

Counter examples:

Example 1. Prove by contradiction that if n is a natural number then

$$\frac{n}{n+1} > \frac{n}{n+2}.$$

Natural numbers are positive integers.

Proof. (By contradiction:) Assume n is a natural number and assume $\frac{n}{n+1} \leq \frac{n}{n+2}$. Then

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{1}{n+1} &\leq \frac{1}{n+2} \\ \Rightarrow n+2 &\leq n+1 \\ \Rightarrow 2 &\leq 1\end{aligned}$$

which contradicts the order on natural numbers. Thus, if n is a natural number then $\frac{n}{n+1} \leq \frac{n}{n+2}$. \square

“If and Only If” or “Equivalence Theorems” Let n be a natural number. n is even if and only if n^2 is even. Here we can denote the statement n is even by A and the statement n^2 is even by B . Then A and B are both a sufficient and necessary condition.

$$A \Leftrightarrow B \quad \equiv \quad (A \Rightarrow B) \wedge (B \Rightarrow A).$$

When we are trying to prove a statement link $A \Leftrightarrow B$ it is at times useful to first prove one direction ($A \Rightarrow B$) and then the other direction ($B \Rightarrow A$).

Example 2. Assume p is prime. Then p divides if and only if p divides b^2 .

Proof. (\Rightarrow) Assume p is prime and assume p divides b , i.e., $b = pm$ for some integers m . Show p divides b^2 , i.e., show $b^2 = pk$ for some integer k . Then

$$\begin{aligned}b^2 &= (pm)^2 \\ &= p^2m^2 \\ &= p(pm^2) \\ &= pk,\end{aligned}$$

where $k = pm^2$ is an integer. Thus, p divides b^2 .

(\Leftarrow) Assume p is prime and assume that p divides b^2 , i.e., $b^2 = pm$ for some integer m . Show p divides b , i.e., show $b = pk$ for some integer k . This will be a direct proof.

Since $b^2 = pm$, and the right hand side has at least one factor of the prime number p , then the left hand side has at least one factor of p (by Fundamental Theorem of Arithmetic.) If b has no factor of p , then b^2 has no factors of p . Thus, b has at least one factor of p , i.e., $b = pk$ for some integer k . Thus, p divides b . \square

You should choose an appropriate proof method for each direction:

Example 3. Prove: the number m is odd if and only if m^2 is odd.

Proof. (\Rightarrow) assume m is odd, i.e., $m = 2p + 1$ for some integer p . Want to show that m^2 is odd, i.e., $m^2 = 2k + 1$ for some integer k . Then,

$$\begin{aligned}m^2 &= (2p + 1)^2 \\&= 4p^2 + 4p + 1 \\&= 2(2p^2 + 2p) + 1 \\&= 2k + 1\end{aligned}$$

where $k = 2p^2 + 2p$ is an integer. Thus m^2 is odd.

(\Leftarrow) (proof by contrapositive:) If m is even, then m^2 is even.

Proof:

Assume m is even, i.e., $m = 2k$ for some integer k . Show that m^2 is even, i.e., $m^2 = 2n$ for some integer n . Then

$$\begin{aligned}m^2 &= (2k)^2 \\&= 4k^2 \\&= 2(2k^2) = 2n\end{aligned}$$

where $n = 2k^2$ is an integer. Thus m^2 is even. □

At times you will have to prove multiple equivalent statements. (For the example below we should know that the reciprocal of a real non-zero number x is just $\frac{1}{x}$.)

Example 4. Let x be a real number that is not equal to 0. Then the following statements are equivalent:

- (i) $x > 0$
- (ii) The sum of x and its reciprocal is greater than or equal to 2.
- (iii) $2^{x + \frac{1}{x}} \geq 4$.

Idea (i) \Rightarrow (ii), (ii) \Rightarrow (iii), (iii) \Rightarrow (i).

(i) \Rightarrow (ii). (Direct proof, work algebra backwards.) Assume x is a real number and $x > 0$. Then,

$$\begin{aligned}(x - 1)^2 &\geq 0 \\&\Rightarrow x^2 - 2x + 1 \geq 0 \\&\Rightarrow x - 2 + \frac{1}{x} \geq 0 \quad \text{since } x > 0 \\&\Rightarrow x + \frac{1}{x} \geq 2.\end{aligned}$$

Thus, (i) \Rightarrow (ii).

[(ii) \Rightarrow (iii)] (Direct proof:) Assume $x + \frac{1}{x} \geq 2$. Then $2^{x+\frac{1}{x}} \geq 4$, since 2^y is an increasing function.

[(iii) \Rightarrow (i)] (Contrapositive: if $x < 0$ then $2^{x+\frac{1}{x}} < 4$.)

Assume $x < 0$. Then $\frac{1}{x} < 0$

$$\Rightarrow x + \frac{1}{x} < 0$$

$$\Rightarrow x + \frac{1}{x} < 2$$

$$2^{x+\frac{1}{x}} < 2^2 = 4.$$

Therefore, (iii) \Rightarrow (i).

□