the thirteen cases [involving] the community in the beginning and in the rest have been recited, the two indefinite cases, the thirty cases involving expiation with forfeiture, the ninety-two cases involving expiation, the four cases that are to be acknowledged, the cases related to the training, the seven cases that are settlements of legal issues.

This much (training-rule) of the Fortunate One has been handed down in the Sutta, has been included in the Sutta, comes up for recitation half-monthly. By all who are united, who are on friendly terms, who are not disputing, is to trained herein.]

[For the analysis of the words found elsewhere in this work, please see the Nidāna, the relevant rule sections, and the conclusion of the Pātimokkha.

sutā: heard; p.p. of *suṇāti* (√su + ṇā); see Nidāna.

panāyasmantehi = junction of *pana* + *āyasmantehi* by way of contraction; see Nidāna.

āyasmantehi: by the venerables; ins. pl. m. of *āyasmā*; see Nidāna.]

## [Saṅghādises'uddeso<sup>158</sup>]

Ime kho panāyasmanto terasa saṅghādisesā dhammā uddesaṃ āgacchanti.

The recitation (of the cases concerning) the community in the beginning and the rest (of the procedure.)

Venerables, these thirteen cases [concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure] come up for recitation.

saṅghādises'uddeso: the recitation [of the cases concerning] the community in the beginning and the rest [of the procedure]; nom. sg. m. Probably an appositive kammadhāraya but here rendered as a genitive tappurisa; see *nidān'uddesa* in Nid intro. Cf. Sd conclusion.

ime: these; see Pār intro. kho panāyasmanto: Venerables; see above Nid.

terasa: thirteen; numeral adj.; = *ti*: three + *dasa*, -d- > -r- as in *pañṇarasa*; see above Nid.

saṅghādisesā: [concerning] the community in the beginning and the rest [of the procedure], (of which) the

<sup>157</sup> D, BhPm 1 & 2, Um, and UP give in brackets this conclusion of the Pātimokkha recital in brief (= *saṅkhitta-pātimokkh'uddesa*) which can be recited in times of an emergency. It is found in the Sp commentary (Sp V 1057) on Mv II 15,1/Vin I 112.

<sup>158</sup> = Be & Mi Se. Not in other texts. (D: *saṅghādisesā*, Um has *saṅghādisesā* in brackets.) BhPm 1, C, G, V, W: *saṅgh-* throughout the text.

start and the rest is (to be done) with/by the community, involving the community initially (and) subsequently, H: (BD I 196:) requiring a formal meeting of the Order, H: (BD I 197:) an offence which in the earlier as well as the later stages (requires) a formal meeting of the order, Ñm: entails initial and subsequent meeting of the Community, Norman: entailing a formal meeting of the saṅgha, Hinüber: the rest (*sesa*, i.e., the duration of the suspension) is with the Saṅgha (i.e., determined by the Saṅgha); adj. qualifying *dhammā*.

Probably the compound *saṅghādisesa* is an inverted locative tappurisa compound containing a dvanda cpd (*saṅgho ādimhi ca sese*: the community in the start and the rest), which is used as a bahubbīhi compound qualifying *dhammā*. See the discussion of the meaning of this term in “On the term *saṅghādisesa*” in the Introduction.

**dhammā uddesaṃ āgacchanti**: cases come up for recitation; see Pār intro.

### [Sd 1: Sikkavissatṭhisikkhāpadaṃ]

**Saṁcetanikā sikkavissatṭhi**,<sup>159</sup> **aññatra supinantā, saṅghādiseso**.

#### [The training precept on emission of semen]

**The intentional emission of semen, except in a dream: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].**

**saṁcetanikā**: Ñm & H: intentional; adjective qualifying *sikkavissatṭhi*. pref. *saṃ*: with + *cetanā*: will, active thought; fr. *cinteti* (√*cint* + *e*): thinks + possessive suf. *-ika*.

**sikkavissatṭhi**: Ñm & H: emission of semen; nom. sg. f. Gen. tapp. cpd = **sukka**: semen, lit. “white stuff” + **vissatṭhi**: emission; action-noun derived from the p.p. of *visajjati/vissajjati* or *vissajati/vissajjati* (*vi* + √*saj*(*j*) (= Skt √*srj*) + *a*): discharges, cf. NP 14.

It is not clear why in this rule the nominative is used and not the locative as in Pācittiya 1 etc, or vice versa. The Mā-L version of this rule uses the locative.

When in Pāli it is asserted that one thing is something two nouns may be juxtaposed and there may be no verb in the sentence; see IP p.9 & 61. When translating into English “to be” should be added.

PED gives both *vissatṭhi* and *visatṭhi* forms under *visatṭhi*. The *visatṭhi* reading appears to be the correct one. Probably, the *-ss-* form arose under the influence of *paṭinissajeyya* where it is appropriate due to the assimilation of *nis* + *saj*, here however, there is no assimilation and there is no reason for a double *-ss-*. See the note on *paṭinissajeyya*; Sd 10 and *visajjetvā* at NP 14.

Mā-L: *saṁcetanikāye śukrasya viśrṣṭhiye* (“In the deliberate emission of semen ...”), PrMoMā-L p.8. Mū: *saṁcintya śukravissatṭhi*; PrMoMū p.16. Sa: *saṁcintya śukravissargo*; PrMoSa p.166.

**aññatra**: except, other than; see Pār 4.

**supinantā**: Ñm: in a dream, H: during a dream; abl. sg. m. = **supina**: a dream + **anta**: in, within, inside, near; noun, having a similar meaning as in *antevāsin*, or could be used pleonastically here; see PED & DP. Cf. Vin I 39: *supinantena*: by one in a dream, and Sn 293: “Yo nesaṃ paramo āsi ... sa vā pi methunaṃ dhammaṃ supinantena pi nāgama.”: “He who was the supreme one of them ... did not come to a sexual act even in a dream.” See also the use of *supinantena* in Vin III 162 & Vin I 295 where it is also said that an arahant can not engage in sex or release semen in dreams.

**saṅghādiseso**: (a case concerning) the community in the beginning and in the rest; adj. qualifying an unexpressed *dhammo*; i.e., “*ayaṃ dhammo saṅghādiseso*” like “*ayaṃ dhammo aniyato*” in Aniyata 1.

Since in the introductions and conclusions to the rule-sections of the Pātimokkha all terms used for offences (*pārājika*, *saṅghādisesa*, etc.) are used as adjectives qualifying *dhamma*, it can be assumed that the terms, including *saṅghādisesa*, are used as adjectives rather than nouns. Both the nouns *sesa* and *avasesa* are neuter in gender and if *saṅghādisesa* would be a noun here the nominative neuter *saṅghādisesaṃ* would be expected.

<sup>159</sup> C, G, V, W, Dm, Um, UP, Bh Pm 1 & 2, Pg, Ra, Vibh Ce, Vibh Ee: *visatṭhi*. Mm & Mi Se: *vissatṭhi*.

Cf. the rule-formulation of the Bhikkhunī Sd rules: “*Ayaṃ bhikkhunī paṭhamāpattikaṃ dhammaṃ āpannā nissāraṇīyaṃ saṅghādisesaṃ*” where *saṅghādisesaṃ* qualifies the accusative *dhammaṃ*.

## [Sd 2: Kāyasamsaggasikkhāpadaṃ]

**Yo pana bhikkhu otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittena mātugāmena saddhiṃ kāyasamsaggaṃ samāpajjeyya, hatthagāhaṃ<sup>160</sup> vā veṇigāhaṃ<sup>161</sup> vā aññatarassa vā aññatarassa vā aṅgassa parāmasanaṃ, saṅghādiseso.**

### [The training precept on physical contact]

**If any bhikkhu, under the influence of an altered mind, should engage in [intimate] physical contact together with a woman [such as]: the holding of a hand, or holding a braid [of hair], or caressing any limb: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].**

**yo pana bhikkhu:** see above Nid.

**otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittena:** under the influence of an altered mind, Ñm: assailed by thoughts misled (by lust), H: affected by desire, with perverted heart.

The phrase expresses one idea as in the stock-phrase “... *otiṇṇo’ mhi jātiyā ... dukkh’ otiṇṇo ...*”: “I am affected by birth ... affected by suffering ...” (e.g. M I 192) in which *otiṇṇo* takes the instrumental too.

**otiṇṇo:** affected, under the influence of, overwhelmed, smitten, infatuated; (pass.) p.p. (used as adj. qualifying *bhikkhu*) of *otarati* (*ava* + √*tar* + *a*): to descend, go down into, penetrate (into water etc.). Vibh: “... *sāratto, apekkhavā, paṭibaddhacitto*.”: “... infatuated, full of desire, bound-mind”; prob. in a similar sense as “*tañhāsallena otiṇṇo*” of S I 40 & Th 448 (cf. Sn 939), i.e., being affected (“smitten”) by Māra’s arrow.<sup>162</sup> Cf. A IV 290: “... *otiṇṇo sātārūpena ...*”

Sp 532: “*Otiṇṇo ti yakkhādīhi viya sattā anto uppajjantena rāgena otiṇṇo, kūpādīni viya sattā asamavekkhitvā, rañjanīye ṭhāne rañjanto sayāṃ vā rāgo otiṇṇo. Rāgasamangiss’ ev’ etaṃ adhivacanaṃ*.”: “Under the influence of: under the influence of lust arisen inside beings like spirits etc., (or) like one who not having considered (subcommentary: considered as *asubha* etc.) the interiors etc. (*kūpādīni*) of beings (? Or: he has not considered the beings like the ones in the internal organs etc. [i.e., worms]) he lusts in lustful states and is under the influence of his own lust. This is a designation of one endowed with lust.”

Cf. A III 67 & 259: “*Tesaṃ abhiñhaṃ dassanā saṃsaggo ahosi, saṃsagge sati viissāso ahosi, viissāse sati otāro ahosi; te otiṇṇacittā ... methunaṃ dhammaṃ paṭiseviṃsu*.”: “Due to the frequent seeing of each other there was contact (*saṃsagga*, also: “association,” “company,” see Bhī Sd 12.), there being contact there was intimacy (*viissāsa*, also: “trust”), there being intimacy there was affection (*otāra*), they with affected minds ... indulged in the sexual act.” Elsewhere—eg. S IV 178—*otāra* means the influence/access/lit. “descent” that Māra finds in unmindful bhikkhus.

In the Bhī Pār 5 & 8, and Sd 5 *avassuta*: “overflowing (with desire)” is used instead of “*otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittena*.”

**vipariṇatena:** altered, perverted; p.p. of *vipariṇāmeti* (*vi* + *pari* + √*nam* + *e*): alters, changes (for the worse; cf. M I 123, D II 266), adjective qualifying *cittena*.

**cittena:** by a mind, by thought; ins. sg. m. of *citta*; cf. Pār 3. = Instrumental of attendant circumstances; see Syntax § 65.

**mātugāmena:** with a woman; ins. sg. m. **gen. tapp. cpd.**; originally “women” in general, i.e., “woman-kind,” but here used in a particular sense. = **mātu:** mother + **-gāma:** -collection, -kind, -group; postposition. *Gāma* is here in the original Vedic sense of “collection” and “heap” rather than in the normal sense of “village” as in

<sup>160</sup> Dm: *hatthagāhaṃ*.

<sup>161</sup> Dm: *veṇigāhaṃ*. (Pg: *veṇigāhaṃ*)

<sup>162</sup> In the Vedic literature Kāma (Cupid) is found instead of the Buddhist Māra. *Artharvaveda* ii. 25, 2 (quoted in Macdonell, A., 1899, p.166): “Tis winged with longing, barbed with love, its shaft is formed of fixed desire: With this his arrow leveled well shall Kāma pierce thee to the heart.”

Pār 2. Cf. *bhūtagāma*: “being-kind” at Pāc 11, on which Sp 761 comments: “*Gāmo ti rāsi ...*”: “A *gāma* is a heap/quantity/collection.”

**saddhim**: together with; (here:) postposition taking ins.

**kāyasamsaggaṃ**: (intimate) physical contact, contact with the body, H: physical contact, Ñm: bodily contact; acc. sg. m.; genitive tappurisa cpd. “contact of the body” or instrumental tappurisa cpd.: “contact with the body.” = **kāya**: body + **samsagga**: contact, connection, company, association; an action-noun from *samsajati* (*saṃ* + √*saj* + *a*). Incidental physical contact by itself is not an offence, rather, it needs to be deliberate intimate and sexually oriented physical contact. The Padabhājana explains it as *ajjhācāra*: “indecenty” or “obscenity.”

**samāpajjeyya**: should enter into, engage in; 3 sg. opt. of *samāpajjati* (*saṃ* + *ā* + √*pad* + *ya*).

**hatthagāhaṃ**: the holding of a hand; acc. sg. m. Gen. tapp. cpd. = **hattha**: hand + **gāhaṃ**: holding, seizing; action-noun from *gaṇhāti* (√*gah* + *ṇha*): grasps, grips, seizes. = Dependent word only appearing at the end of (usually genitive) tappurisa cpds; see IP p.92. For other dependent words see *veyyāvaccakara* (NP 10), *tantavāya* NP 26), *piṇḍapāta* (NP 27), *vinayadhara* (Pāc 71).

V.l. *hatthagāhaṃ*. The double consonant form might have arisen under the influence of the double consonant in the Sanskrit root √*grah*, being a regressive assimilation. The single consonant form might be a more Prākritic form, or a form which arose under the influence of the parallel form √*grh*. See note on *magga(p)paṭipanna* in NP 16.

**vā ... vā ...**: either ... or ..., disjunctive particles.

**veṇigāhaṃ**: the holding of a braid; acc. sg. m. = **veṇi**: a braid (of hair) + **gāha**: see above.

**aññatarassa ... aññatarassa ...**: any, one or the other; pronominal adjective qualifying *aṅgassa*. See Pārājika concl.

**aṅgassa**: limb, member; gen. sg. nt. Lit.: “of a limb,” but this does not fit in English.

**parāmasanaṃ**: caressing, stroking, fondling, rubbing up; action-noun fr. *parāmasati*: rubs over, strokes over, holds onto; = pref. *para*: over + *ā*: at, closely + √*mas*: touches; thus literally it means: “touches closely over”; cf. BD I 203 n. 6.

**saṅghādiseso**: see Sd 1.

### [Sd 3: Duṭṭhullavācāsikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittaṇa mātuḡāmaṃ duṭṭhullāhi vācāhi obhāseyya, yathātaṃ<sup>163</sup> yuvā yuvatiṃ, methunūpasamhitāhi,<sup>164</sup> saṅghādiseso.

### [The training precept on depraved words]

If any bhikkhu, under the influence of an altered mind, should speak suggestively with depraved words to a woman, like a young man to a young woman, [with words] concerned with sexual intercourse: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**yo pana bhikkhu otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittaṇa**: see Sd 2.

**mātuḡāmaṃ**: a woman; acc. sg. m.; cf. Sd 2.

**duṭṭhullāhi**: depraved, wicked, gross, defiling, vulgar, obscene, Ñm & H: lewd; adj. der. fr. *dussati* (√*dus* + *ya*): corrupts, spoils; = p.p. *duṭṭhu*, cf. Sd 8 + pejorative suf. *-alla(ka)*. Cf. *dussaka* at Sd 13. *Duṭṭhulla* can not be simply translated with “lewd” since this term implies sexual crudeness. The *duṭṭhullā āpatti*, see Pāc 64, encompass all the Pār and Sd offences, and most of these have nothing to do with sexuality. Further, this Sd rule implies that there are *duṭṭhullā vācā* that are not related to sexuality (*methunūpasamhitā*). There is no other context where *duṭṭhulla* definitely means “lewd,” rather it seems to have a general sense of “depravedness” or “wickedness.”

<sup>163</sup> All printed eds, except Mi Se, Um, Ra: *yathā taṃ*.

<sup>164</sup> Dm, Vibh Ee: *-upa-*. Mi, Mm Se, V: *-sañhitāhi*, all other eds. *-saṃhitāhi*.

**vācāhi**: with words; ins. plur. f. of *vācā*: speech.

**obhāseyya**: should speak suggestively, should suggest, ... hint, ... propose, ... entice, H: ... offend, Ñm: ... address; 3 sg. opt. of *obhāsati* (*ava* + √*bhās* + *a*; a rare word only found in the few Vinaya occurrences given below. PED and Horner take this present occurrence to mean: “to offend, abuse,” the Pāli form of Skt *avabhāṣati* (*ava* + √*bhāṣ* + *a*). See PrMoSa p.166, 182: *ābhāṣeta*. PED gives one other occurrence in Pāli of *obhāsati* in this sense as support, but this occurrence does not really support this sense. Vin II 262: “... *bhikkhū kāyaṃ vivaritoṃ bhikkhunīnaṃ dassenti* ... *bhikkhuniyo obhāsanti bhikkhunīhi saddhiṃ sampayojenti*: ‘Appeva nāma amhesu sārājjeyyun-ti’.”: “... the bhikkhus, having exposed their bodies, showed off to the bhikkhunīs, ... hinted to the bhikkhunīs, associated together with the bhikkhunīs (thinking): ‘May they be attracted to us!’.” (Sp: “... *asaddhammena obhāsenti*.”)

It would be strange that the bhikkhus would abuse the bhikkhunīs if they wanted to attract them.

See DP I 580 s.v. *obhāsati*: “speaks to suggestively or lewdly or offensively.” It notes that *obhāsa* is possibly related with *bhāsati*.

PED does not give *obhāsati* in the sense of hinting or suggesting, but CDPL 297–98 and BHSGD II 73 (*avabhāsa*) do so, quoting D II 103: “*Olārike obhāse kayiramāne, olārike nimitte kayiramāne* ...”: “Making a broad hint, ... a broad sign ...” and Vism I 23: “... *nimittakammaṃ ... obhāsakammaṃ* ...”. BHSGD II 73 gives Sanskrit examples.

The meaning of the other verb *obhāsati* is ‘shines forth’; it is from the Skt root √*bhās*: to shine; not √*bhaṣ*: to talk. It is well possible that there is a contamination of two Skt roots here in Pāli as with *dosa*, see Sd 9, and that *obhāsati* in the sense of “hints” is from the root √*bhās*. “Hints” or “suggests” fits the offence-examples in the Vibh in which indirect, but easily understandable, suggestions are given.

At Vin IV 20 a daughter in law sees Ven. Udāyī whispering to her mother in law and thinks: “*Kim nu kho so samaṇo sassuyā jāro udāhu obhāsati ti?*.”: “Is the recluse (my) mother in laws’ paramour or does he speak suggestively?.” Sp III 547 on Sd 3: “*Obhāseyyā ti avabhāseyya nānappakāraṇaṃ asaddhammavacanāṃ vadeyya. Yasmā pañ’evam obhāsantassa yo so obhāso nāma, so atthato ajjhācāro hoti rāgavasena abhibhavitoṃ saññāmaṇavaṇṇaṃ ācāro, tasmā tam-atthaṃ dassento* (Vibh.:) *obhāseyyā ti ajjhācāro vuccatī ti āha*.” Cf. Aniy 2: *obhāsituṃ*.

**yathātāṃ**: like, as ... (would suggest) it; adv. = **yathā**: as; see above Nid. concl. + **tāṃ**: that; dem. pron.

*Yathātāṃ* is a fairly common idiomatic expression in the Canon. It is found in subordinate clauses where verbs are lacking, but nevertheless are implied. A verb equalling the one in the main-clause is to be supplied in the translation of the subordinate clause “as ... (verb) it” or in more general sense: “as ... (would do) it.” E.g. M I 249: “*Okappaniyaṃ etaṃ bhoṭa Gotamassa yathātāṃ arahato* ...”: “This is to be believed of the Venerable Gotama, as it (is to be believed) of an accomplished one ...”

*Yathātāṃ* probably is one compound—an abhayibhāva cpd like *yathābhūtaṃ*. The commentaries, e.g. M-a to M I 150, take *tāṃ* to be a mere particle (*nipātamatta*); see Syntax § 52b.

**yuvā**: young man; nom. sg. m. of **yuvan**.

**yuvatīm**: young woman; acc. sg. f. of **yuvatī**.

**methunūpasamhitāhi**: concerned with sexual intercourse; ins. pl. f. adjective qualifying *vācāhi*; Instrumental tapp. cpd. used as bahubbīhi cpd. = **methuna**: sexual intercourse; cf. Pār 1 + **upasaṃhita**: concerned with, connected with; p.p. of *upasandhāraṭi* (*upa* + *saṃ* + √*dhār* + *a*).

Here and in the next rule the adj. **methunūpasamhita** comes last in the sentence and not directly after the word it qualifies. This is for extra emphasis.

Mi & Mm Se: *-sañhitāhi*. For the anussāra *ṃ* changing to *ñ* before *h*; see PG § 74.3.

#### [Sd 4: Attakāmapāricariyasikkhāpadaṃ]

**Yo pana bhikkhu otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittaṇa mātuḡāmassa santike attakāmapāricariyāya vaṇṇaṃ bhāseyya**: “Etad-aggam bhagini pāricariyānaṃ yā mādisaṃ silavantaṃ kalyāṇadhammaṃ brahmacāriṃ



etena dhammena paricareyyā<sup>165</sup> ti,” methunūpasamhitena,<sup>166</sup> saṅghādiseso.

[The training precept on (ministering) to himself with love]

If any bhikkhu, under the influence of an altered mind, [and] in the presence of a woman, should speak praise about the ministering to himself with sex: “Sister, this is the best of ministerings: she who would minister to a virtuous, good natured celibate like me with this act!,” [which is something] connected with sexual intercourse: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**Yo pana bhikkhu otiṇṇo vipariṇatena cittaṇa:** see Sd 2.

**mātugāmassa:** of a woman; gen. sg. m.

**santike:** in the presence, ... vicinity; loc. sg. nt. = *sa*: with; pref. (PED states that *sa* here is the base of *so*, the nom. sg. of the dem. pron.: that, he, she.) + *antika*: near; nt. + conn. suf. *-ika*.

**attakāmapāricariyāya:** about ministering to himself with sex, H: ministering with sense-pleasures for self, Ñm: ministering to his own sensuality; loc. sg. f. Dative tapp. cpd. containing an ins. tapp. cpd.: *kāmapāricariya*: ministering with sex.

Vibh: “Attakāman-ti: attano kāmaṃ attano hetuṃ attano adhippāyaṃ attano pāricariyaṃ.”: “Sex for oneself, the cause for oneself, the sake for oneself, the ministering for oneself.”

Sp: “... methunadhammasaṅkhātēna kāmena pāricariyā: kāmapāricariyā; attano atthāya kāmapāricariyā attakāmapāricariyā.”: “The ministering with *kāma* reckoned as sexual intercourse: ministering with *kāma*; the ministering with *kāma* for the purpose of oneself is ministering to oneself with sex.”

In the latter part of the sentence in which this idiom indicates that is correct, i.e., the ministering with sex “to a virtuous liver of the holy life” in the latter part is the same as the ministering with love to himself in the first part.

In S I 75/ Ud 47 (Ud-a: “attano sukhakāmo”), A I 232 (AA: “attano hitakāmā”), and A II 21/III 91, *attakāma* means “one who loves/cares for himself,” this meaning is also given in MW 135. In the Upaniṣads, Br̥ Ār II 4, *atmakāma* means “one who desires/wishes/loves the supreme self,” i.e., Brahma. At M I 205 & III 155 one finds “... attakāmarūpā viharanti”: “... they dwell like desiring their selves.” In the Buddha’s time, just like nowadays, all religious seekers were seen to be desiring “Self” by most people and Buddhist monks were no exception.

There seems to be a wordplay with *attakāma* here, i.e., desiring self/sex to himself. Wordplays are common in Pāli. Cf. *atthakāma*: one who desires good.

= **atta**: himself. *Atta* is here used as a reflexive pronoun: “himself” or “oneself,” rather than in the Brahmanical sense of “eternal soul,” although there seems to be a wordplay here; see PG § 112,2 & IP p.185f. + **kāma**: sex, love; usually translated as “sense-pleasure” but here it has the erotic meaning like in D II 265–66 + **pāricariyā**: ministration, ministering, serving; fr. *paricarati* (*pari* + √*car* + *a*): attends to, ministers to, serves, often with sexual implications; e.g. S I 124.

**vaṇṇaṃ**: praise, glory; acc. sg. m. cf. Pār 3.

**bhāseyya**: should speak; 3 sg. opt. of *bhāsati* (√*bhās* + *a*).

**etad-aggam**: this (is) the very best, the best of this (type of); acc. sg. nt. adv.: With superlatives etc, a genitive of the thing or person of whom the statement is made is used: i.e., *paricariyānaṃ*; see DP 543 and Syntax § 144 g.

A similar view by women fancying a Jain bhikkhu is quoted in the Jain *Ācārāṅgasūtra* II 2,2,12 (translated by H. Jacobi in *Jaina Sūtras* I 124): “These reverend sramanas &c have ceased from sexual intercourse ...; whatever woman indulges with them in sexual intercourse will have a strong, ... , victorious son of heavenly

<sup>165</sup> Mm Se: *pāri*-.

<sup>166</sup> Dm,Vibh Ee: *methunupasaṃhitena*. Mi & Mm Se, V: *-ūpasaṃhitena*.

beauty.” There is still the belief in India that a barren woman can get pregnant (from their husband) after having kissed (in a non-sexual way) the private parts of a sādhu.

= **etad**: this; nom. sg. nt., referring to what follows, i.e., *paricāriyānaṃ*. *Etad* is the junction form of the dem. pron. *eta* in which the Skt -d- is restored to avoid hiatus; cf. *yad-idaṃ* in Sd 12, *kocid-eva* in NP 29, and *etad-eva* in Pāc 16; see PG § 72, 1 & 105.

this + **aggam**: the highest, the peak; nom. sg. nt.

In Pāli when it is simply asserted that a thing is something (as epithet or attribute) two nouns (incl. a pron. or adj.) may be juxtaposed; see Warder p.9.

**bhagini**: sister; voc. sg. f. Used as a polite way of addressing a woman, including a bhikkhunī, by a bhikkhu. Lit.: “fortunate one” (in so far that she has a brother); see VINS II 93 and MW 744. = √*bhag(a)*: good fortune (Cf. *bhagavā* in the Nid.) + possessive suffix -*inī*.

**pāricariyānaṃ**: of ministerings; gen. pl. f.

**yā**: she who, which; nom. sg. f. of rel. pron. *ya*.

**mādisaṃ**: one like me; adj. = *maṃ*: I; acc. sg. m. of pron. *ma(d)* + √*dis*: to see.

**sīlavantaṃ**: endowed with virtue, virtuous; adj. = **sīla**: virtue + possessive suf. -**vant**.

**kalyāṇadhammaṃ**: good-natured; adj. = **kalyāṇa**: (morally) good + **dhamma**: (here) nature, character.

**brahmacāriṃ**: celibate, practitioner of celibacy, observer of the holy life, Ñm: observer of the Good Life, H: leading the Brahma-life, IP p.128: a celibate, one who lives the supreme (life), Norman: liver of the holy life; acc. sg. m. Gen. tapp. cpd. (= Ñm) or acc. tapp. cpd. (= Horner) It could also be a kammadhāraya cpd, “one who lives divine”. I could only trace one commentarial explanation which explains the meaning of the closely related compound *brahmacariya*: *seṭṭhacariya*: “best life,” which suggests a kammadhāraya cpd. (Vin-a II 483: *Parisuddhaṃ brahmacariyaṃ carantanti nirupakkilesaṃ seṭṭhacariyaṃ carantaṃ*.) Cf *brahmacāriya*, “divine abiding” (Karaniyametta Sutta: “*brahmaṃ etaṃ vihāraṃ*”)

Padabhājana: “*Brahmacārin-ti: methunadhammā paṭivirataṃ*”: “*Brahmacāriṃ*: one who abstains from the sexual act.” See note to *brahmacariya* at Sd 8.

A synonym for a celibate. = **brahma**: divine, supreme + **-cārin**: walking, behaving, living; possessive adj. only in cpds., fr. *carati*: moves, lives.

The word *brahmacārin* in Sanskrit has a double meaning. It can mean an unmarried celibate Brahmin student who studies the Vedas and, more importantly, it can also mean someone who observes celibacy; see MW 738.

Although in our rule the bhikkhu who would have the woman ministering him with the best of ministerings would not be an observer of celibacy anymore, it seems that he uses the pretext of celibacy to attract the woman who might believe that she can get pregnant in this way; see *etad-aggam* above.

**etena**: by this; ins. sg. m. of dem. pron. *eta(d)*.

**dhammena**: with an act, practice; ins. sg. m. The word *dhamma* has the sense of “act” here, see Pār 1: *methuna dhamma*.

**paricareyyā**: = **paricareyya** with lengthening of final -a before *ti*: should minister; 3 sg. opt. of *paricarati*; see above. (V.l. *pāri-* is a corruption as *guṇa* strengthening does not occur in verbs, but only in nouns; cf. *pārisuddhi* / *parisujjhati*.)

**ti**: end quote; see above Nid.

**methunūpasamhitena**: (which is) connected with sexual intercourse; adjective qualifying *dhammena*; see Sd 3.

### [Sd 5: Sañcarittasikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu sañcarittaṃ samāpajjeyya, itthiyā vā purisamatim purisassa vā itthimatim,<sup>167</sup> jāyattane vā jārattane vā, antamaso taṃkhaṇikāya<sup>168</sup> pi, saṅghādiseso.

<sup>167</sup> Mi & Mm Se: *itthī-*.

<sup>168</sup> Be & Se Vibh: *taṃkhaṇikāya*.

[The training precept on mediating]

If any bhikkhu should engage in mediating a man's intention to a woman, or a woman's intention to a man, for being a wife or for being a mistress, even for being one on [just] that occasion: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**yo pana bhikkhu:** see above.

**sañcarittam:** mediating, uniting, H: act as go-between, Ñm: engage to act as go-between; acc. sg. nt. fr. *sañcarati* (*saṃ + car + a*): moves between, ... together, unites.

**samāpajjeyya:** should engage in; see Sd 2.

**itthiyā:** to a woman; dat. sg. f. of *itthī*.

**vā ... vā ...:** or ... or ...; disjunctive indecl. parts.

**purisamatim:** a man's intention; acc. sg. f. = **purisa:** man + **mati:** thought, idea, intention.

**purisassa:** to a man; dat. sg. m.

**itthimatim:** a woman's intention; acc. sg. f.

**jāyattane:** for being a wife, for the state of wife, Ñm: about marriage, H: as a wife; loc. sg. nt. The locative is the so called dative-like locative; see Syntax § 170d. = **jāya:** wife + abstract suf. **-ttana**.

**jārattane:** for being a mistress, Ñm: about concubinage, H: as a mistress; loc. sg. f. **jārā:** mistress, paramour.

**antamaso:** even so much as, just; indecl; cf. Pār 1.

**taṃkhaṇikāya:** for being one (i.e., a mistress) on (just) that occasion, Ñm: for a temporary (arrangement), H: as a temporary wife; loc. sg. f. kammadhāraya cpd. = **taṃ:** that; dem. pron. nt. + **khaṇikāya:** for a moment; loc. sg. nt. = **khaṇa:** moment + conn. suf. **-ika**. Vibh: “*Antamaso taṃkhaṇikāya pī ti muhuttikā bhavissasi*.”: “...: ‘You will be a momentary (wife).’” A *muhuttikā* is one of the ten types of wives listed in the Vibh; see Vin III 139. Because the two preceding terms refer to the female and also because the feminine locative form *khaṇikāya* is used here, it is clear that *taṃkhaṇikāya* refers to the female being a mistress for the man temporarily and not to the temporary arrangement between man and woman as suggested by Ñāṇamoli's translation.

**pi:** even; emph. particle; cf. Pār 1.

[Sd 6: Kuṭṭikārasikkhāpadaṃ]

Saññācīkāya<sup>169</sup> pana bhikkhunā kuṭṭim kārayamānena assāmikaṃ attuddesaṃ, pamāṇikā karetabbā. Tatr'idaṃ<sup>170</sup> pamāṇaṃ: dīghaso dvādasā vidatthiyo sugatavidatthiyā tiriyaṃ satt'antarā. Bhikkhū abhinetaḥ<sup>171</sup> vatthudesanāya. Tehi bhikkhūhi vatthum<sup>171</sup> desetabbaṃ anārambhaṃ<sup>172</sup> saparikkamaṇaṃ<sup>173</sup>. Sārambhe<sup>174</sup> ce bhikkhu vatthusmiṃ aparikkamaṇe<sup>175</sup> saññācīkāya<sup>176</sup> kuṭṭim kāreyya, bhikkhū vā anabhineyya vatthudesanāya, pamāṇaṃ vā atikkāmeyya, saṅghādiseso.

[The training precept on making a hut]

By a bhikkhu who is having a hut, which is without an owner, [and] is designated for himself, built by means of his own begged requisites, [that hut] is to be built according to the [proper] measure. This is the measure here: twelve spans of the sugata-span in length, [and] inside seven [spans] across. Bhikkhus are to be brought to [it] for appointing the site. By those bhikkhus a site is to be appointed which is not

<sup>169</sup> C, D, W: *saṃyācīkāya*.

<sup>170</sup> V: *tatr'idaṃ*.

<sup>171</sup> Dm, Um: *vatthu* (So UP in Sd 7).

<sup>172</sup> Vibh Be v.l.: *anārabhaṃ*. UP (sīhala) v.l. *anārabhaṃ*.

<sup>173</sup> Ra, Um, Pg: *-kamaṇaṃ*.

<sup>174</sup> Vibh Be v.l.: *sārabbhe*.

<sup>175</sup> Ra, Pg: *-kamaṇe*.

<sup>176</sup> C, D, W: *saṃyācīkāya*.



entailing harm [to creatures and which is] having a surrounding space. If a bhikkhu, having requested it himself, should have a hut built on a site entailing harm [to creatures], [and] not having a surrounding space, or if he should not bring bhikkhus to [it] for appointing the site, or if he should let [it] exceed the measure: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**saññācīkāya**: through his own begged requisites (or: having requested (it) himself), Ñm: (with means got) by his own asking, H: begging in company, Norman: by his own begging; = **saṃ**: a shortened form of **sayam**: own, self + **yācīkāya**: ins. sg. f. Shortened form of the noun *yācitaka*: begged goods, or *t > k*; or **yācīkāya**: having requested; abs. of *yācati* ( $\sqrt{yāc} + a$ ): begs, requests, pleads.

The word only occurs in the present context. As it is, it can't be an absolute, as then *yācāya* or *yācivā* would be expected. It can't be a *ṇamul* absolute too as these end in *-akam*. In other contexts, see below, *saññācīka* is an adjective, but what would it then agree with here? It can't agree with *kuṭiṃ*. Note that the origin story has *saññācīkāyo kuṭiyo* and here it is an adjective. If *yācīkāya* is a corruption, then it is a very old one because the Mā-L version also reads *yācīkāya*. It can't agree with an implicit form of *upakaraṇa* as that is a masculine noun.

The Sa version's *yācitam* agrees with *kuṭiṃ* and is an adjective. The Mū version's *yācitā* is a pp used as noun in as an feminine singular instrumental of means, like *sahatthā* in NP 16, "through his own request."

What seems to make most sense is to take the Pāli *yācīkāya* too as an instrumental of means. Wijesekera observes in Syntax § 66g that the ins. of means is also used in a participial sense; i.e., as a parallel to the absolute in *-tvā*. This only happens with verbal nouns or nouns with a strong verbal accent.

PED takes it to be a collective abstract of the prefix *saṃ*: "together" +  $\sqrt{yāc}$ , which only occurs as an instrumental adverb: "by begging together." According to PED, *saññācīkāyo* in the origin-story, instead of *-kāya*, is a corruption. (Vin III 144: "... bhikkhū saññācīkāyo kuṭiyo kārāpentī ..." Sp: "... sayam yācivā gahitūpakaraṇāyo.": ... having themselves begged accepted-support.") PED also disagrees with the Padabhājana. If the word is compared to the usage in Bhī NP 7 & 9: "... parikkhārena ... saññācīkena ...": "... with a requisite ... that has been asked for by herself..." then it seems that an absolute is intended, otherwise the wording would be similar to the Bhī NP rules.

Padabhājana: "*sayam yācivā purisam ...*"

The Sp takes it to be both an ins. pl. f. adj. and an abs.: "*Saññācīkāya pana bhikkhunā ti ettha saññācīkā nāma sayam pavattitayācanā vuccati, tasmā saññācīkāya ti attano yācanāyā ti vuttam hoti, sayam yācitakehi upakaraṇehi ti attho. Yasmā pana sā sayam yācitakehi kayiramānā sayam yācivā kayiramānā hoti, tasmā tam atthapariyāyam dassetuṃ: sayam yācivā purisam-pī ti evam-assa Padabhājanam vuttam.*"

"By a bhikkhu through his-own-begged goods: here so-called his-own-begged (supports) are so-called own-generated askings/beggings, therefore "through his-own begged (supports)" is called "by his-selves" begged (supports)," (thus) "through his-own begged services/support/ goods" is the meaning. But because those through-him-self-begged (supports) are being done having begged him-self, therefore the meaning-mode is shown: (Vibh): "him-self having begged for a man," thus for that the line-analysis has been said."

Sp thus takes *yācīka* as a shortened form of the adjective *yācitaka* (= p.p. *yācita* + diminutive suffix *-ka*): begged, borrowed; *yācitaka* as a neuter noun can also mean "borrowed goods," see PED.

Mā-L: *svayam yācīkāya bhikṣuṇā kuṭiṃ kārayamāṇena*; PrMoMā-L p.9. Mū: *svayam yācitā bhikṣuṇā kuṭiṃ kārayitvā*; PrMoMū p.17. Sa: *svayācitam bhikṣuṇā kuṭiṃ kārayatā*; PrMoSa p.168.

**pana**: but, again; indecl. particle, no need to translate.

**bhikkhunā**: by a bhikkhu; ins. sg. m.

**kuṭiṃ**: hut; acc. sg. f.

**kārayamāṇena**: is having built, is causing to build/make; pr.p. of *kāreti*, the causative of *karoti*. The 7th verb-class conjugational sign is *-aya*, normally this is contracted to *-e-* in Pāli but in some present participles it is retained, see PG § 178,2 & 191. Cf. NP 1: *atikkāmayato*, NP 10: *codayamāno*. *Kāreti* is causative, cf. NP 11–15, but the Padabhājana states: "... karonto vā kārāpento vā." Sp notes that the "spirit-meaning" is "by causing to be built," but "building" is included in the Vibh through inference to show the "purpose-meaning." According

to PED *kāreti* means “to build”; cf. NP 3. In the origin story the causative in *-āpe* form of the verb is used: “... *saññācīkāyo kuṭiyo kārapenti*.”

**assāmikaṃ**: without owner, ... patron, Ñm: with no (lay-) owner, H: which has no benefactor; adjective qualifying *kuṭiṃ*. Bb cpd. = neg. pref. a- + **sāmī**: owner, master, patron (fr. Skt *svāmin*: owner = adj. *sva*: own + suf. *-min*.) + conn. suf. *-ika*. The Padabhāṣana on this word has been mistranslated by Horner in BD I 254: “*Na añño koci sāmiko hoti ...*” is not Horner’s, “... there is not anyone who is the owner...,” but, “... there is not someone else who is the owner ...” The *kuṭi* has no owner or patron who builds it and patronises it, as in the next rule. The Sp on the origin-story states: “*Assāmīkāyo ti anissarāyo, kāretā dāyakena virahitāyo ti attho*”: “Without owner: without master, the builders are without benefactor is the meaning.” Cf. M I 286–87: “*sassāmika*”: “(women) with an owner” i.e., husband.

**attuddesaṃ**: which is designated for himself, indicating, Ñm: destined for himself, H: for his own advantage; adjective qualifying *kuṭiṃ*, bahubbīhi cpd. = **attā**: self + **uddesa**: designation, specification, appointing; fr. *uddisati*, cf. Nid. The origin story has the form *attuddesika*, and the corresponding Sa PrMo rule (see below) has *ātmoddesikaṃ*. *Attuddesika* would fit better with *assāmika*. Bhi NP 7 has “*aññuddisakena*,” which is the opposite of *attudesika*. Vibh: “*attano atthāya*.” Sp: “... *yassā attā uddeso sā attano atthāya hoti ...*” The Mā-L rule 6 has: *asvāmīkātmātmmoddesikā*; PrMoMā-L p.9. Sa: *sasvāmīkātmātmmoddesikaṃ*; PrMoSa p.169.

**pamāṇikā**: according to the measure; adjective qualifying an implicit *kuṭi* in nom. sg. f. = **pamāṇa**: measure, standard size + conn. suf. *-ika*. *Pamāṇika* is a rare word only found in a few places in the canon.

**kāretabbā**: is to be built; f.p.p. of *kāreti*; see above.

**Pamāṇikā kāretabbā** is an independent clause in which *pamāṇikā* is agreeing with an unexpressed *kuṭi*, not with *kuṭiṃ* in the preceding clause. If it would be qualifying *kuṭiṃ* in the preceding clause, it would be *pamāṇikaṃ*. The f.p.p. takes the same subject, *bhikkhunā*, as the preceding clause, but the object of a passive participle is nominative and thus can’t be the accusative *kuṭiṃ*. Cf. the similar construction in NP 13, where the f.p.p. has an explicit object: “*navam paṇa bhikkhunā santhataṃ kārayamānena dve bhāgā suddhakāḷakāṇaṃ elakalomānaṃ ādātabbā ...*” and Pāc 87: “*navam paṇa bhikkhunā mañcaṃ vā pīṭhaṃ vā kārayamānena atthaṅgulapādakaṃ kāretabbam ...*” Cf. Pāc 89 & 90 where the qualified word is also unexpressed. Kkh 40: “*Pamāṇikā kāretabbā ti pamāṇayuttā kāretabbā*.”

**tatr’idaṃ**: here this; see Pār intro. Junction of *tatra* + *idaṃ* in which the final *a* of *tatra* has been elided. = **tatra**: here; adv. of place; see Pār intro. + **idaṃ**: this; nom. sg. nt. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**pamāṇaṃ**: measure, standard; nom. sg. nt.

**dīghaso**: in length; adv. **dīgha**: long; adj. + distributive/ablativ suf. *-so*; see Syntax § 133c.

**dvādasa**: twelve; num. used as adjective qualifying *vidatthiyo* (see Warder 117.) = **dvā**: two, only used in num. cpds. + **dasa**: ten; num.

**vidatthiyo**: span; acc. pl. f. of *vidatthi* (= 12 finger-breadths; see Pāc 87. )

**sugatavidatthiyā**: according to the sugata-span, in accordance with the Well-gone One’s span, H: span of the accepted length, Ñm: sugata-span; ins. sg. f. Gen. tapp. cpd. = Ins. of relation; see Syntax § 70c, and *sugataṅgulena* at Pāc 87. = **sugata**: well-gone, the Well-gone One; an epithet of the Buddha; noun or adj. Kammadhāraya cpd; see IP p.188. It might also mean “king-size,” or “ample-size,” “accepted size” or “standard-size.”

Thanissaro, BMC 528–29 Appendix II, estimates that the *sugatavidatthi* is 25 cm. Cf. Pāc 92. + **vidatthiyā**; gen. sg. f. of *vidatthi*; see above.

**tiriyam**: across, width; indecl. fr.  $\sqrt{tar}$ ; cf. Pāc 28.

**satt’antarā**: seven inside. Junction of *satta* + *antara* through elision of the final *-a* of *satta* before the following closed syllable; see PG § 69. = **satta**: seven, num. + **antara**: inside; adverb (= ablative of *antara*).

**bhikkhū**: bhikkhus; nom. pl. m.

**abhinetabbā**: to be brought to, to be led to, Ñm: to be assembled; f.p.p. of *abhineti* (*abhi* +  $\sqrt{ni}$  + *a*), agreeing with *bhikkhū*.

**vatthudesanāya**: for appointing a site; dat. sg. f. Gen. tapp. cpd. = **vatthu**: site, ground + **desanā**: appointing, indicating, designating; fr. *deseti*, see below.

**tehi**: by those; ins. pl. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**bhikkhūhi**: by the bhikkhus; ins. pl. m.

**vatthum**: site; nom. sg. nt. Passive construction in which the patient is in nominative; see IP p.42 & 107.

V.l. *vatthu* is also nom. sg. nt. Sa rule 6: "... *bhikṣubhir vāstu deśayitavyam ...*"; PrMoSa p.168. Mā-L rule 6: "... *tehi bhikṣūhi vastu deśayitavyam ...*," PrMoMā-L p.9.

**desetabbam**: is to be appointed; f.p.p. of *deseti* ( $\sqrt{dis} + e$ ), cf. Pāc 7. agreeing with *vatthum*.

**anārambham**: not entailing harm [to any creatures], Ñm: entailing no harm (to creatures), H: not involving destruction; adj. Bb cpd. = neg. pref. **an-** + **ārambha**: to slaughter, injure, destroy; according to PED 107 from the Sanskrit verb *ālabhati* ( $\bar{a} + \sqrt{labh} + a$ ), not from the Pāli verb *ārambhati* ( $\bar{a} + \sqrt{rabh} + a$ ). Cf. *samārambha*: injuring, PED 686, (not to be confused with the *samārambha* of Pāc 29) and *nirārambha*: without objects for killing/sacrificing.

**saparikkamanam**: having surrounding space, Ñm: with a surrounding walk, H: with an open space round it; adj. Bb cpd. = pref. **sa**: with, having + pref. **pari**: around + **kamana**: access, moving-space; fr. *kamati*: walks, accesses, goes through.

**sārambhe**: entailing harm, destruction; adj. qualifying *vatthusmiṃ* = pref. *sa*: with, entailing + *ārambha*: see above. (PG § 52,6 suggest an assimilation of *saṃ* + *rambha*, but this is incorrect as the negative form *anārambha* is found in the next rule.)

Mā-L rule 6: *sārambhe*; PrMoMā-L p.9. Sa rule: *sārambhe*; PrMoSa p.168.

**ce**: if; conditional particle.

**bhikkhu**: bhikkhu; nom. sg. m.

**vatthusmiṃ**: on a site; loc. sg. nt.

**aparikkamane**: not having a surrounding space; adj. qualifying *vatthusmiṃ*. Bb cpd. = neg. pref. *a-*: not + *parikkamana*: see above. According to the Padabhāṣana there is a dukkaṭa offence if one only fails in the aspects of *sārambha* or *aparikkamana* or both. Thus, the most important factor is bringing bhikkhus to the kuṭi.

**saññācīkāya**: see above. **kuṭiṃ**: see above.

**kāreyya**: should have built; 3 sg. opt. of *kāreti*; see above. Note the difference with the non-causative *kareyya* in the Nid.

**bhikkhū**: bhikkhus; nom. pl. m.; see above. **vā**: or; disjunctive particle.

**anabhineyya**: should not bring to; neg. pref. *an-*: not + 3 sg. opt. of *abhineti*: see above.

**vatthudesanāya**: see above. **pamāṇam**: see above.

**atikkāmeyya**: should let (it) exceed, make go beyond; 3 sg. opt. of *atikkāmeti* ( $ati + \sqrt{(k)kam} + e$ ), the transitive, causative form of *atikkamati*. Cf. NP 1: *atikkāmayato*.

### [Sd 7: Vihārakārasikkhāpadaṃ]

Mahallakaṃ pana<sup>177</sup> bhikkhunā vihāraṃ kārayamānena sassāmikaṃ attuddesaṃ bhikkhū abhinetaṭṭhā vatthudesanāya. Tehi bhikkhūhi vatthum<sup>178</sup> desetabbam anārambham saparikkamanam.<sup>179</sup> Sārambhe ce bhikkhu vatthusmiṃ aparikkamane<sup>180</sup> mahallakaṃ vihāraṃ kāreyya, bhikkhū vā anabhineyya vatthudesanāya, saṅghādiseso.

### [The training precept on making a dwelling]

<sup>177</sup> Mi Se, G, V: *mahallakam-pana*.

<sup>178</sup> Dm, UP, Um: *vatthu*.

<sup>179</sup> Ra: *-kamaṇam*.

<sup>180</sup> Ra: *-kamaṇe*

By a bhikkhu who is having a large dwelling built, which has an owner, [and] is designated for himself, bhikkhus are to be brought to [it] for appointing the site. By those bhikkhus a site not entailing harm [to any creatures] [and] having a surrounding space is to be appointed. If a bhikkhu should have a hut built on a site entailing harm [to creatures], [and] not having a surrounding space, or if he should not bring bhikkhus to [it] for appointing the site, [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**vihārakārasikkhāpadaṃ**: the training precept on making a dwelling; nom. sg. m. Loc. tapp. cpd. or appositive kammadhāraya: “the dwelling-making training precept.” = **vihāra**: dwelling; see below + **kāra**: making, maker; action-noun, fr. *karoti*: makes.

**mahallakam**: large, great; adj. = **mahā**: large, great + (eastern dialect) suf.—**alla(ka)**.

**vihāram**: dwelling, residence; acc. sg. m. fr. *viharati*; see Sd 13.

**sassāmikam**: which has an owner; pref. **sa-**: with + **sāmika**: see Sd 6.

The rest as in the previous rule.

### [Sd 8: Duṭṭhadosasikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu bhikkhum duṭṭho doso appatīto amūlakena pārājikena dhammena anuddhamseyya: “Appeva nāma naṃ imamhā brahmacariyā cāveyyan-ti,” tato aparena samayena samanuggāhiyamāno<sup>181</sup> vā asamanuggāhiyamāno<sup>182</sup> vā, amūlakañ-c’eva<sup>183</sup> taṃ adhikaraṇaṃ hoti, bhikkhu ca dosaṃ patiṭṭhāti, saṅghādiseso.

#### [The training precept on being corrupted by malice]

If any bhikkhu, corrupted by malice [and] upset, should accuse a bhikkhu with a groundless case involving disqualification [thinking]: “If only I could make him fall away from this holy life!,” [and] then, on another occasion, [whether] being interrogated or not being interrogated, if that legal issue is really groundless, and if the bhikkhu stands firm in malice: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**yo pana bhikkhu**: whichever bhikkhu; see above Nid.

**bhikkhum**: a bhikkhu; acc. sg. m.

**duṭṭho doso appatīto**: corrupted by anger (and ) upset, corrupted (and) upset by anger.

**duṭṭho**: corrupted, depraved, wicked, Ñm: angry, H: malignant; p.p. of *dussati* (see Sd 3 & 13) used as an adjective agreeing with *bhikkhu*. Cf. *duṭṭhagāmabhojaka* in the Jātaka passage mentioned below at “*bhikkhu ca dosaṃ ....*”

**doso**: anger, malice, Ñm: desirous of venting anger, H: malicious; nom. sg. m. *Dosa* is elsewhere always a noun, not an adjective, and “*duṭṭho doso appatīto*” seems to be an idiom meaning “depraved through anger, upset” or “depraved, upset through anger.”

The Padabhāṇa, Vin III 163 explains both words together: “*duṭṭho doso ti kupito ...*” The Sp takes *doso* to mean “one who depraves”: “*Duṭṭho doso ti: dūsito c’eva dūsako ca uppanne hi dose puggalo tena dosena dūsito hoti pakatibhāvaṃ jahāpito tasmā duṭṭho ti vuccati, parañ ca dūseti vināseti tasmā doso ti vuccati; iti duṭṭho doso ti ekass’ev’etaṃ puggalassa ākāranattena dassitaṃ. Tena vuttaṃ duṭṭho doso ti dūsito c’eva dūsako cā ti tattha saddalakkhaṇaṃ pariyesitabbaṃ ...*”: “*Duṭṭho doso*: he is being depraved (*dūsita*) and also is a depraver (*dūsako*; cf. Sd 13.) for when anger arises (internally) one is depraved through it (*dosena dūsito*), one has been made to leave the normal state (of mind) therefore “one is depraved” is said, and one depraves and makes others get lost therefore “depraver” (*doso*) is said. Both are manifest in the various manners of the same one person.

<sup>181</sup> Dm: -ggahīya-.

<sup>182</sup> Dm: -ggahīya-.

<sup>183</sup> G: *amūlakam c’eva*.

Therefore it is said *duṭṭho doso* (meaning:) “depraved and a depraver”; therein the grammar (*saddalakkaṇaṃ*) is to be sought ....”

This explanation is problematic as the word *dosa* has nowhere else in the Pāli or Sanskrit the meaning of a person who corrupts.

The phrase “*duṭṭho doso appatīto*” is not found anywhere else in the Canon, but compare A I 201: “... *duṭṭho dosena abhibhūto* ...,” S IV 339: “*Yaṃ duṭṭho dosādhikaraṇena attavyābādhāya pi ceteti* ...,” It 2: “... *dosena duṭṭhāse* ...,” the Padabhājana on *appatīto* below in this rule: “... *tena ca dosena ... appatīto hoti*.”: “... due to this anger ... he is displeased.” MW 498 lists “*doṣa-dūṣita*”: “disfigured by a fault.” From these phrases it appears that it is both possible that *dosena* in our rule is governed by *appatīto* or that it is governed by *duṭṭho*. As *duṭṭho doso* is quoted as one phrase in the Padabhājana and the commentaries the latter was the one favoured by the tradition. Perhaps the original was “*duṭṭho dosena appatīto*” in which *dosena* was misunderstood and altered due to its being in between past participles, or it is possible that the original was *duṭṭhadosa*. (It might also be possible that originally there was the similar sounding “*dose patiṭṭho*” instead of “*doso appatīto*.”) Cf. the origin-story to this rule in the Suttavibhaṅga (Vin III 163): “*Amhehi ... kupitehi anattamanehi cāvanādhīpāyehi*.” By us ... who are angry, displeased, intending to make (him) fall away..”

The Prātimokṣasūtras have in this rule an ablative (in instrumental sense): *doṣad* or *dveṣad*; see below.

In Sanskrit *doṣa* means: corruption, blemish, fault, depravity, and *dveṣa* means: anger, hatred, malice. In Pāli both have merged into *dosa* (e.g. Dh 357: *dosadosa*: “the fault of anger” = Skt Udānavarga 347: “*dveṣadoṣa*”).

It is not uncommon that one Pāli word can have the meanings of two Sanskrit words since in Pāli there are much less sound-combinations than in Skt, see PG § 23,3; e.g. Skt -rg- and -sy- have been assimilated into -gg- and -ss- in Pāli, e.g. Sd 11: *vagga* = Skt *varga* & *vyagra*, Pāc 27: *sattha* = Skt *sārtha*, *śastra*, and *ṣāstra*, Pāc 34: *nī-* = Skt *nīs-* & *nī*, and Pāc 53 & 60: *hassa* = Skt *hāsyā* & *harṣa*. Unless the context makes it clear, it can be difficult to know what meaning is intended.

Sa: “*duṣṭo doṣād apratītaḥ*”; PrMoSa p.168, Rosen, 1959, p.65–66. Mū: “*dviṣṭo dveṣād apratītaḥ*” (I follow the reading given by Roth in BV 105 n. 10 rather than Banerjee’s reading.) (Skt *dviṣṭa*: hostile, from √*dviṣ*. Cf. Pāli *disa*: enemy). Both can be rendered as: “angered, upset due to anger.” Mā-L: “*duṣṭo doṣāt kupito anāttamano*”: “angered, upset due to anger, displeased”; PrMoMā-L p.9.

**appatīto**: upset, annoyed, displeased, N̄m: desirous of venting anger, H: ill-tempered; adjective agreeing with *bhikkhu*. = neg. pref. **a-** + **patīta**; the p.p. of *pacceti* (*paṭi* + √*i*): returns. Padabhājana: “*Appatīto ti: tena ca kopena tena ca dosena ... appatīto hoti*.”: “*Appatīto*: by that hatred and by that anger ... he is upset.”

**amūlakena**: groundless; adjective agreeing with *dhammena*. = neg. pref.—**a** + **mūla**: root, cause + conn. suf. *-ka*. In this case the accusing monk has not seen, heard or doubted that the monk he wants to get rid of has committed a pārājika. If the other monk has in fact, by chance, committed a pārājika, it would still be called *amūlaka*.

**pārājikena**: involving disqualification; adjective agreeing with *dhammena*. See Pār intro.

**dhammena**: case; ins. sg. m.; see Pār intro.

**anuddhamseyya**: should accuse, ... denounce, ... charge; 3 sg. opt. of *anuddhamseti* (*anu* + √(*d*)*dhas* + *e*).

**appeva**: if only, certainly, please may, hopefully; gives emphasis to the optative; see DP. Cf. Cv IV 10,1/Vin II 85: “*Appeva nāma saṅgho bhijjeyyā ti*.”: “If only the Community would split!” Sp 1192: “... *ayaṃ assa ajjhāsayo hoti*.”: “... this is his wish.” Cf. NP 27: “*appeva mayam-pi*.” = **api**: either an emphatic particle or a particle expressing uncertainty: perhaps. A junction of *api* + *eva* in which the final *-i* of *api* is followed by a dissimilar vowel and changes to *-y-* (cf. the Skt “*apy eva*” in the Mā-L and Sa versions of this rule), then *-py-* is palatalised to *-pp-*; see PG 55 & IP p.215 + 17. Cf. Sd 10 *iccetam*. + **eva**: just, emph. particle.

**nāma**: “!”, indeed, just; adv. used as emph. particle which emphasises other particles but can not be translated.

**naṃ**: him; 3 sg. acc. dem. pron.; variant of *taṃ*.

**imamhā**: from this; 3 sg. abl. of dem. pron. *ayaṃ*.



**brahmacariyā**: from the holy life, Ñm: Good Life, H: Brahma-life; abl. sg. nt. = **brahma**: divine; cf. Sd 4 + **-cariya**: conduct, lifestyle; √*car* + conn. suf. *-iya*. See Sd 4 *brahmacārin*. In some contexts *brahmacariya* clearly means celibacy; i.e., as third precept of the eight precepts, A III 70; and as part of the stock-phrase: “*abrahmacariyaṃ pahāya brahmacāri hoti, ārācāri, virato methunā gāmadhammā*.”: “He abandons non-celibacy and is an observer of celibacy, an observer of abstinence, abstaining from the sexual vulgar act.”; A IV 198. The *anāgāmin*, non-returner, and also the *arahant*, is a *brahmacārin*, since he is incapable of indulging in sexual intercourse; see A V 180.

The commentaries give two meanings. One meaning is *seṭṭhacariya*: “the best life,” e.g. S-a I 307. The other is *methunavirati*: “abstinence from sexual intercourse,” S-a I 94; see the note to Th 236 in Norman, 1969, p.169. See also CP IV 274: “in the basic brahminical sense *brahmacariya*, the practice of *brāhmaṇa*, is celibacy and learning the Vedas. In the Buddhist sense it means to live a pure, undefiled, and celibate life.”

**cāveyyan-ti** = **cāveyyaṃ**: I could make fall away; 1 sg. opt. of the causative of *cavati* (√*cu* + *a*): to fall (away). + **ti**: “...,” end quote; cf. Nid. A junction of *cāveyyaṃ* and *ti* through the dentalisation of *ṃ*.

**tato aparena samayena samanuggāhiyamāno vā asamanuggāhiyamāno vā**: thereupon, on another occasion, being interrogated or not being interrogated; see Pār 4.

**amūlakañc’eva**: and if really groundless; a junction of *amūlakaṃ* and *ca* or *ce* through the palatalisation of *ṃ*. = **amūlakaṃ**: see above + **c’**: and if; = elided form of conditional particle *ce*: if, or the connective particle *ca*: and if; see PG § 69,1. Since there is also a *ca* in the next line, it might also be *ca* here in the conditional sense. + **eva**: really; emphatic particle.

**taṃ**: that; nom. sg. nt. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**adhikaraṇaṃ**: legal issue, Ñm: litigation, H: legal question, Norman: legal process, Than: issue, formal dispute; nom. sg. nt. directional pref. *adhi-* + *karāṇa*: doing, making; √*kar* + action-noun suf. *-aṇa*. See below Adhik.

**hoti**: is; 3 sg. pres. ind.; the contracted form of *bhavati*, cf. Nid.

**bhikkhu**: the bhikkhu; nom. sg. m.

**ca**: and if; connective particle, probably in the conditional sense rather than the connective.

**dosam**: malice, or: fault, error; acc. sg. m. Probably an accusative of direction; see Syntax § 41. Corresponds to Skt *doṣa*; see above. The Padabhājana quoted below (... emptily, ... falsely...) suggests that “fault” is intended rather than “malice,” however the grammar and legal structure seem to require the meaning of “malice.”

**paṭiṭṭhāti**: stands firm in, establishes, bases on, persists; 3 sg. pres. ind. (*pati* + √*ṭhā* + *a*).

**bhikkhu ca dosam paṭiṭṭhāti**: and if the bhikkhu stands firm in malice, (or:) and if the bhikkhu confirms the fault, Ñm: and the bhikkhu admits to anger, H: if the monk confessed his malice.

A difficult phrase. The Padabhājana implies that the bhikkhu admits his mistake: “...: *tucchakaṃ mayā bhāṇitaṃ, musā ..., abhūtaṃ ..., ajānantena mayā bhaṇitaṃ*”: “...: It has been said emptily, falsely, non-factually, not knowingly, by me.”

Kkh 72: “*Yadi hi taṃ adhikaraṇaṃ diṭṭhādīhi mūlehi amūlakañc’eva hoti, ayaṃ codetuṃ āgato bhikkhu ca dosam paṭiṭṭhāti paṭicca tiṭṭhati: tucchakaṃ mayā bhaṇitaṃ ti ādini vadanto paṭijānāti. Tassa bhikkhuno anuddhamṣitakkhaṇe yeva saṅghādiseso ti*.”: “If that legal issue is without the (legal) grounds (consisting) of what has been seen, etc, and this bhikkhu who has come to accuse stands dependent on error (*dosa*) and admits saying: ‘It has been said emptily by me (= Padabhājana)’ etc., for that bhikkhu there is a *saṅghādisesa* offence at the very moment of accusation.”

Horner in BD I 281 n. 1 notes “*Paṭiṭṭhāti* with more general meaning of ‘to stand fast.’ But here, judging by the Old Com ... it must mean ‘confess’ with the sense that his words were standing on or founded in malice. The verb, however, in such meanings is followed by a locative. But *paṭi* governs the accusative.”

*Paṭiṭṭhāti* is an intransitive verb and can not take *dosam* as an patient, therefore the meanings “confirms,” or “admits” or “confesses” don’t make sense. Elsewhere in the Pāli Canon *paṭiṭṭhāti* only takes a locative (E.g. Cv IX 5,7/Vin II 251: “*dvīsu dhammesu paṭiṭṭhātabbaṃ sacce ca akuppe ca*.”; see Syntax § 163, a, V for other

examples.) and it is significant that the Prātimokṣasūtras, see below, all have a locative form here. It is therefore possible that *dosaṃ* is a corruption of *dose*. This might be due to misunderstanding the locative sg. m. as a Māgadhi form in *-e*; see Syntax § 10 and PG § 80,1. The meaning “confirms” also does not make good sense as elsewhere, e.g. Aniy 1–2, *paṭijānāti* is used to denote that word.

It is also possible that *paṭiṭṭhāti* is a corruption of its causative form *paṭiṭṭhāpeti*, which is transitive and can take *dosaṃ* as patient. In the sense suggested by the Padabhājana it needs to be a causative.

The following passage from the Kharassara Jātaka (J I 354) about a corrupt village headman (*duṭṭhagāmahojaka*) shows that “confirms” can be a meaning for the causative *paṭiṭṭhāpeti* and that it can take the accusative *dosaṃ* as patient: “*Rājā taṃ pakkosāpetvā dosaṃ paṭiṭṭhāpetvā, suniggahitaṃ nigahetvā ...*”: “The king having summoned him, having made him establish/confirm (his) fault, having punished him well-punished ...” *Dosa* in this context clearly means “fault”, the Skt *doṣa*, and not “anger,” *dveṣa*. Cf. Dhpa III 146: “... *thero parisamajjhe parisuddhabhāvaṃ paṭiṭṭhāpesi*.”: “the senior bhikkhu established (her) state of purity (= innocence) in the midst of the assembly.”

*Paṭiṭṭhāti* can thus be rendered in two ways. One is to render it in accordance with the Padabhājana in the causative meaning as “he establishes the fault” or “confirms the fault” giving the sense of the bhikkhu admitting his mistake. The other is to give the usual locative sense of “stands firm in malice,” i.e., the bhikkhu is under the influence of anger. What the clause then intends is that the accusing bhikkhu clearly acts out of malice, and not out of mere misjudgement.

Both these renderings are supported by the commentary, which explains that it means that the bhikkhu stands dependent (*paṭicca tiṭṭhati*) on *dosa* and admits it (*paṭijānāti*).

To ascertain the correct meaning of this phrase it is necessary to see what the two factors are which define and accomplish the Saṅghādisesa.

Firstly, the case is to be established as groundless, *amūlaka*, then, secondly, the bhikkhu is to be established as one who has gone on a wrong course through ill-will, *dosāgati* (one of the four wrong courses, see Sd 13). This is the factor of intention. It seems reasonable to assume that *dosa* has the same sense in both parts of this rule. In the initial part of this the two factors of *dosa* and *amūlaka* are introduced, then, in the last part, the two are again stated as defining factors. Therefore, like in the Aniyata rules, the bhikkhu’s admission is not necessary to make it a Sd offence. In this case a misunderstanding about this rule seems to have occurred before the Padabhājana was established.

In both occurrences of *dosa* in this rule a corruption in the Pāli seems to have occurred as the grammar is incorrect. This does not appear to have happened in the Prātimokṣasūtras as they give grammatically correct versions.

Mā-L: “*bhikṣu ca doṣe pratiṣṭhāti: doṣād avacāmī ti*.” “and (if) that bhikkhu stands in malice, saying, ‘I spoke out of malice.’”; BV 104, PrMoMā-L p.9. (Cf. BMD p.56). Sa: “... *doṣe pratiṣṭhed doṣenāvocaṃ iti*”: “... would stand in anger, ‘I spoke with anger.’”; PrMoSa p.170–171. Mū: “*bhikṣuś ca dveṣe pratiṣṭhed dveṣād avocaṃ iti* ...” (PrMoMū p.18/BV 105): “and if the bhikkhu would stand in malice, saying, ‘I spoke out of malice.’” Cf. Rosen, 1959, p.65–66 and Finot 89.

These Prātimokṣasūtras thus have in the rule itself what is roughly equivalent to the Pāli Padabhājana (see above). This is not a unique case. Norman (2006 p. 206f), gives examples of this phenomenon and states that because of the Buddha giving different explanations in different places, the commentarial explanation in one tradition or sect could be the canonical reading in another tradition, and vice versa.

It is noteworthy that Pācittiya 76 (*yo pana bhikkhu bhikkhuṃ amūlakena saṅghādisesena anudhamseyya, pācittiyaṃ*), which is basically the same rule but concerned with the making of a groundless accusation of a *saṅghādisesa* instead of a *pārājika*, does not have any mention of the intentional factor of malice, *dosa*, as given in the first part of Sd 8. The corresponding Prātimokṣasūtra rules (Dhg rule 80, Mā-L 75, Mū 69, but not Sa rule 69), mostly have this factor included in the rule: e.g. Mā-L: “*yo puna bhikṣu bhikṣusya duṣṭo doṣat kupito anāttamano amūlakena saṅghātiṣeṣeṇa dharmenānudhvaṃseya pācattikaṃ*.”; BV p.199. Sa rule 69: “*yaḥ punar bhikṣur bhikṣum amūlakena saṅghāvaśeṣeṇa dharmenānudhvaṃsayet pāyantikā*.”; PrMoSa p.226–27.

Prebish (BMD p.123) suggests that if “the bhikkhu persists in malice” and does not abandon his wrong course but conceals it there is a Sd offence. However, this Sd is a *paṭhamāpattika* Sd offence, not a *yāvattatīyaka* Sd, so there is no question of persevering. See the commentary quoted above: “*anuddhamṣitakkhaṇe yeva*”: “at the very moment of accusation.” The point is that the bhikkhu commits the Sd offence as soon as he makes the false accusation. He has to admit though that he has made a false accusation under the influence of anger in order to undergo the *mānatta* and *parivāsa*. For as many days as he fails to admit the offence, and thus conceals it, he has to stay in probation.

### [Sd 9: Aññabhāgiyasikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu bhikkhum duṭṭho doso appatīto aññabhāgiyassa adhikaraṇassa kiñ-ci desaṃ lesamattaṃ upādāya pārājikena dhammena anuddhamseyya: “Appeva nāma naṃ imamhā brahmacariyā cāveyyan-ti,” tato aparena samayena samanuggāhiyamāno<sup>184</sup> vā asamanuggāhiyamāno<sup>185</sup> vā, aññabhāgiyañ-c’eva<sup>186</sup> taṃ adhikaraṇaṃ hoti, koci deso lesamatto upādinno,<sup>187</sup> bhikkhu ca dosaṃ patiṭṭhāti, saṅghādiseso.

#### [The training precept on (an issue) belonging to another class]

If any bhikkhu, corrupted by malice [and] upset, should accuse a bhikkhu with a case involving disqualification, having taken [it] up [with] some point, which is a mere pretext, of a legal issue belonging to another class [thinking]: “If only I could make him fall away from this holy life!” [and] then, on another occasion, [whether] being interrogated or not being interrogated, if that legal issue is really belonging to another class, [and] some point, which a mere pretext, has been taken up, and if the bhikkhu stands firm in malice: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

Yo pana bhikkhu bhikkhum duṭṭho doso appatīto: see Sd 8.

aññabhāgiyassa: belonging to another class, connected to another class; adj. Bb cpd. = añña: other; adj. + bhāga: class, part, share + -iya: connective suffix.

adhikaraṇassa: of a legal issue; gen. sg. nt. of *adhikaraṇa*; see Sd 8.

kiñ-ci: some; indefinite pron. = junction of *kiṃ* + *ci* through the palatalisation of the *niggahita* of *kiṃ*. *kiṃ* the acc. sg. neuter form of interrogative pron. *ka*: “what?” + appended indef. particle *-ci*; see PG § 111,1.

desaṃ: point, matter; acc. sg. m., fr. *deseti*: see Sd 6 and Pāc 7.

lesamattaṃ: which is mere pretext; adjective qualifying *desaṃ*. Bb cpd. = *lesa*: pretext, ploy +—*matta*: mere, only; adjective.

upādāya: having taken up; abs. of *upādiyati* (*upa* + √*dā* + *i* + *ya*) used as a postposition. Often the postposition *upādāya* matches the English “out of,” i.e.: “out of pretext”; cf. NP 9.

desaṃ lesamattaṃ upādāya: having taken up some point which is a mere pretext.

pārājikena ... vā: see Sd 8.

aññabhāgiyañ-c’eva: = junction of *aññabhāgiyaṃ* + *c’eva* through palatalisation of the final *-ṃ* of *aññabhāgiyaṃ*. = aññabhāgiyaṃ: see above + *c’eva*: see Sd 8.

taṃ adhikaraṇaṃ hoti: see Sd 8.

koci deso lesamatto: some point which a mere pretext; see above, here nom. sg. m.

upādinno: has been taken up; p.p. of *upādiyati* agreeing with *deso*.

bhikkhu ca dosaṃ patiṭṭhāti, saṅghādiseso: see Sd 8.

<sup>184</sup> Dm: -ggahīya-.

<sup>185</sup> Dm: -ggahīya-.

<sup>186</sup> Ra: *aññabhāgiyaṃ ceva*.

<sup>187</sup> Um, G, V: *upādinno*.

### [Sd 10: Saṅghabhedasikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu samaggassa saṅghassa bhedāya parakkameyya, bhedanasamvattanikaṃ vā adhikaraṇaṃ samādāya paggayha tiṭṭheyya, so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi evam-assa vacaniyo:<sup>188</sup> “Mā āyasmā<sup>189</sup> samaggassa saṅghassa bhedāya parakkamī<sup>190</sup> bhedanasamvattanikaṃ vā adhikaraṇaṃ samādāya paggayha aṭṭhāsi. Samet’āyasmā saṅghena, samaggo hi saṅgho sammodamāno avivadamāno ek’uddeso phāsu viharatī ti.”, evañ-ca so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi vuccamāno tath’eva paggaṇheyya, so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi yāvatatiyaṃ samanubhāsitabbo tassa paṭinissaggāya, yāvatatiyañ-ce samanubhāsiyamāno taṃ paṭinissajeyya,<sup>191</sup> iccetam kusalam, no ce paṭinissajeyya,<sup>192</sup> saṅghādiseso.

#### [The training precept on the schism of a community]

If any bhikkhu should endeavor for the schism of a united community, or having undertaken, should persist in upholding a legal issue conducive to schism, [then] that bhikkhu should be spoken to thus by the bhikkhus: “Let the venerable one not endeavor for the schism of the united community, or having undertaken, persist in upholding a legal issue conducive to schism. Let the venerable one convene with the community, for a united community, which is on friendly terms, which is not disputing, which has a single recitation, dwells in comfort,” and [if] that bhikkhu being spoken to thus by the bhikkhus should persist in the same way [as before], [then] that bhikkhu is to be argued with up to three times by the bhikkhus for the relinquishing of that [course], [and if that bhikkhu,] being argued with up to three times, should relinquish that [course], then this is good, [but] if he should not relinquish [it]: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

Yo pana bhikkhu: see Sd 8.

**samaggassa:** united, unanimous, whole, Ñm: in concord, H: harmonious, *Vinaya Texts*: at union; adj. qualifying *saṅgha*. = pref. *saṃ* + *agga*: top; see Sd 4 = Skt *agra*: foremost, best, multitude. Mā-L & Sa: *samagrasya saṃghasya*; BV 149, PrMoSa p.171.

*Samagga* is the correlative of *vagga* (*vi* + *agga*): disunited, dissentious, factional; see Sd 11.

The Skt form *samagra* means: all, whole, entire, complete. The Skt form of Pāli *vagga*: *vyagra* means: dispersed, disunited.

In the context of this rule *samagga* has the more general meaning of “united” in the sense of “harmony” as it is contrasted with *saṅghabheda*: “schism of the community,” and also because it here occurs with “rejoicing together and non-disputing”: “*sammodamāno avivadamāno*.” The latter are found elsewhere in a stock-phrase (underlined); e.g. M III 156: “*Yathā kathaṃ pana tumhe, Anuruddhā, samaggā sammodamānā avivadamānā khīrodakībhūtā aññamaññaṃ piyacakkhūhi sampassantā viharathā ti? Idha mayhaṃ, bhante, evaṃ hoti: Lābhā vata me, suladdhaṃ vata me yo’haṃ evarūpehi sabrahmacārīhi saddhiṃ viharāmī ti.*”: “But how do you, Anuruddhas, dwell in unity, agreeing with each other, not disputing, being like milk (blending with) water, regarding each other with dear eyes. Here, Venerable Sir, it occurs to us thus: ‘There are gains for me, it is well gained by me, that I live with such kind of companions in the Holy Life.’”

Cf. A I 70 where the united assembly is compared to the disunited assembly: “*Dve’mā, bhikkhave, parisā. Katamā dve? Vaggā ca parisā samaggā ca parisā. Katamā ca, bhikkhave, vaggā parisā? Idha, bhikkhave, yassaṃ parisāyaṃ bhikkhū bhaṇḍanaajātā kalahajātā vivādāpannā aññamaññaṃ mukhasattihi vitudentā viharanti, ayaṃ vuccati, bhikkhave, vaggā parisā. “Katamā ca, bhikkhave, samaggā parisā? Idha, bhikkhave, yassaṃ parisāyaṃ bhikkhū samaggā sammodamānā avivadamānā khīrodakībhūtā aññamaññaṃ piyacakkhūhi sampassantā viharanti, ayaṃ vuccati, bhikkhave, samaggā parisā.*”:

<sup>188</sup> V: *vacaniyo*.

<sup>189</sup> Dm, Um, UP: *māyasmā*.

<sup>190</sup> Ra: *parakkamī*.

<sup>191</sup> = D, W, Vibh Ce (but has *-nissajeyya* in Pāc 68), Other eds.: *-nissajeyya*. C reads *-nissajeyya* here but *-nissajeyya* in Sd 12–13 and Pāc 68.

<sup>192</sup> As in previous note.

“There are these two assemblies. Which two? A divided assembly and a united assembly. What is a divided assembly. Now, in which assembly bhikkhus dwell who are arguing, who are quarrelling, who are engaged in dispute, who are piercing one another with the swords of the mouth; this is called a divided assembly. And what is a united assembly? Now, in which assembly bhikkhus dwell who are in unity, who are agreeing with each other, who are not disputing, who are being like milk (blending with) water, (and) who are regarding each other with dear eyes. This is called a united assembly.”

The sense of harmony is also exemplified in Dh 194: “*sukhā saṅghassa sāmaggī, samaggānaṃ tapo sukho.*” Speech that unites, *sāmaggakaraṇiṃ vācam*, is a factor of right speech.

One of the conditions of non-decline of the Saṅgha, *aparihāniya dhamma*, is doing *saṅghakammas* in unity; see A IV 21f, D II 76.

However, in the more technical Vinaya sense, as in Pāc 81, *samagga* applies more to a community that is both united in body, i.e., completely attending and participating when carrying out a *saṅghakamma*, as well as united in mind, i.e., agreeing with each other and having a single opinion about a *saṅghakamma*. The physical sense is emphasised in the Vibh Padabhājana on this rule at Vin III 173: “*Samaggo nāma saṅgho samānasaṃvāsako samānasīmāyaṃ t̥hito.*”: “United is a community that is of the same communion, which is staying in the same boundary-area..”

It is also emphasised in Vin I 104–105/Mv II 5,1: “*Na yathāparisāya pātimokkhaṃ uddissitabbaṃ sakāya sakāya parisāya ... Anujānāmi bhikkhave samaggānaṃ uposathakammaṃ ... ettāvataṃ samaggī yāvataṃ ekāvāso.*”: “The Pātimokkha should not be recited according to assembly, each to his own assembly. I allow bhikkhus a legal act of Uposatha for (all) united ... as far as there is one residence so far extends the unity.”

In Vin I 318/Mv IX 3,5 three factors or conditions are given for a *samaggakamma*: “united legal action” or *vaggakamma* “disunited legal action”: “*Katamañca, bhikkhave, samaggakammaṃ? Ñattidutiye ce, bhikkhave, kamme yāvaticā bhikkhū kammappattā, te āgatā honti, chandārahānaṃ chando āhaṭo hoti, sammukhībhūtā na paṭikkosanti: samaggakammaṃ. Ñatticatutthe ce ...*” How, bhikkhus, is there a united legal action? In a (legal) act of a motion (followed by an announcement) as the second, as far as there are monks who are entitled (to carry it out), they have arrived, the consent has been brought of those who are eligible for (giving) consent, through the non-objection of those who are present. ...”

In brief: 1. complete attendance, 2. consent (and purity in the case of the Uposathakamma) by proxy of the absent bhikkhus, and 3. no objection or protest against the kamma by any bhikkhu who participates.

The first factor complete attendance is discussed above in the section on *sīmā*, the second factor is discussed in the Nidāna, and an example of the third factor is the suspension of the Pātimokkha (*patimokkhaṭṭhapana*) for a bhikkhu with an offence; see above p. 100. Another example of an objection is the request about objections at the end of the three proclamations, *kammavācā*, for the full admission into the Saṅgha, *upasampadā*, at Vin I 93–95/Mv I 76,11–12.

These three conditions are also listed in the explanation on *samaggena saṅghena* in Sp 242; see Pāc 81.

In A V 73–75/AN X 35, a set of ten conditions for *saṅghasamaggī* (contrasted with the opposite conditions for *saṅghabheda*) is given, which if practised will lead to the non-seceding (and) not segregating (of bhikkhus), to not carrying out legal acts separately, and not reciting the Pātimokkha separately. In Vin II 204–205, = Cv VII 5,2–4, this set is found as a set of eighteen conditions: “*Kittāvataṃ nu kho, bhante, saṅgho samaggo hoti ti? “Idh’Upāli, bhikkhū adhammaṃ adhammo ti dīpenti, dhammaṃ dhammo ti dīpenti, avinayaṃ avinayo ti dīpenti, vinayaṃ vinayo ti dīpenti, abhāsitaṃ alapitaṃ tathāgatena abhāsitaṃ alapitaṃ tathāgatena ti dīpenti, bhāsitaṃ lapitaṃ tathāgatena bhāsitaṃ lapitaṃ tathāgatena ti dīpenti, anāciṇṇaṃ tathāgatena anāciṇṇaṃ tathāgatena ti dīpenti, āciṇṇaṃ tathāgatena āciṇṇaṃ tathāgatena ti dīpenti, apaññattaṃ tathāgatena apaññattaṃ tathāgatena ti dīpenti, paññattaṃ tathāgatena paññattaṃ tathāgatena ti dīpenti, anāpattiṃ anāpattiṃ dīpenti, āpattiṃ āpattiṃ ti dīpenti, lahukaṃ āpattiṃ lahukā āpattiṃ ti dīpenti, garukaṃ āpattiṃ garukā āpattiṃ ti dīpenti, sāvasesaṃ āpattiṃ sāvasesā āpattiṃ ti dīpenti, anavasesaṃ āpattiṃ anavasesā āpattiṃ ti dīpenti, duṭṭhullaṃ āpattiṃ duṭṭhullā āpattiṃ ti dīpenti, aduṭṭhullaṃ āpattiṃ aduṭṭhullā āpattiṃ ti dīpenti. Te imehi aṭṭhārasahi vatthūhi na apakassanti, na avapakassanti, na āveniṃ uposathaṃ karonti, na āveniṃ pavāraṇaṃ karonti, na āveniṃ saṅghakammaṃ karonti. Ettāvataṃ kho, Upāli, saṅgho samaggo hoti*”



ti.”:

“To what extent, Venerable Sir, is the Community united? Here, Upāli, bhikkhus elucidate/explain non-Dhamma as non-Dhamma, ... Dhamma as Dhamma, ... non-Vinaya as non-Vinaya, ... Vinaya as Vinaya, ... what has not been said and spoken about by the Tathāgata as what has not been said ..., what has been said ... as ... said ..., what has not been practised ... as ... not ... practised ..., what has been practised ... as ... practised ..., what has not been declared ... as ... not ... declared ..., what has been declared ... as ... declared ..., they elucidate a non-offence as a non-offence, ... an offence as an offence, ... a light offence as a light offence, ... a heavy offence as a heavy offence, ... an offence with remainder (in the Saṅgha, i.e., a Saṅghādisesa or less) as an offence with remainder, ... an offence with no remainder (in the Saṅgha, i.e., a Pārājika) as an offence with no remainder, a depraved offences as a depraved offence, ... a non-depraved offence as a non-depraved offence. With these eighteen factors they don’t secede, don’t segregate, they don’t do a separate Uposatha, ... Invitation, ... legal action. To this extent, Upāli, the Community is united.”

Cf. BD III 136 n. 1 + BD IV 267 n. 7 and the extensive discussion of *samagga* in Juo-Hsüeh Shih, 2000, chapter 4.

**saṅghassa**: of a community; gen. sg. m. Cf. Nid.

**bhedāya**: for the schism, breach, division; dat. sg. m. of **bheda**, action-noun fr. *bhedeti* ( $\sqrt{bhid} + e$ ): causes to break. A dative of purpose; see Syntax § 107d.

**parakkameyya**: should endeavor for, strive for, Ñm: attempt to cause, H: should go forward with; 3 sg. opt. of *parakkamati* (*parā* +  $\sqrt{kam} + a$ ) = pref. *parā*: onto, over +  $\sqrt{(k)kam}$ : moves. The final long *a* of the prefix *para* has been shortened before the double *k* of the root  $\sqrt{(k)kam}$ , Skt  $\sqrt{kram}$ , in accordance with the Law of Morae; see *sekha/sekkha* in Pd 3.

**bhedanasaṃvattanikaṃ**: conducive to schism, Ñm: conducive to schism, H: leading to dissension; adj. Dat. tapp. cpd used as Bb cpd. = **bhedana**: breaking, breach, schism; action-noun ( $\sqrt{bhid} + ana$ ) + **saṃvattanika**: conducive to; adj. *saṃ* +  $\sqrt{vatt} + \text{suf. } -ika$ ; fr. *saṃvattati* (*saṃ* +  $\sqrt{vatt} + a$ ).

**vā**: or; disjunctive particle.

**adhikaraṇaṃ**: legal issue; acc. sg. nt.; see Sd 8.

**samādāya**: having undertaken; absolutive of *samādiyati*, the passive form of *samādāti* (*saṃ* +  $\bar{a}$  +  $\sqrt{dā} + a$ ).

**paggayha**: upholding, having upheld, favouring, kindling; abs. of *paggaṇhāti* = pref. *pa-*: forth, out + *gaṇhāti*: holds; see Sd 2.

**tiṭṭheyya**: should persist in, lit. “should stand”; 3 sg. opt. of *tiṭṭhati* ( $\sqrt{ṭha} + a$ ). *Paggayha tiṭṭheyya*, “should persist in upholding” is a periphrastic construction in which *tiṭṭheyya* acts as an auxiliary verb; see IP 233ff, and Syntax § 19. Perhaps *tiṭṭheyya* acts as an auxiliary to both *samādāya* and *paggayha* (“should persist in undertaking and upholding”), but I am not aware of any other constructions of an auxiliary with the forms of two other verbs.

**so**: that; nom. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**bhikkhu**: bhikkhu; nom. sg. m.

**bhikkhūhi**: by bhikkhus; ins. pl. m.

**evam-assa**: thus should be; = a junction of *evaṃ* and *assa* through weakening of *ṃ* into *m*; see PG § 71,2b. =

**evam**: thus; adv. + **assa**: should be; 3 sg. opt. of *atthi* ( $\sqrt{as} + a + ti$ ), here used as an auxiliary verb; see IP p.234. This *assa* is not to be confused with *assa*, the dative of demonstrative pronoun *ayaṃ*; see above Nid.

**vacaniyo**: to be spoken to, told, addressed, Ñm: to be admonished, H: to be spoken to; f.p.p. of the root  $\sqrt{vac}$ , agreeing with *bhikkhu*. In this and the next rules the different forms of the root  $\sqrt{vac}$  have consistently been rendered by forms of “speaks to” in the sense of admonishing, although sometimes “admonishes” (as Ñm renders), especially in SD 12, would seem more appropriate. Cf. M II 200: “... *Subho māṇavo ... anattamano bhagavantaṃ yeva khuṃsento bhagavantaṃ yeva vambento bhagavantaṃ yeva vadamāno: samaṇo Gotamo pāpiko bhavissatī ti.*”

**mā**: don’t, let not; prohibitive particle taking an aorist.

**āyasmā**: the venerable one; nom. sg. m.; cf. Nid.

As the verbs (*sametu* etc.) used in this sentence are in the third person the nominative is used rather than the vocative. *Āyasmā* is not used as a vocative in Pāli but is only used as a nominative with 3<sup>rd</sup> person verbs; e.g. D II 206: "... *āyasmā Janavasabho yakkho ... sañjānāti ti.*" This is a polite form of speech; see Pāc 68.

The plural form *āyasmanto* is used in the vocative with (imperative) 2<sup>nd</sup> person verbs; e.g. Sd 11: "*Mā āyasmanto ... avacuttha.*"

*Āvuso* is used in the voc. sg. instead of *āyasmā*; see Pāc 70: "*Mā āvuso samañuddesa evaṃ avaca.*"

**samaggassa saṅghassa bheda**: see above.

**parakkami**: endeavor; 3 sg. aor. of *parakkamati*: see above. There is also a second person *i*-aorist in *-i* (see also NP 10 *vinassa/vinassi*) but as *sametu* below is definitely in the third person *parakkami* and *aṭṭhāsi* are also so.

**bhedanasaṃvattanikaṃ vā adhikaraṇaṃ samādāya paggayha**: see above.

**aṭṭhāsi**: persist; 3. sg. aor. of *tiṭṭhati*: see above.

**samet'āyasmā**: let the venerable one convene, assemble, come together, agree, be in accord, Ñm: let the venerable one be at peace with, H: let ... be associated with, *Vinaya Texts*: Be, Sir, at one with...; junction of *sametu* and *āyasmā* through elision of *-u*; PG § 70,2b. see note in the next rule.

**sametu**: let convene, come together, agree; 3 sg. imp. of *sameti* (*saṃ* + *√i* + *a*): convenes, comes together, joins, assembles, agrees; here *sameti* is personal, has a nominative agent, and takes the instrumental *saṅghena*; see note in Sd 11. + **āyasmā**: see above.

Mā-L: "*sametu āyuṣṣan sārddhaṃ saṅghena*"; BV 149.

**saṅghena**: with the community; ins. sg. m.

**samaggo**: which is united; adj. qualifying *saṅgho*.

**hi**: for, because; emphatic particle/indeclinable.

**saṅgho**: a community; nom. sg. m.

**sammodamāno**: which is on friendly terms, being congenial, Ñm: in agreement, H: on friendly terms, *Vinaya Texts*: in harmony; adjective agreeing with *saṅgho*, = pr.p. of *sammodati* (*saṃ* + *√mud* + *a*): is friendly with, agrees with, rejoices together.

Kkh 76/Sp 608: "*Tattha sammodamāno ti aññamaññasampattiyā suṭṭhu modamāno. Avivadamāno-ti: "ayaṃ dhammo, nāyaṃ dhammo"ti evaṃ na vivadamāno.*" : "Herein *sammodamāno* is rejoicing well in one another's success." Cf. the Kkh explanation of *sammodamāno* given in the Pātimokkha conclusion.

**avivadamāno**: which is not disputing, quarrelling, Ñm: without dispute, H: not quarrelsome; adj. agreeing with *saṅgho*, = neg. pref. *a-* + pr.p. of *vivadati* (*vi* + *√vad* + *a*). Cf. Pātimokkha conclusion and Pāc 78: *vivādāpannānaṃ*.

Kkh 76: "*Avivadamāno-ti: Ayaṃ dhammo, nāyaṃ dhammo ti evaṃ na vivadamāno.*" : "*Avivadamāno* is not disputing thus: "This is the Dhamma, this is not the Dhamma."

**ek'uddeso**: which has a single-recitation, Ñm: holds undivided recitations, H: under a single rule; adjective qualifying *saṅgho*. Digu cpd. A junction of *eka* + *uddeso* through elision of the final *-a* of *eka*.

Kkh 76: "*Eko uddeso assā ti ek'uddeso, ekato pavattapātimokkh'uddeso ti attho.*" : "*Ek'uddeso*: '(There is) one recitation of it.' '(There is) an ongoing Pātimokkha-recitation as one (body),' is the meaning."

= **eka**: one, single; num. + **uddesa**: recitation; see above Nid. + Pār intro. This refers to there being only one single recitation of the Pātimokkha within the community's monastery-boundary, *sīmā*, with no faction doing their own separate recitation; see Vin I 105 quoted above. See also the note on the purpose of the Pātimokkha in the Introduction.

**phāsu**: comfortably, at ease; adv. Cf. Nid. Dh 194: "*Sukhā saṅghassa sāmaggī sāmaggīnaṃ tapo sukho.*" : "Pleasant is the unity of the community, the striving of united ones is pleasant."

**viharatī ti** = **viharati**: dwells; (*vi* + *√har* + *a*) + **ti**: end quote; see Sd 8.

**evañ-ca:** and (if) thus; junction of *evaṃ* + *ca* through palatalisation of *ṃ*. =

**evaṃ:** thus; adv. + **ca:** and (if); connective particle; see Sd 8. The Sa version has the hypothetical particle *cet* “if” here instead of *ca*; see PrMoSa p.172f.

**vuccamāno:** being spoken to, told, addressed; pr.p. passive ( see IP p.52) of  $\sqrt{vac}$ ; see above *vacanīya*.

**tath’eva:** in the same way (as before), in just that manner; junction of *tathā* + *eva* through elision of the final *-ā* of *tathā*. = **tathā:** so, in such manner; adverb of manner, cf. Nid. concl. + **eva:** just; emph. particle.

**paggañheyya:** should uphold; 3 sg. opt. of *paggañhāti*: see above.

**yāvatatiyaṃ:** up to the third time; adverb in acc. sg. nt. Abhayībhāva cpd. = **yāva:** up to, until; adv. + **tatiya:** third; ordinal; cf. Nid. concl.

**samanubhāsitaḥ:** to be argued with, remonstrated with, advised, addressed, Ñm: should be remonstrated with, H: should be admonished; f.p.p. of *samanubhāsati* (*saṃ* + *anu* +  $\sqrt{bhās}$  + *a*) agreeing with *bhikkhu*; see IP p.42 & 107.

Vibh & Sp don’t comment upon this word. But according to D-a on D I 163 it means “argues” or “persuades”: “... *kāraṇe dosaṃ dassetvā: “Na tvaṃ idaṃ jānāsi ... idaṃ vissajjehi ti” ...*”: “... having made him see the fault in his argument/reasoning: you don’t know this ... relinquish it!” Cf. M-a II 103 to M I 130: “*Kena kāraṇena evaṃ vadesi ti kāraṇaṃ pucchanta samanubhāsanti nāma.*”: “ “Because of what reasoning do you say so?” asking the reason they challenge.” Ñānamoli/Bodhi render *samanubhāsati* at M I 130 as “cross-questioned.” This verb is often found together with *samanuggāhati*: “interrogates”; see Pār 4.

**tassa:** of that; gen. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*; refers to the course of misconduct leading to an offence, *vatthu*, lit. “ground [for offence]”. The Vibhaṅga (Vin III 173f) explains that a *ñatticatutthakamma* has to be carried out for the relinquishing of that course (*vatthu*): “*Suñātu me bhante saṅgho. Ayaṃ itthannāmo bhikkhu samaggassa saṅghassa bhedāya parakkamati. So taṃ vatthuṃ na paṭinissajati. Yadi saṅghassa pattakallaṃ, saṅgho itthannāmaṃ bhikkhuṃ samanubhāseyya tassa vatthussa paṭinissaggāya. Esā ñatti.*”: “Venerable Sir, let the community listen to me. This bhikkhu named such is endeavoring for the schism of a united community. He does not relinquish that course. If it is suitable to the community, it should admonish the monk named such for the relinquishment of that course. This is the motion.”

**paṭinissaggāya:** for the relinquishment, ... forsaking; dat. sg. m. fr. *paṭinissajati* (*paṭi* + *nis* +  $\sqrt{(s)saj(j)}$  + *a*); see below *paṭinissajeyya*. A dative of purpose; see Syntax § 107d.

**yāvatatiyañ-ce:** junction of *yāvatatiyaṃ* + *ce* through the palatalisation of the final *-ṃ* of *-tatiyaṃ*; see above.

**ce:** if; conditional particle.

**samanubhāsiyamāno:** challenging; pr.p. of *samanubhāsati*; see above.

**taṃ:** that; acc. sg. nt. of dem. pron. *ta(d)* referring to the schismatic legal action mentioned earlier in the rule.

**paṭinissajeyya:** should relinquish; 3 sg. opt. of *paṭinissajati*; see above.

I take the correct reading here to be the one with the single *j* rather than the double *jj*. There is a lot of confusion in the manuscripts and editions between the single and double forms of the root  $\sqrt{saj}$ ; see DP I 515 *ussajati* (*ud* +  $\sqrt{srij}$ ) and 597 *ossajati* (*o/ava* +  $\sqrt{srij}$ ) and the entry in CDP on *os(s)aj(j)ati*. According to Geiger, PG § 33 n. 4, this might be due to a contamination of the Sanskrit roots  $\sqrt{srij}$  and  $\sqrt{sarj}$  in Pāli.

Mā-L: *pratinissargāya*, *pratinissareya*; BV 149, PrMoMā-L p.20; Mū: *pratiniḥsargāya*, *pratiniḥsrjet* (LC 7) Cf. MW 666: *pratiniḥ-√srij*. Cf. NP 14: *visajjetvā*, Sd 1: *visaṭṭhi*, NP 1: *nissaggiya*, NP 22: *nissajeyya*.

**iccetam:** then this (is); = *iti* + *etaṃ* > *ity* + *etaṃ* > *iccetaṃ*. When the vowel *i* is followed by a dissimilar vowel it changes to *y* and then *ty* is palatalised to *cc*; see PG 55, & IP p.215 & 217. Cf. *appeva* in Sd 8, *iccete* in Pāc 57, *pacceka-* in the Nid., and *paccaya* in Pāc 47. = **iti:** thus, so, then; deictic particle; see Pār 3 + **etaṃ:** this; acc. sg. of dem. pron. *eta*.

**kusalaṃ:** good, skilful; nom. sg. nt.

**no:** but not, not; negative and adversative particle. The particle *no* is more emphatic than the more common *na*.

ce: (but) if; see above. **paṭinissajeyya**: see above. **saṅghādiseso**: see above.

### [Sd 11: Bhedanuvattakasikkhāpadaṃ]

Tass'eva kho pana bhikkhussa bhikkhū honti anuvattakā vaggavādakā, eko vā dve vā tayo vā, te evaṃ vadeyyuṃ: "Mā āyasmanto<sup>193</sup> etaṃ bhikkhuṃ kiñ-ci avacuttha, dhammavādī c'eso bhikkhu, vinayavādī c'eso bhikkhu, amhākañ-c'eso<sup>194</sup> bhikkhu, chandañ-ca ruciñ-ca ādāya voharati, jānāti no bhāsati, amhākaṃ-p'etaṃ<sup>195</sup> khamatī ti," te bhikkhū bhikkhūhi evaṃ-assu vacanīyā<sup>196</sup>: "Mā āyasmanto<sup>197</sup> evaṃ avacuttha. Na c'eso bhikkhu dhammavādī, na c'eso bhikkhu vinayavādī. Mā āyasmantānam-pi<sup>198</sup> saṅghabhedo rucittha.<sup>199</sup> Samet'āyasmantānaṃ saṅghena, samaggo hi saṅgho sammodamāno avivadamāno<sup>200</sup> ek'uddeso phāsu viharatī ti," evañ-ca te bhikkhū bhikkhūhi vuccamānā tath'eva paggaṇheyyuṃ, te bhikkhū bhikkhūhi yāvatatiyaṃ samanubhāsitaṃbā tassa paṭinissaggāya, yāvatatiyañ-ce samanubhāsiyamānā taṃ paṭinissajeyyuṃ<sup>201</sup> iccetam kusalam, no ce paṭinissajeyyuṃ,<sup>202</sup> saṅghādiseso.

### [The training precept on the followers of the schism]

Now, there are bhikkhus who are followers of that same bhikkhu, [and] who are speaking for [his] faction: one, or two, or three, [and] they should say so: "Venerables, don't say anything to this bhikkhu! This bhikkhu is one who speaks in accordance with the Teaching and this bhikkhu is one who speaks in accordance the Discipline; this [bhikkhu], having received [our] consent and favour defines [the Teaching & Discipline]. Knowing us, he speaks, [and] this suits us too." [Then] those bhikkhus should be spoken to thus by the bhikkhus: "Venerables, don't say so! This bhikkhu does not speak in accordance with the Teaching, and this bhikkhu does not speak in accordance with the Discipline! Don't let the venerables too favour the schism of the community. Let there be convening with the community for the venerables, for a united community, which is on friendly terms, which is not disputing, which has a single recitation, dwells in comfort," and [if] those bhikkhus being spoken to thus by the bhikkhus should persist in the same way [as before], [then] those bhikkhus are to be argued with up to three times by the bhikkhus for the relinquishing of that [course], [and if those bhikkhus] being argued with up to three times, should relinquish that [course], then this is good, [but] if they should not relinquish [it]: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**bhedanānuvattakasikkhāpadaṃ**: the training precept on the followers of the schism; nom. sg. nt. Loc. tapp. cpd or appositive kammadhāraya: "the followers of the schism training precept." = **bhedā**: schism; see below + **anuvattaka**: follower; see below.

**tass'eva**: of that same; junction of *tassa* + *eva* through the elision of the final *a* of *tassa*. = **tassa**: gen. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)* construed with *anuvattakā*; see Syntax 147b. + **eva**: (here:) very, same; emph. particle.

**kho pana**: now, then; see above Nid.

**bhikkhussa**: of that bhikkhu; gen. sg. m.

**bhikkhū**: bhikkhus; nom. pl. m.

**honti**: there are; 3 pl. pres. ind. of *bhavati* ( $\sqrt{bhu} + a$ ).

**anuvattakā**: who followers, who are going along (with him), who are following (him), Ñm: who are followers, H: who throw in their lot with him; adjective qualifying *bhikkhū*, Bb cpd. = pref. *anu-*: along, after + *vatta*: moving; action-noun + pleonastic adjectival suf. *-ka*; see Pāc 12: *aññavāḍake*.

<sup>193</sup> Dm, Um, UP: *māyasmanto*.

<sup>194</sup> Vibh Ce, Um, W: *amhākaṃ c'eso*.

<sup>195</sup> C, D, W: *amhākaṃ p'etaṃ*.

<sup>196</sup> V: *vacanīyā*.

<sup>197</sup> Dm, Um, UP: *māyasmanto*.

<sup>198</sup> Dm, UP: *māyasmantānam-pi*, Um: *māyasmantānaṃ pi*.

<sup>199</sup> Mi & Mm Se, D, C, G, V, W: *rucittha* (= BhPm 1 & 2 v.l.)

<sup>200</sup> G: *avivadamāno*.

<sup>201</sup> = Vibh Ce, C, D, W. Other eds: *paṭinissajjeyyuṃ*. Cf Sd 11.

<sup>202</sup> = Vibh Ce, C, D, W. Other eds: *paṭinissajjeyyuṃ*. Cf Sd 11.

**vaggavādakā**: who are speaking for (his) faction, who are professing his faction, or: who are speaking for disunity, Ñm: who speak on his side, H: take his part; nom. pl. m. adj. Dat. tapp. cpd. acting as an adjective qualifying *bhikkhū*. = **vagga**: faction, sect. *Vagga* can be equivalent to two Sanskrit words. It can be corresponding to the Sanskrit word *vyagra*: factious, dissentious, Pāli: *vi + agga*, an adj. as opposed to *samagga*; see Sd 10 & Vibh to Sd 10. Vin III 173: “*Bhedāya parakkameyyā ti: kathaṃ ime nānā assu vinā assu vaggā assū ti pakkhaṃ pariyesati gaṇaṃ bandhati.*”: “(Thinking) how could there be variance, separation, disunity for these? He seeks a faction, binds a group,” Vin I 316: “... *vaggattā ... samaggattā ...*” A. I 70: “... *vaggā parisā ca samaggā parisā.*” Vin I 108 & 120: “*Na tveva vaggena saṅghena uposatho kātabbo.*”: “You should not do an observance with a disunited community.”

It can also correspond to the Skt *varga*: a section, group, party; e.g. *cīvaravagga*, after NP 10, and Vin I 319: “... *catuvaggo bhikkhusaṅgho ...*”

It seems that in Pāli the distinction in meaning between the 2 words has blurred sometimes. For double meanings of one Pāli words due to being derived from two or more Sanskrit words, see the end of the note on *dosa*, Sd 8.

Vibh: “... *tassa vaṇṇāya pakkhāya ṭhitā honti.*”: “... they are standing in his rank, his party.” The Vibh. thus supports the *varga* sense.

Sa: *vyagravādina*; PrMoSa p.172. Mā-L: *vargavādakā*; BV 150, PrMoMā-L p.10.

+ **vādaka**: speaking, professing, asserting; = *vāda*: speaking; action-noun + pleonastic adjectival suffix *-ka*; see Pāc 12: *aññavādake*.

**eko**: one; num. **dve**: two; num. **tayo**: three; num. **vā ... vā ...**: or; disj. particle.

**te**: they; nom. pl. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*. **evam**: thus; adv.

**vadeyyum**: should say; 3 sg. opt. of *vadati*, cf. Pār 4.

**mā**: don't; prohibitive article constructed with aor., imp., or opt.

**āyasmanto**: venerables; voc. pl. m. cf. Nid. The 2<sup>nd</sup> person plural verb *avacuttha* indicates that a vocative is used here.

**etaṃ**: this; acc. sg. m. of dem. pron. *eta*. **bhikkhum**: to (this) bhikkhu; acc. sg. m.

**kiñ-ci**: anything; acc. sg. nt. (= acc. of external object; Syntax § 31) indefinite pronoun here used as a nt. substantive; see PED *kiṃ*. Cf. “*kiñci desaṃ*” at Sd 9 .

**avacuttha**: you say; 2 pl. aor. of *√vac*; cf. Sd 10. Takes two patients here *bhikkhum* and *kiñci*.

**dhammavādī**: one who speaks in accordance with Teaching, Ñm: a speaker of the Law, H: one who speaks dhamma; adj. Gen. tapp. cpd. acting as a bb cpd. = **dhamma**: teaching, doctrine + **vādī**: one who speaks, one who is professing, asserting; adjective; = *vāda*; speaking + agent-noun suffix *-in*.

**c'eso**: and this; = a junction of *ca* and *esa* through the elision of the final *a* of *ca*. = **ca**: and; conn. particle. + **eso**: this; nom. sg. m. of dem. pron. *eta(d)*. **bhikkhu**: bhikkhu; nom. sg. m.

**vinayavādī**: one who speaks in accordance with the Discipline; adj. Gen. tapp. cpd. acting as a bb cpd. = **vinaya**: discipline; fr. *vineti* (*vi + √ni + e*) dispels + **vādī**: see above.

**amhākañ-c'eso**: = junction of *amhākaṃ* and *c'eso* through palatalisation of *ṃ*. **amhākaṃ**: of us; gen. sg. m. of personal pronoun *amha*. + **c'eso**: see above.

**amhākañ-c'eso bhikkhu, chandañ-ca ruciñ-ca ādāya voharati, jānāti no bhāsati, amhākaṃ-p'etaṃ khamati ti**: Ñm: he speaks in accordance with our desire and choice, he knows and speaks (for us), and that is our wish, H: and this monk, adopting our desire and objective, gives expression to them, he knows that what he says for us also seems good to us.

**chandañ-ca**: = junction of *chandaṃ* and *ca* through the palatalisation of the final *ṃ* of *chandaṃ*.

**chandaṃ**: consent, desire; acc. sg. m. **ca**: and; connective particle.

**ruciñ-ca**: junction of *ruciṃ* + *ca*.



**ruciṃ**: favour, choice, pleasure, liking; acc. sg. f. Der. fr. *ruccati* ( $\sqrt{ruc} + ya$ ): agrees with, is pleased with. Cf. Sn 781: “*Sakañhi diṭṭhiṃ kathamaccayeyya, chandānuniṭṭho ruciyaṃ nivīṭṭho, sayaṃ samattāni pakubbamāno, yathā hi jāneyya tathā vadeyya.*”: “For how would someone led on by consent and stuck in his choice, overcome his own view? Making assumptions by himself, he would speak as he knows.”

**ādāya**: lit. “having taken,” fig. “in accordance with”; abs. of *ādāti* ( $\bar{a} + \sqrt{dā} + a$ ), cf. *upādāya* at Sd 9.

**voharati**: he defines, expresses; 3 sg. pres. ind. ( $vi + ava + \sqrt{har} + a$ ).

**jānāti**: he knows; 3 sg. pres. ind. cf. Pār 4.

**no**: us; enclitic form of the acc. pl. of *amha*, or gen. pl. of us; see Sp below: *amhākaṃ*.

**bhāsati**: he speaks (to us); 3 sg. pres. ind. ( $\sqrt{bhās} + a$ ).

**jānāti no bhāsati**: he knows us (and) speaks; or: he knows (and) speaks to us, or in better English: knowing us he speaks, Nm: he knows us and speaks for us, H: “He knows that what he says also seems good to us.”; according to the Sp *jānāti* qualifies *no*. Sp 611: “*Jānāti no ti: amhākaṃ chandādāni jānāti. Bhāsati ti: evaṃ karomā ti amhehi saddhiṃ bhāsati ti. Amhākaṃ p’etaṃ khamatī ti: yaṃ so karoti evaṃ amhākaṃ pi ruccati*”:

“‘He knows us’: he knows of our consent etc. ‘He speaks’: he speaks together with us (saying): ‘Thus we act,’ ‘This suits us too’: whatever he does, so it also agrees to us.”

Mā-L: “*jānan caiso bhikṣu bhaṣate no ajānan*”; BV 150, PrMoMā-L p.10. Sa: “*jānaṃ caisa bhikṣur bhāṣate nājānaṃ*”; PrMoSa p.173. Both can be translated as “... and this bhikkhu speaks knowing, not unknowing.”

**amhākaṃ-p’etaṃ**: = a junction through labialisation of the final *ṃ* of *amhākaṃ*: dat. sg. m. of *amha*; see above + **pi**: too; emphatic particle of which the *-i* has been elided in the junction with *etaṃ*. + **etaṃ**: this; see above

**khamatī ti** = **khamati**: (it) agrees, suits, is acceptable; 3 sg. pres. ind. ( $\sqrt{kham} + a$ ) takes a dative of interest: *amhākaṃ*; see Syntax § 98a. + **ti**: “...,” end quote; indeclinable that lengthens the final vowel in the preceding word; see “*parisuddhā ti*” in the Nid.

**te bhikkhū bhikkhūhi evam-assu vacanīyā mā āyasmanto**: as in Sd 10, but what is singular there is plural here.

**evaṃ**: thus; see above. **avacuttha**: you say; see above. **na**: not; neg. particle.

**c’eso bhikkhu dhammavādī na ceso bhikkhu vinayavādī mā**: see above.

**āyasmantānaṃ-pi**: to the venerables too; a junction of *āyasmantānaṃ* and *pi* through labialisation of *ṃ*.

**āyasmantānaṃ**: dat. pl. of *āyasmā*, cf. Nid.

**pi**: too, also; emphatic particle.

**saṅghabhedo**: schism of the community; nom. sg. m., gen. tapp. cpd. Cf. Sd 10.

**ruccittha**: let be your choice; 2 pl. aor. of *ruccati*, takes dat. of interest.

**samet’āyasmantānaṃ saṅghena**: let there be convening with the community for the venerables.

**samet’āyasmantānaṃ**: junction of *sametu* + *āyasmantānaṃ* through elision of the final *-u* of *āyasmantānaṃ*.

**āyasmantānaṃ**: for the venerables; here the dat. pl. is used instead of the nom. sg. of Sd 10.

Why is there a change from nominative to dative? Sp takes it to be a genitive: “*Samet’āyasmantānaṃ saṅghenā ti: āyasmantānaṃ cittaṃ saṅghena saddhiṃ sametu samāgacchatu, ekībhaṇḍaṃ yātū ti vuttaṃ hoti.*” “...: let the mind of the venerables convene, meet together, with the community, let it proceed to a state of unity, is said.”

The verb *sameti* is normally constructed with a dative of the person for whom something else is agreeable, e.g. M II 239 f.: “*āyasmantānaṃ kho atthato hi sameti ...*”: “there is agreement to the venerables as to the meaning...,” Th 1036: “*navehi na sameti me*”: “to me there is no agreement with the new ones”; cf. M II 107, S II 285.

*Sameti* is impersonal (“There is agreement/convening”) and thus singular. In this Sd rule *sameti* is impersonal and takes a dative of advantage. Syntax § 98b: “the impersonal *sameti* ... takes the dative of the person for whom someone else (put in the instrumental) is agreeable or favourable.”

However, occasionally it is personalised and has a nominative agent, e.g. Ud 42: “*sameti cittaṃ cittena*”: “mind

agrees/convenes with mind” and S II 157: “... *telaṃ telena saṃsandati sameti*”: “oil flows together (and) convenes with oil” and this is the case in Sd 10: “*samet’āyasmā saṅghena*.”

In the Mā-L version the verb *sametu* has changed from singular 3 sg. imp. to 3 pl. imp.: *samentu*, while *āyusman* has changed from the nom. sg. to the nom. pl. *āyusmanto*.

Mā-L rule 10: “*sametu āyusman sārđhaṃ saṅghena*”; BV 149.

Mā-L Sd 11: “*samentu āyusmanto sārđhaṃ saṅghena*”; BV 150.

*The rest is as at Sd 10, except that what is singular there is plural here.*

### [Sd 12: Dubbacasikkhāpadam]

**Bhikkhu pan’eva dubbacajātiko hoti, uddesapariyāpannesu sikkhāpadesu bhikkhūhi sahadhammikaṃ vuccamāno attānaṃ avacanīyaṃ karoti:** “Mā maṃ āyasmanto kiñ-ci avacuttha, kalyāṇaṃ vā pāpakaṃ vā, aham-p’āyasmante na kiñ-ci vakkhāmi, kalyāṇaṃ vā pāpakaṃ vā. Viramathāyasmanto mama vacanāyā ti”, so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi evaṃ-assa vacanīyo:<sup>203</sup> “Mā āyasmā<sup>204</sup> attānaṃ avacanīyaṃ akāsi. Vacanīyam-evāyasmā<sup>205</sup> attānaṃ karotu. Āyasmā pi bhikkhū vadetu<sup>206</sup> saha dhammena,<sup>207</sup> bhikkhū pi āyasmantaṃ vakkhanti saha dhammena. Evaṃsaṃvaddhā<sup>208</sup> hi tassa bhagavato parisā, yad-idaṃ aññamaññavacanena aññamaññavuṭṭhāpanenā ti,” evañ-ca so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi vuccamāno tath’eva paggaṇheyya, so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi yāvatatiyaṃ samanubhāsitabbo tassa paṭinissaggāya, yāvatatiyañ-ce samanubhāsiyamāno taṃ paṭinissajeyya<sup>209</sup> iccetaṃ kusalaṃ, no ce paṭinissajeyya,<sup>210</sup> saṅghādiseso.

[The training precept on being of a nature difficult to be spoken to]

Now, a bhikkhu is of a nature difficult to be spoken to, [and when] being righteously spoken to by the bhikkhus about the training precepts included in the recitation, he makes himself [one] who can not be spoken to [saying]: “Venerables, don’t say anything good or bad to me, and I too shall not say anything good or bad to the venerables! Venerables, refrain from speaking to me!” [Then] that bhikkhu should be spoken to thus by the bhikkhus: “Let the venerable one not make himself [one] who cannot be spoken to. Let the venerable one make himself [one] who can be spoken to. Let the venerable one speak to the bhikkhus with righteousness and the monks too will speak to the venerable one with righteousness. For the Blessed One’s assembly has grown thus, that is, by the speaking of one to another, by the rehabilitating of one another,” and [if] that bhikkhu being spoken to thus by the bhikkhus should persist in the same way [as before], [then] that bhikkhu is to be argued with up to three times by the bhikkhus for the relinquishing of that [course], [and if that bhikkhu,] being argued with up to three times, should relinquish that [course], then this is good, [but] if he should not relinquish [it]: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**bhikkhu:** a bhikkhu; nom. sg. m.

**pan’eva:** now, now if, further, H: if; junction of *pana* + *eva* in which the final -a of *pana* is elided; PG § 70,1b. =

**pana:** again, and now; conn. particle; see above Nid. + **eva:** just; emph. particle.

**dubbacajātiko:** who is of a nature difficult to be spoken to, Ńm: naturally difficult to admonish, H: one who is difficult to speak to; adj. qualifying *bhikkhu*. Bb cpd. = **dubbaca:** difficult to be spoken to; adj. = kammadhāraya used as b.b. cpd. = pref. **dur-**: difficult, hard; see Pār 1: *dubbalya* + **vaca:** to be spoken to; usually *vaca* means speech, cf. Pāc 7, but here *vaca* is derived from the verbal stem *vaca* like other similar

<sup>203</sup> V: *vacanīyo*. (Not so *avacanīyaṃ* and *vacanīyaṃ* below.)

<sup>204</sup> See Sd 10.

<sup>205</sup> Vibh Ee, Mm Se, BhPm 2, D: “... *vacanīyaṃ eva āyasmā*.” V: “... *vacanīyameva āyasmā*.”

<sup>206</sup> Dm, Be Sp, Um: *vadatu*.

<sup>207</sup> All printed editions, except Ra and BhPm 1 & 2: *sahadhammena*.

<sup>208</sup> Mi & Mm Se, G, Um: *-vaḍḍhā*. All printed editions: *evaṃ saṃvaddhā*. Mi & Mm Se, G, V, Um: *-vaḍḍhā*.

<sup>209</sup> = D, W, Vibh Ce (but has *-nissajjeyya* in Pāc 68), Other eds.: *-nissajjeyya*. C reads *-nissajjeyya* here but *-nissajjeyya* in Sd 12–13 and Pāc 68.

<sup>210</sup> As in previous note.

nouns such as “*duddasa*,” “*duranubodha*,” “*dubbinaya*,” “*susambudha*” etc; see IP p.188. The double *-bb-* is due to the assimilation of the final *-r* of *dur-* and the initial *-v* of *vaca* into *-vv-*, which then changes to *-bb-* as the consonant combinations *-rv-* and *-vv-* don’t occur in Pāli; see *dubbalya* at Pār 1.

The opposite form is *suvaro/subbaco*: easily spoken to. Sp III 612: “*Dubbaco ti: dukkheṇa kicchena vaditabbo, na sakkā sukhena vattun-ti attho*.”: “Difficult to be spoken to: with pain and difficulty he is to be spoken to; it is not possible to speak with ease is the meaning.” Kkh 79: “... *dubbacasabhāvo, vattuṃ asakkuṇeyyo ti attho*.”: “... with a nature of being difficult to be spoken to, one is not able to speak is the meaning.” Cf. BD I 310 n.1. + **jātika**: (here:) nature, character, lit. birth = **jāti**: birth + conn. suf. **-ika**.

**hoti**: he is; 3 sg. pres. ind.; the contracted form of *bhavati*; cf. Nid.

**uddesapariyāpannesu**: included in the recitation (of the Pātimokkha); adj. qualifying *sikkhāpadesu*. Bb cpd. = **uddesa**: recitation; see Pār intro. Padabhājana: “*Pātimokkhapariyāpannesu sikkhāpadesu*.” The Pātimokkha recitation is referred to as *uddesa*; see Pāc 73, Pātimokkha Concl., Sd 10, A I 230 + **pariyāpanna**: included; p.p. of *pariyāpajjati* (*pari* +  $\sqrt{pad}$  + *ya*): goes completely into, include.

**sikkhāpadesu**: with regards the training precepts; loc. pl. nt. Gen. tapp. cpd. = **sikkhā**: training; see Pār 1 + **pada**: rule, item, part, constituent, lit. “path.”

**bhikkhūhi**: by bhikkhus; ins. pl. m.

**sahadhammikaṃ**: righteously, reasonably, legitimately, in accordance with the law, H: according to dhamma, Ñm: lawfully; adjective (bb cpd) used as an adverb of manner; see Syntax § 52 and Bodhi 2000, p.747 n. 72 (to S II 33). = **saha**: with; pref. + **dhamma**: the Teaching + conn. suf. **-ika**; cf. Pāc 71, 79, and M I 231: “*Yo ... tathāgatena ... sahadhammikaṃ pañhaṃ puṭṭho*.”

**vuccamāno**: being spoken to, admonished; pr.p. see Sd 10.

**attānaṃ**: himself; acc. sg. m. of *attā*. = reflexive pron.; see Sd 4: *attakāma*.

**avacanīyaṃ**: one who cannot be spoken to, Ñm: unadmonishable; adj. Bb cpd. qualifying *attānaṃ*. Neg. pref. *a-*: not + *vacanīya*: to be spoken to; see Sd 10.

**karoti**: he makes; 3 sg. pres. ind. ( $\sqrt{kar}$  + *o*)

**maṃ**: to me; acc. sg. m. of pers. pron. *amha*.

**mā ... āyasmanto kiñ-ci avacuttha**: see above Sd 11.

**kalyāṇaṃ**: good; adjective qualifying *kiñ-ci* (here an acc. sg. nt. noun; see Sd 11), or an adjective qualifying an unexpressed *dhammaṃ* or *kiñ-ci*. Cf. Sd 4. **vā ... vā ...**: or ... or ...; disjunctive particle.

**pāpakaṃ**: bad; adj. Cf. Pār 3.

**mā maṃ āyasmanto kiñ-ci avacuttha, kalyāṇaṃ vā pāpakaṃ vā**: venerables, don’t say anything good or bad to me, Ñm: let the venerables not admonish me at all about what is either good or what is bad, H: do not say anything to me, venerables, either good or bad. Ñm translates *kiñ-ci* as an adverb but that would be unusual. Like in Sd 11 it rather seems to act as an accusative neuter substantive with *kalyāṇa* and *pāpaka* qualifying it as adjectives. Ñm translates it as a pronoun to both *kalyāṇaṃ* and *pāpakaṃ* and taking these as abstract nouns in neuter gender; see IP p.62. This seems unlikely, but it is not impossible since the root  $\sqrt{vac}$  can take two patients; see Syntax § 58,c,i, and IP p.18.

**aham-p’āyasmante** = *ahaṃ pi āyasmante*: junction of *ahaṃ* + *pi* + *āyasmante* through labialisation of the final *-ṃ* of *ahaṃ*, and the elision of the *-i* of *pi*.

**ahaṃ**: I; nom. sg. pron. **pi**: also; emph. particle. **āyasmante**: to the venerables; acc. pl. m.

**na**: not; neg. particle. **kiñ-ci**: anything; indef. pron.; see Sd 9.

**vakkhāmi**: I shall say; 1 sg. fut. of  $\sqrt{vac}$ .

**viramathāyasmanto**: junction of *viramatha* + *āyasmanto* through contraction; PG § 69,1.= **viramatha**: refrain from, abstain; 2 pl. imp. of *viramati* (*vi* +  $\sqrt{ram}$  + *a*), takes abl. (Cf. the five training precepts for lay-people formula: “*pāṇātipātā veramaṇī ...*”) + **āyasmanto**.

**mama**: to me; dat. sg. of pers. pron. *ma(d)*.

**vacanāyā ti:** = **vacanāya:** speaking to; dat. sg. nt. of action-noun *vacana*, √*vac* + action-noun suffix *-ana*. Normally *viramati* takes an ablative, but the ending *-āya* is dative in neuter stems. Occasionally there appears to be an assimilation of an ablative to a preceding dative in Pāli and here there is assimilation with the preceding *mama*. Cf. D II 27: "Yassa ... aññatra tathāgatassā ti." and Syntax § 143. + **ti:** "...," end quote; indeclinable that causes lengthening of the final vowel of *vacanāya*; cf. Nid.

**so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi evam-assa vacanīyo mā āyasmā:** see Sd 10.

**akāsi:** make; 2 sg. aor. of *karoti*.

**vacanīyam-evāyasmā:** a junction of *vacanīyam* and *eva* through weakening of the final *-ṃ* of *vacanīyam* and a junction of *eva* and *āyasmā* through contraction.

**eva:** just; emph. particle.

**āyasmā:** the venerable one; nom. sg. m. With a 3<sup>rd</sup> person verb the nominative is used, not a vocative; see Sd 10.

**karotu:** let make; 3 sg. imp. of *karoti*.

**pi:** also; emph. particle.

**vadetu:** let speak to; 3 sg. imp. of *vadeti* (√*vad* + *e*). Regarding the variant reading *vadatu* (√*vad* + *a*): Be Vibh & Vibh Ee have *vadeti* in the origin-story: "So *evam vadeti*: ... *vadeyyam*." Be & Ee Sp comment upon it with *vadatu*, see below. *Vadeti* is not a causative form (which is *vādeti*) and is just an alternative verbal class 10 form of *vadati*, see PG § 139,2 and PED s.v. *vadati*.

Mā-L: *vadatu*; BV 154, PrMoMā-L p.11 Sa: *vadatu*; PrMoSa p.178.

**saha:** with; indecl. *Saha* is here not taken as a prefix but as an indeclinable that takes the instrumental *dhammena*; see Syntax § 64d and the note to Pāc 5: *mātugāmena saha*. However, as some instrumentals are used as adverbs of manner, *sahadhammena* could be taken as one word corresponding to the adverb *sahadhammikaṃ*.

**dhammena:** with righteousness, with legitimacy, with lawfulness; ins. sg. m. Cf. the adverb *sahadhammikaṃ* above. It might refer to *vacanena* & *vuṭṭhāpanena* below. Sp: "*vadetu* (Be: *vadatu*) *saha dhammenā ti sahadhammikenā sikkhāpadena saha dhammena vā aññena pi pāsādikabhāvasaṃvattanikena vacanena vadatu* (= Be, Ee)." "Speak with legitimacy: speak with a legitimate training precept or with another speech leading to a pleasant state."

**āyasmantaṃ:** to the venerable one; acc. sg. m.

**vakkhanti:** they shall speak to, admonish; 3 pl. fut. of √*vac* (of which the present is not found.).

**evamsaṃvaddhā:** thus-grown, Ñm: comes to growth thus, H: thus is the multitude increased for the lord, Norman: has come to growth thus; adj. qualifying *parisā*. Bb cpd. This is a compound, like *evamvādin* (see DP s.v. *evam*), rather than two words as the editions have it. It refers to the past growth rather than to the future growth. = **evam:** thus; indecl. + **saṃvaddhā:** grown, prospered; adj. qualifying *parisā*. = p.p. of *saṃvaddhati* (*saṃ* + √*vaddh* + *a*), Cf. A IV 21: "Yāvakiṃvañ-ca bhikkhū samaggā sannipatissanti, samaggā vuṭṭhahissanti, samaggā saṅghakaraṇīyāni karissanti, vuddhi yeva bhikkhūnaṃ pāṭikaṅkhā no parihāni.": "For as long as the bhikkhus sit down in unity, rise in unity, do community-business in unity, growth can be expected for the bhikkhus, not decline."

**hi:** for, because; emph. particle.

**tassa:** of that; gen. sg. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**bhagavato:** of the Blessed One; gen. sg. m. of *bhagavā*, cf. Nid.

**parisā:** assembly; nom. sg. f. Cf. Nid. + NP 22.

**yad-idam:** that is, that is to say, i.e.; junction of rel. pron. *ya(d)* + *idaṃ* in which the Skt *-d* is restored to avoid hiatus; see Sd 4 *etadaggaṃ* & Pāc 16: *etad-eva*. Warder states that it is an indeclinable emphatic demonstrative; IP p.73. Cf. the masculine form *yo so* (NP 22) with a different demonstrative, and *seyyathidaṃ* at NP 23.

= **yad:** nt. of rel. pron. *ya(d)*: what. + **idaṃ:** this; nt. of dem. pron. *ayaṃ*.

**aññamaññavacanena**: by the speaking of one to one another, Ñm: by mutual admonishment; ins. sg. nt. Gen. tapp. cpd. = **aññamañña**: one another, each other, mutual; lit. another to another; acc. sg. m. reciprocal pronoun. The *m* of *aññamaññam* has been elided in the junction with *vacanena*; cf. Pār 3: “*tuyh’iminā*.” DP suggests it is *añña-m-añña*. PED = *añña*: another one + *añña*: another one + **vacana**: speaking; see above *vacanāya*.

**aññamañnavuṭṭhāpanenā ti**: by the rehabilitating of one another, Ñm: by mutual rehabilitation, H: by assisting one another; Gen. tapp. cpd. = **aññamañña** + **vuṭṭhāpanena**: emerging, raising out of, rehabilitation; ins. sg. nt. Action-noun fr. *vuṭṭhāpeti*: makes emerge, makes rehabilitated; the causative of *vuṭṭhāti* (*vi* + *ud* + *√tha* + *a*): rouses, emerges. PED takes it as hiatus filler *-v-* + *utthāti*. It is often used, as here, in relation to “emerging” from offences through confession, e.g. Vin I 64: “*āpattiyaṃ vuṭṭhāna*.” The Skt form is *utthāpana* and the *-v-* is a fossilised junction consonant; see the note on *voropeti* at Pār 3. + **ti**: “...,” end quote; cf. Nid.

**evañ-ca ... saṅghādiseso**: as in Sd 10 but what is sg. there is pl. here.

### [Sd 13: Kuladūsakasikkhāpadaṃ]

Bhikkhu pañeva aññataraṃ gāmaṃ vā nigamaṃ vā upanissāya viharati kuladūsako pāpasamācāro. Tassa kho<sup>211</sup> pāpakā samācārā dissanti c’eva suyyanti<sup>212</sup> ca, kulāni ca tena duṭṭhāni dissanti c’eva suyyanti<sup>213</sup> ca, so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi evaṃ-assa vacanīyo:<sup>214</sup> “Āyasmā kho kuladūsako pāpasamācāro. Āyasmato kho pāpakā samācārā dissanti c’eva suyyanti<sup>215</sup> ca, kulāni cāyasmatā duṭṭhāni dissanti c’eva suyyanti<sup>216</sup> ca. Pakkamat’āyasmā imamahā āvāsā. Alaṃ te<sup>217</sup> idha vāsenā ti,”<sup>218</sup> evañ-ca so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi vuccamāno te bhikkhū evaṃ vadeyya: “Chandagāmino ca bhikkhū, dosagāmino ca bhikkhū, mohagāmino ca bhikkhū, bhayagāmino ca bhikkhū, tādīsikāya āpattiyaṃ ekaccaṃ pabbājenti, ekaccaṃ na pabbājenti ti,” so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi evaṃ-assa vacanīyo: “Mā āyasmā<sup>219</sup> evaṃ avaca, na ca bhikkhū chandagāmino, na ca bhikkhū dosagāmino, na ca bhikkhū mohagāmino, na ca bhikkhū bhayagāmino. Āyasmā kho kuladūsako pāpasamācāro, āyasmato kho pāpakā samācārā dissanti c’eva suyyanti<sup>220</sup> ca, kulāni cāyasmatā duṭṭhāni dissanti c’eva suyyanti<sup>221</sup> ca. Pakkamat’āyasmā imamahā āvāsā. Alaṃ te<sup>222</sup> idha vāsenā ti,” evañ-ca so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi vuccamāno tath’eva paggaṇheyya, so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi yāvatatiyaṃ samanubhāsitaṃ tassa paṭinissaggāya, yāvatatiyañ-ce samanubhāsiyamāno taṃ paṭinissajeyya<sup>223</sup> iccetaṃ kusalaṃ, no ce paṭinissajeyya,<sup>224</sup> saṅghādiseso.

### [The training precept on the spoiler of families]

Now, a bhikkhu lives dependent upon a certain village or town who is a spoiler of families, who is of bad behaviour. His bad behaviour is seen and is heard about, and the families spoilt by him are seen and heard about. That bhikkhu is to be spoken to thus by the bhikkhus: “The venerable one is a spoiler of families, one who is of bad behaviour. The bad behaviour of the venerable one is seen and is heard about, and the families spoilt by the venerable one are seen and are heard about. Let the venerable one depart from this dwelling-place! Enough of you dwelling here!” and [if] that bhikkhu being spoken to thus by the bhikkhus should say thus to those bhikkhus: “The bhikkhus are driven by desire; the bhikkhus are

<sup>211</sup> BhPm 1 & 2, C, D, G, V, W, Ra: *tassa pāpakā* ...

<sup>212</sup> C, D, W: *sūyanti*.

<sup>213</sup> C, D, W: *sūyanti*.

<sup>214</sup> V: *vacanīyo*.

<sup>215</sup> C, D, W: *sūyanti*.

<sup>216</sup> C, D, W: *sūyanti*.

<sup>217</sup> Mi & Mm Se, BhPm 1 & 2, C, G, V, W, Um, Ra: *alan-te*.

<sup>218</sup> BhPm 1 & 2, Um, Vibh Ee: *idhavāsenā ti*.

<sup>219</sup> As in Sd 10.

<sup>220</sup> C, D, W: *sūyanti*.

<sup>221</sup> C, D, W: *sūyanti*.

<sup>222</sup> Mi & Mm Se, BhPm 1 & 2, C, G, V, W, Um, Ra: *alan-te*.

<sup>223</sup> = D, W, Vibh Ce (but has *-nissajjeyya* in Pāc 68), Other eds.: *-nissajjeyya*. C reads *-nissajjeyya* here but *-nissajeyya* in Sd 12–13 and Pāc 68.

<sup>224</sup> As in previous note.



driven by anger; the bhikkhus are driven by delusion; the bhikkhus are driven by fear. They banish someone because of this kind of offence, [but] another one they do not banish.” [Then] that bhikkhu is to be spoken to thus by the bhikkhus: “Let the venerable one not speak thus! The bhikkhus are not driven by desire; and the bhikkhus are not driven by anger; and the bhikkhus are not driven by delusion; and the bhikkhus are not driven by fear. The venerable one is a spoiler of families, one who is of bad behaviour. The bad behaviour of the venerable one is seen and is heard about, and the families spoilt by the venerable one are seen and are heard about. Let the venerable one depart from this dwelling-place! Enough of you dwelling here!” and [if] that bhikkhu being spoken to thus by the bhikkhus should persist in the same way [as before], [then] that bhikkhu is to be argued with up to three times by the bhikkhus for the relinquishing of that [course], [and if that bhikkhu,] being argued with up to three times, should relinquish that [course], then this is good, [but] if he should not relinquish [it]: [this is a case concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure].

**bhikkhu pan’eva**: “now, a bhikkhu ...”; see Sd 12.

**aññataram**: some, one or another, a certain; adjective; see above Nid. concl.

**gāmaṃ**: village; acc. sg. m. **vā**: or; disj. particle.

**nigamaṃ**: town; acc. sg. m.

**upanissāya**: dependent upon (for support; i.e., for alms, etc.); indeclinable, originally an abs. of *upanissayati* (*upa + nis + √(s)sī + ya*), which takes an accusative of the thing governed; see Syntax § 55, cf. *uddissa* in NP 8–10. *Upanissāya* can be regarded as a postposition; see IP p.239.

**viharati**: he lives, dwells; 3 sg. pres. ind. (*vi + √har + a*). Here an auxiliary verb expressing duration; see IP p.239.

**kuladūsako**: one who is spoiling families, one who is a spoiler of families, Ñm: who is a corrupter of families, H: one who brings a family into disrepute; adjective qualifying bhikkhu. Acc. or gen. tapp. cpd. acting as a bb cpd qualifying *bhikkhu*. = **kula**: family, clan + **dūsaka**: one who is spoiling, spoiler, corrupter; agent-noun. = *dūsa*: spoiling; action-noun fr. *√dus + agent-noun suffix -aka* causing lengthening in the root *√dus*; see Pāc 12. Cf. *duṭṭha* below.

**pāpasamācāro**: who is of bad behaviour, Ñm: of bad behaviour, H: of depraved conduct; adjective qualifying *bhikkhu*. Kammadhāraya cpd used as bb cpd. = **pāpa**: bad + **samācāra**: behaviour, conduct, activity; action-noun fr. *samācarati* (*saṃ + ā + √car + a*): behaves, acts, practises.

**tassa**: of him; gen. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*. **kho**: no need to translate.; emphatic particle.

**pāpakā**: bad; adjective qualifying *samācārā*; cf. Sd 12.

**samācārā**: behaviour, conduct, activities, practices; nom. pl. m. Although the *samācārā* is plural here and should literally be translated as “behaviours,” this sounds odd in English and it has been translated as “behaviour” instead, which carries a plural sense.

**dissanti**: are seen; 3 pl. pres. ind. pass. of *√dis*.

**c’eva**: = junction of *ca + eva* in which the *-a* of *ca* is elided.

**ca ... ca ...**: both ... and; connective particle. **eva**: just; emph. particle.

**suyyanti**: are heard; 3 pl. pres. ind. pass. of *suṇāti*; see above Nid.

**kulāni**: families; nom. pl. nt. of *kula*; see above.

**tena**: by him; 3 sg. ins. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**duṭṭhāni**: spoiled, corrupted; p.p. of *dussati* used as adj. qualifying *kulāni*; see Sd 8.

**so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi evam-assa vacanīyo**: see Sd 10.

**āyasmā**: venerable one; nom. sg. m. **āyasmato**: of the venerable one; gen. sg. m.

**cāyasmatā**: = junction of *ca + āyasmatā* by way of contraction; PG § 69.

**āyasmatā**: by the venerable one; ins. sg. m.

**pakkamat'āyasmā:** junction of *pakkamatu* and *āyasmā* through elision of the final -u of *pakkamatu*. = **pakkamatu:** let depart, let leave; 3 sg. imp. of *pakkamati* (*pa* + √*kam* + *a*): leaves, departs; cf. Pāc 14 + **āyasmā:** see above.

**imamhā:** from this; abl. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ayaṃ*.

**āvāsā:** dwelling-place, residence; abl. sg. m. fr. *āvasati* (*ā* + √*vas* + *a*) resides.

**alam:** enough; an indeclinable that takes an instrumental or a dative. It is not clear whether *alam* here takes the dative *te*, or the instrumental *vāsena*, or both. *Alaṃ* with an instrumental expresses an invitation to stop; Syntax § 82b. *Alaṃ* with a noun in dative denotes a person for whom something is fit or proper; see Pār 4: *alam-ariya*, and Syntax § 108d.

**te:** for you; dat. sg. of pers. pron. *tvaṃ*.

**idha:** here; adv.

**vāsenā ti:** = **vāsena:** dwelling; ins. sg. nt. action-noun; = √*vas* + action-noun suf. -ana + **ti:** "...," end quote; cf. Nid.

**evañ-ca so bhikkhu bhikkhūhi vuccamāno:** see Sd 10. **te bhikkhū evaṃ:** see Sd 11.

**vadeyya:** should say; 3 sg. opt. of *vadati* (√*vad* + *a*): says.

**chandagāmino:** driven by desire, moved by desire, going by desire; adjective qualifying *bhikkhū*. nom. pl. of *chandagāmi*; = **chanda:** desire + **-gāmin:** moved by, lit. going; adj. used in cpds.

**dosa:** hate, **moha:** delusion, **bhaya:** fear.

**tādisikāya:** this kind of, of such kind; Adjective qualifying *āpattiyā*. Ins. sg. f. of adj. **tādisika** = *tādī*: such; fr. dem. pron. *ta(d)* + √*dis*: to see; cf. *mādisaṃ*; Sd 4. + conn. suf. -ika. It takes the ins. sg. ending of the feminines in *ā*; see IP p.9 & 61.

**āpattiyā:** because of an offence, due to an offence; ins. sg. f. of *āpatti*. Instrumental of cause or motive; see IP pp.44–45.

**ekaccaṃ:** someone, a certain one; acc. sg. nt.; see PG 113,9. = *eka* + *ya* > *eka-t-ya* > *ekacca*; see Sd 10: *iccetam* & PG 73,5.

**ekaccaṃ ... ekaccaṃ ...:** someone ... another one ...; see PG 113,9.

**pabbājenti:** they banish; 3 pl. pres. ind. of *pabbājeti*, the causative of *pabbajati*—see Pār 2. This *bhikkhu* is referring to the legal act of banishment, *pabbājaniyakamma*. One of the acts of punishment, *daṇḍakamma*, which the Saṅgha can impose on an erring *bhikkhu*. A *bhikkhu* on whom this punishment has been imposed has to leave the area of his residence; see Dhirasekera 118–121.

**ekaccaṃ na pabbājenti ti. So ... avaca:** see above.

**na:** not; neg. particle. For the rest see above.

### [Saṅghādisesa conclusion]

Uddiṭṭhā kho āyasmanto terasa saṅghādisesā dhammā, nava paṭhamāpattikā<sup>225</sup> cattāro yāvatatiyakā. Yesaṃ bhikkhu aññataram vā aññataram vā āpajjitvā, yāvatihama<sup>226</sup> jānaṃ paṭicchādeti, tāvatihama<sup>227</sup> tena bhikkhunā akāmā parivatthabbaṃ.<sup>228</sup> Parivutthaparivāsena<sup>229</sup> bhikkhunā uttariṃ<sup>230</sup> chārattaṃ bhikkhumānattāya paṭipajjitabbaṃ. Ciṇṇamānatto bhikkhu, yattha siyā vīsatiḡaṇo bhikkhusaṅgho,<sup>231</sup> tattha so bhikkhu<sup>232</sup> abbhetabbo. Ekena pi ce ūno<sup>233</sup> vīsatiḡaṇo bhikkhusaṅgho taṃ bhikkhuṃ abheyya,

<sup>225</sup> V: *patham-*

<sup>226</sup> Be, UP, G, V: *yāvatihama*.

<sup>227</sup> Be, UP, G, V: *tāvatihama*.

<sup>228</sup> V: *parivaṭṭhabbaṃ*.

<sup>229</sup> V: *parivutṭha-*.

<sup>230</sup> Dm, Vibh Ce, Um: *uttari*.

<sup>231</sup> BhPm 1, C, V, W: *-saṅgho*.

<sup>232</sup> Mi v.l.: *bhikkhu bhikkhūhi*.

<sup>233</sup> V, Bh Pm 2 (syāma) v.l.: *ono*. Um, G: *ūno*.

so ca bhikkhu anabbhito, te ca bhikkhū gārayhā. Ayaṃ tattha sāmīci.

Tatthāyasmante pucchāmi: Kacci'ttha parisuddhā?

Dutiyam-pi pucchāmi: Kacci'ttha parisuddhā?

Tatiyam-pi pucchāmi: Kacci'ttha parisuddhā?

Parisuddh'etthāyasmanto, tasmā tuṇhī, evam-etam dhārayāmi.<sup>234</sup>

*Saṅghādisesuddeso niṭṭhito.*<sup>235</sup>

Venerables, the thirteen cases [concerning] the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure] have been recited, nine [cases] are of the offence-at-once [-class], four [cases] are of the up-to-the-third [time admonition-class]. A bhikkhu who has committed any one of [these offenses], has to stay on probation with no choice [in the matter] for as many days as he knowingly conceals [it]. Moreover, by a bhikkhu who has stayed on the probation, a six-night state of deference to [other] bhikkhus has to be entered upon. [When] the bhikkhu [is one by whom] the deference has been performed: wherever there may be a community of bhikkhus, which is a group of twenty [or more bhikkhus], there that bhikkhu should be reinstated. If a community of bhikkhus, which is a group of twenty deficient by even one [bhikkhu], should reinstate that bhikkhu [then] that bhikkhu is not reinstated, and those monks are blameworthy. This is the proper procedure here.

Concerning that I ask the venerables: [Are you] pure in this?

A second time again I ask: [Are you] pure in this?

A third time again I ask: [Are you] pure in this?

The venerables are pure in this, therefore there is silence, so do I bear this [in mind].

*The recitation concerning the community in the beginning and the rest [of the procedure] is finished.*

**uddiṭṭhā kho āyasmanto:** see Nid concl.

**terasa saṅghādisesā dhammā:** see Sd intro.

**nava:** nine; numeral.

**paṭhamāpattikā:** which are of the offence-at-once-class, (lit. “first offence-ish”), Ñm: being established on the first transgression, H: which become offence at once; adj. qualifying *dhammā*. Bb cpd. = **paṭhama:** first, at once; ordinal + **āpattika:** belonging to the offence; = *āpatti:* offence + connective adjectival suf. -ka. Cf. Vin IV 226: “bhikkhunī paṭhamāpattikaṃ dhammaṃ āpannaṃ.”

**cattāro:** four; numeral.

**yāvatatīyakā:** which are of the (challenging) up to the third time-class, H: which are not completed until the third admonition; adj. qualifying *dhammā*. Bb cpd. **yāva:** as far as, up to; indecl. + **tatiya:** third: ordinal + connective adjectival suf. -ka. Ñm renders: “being established on the third transgression.” This is incorrect for what is meant here are the three challenges by other bhikkhus for giving up the wrong course. If the bhikkhu does not relinquish his behaviour upon the third challenge then he incurs the Sd offence.

**yesaṃ bhikkhu aññataraṃ vā aññataraṃ vā āpajjitvā:** a bhikkhu who has committed any one of which; see Pār concl.

**yāvatihaṃ ... tāvatihaṃ ...:** lit. for as many days ... for so many days; i.e., for as many days as; adverbs in

<sup>234</sup> = Mm Se, Ra, BhPm 1 & 2, C, D, G, V, W.

<sup>235</sup> Ñd Ce, UP, Mi Se: *Saṅghādisesuddeso tatiyo*. Dm: *Saṅghādiseso niṭṭhito*.

acc. sg. nt. Abbayibhāva cpds. = relative clause with the adverbs of time **yāva** & **tāva** + **-t-**: hiatus-filler + **iha** = *aha*: day; nt. Cf. NP 1: *dasāha*. *Yāvatiham* & *tāvatiham* are abbayibhāva adverbial cpds in acc. sg. nt. Other relative clause constructions: *yattha/tattha*, Sd concl; *yena/tena*, Aniy 1; *yaṃ/taṃ*, NP 10 & Pāc 73; *yāva/tāva*, Pāc 71; *yo/so*, NP 22; *ye/te*, Pāc 68; *yāni/tāni*, NP 29; *yato/tattha*, NP 10; *yassa/so*, Pāc 84; *tassa/yaṃ*, NP 22; see IP p.71 & 291f.

**jānaṃ**: knowingly; nom. sg. m. Pr.p. of *jānāti* used like an adverb, or agreeing with *bhikkhu* (“(though) knowing it”); see note on *jānaṃ* at Pār 4.

**paṭicchādeti**: he conceals; 3 sg. pres. ind. (*paṭi* +  $\sqrt{\text{chad}}$  + *e*); cf. Pāc 64.

**tena**: by that; ins. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

**bhikkhunā**: by (that) *bhikkhu*; ins. sg. m.

**akāmā**: without choice, involuntarily, whether one likes it or not, against one’s will, unwillingly, Ñm: with no choice in the matter, H: even against his will; kammadhāraya used as ins. sg. m. adverb. (Probably not an ablative of cause as DP suggests). = instrumental of attendant circumstances, see Syntax § 75c and 65c, ending in *-ā* (see *sahatthā* at NP 16); = neg. pref. *a-* + *kāma*: desire, liking, will; m. An idiom that is difficult to translate. Sp: “*Akāmā parivattabbāna-ti na kāmena, na vāsena, atha kho akāmena avāsena parivāsaṃ samādāya vatthabbaṃ*.”: “With no choice/liking, with no control/authority. Then with no choice/liking, no control he has to dwell having undertaken the probation period.” Cf. Vin I 282–83/Mv VIII,4: “... *akāmā bhāgaṃ dātuṃ*.”: “to give a share with no choice.” Sp 1120: “... *anicchāya dātuṃ*.”: “... to give against their choice.”

D-a 263: “*attanā anicchāya*”: “not with his own choice.”

The commentaries explanations: *akāmena* & *anicchāya*, suggest it to be an instrumental in *-ā*. Some masculine instrumentals in *-ā* are instrumentals of means, e.g. *sahatthā* at Pāc 41; see Syntax § 6, 66a, 67, and 122.

**parivattabbam**: is to stay on probation; nom. sg. nt. of the f.p.p. of *parivasati* (*pari* +  $\sqrt{\text{vas}}$  + *a*): stays, dwells, spends for a certain amount of time, agreeing with an unexpressed *taṃ*.

For the *parivāsa* and *mānatta* procedures, see BMC I, pp.154–156, TP xlix-li, Nolot 1996, and Vajirañāṇavarorasa, *The Entrance to the Vinaya*, 1983, Vol. III, pp.312–364.

**parivutthaparivāse**: lit.: by whom the staying in probation has been stayed, who has stayed the probation; adj. qualifying *bhikkhunā*; Inverted kammadhāraya used as Bb cpd that acts as passive subordinate clause; see IP p.137, 155, , and *ciṇṇamānato* below. The clause is passive and the traditional Pāli grammarians would explain it as: “*yena parivāso parivuttho so*”: “by whom the probation has been stayed..”

= **parivuttha**: stayed; p.p. of *parivasati* (pref. *pari-*: around, about +  $\sqrt{\text{vas}}$ : stays, dwells) + **parivāsa**: the staying in probation, probation-period; action-noun derived from *parivasati*.

**uttariṃ**: moreover, further; indecl., adv. to *paṭipajjitabbaṃ*; see Pāc 73, and NP 3.

**chārattam**: six-night; acc. sg. nt. adverbial expression = **cha(!)**: six; numeral of which the original final consonant *-ḷ* has been assimilated to the initial consonant of *rattam*. Because the consonant-combinations *-rr-* is not used in Pāli the final *-a* in *cha-* gets lengthened instead in accordance with the law of Morae to make a long syllable; see PG § 67. + **rattam**: night. In the Vinaya the passage of nights is counted since the lunar-calendar is used. A twenty-four hour period is therefore counted as a night not as a day; see BMC 154.

**bhikkhumānattāya**: state of deference to *bhikkhus*, Ñm: penance for *bhikkhus*, H: the monk’s *mānatta* discipline; dat. sg. nt. Dat. tapp. cpd. = **bhikkhu**: *bhikkhu* + **mānatta**: meaning not certain. The commentary (Kkh 87/Sp 629) states: “*Bhikkhumānattāya ti bhikkhūnaṃ mānanabhāvāya, ārāddhanattāya ti vuttaṃ hoti*” “State of deference to *bhikkhus*: the state of the deferring of *bhikkhus*, for the purpose of conciliating/winning approval, it is said.” See Nolot, 1996, III, n. 6: “Traditional etymology points to some kind of ‘conciliation’ or ‘conciliatory measure’.”

= *māna*: (here:) honor, deference, respect; fr. *māneti*: defers, honors (Used in the *aparihāniyā dhammā* at A IV 21.) + abstract suf. *-tta*: state, condition. The translations in Chinese (“respectful behavior”) and Tibetan (“making glad”) of other Buddhist schools are in accordance with the Pāli commentarial interpretation; see BHSGD II *mānatva* and also Dhirasekera 113f.

**paṭipajjitabbam**: is to enter upon, follow, undergo; f.p.p. of *paṭipajjati* (*paṭi* +  $\sqrt{\text{pad}}$  + *ya*): undergoes, enters upon a path or course.

**ciṇṇamānatto**: by whom the *mānatta* has been performed, who has gone through the deference; adjective qualifying bhikkhu. Kammadhāraya used as bb cpd acting as a passive subordinate clause; see IP p.155, *parivutthaparivāso* above, and Pātimokkha concl: *suttāgataṃ*. Traditionally the cpd would be explained as “*yena mānatto ciṇṇo so*” = **ciṇṇa**: has been gone through, proceeded; p.p. of *carati* ( $\sqrt{\text{car}}$  + *a*): goes, moves + **mānatta**: see above.

**ciṇṇamānatto bhikkhu**: a bhikkhu (is one by whom) the deference (to bhikkhus) has been performed, Ñm: “When the bhikkhu has completed the penance ...,” H: “if, when the monk has performed the mānatta discipline, ...” Possibly a nominative absolute, the nominative noun and participle being in agreement like the locative and genitive absolute in similar introductory clauses in NP 1–3 and Pāc 22; see Syntax § 26. Cf. “*yāni kho pana tāni ...*” at NP 22, and at NP 29 where it is preceded by another introductory clause: “*upavassaṃ kho pana kattikapuṇṇamaṃ*.” Since the verb *hoti* is implied in these constructions, it is usually not directly expressed; see Syntax § 20b-c.

**yattha ... tattha ...**: where ... there ..., when ... then ...; relative clause with **yattha**: where, wherever, when; adv. of place = rel. pron. *ya* + suf. of place *-ttha*. **tattha**: there, in that place, then; adv. of place. = dem. pron. *ta(d)* + *-ttha*, cf. Nid intro and Pār intro. Both the local and temporal sense of *yattha* are possible, however, it seems more likely that the local sense is the correct one as the bhikkhu is allowed to go to another monastery to do the *abbhāna*, while the temporal sense would imply that he might have to wait for long until twenty bhikkhus are found who are willing to come to the monastery and participate in the *abbhāna*. The Kkh supports the local sense: “*yattha siyā vīsati gaṇo ti ettha vīsati saṅgho gaṇo assā ti vīsati gaṇo*”; Kkh 87.

**siyā**: may be; 3 sg. opt. of *atthi*; see above Nid.

**vīsati gaṇo bhikkhusaṅgho**: a community of bhikkhus which is a group of twenty.

**vīsati gaṇo**: a group of twenty; adjective qualifying *bhikkhusaṅgho*. Digu cpd. = **vīsati**: 20, num. + **gaṇo**: group, chapter; cf. Pāc 32.

**bhikkhusaṅgho**: community of bhikkhus; nom. sg. m. Gen. tapp. cpd.

**tattha**: herein, in this case; indecl. See Nid. concl.

**so**: that; 3 sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*. **bhikkhu**: nom. sg. m.

**abbhetabbo**: should be reinstated, can be..., Ñm: must be reinstated, H: may be rehabilitated; f.p.p. of *abbheti* (*abhi* + *ā* +  $\sqrt{\text{i}}$  + *e*): lit. makes come back to, DP: summons, recalls. = Skt *āhvayati* corresponding to Pāli *avheti/avhāyati* (*ā* +  $\sqrt{\text{vhā}}$  + *aya/e*): summons, calls back. *Abbheti* presumably arose by way of *\*ābhayati/ābheti* from the Skt *āhvayati* in accordance with the Skt *-hv-* > Pāli *-vh-* alternation (e.g. *jihvā* > *jivhā*), see PG 49,1, and the *-v-* > *-b-* alternation, see PG 46,1 & 51,3, then, through the law of Morae *ābh-* becomes *abbh-* in Pāli, see PG § 5.

Sp 690: “*Abbhetabbo ti abhi etabbo sampañicchitabbo abbhānakammavasena osāretabbo ti vuttaṃ hoti. Avhātabbo ti vā attho*.”: “*Abbhetabbo*: ‘One is to come back (*eti*) towards (*abhi*), is to be accepted, by means of the legal act of reinstatement (*abbhāna*) one is to be made to re-enter (the Saṅgha)’ is said. Or: ‘one is to be summoned/called back’ is the meaning.”

There seems to be no obligation in the Vinaya that the bhikkhu *has* to be reinstated in any monastery where there are 20 bhikkhus or more. The bhikkhus in a monastery might not wish to do the procedure for some reason and can therefore send the bhikkhu to another monastery, thus it is preferable to translate the f.p.p. here with “should be” or “can be” as at NP 10, Pāc 47, etc.

**ekena**: by one; ins. sg. m. of *eka*.

**pi**: even; emph. particle; see Pār 1.

**ce**: if; conditional particle.

**ūno**: deficient, lacking; adjective agreeing with *bhikkhusaṅgho*, taking the instrumental *ekena*. Cf. Pāc 65.



**taṃ bhikkhuṃ**: that bhikkhu; acc. sg. of “so bhikkhu”; see above.

**abbheyya**: should reinstate; 3 sg. opt. of *abbheti*; see above.

**ca**: and; conn. particle.

**anabbhito**: not reinstated; neg. pref. *an-* + p.p. of *abbheti*; see above.

**te bhikkhū**: those bhikkhus; nom. pl. of “so bhikkhu”; see above.

**gārayhā**: are blameworthy, are to be blamed; f.p.p. of *garahati* ( $\sqrt{\text{garah}} + \text{ya} > \text{garahya} > \text{garayha}$ ) used as an adjective to *bhikkhū*; cf. Pāc 65 and Pd 1.

**ayaṃ**: this; nom. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ayaṃ*.

**sāmīci**: the right course, proper procedure; nom. sg. f.

**ayaṃ tattha sāmīci**: this is the proper procedure here, Ñm: this is the proper course here.

**tatth’āyasmante ... niṭṭhito**: see Sd intro. + Nid concl.

**saṅghādises’uddeso**: the recitation concerning the community in the beginning and the rest [of the procedure]; nom. sg. m. Kammadhāraya cpd. Junction of *saṅghādisesa* + *uddeso* through the elision of *-a*. =

**saṅghādisesa**: see above. + **uddeso**: recitation; nom. sg. m.; see Pār intro.

This is the third of the four ways of reciting the Pātimokkha in brief; see the “Recitation of the Pātimokkha” section in the Introduction.

**niṭṭhito**: finished; see Nid concl.

## [Aniyatuddeso<sup>236</sup>]

**Ime kho panāyasmanto dve aniyatā dhammā uddesaṃ āgacchanti.**

### [The recitation of the uncertain [cases]]

**Venerables, these two uncertain cases come up for recitation.**

**aniyat’uddeso**: the recitation of the uncertain (cases); nom. sg. m. . Probably an appositive kammadhāraya, but here rendered as a genitive tappurisa; see *niddān’uddesa* in Nid intro. See below Aniy conclusion.

**Ime kho panāyasmanto ... dhammā uddesaṃ āgacchanti**: see Pār & Sd intro.

**dve**: two; nom. m. sg.

**aniyatā**: Ñm: indefinite, H: undetermined, unfixed, uncertain; adj., neg. pref. *a-* + *niyata*: fixed, certain, fr. *niyameti* (*ni* +  $\sqrt{\text{yam}}$  + *e*): restrains, fixes, ties down.

## [Aniy 1: Paṭhama-aniyatasikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu mātuḡāmena saddhiṃ eko ekāya raho paṭicchanne āsane alaṅkammaniye<sup>237</sup> nisajjaṃ kappeyya, tam-enaṃ saddheyyavacasā upāsikā disvā tiṇṇaṃ dhammānaṃ aññatarena vadeyya: pārājikena vā saṅghādisesena vā pācittiyena vā, nisajjaṃ bhikku paṭijānamāno tiṇṇaṃ dhammānaṃ aññatarena kāretabbo: pārājikena vā saṅghādisesena vā pācittiyena vā, yena vā sā saddheyyavacasā upāsikā vadeyya, tena so bhikkhu kāretabbo, ayaṃ dhammo aniyato.

### [The first uncertain training precept]

**If any bhikkhu should sit down together with a woman, one [man] with one [woman], privately, on a concealed seat [that is] sufficiently fit for doing [it], [and then if] a female lay-follower whose words can be trusted having seen that, should speak according to one of three cases: according to disqualification, according to what concerns the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure], or**

<sup>236</sup> = Be & Mi Se. D: *Aniyatā*; Um has this in brackets. Nothing in other texts.

<sup>237</sup> C, Vibh Ee: *alaṅkammaniye*. Dm, Um, Mm Se, V, W: *alaṅkammaniye*. UP, G, BhPm 1 & 2, Ra: *alaṃ kammaniye*.