# M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020

**Author: Anu Sivaraman** 

**Bench: Anu Sivaraman** 

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

1

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.35597 OF 2019(Y)

# PETITIONERS:

M/S.TECHNO ENGINEERING CORPORATION, C/3102, INTERNATIONAL STADIUM, KALOOR, KOCHI-682017, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING PARTNER, SRI.V.R.NAIR, AGED 76 YEARS, SON OF LATE MR.A.K.VASUDEVAN NAIR.

BY ADVS.
SRI.ANIL S.RAJ
SMT.K.N.RAJANI
SRI.RADHIKA RAJASEKHARAN P.
SMT.ANILA PETER
SRI.C.PRABIN BENNY
SRI.S.SUDHEESH

#### RESPONDENT/S:

- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(E),
  BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, CTO
  BUILDING, KARAKKATTU ROAD, ERNAKULAM-682016.
- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, SANCHAR
  BHAVAN, KOVILAKATHUMPADAM, TUDA ROAD, TRICHUR680022.

1

THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E),
BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 3RD FLOOR BSNL

M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020

BHAVAN, SOUTH BAZAR, KANNUR-670002.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

2

4 SUB DIVISIONAL ENGINEER (E),
BSNL ELECTRICAL SUB DIVISION, 2ND FLOOR
TELEPHONE BHAVAN, ALAPPUZHA - 688011.

R1-4 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

# OTHER PRESENT:

SR. ADV. SRI. R.D. AGRAWALA FOR BSNL AND GP. SMT. B.VINITHA AND SMT. PRINCY XAVIER

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).27660/2019(F) AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

3

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.27660 OF 2019(F)

# PETITIONERS:

ALLIES FIRE SYSTEMS PVT. LTD. FIRST FLOOR, CITY SCAPE BUILDING, NR. POLICE STATION, SOUTH KALAMASSERY, CHANGAMPUZHA NAGAR P.O, ERNAKULAM 682 033 REPRESENTED BY ITS DIRECTOR, MR. THOMAS MANI

BY ADVS.

SRI.SANTHOSH MATHEW SRI.ARUN THOMAS SRI.JENNIS STEPHEN SRI.VIJAY V. PAUL SMT.VEENA RAVEENDRAN

SRI.ANIL SEBASTIAN PULICKEL SMT.DIVYA SARA GEORGE

SMT.JAISY ELZA JOE

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
  REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARYMINISTRY OF
  COMMUNICATIONS, SANCHAR BHAWAN 20, ASHOKA ROAD,
  NEW DELHI 110 001
  REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY
- 2 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD,
  BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR
  LANE, JANPATH , NEW DELHI 110 001
  REPRESENTED BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING
  DIRECTOR

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

4

- 3 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER,
  0FFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E)
  BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, CTO BLDG.
  KARAKKATTU ROAD, ERNAKULAM 682 036
- 4 SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER (E)
  0FFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER(E)BSNL KERALA
  ELECTRICAL ZONE, ADMN. BUILDING, TELEPHONE
  EXCHANGE COMPOUND, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM
  695 009
- 5 SUB DIVISIONAL ENGINEER (E)
  0/0 THE SUB DIVISIONAL ENGINEER, BSNL
  ELECTRICAL SUB DIVISION, NR. IRON BRIDGE,
  ALAPPUZHA 688 001
- 6 ADDL.R6.NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION
  DIRECTORATE OF HEALTH SERVICES COMPOUND,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695035 REPRESENTED BY ITS
  STATE MISSION DIRECTOR MR.KESHVENDRA KUMA IAS.
- 7 ADDL.R7.CHIEF ENGINEER
  BSNL KERALA CIVIL ZONE, 1ST FLOOR,
  ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, MANACAUD,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009.

R1 BY SRI.RAJAGOPALAN.A., CGC R2-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R6 BY SRI.M.AJAY, SC, NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

5

# IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

# **PRESENT**

# THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

# MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.30701 OF 2019(K)

# PETITIONER:

LAIQUE P.P S/O.P.P MUHAMMED, AGED 50 YEARS, BSNL CONTRACTOR, PUTHUKAYIL PUTHIYA MALIYEKKAL HOUSE, B.P. ANGADI P.O. TIRUR TALUK, MALAPPURAM

BY ADV. SRI.C.M.MOHAMMED IQUABAL

DISTRICT.

#### RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED(GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING)
  REPRESENTED BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE, JANPATH, NEW DELHI 110 001.
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER,
  BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED, PMG JUNCTION,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 001.
- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER,

  OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (C), BSNL CIVIL

  DIVISION E-11, THAZHETHANGADI (PO), KOTTAYAM

  686 005.

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

6

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

# MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.30826 OF 2019(C)

#### PETITIONER:

K.S.HARIKUMAR AGED 51 YEARS SUBHASREE, NEELESWARAM P.O, KOTTARAKKARA, KOLLAM- 691 506

BY ADVS. SRI.RAGHUL SUDHEESH SMT.J.LAKSHMI

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD
  BHARATH SANCHAR BHAVAN, HAREESH CHANDRA MATHUR
  LANE , JANPATH , NEW DELHI- 110001, REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR .
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER

  BSNL KERALA CIRCLE, PMG JUNCTION , VIKAS BHAVAN
  P.O, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 033
- THE CHIEF ENGINEER(C)

  BSNL KERALA CIVIL ZONE, FIRST FLOOR,
  ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, YAMUNA NAGAR,
  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 009
- 4 THE SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER (C)
  FIRST FLOOR , ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING , YAMUNA
  NAGAR, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 009
  W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

7

THE GENERAL MANAGER
KOLLAM , BSNL BHAVAN, VELLAYITTAMBALAM ,
THIRUMULLAVARAM PO, KOLLAM- 691 012

R1-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

8

# IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

# **PRESENT**

# THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

# MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31181 OF 2019(W)

# PETITIONER:

REGI ENGINEERING WORKS
NEAR PANJAYATH OFFICE, THIRUVALLA ROAD,
MALLAPPALLY P.O, PATHANAMTHITTA DISTRICT-689
585, REPRESENTED BY ITS PROPRIETOR, REGI
VARUGHESE, RESIDING AT LANKAGRI HOUSE,
PARUMTHURUTHI P.O, THIRUVALLA.

BY ADVS. SMT.SINDHU SANTHALINGAM SRI.A.D.SHAJAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 UNION OF INDIA SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, TELECOM DEPARTMENT, NEW DELHI-110 003
- 2 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED, CORPORATE OFFICE, NEW DELHI-110 001, REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY.
- 3 CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, 0/0. OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, TELECOM KERALA CIRCLE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033
- 4 CHIEF ENGINEER (E)
  0/0. OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E) KERALA
  ELECTRICAL ZONE, BSNL, 1ST FLOOR, ADMN.
  BUILDING, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND,
  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

9

5 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E-P)
0/0. OF CHIEF ENGINEER(E), KERALA ELECTRICAL
ZONE, BSNL, 1ST FLOOR, ADMN. BUILDING,
TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND, MANACAUD,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009

R1 BY ADV. SHRI.P.VIJAYAKUMAR, ASG OF INDIA

R2-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

10

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31202 OF 2019(A)

#### PETITIONER:

LAIQUE.P.P AGED 50 YEARS S/O.P.P.MUHAMMED, BSNL CONTRACTOR, PUTHUKAYIL PUTHIYA MALIYEKKAL HOUSE, B.P.ANGADI.P.O., TIRUR TALUK, MALAPPURAM DISTRICT

BY ADV. SRI.C.M.MOHAMMED IQUABAL

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED
  (GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING), REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL
  CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE,
  NANPATH, NEW DELHI-110001
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER

  BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED, PMG JUNCTION,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695001
- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER

  OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(CIVIL), BSNL

  CIVIL DIVISION, 1ST FLOOR, COAXIALSTAFF

  QUARTERS, EAST HILL, WEST HILL.P.O., CALICUT,

  PIN-673005

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED

CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

11

#### IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31220 OF 2019(B)

# PETITIONERS:

AIR COOL MAKERS,
NANDANAM M L ROAD, KOTTAYAM, REP. BY ITS
PROPRIETOR, SHRI. MONIE MATHAI, AGED 49, S/O.
K.M. MATHAI, RESIDING AT RAJA VILLA, NEAR
PALLIPURATHKAVU TEMPLE, KOTTAYAM-686 013

BY ADVS. SMT.SINDHU SANTHALINGAM SRI.A.D.SHAJAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 UNION OF INDIA SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, TELECOM DEPARTMENT, NEW DELHI-110003.
- 2 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED, CORPORATE OFFICE, NEW DELHI-110 003, REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY.
- 3 CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, 0/0. THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, TELECOM KERALA CIRCLE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.
- 4 CHIEF ENGINEER (E)
  0/0. THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E), KERALA ELECTRICAL
  ZONE, BSNL, 1ST FLOOR, ADMN. BUILDING,
  TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND, MANACAUD,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

12

5 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E-P) 0/0. THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E), KERALA ELECTRICAL M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020

ZONE, BSNL, 1ST FLOOR, ADMN. BUILDING, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009

R1 BY ADV. SHRI.P.VIJAYAKUMAR, ASG OF INDIA R2-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

13

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31225 OF 2019(C)

# PETITIONER:

LAIQUE.P.P AGED 50 YEARS S/O.P.P.MUHAMMED, BSNL CONTRACTOR, PUTHUKAYIL PUTHIYA MALIYEKKAL HOUSE, B.P.ANGADI P.O., TIRUR TALUK, MALAPPURAM DISTRICT.

BY ADV. SRI.C.M.MOHAMMED IQUABAL

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED
  (GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING), REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL
  CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110001.
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER,
  BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED, PMG JUNCTION,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695001.
- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER,

  OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (C), BSNL

  CIVIL DIVISION NO-II, ERNAKULAM, PIN-682016.

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

14

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31714 OF 2019(L)

# PETITIONER:

ALI AND ASSOCIATES
19/503, MOOLEPPADAM ROAD, KALAMASSERY,
ERNAKULAM, PIN-683104-REPRESENTED BY ITS
MANAGING PARTNER MR. MUHAMMED ALI, S/O. P.K.
ALIKUTTY, AGED 57 YEARS, KALLIDUM HOUSE,
MOOLEPADAM ROAD, KALAMASERRY, ERNAKULAM
DISTRICT, PIN-683 104.

BY ADVS. SRI.PRAMOJ ABRAHAM SRI.K.A.ANISH

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.
  (GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING), REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL
  CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110 001.
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER

  BSNL, KERALA TELECOMMUNICATIONS CIRCLE OFFICE,

  PMG JUNCTION, VIKAS BHAVAN POST,

  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.
- 3 CHIEF ENGINEER-CIVIL
  BSNL, KERALA CIVIL ZONE, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE
  BUILDING, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-605036.

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

16

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31925 OF 2019(M)

# PETITIONER:

SURESH KUMAR,
AGED 46 YEARS
S/O.G.KUTTAN PILLAI PROPRIETOR, SABARI
ELECTRICALS AND ENGINEERING,
CHEMPAZHANTHY.P.O., THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695587

BY ADVS.
SRI.N.KRISHNA PRASAD
SRI.IMAM GRIGORIOS KARAT
SRI.DEEPAK VARUGHESE MATHEW
SMT.GEETHU SUSAN VARGHESE

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD, REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, SANCHAR BHAVAN, NEW DELHI-110001
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER
  BSNL, KERALA CIRCLE, PATTOM,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695004
- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(E)
  BSNL, ELECTRICAL ZONE, KURIYATHI, MANACAUD
  POST, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

# IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

# **PRESENT**

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.31948 OF 2019(P)

# PETITIONER:

ANEESH R.S., AGED 39 YEARS SHEENA BHAVANAM, IRUMBANANGADU P.O., EZHUKONE, KOLLAM - 691 505.

BY ADVS. SRI.RAGHUL SUDHEESH SMT.J.LAKSHMI

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD., BHARATH SANCHAR BHAVAN, HAREESH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE, JANPATH, NEW DELHI - 110 001, REPRESENTED BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR.
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER,
  BSNL KERALA CIRCLE, PMG JUNCTION, VIKAS BHAVAN
  P.O., THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 033.
- THE CHIEF ENGINEER (C),

  BSNL KERALA CIVIL ZONE, FIRST FLOOR,

  ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, YAMUNA NAGAR,

  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 009.
- THE SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER (C),
  FIRST FLOOR, ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, YAMUNA
  NAGAR, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 009.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

18

5 THE GENERAL MANAGER, KOLLAM, BSNL BHAVAN, VELLAYITTAMBALAM, THIRUMULLAVARAM P.O., KOLLAM - 691 012. R1-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R1-5 BY ADV. SHRI.R.D.AGRAWALA

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

19

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.32074 OF 2019(H)

# PETITIONER:

SURESH KUMAR
AGED 46 YEARS
S/O.KUTTANPILLAI, PROPRIETOR, SABARI ELETRICALS
AND ENGINEERING, CHEMPAZHANTHY P.O.,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 587

BY ADVS.

SRI.N.KRISHNA PRASAD SRI.IMAM GRIGORIOS KARAT SRI.DEEPAK VARUGHESE MATHEW SMT.GEETHU SUSAN VARGHESE

#### RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD., REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, SANCHAR BHAVAN, NEW DELHI-110 001
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, KERALA CIRCLE, PATTOM, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 004
- THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(E),

  BSNL , ELECTRICAL ZONE, KURIYATHI, MANACAUD

  POST, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON

12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

20

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.32159 OF 2019(T)

#### PETITIONER:

GENERAL ELECTRIC CORPORATION,
OTTAPALAM SHOPPING COMPLEX, MAIN ROAD,
OTTAPALAM, PALAKKAD-679 101, REP Y ITS PARTNER
K. ABOOBAKKER SIDHIC.

BY ADV. SRI.H.RAMANAN

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD. (BSNL),
  REG.OFFICE, BHARAT SANCHERI BHAVAN, HCM LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DHLHI-110001, REP BY ITS CHAIRMAN
  AND MANAGING DIRECTOR.
- 2 CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, OFFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.
- THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE, ADMINISTRATIVE
  BUILDING, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND,
  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009.
- 4 DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER (FINANCE), OFFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.
- 5 CHIEF ACCOUNTS OFFICER BILLS(ERP AND CSC),
  BSNL KERALA CIRCLE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.
  W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

21

6 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (ELECTRICAL),

M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020

BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, CTO BUILDING, ERNAKULAM-682 016.

- 7 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E), BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, SANCHAR BHAVAN, TUDA ROAD, THRISSUR-680002.
- 8 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, OLD CTO BLDG,SILK
  STREET, BEACH ROAD, KOZHIKODE-673 032.
- 9 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E), BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, BSNL BHAVAN, SOUTH BAZZAR, KANNUR-670002.
- 10 UNION OF INDIA,
  REP BY SECRETARY TO FINANCE, MINISTRY OF
  FINANCE, NEW DELHI-111001.
- 11 DEPARTMENT OF TELE COMMUNICATIONS, REP BY SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION,S NEW DELHI-111001.

R1-9 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R10-11 BY SRI.K.SHRI HARI RAO, CGC

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

22

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.32503 OF 2019(K)

# PETITIONER:

NEV TECH ENGINEERS AND CONTRACTORS
SAPTHATHI BUILDINGS, KONTHURUTHY, THEVARA P.O.,
KOCHI-682 013, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING
PARTNER MR.JOHN KELOTH, S/O.VAKKACHAN, AGED 65
YEARS, KELOTH HOUSE, CNRA-1, KONTHURUTHY,
THEVARA P.O., KOCHI-682 013.

BY ADVS. SRI.PRAMOJ ABRAHAM SMT.SARANYA CHANDRAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED
  (GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING), REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL
  CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDA MATHUR LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110 001.
- THE CHIEG GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL,
  KERALA TELECOMMUNICATIONS, CIRCLE OFFICE, PMG
  JUNCTION, VIKAS BHAVAN POST,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.
- 3 CHIEF ENGINEER-ELECTRICAL, BSNL,
  KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE
  BUILDING, MANACUAD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-690 533.

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

23

12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

24

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.32577 OF 2019(V)

# PETITIONER:

KURIAN VARGHESE AGED 58 YEARS

MATHARA HOUSE, PANACODE. P.O, VADAVUCODE,

ERNAKULAM-682310.

BY ADVS.

SRI.SANTHOSH MATHEW

SRI.ARUN THOMAS

SRI.JENNIS STEPHEN

SRI.VIJAY V. PAUL

SMT.KARTHIKA MARIA

SMT. VEENA RAVEENDRAN

SRI.ANIL SEBASTIAN PULICKEL

SMT.DIVYA SARA GEORGE

SMT.JAISY ELZA JOE

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
  MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS, SANCHARA BHAWAN
  20, ASHOKA ROAD, NEW DELHI-110001, REPRESENTED BY
  THE SECRETARY.
- 2 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD,
  BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR
  LANE, JANPATH,
  NEW DELHI-110001, REPRESENTED BY ITS CHAIRMAN
  AND MANAGING DIRECTOR.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

25

- 3 CHIEF ENGINEER, BSNL KERALA CIVIL ZONE,1ST FLOOR, ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING,MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009.
- 4 SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER(E),
  OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER(E),
  BSNL KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE,
  ADMN.BUILDING, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE
  COMPOUND, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009.
- 5 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(CIVIL)
  OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(CIVIL), BSNL
  CIVIL DIVISION, E-2, BSNL STAFF QUARTERS,
  KOTTAYAM 686 005.
- 6 NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION,
  DIRECTORATE OF HEALTH SERVICE COMPOUND,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695035, REPRESENTED BY ITS
  STATE MISSION DIRECTOR MR.KESHVENDRA KUMAR IAS.

R1 BY ADV. SHRI.P.VIJAYAKUMAR, ASG OF INDIA R2-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R6 BY ADV. SRI.M.AJAY

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED

CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

26

#### IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.32610 OF 2019(A)

# PETITIONER:

KURIAN VARGHESE AGED 58 YEARS MATHARA HOUSE, PANACODE.P.O., VADAVUCODE, ERNAKULAM-682310

BY ADVS.

SRI.SANTHOSH MATHEW
SRI.ARUN THOMAS
SRI.JENNIS STEPHEN
SRI.VIJAY V. PAUL
SMT.KARTHIKA MARIA
SMT.VEENA RAVEENDRAN

SRI.ANIL SEBASTIAN PULICKEL SMT.DIVYA SARA GEORGE

SMT.JAISY ELZA JOE

# RESPONDENTS:

1 UNION OF INDIA MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS, SANCHAR BHAWAN 20, ASHOKA ROAD, NEW DELHI 110001 REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY

2 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.,
BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR
LANE, JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110001 REPRESENTED BY
ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

27

3 CHIEF ENGINEER
BSNL KERALA CIVIL ZONE 1ST FLOOR,
ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, MANACAUD,
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009

- 4 SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER(E)
  0FFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER(E), BSNL KERALA
  ELECTRICAL ZONE ADMN. BUILDING, TELEPHONE
  EXCHANGE COMPOUND MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM695009
- 5 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(CIVIL)
  OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(CIVIL), BSNL
  CIVIL DIVISION, E-2, BSNL STAFF QUARTERS,
  KOTTAYAM-686005
- 6 NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION
  DIRECTORATE OF HEALTH SERVICES COMPOUND
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695035 REPRESENTED BY ITS
  STATE MISSION DIRECTOR MR.KESHAVENDRA KUMAR IAS

R1 BY SMT.SREEKALA K.L., CGC R2-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R6 BY ADV. SRI.M.AJAY

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

28

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.33286 OF 2019(I)

# PETITIONER:

G.SHYLENDRA GOPAL AGED 67 YEARS HIMA HYIMAM T.K.M.C.P.O, KARIKKODE KOLLAM-691005

BY ADVS. SRI.RAGHUL SUDHEESH SMT.J.LAKSHMI

#### RESPONDENTS:

M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.
  BHARATH SANCHAR BHAVAN, HAREESH CHANDRA MATHUR
  LANE JANPATH NEW DELHI-110001 REPRESENTED BY
  ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR
- THE CHIER GENERAL MANAGER

  BSNL KERALA CIRCLE, PMG JUNCTION, VIKAS

  BHAVAN.P.O, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033
- 3 CHIER ENGINEER(C)
  BSNAL KERALA CIVIL ZONE, FIRST FLOOR,
  ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, YAMUNA NAGAR,
  MANACADUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009
- THE SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER(C)
  BSNL, FIRST FLOOR, ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING,
  YAMUNA NAGAR, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM695009

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

29

- 5 THE GENERAL MANAGER, KOLLAM, BSNL BHAVAN, VELLAYITTAMBALAM, THIRUMULLAVARAM.P.O, KOLLAM- 691012
- THE GENERAL MANAGER
  THIRUVALLA BSNL BHAVAN, THIRUVALLA-689101

R1-6 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

30

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.33430 OF 2019(C)

PETITIONERS:

PRASAD.O.K AGED 47 YEARS M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020

OLIKKOTTUKUDIYIL HOUSE, VARAPETTY.P.O., KOTHAMANGALAM, ERNAKULAM DISTRICT PIN-686691

BY ADVS.

SRI.V.K.PRASAD SRI.M.PRAVEESH

# RESPONDENTS:

- THE CHAIMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR
  BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED, CORPORATE OFFICE,
  8TH FLOOR, BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED BHAVAN,
  NEW DELHI-110001
- THE BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED

  (A GOVERNMENT OF INDIA ENTERPRISE), REPRESENTED

  BY CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, KERALA CIRCLE,

  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695001
- THE GENRAL MANAGER
  TELECOM, BSNL BHAVAN, KOCHI-682016
- THE ASSISTNAT GENERAL MANAGER(CP)
  TELECOM, OFFICE OF THE PRINCIPAL GENERAL
  MANAGER, BSNL BHAVAN, KOCHI-682016

R1-4 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R1-4 BY ADV. SHRI.R.D.AGRAWALA

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

31

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

32

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.33435 OF 2019(D)

PETITIONERS:

NAVEEN,

AGED 42 YEARS
PROPERIETOR, NAVEEN ELECTROMECH, BHAVANA, CMC 17, CHERTHALAP.O., ALAPPUZHA - 688 524.

BY ADV. SRI.H.RAMANAN

#### RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.(BSNL),
  REGD. OFFICE, BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HCM LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI 110001, REP. BY ITS
  CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR.
- 2 CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, OFFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAURAM - 695 033.
- THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE
  COMPOUND, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695
  009.
- 4 DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER (FINANCE), OFFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAURAM - 695 033.
- 5 CHIEF ACCOUNTS OFFICER BILLS (ERP AND CSC), BSNL, KERALA CIRCLE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM - 695 033.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

33

- 6 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (ELECTRICAL), BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, CTO BUILDING, ERNAKULAM - 682 016.
- 7 UNION OF INDIA, REP BY SECRETARY TO FINANCE, MINISTRY OF FINANCE, NEW DELHI - 111 001.
- 8 DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS, REP BY SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS, NEW DELHI - 111 001.

R1-6 BY ADV. SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP R7-8 BY SMT.PREMLATHA K. NAIR, CGC

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

# IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

# **PRESENT**

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.33466 OF 2019(G)

# PETITIONERS:

JOSHY SEBASTIAN
AGED 53 YEARS
PROPRIETOR, ABLE ELECTRICALS PUTHENKULANGARA
HOUSE, KUMARANALLOOR P.O, KOTTAYAM 680 016
ERNAKULAM.

BY ADV. SRI.H.RAMANAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.(BSNL)
  RG. OFFICE, BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HCM LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI 110 001.
  REP BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR
- 2 CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER,
  0FFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG
  JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 033.
- 3 THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E)
  BSNL KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE, ADMINISTRATIVE
  BUILDING, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND,
  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 009.
- THE CHIEF ENGINEER (CIVIL),

  BANL KERALA ZONE, 1ST FLOOR, TE BUILDING,

  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 009.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

35

- DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER (FINANCE)
  OFFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG
  JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 033.
- 6 CHIEF ACCOUNTS OFFICER ,
  BILLS (ERP AND CSC)
  BSNL, KERALA CIRCLE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695
  033.

7 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (ELECTRICAL)
BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 4TH FLOOR, CTO
BUILDING, ERNAKULAM 682 016

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

36

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.33726 OF 2019(M)

# PETITIONER:

M/S.SPANDS

ELECTRICAL ENGINEERS AND CONTRACTORS, DOOR NO.5/3424, C-4, NOOR COMPLEX, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE-673004, REP. BY ITS MANAGING PARTNER K.NARAYANAN.

BY ADV. SRI.H.RAMANAN

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.(BSNL),
  REGD. OFFICE, BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HCM LANE,
  JANAPATH, NEW DELHI-110001, REP. BY ITS
  CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR.
- 2 CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER,
  0FFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG
  JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.
- THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE, ADMINISTRATIVE
  BUILDING, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE COMPOUND,
  MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695009.
- 4 DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER (FINANCE).
  OFFICE OF THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, PMG

M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020 JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.

5 CHIEF ACCOUNTS OFFICER BILLS (ERP AND CSC),
BSNL, KERALA CIRCLE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.
W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

c/:Nos:55557/15 & con:cases

37

- 6 GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, DPO ROAD, MALAPPURAM-676505.
- 7 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, OLD CTO BLDG. SILK
  STREET, BEACH ROAD, KOZHIKODE-673032.
- 8 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (E),
  BSNL ELECTRICAL DIVISION, BSNL BHAVAN, SOUTH
  BAZZAR, KANNUR-670002.
- 9 UNION OF INDIA, REP. BY SECRETARY TO GOVT. DEPT. OF FINANCE, NEW DELHI-111001.
- DEPARTMENT OF TELE COMMUNICATIONS, REP. BY ITS SECRETARY, SANSAD MARG, NEW DELHI-111001.

R1-8 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R9-10 BY ADV. SRI.P.VIJAYAKUMAR

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

38

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.34741 OF 2019(P)

# PETITIONERS:

M.J.JOY AGED 59 YEARS S/O.GEORGE JOSEPH, MANIKATH HOUSE, KOITHARA ROAD, PANAMPILLY NAGAR, KOCHI- 682036

BY ADVS.

SRI.PRAMOJ ABRAHAM SMT.SARANYA CHANDRAN

#### RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD
  (GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING) REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL
  CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110001
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER

  BSNL, KERALA TELECOMMUNICATIONS CIRCLE OFFICE,

  PMG JUNCTION, VIKAS BHAVAN, POST,

  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033
- 3 CHIEF ENGINEER-CIVIL
  BSNL, KERALA CIVIL ZONE, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE
  BUILDING, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAURAM

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

39

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.34913 OF 2019(L)

# PETITIONER:

ALLIES FIRE SYSTEMS PVT.LTD FIRST FLOOR, CITY SCAPE BUILDING, NR.POLICE STATION SOUTH KALAMASSERY, CHANGAMPUZHA NAGAR P.O., ERNAKULAM-682 033, REPRESENTED BY ITS DIRECTOR MR.THOMAS MANI.

BY ADVS.

SRI.SANTHOSH MATHEW

SRI.ARUN THOMAS

SRI.JENNIS STEPHEN

SRI.VIJAY V. PAUL

SMT.KARTHIKA MARIA

SMT. VEENA RAVEENDRAN

SRI.ANIL SEBASTIAN PULICKEL

SMT.DIVYA SARA GEORGE

SMT.LEAH RACHEL NINAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 UNION OF INDIA
  REPRESENTED BY THE TELECOM SECRETARY, MINISTRY
  OF COMMUNICATIONS, SANCHAR BHAWAN 20, ASHOKA
  ROAD, NEW DELHI-110 001.
- 2 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.,
  REPRESENTED BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING
  DIRECTOR, BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HARISH CHANDRA
  MATHUR LANE, JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110 001.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

40

- 3 CHIEF ENGINEER, BSNL KERALA CIVIL ZONE, 1ST FLOOR, ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009.
- 4 SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER(E),
  0FFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER(E), BSNL KERALA
  ELECTRICAL ZONE, ADMN. BUILDING, TELEPHONE
  EXCHANGE COMPOUND, MANACAUD,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009.
- 5 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(E),
   OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER(E), BSNL
   ELECTRICAL DIVISION, 2ND FLOOR, ADMN. BUILDING,
   TE COMPOUND, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695
   009.
- 6 SUB DIVISIONAL ENGINEER,
  BSNL EXTERNAL PROJECT DIVISION, OFFICE OF THE
  SUB DIVISIONAL ENGINEER(E), BSNL ELECTRICAL SUB
  DIVISION I GROUND FLOOR, ADMN. BUILDING, TE
  COMPOUND, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 009.
- 7 NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION,
  DIRECTORATE OF HEALTH SERVICES COMPOUND,
  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 035, REPRESENTED BY ITS
  STATE MISSION DIRECTOR MR.KESHVENDRA KUMAR
  I.A.S.

R2-6 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

41

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.34930 OF 2019(M)

# PETITIONER:

BABY PUTHURAN, AGED 64 YEARS PUTHUR PUTHIYEDATHU HOUSE, PERUVA P.O., KOTTAYAM DISTRICT.

BY ADV. SRI.K.MANOJ CHANDRAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD., BHARATH SANCHAR BHAVAN, HAREESH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE, JANPATH, NEW DELHI - 110 001, REPRESENTED BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR.
- THE CHIEF MANAGER,
  BSNL KERALA CIRCLE, PMG JUNCTION, VIKAS BHAVAN
  P.O., THIRUVANANTHAPURAM 695 033.
- THE GENERAL MANAGER,
  BSNL, PATHANAMTHITTA TELECOM DISTRICT,
  THIRUVALLA 689 101.
- THE GENERAL MANAGER,

  BSNL, OFFICE OF THE PRINCIPAL GENERAL MANAGER,

  TELECOM DISTRICT, KOTTAYAM 686 001.
- 5 THE PRINCIPAL GENERAL MANAGER,
  BSNL, OFFICE OF THE PRINCIPAL GENERAL MANAGER,
  TELECOM DISTRICT, ERNAKULAM, KOCHI 682 016.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

6 STATE TAX OFFICER (WORKS CNTRACT), OFFICE OF THE DEPUTY COMMISSIONER, SGST DEPARTMENT, KOTTAYAM - 686 001.

R1-5 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP,SC, BSNL R1-5 BY ADV. SHRI.R.D.AGRAWALA

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

43

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE AND SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.35721 OF 2019(M)

# PETITIONER:

P.D.ANTONY AGED 61 YEARS S/O.DEVASY, CONTRACTOR, POLAPARAMBIL HOUSE, KADAVANTHRA, KOCHI-682020.

BY ADVS.

SRI.PRAMOJ ABRAHAM SMT.SARANYA CHANDRAN

# RESPONDENTS:

- 1 BHARATH SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.
  (GOVERNMENT OF INDIA UNDERTAKING), REPRESENTED
  BY ITS CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING DIRECTOR, BSNL
  CORPORATE OFFICE, HARISH CHANDRA MATHUR LANE,
  JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110001.
- THE CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER,

  BSNL, KERALA TELECOMMUNICATIONS CIRCLE OFFICE,

  PMG JUNCTION, VIKAS BHAVAN POST,

  THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.
- 3 CHIEF ENGINEER CIVIL, BSNL, KERALA CIVIL ZONE, TELEPHONE EXCHANGE

M/S.Techno Engineering Corporation vs The Executive Engineer(E) on 9 March, 2020 BUILDING, MANACAUD, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

44

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.652 OF 2020(F)

# PETITIONER:

NADESH KUMAR.O.K, AGED 35 YEARS S/O AYYAPPAN O.K, VALIYAKULANGARA HOUSE, VATTAPPARA, VAZHAKKAD, CHERUVAYOOR, MALAPPURAM DISTRICT.

BY ADV. SRI.K.RAKESH

#### RESPONDENTS:

- THE GENERAL MANAGER
  OFFICE OF THE GENERAL MANAGER, TELECOM, BHARATH
  SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED (BSNL), MALAPPURAM, PIN676 505.
- THE ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER (P),
  OFFICE OF THE GENERAL MANAGER, TELECOM, BHARATH
  SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED (BSNL), MALAPPURAM, PIN676 505.
- THE DIVISIONAL ENGINEER TRANSMISSION, BSNL, KONNOLA BUILDING, MALAPPURAM DISTRICT, PIN-676 505.

R1-3 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED

CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

45

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

**PRESENT** 

THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN

MONDAY, THE 09TH DAY OF MARCH 2020 / 19TH PHALGUNA, 1941

WP(C).No.813 OF 2020(B)

# PETITIONER:

CRISTALINE TELESERVICES PVT. LTD., CRISTALINE HOUSE , CC NO 46/3027, SOBHA ROAD, VENNALA P.O.COCHIN-682 028, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR LIYAKATH ALI .A, AGED 63 YEARS, S/O E.ABDUL VAHID, RESIDING AT AQUA GARDENS, ARKAKADAVU, VENNALA P.O.COCHIN-682 028.

BY ADV. SRI.P.SATHISAN

# **RESPONDENTS:**

- 1 BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED (BSNL),
  REPRESENTED THROUGH CHAIRMAN AND MANAGING
  DIRECTOR, BHARAT SANCHAR BHAVAN, HARISH CHANDRA
  MATHUR LANE, JANPATH, NEW DELHI-110 001.
- PRINCIPAL GENERAL MANAGER,
  TELECOM ERNAKULAM (SSA ERNAKULAM), BSNL BHAVAN,
  KALATHIPARAMNBHU ROAD, M.G.ROAD. P.O.ERNAKULAM682 016.
- 3 PRINCIPAL GENERAL MANAGER,
  TELECOM ALAPPUZHA (SSA ALAPPUZHA) BSNL BHAVAN,
  NEAR PITCHU IYER JUNCTION, ALAPPUZHA CIVIL
  STATION P.O., PIN-688 001.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

46

4 GENERAL MANAGER,
TELECOM KOLLAM (SSA KOLLAM) BSNL BHAVAN,
VELLAYITTIYAMBALAM, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM
P.O.KOLLAM-691 012.

- 5 GENERAL MANAGER TELECOM, WAYANAD (SSA WAYANAD), BSNL BHAVAN, BALAN K NAIR ROAD, ASHOKAPURAM P.O.KOZHIKODE-673 001.
- 6 PRINCIPAL GENERAL MANAGER (SSA TRIVANDRUM), BSNL BHAVAN, UPPALAM ROAD, TRIVANDRUM-695 001.
- 7 UNION OF INDIA,
  REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT OF
  TELECOMMUNICATIONS, SANCHAR BHAWAN, ASHOKA
  ROAD, NEW DELHI-110 001.

R1-6 BY SRI.MATHEWS K.PHILIP, SC, BSNL R7 BY ADV. KUM.S.KRISHNA

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 12-02-2020, ALONG WITH WP(C).35597/2019 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 09-03-2020 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

47

# **JUDGMENT**

[ WP(C).35597/2019, WP(C).27660/2019, WP(C).30701/2019, WP(C).30826/2019, WP(C).31181/2019, WP(C).31202/2019, WP(C).31220/2019, WP(C).31225/2019, WP(C).31714/2019, WP(C).31925/2019, WP(C).31948/2019, WP(C).32074/2019, WP(C).32159/2019, WP(C).32503/2019, WP(C).32577/2019, WP(C).32610/2019, WP(C).33286/2019, WP(C).33430/2019, WP(C).33435/2019, WP(C).33466/2019, WP(C).33726/2019, WP(C).34741/2019, WP(C).34913/2019, WP(C).34930/2019, WP(C).35721/2019, WP(C).652/2020, WP(C).813/2020 ] Dated this the 9th day of March 2020 JUDGMENT

1. All these writ petitions are essentially filed seeking payment of amounts due from Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd (BSNL for short) towards the petitioners who have undertaken contract works. The petitioners contend that they are entitled to the payment of amounts which are essentially admitted by the BSNL. They contend that the refusal on the part of the BSNL to release the amounts due after extracting the work from them is completely unsustainable in law.

# W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases

- 2. Heard the learned counsel appearing for the petitioners in these writ petitions and the learned Senior Counsel appearing on behalf of the respondents as assisted by the respective standing counsel.
- 3. Counter affidavits have been filed in many of these cases. In the counter affidavits filed, it is contended that the amounts claimed are in respect of contractual claims between the parties and in

the absence of specific admission of the amounts by the respondents, these writ petitions would not be maintainable before this Court. It is contended that in some of these cases, no bills are produced and that even the nature of the work undertaken and the amounts due are not properly mentioned. It is stated that the question whether any amount is liable to be paid in terms of the contract between the parties is a question of fact which can be decided only after taking evidence and that this Court should not consider the writ petitions. In some of these cases, it is contended that the petitioners are Micro, Small or Medium Enterprises which are covered by the provisions of the Micro Small and Medium W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases Enterpises Development Act, 2006 (MSMED Act for short) and there is a bar to claim any relief for goods supplied or services rendered before any court, expect in terms of Chapter 5 of the said special enactment.

- 4. Apart from placing affidavits on record in these cases, the learned Senior Counsel has also made available a breakup of cases for the convenience of this Court.
- 5. The learned counsel for the petitioners would rely on a decision of a Full Bench of this Court reported in State of Kerala and others v. T.V.Anil [2002 (1) KLT 371 (FB)]. After considering the case law on the point, the Full Bench held that it cannot be said in absolute terms that a writ petition is not maintainable in contractual matters including where the Contractors seek enforcement of the obligation on the part of the State to pay the admitted bill amounts. It was held that there is a public law element in contracts where the State is a party, and that it follows that there is public duty involved and therefore the High Court will be well within its jurisdiction to W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases consider the writ petitions seeking payment of amounts admittedly due.
- 6. The learned Senior Counsel on the other hand relied on the Constitution Bench decision of the Apex Court in Moti Das v. S.P. Sahi [AIR 1959 SC 942], D.L.F. Housing Construction (P) Ltd. v. Delhi Municipal Corporation and others [(1976) 3 SCC 160] M/s.Burmah Construction Co. v. State of Orissa and others [AIR 1962 SC 1320], K.S.Rashid and son v. Income Tax Investigation Commission, etc. [1954 SCR 738, N.T.Abraham v. State of Kerala and others [(1999) 9 SCC 280], Central Bank of India v. Rooplal Bansal [(1999) 9 SCC 254], Jai Singh v. Union of India and others [(1977) 1 SCC 1]. It is contended by the learned Senior Counsel that the decisions of the Apex Court are authority on the point that factual aspects cannot be investigated in writ proceedings and that where the relationships between the parties is contractual in nature, the intervention of the High Court under Article 226 would not be justified since the civil remedy of suit is readily available to the parties. The learned Senior Counsel submits that in most W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases of these cases the claim is not admitted in full. It is, therefore, contended that the entire claim would, therefore, have to be adjudicated before a civil court having jurisdiction and directions by this Court to pay admitted amounts would not be justified. It is submitted that the petitioners/contractors cannot approach two Forums in respect of the same claim on the ground that part of the claim is admitted and part of it is not. It is, therefore, contended that the writ petitions are liable to be dismissed, leaving open the contentions of the parties to be decided in appropriate proceedings.
- 7. I have considered the contentions advanced. The question raised in these writ petitions is with regard to payment of the admitted amount due from the BSNL Ltd. It is not in dispute before me that the respondent answers the definition of State under Article 12 of the Constitution of India. It is

also not in dispute that the amounts are due on account of contracts entered into between the respondents and the petitioners, who are the contractors. In most of these cases, at least part of the liability is admitted. In the above factual situation, in cases W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases where there is admission of liability and where no complicated questions of fact arise for consideration, the power of this Court under Article 226 of the Constitution of India to direct payment of admitted amounts by a State or its instrumentality cannot be said to be foreclosed merely by the existence of an alternate remedy. The contention of the petitioners that there is a bar under the Micro Small and Medium Enterpises Development Act, 2006 is also absolutely untenable, since Chapter V of the said Act only provides for a remedy to such enterprises for recovery of amounts by recourse to the Micro and Small Enterprises Facilitation Council and does not expressly or impliedly bar the jurisdiction of other Forums available to such enterprises. Even otherwise, a statutory bar provided in Chapter V of the MSMED Act, cannot extend to excluding the writ jurisdiction of this Court being exercised under the Constitution of the Country.

- 8. A factual dispute can be said to exist only where the respondents are bona fide disputing their liability and not in cases where the State or its instrumentality raises vexatious W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases and untenable disputes only in order to delay payments of amounts due to its citizens even if the amounts are payable under a contract. The decisions of the Apex Court from the celebrated decision of Ramana Dhayaram Shetty v. The International Airport Authority of India [AIR 1979 SC 1628] are authority on the point that all action of the State including in its exercise of contractual obligations should be informed by reason and be non-arbitrary in character. In the above view of the matter, the contention that the respondents cannot be directed by this Court to meet even their admitted liability is completely untenable and such argument is devoid of merits.
- 9. Hence, there will be a direction to the respondents to pay the admitted amounts due to the petitioners in these writ petitions. In view of the pleadings as to financial stringency, payments shall be made within a period of six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. With regard to any bona fide dispute as to the extent of liability, the right of the petitioners to approach the appropriate civil court for adjudication of the amounts actually due is left open. In cases W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases where there are no bills produced so as to decide whether the liability is admitted or not, the representations, if any, submitted by the petitioners shall be considered and appropriate orders shall be passed by the respondents, either admitting or denying their liability and specifically stating what part of liability is admitted. In all such cases, the petitioners shall be permitted to make additional representations producing the bills or the material, if any, before the competent among the respondents for a proper consideration of the issue. In those cases also, the amounts found due after a proper consideration shall be released within a period of six months from the date on which orders are passed on the representations. In cases where liability is disputed, the right of the contractors to approach the appropriate civil courts will be left open.

10.In two of these writ petitions, that is, W.P.(C).Nos.31714/19 & 32503/19, the contention is that the firms in question are not registered partnership firms and therefore Section 69 of the Partnership Act, 1932 stands in the way of the said firms W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases suing for release of amounts. I notice that the work has been awarded to the firm in question and the bills

have been duly raised by the firm. The respondents, therefore, cannot take up a claim that the firm is not registered and therefore cannot sue in its name, to defeat the admitted claims.

11.In four of these writ petitions, that is, 2766o/19, 34913/19, 32577/19 & 3261o/19, it is contended that the payments are to be made after receipt of amounts from external agencies which were involved in sanctioning and carrying out of the work and therefore there can be no direction to the BSNL to pay such amounts. It is contended by the learned counsel for the petitioners that in all of these cases the external agencies have been impleaded as respondents and that appropriate directions are to be issued to those respondents to meet the liabilities, if necessary. In some of these cases, statements have also been filed by the National Health Mission, which was the funding agency, wherein it is stated that the details of the pending bills have not been reported by the BSNL to the funding agency and that the funding agency has already W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases released 95% of the payment in respect of the works in question to the BSNL. It is stated that if the appropriate authority in the BSNL is ready to execute the tripartite agreement with the funding agency and contractors, the balance amount shall also be released without delay on production of the final fill bill along with utilisation certificate, audited statement, completion certificate, completion plan and structural stability certificate.

12.In W.P.(C).Nos.31220/2019 and 33430/2019, it is submitted by the learned counsel for the respondents that the entire liability in respect of these cases are admitted. A counter affidavit is also placed on record to that effect. In the above view of the matter, the respondents are liable to pay the entire amounts found due shall be released to the petitioners.

13.In the above view of the matter, W.P.(C).Nos.31220/2019 and 33430/2019 are allowed. The competent among the respondents shall pay the entire amounts found due within six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases W.P.(C).Nos.35597/2019 and 813/2020 are allowed. The competent among the respondents shall release payment of the amounts due under the bills within six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. W.P.(C).Nos.31714/19 and 32503 of 2019 are allowed. The competent among the respondents shall release payment of the amounts due under the bills within six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. W.P.(C).Nos.27660/2019, 34913/2019, 32577/2019 & 32610/2019 are disposed of. There will be a direction to the competent among respondents to enter into a tripartite agreement with the petitioner and the National Health Mission for the release of the amounts due. All necessary certificates shall be furnished and amounts due shall be released by the National Health Mission and the amounts so released shall be paid to the petitioners without delay, at any rate within a period of three months form the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment.

W.P.(C).No.34741/2019 is disposed of with a direction to the respondents to make the payment due as and when the W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases amounts are received from the KUFOS, which was the funding agency to pay the amounts due to the petitioner on such amounts.

W.P.(C).Nos.35721/19, 652/2020, 31925/2019, 32159/19, 31225/19, 32074/19, 33726/19, 31948/19, 31202/2019, 33466/2019, 33435/19, 30701/2019 & 30826/2019 are disposed of. There will be a direction to the competent among the respondents to take up, consider and pass appropriate orders on the detailed representations submitted by the petitioner, taking note of the documents produced within a period of one month from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. On the basis of orders passed, the admitted amounts due shall be released to the petitioners within a period of six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. This will not prejudice the right of the petitioners to move civil suits or other proceedings contemplated in law with regard to any disputed liability.

W.P.(C).Nos.33286/19, 31181/2019 and 34930/2019 are disposed of directing the competent among the respondents to W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases release the admitted amounts due to the petitioners within a period of six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. This will be without prejudice to the right of the petitioners to raise claims before the appropriate court or the authority, as the case may be, in respect of the disputed liability.

Sd/-

Anu Sivaraman, Judge sj W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35597/2019 PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.68/BSNL/ED/EKM/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 24.9.2018.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.44 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 8.2.2019.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.78/BSNL/ED/EKM/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 15.10.2018.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.52 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 28.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.80/BSNL/ED/EKM/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 27.10.2018.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.49 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 23.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.88/BSNL/ED/EKM/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 16.11.2018.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.50 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 23.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.132/BSNL/ED/TCR/2017-18 OF WORK ORDER DATED 16.2.2018.

EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.31 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 8.11.2018.

EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.133/BSNL/ED/TCR/2017-18 OF WORK ORDER DATED 16.2.2018.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P12 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.29 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 6.9.2018.

EXHIBIT P13 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.01/BSNL/ED/TCR/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 2.4.2018.

EXHIBIT P14 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.39 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 4.1.2019.

EXHIBIT P15 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.07/BSNL/ED/TCR/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 12.7.2018.

EXHIBIT P16 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.45 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 16.2.2019.

EXHIBIT P17 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.09/BSNL/ED/TCR/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 19.7.2018.

EXHIBIT P18 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.40 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 4.1.2019.

EXHIBIT P19 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.14/BSNL/ED/TCR/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 25.7.2018.

EXHIBIT P20 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.51 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 26.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P21 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.21/EEET/KNR/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 18.7.2018.

EXHIBIT P22 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.47 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 14.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P23 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.44/EEET/KNR/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 26.11.2018.

EXHIBIT P24 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.46 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 14.3.2019. W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P25 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.B2B01 FOR THE WORK ORDER NO.44/EEET/KNR/2018-19 DATED 10.6.2018.

EXHIBIT P26 TRUE COPY OF AGREEMENT NO.05/BSNL/ESD/ALP/2018-19 OF WORK ORDER DATED 3.4.2018.

EXHIBIT P27 TRUE COPY OF INVOICE NO.53 FOR THE SAID WORK ORDER DATED 28.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P28 TRUE COPY OF LETTER ADDRESSED TO THE CHIEF ENGINEER (E), BSNL KERALA ELECTRICAL ZONE, TRIVANDRUM BY THE PETITIONER DATED 6.6.2019.

EXHIBIT P29 TRUE COPY OF PRINT OUT OF THE ARTICLE WHICH APPEARED ONLINE AT WWW.INDIATODAY.IN ON 28.9.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27660/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE NOTICE INVITING TENDER NO.

190/BSNL/ED/EKM/2015-16 DATED 31-07-2015 EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE WORK ORDER DATED 09- 12-2015 ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT TO THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE 5TH AND FINAL BILL APPROVED BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE BILL DATED 24-07-2018 SUBMITTED TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT WITH THE CORRECT BILL AMOUNT BY THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 12-08-2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGE OF THE AGREEMENT SHOWING THE AMOUNTS.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE BANK GUARANTEE EXECUTED AS EMX BY THE PETITIONER EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE LATEST BANK GUARANTEE EXECUTED BY THE PETITIONER FOR SECURITY DEPOSITAND THE EXTENSION LETTER ISSUED TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE LATEST BANK GUARANTEEEXCUTED BY THE PETITIONER AS PERFORMANCE GUARANTEE W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 30701/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 22.11.2017.

EXHIBIT P2 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 22.11.2017.

EXHIBIT P3 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 22.11.2017.

EXHIBIT P4 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 1ST RESPONDENT DATED 30.09.2019.

EXHIBIT P5 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATIONS SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 2ND RESPONDENT DATED 30.09.2019.

EXHIBIT P6 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATIONS SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 5.10.2019.

EXHIBIT P7 THE TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT IN WPC NO. 26374/2019 OF THIS HONBLE COURT DATED 24.10.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 30826/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 07.11.2019.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/04 DATED 30.06.2018.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/05 DATED 30.06.2018 EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/09 DATED 27.09.2018.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/11 DATED 10.12.2018.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/12 DATED 10.12.2018.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/14 DATED 19.03.2019.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO. 2018-19/16 DATED 30.03.2019.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO. 2018-19/17 DATED 30.03.2019.

EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO. 2019-20/01 DATED 22.05.2019.

EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2019-20/02 DATED 16.07.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31181/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 A TRUE COPY OF THE MEMORANDUM NO. DTD.

59(2)/2017/CEET/TVM/3737 DTD. 17.11.2017 OF THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P2 A TRUE COPY OF THE STATEMENT PREPARED BY THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P3 A TRUE COPY OF THE LAWYER NOTICE DTD.

4.10.2019 TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31202/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 1.6.2018 EXHIBIT P2 THE TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.218- 19/06 ISSUED BY THE BSNL DATED 14.12.2018 EXHIBIT P3 THE TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.218-

19/07 ISSUED BY THE BSNL DATED 6.3.2019 EXHIBIT P4 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 1ST RESPONDENT DATED 30.09.2019 EXHIBIT P5 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATIONS SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 2ND RESPONDENT DATED 30.09.2019 EXHIBIT P6 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATIONS SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 5.10.2019 EXHIBIT P7 THE TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT IN WP(CONO.26374/2019 OF THIS HON'BLE COURT DATED 24.10.2019 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31220/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 A TRUE COPY OF THE MEMORANDUM NO.

59(5)/2018/CEET/TVM/1466 DTD. 7.11.2018 OF THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P2 A TRUE COPY OF THE LAWYER NOTICE DTD.

4.10.2019 TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31225/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 29.3.2017.

EXHIBIT P2 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 29.3.2017.

EXHIBIT P3 THE TRUE COPY OF THE COMMUNICATION ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 7.2.2018.

EXHIBIT P4 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 1ST RESPONDENT DATED 30.9.2019.

EXHIBIT P5 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 2ND RESPONDENT DATED 30.9.2019.

EXHIBIT P6 THE TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE 3RD RESPONDENT DATED 5.10.2019.

EXHIBIT P7 THE TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT IN W.P. (C) NO.26374/2019 OF THIS HON'BLE COURT DATED 24.10.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31714/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.02/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 14.2.2019.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.44/EE-

BSNK/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.2.2019. EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.43/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.2.2019. EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.45/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.2.2019. EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.02/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 7.5.2019. EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.03/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P12 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 7.5.2019. EXHIBIT P13 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.01/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P14 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 7.5.2019. EXHIBIT P15 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.40/EE-

BSNL/CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P16 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 15.2.2019.

EXHIBIT P<sub>17</sub> TRUE COPY OF THE WRITTEN REQUEST ISSUED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE RESPONDENTS DATED 6.11.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31925/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 28.09.2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE RESPONDENTS 2 AND 3 EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICES PRODUCED BY THE PETITIONER AS AN ACCOMPANIMENT TO EXT.P1 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31948/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF RELEVANT PAGES OF AGREEMENT NO.22/EE/RCD/KLM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF RELEVANT PAGES OF AGREEMENT NO.09/EE/BCD/KLM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/04 DATED 24/11/2018.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/05 DATED 16/03/2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32074/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 13.10.2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE RESPONDENTS 2 AND 3 EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE LIST OF WORKS PRODUCED ALONG WITH EXT P1 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32159/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 SPECIMEN AGREEMENT BETWEEN PETITIONER AND 1ST RESPONDENT DATED 29.7.2015 (TRUE COPY) EXHIBIT P2 STATEMENT OF AMOUNTS DUE TO FOR THE PERIOD 1.9.2018 TO 16.8.2019 (TRUE COPY) DATED 29.7.2015 EXHIBIT P3 PETITIONERS LEGAL NOTICE (TRUE COPY) DATED 22.10.2019 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32503/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.153/BSNL/ED/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 13.11.2018.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 19.01.2019.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.125/BSNL/ED/EKM/2014-15.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 01.02.2019.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.51/BSNL/ED/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 01.02.2019.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 11.11.2019.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.108/BSNL/ED/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 17.11.2019.

EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF THE SAID WRITTEN REQUEST ISSUED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE RESPONDENTS DATED 11.11.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32577/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF NOTICE INVITING TENDER ISSUED ON BEHALF OF THE 2ND RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 10.08.2017 ISSUED BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 14/08/2017 SENT BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT TO THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE CONTRACT DATED 19/09/2017 ENTERED INTO BETWEEN THE PETITIONER AND THE 2ND RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 19/09/2017 SENT BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT TO THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE WORK CERTIFICATE DATED 16/10/2019 ISSUED BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT IN FAVOUR OF THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE IVTH PART BILL SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE RESPONDENTS FOR THE WORK COMPLETED. EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE FINAL BILL AS MEASURED AND ENTERED BY THE  $_5$ TH RESPONDENT FOR THE WORK COMPLETED.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATIONS DATED 28/11/2018 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 18/06/2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIOER TO THE RESPONDENTS 3 TO 5.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32610/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE NOTICE INVITING TENDER BEARING NUMBER NIT NO.12/CD-KTM/2017-18 ISSUED BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT ON BEHALF OF THE 6TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 10/08/2017 ISSUED TO THE 5TH RESPONDENT BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER OF ACCEPTANCE OF BID DATED 14/08/2017 ISSUED BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT TO THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE CONTRACT DATED 19/09/2017 ENTERED INTO BETWEEN THE PETITIONER AND THE 2ND RESPONDENT FOR THE EXECUTION OF WORK AS PER THE NIT.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 19/09/2017 ISSUED TO THE PETITIONER BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE WORK CERTIFICATE DATED 16/10/2019 ISSUED BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT IN FAVOUR OF THE PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE IVTH PART BILL SUBMITTED TO THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE FINAL BILL SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE RESPONDENTS.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 28/11/2018 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 18/6/19 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 3RD RESPONDENT.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33286/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE5TH RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 6TH RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE BILL IN AGREEMENT NO.58/EE-TCD/KTM/2018-19 EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE TABLE CONTAINING 11 BILLS DUE TO THE PETITIONER EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/04 DATED 04.08.2018 EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE NO.2018-19/12 DATED 30.03.2019 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33430/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 A TREUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 04.11.2019 SENT BY PETITIONER TO THE 2ND RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P2 A TRUE COPY OF STATEMENT DATED 30.11.2019 FOR AMOUNT OF RS.1,84,77,954/-(RUPEES ONE CRORE EIGHTY FOUR LAKH SEVENTY SEVEN THOUSAND NINE HUNDRED AND FIFTY FOURT) ISSUED BY 4TH RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P3 A TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT OF THIS HON'BLE COURT IN WPC NO. 21640/2019 DATED 26.08.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33435/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 SPECIMEN AGREEMENT BETWEEN PETITIONER AND 1ST RESPONDENT (TRUE COPY).

EXHIBIT P2 STATEMENT OF INVOICE FOR THE PERIOD OF 24-04-2018 TO 15-05-2019 AND REFUND OF EMD/SD AS ON 14-08-2019 (TRUE COPY). W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33466/2019

## PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF SPECIMEN AGREEMENT DT 19- 03-2018 BETWEEN PETITIOENR AND 1ST RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF STATEMENT OF INVOICE FOR THE PERIOD OF 05-09-2018 TO 26-10-2019 ELECTRICAL.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF STATEMENT OF EMD, SD DEPOSITS INCLUDING FDR.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF LETTER AWARDING TENDER FOR CIVIL WORLKS TO PETITIONER.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF STATEMENT OF INVOICE FOR THE PERIOD OF 07-05-18 TO 27-03-2019. CIVIL.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33726/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 SPECIMEN AGREEMENT BETWEEN PETITIONER AND 1ST RESPONDENT (TRUE COPY) EXHIBIT P2 STATEMENT OF AMOUNTS DUE TO THE PETITIONER FOR THE PERIOD 24.08.18 TO 26.10.19 (TRUE COPY) W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 34741/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.15/E-

BSNL-CD-II/EKM/2015-16 EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 26.07.2018 EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE WRITTEN REQUEST ISSUED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE RESPONDENTS DATED 4.11.2019 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 34913/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE RELEVANT COPY OF THE NOTICE INVITING TENDER ISSUED ON BEHALF OF THE 2ND RESPONDENT BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE WORK ORDER DATED 30.06.2018 ISSUED TO THE PETITIONER BY THE 5TH RESPONDENT.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.2/ED(EXTL)/2018-19 EXECUTED BETWEEN THE PETITIONER AND THE 5TH RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF BILL DATED 21.06.2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER AND ACKNOWLEDGED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF BILL DATED 30.08.2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER AND ACKNOWLEDGED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF REPRESENTATION DATED 05.11.2019 SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO RESPONDENTS 3

TO 5.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF REPRESENTATION DATED 05.12.2019 ALONG WITH THE LEDGER ACCOUNT STATEMENT OF THE PETITIONER SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE RESPONDENTS 3, 4, 5 AND 7.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE TDS CERTIFICATE OF THE PETITIONER AND THE STATEMENT SHOWING THE AMOUNT OF TDS CREDIT REFLECTED ON PETITIONER'S ACCOUNT.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 34930/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT DATED 13-04-2018.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT DATED 29-09-2018.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT DATED 07-06-2016.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED NIL.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 28-11-2019.

EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 16-11-2019.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ASSESSMENT ORDER FOR THE PERIOD NOVEMBER 2018 DATED 30-07- 2019.

EXHIBIT P7(A) TRUE COPY OF THE ASSESSMENT ORDER FOR THE PERIOD DECEMBER 2018 DATED 30-07- 2019.

EXHIBIT 7(B) TRUE COPY OF THE ASSESSMENT ORDER FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 2019 DATED 30-07- 2019.

EXHIBIT P7(C) TRUE COPY OF THE ASSESSMENT ORDER FOR THE PERIOD FEBRUARY 2019 DATED 30-07- 2019.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF REPRESENTATION DATED 25-11-2019.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 25-11-2019 SUBMITTED BEFORE THE 4TH RESPONDENT.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE REPRESENTATION DATED 25-11-2019 SUBMITTED BEFORE THE 5TH

RESPONDENT..

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35721/2019 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.28/EE-

BSNL-CD-I/EKM/2015-2016.

EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COY OF THE INVOICE.

EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE WO NO.5/EECDI/BSNL/EKM/2018-19/731.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 17.7.2018.

EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.16/EE-

BSNL-CDI/EKM/2018-19 EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.12.2018.

EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE WO NO.1/SDE/CSD VI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.12.2018.

EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.15/EE-

BSNL-CD-I/EKM/2018-2019.

EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.12.2018.

EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF THE WO NO.03/SDE/CSD VI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P12 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.12.2018.

EXHIBIT P13 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.09/EE-

BSNL-CD-I/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P14 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.3.2019. W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P15 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.41/EE-

BSNL-CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P16 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 11.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P17 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.42/EE-

BSNL-CD-II/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P18 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 11.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P19 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.04/SDE-

BSNL-CSD-VI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P20 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P21 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.28/EE-

BSNL-CDI/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P22 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P23 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.05/EE-

BSNL-CDI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P24 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P25 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT WO NO.08/SDE/CSD VI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P26 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P27 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.05/21/EE-

BSNL-CDI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P28 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P29 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.12.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P30 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.08/EE-

BSNL-CDI/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P31 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P32 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.01/SDE-

BSNL-CSDVI/EKM/2019-20.

EXHIBIT P33 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 4.6.2019. EXHIBIT P34 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.01/SDE (C)/BCSD IV/EKM/2018-19.

EXHIBIT P35 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 30.3.2019.

EXHIBIT P36 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT NO.16/EE-

BSNL-CDI/EKM/2017-18.

EXHIBIT P37 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.10.2019.

EXHIBIT P38 TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT WO NO.01/EE/CD-I/EKM/2019-20.

EXHIBIT P39 TRUE COPY OF THE INVOICE DATED 1.12.2019.

EXHIBIT P40 TRUE COPY OF THE WRITTEN REQUEST DATED 12.12.2019.

W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 652/2020 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1(A) TO TRUE COPIES OF THE WORK ORDERS ISSUED P1(I) BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT TO THE PETITIONER EXHIBIT P2 (A) TO TRUE COPIES OF THE FINAL BILLS P2(I) SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE GENERAL MANAGER, BSNL, MALAPPURAM EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT DATED 15.11.2019 IN WPC NO.27216/2019 OF THIS HON'BLE COURT W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases APPENDIX OF WP(C) 813/2020 PETITIONER'S/S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE CONTRACT AGREEMENT BETWEEN M/S BSNL AND PETITIONER AT ERNAKULAM ON 3.4.2017 EXHIBIT P1(A) TRUE COPY OF THE CONTRACT AGREEMENT BETWEEN M/S BSNL AND PETITIONER AT ERNAKULAM ON 30.4.2017 EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE MUTUAL NON-DISCLOSURE AGREEMENT DATED 9.8.2016 EXHIBIT P2(A) TRUE COPY OF THE AGREEMENT DATED 30.4.2019 BETWEEN BSNL AND THE PETITIONER COMPANY EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE SERVICE CONTRACT AGREEMENT DATED 30.1.2017 BETWEEN BSNL AND THE PETITIONER COMPANY EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE SERVICE CONTRACT AGREEMENT DATED 26.3.2018 BETWEEN PETITIONER COMPANY AND THE BSNL EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE MUTUAL NON-DISCLOSURE AGREEMENT DATED 30.5.2016 EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT DATED 2.11.2019 EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT DATED 30.10.2019 EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT DATED 1.11.2019 EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT DATED

2.11.2019 W.P.(C).Nos.35597/19 & con.cases EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT DATED 4.11.2019 EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF CERTIFICATE APPROVED BY NSIC DATED 4.3.2015 EXHIBIT P11(A) TRUE COPY OF THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF EXT P11.

EXHIBIT P12 TRUE COPY OF THE LAWYER NOTICE ISSUED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE RESPONDENTS DATED 26.11.2019 EXHIBIT P13 TRUE COPY OF THE REPLY LETTER ISSUED BY THE RESPONDENTS DATED 16.12.2019 True copy PS to Judge