saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

1. khemāsutta
1. With Khemā

ekaṃ samayaṃ bhagavā sāvatthiyaṃ viharati jetavane anāthapiṇḍikassa ārāme.
At one time the Buddha was staying near Sāvatthī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's monastery.

tena kho pana samayena khemā bhikkhunī kosalesu cārikaṃ caramānā antarā ca sāvatthiṃ antarā ca sāketaṃ toraṇavatthusmiṃ vāsaṃ upagatā hoti.
Now at that time the nun Khemā was wandering in the land of the Kosalans between Sāvatthī and Sāketa when she took up residence in Toraṇavatthu.

atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo sāketā sāvatthiṃ gacchanto, antarā ca sāketaṃ antarā ca sāvatthiṃ toraṇavatthusmiṃ ekarattivāsaṃ upagacchi.
Then King Pasenadi was traveling from Sāketa to Sāvatthī, and he too stayed in Toraṇavatthu for a single night.

atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo aññataraṃ purisaṃ āmantesi:
Then King Pasenadi addressed a man,

"ehi tvaṃ, ambho purisa, toraṇavatthusmiṃ tathārūpaṃ samaṇaṃ vā brāhmaṇaṃ vā jāna yamahaṃ ajja payirupāseyyan"ti.
"Please, mister, check if there's a suitable ascetic or brahmin in Toraṇavatthu to whom I can pay homage."

"evaṃ, devā"ti kho so puriso rañño pasenadissa kosalassa paṭissutvā kevalakappaṃ toraṇavatthuṃ āhiṇḍanto nāddasa tathārūpaṃ samaṇaṃ vā brāhmaṇaṃ vā yaṃ rājā pasenadi kosalo payirupāseyya.
"Yes, Your Majesty," replied that man. He searched all over Toraṇavatthu, but he couldn't see a suitable ascetic or brahmin for the king to pay homage to.

addasā kho so puriso khemaṃ bhikkhuniṃ toraṇavatthusmiṃ vāsaṃ upagataṃ.
But he saw that the nun Khemā was staying there,

disvāna yena rājā pasenadi kosalo tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā rājānaṃ pasenadiṃ kosalaṃ etadavoca:
so he went to the king and said to him,

"natthi kho, deva, toraṇavatthusmiṃ tathārūpo samaṇo vā brāhmaṇo vā yaṃ devo payirupāseyya.
"Your Majesty, there's no ascetic or brahmin in Toraṇavatthu for the king to pay homage to.

atthi ca kho, deva, khemā nāma bhikkhunī, tassa bhagavato sāvikā arahato sammāsambuddhassa.
But there is the nun Khemā, who's a disciple of the Blessed One, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha.

tassā kho pana ayyāya evaṃ kalyāṇo kittisaddo abbhuggato:
She has a good reputation as being

'paṇḍitā, viyattā medhāvinī bahussutā cittakathā kalyāṇapaṭibhānā'ti.
astute, competent, clever, learned, a brilliant speaker, and eloquent.

taṃ devo payirupāsatū"ti.
Your Majesty may pay homage to her."

atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo yena khemā bhikkhunī tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā khemaṃ bhikkhuniṃ abhivādetvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho rājā pasenadi kosalo khemaṃ bhikkhuniṃ etadavoca:
Then King Pasenadi of Kosala went up to the nun Khemā, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to her:

"kiṁ nu kho, ayye, hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā"ti?
"Ma'am, does a Realized One exist after death?"

"abyākataṁ kho etaṁ, mahārāja, bhagavatā:
"Great king, this has not been declared by the Buddha."

'hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṁ panayye, na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā"ti?
"Well then, does a Realized One not exist after death?"

"etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṁ bhagavatā:
"This too has not been declared by the Buddha."

'na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṁ nu kho, ayye, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā"ti?
"Well then, does a Realized One both exist and not exist after death?"

"abyākataṁ kho etaṁ, mahārāja, bhagavatā:
"This has not been declared by the Buddha."

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṁ panayye, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā"ti.
"Well then, does a Realized One neither exist nor not exist after death?"

"etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṁ bhagavatā:
"This too has not been declared by the Buddha."

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"'kiṁ nu kho, ayye, hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti, iti puṭṭhā samānā:
"Ma'am, when asked these questions, you say

'abyākataṁ kho etaṁ, mahārāja, bhagavatā—
that this has not been declared by the Buddha.

hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti vadesi.

'kiṁ panayye, na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭhā samānā:
-

'etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṁ bhagavatā—

na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

'kiṁ nu kho, ayye, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭhā samānā:
-

'abyākataṁ kho etaṁ, mahārāja, bhagavatā—

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

'kiṁ panayye, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭhā samānā:
-

'etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṁ bhagavatā—

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṁ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

ko nu kho, ayye, hetu, ko paccayo yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
What's the cause, what's the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?"

"tena hi, mahārāja, taññevettha paṭipucchissāmi. yathā te khameyya tathā naṃ byākareyyāsi.
"Well then, great king, I'll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like.

taṃ kiṃ maññasi, mahārāja,
What do you think, great king?

atthi te koci gaṇako vā muddiko vā saṅkhāyako vā yo pahoti gaṅgāya vālukaṃ gaṇetuṃ—
Is there any accountant or finger-tallier or reckoner who can count the grains of sand in the Ganges, that is,

ettakā vālukā iti vā, ettakāni vālukasatāni iti vā, ettakāni vālukasahassāni iti vā, ettakāni vālukasatasahassāni iti vā"ti?
how many grains of sand there are, how many hundreds or thousands or hundreds of thousands of grains of sand?"

"no hetaṃ, ayye".
"No, ma'am."

"atthi pana te koci gaṇako vā muddiko vā saṅkhāyako vā yo pahoti mahāsamudde udakaṃ gaṇetuṃ—
"Is there any accountant or finger-tallier or reckoner who can count the water in the ocean, that is,

ettakāni udakāḷhakāni iti vā, ettakāni udakāḷhakasatāni iti vā, ettakāni udakāḷhakasahassāni iti vā, ettakāni udakāḷhakasatasahassāni iti vā"ti?
how many gallons of water there are, how many hundreds or thousands or hundreds of thousands of gallons of water?"

"no hetaṃ, ayye".
"No, ma'am.

"taṃ kissa hetu"?
Why is that?

"mahāyye, samuddo gambhīro appameyyo duppariyogāho"ti.
Because the ocean is deep, immeasurable, and hard to fathom."

"evameva kho, mahārāja, yena rūpena tathāgataṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya taṃ rūpaṃ tathāgatassa pahīnaṃ ucchinnamūlaṃ tālāvatthukataṃ anabhāvaṃkataṃ āyatiṃ anuppādadhammaṃ.
"In the same way, great king, any form by which a Realized One might be described has been cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated, and unable to arise in the future.

rūpasaṅkhāyavimutto kho, mahārāja, tathāgato gambhīro appameyyo duppariyogāho—
A Realized One is freed from reckoning in terms of form. They're deep, immeasurable, and hard to fathom,

seyyathāpi mahāsamuddo.
like the ocean.

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti.
To say that after death, a Realized One exists, or doesn't exist, or both exists and doesn't exist, or neither exists nor doesn't exist: none of these apply.

yāya vedanāya tathāgataṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya, sā vedanā tathāgatassa pahīnā ucchinnamūlā tālāvatthukatā anabhāvaṅkatā āyatiṃ anuppādadhammā.
Any feeling …

vedanāsaṅkhāyavimutto, mahārāja, tathāgato gambhīro appameyyo
duppariyogāho—

-

seyyathāpi mahāsamuddo.

-

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na
upeti, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'neva hoti na na hoti
tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti.

-

yāya saññāya tathāgataṃ … pe …
    perception …

yehi saṅkhārehi tathāgataṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya, te saṅkhārā tathāgatassa
pahīnā ucchinnamūlā tālāvatthukatā anabhāvaṅkatā āyatiṃ anuppādadhammā.
    choices …

saṅkhārasaṅkhāyavimutto kho, mahārāja, tathāgato gambhīro appameyyo
duppariyogāho—

-

seyyathāpi mahāsamuddo.

-

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na
upeti, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'neva hoti na na hoti
tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti.

-

yena viññāṇena tathāgataṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya taṃ viññāṇaṃ tathāgatassa
pahīnaṃ ucchinnamūlaṃ tālāvatthukataṃ anabhāvaṅkataṃ āyatiṃ
anuppādadhammaṃ.
    *consciousness by which a Realized One might be described has been cut off at the root, made
    like a palm stump, obliterated, and unable to arise in the future.*

viññāṇasaṅkhāyavimutto kho, mahārāja, tathāgato gambhīro appameyyo
duppariyogāho—
    *A Realized One is freed from reckoning in terms of consciousness. They're deep,
    immeasurable, and hard to fathom,*

seyyathāpi mahāsamuddo.
    like the ocean.

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na
upeti, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'neva hoti na na hoti
tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upetī"ti.
    *To say that after death, a Realized One exists, or doesn't exist, or both exists and doesn't exist,
    or neither exists nor doesn't exist: none of these apply."*

atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo khemāya bhikkhuniyā bhāsitaṃ abhinanditvā
anumoditvā uṭṭhāyāsanā khemaṃ bhikkhuniṃ abhivādetvā padakkhiṇaṃ katvā
pakkāmi.
    *Then King Pasenadi approved and agreed with what the nun Khemā said. Then he got up from
    his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled her, keeping her on his right, before leaving.*

atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo aparena samayena yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami;
upasaṅkamitvā bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno
kho rājā pasenadi kosalo bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
    *Then on a later occasion King Pasenadi of Kosala went up to the Buddha, bowed, and sat
    down to one side. He asked the Buddha exactly the same questions he had asked the nun
    Khemā, and received the same answers.*

"kiṃ nu kho, bhante, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?

-

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, mahārāja, mayā:

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

"kiṃ pana, bhante, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?

"etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṃ mayā:

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

"kiṃ nu kho, bhante, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, mahārāja, mayā:

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

"kiṃ pana, bhante, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?

"etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṃ mayā:

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

"'kiṃ nu kho, bhante, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭho samāno:

'abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, mahārāja, mayā—hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi … pe ….

"'kiṃ pana, bhante, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭho samāno:

'etampi kho, mahārāja, abyākataṃ mayā—

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.

ko nu kho, bhante, hetu, ko paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?

"tena hi, mahārāja, taññevettha paṭipucchissāmi. yathā te khameyya tathā naṃ byākareyyāsi.

taṃ kiṃ maññasi, mahārāja, atthi te koci gaṇako vā muddiko vā saṅkhāyako vā yo pahoti gaṅgāya vālukaṃ gaṇetuṃ—

ettakā vālukā iti vā … pe … ettakāni vālukasatasahassāni iti vā"ti?

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

"atthi pana te koci gaṇako vā muddiko vā saṅkhāyako vā yo pahoti mahāsamudde udakaṃ gaṇetuṃ—

ettakāni udakāḷhakāni iti vā … pe … ettakāni udakāḷhakasatasahassāni iti vā"ti?

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

"taṃ kissa hetu"?

"mahā, bhante, samuddo gambhīro appameyyo duppariyogāho.

evameva kho, mahārāja, yena rūpena tathāgataṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya, taṃ rūpaṃ tathāgatassa pahīnaṃ ucchinnamūlaṃ tālāvatthukataṃ anabhāvaṅkataṃ āyatiṃ anuppādadhammaṃ.

rūpasaṅkhāyavimutto kho, mahārāja, tathāgato gambhīro appameyyo duppariyogāho—

seyyathāpi mahāsamuddo.

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti … pe …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti.

yāya vedanāya … pe …

yāya saññāya … pe … yehi saṅkhārehi … pe ….

yena viññāṇena tathāgataṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya, taṃ viññāṇaṃ tathāgatassa pahīnaṃ ucchinnamūlaṃ tālāvatthukataṃ anabhāvaṅkataṃ āyatiṃ anuppādadhammaṃ.

viññāṇasaṅkhāyavimutto kho, mahārāja, tathāgato gambhīro appameyyo duppariyogāho—

seyyathāpi mahāsamuddo.

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upeti, 'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi na upetī"ti.

"acchariyaṃ, bhante, abbhutaṃ, bhante.
He said, "It's incredible, sir, it's amazing!

yatra hi nāma satthu ceva sāvikāya ca atthena attho byañjanena byañjanaṃ saṃsandissati, samessati, na virodhayissati yadidaṃ aggapadasmiṃ.
How the meaning and the phrasing of the teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!

ekamidāhaṃ, bhante, samayaṃ khemaṃ bhikkhuniṃ upasaṅkamitvā etamatthaṃ apucchiṃ.
This one time I went to the nun Khemā and asked her about this matter.

sāpi me ayyā etehi padehi etehi byañjanehi etamatthaṃ byākāsi, seyyathāpi bhagavā.
And she explained it to me with these words and phrases, just like the Buddha.

acchariyaṃ, bhante, abbhutaṃ, bhante.
It's incredible, sir, it's amazing!

yatra hi nāma satthu ceva sāvikāya ca atthena attho byañjanena byañjanaṃ saṃsandissati, samessati, na virodhayissati yadidaṃ aggapadasmiṃ.
How the meaning and the phrasing of the teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!

handa dāni mayaṃ, bhante, gacchāma.
Well, now, sir, I must go.

bahukiccā mayaṃ bahukaraṇīyā”ti.
I have many duties, and much to do.”

“yassadāni tvaṃ, mahārāja, kālaṃ maññasī”ti.
“Please, great king, go at your convenience.”

atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo bhagavato bhāsitaṃ abhinanditvā anumoditvā
uṭṭhāyāsanā bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā padakkhiṇaṃ katvā pakkāmīti.
*Then King Pasenadi approved and agreed with what the Buddha said. Then he got up from his
seat, bowed, and respectfully circled him, keeping him on his right, before leaving.*

paṭhamaṃ.

samyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

2. anurādhasutta
2. With Anurādha

ekaṃ samayaṃ bhagavā vesāliyaṃ viharati mahāvane kūṭāgārasālāyaṃ.
*At one time the Buddha was staying near Vesālī, at the Great Wood, in the hall with the peaked
roof.*

tena kho pana samayena āyasmā anurādho bhagavato avidūre araññakuṭikāyaṃ
viharati.
Now at that time Venerable Anurādha was staying not far from the Buddha in a wilderness hut.

atha kho sambahulā aññatitthiyā paribbājakā yenāyasmā anurādho
tenupasaṅkamiṃsu; upasaṅkamitvā āyasmatā anurādhena saddhiṃ sammodiṃsu.
*Then several wanderers who follow other paths went up to Venerable Anurādha and exchanged
greetings with him.*

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdiṃsu. ekamantaṃ
nisinnā kho te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā āyasmantaṃ anurādhaṃ etadavocuṃ:
*When the greetings and polite conversation were over, they sat down to one side and said to
him:*

“yo so, āvuso anurādha, tathāgato uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto, taṃ
tathāgato imesu catūsu ṭhānesu paññāpayamāno paññāpeti:
*“Reverend Anurādha, when a Realized One is describing a Realized One—a supreme person,
highest of people, who has reached the highest point—they describe them in these four ways:*

‘hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā’ti vā, ‘na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā’ti vā, ‘hoti ca
na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā’ti vā, ‘neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ
maraṇā’ti vā”ti?
*After death, a Realized One exists, or doesn't exist, or both exists and doesn't exist, or neither
exists nor doesn't exist.”*

“yo so, āvuso, tathāgato uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto, taṃ tathāgato
aññatra imehi catūhi ṭhānehi paññāpayamāno paññāpeti:
*“Reverends, when a Realized One is describing a Realized One—a supreme person, highest of
people, who has reached the highest point—they describe them other than these four ways:*

‘hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā’ti vā, ‘na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā’ti vā, ‘hoti ca
na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā’ti vā, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ
maraṇāti vā”ti.
*After death, a Realized One exists, or doesn't exist, or both exists and doesn't exist, or neither
exists nor doesn't exist.”*

evaṃ vutte, te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā āyasmantaṃ anurādhaṃ etadavocuṃ:
When he said this, the wanderers said to him,

"so cāyaṃ bhikkhu navo bhavissati acirapabbajito, thero vā pana bālo abyatto"ti.
"This mendicant must be junior, recently gone forth, or else a foolish, incompetent senior mendicant."

atha kho te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā āyasmantaṃ anurādhaṃ navavādena ca bālavādena ca apasādetvā uṭṭhāyāsanā pakkamiṃsu.
Then, after rebuking Venerable Anurādha by calling him "junior" and "foolish", the wanderers got up from their seat and left.

atha kho āyasmato anurādhassa acirapakkantesu aññatitthiyesu paribbājakesu etadahosi:
Soon after they had left, Anurādha thought,

"sace kho maṃ te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā uttariṃ puccheyyuṃ,
"If those wanderers were to inquire further,

kathaṃ byākaramāno nu khvāhaṃ tesaṃ aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ vuttavādī ceva bhagavato assaṃ, na ca bhagavantaṃ abhūtena abbhācikkheyyaṃ, dhammassa cānudhammaṃ byākareyyaṃ, na ca koci sahadhammiko vādānuvādo gārayhaṃ ṭhānaṃ āgaccheyyā"ti?
how should I answer them so as to repeat what the Buddha has said, and not misrepresent him with an untruth? How should I explain in line with his teaching, so that there would be no legitimate grounds for rebuke and criticism?"

atha kho āyasmā anurādho yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho āyasmā anurādho bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
Then Venerable Anurādha went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and told him what had happened.

"idhāhaṃ, bhante, bhagavato avidūre araññakuṭikāyaṃ viharāmi.
-

atha kho, bhante, sambahulā aññatitthiyā paribbājakā yenāhaṃ tenupasaṅkamiṃsu; upasaṅkamitvā mayā saddhiṃ sammodiṃsu.
-

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdiṃsu. ekamantaṃ nisinnā kho, bhante, te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā maṃ etadavocuṃ:
-

'yo so, āvuso anurādha, tathāgato uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto, taṃ tathāgato imesu catūsu ṭhānesu paññāpayamāno paññāpeti:
-

"hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti vā … pe …
-

"neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti vā'ti?
-

evaṃ vuttāhaṃ, bhante, te aññatitthiye paribbājake etadavocaṃ:
-

'yo so, āvuso, tathāgato uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto, taṃ tathāgato aññatra imehi catūhi ṭhānehi paññāpayamāno paññāpeti:
-

"hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti vā … pe …
-

"neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti vā'ti.
-

evaṃ vutte, bhante, te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā maṃ etadavocuṃ:
-

'so cāyaṃ bhikkhu navo bhavissati acirapabbajito thero vā pana bālo abyatto'ti.
-

atha kho maṃ, bhante, te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā navavādena ca bālavādena ca apasādetvā uṭṭhāyāsanā pakkamiṃsu.

tassa mayhaṃ, bhante, acirapakkantesu tesu aññatitthiyesu paribbājakesu etadahosi:

'sace kho maṃ te aññatitthiyā paribbājakā uttariṃ puccheyyuṃ, kathaṃ byākaramāno nu khvāhaṃ tesaṃ aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ vuttavādī ceva bhagavato assaṃ, na ca bhagavantaṃ abhūtena abbhācikkheyyaṃ, dhammassa cānudhammaṃ byākareyyaṃ, na ca koci sahadhammiko vādānuvādo gārayhaṃ ṭhānaṃ āgaccheyyā'''ti?

"taṃ kiṃ maññasi, anurādha,
"What do you think, Anurādha?

rūpaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā"ti?
Is form permanent or impermanent?"

"aniccaṃ, bhante".
"Impermanent, sir."

"yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā"ti?
"But if it's impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?"

"dukkhaṃ, bhante".
"Suffering, sir."

"yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ, kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:
"But if it's impermanent, suffering, and liable to fall apart, is it fit to be regarded thus:

'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'''ti?
'This is mine, I am this, this is my self'?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"vedanā niccā vā aniccā vā"ti?
"Is feeling …

… pe …

saññā … pe …
perception …

saṅkhārā … pe …
choices …

"viññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā"ti?
consciousness permanent or impermanent?"

"aniccaṃ, bhante".
"Impermanent, sir."

"yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā"ti?
"But if it's impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?"

"dukkhaṃ, bhante".
"Suffering, sir."

"yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ, kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:
"But if it's impermanent, suffering, and liable to fall apart, is it fit to be regarded thus:

'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'''ti?
'This is mine, I am this, this is my self'?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"tasmātiha, anurādha, yaṃ kiñci rūpaṃ atītānāgatapaccuppannaṃ ajjhattaṃ vā bahiddhā vā oḷārikaṃ vā sukhumaṃ vā hīnaṃ vā paṇītaṃ vā yaṃ dūre santike vā, sabbaṃ rūpaṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti evametaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya daṭṭhabbaṃ.

"So, Anurādha, you should truly see any kind of form at all—past, future, or present; internal or external; coarse or fine; inferior or superior; far or near: *all* form—with right understanding: 'This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.'

yā kāci vedanā atītānāgatapaccuppannā … pe …

Any kind of feeling …

yā kāci saññā … pe …

perception …

ye keci saṅkhārā … pe …

choices …

yaṃ kiñci viññāṇaṃ atītānāgatapaccuppannaṃ ajjhattaṃ vā bahiddhā vā oḷārikaṃ vā sukhumaṃ vā hīnaṃ vā paṇītaṃ vā yaṃ dūre santike vā, sabbaṃ viññāṇaṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti evametaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya daṭṭhabbaṃ.

consciousness at all—past, future, or present; internal or external; coarse or fine; inferior or superior; far or near: *all* consciousness—with right understanding: 'This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.'

evaṃ passaṃ, anurādha, sutavā ariyasāvako rūpasmimpi nibbindati, vedanāyapi nibbindati, saññāyapi nibbindati, saṅkhāresupi nibbindati, viññāṇasmimpi nibbindati.

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness.

nibbindaṃ virajjati; virāgā vimuccati; vimuttasmiṃ vimuttamiti ñāṇaṃ hoti.

Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they're freed, they know they're freed.

'khīṇā jāti, vusitaṃ brahmacariyaṃ, kataṃ karaṇīyaṃ, nāparaṃ itthattāyā'ti pajānāti.

They understand: 'Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is no return to any state of existence.'

taṃ kiṃ maññasi, anurādha,

What do you think, Anurādha?

rūpaṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?

Do you regard the Realized One as form?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

"No, sir."

"vedanaṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?

"Do you regard the Realized One as feeling …

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

-

"saññaṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?

perception …

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

-

"saṅkhāre tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?

choices …

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

-

"viññāṇaṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?

consciousness?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"taṃ kiṃ maññasi, anurādha,
"What do you think, Anurādha?

rūpasmiṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?
Do you regard the Realized One as in form?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"aññatra rūpā tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?
"Or do you regard the Realized One as distinct from form?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"vedanāya … pe …
"Do you regard the Realized One as in feeling …

aññatra vedanāya … pe …
or distinct from feeling …

saññāya … pe …
as in perception …

aññatra saññāya … pe …
or distinct from perception …

saṅkhāresu … pe …
as in choices …

aññatra saṅkhārehi … pe …
or distinct from choices …

viññāṇasmiṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?
as in consciousness …

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
-

"aññatra viññāṇā tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?
or as distinct from consciousness?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"taṃ kiṃ maññasi, anurādha,
"What do you think, Anurādha?

rūpaṃ, vedanaṃ, saññaṃ, saṅkhāre, viññāṇaṃ tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?
Do you regard the Realized One as possessing form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"taṃ kiṃ maññasi, anurādha,
"What do you think, Anurādha?

ayaṃ so arūpī avedano asaññī asaṅkhāro aviññāṇo tathāgatoti samanupassasī"ti?
Do you regard the Realized One as one who is without form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"ettha ca te, anurādha, diṭṭheva dhamme saccato thetato tathāgate anupalabbhiyamāne kallaṃ nu te taṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ—
"In that case, Anurādha, since you don't acknowledge the Realized One as a genuine fact in the present life, is it appropriate to declare:

yo so, āvuso, tathāgato uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto, taṃ tathāgato aññatra imehi catūhi ṭhānehi paññāpayamāno paññāpeti:
'Reverends, when a Realized One is describing a Realized One—a supreme person, highest of people, who has reached the highest point—they describe them other than these four ways:

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā … pe …
After death, a Realized One exists, or doesn't exist, or both exists and doesn't exist, or neither exists nor doesn't exist'?"

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā"ti?
-

"no hetaṃ, bhante".
"No, sir."

"sādhu sādhu, anurādha.
"Good, good, Anurādha!

pubbe cāhaṃ, anurādha, etarahi ca dukkhañceva paññāpemi dukkhassa ca nirodhan"ti.
In the past, as today, what I describe is suffering and the cessation of suffering."

dutiyaṃ.
-

saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

3. paṭhamasāriputtakoṭṭhikasutta
3. With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (1st)

ekaṃ samayaṃ āyasmā ca sāriputto, āyasmā ca mahākoṭṭhiko bārāṇasiyaṃ viharanti isipatane migadāye.
At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Benares, in the deer park at Isipatana.

atha kho āyasmā mahākoṭṭhiko sāyanhasamayaṃ paṭisallānā vuṭṭhito yenāyasmā sāriputto tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā āyasmatā sāriputtena saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita came out of retreat, went to Venerable Sāriputta, and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho āyasmā mahākoṭṭhiko āyasmantaṃ sāriputtaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to Sāriputta:

"kiṃ nu kho, āvuso sāriputta, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
"Reverend Sāriputta, does a Realized One exist after death?"

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, āvuso, bhagavatā:
"Reverend, this has not been declared by the Buddha."

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṃ panāvuso, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
"Well then, does a Realized One not exist after death? …

"etampi kho, āvuso, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
-

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

-

"kiṃ nu kho, āvuso, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
Does a Realized One both exist and not exist after death? …

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, āvuso, bhagavatā:

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

-

"kiṃ panāvuso, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
Does a Realized One neither exist nor not exist after death?"

"etampi kho, āvuso, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
"This too has not been declared by the Buddha."

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

-

"'kiṃ nu kho, āvuso, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭho samāno, 'abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, āvuso, bhagavatā—
"Reverend, when asked these questions, you say that they have not been declared by the Buddha.

hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi … pe …

-

'kiṃ panāvuso, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭho samāno:

-

'etampi kho, āvuso, abyākataṃ bhagavatā—

-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.

-

ko nu kho, āvuso, hetu, ko paccayo yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
What's the cause, what's the reason why they have not been declared by the Buddha?"

"hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti kho, āvuso, rūpagatametaṃ.
"Reverend, 'does a Realized One exist after death?' is included in form.

na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, rūpagatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One not exist after death?' is included in form.

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, rūpagatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One both exist and not exist after death?' is included in form.

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, rūpagatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One neither exist nor not exist after death?' is included in form.

hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti kho, āvuso, vedanāgatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One exist after death?' is included in feeling …

na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, vedanāgatametaṃ.

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, vedanāgatametaṃ.

-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, vedanāgatametaṃ.

-

hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti kho, āvuso, saññāgatametaṃ.
perception …

na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, saññāgatametaṃ.

-

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, saññāgatametaṃ.

-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, saññāgatametaṃ.

-

hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti kho, āvuso, saṅkhāragatametaṃ.
choices …

na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, saṅkhāragatametaṃ.

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, saṅkhāragatametaṃ.

-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, saṅkhāragatametaṃ.

-

hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti kho, āvuso, viññāṇagatametaṃ.
consciousness.

na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, viññāṇagatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One not exist after death?' is included in consciousness.

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, viññāṇagatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One both exist and not exist after death?' is included in consciousness.

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti, viññāṇagatametaṃ.
'Does a Realized One neither exist nor not exist after death?' is included in consciousness.

ayaṃ kho, āvuso, hetu ayaṃ paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.
This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha."

tatiyaṃ.

-

saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

4. dutiyasāriputtakoṭṭhikasutta
4. With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (2nd)

ekaṃ samayaṃ āyasmā ca sāriputto, āyasmā ca mahākoṭṭhiko bārāṇasiyaṃ viharanti isipatane migadāye … pe …
At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Benares, in the deer park at Isipatana. …

(sāyeva pucchā.)
(The same down as far as:)

"ko nu kho, āvuso, hetu, ko paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
"What's the cause, reverend, what's the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?"

"rūpaṃ kho, āvuso, ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, rūpasamudayaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, rūpanirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, rūpanirodhagāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
"Reverend, not truly knowing and seeing form, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its cessation, one thinks 'a Realized One exists after death' or

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
'a Realized One doesn't exist after death' or

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
'a Realized One both exists and doesn't exist after death' or

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

vedanaṃ … pe …
Not truly knowing or seeing feeling …

saññaṃ … pe …
perception …

saṅkhāre … pe …
choices …

viññāṇaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, viññāṇasamudayaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, viññāṇanirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, viññāṇanirodhagāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
consciousness, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its cessation, one thinks 'a Realized One exists after death' or

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
'a Realized One doesn't exist after death' or

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
'a Realized One both exists and doesn't exist after death' or

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'''tipissa hoti.
'A Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

rūpañca kho, āvuso, jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, rūpasamudayaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, rūpanirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, rūpanirodhagāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …
Truly knowing and seeing form …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.

vedanaṃ … pe …
feeling …

saññaṃ … pe …
perception …

saṅkhāre … pe …
choices …

viññāṇaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, viññāṇasamudayaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, viññāṇanirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, viññāṇanirodhagāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti;
consciousness, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its cessation, one doesn't think 'a Realized One exists after death' or

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti;
'a Realized One doesn't exist after death' or

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti;
'a Realized One both exists and doesn't exist after death' or

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

ayaṃ kho, āvuso, hetu ayaṃ paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.
This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha."

catutthaṃ.

samyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
   1. The Undeclared Points

5. tatiyasāriputtakoṭṭhikasutta
   5. With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (3rd)

ekaṃ samayaṃ āyasmā ca sāriputto, āyasmā ca mahākoṭṭhiko bārāṇasiyaṃ viharanti isipatane migadāye … pe …
   At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Benares, in the deer park at Isipatana. …

(sāyeva pucchā.)
   (The same down as far as:)

"ko nu kho, āvuso, hetu ko paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
   "What's the cause, reverend, what's the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?"

"rūpe kho, āvuso, avigatarāgassa avigatacchandassa avigatapemassa avigatapipāsassa avigataparilāhassa avigatataṇhassa 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …
   "Reverend, if you're not rid of greed, desire, fondness, thirst, passion, and craving for form …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.
-

vedanāya … pe …
   feeling …

saññāya … pe …
   perception …

saṅkhāresu … pe …
   choices …

viññāṇe avigatarāgassa avigatacchandassa avigatapemassa avigatapipāsassa avigataparilāhassa avigatataṇhassa 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …
   consciousness, you think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.
   'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

rūpe ca kho, āvuso, vigatarāgassa … pe …
   If you are rid of greed for form …

vedanāya … pe …
   feeling …

saññāya … pe …
   perception …

saṅkhāresu … pe …
   choices …

viññāṇe vigatarāgassa vigatacchandassa vigatapemassa vigatapipāsassa vigataparilāhassa vigatataṇhassa 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …
   consciousness, you don't think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.
   'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

ayaṃ kho, āvuso, hetu, ayaṃ paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.
   This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha."

pañcamaṃ.

-

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

6. catutthasāriputtakoṭṭhikasutta
6. With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (4th)

ekaṃ samayaṃ āyasmā ca sāriputto, āyasmā ca mahākoṭṭhiko bārāṇasiyaṃ viharanti isipatane migadāye.
At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Benares, in the deer park at Isipatana.

atha kho āyasmā sāriputto sāyanhasamayaṃ paṭisallānā vuṭṭhito yenāyasmā mahākoṭṭhiko tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā āyasmatā mahākoṭṭhikena saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Sāriputta came out of retreat, went to Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita, and they greeted each other.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho āyasmā sāriputto āyasmantaṃ mahākoṭṭhikaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to Mahākoṭṭhita:

"'kiṃ nu kho, āvuso koṭṭhika, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti … pe …
"Reverend Koṭṭhita, does a Realized One exist after death?" …

'kiṃ panāvuso, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti iti puṭṭho samāno:
"Reverend, when asked these questions, you say that this has not been declared by the Buddha.

'etampi kho, āvuso, abyākataṃ bhagavatā—

-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.

-

ko nu kho, āvuso, hetu, ko paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
What's the cause, what's the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?"

"rūpārāmassa kho, āvuso, rūparatassa rūpasammuditassa rūpanirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
"Reverend, if you like, love, and enjoy form, and don't truly see the cessation of form, you think 'a Realized One exists after death' or

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
'a Realized One doesn't exist after death' or

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti;
'a Realized One both exists and doesn't exist after death' or

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

vedanārāmassa kho, āvuso, vedanāratassa vedanāsammuditassa, vedanānirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …
If you like, love, and enjoy feeling …

saññārāmassa kho, āvuso … pe …
perception …

saṅkhārārāmassa kho āvuso … pe …
choices …

viññāṇārāmassa kho, āvuso, viññāṇaratassa viññāṇasammuditassa viññāṇanirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …

consciousness, and don't truly see the cessation of consciousness, you think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.

'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

na rūpārāmassa kho, āvuso, na rūparatassa na rūpasammuditassa, rūpanirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …

If you don't like, love, and enjoy form …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.
-

na vedanārāmassa kho, āvuso … pe …

feeling …

na saññārāmassa kho, āvuso … pe …

perception …

na saṅkhārārāmassa kho, āvuso … pe …

choices …

na viññāṇārāmassa kho, āvuso, na viññāṇaratassa na viññāṇasammuditassa, viññāṇanirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …

consciousness, and you truly see the cessation of consciousness, you don't think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.

'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

ayaṃ kho, āvuso, hetu, ayaṃ paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.

This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha."

"siyā panāvuso, aññopi pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?

"But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha?"

"siyā, āvuso.

"There could, reverend.

bhavārāmassa kho, āvuso, bhavaratassa bhavasammuditassa, bhavanirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …

If you like, love, and enjoy existence, and don't truly see the cessation of continued existence, you think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.

'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

na bhavārāmassa kho, āvuso, na bhavaratassa na bhavasammuditassa, bhavanirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …

If you don't like, love, and enjoy existence, and you truly see the cessation of continued existence, you don't think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.

'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

ayampi kho, āvuso, pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.

This too is a way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha."

"siyā panāvuso, aññopi pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?

"But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha?"

"siyā, āvuso.
"There could, reverend.

upādānārāmassa kho, āvuso, upādānaratassa upādānasammuditassa, upādānanirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …
If you like, love, and enjoy grasping, and don't truly see the cessation of grasping, you think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

na upādānārāmassa kho, āvuso, na upādānaratassa na upādānasammuditassa, upādānanirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …
If you don't like, love, and enjoy grasping, and you truly see the cessation of grasping, you don't think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva, hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

ayampi kho, āvuso, pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.
This too is a way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha."

"siyā panāvuso, aññopi pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
"But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha?"

"siyā, āvuso.
"There could, reverend.

taṇhārāmassa kho, āvuso, taṇhāratassa taṇhāsammuditassa, taṇhānirodhaṃ ajānato apassato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti … pe …
If you like, love, and enjoy craving, and don't truly see the cessation of craving, you think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

na taṇhārāmassa kho, āvuso, na taṇhāratassa na taṇhāsammuditassa, taṇhānirodhaṃ jānato passato yathābhūtaṃ, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti … pe …
If you don't like, love, and enjoy craving, and you truly see the cessation of craving, you don't think 'a Realized One exists after death' …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipissa na hoti.
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death.'

ayampi kho, āvuso, pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti.
This too is a way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha."

"siyā panāvuso, aññopi pariyāyo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ bhagavatā"ti?
"But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha?"

"ettha dāni, āvuso sāriputta, ito uttari kiṃ icchasi?
"Seriously, reverend, what more could you want?

taṇhāsaṅkhayavimuttassa, āvuso sāriputta, bhikkhuno vaṭṭaṃ natthi paññāpanāyā"ti.
For one who is freed due to the ending of craving, there is no cycle of rebirths to be found."

chaṭṭhaṃ.
-

saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

7. moggallānasutta
7. With Moggallāna

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako yenāyasmā mahāmoggallāno tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā āyasmatā mahāmoggallānena saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāranīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako āyasmantaṃ mahāmoggallānaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to Mahāmoggallāna:

"kiṃ nu kho, bho moggallāna, sassato loko"ti?
"Master Moggallāna, is this right: 'the world is eternal'?"

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:
"Vaccha, this has not been declared by the Buddha."

'sassato loko'"ti.
-

"kiṃ pana, bho moggallāna, asassato loko"ti?
"Then is this right: 'the world is not eternal' …

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
-

'asassato loko'"ti.
-

"kiṃ nu kho, bho moggallāna, antavā loko"ti?
'the world is finite' …

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:
-

'antavā loko'"ti.
-

"kiṃ pana, bho moggallāna, anantavā loko"ti?
'the world is infinite' …

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
-

'anantavā loko'"ti.
-

"kiṃ nu kho, bho moggallāna, taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīran"ti?
'the soul and the body are identical' …

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:
-

'taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīran'"ti.
-

"kiṃ pana, bho moggallāna, aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīran"ti?
'the soul and the body are different things' …

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
-

'aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīran'"ti.
-

"kiṃ nu kho, bho moggallāna, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
'a Realized One exists after death' …

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:
-

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṃ pana, bho moggallāna, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
'a Realized One doesn't exist after death' …

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
-

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

"kiṃ nu kho, bho moggallāna, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
'a Realized One both exists and doesn't exist after death' …

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:
-

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṃ pana, bho moggallāna, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death'?"

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
"This too has not been declared by the Buddha."

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"ko nu kho, bho moggallāna, hetu ko paccayo, yena aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti—
"What's the cause, Master Moggallāna, what's the reason why the wanderers who follow other paths answer these questions when asked?

sassato lokoti vā, asassato lokoti vā, antavā lokoti vā, anantavā lokoti vā, taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīranti vā, aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīranti vā, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti vā, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti vā, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti vā, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti vā?

ko pana, bho moggallāna, hetu ko paccayo, yena samaṇassa gotamassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti—
And what's the cause, what's the reason why the ascetic Gotama doesn't answer these questions when asked?"

sassato lokotipi, asassato lokotipi, antavā lokotipi, anantavā lokotipi, taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīrantipi, aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīrantipi, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇātipi, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇātipi, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇātipi, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇātipī"ti?
-

"aññatitthiyā kho, vaccha, paribbājakā cakkhuṃ 'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'ti samanupassanti … pe …
"Vaccha, the wanderers who follow other paths regard the eye like this: 'This is mine, I am this, this is my self.' They regard the ear … nose …

jivhaṃ 'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'ti samanupassanti … pe …
tongue … body …

manaṃ 'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'ti samanupassanti.
mind like this: 'This is mine, I am this, this is my self.'

tasmā aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti—
That's why they answer these questions when asked.

sassato lokoti vā … pe …
-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇāti vā.

-

tathāgato ca kho, vaccha, arahaṃ sammāsambuddho cakkhuṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti samanupassati … pe …
The Realized One, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha regards the eye like this: 'This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.' He regards the ear … nose …

jivhaṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti samanupassati … pe …
tongue … body …

manaṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti samanupassati.
mind like this: 'This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.'

tasmā tathāgatassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti—
That's why he doesn't answer these questions when asked."

sassato lokotipi … pe …

-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇātipī'ti.

-

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako uṭṭhāyāsanā yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta got up from his seat and went to the Buddha and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side. He asked the Buddha the same questions, and received the same answers.

"kiṃ nu kho, bho gotama, sassato loko"ti?

-

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, mayā: 'sassato loko'ti … pe ….

"kiṃ pana, bho gotama, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ mayā:

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

"ko nu kho, bho gotama, hetu ko paccayo, yena aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:

'sassato loko'ti vā … pe …

-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā?

-

ko pana, bho gotama, hetu ko paccayo, yena bhoto gotamassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:

'sassato loko'tipi … pe …

-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipī'ti?

-

"aññatitthiyā kho, vaccha, paribbājakā cakkhuṃ 'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'ti samanupassanti … pe …

-

jivhaṃ 'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'ti samanupassanti … pe …
-

manaṃ 'etaṃ mama, esohamasmi, eso me attā'ti samanupassanti.
-

tasmā aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
-

'sassato loko'ti vā … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā.
-

tathāgato ca kho, vaccha, arahaṃ sammāsambuddho cakkhuṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti samanupassati … pe …

jivhaṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti samanupassati … pe …
-

manaṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā'ti samanupassati.
-

tasmā tathāgatassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
-

'sassato loko'tipi, 'asassato loko'tipi, 'antavā loko'tipi, 'anantavā loko'tipi, 'taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīran'tipi, 'aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīran'tipi, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi, 'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipī'ti.

"acchariyaṃ, bho gotama, abbhutaṃ, bho gotama.
He said, "It's incredible, Master Gotama, it's amazing!

yatra hi nāma satthu ca sāvakassa ca atthena attho byañjanena byañjanaṃ saṃsandissati samessati na virodhayissati, yadidaṃ aggapadasmiṃ.
How the meaning and the phrasing of the teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!

idānāhaṃ, bho gotama, samaṇaṃ mahāmoggallānaṃ upasaṅkamitvā etamatthaṃ apucchiṃ.
Just now I went to the ascetic Mahāmoggallāna and asked him about this matter.

samaṇopi me moggallāno etehi padehi etehi byañjanehi tamatthaṃ byākāsi, seyyathāpi bhavaṃ gotamo.
And he explained it to me with these words and phrases, just like Master Gotama.

acchariyaṃ, bho gotama, abbhutaṃ, bho gotama.
It's incredible, Master Gotama, it's amazing!

yatra hi nāma satthu ca sāvakassa ca atthena attho byañjanena byañjanaṃ saṃsandissati samessati na virodhayissati, yadidaṃ aggapadasmin"ti.
How the meaning and the phrasing of the teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!"

sattamaṃ.
-

saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

8. vacchagottasutta
8. With Vacchagotta

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to the Buddha and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāranīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to the Buddha:

"kiṃ nu kho, bho gotama, sassato loko"ti?
"Master Gotama, is this right: 'the world is eternal'?"

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, mayā: 'sassato loko'ti … pe ….
"This has not been declared by me, Vaccha." …

"kiṃ pana, bho gotama, 'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti?
"Then is this right: 'a Realized One neither exists nor doesn't exist after death'?"

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ mayā:
"This too has not been declared by me."

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"ko nu kho, bho gotama, hetu, ko paccayo, yena aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
"What's the cause, Master Gotama, what's the reason why the wanderers who follow other paths answer these questions when asked?

'sassato loko'ti vā … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā?
-

ko pana, bho gotama, hetu, ko paccayo, yena bhoto gotamassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
And what's the cause, what's the reason why Master Gotama doesn't answer these questions when asked?"

'sassato loko'tipi … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipī'"ti?
-

"aññatitthiyā kho, vaccha, paribbājakā rūpaṃ attato samanupassanti, rūpavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, attani vā rūpaṃ, rūpasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.
"Vaccha, the wanderers who follow other paths regard form as self, self as having form, form in self, or self in form.

vedanaṃ attato samanupassanti … pe …
They regard feeling …

saññaṃ … pe …
perception …

saṅkhāre … pe …
choices …

viññāṇaṃ attato samanupassanti, viññāṇavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, attani vā viññāṇaṃ, viññāṇasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.
consciousness as self, self as having consciousness, consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.

tasmā aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
That's why they answer these questions when asked.

'sassato loko'ti vā … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā.
-

tathāgato ca kho, vaccha, arahaṃ sammāsambuddho na rūpaṃ attato samanupassati, na rūpavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, na attani vā rūpaṃ, na rūpasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.
The Realized One doesn't regard form as self, self as having form, form in self, or self in form.

na vedanaṃ attato samanupassati … pe …
He doesn't regard feeling …

na saññaṃ … pe …
perception …

na saṅkhāre … pe …
choices …

na viññāṇaṃ attato samanupassati, na viññāṇavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, na attani vā viññāṇaṃ, na viññāṇasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.
consciousness as self, self as having consciousness, consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.

tasmā tathāgatassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
That's why he doesn't answer these questions when asked."

'sassato loko'tipi … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipī'ti.
-

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako uṭṭhāyāsanā yenāyasmā mahāmoggallāno tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā āyasmatā mahāmoggallānena saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta got up from his seat and went to Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako āyasmantaṃ mahāmoggallānaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side. He asked Mahāmoggallāna the same questions, and received the same answers.

"kiṃ nu kho, bho moggallāna, sassato loko"ti?
-

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā: 'sassato loko'ti … pe ….

"kiṃ pana, bho moggallāna, 'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti?
-

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"ko nu kho, bho moggallāna, hetu, ko paccayo, yena aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
-

'sassato loko'ti vā … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā?
-

ko pana, bho moggallāna, hetu, ko paccayo yena samaṇassa gotamassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:
-

'sassato loko'tipi … pe …
-

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipī"ti?

"aññatitthiyā kho, vaccha, paribbājakā rūpaṃ attato samanupassanti, rūpavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, attani vā rūpaṃ, rūpasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.

vedanaṃ attato samanupassanti … pe …

saññaṃ … pe …

saṅkhāre … pe …

viññāṇaṃ attato samanupassanti, viññāṇavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, attani vā viññāṇaṃ, viññāṇasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.

tasmā aññatitthiyānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ evaṃ puṭṭhānaṃ evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:

'sassato loko'ti vā … pe …

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vā.

tathāgato ca kho, vaccha, arahaṃ sammāsambuddho na rūpaṃ attato samanupassati, na rūpavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, na attani vā rūpaṃ, na rūpasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.

na vedanaṃ attato samanupassati … pe …

na saññaṃ … pe …

na saṅkhāre … pe …

na viññāṇaṃ attato samanupassati, na viññāṇavantaṃ vā attānaṃ, na attani vā viññāṇaṃ, na viññāṇasmiṃ vā attānaṃ.

tasmā tathāgatassa evaṃ puṭṭhassa na evaṃ veyyākaraṇaṃ hoti:

'sassato loko'tipi, 'asassato loko'tipi, 'antavā loko'tipi, 'anantavā loko'tipi, 'taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīran'tipi, 'aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīran'tipi, 'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi, 'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi, 'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipi, 'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'tipī"ti.

"acchariyaṃ, bho moggallāna, abbhutaṃ, bho moggallāna.
He said, "It's incredible, Master Moggallāna, it's amazing.

yatra hi nāma satthu ca sāvakassa ca atthena attho byañjanena byañjanaṃ saṃsandissati, samessati, na virodhayissati, yadidaṃ aggapadasmiṃ.
How the meaning and the phrasing of the teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!

idānāhaṃ, bho moggallāna, samaṇaṃ gotamaṃ upasaṅkamitvā etamatthaṃ apucchiṃ.
Just now I went to the ascetic Gotama and asked him about this matter.

samaṇopi me gotamo etehi padehi etehi byañjanehi etamatthaṃ byākāsi, seyyathāpi bhavaṃ moggallāno.
And he explained it to me with these words and phrases, just like Master Moggallāna.

acchariyaṃ, bho moggallāna, abbhutaṃ, bho moggallāna.
It's incredible, Master Moggallāna, it's amazing!

yatra hi nāma satthu ca sāvakassa ca atthena attho byañjanena byañjanaṃ
saṃsandissati samessati na virodhayissati, yadidaṃ aggapadasmin"ti.
*How the meaning and the phrasing of the teacher and the disciple fit together and agree
without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!"*

aṭṭhamaṃ.

saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

9. kutūhalasālāsutta
9. The Debating Hall

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā
bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to the Buddha and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ
nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
*When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to the
Buddha:*

"purimāni, bho gotama, divasāni purimatarāni sambahulānaṃ nānātitthiyānaṃ
samaṇabrāhmaṇānaṃ paribbājakānaṃ kutūhalasālāyaṃ sannisinnānaṃ
sannipatitānaṃ ayamantarākathā udapādi:
*"Master Gotama, a few days ago several ascetics, brahmins, and wanderers who follow various
other paths were sitting together in the debating hall, and this discussion came up among them:*

'ayaṃ kho pūraṇo kassapo saṅghī ceva gaṇī ca gaṇācariyo ca ñāto yasassī titthakaro
sādhusammato bahujanassa.
*'This Pūraṇa Kassapa leads an order and a community, and teaches a community. He's a
well-known and famous religious founder, regarded as holy by many people.*

sopi sāvakaṃ abbhatītaṃ kālaṅkataṃ upapattīsu byākaroti:
When a disciple passes away, he declares that

"asu amutra upapanno, asu amutra upapanno"ti.
this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

yopissa sāvako uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto tampi sāvakaṃ
abbhatītaṃ kālaṅkataṃ upapattīsu byākaroti:
*And as for a disciple who is a supreme person, highest of people, having reached the highest
point, when they pass away he also declares that*

"asu amutra upapanno, asu amutra upapanno"ti.
this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

ayampi kho makkhali gosālo … pe …
This Makkhali Gosāla …

ayampi kho nigaṇṭho nāṭaputto … pe …
Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta …

ayampi kho sañcayo belaṭṭhaputto … pe …
Sañjaya Belaṭṭhiputta …

ayampi kho pakudho kaccāno … pe …
Pakudha Kaccāyana …

ayampi kho ajito kesakambalo saṃghī ceva gaṇī ca gaṇācariyo ca ñāto yasassī titthakaro sādhusammato bahujanassa.
Ajita Kesakambala leads an order and a community, and teaches a community. He's a well-known and famous religious founder, regarded as holy by many people.

sopi sāvakaṃ abbhatītaṃ kālaṅkataṃ upapattīsu byākaroti:
When a disciple passes away, he declares that

"asu amutra upapanno, asu amutra upapanno"ti.
this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

yopissa sāvako uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto tampi sāvakaṃ abbhatītaṃ kālaṅkataṃ upapattīsu byākaroti:
And as for a disciple who is a supreme person, highest of people, having reached the highest point, when they pass away he also declares that

"asu amutra upapanno, asu amutra upapanno"'ti.
this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

ayampi kho samaṇo gotamo saṃghī ceva gaṇī ca gaṇācariyo ca ñāto yasassī titthakaro sādhusammato bahujanassa.
This ascetic Gotama leads an order and a community, and teaches a community. He's a well-known and famous religious founder, regarded as holy by many people.

sopi sāvakaṃ abbhatītaṃ kālaṅkataṃ upapattīsu byākaroti:
When a disciple passes away, he declares that

'asu amutra upapanno, asu amutra upapanno'ti.
this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

yopissa sāvako uttamapuriso paramapuriso paramapattipatto tañca sāvakaṃ abbhatītaṃ kālaṅkataṃ upapattīsu na byākaroti:
But as for a disciple who is a supreme person, highest of people, having reached the highest point, when they pass away he doesn't declare that

'asu amutra upapanno, asu amutra upapanno'ti.
this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

api ca kho naṃ evaṃ byākaroti:
Rather, he declares that they have

'acchecchi taṇhaṃ, vivattayi saṃyojanaṃ, sammā mānābhisamayā antamakāsi dukkhassā'ti.
cut off craving, untied the fetters, and by rightly comprehending conceit have made an end of suffering.

tassa mayhaṃ, bho gotama, ahu deva kaṅkhā, ahu vicikicchā:
I had doubt and uncertainty about that:

'kathaṃ nāma samaṇassa gotamassa dhammo abhiññeyyo'''ti?
'How on earth can I understand the ascetic Gotama's teaching?'"

"alañhi te, vaccha, kaṅkhituṃ, alaṃ vicikicchituṃ.
"Vaccha, no wonder you're doubting and uncertain.

kaṅkhanīye ca pana te ṭhāne vicikicchā uppannā.
Doubt has come up in you about an uncertain matter.

saupādānassa khvāhaṃ, vaccha, upapattiṃ paññāpemi no anupādānassa.
I describe rebirth for someone who grasps fuel, not for someone who doesn't grasp fuel.

seyyathāpi, vaccha, aggi saupādāno jalati, no anupādāno;
It's like a fire which only burns with fuel, not without fuel.

evameva khvāhaṃ, vaccha, saupādānassa upapattiṃ paññāpemi, no anupādānassā"ti.
In the same way I describe rebirth for someone who grasps fuel, not for someone who doesn't grasp fuel."

"yasmiṃ, bho gotama, samaye acci vātena khittā dūrampi gacchati, imassa pana bhavaṃ gotamo kiṃ upādānasmiṃ paññāpetī"ti?
"But when a flame is blown away by the wind, what do you say is its fuel then?"

"yasmiṃ kho, vaccha, samaye acci vātena khittā dūrampi gacchati, tamahaṃ vātūpādānaṃ paññāpemi.
"At such a time, I say that it's fueled by wind.

vāto hissa, vaccha, tasmiṃ samaye upādānaṃ hotī"ti.
For the wind is its fuel then."

"yasmiñca pana, bho gotama, samaye imañca kāyaṃ nikkhipati, satto ca aññataraṃ kāyaṃ anupapanno hoti, imassa pana bhavaṃ gotamo kiṃ upādānasmiṃ paññāpetī"ti?
"But when someone who is attached has laid down this body and has not been reborn in one of the realms, what does Master Gotama say is their fuel then?"

"yasmiṃ kho, vaccha, samaye imañca kāyaṃ nikkhipati, satto ca aññataraṃ kāyaṃ anupapanno hoti, tamahaṃ taṇhūpādānaṃ vadāmi.
"When someone who is attached has laid down this body, Vaccha, and has not been reborn in one of the realms, I say they're fueled by craving.

taṇhā hissa, vaccha, tasmiṃ samaye upādānaṃ hotī"ti.
For craving is their fuel then."

navamaṃ.
-

saṃyutta nikāya 44
Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga
1. The Undeclared Points

10. ānandasutta
10. With Ānanda

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to the Buddha and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to the Buddha:

"kiṃ nu kho, bho gotama, atthattā"ti?
"Master Gotama, does the self exist absolutely?"

evaṃ vutte, bhagavā tuṇhī ahosi.
But when he said this, the Buddha kept silent.

"kiṃ pana, bho gotama, natthattā"ti?
"Then does the self not exist absolutely?"

dutiyampi kho bhagavā tuṇhī ahosi.
But for a second time the Buddha kept silent.

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako uṭṭhāyāsanā pakkāmi.
Then the wanderer Vacchagotta got up from his seat and left.

atha kho āyasmā ānando acirapakkante vacchagotte paribbājake bhagavantaṃ etadavoca:
And then, not long after Vacchagotta had left, Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha:

"kiṃ nu kho, bhante, bhagavā vacchagottassa paribbājakassa pañhaṃ puṭṭho na byākāsī"ti?
"Sir, why didn't you answer Vacchagotta's question?"

"ahañcānanda, vacchagottassa paribbājakassa 'atthattā'ti puṭṭho samāno 'atthattā'ti byākareyyaṃ, ye te, ānanda, samaṇabrāhmaṇā sassatavādā tesametaṃ saddhiṃ abhavissa.

"Ananda, when Vacchagotta asked me whether the self exists absolutely, if I had answered that 'the self exists absolutely' I would have been siding with the ascetics and brahmins who are eternalists.

ahañcānanda, vacchagottassa paribbājakassa 'natthattā'ti puṭṭho samāno 'natthattā'ti byākareyyaṃ, ye te, ānanda, samaṇabrāhmaṇā ucchedavādā tesametaṃ saddhiṃ abhavissa.

When Vacchagotta asked me whether the self does not exist absolutely, if I had answered that 'the self does not exist absolutely' I would have been siding with the ascetics and brahmins who are annihilationists.

ahañcānanda, vacchagottassa paribbājakassa 'atthattā'ti puṭṭho samāno 'atthattā'ti byākareyyaṃ, api nu me taṃ, ānanda, anulomaṃ abhavissa ñāṇassa uppādāya:

When Vacchagotta asked me whether the self exists absolutely, if I had answered that 'the self exists absolutely' would that have helped give rise to the knowledge that

'sabbe dhammā anattā'"ti?

all things are not-self?"

"no hetaṃ, bhante".

"No, sir."

"ahañcānanda, vacchagottassa paribbājakassa 'natthattā'ti puṭṭho samāno 'natthattā'ti byākareyyaṃ, sammūḷhassa, ānanda, vacchagottassa paribbājakassa bhiyyo sammohāya abhavissa:

"When Vacchagotta asked me whether the self does not exist absolutely, if I had answered that 'the self does not exist absolutely', Vacchagotta—who is already confused—would have got even more confused, thinking:

'ahuvā me nūna pubbe attā, so etarahi natthī'"ti.

'It seems that the self that I once had no longer exists.'"

dasamaṃ.

-

samyutta nikāya 44

Linked Discourses 44

1. abyākatavagga

1. The Undeclared Points

11. sabhiyakaccānasutta

11. With Sabhiya Kaccāna

ekaṃ samayaṃ āyasmā sabhiyo kaccāno ñātike viharati giñjakāvasathe.

At one time Venerable Sabhiya Kaccāna was staying at Nādika in the brick house.

atha kho vacchagotto paribbājako yenāyasmā sabhiyo kaccāno tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā āyasmatā sabhiyena kaccānena saddhiṃ sammodi.

Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to him, and exchanged greetings with him.

sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. ekamantaṃ nisinno kho vacchagotto paribbājako āyasmantaṃ sabhiyaṃ kaccānaṃ etadavoca:

When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to Sabhiya Kaccāna:

"kiṃ nu kho bho, kaccāna, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?

"Master Kaccāna, does a Realized One exist after death?"

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:

"Vaccha, this has not been declared by the Buddha."

'hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.

-

"kiṃ pana, bho kaccāna, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
"Well then, does a Realized One not exist after death?"

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
"This too has not been declared by the Buddha."

'na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṃ nu kho, bho kaccāna, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
"Well then, does a Realized One both exist and not exist after death?"

"abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā:
"This has not been declared by the Buddha."

'hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"kiṃ pana, bho kaccāna, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā"ti?
"Well then, does a Realized One neither exist nor not exist after death?"

"etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā:
"This too has not been declared by the Buddha."

'neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'"ti.
-

"'kiṃ nu kho, bho kaccāna, hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti, iti puṭṭho samāno:
"Master Kaccāna, when asked these questions, you say that this has not been declared by the Buddha.

'abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā—
-

hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

'kiṃ pana, bho kaccāna, na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti, iti puṭṭho samāno:
-

'abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā—
-

na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

'kiṃ nu kho, bho kaccāna, hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti, iti puṭṭho samāno:
-

'abyākataṃ kho etaṃ, vaccha, bhagavatā—
-

hoti ca na ca hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

'kiṃ pana, bho kaccāna, neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti, iti puṭṭho samāno:
-

'etampi kho, vaccha, abyākataṃ bhagavatā—
-

neva hoti na na hoti tathāgato paraṃ maraṇā'ti vadesi.
-

ko nu kho, bho kaccāna, hetu, ko paccayo, yenetaṃ abyākataṃ samaṇena gotamenā"ti?
What's the cause, what's the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?"

"yo ca, vaccha, hetu, yo ca paccayo paññāpanāya rūpīti vā arūpīti vā saññīti vā asaññīti vā nevasaññīnāsaññīti vā, so ca hetu, so ca paccayo sabbena sabbaṃ sabbathā sabbaṃ aparisesaṃ nirujjheyya.

"In order to describe him as 'possessing form' or 'formless' or 'percipient' or 'non-percipient' or 'neither percipient nor non-percipient', there must be some cause or reason for doing so.
But if that cause and reason were to totally and utterly cease without anything left over,

kena naṃ paññāpayamāno paññāpeyya rūpīti vā arūpīti vā saññīti vā asaññīti vā nevasaññīnāsaññīti vā"ti.

how could you describe him in any such terms?"

"kīvaciraṃ pabbajitosi, bho kaccānā"ti?

"Master Kaccāna, how long has it been since you went forth?"

"naciraṃ, āvuso, tīṇi vassānī"ti.

"Not long, reverend: three years."

"yassapassa, āvuso, etamettakena ettakameva tampassa bahu, ko pana vādo evaṃ abhikkante"ti.

"Well, you've learned a lot already, let alone what lies ahead!"

ekādasamaṃ.

-

abyākatavaggo paṭhamo.

-

khemātherī anurādho,

-

sāriputtoti koṭṭhiko;

-

moggallāno ca vaccho ca,

-

kutūhalasālānando;

-

sabhiyo ekādasamanti.

-

abyākatasaṃyuttaṃ samattaṃ.

The Linked Discourses on undeclared questions are complete.

saḷāyatanavedanā,

-

mātugāmo jambukhādako;

-

sāmaṇḍako moggallāno,

-

citto gāmaṇi saṅkhataṃ;

-

abyākatanti dasadhāti.

-

saḷāyatanavaggo catuttho.

-

saḷāyatanavaggasaṃyuttapāli niṭṭhitā.

The Book of the Aggregates is finished.