

## Retraction

# RETRACTED: Khan et al. A Comprehensive Survey of Energy-Efficient MAC and Routing Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks. *Electronics* 2022, 11, 3015

Zahid Ullah Khan <sup>1,2,3,\*</sup>, Qiao Gang <sup>1,2,3</sup>, Aman Muhammad <sup>1,2,3</sup> , Muhammad Muzzammil <sup>1,2,3</sup> , Sajid Ullah Khan <sup>4</sup>, Mohammed El Affendi <sup>5</sup> , Gauhar Ali <sup>5</sup> , Imdad Ullah <sup>6</sup>  and Javed Khan <sup>7</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Acoustic Science and Technology Laboratory, Harbin Engineering University, Harbin 150001, China  
<sup>2</sup> Key Laboratory of Marine Information Acquisition and Security, Harbin Engineering University, Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, Harbin 150001, China  
<sup>3</sup> College of Underwater Acoustic Engineering, Harbin Engineering University, Harbin 150001, China  
<sup>4</sup> Department of Computer Science, IT University of Lakki Marwat, Lakki Marwat 28440, Pakistan  
<sup>5</sup> EIAS Data Science and Blockchain Lab, College of Computer and Information Sciences, Prince Sultan University, Riyadh 11586, Saudi Arabia  
<sup>6</sup> College of Computer Engineering and Sciences, Prince Sattam Bin Abdulaziz University, Al-Kharj 11942, Saudi Arabia  
<sup>7</sup> Department of Electrical Engineering, University of Science and Technology Bannu, Bannu 28100, Pakistan  
\* Correspondence: engr.zahidkhan09@hrbeu.edu.cn

The journal retracts the article, entitled “A Comprehensive Survey of Energy-Efficient MAC and Routing Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks” [1], cited above.

Following publication, concerns were brought to the attention of the Editorial Office regarding a significant overlap between this publication [1] and a previously published article [2], and the unauthorized use of materials produced by a different authorship group. Adhering to our complaints procedure, the Editorial Office and Editorial Board conducted an investigation that confirmed a significant overlap between these articles [1,2], without appropriate citation, and the use of Figures 3–13 without copyright permission. As a result, the Editorial Board has decided to retract this paper as per MDPI’s retraction policy ([https://www.mdpi.com/ethics#\\_bookmark30](https://www.mdpi.com/ethics#_bookmark30)). This retraction was approved by the Editor-in-Chief of the journal *Electronics*.

The authors have not agreed to this retraction.

## References

1. Khan, Z.U.; Gang, Q.; Muhammad, A.; Muzzammil, M.; Khan, S.U.; El Affendi, M.; Ali, G.; Ullah, I.; Khan, J. RETRACTED: Khan et al. A Comprehensive Survey of Energy-Efficient MAC and Routing Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks. *Electronics* 2022, 11, 3015. *Electronics* 2025, 14, 1451. <https://doi.org/10.3390/electronics14071451>
2. Khater, E.M.; El-Fishawy, N.; Tolba, M.; Ibrahim, D.M. Review of ALOHA-based MAC Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks. *MEJ Mansoura Eng. J.* 2022, 47, 12–25. [\[CrossRef\]](#)

**Disclaimer/Publisher’s Note:** The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.



Received: 6 March 2025  
Accepted: 21 March 2025  
Published: 3 April 2025

**Citation:** Khan, Z.U.; Gang, Q.; Muhammad, A.; Muzzammil, M.; Khan, S.U.; El Affendi, M.; Ali, G.; Ullah, I.; Khan, J. RETRACTED: Khan et al. A Comprehensive Survey of Energy-Efficient MAC and Routing Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks. *Electronics* 2022, 11, 3015. *Electronics* 2025, 14, 1451. <https://doi.org/10.3390/electronics14071451>

**Copyright:** © 2025 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).