Functional Programming and Interactive Theorem Proving

with Isabelle/HOL

Peter Lammich

School of Computer Science The University of Manchester

2019-8-1

Programming and proving correct quicksort

Programming and proving correct quicksort using the Theorem Prover Isabelle/HOL https://isabelle.in.tum.de/

Programming and proving correct quicksort

using the Theorem Prover Isabelle/HOL

https://isabelle.in.tum.de/

download it and follow this lecture on your laptop!

Lecture Material:

https://github.com/lammich/MCR_SS_2019_FunProgProve

Programming and proving correct quicksort

using the Theorem Prover Isabelle/HOL

https://isabelle.in.tum.de/

download it and follow this lecture on your laptop!

Lecture Material:

https://github.com/lammich/MCR_SS_2019_FunProgProve

Relax and enjoy! There is no exam on this lecture!

Raise your hand if you

• Have ever written a computer program

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL
 - in JavaScript

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL
 - in JavaScript
 - in PHP, Python, Ruby, PERL

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL
 - in JavaScript
 - in PHP, Python, Ruby, PERL
 - in Haskell, Scala, OCaml, SML, LISP, Scheme

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL
 - in JavaScript
 - in PHP, Python, Ruby, PERL
 - in Haskell, Scala, OCaml, SML, LISP, Scheme
- Know what quicksort is

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL
 - in JavaScript
 - in PHP, Python, Ruby, PERL
 - in Haskell, Scala, OCaml, SML, LISP, Scheme
- Know what quicksort is
- Know what (structural) induction means

- Have ever written a computer program
 - in C, C++, Java, BASIC, PASCAL
 - in JavaScript
 - in PHP, Python, Ruby, PERL
 - in Haskell, Scala, OCaml, SML, LISP, Scheme
- Know what quicksort is
- Know what (structural) induction means
- Have ever used an interactive theorem prover

- Empty list
- a # / List with first element a and then list /

[] Empty list a # I List with first element a and then list I Example: 1#2#3#4#[

```
[] Empty list a \# I \text{ List with first element } a \text{ and then list } I Example: 1 \# 2 \# 3 \# 4 \# [] Notation: [1, 2, 3, 4]
```

```
[] Empty list

a # / List with first element a and then list /

Example: 1#2#3#4#[]

Notation: [1, 2, 3, 4]

/1 @ /2: concatenate two lists

Example: [1, 2, 3] @ [4, 5, 6] = [1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6]
```

$\mathsf{Append}\ @$

How to define @?

How to define @ ? Using only [] and #?

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

$$[] @ l_2 =$$

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

$$[] @ l_2 = l_2$$

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

$$[] @ l_2 = l_2 (x # l_1) @ l_2 =$$

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

[] @
$$l_2 = l_2$$

(x # l_1) @ $l_2 = x$ # (l_1 @ l_2)

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

Case distinction whether first list is empty:

$$\begin{bmatrix}
@ l_2 = l_2 \\
(x \# l_1) @ l_2 = x \# (l_1 @ l_2)
\end{bmatrix}$$

Example:

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

Case distinction whether first list is empty:

[] @
$$l_2 = l_2$$

(x # l_1) @ $l_2 = x$ # (l_1 @ l_2)

Example:

$$([1,\!2] \ @ \ [3]) \ = (1 \ \# \ 2 \ \# \ []) \ @ \ (3 \ \# \ [])$$

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

Case distinction whether first list is empty:

Example:

$$\begin{array}{lll} ([1,\!2] \ @ \ [3]) &= (1 \ \# \ 2 \ \# \ []) \ @ \ (3 \ \# \ []) \\ &= 1 \ \# \ ((\ 2 \ \# \ []) \ @ \ (3 \ \# \ [])) \end{array}$$

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

Case distinction whether first list is empty:

$$[] @ l_2 = l_2 (x # l_1) @ l_2 = x # (l_1 @ l_2)$$

Example:

$$([1,2] @ [3]) = (1 \# 2 \# []) @ (3 \# [])$$

= 1 # ((2 # []) @ (3 # []))
= 1 # 2 # ([] @ (3 # []))

How to define @? Using only [] and #?

Case distinction whether first list is empty:

Example:

$$\begin{array}{l} ([1,2] @ [3]) &= (1 \# 2 \# []) @ (3 \# []) \\ &= 1 \# ((2 \# []) @ (3 \# [])) \\ &= 1 \# 2 \# ([] @ (3 \# [])) \\ &= 1 \# 2 \# 3 \# [] \\ \end{array}$$

Erase all elements not ≤ 4 from a list

 $\textit{leq}4\ [1,\!42,\!7,\!5,\!2,\!6,\!3]$

$$\textit{leq}4~[1,\!42,\!7,\!5,\!2,\!6,\!3]~=[1,\!2,\!3]$$

$$leq4 [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] = [1,2,3]$$

$$leq4 [] =$$

$$\textit{leq}4 \ [1,\!42,\!7,\!5,\!2,\!6,\!3] \ = [1,\!2,\!3]$$

$$leq4 [] = []$$

$$\begin{array}{lll} \textit{leq4} \ [1,\!42,\!7,\!5,\!2,\!6,\!3] &= [1,\!2,\!3] \\ \textit{leq4} \ [] &= [] \\ \textit{leq4} \ (x\#\textit{I}) &= \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ll} \textit{leq4} \ [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] \ = [1,2,3] \\ \\ \textit{leq4} \ [] \ = [] \\ \textit{leq4} \ (\textit{x\#I}) \ = \textit{if} \ \textit{x} \leq 4 \ \textit{then} \ \textit{x} \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \ \textit{else} \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \textit{leq4} \ [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] \ = \ [1,2,3] \\ \\ \textit{leq4} \ [] \ = \ [] \\ \textit{leq4} \ (\textit{x\#I}) \ = \ \textit{if} \ \textit{x} \leq 4 \ \textit{then} \ \textit{x} \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \ \textit{else} \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \\ \\ \textit{leq4} \ [1,\ 42,\ 7,\ 5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \textit{leq4} \ [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] \ = \ [1,2,3] \\ \textit{leq4} \ [] \ = \ [] \\ \textit{leq4} \ (\textit{x\#I}) \ = \ \textit{if} \ \textit{x} \leq 4 \ \textit{then} \ \textit{x} \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \ \textit{else} \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \\ \textit{leq4} \ [1,\ 42,\ 7,\ 5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \\ = \ 1 \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ [42,\ 7,\ 5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \end{array}$$

$$leq4 [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] = [1,2,3]$$

 $leq4 [] = []$
 $leq4 (x\#I) = if x \le 4 then x \# leq4 I else leq4 I$
 $leq4 [1, 42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$
 $= 1 \# leq4 [42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$
 $= 1 \# leq4 [7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$

$$\begin{array}{l} \textit{leq4} \ [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] \ = \ [1,2,3] \\ \textit{leq4} \ [] \ = \ [] \\ \textit{leq4} \ (x\#\textit{I}) \ = \ \textit{if} \ x \leq 4 \ \textit{then} \ x \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \ \textit{else} \ \textit{leq4} \ \textit{I} \\ \textit{leq4} \ [1,\ 42,\ 7,\ 5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \\ = \ 1 \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ [42,\ 7,\ 5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \\ = \ 1 \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ [7,\ 5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \\ = \ 1 \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ [5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \\ = \ 1 \ \# \ \textit{leq4} \ [5,\ 2,\ 6,\ 3] \\ \end{array}$$

$$leq4 [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] = [1,2,3]$$
 $leq4 [] = []$
 $leq4 (x\#l) = if x \le 4 then x \# leq4 l else leq4 l$
 $leq4 [1, 42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$
 $= 1 \# leq4 [42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$
 $= 1 \# leq4 [7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$
 $= 1 \# leq4 [5, 2, 6, 3]$
 $= 1 \# leq4 [2, 6, 3]$

$$\begin{aligned} & leq4 \; [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] \; = [1,2,3] \\ & leq4 \; [] \; = [] \\ & leq4 \; (x\#I) \; = \; if \; x \leq 4 \; then \; x \; \# \; leq4 \; I \; else \; leq4 \; I \\ & leq4 \; [1,\; 42,\; 7,\; 5,\; 2,\; 6,\; 3] \\ & = \; 1 \; \# \; leq4 \; [42,\; 7,\; 5,\; 2,\; 6,\; 3] \\ & = \; 1 \; \# \; leq4 \; [7,\; 5,\; 2,\; 6,\; 3] \\ & = \; 1 \; \# \; leq4 \; [5,\; 2,\; 6,\; 3] \\ & = \; 1 \; \# \; leq4 \; [2,\; 6,\; 3] \\ & = \; 1 \; \# \; leq4 \; [2,\; 6,\; 3] \\ & = \; 1 \; \# \; 2 \; \# \; leq4 \; [6,\; 3] \end{aligned}$$

$$leq4 [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] = [1,2,3]$$

$$leq4 [] = []$$

$$leq4 (x\#l) = if x \le 4 \text{ then } x \# \text{ leq4 } l \text{ else leq4 } l$$

$$leq4 [1, 42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$$

$$= 1 \# \text{ leq4 } [42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$$

$$= 1 \# \text{ leq4 } [7, 5, 2, 6, 3]$$

$$= 1 \# \text{ leq4 } [5, 2, 6, 3]$$

$$= 1 \# \text{ leq4 } [2, 6, 3]$$

$$= 1 \# 2 \# \text{ leq4 } [6, 3]$$

$$= 1 \# 2 \# \text{ leq4 } [3]$$

```
leg4 [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] = [1,2,3]
leg4 || = ||
leq4 (x\#I) = if x < 4 then x \# leq4 I else leq4 I
leg4 [1, 42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [7, 5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# 2 \# leg4 [6, 3]
= 1 \# 2 \# leg4 [3]
= 1 \# 2 \# 3 \# lea4
```

```
leg4 [1,42,7,5,2,6,3] = [1,2,3]
leg4 || = ||
leq4 (x\#I) = if x < 4 then x \# leq4 I else leq4 I
leg4 [1, 42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [42, 7, 5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [7, 5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [5, 2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# leg4 [2, 6, 3]
= 1 \# 2 \# leg4 [6, 3]
= 1 \# 2 \# leg4 [3]
= 1 \# 2 \# 3 \# lea4
= 1 \# 2 \# 3 \# 1
```

Condition as parameter to function

7

Condition as parameter to function

```
filter P \ [] = []
filter P \ (x \# I) = (if P \times then \times \# filter P \ I else filter P \ I)
```

filter $(\lambda x. \ x \le (4::'a))$ l: Same as leq4

Condition as parameter to function

```
filter P [] = []
filter P (x \# I) = (if P x then x \# filter P I else filter P I)
```

filter $(\lambda x. \ x \le (4::'a))$ l: Same as leq4

 $\lambda x. \ x \leq (4::'a)$ is anonymous function, with parameter x.

7

Demo.thy

Functions

count | x How often does element x occur in list |

count / x How often does element x occur in list /

Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 =

count / x How often does element x occur in list /

Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4

count / x How often does element x occur in list /

Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4

count [] x =

count / x How often does element x occur in list /

Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4

count [] x = 0

```
count l \times l How often does element x occur in list l Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4 count [l \times l] x = 0 count (l \times l] x = 0 count (l \times l] x = 0
```

```
count l \times l How often does element x occur in list l Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4 count [l \times l] x = 0 count (l \times l] x = 0 then 1 + count l \times l else count l \times l
```

```
count l \times l How often does element x occur in list l Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4 count [] \times l = 0 count (y \# l) \times l = l if x = y then 1 + c count [2, 2, 1, 2] 2 = l
```

```
count / x How often does element x occur in list /
Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4
count []x = 0
count (y \# I) x = if x = y then 1 + count I x else count I x
count [2, 2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + count [2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [2] 2
```

```
count / x How often does element x occur in list /
Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4
count [] x = 0
count (y \# I) x = if x = y then 1 + count I x else count I x
count [2, 2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + count [2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [2] 2
= 1 + 1 + 1 + count [] 2
```

9

```
count / x How often does element x occur in list /
Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4
count [] x = 0
count (y \# I) x = if x=y then 1 + count I x else count I x
count [2, 2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + count [2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [2] 2
= 1 + 1 + 1 + count [] 2
= 1 + 1 + 1 + 0
```

```
count / x How often does element x occur in list /
Example: count [1, 2, 3, 1, 2, 3, 2, 2] 2 = 4
count [] x = 0
count (y \# I) x = if x=y then 1 + count I x else count I x
count [2, 2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + count [2, 1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [1, 2] 2
= 1 + 1 + count [2] 2
= 1 + 1 + 1 + count [] 2
= 1 + 1 + 1 + 0
=3
```

Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False

Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] =

Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] = True

```
Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] = True sorted [x] = True
```

Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] = True sorted [x] = True

```
Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] = True sorted [x] = True sorted [
```

```
Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] = True sorted [x] = True sorted [x] = True sorted [x] = x \le y \land sorted (y \# I)
```

Is a list sorted? E.g. sorted [1, 2, 4] = True, sorted [1, 4, 3] = False sorted [] = True sorted [x] = True sorted [x] = True sorted $[x] = x \le y \land sorted (y \# I)$ Note \land means "and".

Demo.thy

Count and Sortedness

Quicksort

Algorithm to sort a list

Algorithm to sort a list

- \bigcirc pick pivot element p (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

Algorithm to sort a list

- \bullet pick pivot element ρ (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

```
\begin{array}{l} \textit{qs} \ [3,\ 2,\ 5,\ 4,\ 7] \\ = \end{array}
```

Algorithm to sort a list

- \bullet pick pivot element p (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

```
qs [3, 2, 5, 4, 7]
= qs [2] @ [3] @ qs [5, 4, 7]
=
```

Algorithm to sort a list

- \bullet pick pivot element p (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

```
qs [3, 2, 5, 4, 7]
= qs [2] @ [3] @ qs [5, 4, 7]
= [2] @ [3] @ qs [4] @ [5] @ qs [7]
=
```

Algorithm to sort a list

- \bullet pick pivot element ρ (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

```
qs [3, 2, 5, 4, 7]
= qs [2] @ [3] @ qs [5, 4, 7]
= [2] @ [3] @ qs [4] @ [5] @ qs [7]
= [2] @ [3] @ [4] @ [5] @ [7]
```

Algorithm to sort a list

- \bullet pick pivot element ρ (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

```
qs [3, 2, 5, 4, 7]
= qs [2] @ [3] @ qs [5, 4, 7]
= [2] @ [3] @ qs [4] @ [5] @ qs [7]
= [2] @ [3] @ [4] @ [5] @ [7]
= [2, 3, 4, 5, 7]
```

Algorithm to sort a list

qs [3, 2, 5, 4, 7]

Idea:

- 1 pick pivot element p (e.g. first element of list)
- 2 partition list into elements $\leq p$ and > p
- 3 recursively sort partitions

= as [2] @ [3] @ as [5, 4, 7]

```
= [2] @ [3] @ qs [4] @ [5] @ qs [7]

= [2] @ [3] @ [4] @ [5] @ [7]

= [2, 3, 4, 5, 7]

qs [] = []

qs (p \# l) = qs (filter (\lambda x. x \le p) l) @ [p] @ qs (filter (\lambda x. x > p) l)
```

Demo.thy

Quicksort

Correct Sorting

What does it mean that quicksort is correct?

Correct Sorting

What does it mean that quicksort is correct?

1 The resulting list must be sorted sorted (qs l)

Correct Sorting

What does it mean that quicksort is correct?

- 1 The resulting list must be sorted sorted (qs l)
- 2 and must contain same elements $\forall x$. count $(qs \ l) \ x = count \ l \ x$

 $\forall x \dots$ means "for all x"

Demo.thy

Correctness of Sorting

count
$$(l_1 @ l_2) x =$$

$$count (I_1 @ I_2) x = count I_1 x + count I_2 x$$

count
$$(l_1 @ l_2) x = count l_1 x + count l_2 x$$

count (filter $P I$) $x =$

count
$$(I_1 @ I_2) x = count I_1 x + count I_2 x$$

count (filter P I) $x = if P x$ then count I x else 0

count
$$(I_1 @ I_2) x = count I_1 x + count I_2 x$$

count (filter $P I$) $x = if P x$ then count $I x$ else 0
count (filter $(\lambda x. x \le p) I$) $x + count$ (filter $(\lambda x. x > p) I$) $x = I$

```
count (I_1 @ I_2) x = count I_1 x + count I_2 x

count (filter P I) x = if P x then count I x else 0

count (filter (\lambda x. x \le p) I) x + count (filter (\lambda x. x > p) I) x = count I x
```