Models of population-wide cultural change tend to invoke one of two broad models of individual change. One approach theorizes that people actively update their beliefs and behaviors in the face of new information. The other argues that, following early socialization experiences, dispositions are stable. We formalize these two models, elaborate empirical implications of each, and derive a simple combined model for comparing them using panel data. We test this model on 183 attitude and behavior items from the 2006-14 rotating panels of the General Social Survey. Though the pattern of results is complex, it is somewhat more consistent with the settled dispositions model than the active updating model. Most observed change in the GSS appears to be short-term attitude change or measurement error rather than persisting changes. When persistent change occurs, it is somewhat more likely to occur in younger people than older people and more common for public behaviors and beliefs about high-profile issues than private attitudes. We argue that we need both models in our theory of cultural evolution but that we need more research on the circumstances under which each is more likely to apply.