# **Westlaw UK Delivery Summary**

Request made by: IPUSERCP3396247981

IPUSERCP3396247981

Request made on: Tuesday, 01 July, 2014 at 10:52 BST

Client ID: ukadvlegal-245

Content Type Cases

Title: Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd

Delivery selection: Current Document

Number of documents delivered: 1

Sweet & Maxwell is part of Thomson Reuters. © 2014 Thomson Reuters (Professional) UK Limited

Status: Positive or Neutral Judicial Treatment

### **Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd**

# Hadley v Midland Fertility Services Ltd

Family Division 01 October 2003

# **Case Analysis**

#### Where Reported

[2003] EWHC 2161 (Fam); [2004] 2 W.L.R. 713; [2003] 4 All E.R. 903; [2004] 1 F.L.R. 67; [2003] 3 F.C.R. 577; (2004) 75 B.M.L.R. 115; [2003] Fam. Law 879; (2003) 100(39) L.S.G. 38; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 1519; (2003) 147 S.J.L.B. 1150; Times, October 2, 2003; Independent, October 14, 2003; Official Transcript

### Case Digest

Subject: Health

**Keywords:** Consent; In vitro fertilisation; Right to respect for private and family life; Withdrawal

**Summary:** The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 Sch.3 para.4 gave each party to IVF treatment an unconditional right to withdraw or vary their consent to the use of embryos for IVF at any time up until the embryos were actually used in treatment; where parties had given consent together and had subsequently separated, that consent became ineffective.

**Abstract:** E and H sought declarations in relation to the use and storage of their frozen embryos and, if necessary, a declaration that certain provisions of the Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 were incompatible with, inter alia, the right to private and family life pursuant to the Human Rights Act 1998 Sch.1 Part I Art.8. E additionally sought an injunction requiring her former partner, J, to restore his consent to the storage and use of the embryos. E and H had undergone IVF treatment with J and W, their respective male former partners. Following the breakdown of their relationships, E and H still wished to have the remaining embryos removed from storage and transferred into them. E contended that J had agreed that the embryos would always be available for her use and that she had relied upon that to her detriment. J denied that. E argued that equitable estoppel applied and J's consent should be restored. H submitted that the fact that she and W had previously had embryos unsuccessfully transferred into her meant that the remaining embryos in storage had been "used" for the purposes of Sch.3 para.4(2)(a) to the 1990 Act. J and W argued that they had an unqualified right to withdraw their consent and that the stored embryos had not been "used" until transferred into a woman. The Secretary of State and the Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority were joined to the proceedings and argued that the terms of the 1990 Act precluded the court from granting the relief sought.

Held, refusing the declarations, that the consents given in both cases were for "treatment together" with the named partner and no other purpose and thus could not be effective for sole use by the claimants. In any event, Sch.3 para.4(1) to the 1990 Act gave each party the unconditional right to withdraw consent at any time up until use. "Use" in the context of the instant case meant the transfer of the embryos into the women. To suggest otherwise would render it

impossible for consent to ever be withdrawn once embryos had been created and stored. Schedule 3 to the 1990 Act did not infringe the right to respect for private and family life enshrined in Art.8. There were sound policy reasons behind Sch.3 which enabled each party to withdraw consent to treatment before use, providing the parties with equal rights to respect for their private lives. Therefore the interference by the state was lawful and proportionate. In respect of E's case, J did not give any definite assurances to E that she could use the embryos whatever happened. However, even if he had done so, promissory estoppel could not apply in E's case as there were clear provisions in the 1990 Act which gave any party the right to withdraw consent. Accordingly, J could not have promised to do what the law would not have allowed him to do.

Judge: Wall, J.

**Counsel:** For E and H: Robin Tolson Q.C. and Susan Freeborn. . For the clinics: Kristina Stern. . For J: Kambiz Moradifar and Vanessa McKinlay. . For W: Stefano Nuvoloni. . For the Secretary of State: Jason Coppel. . For the HFEA: Dinah Rose.

**Solicitor:** For E and H: Withy King (Trowbridge). For the clinics: Bevan Ashford and Young & Lee (Birmingham). For J: Davey Son & Jones (Gloucester). For W: Baches (Wednesbury). For the Secretary of State: Department Solicitor. For the HFEA: Morgan Cole (Cardiff).

# Appellate History & Status

#### **Family Division**

#### **Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd**

[2003] EWHC 2161 (Fam); [2004] 2 W.L.R. 713; [2003] 4 All E.R. 903; [2004] 1 F.L.R. 67; [2003] 3 F.C.R. 577; (2004) 75 B.M.L.R. 115; [2003] Fam. Law 879; (2003) 100(39) L.S.G. 38; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 1519; (2003) 147 S.J.L.B. 1150; Times, October 2, 2003; Independent, October 14, 2003; Official Transcript

#### **Affirmed**

# **Court of Appeal (Civil Division)**

# **Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd**

[2004] EWCA Civ 727; [2005] Fam. 1; [2004] 3 W.L.R. 681; [2004] 3 All E.R. 1025; [2004] 2 F.L.R. 766; [2004] 2 F.C.R. 530; (2004) 78 B.M.L.R. 181; [2004] Fam. Law 647; (2004) 148 S.J.L.B. 823; Times, June 30, 2004; Independent, June 29, 2004; Official Transcript

### **Complaint dismissed**

#### **European Court of Human Rights**

Evans v United Kingdom (6339/05)

[2006] 2 F.L.R. 172; [2006] 1 F.C.R. 585; (2006) 43 E.H.R.R. 21; [2006] Fam. Law 357; (2006) 156 N.L.J. 456; Times, March 17, 2006

# **Related Cases**

Human Fertilisation & Embryology Authority v Amicus Healthcare Ltd

[2005] EWHC 1092 (QB); Official Transcript; QBD

#### Evans v United Kingdom (6339/05)

[2007] 1 F.L.R. 1990; [2007] 2 F.C.R. 5; (2008) 46 E.H.R.R. 34; 22 B.H.R.C. 190; (2007) 95 B.M.L.R. 107; [2007] Fam. Law 588; (2007) 157 N.L.J. 599; Times, May 2, 2007; ECHR (Grand Chamber)

#### **All Cases Cited**

#### Advocate General for Scotland v MacDonald

[2003] UKHL 34; [2004] 1 All E.R. 339; 2003 S.C. (H.L.) 35; 2003 S.L.T. 1158; 2003 S.C.L.R. 814; [2003] I.C.R. 937; [2003] I.R.L.R. 512; [2003] E.L.R. 655; (2003) 100(29) L.S.G. 36; (2003) 147 S.J.L.B. 782; 2003 G.W.D. 23-677; Times, June 20, 2003; Official Transcript; HL; 2003-06-19

# R. (on the application of Hooper) v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions

[2003] EWCA Civ 813; [2003] 1 W.L.R. 2623; [2003] 3 All E.R. 673; [2003] 2 F.C.R. 504; [2003] U.K.H.R.R. 1268; 14 B.H.R.C. 626; (2003) 100(29) L.S.G. 35; Times, June 28, 2003; Independent, June 25, 2003; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2003-06-18

# R. (on the application of Quintavalle) v Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority

[2003] EWCA Civ 667; [2004] Q.B. 168; [2003] 3 W.L.R. 878; [2003] 3 All E.R. 257; [2003] 2 F.L.R. 335; [2003] 2 F.C.R. 193; [2003] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 294; (2003) 73 B.M.L.R. 116; [2003] A.C.D. 75; [2003] Fam. Law 565; (2003) 100(27) L.S.G. 37; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 824; (2003) 147 S.J.L.B. 598; Times, May 20, 2003; Independent, May 20, 2003; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2003-05-16

### Actionstrength Ltd (t/a Vital Resources) v International Glass Engineering IN.GL.EN SpA

[2003] UKHL 17; [2003] 2 A.C. 541; [2003] 2 W.L.R. 1060; [2003] 2 All E.R. 615; [2003] 2 All E.R. (Comm) 331; [2005] 1 B.C.L.C. 606; [2003] 1 C.L.C. 1003; [2003] B.L.R. 207; 88 Con. L.R. 208; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 563; (2003) 147 S.J.L.B. 418; Times, April 4, 2003; Official Transcript; HL; 2003-04-03

# R. (on the application of Quintavalle) v Secretary of State for Health

[2003] UKHL 13; [2003] 2 A.C. 687; [2003] 2 W.L.R. 692; [2003] 2 All E.R. 113; [2003] 1 F.C.R. 577; (2003) 71 B.M.L.R. 209; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 439; Times, March 14, 2003; Independent, March 18, 2003; Official Transcript; HL; 2003-03-13

#### L Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust v A

[2003] EWHC 259 (QB); [2003] 1 F.L.R. 1091; [2003] 1 F.C.R. 599; [2003] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 151; (2003) 71 B.M.L.R. 168; [2003] Fam. Law 396; (2003) 100(17) L.S.G. 28; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 351; Times, February 28, 2003; Independent, March 5, 2003; Official Transcript; QBD; 2003-02-26

#### R (A Child) (IVF: Paternity of Child), Re

[2003] EWCA Civ 182; [2003] Fam. 129; [2003] 2 W.L.R. 1485; [2003] 2 All E.R. 131; [2003] 1 F.L.R. 1183; [2003] 1 F.C.R. 481; (2003) 71 B.M.L.R. 157; [2003] Fam. Law 394; (2003) 100(13) L.S.G. 27; (2003) 153 N.L.J. 317; Times, February 20, 2003; Independent, February 25, 2003; CA (Civ Div); 2003-02-19

#### R. (on the application of CD) v Secretary of State for the Home

Page4

#### **Department**

[2003] EWHC 155 (Admin); [2003] 1 F.L.R. 979; [2003] Prison L.R. 220; [2003] A.C.D. 69; [2003] Fam. Law 315; Times, January 27, 2003; Official Transcript; QBD (Admin); 2003-01-16

# R. (on the application of Anderson) v Secretary of State for the Home Department

[2002] UKHL 46; [2003] 1 A.C. 837; [2002] 3 W.L.R. 1800; [2002] 4 All E.R. 1089; [2003] 1 Cr. App. R. 32; [2003] H.R.L.R. 7; [2003] U.K.H.R.R. 112; 13 B.H.R.C. 450; [2003] Prison L.R. 36; (2003) 100(3) L.S.G. 31; (2002) 146 S.J.L.B. 272; Times, November 26, 2002; Independent, November 27, 2002; Official Transcript; HL; 2002-11-25

#### R. v Lichniak (Daniella Helen)

[2002] UKHL 47; [2003] 1 A.C. 903; [2002] 3 W.L.R. 1834; [2002] 4 All E.R. 1122; [2003] 1 Cr. App. R. 33; [2003] H.R.L.R. 8; [2003] U.K.H.R.R. 62; 13 B.H.R.C. 437; [2003] Prison L.R. 55; (2003) 100(5) L.S.G. 29; (2002) 146 S.J.L.B. 272; Times, November 26, 2002; Official Transcript; HL; 2002-11-25

#### L Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust v A (Preliminary Hearing)

[2003] 1 F.L.R. 412; [2003] Fam. Law 95; QBD; 2002-11-04

### R. (on the application of Rose) v Secretary of State for Health

[2002] EWHC 1593 (Admin); [2002] 2 F.L.R. 962; [2002] 3 F.C.R. 731; [2002] U.K.H.R.R. 1329; (2003) 69 B.M.L.R. 83; [2003] A.C.D. 6; [2003] Fam. Law 19; (2002) 99(39) L.S.G. 38; Times, August 22, 2002; Official Transcript; QBD (Admin); 2002-07-26

#### Djebari v Secretary of State for the Home Department

[2002] EWCA Civ 813; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2002-05-13

#### Pretty v United Kingdom (2346/02)

[2002] 2 F.L.R. 45; [2002] 2 F.C.R. 97; (2002) 35 E.H.R.R. 1; 12 B.H.R.C. 149; (2002) 66 B.M.L.R. 147; [2002] Fam. Law 588; (2002) 152 N.L.J. 707; ECHR; 2002-04-29

#### Centre for Reproductive Medicine v U

[2002] EWCA Civ 565; [2002] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 259; Independent, May 1, 2002; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2002-04-24

# R. (on the application of Smeaton) v Secretary of State for Health

[2002] EWHC 610 (Admin); [2002] 2 F.L.R. 146; [2002] 2 F.C.R. 193; (2002) 66 B.M.L.R. 59; [2002] Crim. L.R. 664; [2002] A.C.D. 70; [2002] Fam. Law 664; (2002) 99(22) L.S.G. 33; (2002) 152 N.L.J. 638; (2002) 146 S.J.L.B. 117; Times, May 2, 2002; Daily Telegraph, May 16, 2002; Official Transcript; QBD (Admin); 2002-04-18

# R. (on the application of Amin (Imtiaz)) v Secretary of State for the Home Department

[2002] EWCA Civ 390; [2003] Q.B. 581; [2002] 3 W.L.R. 505; [2002] 4 All E.R. 336; (2002) 166 J.P. 505; [2002] U.K.H.R.R. 846; [2002] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 187; (2003) 69 B.M.L.R. 35; [2002] Po. L.R. 100; [2002] A.C.D. 74; (2002) 166 J.P.N. 529; (2002) 99(19) L.S.G. 29; (2002) 146 S.J.L.B. 101; Times, April 18, 2002; Independent, April 12, 2002; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2002-03-27

#### S (Children) (Care Order: Implementation of Care Plan), Re

[2002] UKHL 10; [2002] 2 A.C. 291; [2002] 2 W.L.R. 720; [2002] 2 All E.R. 192; [2002] 1 F.L.R. 815; [2002] 1 F.C.R. 577; [2002] H.R.L.R. 26; [2002] U.K.H.R.R. 652; [2002] B.L.G.R. 251; [2002] Fam. Law 413; (2002) 99(17) L.S.G. 34; (2002) 146 S.J.L.B. 85; Times, March 15, 2002; Independent, March 20, 2002; Official Transcript; HL; 2002-03-14

#### Wandsworth LBC v Michalak

[2002] EWCA Civ 271; [2003] 1 W.L.R. 617; [2002] 4 All E.R. 1136; [2003] 1 F.C.R. 713; [2002] H.L.R. 39; [2002] N.P.C. 34; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2002-03-06

#### Jennings v Rice

[2002] EWCA Civ 159; [2003] 1 F.C.R. 501; [2003] 1 P. & C.R. 8; [2002] W.T.L.R. 367; [2002] N.P.C. 28; [2002] 2 P. & C.R. DG2; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2002-02-22

# R. (on the application of Assisted Reproduction and Gynaecology Centre) v Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority

[2002] EWCA Civ 20; [2003] 1 F.C.R. 266; [2002] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 148; [2002] Fam. Law 347; (2002) 99(12) L.S.G. 33; Times, March 21, 2002; Independent, February 6, 2002; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2002-01-31

# R. (on the application of P) v Secretary of State for the Home Department

[2001] EWCA Civ 1151; [2001] 1 W.L.R. 2002; [2001] 2 F.L.R. 1122; [2001] 3 F.C.R. 416; [2001] U.K.H.R.R. 1035; [2001] Prison L.R. 297; [2001] Fam. Law 803; (2001) 98(34) L.S.G. 41; (2001) 145 S.J.L.B. 203; Times, August 1, 2001; Independent, October 11, 2001; Daily Telegraph, July 31, 2001; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2001-07-20

#### R. v A (Complainant's Sexual History)

[2001] UKHL 25; [2002] 1 A.C. 45; [2001] 2 W.L.R. 1546; [2001] 3 All E.R. 1; [2001] 2 Cr. App. R. 21; (2001) 165 J.P. 609; [2001] H.R.L.R. 48; [2001] U.K.H.R.R. 825; 11 B.H.R.C. 225; [2001] Crim. L.R. 908; (2001) 165 J.P.N. 750; Times, May 24, 2001; Independent, May 22, 2001; Daily Telegraph, May 29, 2001; Official Transcript; HL; 2001-05-17

# TP v United Kingdom (28945/95)

[2001] 2 F.L.R. 549; [2001] 2 F.C.R. 289; (2002) 34 E.H.R.R. 2; (2001) 3 L.G.L.R. 52; (2001) 4 C.C.L. Rep. 398; [2001] Fam. Law 590; Times, May 31, 2001; ECHR; 2001-05-10

# R. (on the application of Holding & Barnes Plc) v Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

[2001] UKHL 23; [2003] 2 A.C. 295; [2001] 2 W.L.R. 1389; [2001] 2 All E.R. 929; [2002] Env. L.R. 12; [2001] H.R.L.R. 45; [2001] U.K.H.R.R. 728; (2001) 3 L.G.L.R. 38; (2001) 82 P. & C.R. 40; [2001] 2 P.L.R. 76; [2001] J.P.L. 920; [2001] 20 E.G. 228 (C.S.); (2001) 98(24) L.S.G. 45; (2001) 151 N.L.J. 727; (2001) 145 S.J.L.B. 140; [2001] N.P.C. 90; Times, May 10, 2001; Independent, June 25, 2001; Daily Telegraph, May 15, 2001; Official Transcript; HL; 2001-05-09

Page6

# Beach v Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

[2001] EWHC Admin 381; [2002] J.P.L. 185; Official Transcript; QBD (Admin); 2001-05-04

#### Shah v Shah

[2001] EWCA Civ 527; [2002] Q.B. 35; [2001] 3 W.L.R. 31; [2001] 4 All E.R. 138; Times, May 15, 2001; Daily Telegraph, April 24, 2001; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2001-04-10

# R. (on the application of Mellor) v Secretary of State for the Home Department

[2001] EWCA Civ 472; [2002] Q.B. 13; [2001] 3 W.L.R. 533; [2001] 2 F.L.R. 1158; [2001] 2 F.C.R. 153; [2001] H.R.L.R. 38; (2001) 59 B.M.L.R. 1; [2001] Prison L.R. 219; [2001] Fam. Law 736; (2001) 98(22) L.S.G. 35; (2001) 145 S.J.L.B. 117; Times, May 1, 2001; Independent, April 6, 2001; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2001-04-04

#### R. v A (Joinder of Appropriate Minister)

[2001] 1 W.L.R. 789; Times, March 21, 2001; Independent, March 27, 2001; HL; 2001-03-07

#### **Greenfield v Irwin (A Firm)**

[2001] EWCA Civ 113; [2001] 1 W.L.R. 1279; [2001] 1 F.L.R. 899; [2001] P.I.Q.R. Q7; [2001] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 143; (2001) 59
B.M.L.R. 43; Times, February 6, 2001; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2001-01-24

#### Tameside MBC v Barlow Securities Group Services Ltd

[2001] EWCA Civ 1; [2001] B.L.R. 113; 75 Con. L.R. 112; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2001-01-15

#### Lee v Taunton and Somerset NHS Trust

[2001] 1 F.L.R. 419; [2001] Fam. Law 103; QBD; 2000-11-01

### A (Children) (Conjoined Twins: Medical Treatment) (No.1), Re

[2001] Fam. 147; [2001] 2 W.L.R. 480; [2000] 4 All E.R. 961; [2001] 1 F.L.R. 1; [2000] 3 F.C.R. 577; [2000] H.R.L.R. 721; [2001] U.K.H.R.R. 1; 9 B.H.R.C. 261; [2000] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 425; (2001) 57 B.M.L.R. 1; [2001] Crim. L.R. 400; [2001] Fam. Law 18; (2000) 150 N.L.J. 1453; Times, October 10, 2000; Independent, October 3, 2000; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2000-09-22

# **Jabari v Turkey (40035/98)**

9 B.H.R.C. 1; [2001] I.N.L.R. 136; ECHR; 2000-07-11

### R. v DPP Ex p. Kebeline

[2000] 2 A.C. 326; [1999] 3 W.L.R. 972; [1999] 4 All E.R. 801; [2000] 1 Cr. App. R. 275; [2000] H.R.L.R. 93; [2000] U.K.H.R.R. 176; (2000) 2 L.G.L.R. 697; (1999) 11 Admin. L.R. 1026; [2000] Crim. L.R. 486; (1999) 96(43) L.S.G. 32; Times, November 2, 1999; Official Transcript; HL; 1999-10-28

# R. v North West Lancashire HA Ex p. A

[2000] 1 W.L.R. 977; [2000] 2 F.C.R. 525; (1999) 2 C.C.L. Rep. 419; [1999] Lloyd's Rep. Med. 399; (2000) 53 B.M.L.R. 148; Times, August 24, 1999; Independent, October 5, 1999; Official Transcript;

CA (Civ Div); 1999-07-29

#### Yaxley v Gotts

[2000] Ch. 162; [1999] 3 W.L.R. 1217; [2000] 1 All E.R. 711; [1999] 2 F.L.R. 941; (2000) 32 H.L.R. 547; (2000) 79 P. & C.R. 91; [1999] 2 E.G.L.R. 181; [1999] Fam. Law 700; [1999] E.G. 92 (C.S.); (1999) 96(28) L.S.G. 25; (1999) 143 S.J.L.B. 198; [1999] N.P.C. 76; (1999) 78 P. & C.R. D33; Times, July 8, 1999; Independent, July 6, 1999; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 1999-06-24

# Chassagnou v France (25088/94)

(2000) 29 E.H.R.R. 615; 7 B.H.R.C. 151; ECHR; 1999-04-29

### St George's Healthcare NHS Trust v S (Guidelines)

[1999] Fam. 26; (1997-98) 1 C.C.L. Rep. 578; [1998] Fam. Law 662; Times, August 3, 1998; CA (Civ Div); 1998-07-30

## St George's Healthcare NHS Trust v S

[1999] Fam. 26; [1998] 3 W.L.R. 936; [1998] 3 All E.R. 673; [1998] 2 F.L.R. 728; [1998] 2 F.C.R. 685; (1997-98) 1 C.C.L. Rep. 410; (1998) 44 B.M.L.R. 160; [1998] C.O.D. 396; [1998] Fam. Law 526; (1998) 95(22) L.S.G. 29; (1998) 148 N.L.J. 693; (1998) 142 S.J.L.B. 164; Times, May 8, 1998; Independent, May 12, 1998; CA (Civ Div); 1998-05-07

#### Botta v Italy (21439/93)

(1998) 26 E.H.R.R. 241; 4 B.H.R.C. 81; (1999) 2 C.C.L. Rep. 53; [1998] H.R.C.D. 302; ECHR; 1998-02-24

#### Attorney General's Reference (No.3 of 1994), Re

[1998] A.C. 245; [1997] 3 W.L.R. 421; [1997] 3 All E.R. 936; [1998] 1 Cr. App. R. 91; [1997] Crim. L.R. 829; (1997) 94(36) L.S.G. 44; (1997) 147 N.L.J. 1185; (1997) 141 S.J.L.B. 189; Times, July 25, 1997; Independent, October 1, 1997; HL; 1997-07-24

#### Smith v Lawson

(1998) 75 P. & C.R. 466; [1997] E.G. 85 (C.S.); [1997] N.P.C. 87; (1997) 74 P. & C.R. D34; CA (Civ Div); 1997-06-05

## X, Y and Z v United Kingdom (21830/93)

[1997] 2 F.L.R. 892; [1997] 3 F.C.R. 341; (1997) 24 E.H.R.R. 143; (1998) 39 B.M.L.R. 128; [1997] Fam. Law 605; (1997) 94(17) L.S.G. 25; Times, April 23, 1997; Independent, April 24, 1997; ECHR; 1997-04-22

#### U v W (Attorney General Intervening) (No.2)

[1998] Fam. 29; [1997] 3 W.L.R. 739; [1997] 2 C.M.L.R. 431; [1997] Eu. L.R. 350; [1997] 2 F.L.R. 282; [1998] 1 F.C.R. 526; (1997) 38 B.M.L.R. 54; (1997) 141 S.J.L.B. 57; Times, March 4, 1997; Independent, April 14, 1997; Fam Div; 1997-02-19

#### MB (Caesarean Section), Re

[1997] 2 F.L.R. 426; [1997] 2 F.C.R. 541; [1997] 8 Med. L.R. 217; (1997) 38 B.M.L.R. 175; [1997] Fam. Law 542; (1997) 147 N.L.J. 600; Times, April 18, 1997; Independent, April 8, 1997; CA (Civ Div); 1997-02-18

# R. v Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority Ex p. Blood

[1999] Fam. 151; [1997] 2 W.L.R. 806; [1997] 2 All E.R. 687; [1997]

2 C.M.L.R. 591; [1997] Eu. L.R. 370; [1997] 2 F.L.R. 742; [1997] 2 F.C.R. 501; (1997) 35 B.M.L.R. 1; [1997] C.O.D. 261; [1997] Fam. Law 401; (1997) 147 N.L.J. 253; Times, February 7, 1997; Independent, February 11, 1997; CA (Civ Div); 1997-02-06

#### B (Minors) (Care Proceedings: Issue Estoppel), Re

[1997] Fam. 117; [1997] 3 W.L.R. 1; [1997] 2 All E.R. 29; [1997] 1 F.L.R. 285; [1997] 1 F.C.R. 477; [1997] Fam. Law 235; (1997) 161 J.P.N. 358; (1996) 93(44) L.S.G. 30; (1996) 140 S.J.L.B. 252; Times, December 16, 1996; Independent, November 25, 1996; Fam Div; 1996-11-01

#### B (Minors) (Parentage), Re

[1996] 2 F.L.R. 15; [1996] 3 F.C.R. 697; [1996] Fam. Law 536; Fam Div; 1996-02-15

### **Woolwich Building Society v Dickman**

[1996] 3 All E.R. 204; (1996) 28 H.L.R. 661; (1996) 72 P. & C.R. 470; [1996] E.G. 33 (C.S.); [1996] N.P.C. 22; (1996) 72 P. & C.R. D13; Times, March 20, 1996; CA (Civ Div); 1996-02-15

#### **Burton v United Kingdom (31600/96)**

(1996) 22 E.H.R.R. CD134; Eur Comm HR; 1996-01-01

#### Q (A Minor) (Parental Order), Re

[1996] 1 F.L.R. 369; [1996] 2 F.C.R. 345; [1996] Fam. Law 206; Fam Div; 1995-11-23

#### McCann v United Kingdom (A/324)

(1996) 21 E.H.R.R. 97; Times, October 9, 1995; Independent, October 6, 1995; ECHR; 1995-09-27

#### Kroon v Netherlands (A/297-C)

[1995] 2 F.C.R. 28; (1995) 19 E.H.R.R. 263; ECHR; 1994-10-27

#### G (A Minor) (Care Orders: Threshold Conditions), Re

[1995] Fam. 16; [1994] 3 W.L.R. 1211; [1994] 2 F.L.R. 69; 93 L.G.R. 162; [1994] Fam. Law 485; Fam Div; 1993-06-16

#### Airedale NHS Trust v Bland

[1993] A.C. 789; [1993] 2 W.L.R. 316; [1993] 1 All E.R. 821; [1993] 1 F.L.R. 1026; [1994] 1 F.C.R. 485; [1993] 4 Med. L.R. 39; (1993) 12 B.M.L.R. 64; [1993] Fam. Law 473; (1993) 143 N.L.J. 199; Times, February 5, 1993; Independent, February 5, 1993; Guardian, February 5, 1993; HL; 1993-02-04

#### Niemietz v Germany (A/251-B)

(1993) 16 E.H.R.R. 97; ECHR; 1992-12-16

#### Andersson (Margareta) v Sweden (A/226)

(1992) 14 E.H.R.R. 615; ECHR; 1992-02-25

#### Cossey v United Kingdom (10843/84)

[1991] 2 F.L.R. 492; [1993] 2 F.C.R. 97; (1991) 13 E.H.R.R. 622; [1991] Fam. Law 362; Times, October 17, 1990; ECHR; 1990-09-27

#### Gaskin v United Kingdom (A/160)

[1990] 1 F.L.R. 167; (1990) 12 E.H.R.R. 36; Times, August 28,

1989; Official Transcript; ECHR; 1989-07-07

#### Olsson v Sweden (A/130)

(1989) 11 E.H.R.R. 259; Times, March 28, 1988; ECHR; 1988-03-24

### F (In Utero), Re

[1988] Fam. 122; [1988] 2 W.L.R. 1288; [1988] 2 All E.R. 193; [1988] 2 F.L.R. 307; [1988] F.C.R. 529; [1988] Fam. Law 337; (1988) 152 J.P.N. 538; (1988) 138 N.L.J. Rep. 37; (1988) 132 S.J. 820; (1989) 133 S.J. 1088; Times, January 20, 1988; CA (Civ Div); 1988-02-04

#### Kenny v Kelly

[1988] I.R. 457; 1988-01-01

### F v Switzerland (A/128)

(1988) 10 E.H.R.R. 411; ECHR; 1987-12-18

#### Johnston v Ireland (A/112)

(1987) 9 E.H.R.R. 203; Times, January 7, 1987; ECHR; 1986-12-18

### Rees v United Kingdom (A/106)

[1987] 2 F.L.R. 111; [1993] 2 F.C.R. 49; (1987) 9 E.H.R.R. 56; [1987] Fam. Law 157; Times, October 21, 1986; ECHR; 1986-10-17

#### Gillick v West Norfolk and Wisbech AHA

[1986] A.C. 112; [1985] 3 W.L.R. 830; [1985] 3 All E.R. 402; [1986] Crim. L.R. 113; (1985) 82 L.S.G. 3531; (1985) 135 N.L.J. 1055; (1985) 129 S.J. 738; HL; 1985-10-17

#### Abdulaziz v United Kingdom (A/94)

(1985) 7 E.H.R.R. 471; ECHR; 1985-05-28

#### X v Netherlands (A/91)

(1986) 8 E.H.R.R. 235; ECHR; 1985-03-26

### Rasmussen v Denmark (A/87)

(1985) 7 E.H.R.R. 371; ECHR; 1984-11-28

#### Malone v United Kingdom (A/82)

(1985) 7 E.H.R.R. 14; ECHR; 1984-08-02

#### Telfair Shipping Corp v Athos Shipping Co SA (The Athos)

[1983] 1 Lloyd's Rep. 127; CA (Civ Div); 1982-11-18

# Amalgamated Investment & Property Co Ltd (In Liquidation) v Texas Commerce International Bank Ltd

[1982] Q.B. 84; [1981] 3 W.L.R. 565; [1981] 3 All E.R. 577; [1982] 1 Lloyd's Rep. 27; [1981] Com. L.R. 236; (1981) 125 S.J. 623; CA (Civ Div); 1981-07-31

### Paton v United Kingdom (8416/78)

(1981) 3 E.H.R.R. 408; Eur Comm HR; 1980-05-13

## Airey v Ireland (A/32)

(1979-80) 2 E.H.R.R. 305; ECHR; 1979-10-09

#### Marckx v Belgium (A/31)

(1979-80) 2 E.H.R.R. 330; ECHR; 1979-06-13

#### BP Exploration Co (Libya) Ltd v Hunt (No.2)

[1979] 1 W.L.R. 783; (1979) 123 S.J. 455; QBD; 1979-03-16

#### **Brikom Investments Ltd v Carr**

[1979] Q.B. 467; [1979] 2 W.L.R. 737; [1979] 2 All E.R. 753; (1979) 38 P. & C.R. 326; (1979) 251 E.G. 359; CA (Civ Div); 1979-01-16

#### Johnson v Moreton

[1980] A.C. 37; [1978] 3 W.L.R. 538; [1978] 3 All E.R. 37; (1979) 37 P. & C.R. 243; (1978) 247 E.G. 895; (1978) 122 S.J. 697; HL; 1978-07-27

### **Paton v British Pregnancy Advisory Service Trustees**

[1979] Q.B. 276; [1978] 3 W.L.R. 687; [1978] 2 All E.R. 987; (1978) 122 S.J. 744; QBD; 1978-05-24

#### Western Fish Products Ltd v Penwith DC

[1981] 2 All E.R. 204; 77 L.G.R. 185; (1979) 38 P. & C.R. 7; [1978] J.P.L. 627; (1978) 122 S.J. 471; CA (Civ Div); 1978-05-22

#### Bruggemann v Germany (6959/75)

(1981) 3 E.H.R.R. 244; Eur Comm HR; 1977-07-12

### Thoday v Thoday

[1964] P. 181; [1964] 2 W.L.R. 371; [1964] 1 All E.R. 341; (1964) 108 S.J. 15; CA; 1963-12-19

### **Kok Hoong v Leong Cheong Kweng Mines**

[1964] A.C. 993; [1964] 2 W.L.R. 150; [1964] 1 All E.R. 300; (1963) 107 S.J. 1037; PC (FMS); 1963-12-10

# Combe v Combe

[1951] 2 K.B. 215; [1951] 1 All E.R. 767; [1951] 1 T.L.R. 811; (1951) 95 S.J. 317; CA; 1951-03-06

# Canada and Dominion Sugar Co Ltd v Canadian National (West Indies) Steamship Co Ltd

[1947] A.C. 46; (1947) 80 Ll. L. Rep. 13; 62 T.L.R. 666; [1947] L.J.R. 385; PC (Can); 1946-10-24

### Central London Property Trust Ltd v High Trees House Ltd

[1947] K.B. 130; [1956] 1 All E.R. 256 (Note); 62 T.L.R. 557; [1947] L.J.R. 77; 175 L.T. 333; KBD; 1946-07-18

### **Hughes v Metropolitan Railway Co**

(1876-77) L.R. 2 App. Cas. 439; HL; 1877-06-05

#### **All Cases Citing**

# Mentioned by

Holdich v Lothian Health Board

[2013] CSOH 197; Official Transcript; OH; 2013-12-19

### Mentioned by

R (A Child) (IVF: Paternity of Child), Re

[2005] UKHL 33; [2005] 2 A.C. 621; [2005] 2 W.L.R. 1158; [2005] 4

All E.R. 433; [2005] 2 F.L.R. 843; [2005] 2 F.C.R. 223; [2005] Fam. Law 701; (2005) 102(21) L.S.G. 33; (2005) 155 N.L.J. 797; Times, May 13, 2005; Independent, May 17, 2005; Official Transcript; HL; 2005-05-12

# Significant Legislation Cited

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) para.4(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) para.4(2)(a)

Human Rights Act 1998 Sch.1 Part I Art.8

# **Legislation Cited**

Child Support Act 1991 (c.48)

Child Support Act 1991 (c.48) s.1(1)

Child Support Act 1991 (c.48) s.6

Children Act 1989 (c.41)

Children Act 1989 (c.41) Part 4

Children Act 1989 (c.41) s.1(3)

Children Act 1989 (c.41) s.13(5)

Children Act 1989 (c.41) s.28(6)

Children Act 1989 (c.41) s.31

Children Act 1989 Part IV

Code of Practice

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.1

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.12

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.14

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.2

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.2(1)

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.8

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.8(1)

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms art.8(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.2 para.1

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.2 para.1(d)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.2 para.2

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3

<u>Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3</u> para.1(2)(a)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.2

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.2(1)(b)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.3

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.3(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.4

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.4(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.4(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.4(2)(a)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.6

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.6(3)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) Sch.3 para.8(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) art.8(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) art.8(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) para.4(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) para.4(2)(a)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.1

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.1(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.11

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.11(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.12

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.12(c)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.13(5)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.2(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.23(3)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.25(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.25(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.28

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.28(2)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.28(3)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.28(3)(a)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.28(6)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.29

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.3

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.3(1)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.4

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.4(1)(b)

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (c.37) s.41(2)(a)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.1(1)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.1(2)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.12

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.12(c)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.3

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.3(1)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.4

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.4(2)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.4(4)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.6(1)

Human Rights Act 1998 (c.42) s.6(2)

Human Rights Act 1998 Sch.1

Human Rights Act 1998 Sch.1 Part I Art.8

Matrimonial Causes Act 1973 (c.18) s.34

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.1(1)(a)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.11(1)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.12(c)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.13(5)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.2(1)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.25(1)

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.3

Surrogacy Arrangements Act 1985 (c.49) s.41(2)(a)

#### **Journal Articles**

# Embryo legal challenge ends

Consent; Discrimination; Embryology; Estoppel; In vitro fertilisation; Right to respect for private and family life.

Fam. L.J. 2007, 67(Jun), 11-13

### Privacy and open justice in the family courts - Part 2

Children; Family proceedings; Hearings in open court; Privacy;

Public interest; Reporting restrictions.

Fam. Law 2007, 37(Apr), 326-330

#### Battle over frozen embryos continues

Consent; Embryology; In vitro fertilisation; Right to life; Right to respect for private and family life.

Fam. L.J. 2006, 56(May), 3-5

# Evans v Amicus Healthcare; Hadley v Midland Fertility Services - revealing cracks in the "twin pillars"?

Assisted reproduction; Childrens welfare; Consent; Human rights; Variation.

C.F.L.Q. 2004, 16(4), 437-452

# Consent, frozen embryos, procreative choice and the ideal family.

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Right to respect for private and family life.

C.L.J. 2004, 63(1), 47-49

### Discord and disposal of embryos

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Right to respect for private and family life.

Edin. L.R. 2004, 8(1), 84-93

# Mix-ups, mistake and moral judgement: recent developments in UK law on assisted conception.

Assisted reproduction; Consent; Feminist jurisprudence; Paternity; Socio legal studies.

Fem. L.S. 2004, 12(1), 67-77

### Frozen embryos, frozen hearts, frozen law?

Assisted reproduction; Consent; Embryology; In vitro fertilisation; Right to life; Right to respect for private and family life.

N.L.J. 2004, 154(7140), 1206-1207

# Health and medical treatment: consent to IVF treatment: Articles 2 and 8 ECHR.

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Right to life; Right to respect for private and family life; Withdrawal.

P.L. 2004, Sum, 428-429

#### Clinical negligence update (May)

S.J. 2004, 148(21), 625-626, 628

# Clinical negligence update (May)

Body parts; Care expenses; Causation; Children; Clinical negligence; Codes of practice; Consent; Cosmetic surgery; Costs; Expert evidence; Future loss; Group litigation orders; In vitro fertilisation; Measure of damages; Mental patients rights; Post mortems; Retention; Seclusion; Wrongful birth.

S.J. 2004, 148(21), 625-626, 628

Whether applicants could use frozen embryos once consent had been withdrawn by male partners.

Assisted reproduction; Consent; Embryology; Right to life; Right to marry; Right to respect for private and family life.

S.L. Rev. 2004, 41(Spr), 2-3

#### The frozen embryos case: a comment.

Assisted reproduction; Consent; In vitro fertilisation; Paternity; Spouses.

Childright 2003, 200, 16-17

# Human rights: a review of the year

Asylum; Coroners; Discrimination; Environmental liability; Health; Immunities; Measure of damages; Privacy; Public authorities; Right to fair trial.

E.H.R.L.R. 2003, 6, 587-600

# Consenting adults?

Assisted reproduction; Consent; In vitro fertilisation; Infertility; Right to life; Right to respect for private and family life.

Fam. L.J. 2003/04, 32(Dec/Jan), 2-4

#### Medical law.

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Right to respect for private and family life.

Fam. Law 2003, 33(Dec), 879-881

# Human reproduction and the law: consent withdrawn for embryo use.

Consent; In vitro fertilisation; Right to respect for private and family life; Withdrawal.

Med. L. Mon. 2003, Oct, 6-7

#### Consent: IVF treatment.

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Promissory estoppel; Right to respect for private and family life.

Med. Lit. 2003, 10(Oct), 4-5

#### Public law update (October)

Asylum seekers; Category A prisoners; Community care; Consultation; Disabled persons; Disclosure; Grants; Inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment; Local government finance; Prisoners rights; Reports; Right to fair trial; Right to respect for private and family life.

N.L.J. 2003, 153(7099), 1515-1516

#### IVF and consent.

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Promissory estoppel; Right to life; Right to marry; Right to respect for private and family life; Withdrawal.

S.J. 2003, 147(40), 1196-1197

# Human rights and embryos.

Consent; Discrimination; In vitro fertilisation; Right to life; Right to marry; Right to respect for private and family life.

Soc. L. 2003, 37(Oct), 8-9

#### **Books**

# Chitty on Contracts 31st Ed. Incorporating First Supplement

Chapter: Chapter 3 - Consideration

Documents: Sub-section (iii) - Equitable Mitigations

### Chitty on Contracts 31st Ed.

Chapter: Chapter 3 - Consideration

Documents: Sub-section (iii) - Equitable Mitigations

# Jackson & Powell on Professional Liability 7th Ed. Incorporating Second Cumulative Supplement

Chapter: Chapter 7 - Human Rights and Professionals

Documents: Sub-section (iv) - Article 8

# Jackson & Powell on Professional Liability 7th Ed.

Chapter: Chapter 7 - Human Rights and Professionals

Documents: Sub-section (iv) - Article 8

# Phipson on Evidence 18th Ed.

Chapter: Chapter 5 - Estoppels

Documents: Sub-section (c) - Promissory estoppel

© 2014 Sweet & Maxwell

