

Report on “The *FrobeniusThresholds* package for *Macaulay2*” by Hernández, et al, for JSAG

February 5, 2020

I am satisfied with the authors’ response to my comments on the previous version of the paper.

At the level of typesetting, the “ ν ” within Macaulay2 output did not appear in the PDF, for example in section 4.2 (page 9) the inputs i12 and i15 have Macaulay2 comments that are supposed to have ν , but the character is missing in the PDF. (Again on several subsequent pages.)

I was able to use the package easily with Macaulay2 v1.15. All the commands in the paper worked fine. I did a very small amount of extra exploration, including running ‘check’ on the package. All seems well.

The documentation is good. (In particular, the documentation for `GuessStrategy`, which the paper refers to, is especially interesting.)

At a quick look, the code looks carefully written, with good organization and informative comments.

(The web page links for Erin Bela and Zhibek Kadyrsizova seem to be out of date and incorrect, respectively.)

Therefore in conclusion my feeling is that the paper and package are excellent and I recommend accepting them for publication.¹

¹The business with missing ν is probably an issue with needing to use ‘fontenc’. The journal typesetter will have to do that, it doesn’t seem like something for the authors to fix. I’m mentioning it anyway because I suppose they will want to keep an eye out for it in the page proofs, and maybe update the arxiv version of the paper.