

taṃ bhikkhuṃ: that bhikkhu; acc. sg. of “so bhikkhu”; see above.

abbheyya: should reinstate; 3 sg. opt. of *abbheti*; see above.

ca: and; conn. particle.

anabbhito: not reinstated; neg. pref. *an-* + p.p. of *abbheti*; see above.

te bhikkhū: those bhikkhus; nom. pl. of “so bhikkhu”; see above.

gārayhā: are blameworthy, are to be blamed; f.p.p. of *garahati* ($\sqrt{\text{garah}} + ya > \text{garahya} > \text{garayha}$) used as an adjective to *bhikkhū*; cf. Pāc 65 and Pd 1.

ayaṃ: this; nom. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ayaṃ*.

sāmīci: the right course, proper procedure; nom. sg. f.

ayaṃ tattha sāmīci: this is the proper procedure here, Ñm: this is the proper course here.

tatth’āyasmante ... niṭṭhito: see Sd intro. + Nid concl.

saṅghādises’uddeso: the recitation concerning the community in the beginning and the rest [of the procedure]; nom. sg. m. Kammadhāraya cpd. Junction of *saṅghādisesa* + *uddeso* through the elision of *-a*. =

saṅghādisesa: see above. + **uddeso**: recitation; nom. sg. m.; see Pār intro.

This is the third of the four ways of reciting the Pātimokkha in brief; see the “Recitation of the Pātimokkha” section in the Introduction.

niṭṭhito: finished; see Nid concl.

[Aniyatuddeso²³⁶]

Ime kho panāyasmanto dve aniyatā dhammā uddesaṃ āgacchanti.

[The recitation of the uncertain [cases]]

Venerables, these two uncertain cases come up for recitation.

aniyat’uddeso: the recitation of the uncertain (cases); nom. sg. m. . Probably an appositive kammadhāraya, but here rendered as a genitive tappurisa; see *niddān’uddesa* in Nid intro. See below Aniy conclusion.

Ime kho panāyasmanto ... dhammā uddesaṃ āgacchanti: see Pār & Sd intro.

dve: two; nom. m. sg.

aniyatā: Ñm: indefinite, H: undetermined, unfixed, uncertain; adj., neg. pref. *a-* + *niyata*: fixed, certain, fr. *niyameti* (*ni* + $\sqrt{\text{yam}}$ + *e*): restrains, fixes, ties down.

[Aniy 1: Paṭhama-aniyatasikkhāpadaṃ]

Yo pana bhikkhu mātuḡāmena saddhiṃ eko ekāya raho paṭicchanne āsane alaṅkammaniye²³⁷ nisajjaṃ kappeyya, taṃ-enaṃ saddheyyavacasā upāsikā disvā tiṇṇaṃ dhammānaṃ aññatarena vadeyya: pārajikena vā saṅghādisesena vā pācittiyena vā, nisajjaṃ bhikku paṭijānamāno tiṇṇaṃ dhammānaṃ aññatarena kāretabbo: pārajikena vā saṅghādisesena vā pācittiyena vā, yena vā sā saddheyyavacasā upāsikā vadeyya, tena so bhikkhu kāretabbo, ayaṃ dhammo aniyato.

[The first uncertain training precept]

If any bhikkhu should sit down together with a woman, one [man] with one [woman], privately, on a concealed seat [that is] sufficiently fit for doing [it], [and then if] a female lay-follower whose words can be trusted having seen that, should speak according to one of three cases: according to disqualification, according to what concerns the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure], or

²³⁶ = Be & Mi Se. D: *Aniyatā*; Um has this in brackets. Nothing in other texts.

²³⁷ C, Vibh Ee: *alaṅkammaniye*. Dm, Um, Mm Se, V, W: *alaṅkammaniye*. UP, G, BhPm 1 & 2, Ra: *alaṅ kammaniye*.

according to expiation, [then] the bhikkhu who is admitting the sitting down should be made to do [what is] according to one of three cases: according to disqualification, or according to what concerns the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure], or according to expiation, or according to whatever that female lay-follower whose words can be trusted should say, according to that the bhikkhu is to be made to do. This is an uncertain case.

paṭhama-aniyatasikkhāpadaṃ: the first uncertain training precept; nom. sg. nt. A kammadhāraya cpd containing another kammadhāraya: *aniyatasikkhāpada*. = **paṭhama**: first; adj. + **aniyata**: uncertain; see below + **sikkhāpada**: training precept; see Pār 1.

yo pana bhikkhu mātuḡāmena saddhiṃ: see Sd 2.

eko: one; nom. sg. m. **ekāya**: with one (female); ins. sg. f.

eko ekāya: one [man] with one [woman]. In order to retain the genders expressed in the Pāli this rendering has been chosen rather than the rendering given in DP 526 (col 1 top): “one with the other.”

raho: privately, in secret, in private; adv./ind.; from Vedic *rahas*.

paṭicchanne: concealed, hidden, covered, secluded, screened; adj., p.p. of *paṭicchādeti*, see Sd concl.

āsane: on a seat; loc. sg. nt.

alaṅkammaniye: sufficiently fit for doing (it), i.e., fit for having sex; adj. Bb cpd. = junction of *alaṃ* + *kammaniya* through gutturalisation of the final *-ṃ* of *alaṃ*. **alaṃ**: sufficient; indecl. cf. Pār 1. + **kammaniya**: fit for doing, workable; = **kamma**: action, work + abstract suffix *-ṇiya/-ṇya*. = Skt *karmaṇya*, BHS *karmaṇiya/karmaṇīya*; see DP.

nisajjaṃ: sitting down, seat, place for sitting; acc. sg. f., fr. *nisīdati* (*ni* + $\sqrt{\text{sad}}$ + *a*): sits down, cf. Pāc 42

kappeyya: should use, take; 3 sg. opt. of *kappeti* ($\sqrt{\text{kapp}}$ + *e*).

nisajjaṃ kappeyya: should sit down, sit, Ñm: should seat himself, H: should sit down; cf. Pāc 5, 30, 43–45. Vibh: “... *upanisinnō ... upanipanno ...*” There are two shades of meaning: using a seat, and sitting down. It is difficult to give a satisfactory rendering. The same applies for “*saha seyyaṃ kappeyya*” of Pāc 5, where there is also the difficulty of two shades of meaning. Probably *nisajjaṃ kappeti* is an idiomatic verbal compound having the simple meaning of “sits down”; see the note to *seyyaṃ kappeyya* at Pāc 5.

tam-enam: then that, then him; junction of *taṃ* + *enam* in which *-ṃ* of *taṃ* is weakened to *m*; PG § 71,2b. In Vin I 127 *tam-enam* seems to act as one adverb, but normally *taṃ* functions as an adverb in acc. sg. nt. referring back to something or someone just mentioned, i.e., the bhikkhu sitting with the woman, as in Sn 981 and M I 31; see PED 292 and DP.

Cf. “*sa kho so*,” D I 69, and “*ete te*,” Vin IV 112 & S II 17, which also repeat the pronoun. One possibility is that it is a junction of *taṃ* + *eva* + *naṃ* rather than *taṃ* + *naṃ*.

= **taṃ**: that; acc. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)* + **enam**: this, it, him; acc. sg. m. dem. pron., variant of *etaṃ*.

saddheyyavacasā: whose words can be trusted, PED: of credible speech, Ñm: whose word can be trusted, H: trustworthy; adj. F.p.p. of the verb *saddahati* (*saṃ* + $\sqrt{\text{dhā}}$ + *a*) (from which *saddha* is derived) + **vacasā**: having speech; adj. form of *vaco/vacas*: having speech, having words. Kkh 90: “...: *saddhātabba-vacanā ariyasāvikā ti attho*.”

upāsikā: female lay-follower, lay devotee; nom. sg. f. (*upāsaka* = m.) fr. *upāsati* (*upa* + $\sqrt{\text{ās}}$ + *e*): sits close, i.e., attends, honours.

disvā: having seen; abs. of *passati*; cf. *dissanti* at Sd 13.

tiṇṇaṃ: of three; gen. m. of numeral *tayo*.

dhammānaṃ: cases; gen. pl. m.

aññatarena: with regards to a certain, in accordance with a certain; adj. qualifying an unexpressed *dhammena*; cf. Pār & Sd concl. = Instrumental of relation/specification/accordance; see Syntax § 70,a i. *Aññatara*: one of two/several, a certain; is a comparative of *añña* “another.”

vadeyya: should say; 3 sg. opt. of *vadati*; cf. Sd 13. Since it is likely that she is not familiar with the bhikkhu's disciplinary rules she will not say exactly which type of offence she has seen. She just tells what she has seen and the bhikkhus define the type of offence.

pārājikena: (what is) in accordance with (a case) involving disqualification; adj. qualifying an unexpressed *dhammena*.

vā ... vā: either ... or; disj. parts.

saṅghādisesena: (what is) in accordance with (a case) involving the community in the beginning and in the rest; adj. qualifying *dhammena*.

pācittiya: (what is) in accordance with (a case) involving expiation, PED & *Vinaya Texts* 31: requiring expiation, H: involving expiation, Nm: entailing expiation, Than: to be confessed (Cf. Thān, BMC 163); adjective qualifying *dhammena*.

Prāyaścittika was the Vedic ritual expiation for transgressions; see Roth, 1968, p.346, and Hinüber, 1999 p.17, and 1985 p.63–66. “Expiation” in English means: “to atone for (sin or wrongdoing); make amends for,” while confession means: “to make an acknowledgement, esp. of one’s faults or crimes.”; see Collins Concise English Dictionary. In the Buddhist tradition a Pācittiya offence is confessed to another bhikkhu and there is no atonement of any sort, therefore confession fits better for *pācittiya*.

The etymology of *pācittiya* is uncertain, see PED 450 and BD II 3 n. 4. Hinüber 1999 p.17 and 1985 p.63–66, following Mayrhofer, takes *pācittiya* to be related to the Vedic *prāyaścitta*. (The *-āya-* being contracted into *-ā-* in Pāli; see PG 20 n. 2) See BD II 3 n. 4: “Pācittiya as *prāyaścittika* means lit.: “in repentance, in compensation, in expiation.” MW 708: *prāyaścitta*: atonement, expiation, amends, penance; see also VINS II 50.

The Jains had ten categories of offences which required *pāyaccitta* (= Skt: *prāyaścitta*): expiation (through penance, *tapas*). The heaviest of which is the *pārāñcika*, corresponding to the Pāli *pārājika*, the lightest is the *dukkāḍa*, the Pāli *dukkāṭa*; see N. Taita & M.M. Kumar, 1980, p.14–17 + 52, Levi, 1912, p.505f., Roth, 1968, p.342, Dutt 72. The Mā-L school used *pācattika*, Mū: *pāyantika*, Sa: *pātayantika*.²³⁸

Vin V 148:

“Pācittiyān-ti yaṃ vuttaṃ, taṃ suṇohi yathātathāṃ.

Pātetī kusalaṃ dhammaṃ, ariyamaggaṃ aparajjhātī,

Cittasammohanaṃ²³⁹ ṭhānaṃ, ten’etaṃ iti vuccatī.”

“What is called a ‘pācittiya’, listen to it as it is:

One drops a wholesome state, one offends against the noble way,

(It is) an occasion for mental confusion, therefore this is called thus.”

nisajjaṃ: see above. **bhikkhu**: nom. sg. m.

paṭijānamāno: admitting, Nm: concurs, H: acknowledging; pr.p. of *paṭijānāti* (*paṭi* + $\sqrt{nā}$ + *ṇa*) agreeing with *bhikkhu*.

kāretabbo: is to be made to do, is to be done with, is to be dealt with; f.p.p. of *kāreti*, causative of *karoti*; cf. Pāc 73: *yathādhmmo kāretabbo* and Adhik: *paṭiññāya kāretabbo*. The bhikkhu is to be made to do by other bhikkhus the legal procedure that is in accordance with the offence he has committed.

yena ... tena ...: with what(ever) ... with that, or: by which; correlative pronouns, ins. of *ya(d)* + *ta(d)*, agreeing with unexpressed *dhammena*.

vā: or; disj. particle. When the bhikkhu has stated his side, then the judging bhikkhus may accept that or impute an offence on him according to what the *upāsikā* says. According to Thanissaro Bhikkhu, BMC I 158 f., this clause is a remnant of an early time, when the Vibhaṅga on it was not yet in existence. The Vibhaṅga, in line with the guidelines for handling accusations in the Khandhakas, states that he should be punished only

²³⁸ See Roth, 1968, p.342 & Hirakawa, 1982, pp.23–24. BMD p.14, and Hinüber 1985 pp.63–66 list some more versions of the word.

²³⁹ There appears to be a word-play here: *pā* (*teti*) + *citt* (*asamohanaṃ*) = *pācitt(iya)*.

in accordance with what he admits. Thus, this is an interesting case of a rule-clause superseded by its Vibhaṅga commentary and the guidelines in the Khandhakas.

sā: that; nom. sg. f. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*. **so:** that; nom. sg. m. of dem. pron. *ta(d)*.

ayaṃ: this; nom. sg. of dem. pron. *ayaṃ*.

dhmmo aniyato: indefinite case; see above, here nom. sg. m. The sentence verb *hoti* is unexpressed here. The whole rule is one sentence as the optative requires the “*ayaṃ dhmmo aniyato hoti*” as completion; see Pār 2 *ādiyeyya*. The other sentences are in parenthesis in it.

[Aniy 2: Dutiya-aniyatasikkhāpadaṃ]

Na heva kho pana paṭicchannaṃ āsanaṃ hoti nālaṅkammaniyaṃ,²⁴⁰ alaṅ-ca kho hoti mātugāmaṃ duṭṭhullāhi vācāhi obhāsitaṃ. Yo pana bhikkhu tathārūpe āsane mātugāmena saddhiṃ eko ekāya raho nisajjaṃ kappeyya, tam-enam saddheyyavacasā²⁴¹ upāsikā disvā dvinnam dhammānaṃ aññatarena vadeyya saṅghādisesena vā pācittiyena vā, nisajjaṃ bhikkhu paṭijānamāno dvinnam dhammānaṃ aññatarena kāretabbo saṅghādisesena vā pācittiyena vā, yena vā sā saddheyyavacasā upāsikā vadeyya, tena so bhikkhu kāretabbo, ayam-pi dhmmo aniyato.

[The second uncertain training precept]

But even if the seat is neither concealed nor sufficiently fit for doing it, but is sufficient for speaking suggestively to a woman with depraved words: if any bhikkhu should sit down on such a seat together with a woman—one [man] with one [woman], privately—[and then if] a female lay-follower whose words can be trusted having seen that, should speak according to one of two cases: according to what concerns the community in the beginning and in the rest, or according to expiation, [then] the bhikkhu admitting the sitting down is to be made to do according to one of two cases: according to what concerns the community in the beginning and in the rest [of the procedure], or according to expiation, or according to whatever that female lay-follower whose words can be trusted should say, according to that the bhikkhu is to be made to do, this too is an uncertain case.

dutiya-aniyatasikkhāpadaṃ: the second uncertain training precept; nom. sg. nt. A kammadhāraya cpd containing another kammadhāraya: *aniyatasikkhāpada*. = **dutiya:** second; ordinal + **sikkhāpada:** training precept.

na heva kho pana ... na ... ca ...: But even if ... neither ... nor” A “*na ... na ...*”: “neither ... nor” construction in combination with (disjunctive) particles; see DP s.v. *eva*: “*n’eva ... na ...*”

The “*na heva ... na ... ca ...*” construction is also found elsewhere, esp. with *api ca*; e.g. A IV 54: “*Idh’ekacco samaṇo vā brāhmaṇo vā sammā brahmacārī paṭijānamāno na heva kho mātugāmena saddhiṃ dvayaṃ-dvaya-samāpattiṃ samāpajjati, na pi mātugāmassa ucchādana-parimaddana-nhāpana-sambāhanaṃ sādīyati; api ca kho mātugāmena saddhiṃ saṅgagghati ...*” Cf. Vin II 243, Th 664.

It is not to be confused with *pan’eva* at Sd 12 & 13.

na: not; neg. particle.

heva: no need to translate; emphatic particles; maybe a junction of *hi* + *eva* in which the *-i* of *hi* has been elided, as in *hevaṃ* and *hetam*, or maybe it is a junction of *na* + *eva* in which the junction consonant *-h-* has been added to avoid hiatus. In this case we should read: “*na-h-eva*”; see PG § 73,7. According to Warder, IP p.214, it is a junction of the emphatic particle *ha* + *eva*.

Norman suggests that forms such as *heva* and *hevaṃ* are probably Eastern dialect forms, i.e., Māgadhisms, as they sometimes stand at the start of clauses and *hi*, being an enclitic, cannot do so; see CP V p.79 and PG § 73 n. 5.

²⁴⁰ Vibh Ee: *-kammaniyaṃ*. Mm Se, BhPm 1–2, C, D, G, V, W, Um, Ra, Vibh Ee: *nālaṃ kammaniyaṃ*. UP, BhPm 1 & 2, Ra: *nālaṃ kammaniyaṃ*.)

²⁴¹ In W a (later?) correction has been added before this: *sā*.

kho pana: no need to translate; see above Sd.

paṭicchannaṃ āsanaṃ: concealed seat; nom. sg. nt.; see Aniy 1.

hoti: it is; 3 sg. pres. ind. contracted form of *bhavati*: see above Nid. *Hoti* states attributes of a thing, rather than emphasising the existence of a thing as *atthi* does; see IP p.30.

nālaṅkammaṇiyaṃ: = junction of *na* + *alaṃ* through contraction and *alaṃ* + *kammaṇiyaṃ*; see Aniy 1.

alañ-ca: junction of *alaṃ* + *ca* through the palatalisation of *-ṃ*.

alaṃ: sufficient; indecl. + **ca:** but; disj. particle. The particle *ca* is normally connective but becomes disjunctive after a negation; see the notes on Th 41 in Norman 1969 and Dhp 5 in Norman, 2000..

mātugāmaṃ duṭṭhullāhi vācāhi: see Sd 3.

obhāsituṃ: to speak suggestively; inf. of *obhāsati*: see Sd 3.

yo pana bhikkhu: see above Nid.

tathārūpe: of such kind, such; adj. see Pār 2.

āsane: see Aniy 1.

The rest as Aniy 1 except:

dvinnam: of two; gen. pl. m. of num. *dve*.

ayam-pi: junction of *ayam* + *pi* through labialisation of *-ṃ*.

pi: too; emph. particle.

[Aniyata conclusion]

Uddiṭṭhā kho āyasmanto dve aniyatā dhammā.

Tatthāyasmante pucchāmi: Kacci'ttha parisuddhā?

Dutiyam-pi pucchāmi: Kacci'ttha parisuddhā?

Tatitiam-pi pucchāmi: Kacci'ttha parisuddhā?

Parisuddh'etthāyasmanto, tasmā tuṇhī, evam-etam dhārayāmi.²⁴²

*Aniyat'uddeso niṭṭhito.*²⁴³

Venerables, the two uncertain cases have been recited.

Concerning that I ask the Venerables: [Are you] pure in this?

A second time again I ask: [Are you] pure in this?

A third time again I ask: [Are you] pure in this?

The venerables are pure in this, therefore there is silence, thus I bear this [in mind].

The recitation of the uncertain [cases] is finished.

uddiṭṭhā ... niṭṭhito: see Aniy intro. + Nid. concl.

aniyat'uddeso: indefinite-(cases)-recitation; nom. sg. m. Appositive kammadhāraya cpd. = junction of *aniyata* + *uddesa* through the elision of the final *-a* of *aniyata*; see Pār intro and concl.

This is the fourth of the four ways of reciting the Pātimokkha in brief; see "Recitation of the Pātimokkha." section in the Introduction.

²⁴² Dm, UP, Ra, Um: *dhārayāmi ti*.

²⁴³ Nd Ce, Um, UP, Mi Se: *Aniyatuddeso catuttho*. Dm: *Aniyato niṭṭhito*.