

# RMIT School of Science

Course Notes

COSC1147

Semester 2, 2017

Week 11

# Lecture Component

- ▶ Further case studies

# 8-step process in analysing a case study

1. Read it 2-3 times
2. Underline important parts/segments/lines in the case study
3. State/write your assumptions (**a very important step**)
4. Identify the stakeholders- both *internal* and *external*
5. Identify duty/obligation(s) for internal stakeholders
6. Now figure out if there is an issue/dilemma based on the list created in step 5
7. If there is figure out prospective solutions
8. Conclude by stating the best solution/outcome (*sometimes there may not be a solution*)

# Note about this lecture

- ▶ Slides following each case study have been left empty
- ▶ This is on purpose
- ▶ While discussing this during lecture, please write down the solutions
- ▶ This will help you during exam preparation

# Case study # 1:UBER

## Disruptive Technologies

- ▶ <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/business/uber-london-ban-sadiq-khan-tfl-statement-in-full-licence-not-renewed-a7960921.html>

# Questions

1. Is there an ethical problem with the way Uber operates?
2. Is the problem different in different countries?

# Uber in Victoria

- ▶ The independent report by SGS Economics and Planning found the taxi industry generated \$822 million in fares each year and employs almost 17,000 people. UberX drivers use private cars to carry passengers who book rides using the company's smartphone app.
- ▶ The rise of the popular service has infuriated taxi drivers and owners, who say they are being undercut by UberX drivers who do not pay licence fees.
- ▶ The Victorian State Government reaps \$102.3 million a year in taxi-related taxes and the Federal Government takes \$105.5 million.
- ▶ Taxis are heavily regulated in Victoria.

# Questions

1. What is the dilemma here?
2. Who are the stakeholders?
3. Is it ethical for Uber to not pay the taxes that taxi drivers pay? Explain from the perspective of a member of the public, who lives in Melbourne
4. What should the Victorian Government do and why? Explain two of their options and which decision you think they should take



# Solutions??

# Case study # 2 (Technology and Health)

- ▶ <http://www.cnet.com/au/news/how-accurate-are-wristband-heart-rate-monitors/>
- ▶ **Do wristband heart trackers actually work? A** **checkup.**
- ▶ More wrist-based heart rate monitors are hitting the market, letting you gauge your fitness with a quick read of your pulse. But as Sharon Profis discovered after a visit to the doctor, these optical monitors may need more R&D.

# Questions

1. How accurate should readings be? How accurate can they be?
2. Where does the data go?
3. Who owns the data? Who should own data?
4. Can they improve health? How would you know if it worked? What testing should be done on such devices?

# Solution

# Case study # 3 (Gender Equity)

- ▶ Theme: Ethics of a larger organisation
- ▶ Case link: [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/saadiah-zahidi/what-makes-the-nordic-country\\_b\\_4159555.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/saadiah-zahidi/what-makes-the-nordic-country_b_4159555.html)

# Questions?

1. Do you see an ethical issue?
2. Do you think employees misuse the organisational policies at times?
3. Is there a role for Government policies?
4. Should there be paternity leave?

# Solution

# Case study # 4 (ANZ threatened to discipline pregnant worker)

- ▶ Theme: Ethics of a larger organisation
- ▶ Case link: <http://www.theage.com.au/victoria/anz-threatened-to-discipline-pregnant-worker-over-pelvic-exam-court-told-20140807-101m53.html>



# Questions?

1. Do you see an ethical issue?
2. Do you see a legal issue?
3. Were the actions of ANZ justified?
4. Do you think employees misuse the organisational policies at times?
5. What was the right course of action in this case?
6. Should Katherine be compensated?

# Solution

# Case # 4 (Case of East-West tunnel)

- ▶ Theme: Ecology of the land and sustainability issues
- ▶ Case link:  
<http://www.theage.com.au/victoria/east-west-link-battle-goes-underground-20140806-1017er.html>  
and,  
<https://urbanmelbourne.info/transport/2013/07/17/how-to-ruin-an-improving-landscape-east-west-tunnel>

# Questions?

1. Is there an underlying issue?
2. Are residents right in their protest?
3. Do you think the State Government is right in proposing this tunnel?
4. What would a deontologist say?
5. What would a utilitarian say?

# Solution

# Case # 5 (The case of NBN)

- ▶ Theme: ??
- ▶ Case link:  
<http://delimiter.com.au/2014/01/28/incredible-nbn-debate-stuck-yesterdays-logic-says-budde/>

# Questions

1. What theme would this case study fit in?
2. What according to you is the issue with NBN project?
3. Is there an underlying dilemma? If yes, what is it?
4. Can this controversial debate be settled? Do you propose any solutions?

# Solution



# Solution

# Solution

# Case 6 # (Right to be forgotten)

- ▶ Theme: Big organisation ethics
- ▶ Case link:  
<http://www.theage.com.au/technology/technology-news/regulators-agree-on-googles-right-to-refuse-right-to-be-forgotten-requests-20140919-10j5ps.html>

# Questions?

1. Do people have right to be refused?
2. Is it ethical for Google to refuse such a request?
3. Is Google's refusal ethical?
4. What issues does this raise?
5. Should there be a law that supports above dilemma?

# Solution

# Solution

30

# Solution