EXTENDS Naturals, FiniteSets, Sequences, TLC

The set of all ONOS nodes CONSTANTS Nodes

Stream states
CONSTANTS Open, Closed

 $\begin{array}{c} {\rm Master~arbitration~message~types} \\ {\rm CONSTANTS~} Master Arbitration Update \end{array}$

Write message types
CONSTANTS WriteRequest, WriteResponse

Response status constants CONSTANTS Ok, AlreadyExists, PermissionDenied

Empty value
CONSTANT Nil

The current state of mastership elections VARIABLES term, master, backups

The current mastership event queue for each node VARIABLE events

The current mastership state for each node VARIABLE masterships

Whether the node has received a MasterArbitrationUpdate indicating it is the current master VARIABLE isMaster

The state of all streams and their requests and responses VARIABLE streams, requests, responses

The current set of elections for the switch, the greatest of which is the current master $VARIABLE\ elections$

Counting variables used to enforce state constraints ${\tt VARIABLES}\ master ship Changes,\ stream Changes,\ message Count$

A history of successful writes to the switch used for model checking VARIABLE history

Mastership/consensus related variables $mastershipVars \triangleq \langle term, master, backups, mastershipChanges \rangle$

```
Node related variables node Vars \triangleq \langle events, \, masterships, \, isMaster \rangle
Stream related variables stream Vars \triangleq \langle streams, \, stream Changes \rangle
Message related variables message \, Vars \triangleq \langle requests, \, responses, \, message Count \rangle
Device related variables device \, Vars \triangleq \langle elections, \, history \rangle
A sequence of all variables vars \triangleq \langle mastership \, Vars, \, node \, Vars, \, stream \, Vars, \, message \, Vars, \, device \, Vars \rangle
```

Helpers

```
Returns a sequence with the head removed Pop(q) \triangleq SubSeq(q, 2, Len(q))
```

Returns a sequences with the element at the given index removed $Drop(q, i) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} SubSeq(q, 1, i-1) \circ SubSeq(q, i+1, Len(q))$

Returns the set of values in f $Range(f) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \{f[x] : x \in \text{DOMAIN } f\}$

Returns the maximum value from a set or undefined if the set is empty $Max(s) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \text{CHOOSE } x \in s : \forall y \in s : x \geq y$

This section models the messaging between controller nodes and the device. Messaging is modelled on TCP, providing strict ordering between controller and device via sequences. The 'requests' sequence represents the messages from controller to device for each node, and the 'responses' sequence represents the messages from device to each node. Requests and responses are always received from the head of the queue and are never duplicated or reordered.

This section models the mastership election service used by the controller to elect masters. Mastership changes through join and leave steps. Mastership is done through a consensus service, so these steps are atomic. When a node joins or leaves the mastership election, events are queued to notify nodes of the mastership change. Nodes learn of mastership changes independently of the state change in the consensus service.

Node 'n' joins the mastership election

If the current 'master' is Nil, set the master to node 'n', increment the 'term', and send a master-ship change event to each node. If the current 'master' is non-Nil, append node 'n' to the sequence of 'backups'.

```
JoinMastershipElection(n) \triangleq
    \land \lor \land master = Nil
           \wedge term' = term + 1
           \wedge master' = n
           \wedge backups' = \langle \rangle
           \land events' = [i \in Nodes \mapsto Append(events[i], [
                                                term \mapsto term'.
                                                master \mapsto master',
                                                backups \mapsto backups'[)]
        \lor \land master \neq Nil
           \land master \neq n
           \land n \notin Range(backups)
           \wedge backups' = Append(backups, n)
           \land events' = [i \in Nodes \mapsto Append(events[i], [
                                                term \mapsto term,
                                                master \mapsto master,
                                                backups \mapsto backups'[)]
           \land UNCHANGED \langle term, master \rangle
    \land mastershipChanges' = mastershipChanges + 1
    ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨masterships, isMaster, stream Vars, message Vars, device Vars⟩
```

Node 'n' leaves the mastership election

If node 'n' is the current 'master' and a backup exists, increment the 'term', promote the first backup to master, and send a mastership change event to each node. If node 'n' is the current 'master' and no backups exist, set the 'master' to *Nil*. If node 'n' is in the sequence of 'backups', simply remove it.

```
LeaveMastershipElection(n) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
    \land \lor \land master = n
          \land \lor \land Len(backups) > 0
                 \wedge term' = term + 1
                 \land master' = backups[1]
                 \wedge backups' = Pop(backups)
                 \land events' = [i \in Nodes \mapsto Append(events[i], [i])
                                                       term \mapsto term',
                                                       master \mapsto master',
                                                       backups \mapsto backups'])]
              \lor \land Len(backups) = 0
                 \land master' = Nil
                 \land UNCHANGED \langle term, backups, events \rangle
        \lor \land n \in Range(backups)
          \land backups' = Drop(backups, CHOOSE j \in DOMAIN backups : backups[j] = n)
          \land UNCHANGED \langle term, master, events \rangle
    \land mastershipChanges' = mastershipChanges + 1
    ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨masterships, isMaster, stream Vars, message Vars, device Vars⟩
```

This section models controller-side mastership arbitration. The controller nodes receive mastership change events from the mastership service and send master arbitration requests to the device. Additionally, master nodes can send write requests to the device.

```
Returns master node 'n' election\_id for mastership term 'm' MasterElectionId(m) \triangleq m.term + Cardinality(Nodes)
```

Returns backup node 'n' election_id for mastership term 'm'

 $BackupElectionId(n, m) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups : m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.backups[i] = m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.term + Cardinality(Nodes) - CHOOSE \ i \in DOMAIN \ m.term + CARDINALITY - CARDINALIT$

```
Returns the mastership term for MasterArbitrationUpdate 'm' MasterTerm(m) \triangleq m.election\_id - Cardinality(Nodes)
```

Node 'n' receives a mastership change event from the mastership service

When a mastership change event is received, the node's local mastership state is updated. If the mastership term has changed, the node will set a flag to push the mastership change to the device in the master arbitration step.

```
term
                                               \mapsto e.term,
                                     master \mapsto e.master,
                                     backups \mapsto e.backups,
                                     sent
                                               \mapsto FALSE]]
       \lor \land e.term = m.term
          \land masterships' = [masterships \ EXCEPT \ ![n] = [
                                     term
                                               \mapsto e.term,
                                     master \mapsto e.master,
                                     backups \mapsto e.backups,
                                     sent
                                               \mapsto m.sent
\land events' = [events \ EXCEPT \ ![n] = Pop(events[n])]
\land UNCHANGED \langle mastership Vars, is Master, stream Vars, message Vars, device Vars <math>\rangle
```

Node 'n' sends a MasterArbitrationUpdate to the device

If the node has an open stream to the device and a valid mastership state, a MasterArbitrationUpdate is sent to the device. If the node is a backup, the request's 'election_id' is set to (mastership term) + (number of nodes) - (backup index). If the node is the master, the 'election_id' is set to (mastership term) + (number of nodes). This is done to avoid $election_ids \leq 0$. Note that the actual protocol requires a $(device_id, role_id, election_id)$ tuple, but $(device_id, role_id)$ have been excluded from this model as we're modelling interaction only within a single $(device_id, role_id)$ and thus they're irrelevant to correctness. The mastership term is sent in MasterArbitrationUpdate requests for model checking.

```
SendMasterArbitrationUpdate(n) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
     \land streams[n] = Open
     \wedge \text{ LET } m \stackrel{\triangle}{=} masterships[n]
             \land m.term > 0
             \land \neg m.sent
             \wedge \vee \wedge m.master = n
                   \land SendRequest(n, [
                                         \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                          election\_id \mapsto MasterElectionId(m),
                                         \mapsto m.term)
                \vee \wedge m.master \neq n
                   \land n \in Range(m.backups)
                   \land SendRequest(n, [
                                         \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                          type
                          election\_id \mapsto BackupElectionId(n, m),
                          term
                                         \mapsto m.term
     \land masterships' = [masterships \ EXCEPT \ ![n].sent = TRUE]
     \land UNCHANGED \langle mastership Vars, events, is Master, device Vars, stream Vars, responses <math>\rangle
```

Node 'n' receives a MasterArbitrationUpdate from the device

If the node has an open stream with a MasterArbitrationUpdate, determine whether the local node is the master. If the MasterArbitrationUpdate 'status' is Ok, the 'election_id' matches the last requested mastership term, and 'n' is the master for that term, update the node's state to master. Otherwise, the mastership request is considered out of date.

Note that the separate 'isMaster' state is maintained to indicate whether the *device* considers this node to be the current master, and this is necessary for the safety of the algorithm. Both the node and the device must agree on the role of the node.

```
ReceiveMasterArbitrationUpdate(n) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
    \land streams[n] = Open
    \land HasResponse(n, MasterArbitrationUpdate)
    \wedge \text{ LET } r \stackrel{\triangle}{=} NextResponse(n)
            m \triangleq masterships[n]
      IN
            \vee \wedge r.status = Ok
               \land m.master = n
               \wedge m.term = MasterTerm(r)
               \land m.sent
               \land isMaster' = [isMaster \ EXCEPT \ ![n] = TRUE]
            \lor \land \lor r.status \neq Ok
                  \vee m.master \neq n
                  \vee \neg m.sent
                  \vee m.term \neq MasterTerm(r)
               \wedge isMaster' = [isMaster \ EXCEPT \ ![n] = FALSE]
    \land DiscardResponse(n)
    ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨events, masterships, mastership Vars, device Vars, stream Vars, requests, message Count⟩
```

Master node 'n' sends a WriteRequest to the device

To write to the device, the node must have an open stream, must have received a mastership change event from the mastership service (stored in 'masterships') indicating it is the master, and must have received a MasterArbitrationUpdate from the switch indicating it is the master (stored in 'isMaster') for the same term as was indicated by the mastership service. The term is sent with the WriteRequest for model checking.

```
SendWriteRequest(n) \triangleq
    \land streams[n] = Open
    \wedge LET m \stackrel{\Delta}{=} masterships[n]
            \wedge m.term > 0
            \land m.master = n
            \wedge isMaster[n]
            \land SendRequest(n, [
                                \mapsto WriteRequest,
                   election\_id \mapsto MasterElectionId(m),
                   term
                                \mapsto m.term
    ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨mastership Vars, node Vars, device Vars, stream Vars, responses⟩
 Node 'n' receives a write response from the device
```

 $ReceiveWriteResponse(n) \triangleq$

```
\land streams[n] = Open
\land HasResponse(n, WriteResponse)
\wedge \text{ LET } m \stackrel{\triangle}{=} NextResponse(n)
```

```
IN \lor m.status = Ok \lor m.status = PermissionDenied \land DiscardResponse(n) \land UNCHANGED \ \langle mastership Vars, node Vars, device Vars, stream Vars, requests, message Count \rangle
```

This section models a P4 Runtime device. For the purposes of this spec, the device has two functions: determine a master controller node and accept writes. Mastership is determined through MasterArbitrationUpdates sent by the controller nodes. The 'election_id's provided by controller nodes are stored in 'elections', and the master is computed as the node with the highest 'election_id' at any given time. The device will only allow writes from the current master node.

```
Returns the highest election ID for the given elections DeviceElectionId(e) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} Max(Range(e))
```

```
Returns the master for the given elections  \begin{array}{l} DeviceMaster(e) \; \triangleq \\ \text{IF } \; Cardinality(\{i \in Range(e) : i > 0\}) > 0 \; \text{THEN} \\ \text{CHOOSE } \; n \in \text{DOMAIN} \; e : e[n] = DeviceElectionId(e) \\ \text{ELSE} \\ Nil \end{array}
```

Opens a new stream between node 'n' and the device

When a stream is opened, the 'streams' state for node 'n' is set to *Open*. Stream creation is modelled as a single step to reduce the state space.

```
\begin{aligned} &ConnectStream(n) \triangleq \\ & \wedge streams[n] = Closed \\ & \wedge streams' = [streams \ \text{except} \ ![n] = Open] \\ & \wedge streamChanges' = streamChanges + 1 \\ & \wedge \ \text{unchanged} \ \langle mastership Vars, \ node Vars, \ device Vars, \ message Vars \rangle \end{aligned}
```

Closes an open stream between node 'n' and the device

When a stream is closed, the 'streams' state for node 'n' is set to Closed, any 'election_id' provided by node 'n' is forgotten, and the 'requests' and 'responses' queues for the node are cleared. Additionally, if the stream belonged to the master node, a new master is elected and a MasterArbitrationUpdate is sent on the streams that remain in the Open state. The MasterArbitrationUpdate will be sent to the new master with a 'status' of Ok and to all slaves with a 'status' of AlreadyExists.

```
CloseStream(n) \triangleq \\ \land streams[n] = Open \\ \land elections' = [elections \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![n] = 0] \\ \land streams' = [streams \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![n] = Closed] \\ \land requests' = [requests \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![n] = \langle \rangle] \\ \land \text{LET} \ oldMaster \ \triangleq \ DeviceMaster(elections) \\ newMaster \ \triangleq \ DeviceMaster(elections') \\ \text{IN} \\ \lor \land oldMaster \neq newMaster \\ \end{cases}
```

```
\land responses' = [i \in DOMAIN \ streams' \mapsto
                              IF streams'[i] = Open Then
                                   If i = newMaster then
                                       Append(responses[i], [
                                                         \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                                                         \mapsto Ok,
                                            status
                                            election\_id \mapsto DeviceElectionId(elections')])
                                    ELSE
                                       Append(responses[i], [
                                            type
                                                         \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                                                         \mapsto AlreadyExists,
                                            status
                                            election\_id \mapsto DeviceElectionId(elections')])
                                ELSE
          \land messageCount' = messageCount + 1
       \lor \land oldMaster = newMaster
          \land responses' = [responses \ EXCEPT \ ![n] = \langle \rangle]
          \land UNCHANGED \langle messageCount \rangle
\land streamChanges' = streamChanges + 1
\land UNCHANGED \langle mastership Vars, node Vars, history \rangle
```

The device receives and responds to a MasterArbitrationUpdate from node 'n'

If the 'election_id' is already present in the 'elections' and does not already belong to node 'n', the stream is *Closed* and 'requests' and 'responses' are cleared for the node. If the 'election_id' is not known to the device, it's added to the 'elections' state. If the change results in a new master being elected by the device, a *MasterArbitrationUpdate* is sent on all *Open* streams. If the change does not result in a new master being elected by the device, node 'n' is returned a

MasterArbitrationUpdate. The device master will always receive a

 ${\it Master Arbitration Update}$ response with 'status' of ${\it Ok}$, and slaves will always receive a 'status' of ${\it Already Exists}$.

```
\lor \ \land \ oldMaster \neq newMaster
                          \land responses' = [i \in \text{DOMAIN } streams \mapsto
                                               IF streams[i] = Open THEN
                                                   If i = newMaster then
                                                        Append(responses[i], [
                                                                         \mapsto Master Arbitration Update,
                                                            type
                                                                         \mapsto Ok,
                                                            status
                                                            election\_id \mapsto DeviceElectionId(elections')])
                                                    ELSE
                                                        Append(responses[i], [
                                                                         \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                                                            type
                                                                         \mapsto AlreadyExists,
                                                            status
                                                            election\_id \mapsto DeviceElectionId(elections')])
                                                ELSE
                                                   responses[i]] \\
                          \land messageCount' = messageCount + 1
                       \lor \land oldMaster = newMaster
                          \wedge \vee \wedge n = newMaster
                                \land SendResponse(n, [
                                                    \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                                       type
                                                    \mapsto Ok,
                                       status
                                       election\_id \mapsto DeviceElectionId(elections')])
                             \lor \land n \neq newMaster
                                \land SendResponse(n, [
                                                    \mapsto MasterArbitrationUpdate,
                                       type
                                                    \mapsto AlreadyExists,
                                       election\_id \mapsto DeviceElectionId(elections')])
               ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨stream Vars⟩
     \land DiscardRequest(n)
     \land UNCHANGED \langle mastership Vars, node Vars, history \rangle
 The device receives a WriteRequest from node 'n'
If the WriteRequest 'election_id' matches the 'election_id' recorded on the device for node 'n' and
the node is the current master for the device, accept the write and record the term for model
checking. Otherwise, return a 'PermissionDenied' response.
HandleWrite(n) \triangleq
     \land streams[n] = Open
    \land HasRequest(n, WriteRequest)
    \wedge \text{ LET } m \stackrel{\triangle}{=} NextRequest(n)
       ΙN
            \lor \land elections[n] = m.election\_id
               \land DeviceMaster(elections) = n
               \land history' = Append(history, [node \mapsto n, term \mapsto m.term])
               \land SendResponse(n, [
                      type \mapsto WriteResponse,
```

```
status \mapsto Ok)
              \lor \land \lor elections[n] \neq m.election\_id
                     \vee DeviceMaster(elections) \neq n
                 \land SendResponse(n, [
                         type \mapsto WriteResponse,
                         status \mapsto PermissionDenied)
                 \land UNCHANGED \langle history \rangle
     \land DiscardRequest(n)
     \land UNCHANGED \langle mastership Vars, node Vars, elections, stream Vars <math>\rangle
The invariant asserts that the device will not allow a write from an older master if it has already
accepted a write from a newer master. This is determined by comparing the mastership terms of
accepted writes. For this invariant to hold, terms may only increase in the history of writes.
TypeInvariant \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \forall i \in \text{DOMAIN } history : i = 1 \lor history[i-1].term \le history[i].term
Init \triangleq
     \wedge term = 0
     \wedge master = Nil
     \wedge backups = \langle \rangle
     \land events = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \langle \rangle]
     \land masterships = [n \in Nodes \mapsto [term \mapsto 0, master \mapsto Nil, backups \mapsto \langle \rangle, sent \mapsto FALSE]]
     \land isMaster = [n \in Nodes \mapsto FALSE]
     \land streams = [n \in Nodes \mapsto Closed]
     \land requests = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \langle \rangle]
     \land responses = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \langle \rangle]
```

$Next \triangleq$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : ConnectStream(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : CloseStream(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : JoinMastershipElection(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : LeaveMastershipElection(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : LearnMastership(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : SendMasterArbitrationUpdate(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : HandleMasterArbitrationUpdate(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : ReceiveMasterArbitrationUpdate(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : SendWriteRequest(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : HandleWrite(n)$

 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : ReceiveWriteResponse(n)$

 $Spec \triangleq Init \wedge \Box [Next]_{vars}$

- $\begin{tabular}{ll} $$ \ $\ * Modification History \\ * Last modified $\it Tue Feb~19~17:59:56~PST~2019$ by $\it jordanhalterman \\ * Created $\it Thu Feb~14~11:33:03~PST~2019$ by $\it jordanhalterman \\ \end{tabular}$