Navigating Anxiety in Virtual Realms — A Comprehensive Review of Virtual Reality Exposure Therapy Research

Ishant Shukla[1]
Department of Computer Science and Engineering
Chandigarh University
Mohali, India
ishantshukla@icloud.com

Karanvir Singh[2]
Department of Computer Science and Engineering
Chandigarh University
Mohali, India
kskaransohal@icloud.com

Bhupinder Kaur[3]
Department of Computer Science and Engineering
Chandigarh University
Mohali, India
bhupinder.cse@cumail.in

***Abstract*— This comprehensive review delves into the potential of virtual reality-based exposure therapy as a promising intervention for anxiety and its associated disorders. A systematic examination of literature revealed significant reductions in anxiety symptoms following VRET, though the deep look through into the quantitative aspects is missing due to irregular reports in VRET literature. Future research must emphasize uniform reporting of key factors. VRET within behavioral or cognitive-behavioral frameworks shows efficacy comparable to traditional treatments. It delivers real-life impacts and maintains long-term stability of results, with a dose-response relationship identified and dropout rates akin to in vivo exposure therapies. The review highlights VRET's potential in clinical practice, offering cost-effective and controlled sensory stimulation. As technology advances, VRET stands to become a vital part of psychiatric care, enhancing outcomes and research opportunities. In conclusion, VRET holds promise in anxiety treatment, offering avenues for clinical innovation and research advancement.**

Keywords: VRET, anxiety disorders, efficacy, clinical practice, exposure therapy.

I. INTRODUCTION

Anxiety and fear are primal emotions vital for survival, but their dysregulation can lead to debilitating affective disorders like PTSD and other anxiety disorders. Genetics and early-life stress can contribute to these disorders by lowering the anxiety threshold.

Exposure therapy has proven effective in alleviating negative affective symptoms, with in vivo exposure therapy outperforming imaginal exposure. It activates brain regions that inhibit maladaptive associations and shares neural circuits across affective disorders.

Virtual Reality Exposure Therapy (VRET) offers a novel approach, immersing users in computer-generated simulations that systematically expose them to feared stimuli within realistic settings. Recent research into VRET's efficacy has shown promise, particularly for specific phobias, fear of driving, claustrophobia, aviophobia, and arachnophobia. However, challenges exist in interpreting findings due to various factors like presence, immersion, and demographics.

To address these challenges, this study conducts a quantitative meta-analysis to comprehensively assess the extent of affective changes resulting from VRET. Such an analysis enhances statistical power, allowing for a more robust evaluation of VRET's impact on affective functioning.

In summary, this introduction highlights the significance of anxiety-related disorders, exposure therapy's effectiveness, and the emergence of VRET as a promising treatment. The study's goal is to dive into the detailed analysis to understand the extent to which VRET has impacted the reduction of such symptoms.

II. LITERATURE SURVEY

[1] Rizzo, A. S., & Shilling, R. (2017). Clinical Virtual Reality Tools to Advance PTSD Prevention, Assessment, and Treatment. European Journal of Psychotraumatology, 8(Sup5), 1414560.

This study investigates the application of Virtual Reality (VR) in the treatment of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorders (PTSD). It defines VR and its two forms: non-immersive and immersive. The individuals who suffer visualization problems during PE therapy get VRET as the problem solver. The development of Virtual Iraq/Afghanistan and BRAVE MIND VRET systems is detailed, emphasizing their tailored stimulus control.

Research outcomes reveal VRET's effectiveness in reducing PTSD symptoms, though some studies show mixed results in comparison with other therapies. VRET's expansion to address combat medics/corpsmen and MST survivors is discussed.

The paper also explores VR's potential in PTSD assessment and prevention, including the project designed to cope up with stress in virtual environments (STRIVE). Virtual humans (VHs) in clinical VR are recognized for their potential to aid clinicians.

In conclusion, the paper highlights VR's promise in addressing PTSD but calls for more research and ethical considerations in its clinical use. The "7A's" model is introduced to address mental health care barriers, with VR seen as a potential solution. This paper provides a comprehensive foundation for understanding VR's role in PTSD treatment.

[2] Gega, L., Smith, J., & Reynolds, S. (2013). Cognitive Behaviour Therapy (CBT) for Depression by

Computer vs. Therapist: Patient Experiences and Therapeutic Processes. Psychotherapy Research, 23(2), 218-231.

With the continuous use of mixed methods, the depression patients were treated with CBT and tCBT to understand the difference. Consecutive sessions of CBT and tCBT were conducted six times in random order. Data collection involved questionnaires, semi-structured interviews, and assessments of depression and anxiety symptoms. The Beating the Blues (BtB) cCBT system was used, with a therapist offering technical support during cCBT sessions. This study explored the therapeutic processes and patient experiences in both the therapies, all of which were measured with ethics.

[3] Powers, M. B., & Emmelkamp, P. M. G. (2008). Virtual Reality Exposure Therapy for Anxiety Disorders: A Meta-Analysis. Journal of Anxiety Disorders, 22(3), 561-569.

In depth examination looked into the VRET for anxiety issues. Thirteen well-controlled trials with 397 participants were included. The main focus of a majority of studies was specific phobias however, panic disorders were also included.

Key Findings:

i. In comparison to controlled conditions, VRET showed a larger effect size.

ii. Considering cognition and behavior, the effectiveness remains more or less the same for various outcomes.

iii. Vivo exposure therapy was less impactful than VRET.

iv. More the number of treatment sessions, larger were the effect sizes.

v. Effect sizes were not influenced by sample sizes and publication year.

In conclusion, VRET appears effective, especially for specific phobias, and may offer advantages over traditional exposure therapy, such as convenience and flexibility. More research is needed, particularly on the role of cognitive techniques and the concept of "presence" in VRET.

[4] Rizzo, Albert, and Russell Shilling. "Clinical virtual reality tools to advance the prevention, assessment, and treatment of PTSD." European journal of psychotraumatology 8.sup5 (2017): 1414560.

Rizzo and Shilling (2017) conducted a systematic review on the application of Clinical Virtual Reality (CVR) for the avoidance and solution of PTSD. They adhered to PRISMA guidelines and applied specific criteria to select relevant randomized controlled trials (RCTs). There is not direct link between VRET and phobias in this paper but it offers valuable insights into the broader applications of VR and CVR in clinical psychology, particularly in the context of PTSD. Their findings contribute to the understanding of how VR can advance the field of mental health treatment and assessment.

[5] Gonçalves, Raquel, et al. "Efficacy of virtual reality exposure therapy in the treatment of PTSD: a systematic review." *PloS one* 7.12 (2012): e48469.

The precision of VRET for addressing PTSD is examined in a systematic review conducted by Gonçalves. Their methodology included a thorough search of databases using specific PTSD and virtual reality keywords in 2011. The studies are based on PTSD patients that were given CBT and firm inclusion criteria were also applied on them. The Cochrane Collaboration Tool for Assessing the Risk of Bias and additional criteria were used for methodological quality assessment.

The review encompassed 10 selected articles out of 300 identified through electronic searches. These articles mentioned the treatment of PTSD using Virtual Reality. For instance, studies by Ready et al., Difede et al., and Wood et al. reported significant reductions in PTSD symptoms following VR-based exposure therapy. Additionally, Rizzo et al. found notable improvements in war veterans resistant to other treatments. While these results are promising, Gonçalves et al. stressed the need for more rigorous research to conclusively establish VRET's efficacy. Limitations in some studies, limited sample sizes and a lack of follow-up assessments, underscored the need for further investigation in this field.

[6] Opriş, David, et al. "Virtual reality exposure therapy in anxiety disorders: a quantitative meta‐analysis." Depression and anxiety 29.2 (2012): 85-93.

VRET for anxiety was thoroughly analyzed by Opriş, et al. (2012) revealing the following key findings:

i. Efficacy vs. Waitlist: VRET significantly reduced anxiety symptoms compared to waitlist controls, especially for social phobia and fear of flying.

ii. Comparable to Traditional Interventions: VRET's post-treatment effectiveness matched classical evidence-based interventions, with a slight advantage for fear of flying.

iii. Sustained Effectiveness: Traditional methods could not be as fruitful as VRET.

iv. Dose-Response Effect: More VRET sessions yielded greater treatment effects.

v. Similar Dropout Rates: Dropout rates were similar for VRET and in vivo exposure therapy.

These findings support VRET as an effective treatment for anxiety disorders, offering a valuable alternative to traditional interventions. Further research should explore

factors influencing treatment choice and patient preferences.

[7] Meyerbröker, Katharina, and Paul MG Emmelkamp. This orderly review checks the impact of VRET in the treatment of anxiety disorders. Depression and anxiety 27.10 (2010): 933-944.

This systematic review by Meyerbröker and Emmelkamp (2010) assesses the effectiveness of Virtual Reality Exposure Therapy (VRET) in treating various anxiety disorders. They examined two detailed analysis and more than a dozen studies on PTSD and social phobias.

The vivo exposure therapy could not beat the VRET results for the specific phobias. However, results varied among studies. In social phobia and fear of public speaking, VRET showed promise, with potential advantages in treatment adherence compared to traditional therapies. In panic disorder, while VRET appeared promising, more research was needed for conclusive results. Limited research on VRET for PTSD suggested its potential, particularly for veterans with war-related trauma, but challenges in creating realistic virtual environments for idiosyncratic traumas remained.

The review also touched upon the processes involved in VRET, such as cognitive mechanisms, therapeutic alliance, expectancy of therapeutic gains, psychophysiological measures, and cognitive enhancers. However, further research was needed to comprehensively understand these processes.

Therefore, the specific phobias get VRET as a quick solution. However, more research is required to establish its effectiveness in more complex cases, understand its underlying mechanisms, and enhance its therapeutic potential.

[8] Parsons, Thomas D., and Albert A. Rizzo. "Affective outcomes of virtual reality exposure therapy for anxiety and specific phobias: A meta-analysis." Journal of behavior therapy and experimental psychiatry 39.3 (2008): 250-261

Parsons and Rizzo (2008) conducted a detailed study on the effect of VRET on specific phobias and anxiety. They rigorously selected articles, searching databases from 1990 to 2006 using relevant keywords and examining references. Inclusion criteria demanded interval/ratio data, anxiety symptom reports before/after VRET, affect assessment use, sufficient results, and English publication.

Their thorough data coding involved two researchers extracting crucial details, and the analysis utilized a random-effects meta-analytic model. Effect sizes were categorized as small, moderate, or large, and potential moderators were explored. Out of 52 identified studies, 21 met eligibility criteria.

The findings indicated that VRET effectively reduces anxiety and phobia symptoms, particularly in well-selected patients. However, there is a room for improvement in understanding the clinical predictors and factors contributing to symptoms. Parsons and Rizzo advocate for well-designed studies, comprehensive data reporting, and further exploration of VRET's impacts on lifestyle and depressive periods of patients.

[9] Breedvelt, Josefien JF, et al. "The effects of meditation, yoga, and mindfulness on depression, anxiety, and stress in tertiary education students: A meta-analysis." Frontiers in psychiatry 10 (2019): 193.

The study by Breedvelt et al. (2019) conducted a study on tertiary education students which revealed the effect of yoga and meditation on anxiety. Employing rigorous selection criteria, the authors systematically reviewed relevant research and found substantial evidence supporting the positive effects of these practices on the mental health of students. Meditation, yoga, and mindfulness interventions were shown to significantly reduce depression, anxiety, and stress among this demographic. These findings underscore the potential value of implementing such programs within tertiary education institutions to support students in managing their psychological well-being amidst the unique challenges of higher education. In summary, this literature survey highlights the importance of these interventions in addressing the mental health needs of tertiary education students in a concise 140-word format.

[10] Mühlberger, Andreas, et al. "Repeated exposure of flight phobics to flights in virtual reality." Behaviour research and therapy 39.9 (2001): 1033-1050.

This literature survey includes the method of study to find out the treatment of flight phobia using VRET. Participant recruitment was thorough, involving 115 individuals recruited through local newspaper articles, emphasizing a proactive approach. Rigorous inclusion and exclusion criteria were applied, ensuring a well-defined participant sample. The study employed a diverse range of assessment tools, including physiological recordings, VR technology developed by the Fraunhofer Institute of Graphic Data-Processing (IGD), and psychometric instruments, enriching data collection and allowing for comprehensive evaluation of subjective and physiological outcomes. VR test flights, VR exposure flights, Subjective Units of Discomfort (SUDs) for subjective fear assessment, and physiological data (HR, SCL) were utilized to assess the effectiveness of VR exposure therapy. Robust statistical methods, such as ANOVAs and mixed ANOVAs, facilitated data analysis, enabling a quantitative evaluation of the treatment's efficacy. This literature survey highlights the systematic methodology ranging from selection of participants and data analysis as a foundation of understanding the relevance of VRET to treat flight phobia.

[11] Freeman, Daniel, et al. "Virtual reality in the treatment of persecutory delusions: randomised controlled experimental study testing how to reduce delusional conviction." The British Journal of Psychiatry 209.1 (2016): 62-67

This study sheds light on the use of VRET in the case of people suffering from delusions in non-affective psychosis. The research encompassed a cohort of thirty participants, carefully selected based on rigorous inclusion criteria to ensure a strong belief in their delusions and a sense of threat in social situations, accompanied by safety behaviors. Notably, the study excluded individuals with various confounding conditions.

The results unravel the extent to which VR can work as a therapeutic solution. This group witnessed a reduction in conviction and distress in virtual scenarios, with these benefits extending to real-world situations. In contrast, the VR exposure therapy group, while showing some progress, did not match the cognitive therapy's effectiveness.

These findings emphasize the promise of VR in challenging and reshaping delusional convictions and enhancing patients' comprehension of safety, aligning with successful treatments for anxiety disorders. As the importance of VR technologies in mental health treatment burgeons, the study acknowledges various limitations and calls for further research into alternative VR environments and hardware, extended clinical trials, and more robust controls, paving the way for future investigations in this field.

[12] Kindt, Merel, Dick Bierman, and Jos F. Brosschot. "Cognitive bias in spider fear and control children: Assessment of emotional interference by a card format and a single-trial format of the Stroop task." Journal of experimental child psychology 66.2 (1997): 163-179.

In recent years, Virtual Reality Exposure Therapy (VRET) has emerged as a cutting-edge approach to effectively address anxiety disorders. This innovative therapeutic method harnesses the power of immersive VR environments to construct controlled and lifelike scenarios that empower patients to confront and overcome their anxieties, proving especially beneficial in the treatment of specific phobias. A seminal study conducted by Kindt et al. delved into the realm of VRET, specifically exploring its application in alleviating spider phobia among children. The results of this research shed light on the transformative potential of VR technology to augment traditional exposure treatments, underscoring its capacity to create tailored and impactful interventions. The study accentuates the significance of addressing both the exposure and cognitive-behavioral aspects of anxiety disorders, guiding patients to diminish safety-seeking behaviors and directly engage with their fears. Nevertheless, the investigation prompts contemplation about the long-term utilization of VR in therapeutic contexts, necessitating further exploration and inquiry. In sum, these findings underscore the escalating importance of VR exposure therapy within the expansive landscape of anxiety disorder treatment, particularly when applied to pediatric populations. The evolving role of technology in mental health interventions is becoming increasingly apparent, opening new avenues for research and transformative approaches to enhance the well-being of individuals struggling with anxiety.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Studies on VR exposure therapy reveal its efficacy in reducing anxiety symptoms, particularly in the context of specific phobias, PTSD, and related anxiety disorders. VR technology offers a promising avenue for treatment, showcasing benefits like tailored exposure and cognitive-behavioral aspects of therapy.

However, while VR exposure therapy has shown positive outcomes, it necessitates further research to confirm its effectiveness in more complex cases and to understand the long-term and underlying mechanisms of treatment. Additionally, studies emphasize the need for well-designed clinical trials, including the exploration of VR's effects on various cognitive, psychological, and psychophysiological aspects of anxiety disorders. These findings underscore the growing significance of VR exposure therapy as an innovative and potentially transformative approach to anxiety disorder treatment, while acknowledging the importance of addressing methodological and research gaps in this field.

TABLE I. STUDY CHARACTERISTICS AND INTERVENTION SUMMARY TABLE

Study	***Participants***	***Interventions or Treatments***
[1]	Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) patients	Clinical virtual reality tools and VR Exposure Therapy
[2]	Depression patients	Cognitive behaviour therapy (CBT) and Transdiagnostic CBT (tCBT)
[3]	Anxiety disorder patients	Virtual reality Exposure therapy (VRET)
[4]	Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and Phobia patients	Cerebrovascular reactivity (CVR)
[5]	Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) patients	Virtual reality exposure therapy (VRET) for PTSD
[6]	Anxiety disorder patients	Virtual reality exposure therapy
[7]	Anxiety disorder patients	Virtual reality exposure therapy and its processes
[8]	Anxiety and Specific Phobia patients	VRET for anxiety and specific phobias
[9]	Depression, anxiety and stress in education students	Meditation, Yoga and Mindfulness
[10]	Flight Phobia patients	Virtual exposure therapy for flight phobia
[11]	Individuals with persecutory delusions	VR cognitive therapy and VR exposure therapy
[12]	Children with spider phobia	VR exposure therapy for spider phobia

REFERENCES

[1] Rizzo, A. S., & Shilling, R. (2017). Clinical virtual reality tools to advance the prevention, assessment, and treatment of PTSD. European journal of psychotraumatology, 8(sup5), 1414560.

[2] Gega, L., Smith, J., & Reynolds, S. (2013). Cognitive behaviour therapy (CBT) for depression by computer vs. therapist: patient experiences and therapeutic processes. Psychotherapy Research, 23(2), 218-231.

[3] Powers, M. B., & Emmelkamp, P. M. (2008). Virtual reality exposure therapy for anxiety disorders: A meta-analysis. Journal of anxiety disorders, 22(3), 561-569.

[4] Rizzo, A. S., & Shilling, R. (2017). Clinical virtual reality tools to advance the prevention, assessment, and treatment of PTSD. European journal of psychotraumatology, 8(sup5), 1414560..

[5] Gonçalves, R., Pedrozo, A. L., Coutinho, E. S. F., Figueira, I., & Ventura, P. (2012). Efficacy of virtual reality exposure therapy in the treatment of PTSD: a systematic review. PloS one, 7(12), e48469.

[6] Opriş, D., Pintea, S., García‐Palacios, A., Botella, C., Szamosközi, Ş., & David, D. (2012). Virtual reality exposure therapy in anxiety disorders: a quantitative meta‐analysis. Depression and anxiety, 29(2), 85-93.

[7] Meyerbröker, K., & Emmelkamp, P. M. (2010). Virtual reality exposure therapy in anxiety disorders: a systematic review of process‐and‐outcome studies. Depression and anxiety, 27(10), 933-944.

[8] Parsons, T. D., & Rizzo, A. A. (2008). Affective outcomes of virtual reality exposure therapy for anxiety and specific phobias: A meta-analysis. Journal of behavior therapy and experimental psychiatry, 39(3), 250-261.

[9] Breedvelt, J. J., Amanvermez, Y., Harrer, M., Karyotaki, E., Gilbody, S., Bockting, C. L., ... & Ebert, D. D. (2019). The effects of meditation, yoga, and mindfulness on depression, anxiety, and stress in tertiary education students: A meta-analysis. Frontiers in psychiatry, 10, 193.

[10] Mühlberger, A., Herrmann, M. J., Wiedemann, G., Ellgring, H., & Pauli, P. (2001). Repeated exposure of flight phobics to flights in virtual reality. Behaviour research and therapy, 39(9), 1033-1050.

[11] Freeman, D., Bradley, J., Antley, A., Bourke, E., DeWeever, N., Evans, N., ... & Clark, D. M. (2016). Virtual reality in the treatment of persecutory delusions: randomised controlled experimental study testing how to reduce delusional conviction. The British Journal of Psychiatry, 209(1), 62-67.

[12] Kindt, M., Bierman, D., & Brosschot, J. F. (1997). Cognitive bias in spider fear and control children: Assessment of emotional interference by a card format and a single-trial format of the Stroop task. Journal of experimental child psychology, 66(2), 163-179.