

Other suggestions by line number(s):

- 45-48 Sentence is difficult to parse and I am not sure what point you are trying to make. Are you trying to make the point that using popular frameworks are insufficient to run scientific benchmarks across HPC systems?
- 57 “Hence they...” → “Hence, they...”
- 60-61 “independently” twice is redundant
- 63 Be consistent with the capitalization of “Cloudmesh”. From the Cloudmesh documentation, it looks like “Cloudmesh” should be capitalized. This is throughout the paper.
- 66 What is “cloudmask”? Is there a reference to this?
- 80 “Hence in...” → “Hence, in...”
- 86 “Energy consumption...” → “energy consumption...”
- 109 Need to clarify and define “experiment executions” and “workflow”. Used interchangeably in the paper which is confusing.
- 112 Suggest separating the sentences
- 115-117 Clarify the connection between “bottom-up approach” and “multiple experiment runs”
- 118 “...where we from the application users learn what features...” → “...where we learn from the application users what features...”
- 123 “...which a distributed as part...” → “...which are distributed as part...”
- 131 “requirements” is redundant
- 131 “a Section about the requirements...” → “a section about the requirements...”
- 134 Should explain what kind of “cloud”, eg, “public cloud”
- 135 Is the “experiment executor” part of Cloudmesh? If so, you should use “Cloudmesh Experiment Executor”
- 140 “issue” is strange here. What issue are you talking about?
- 161 What is “futures from Karajan”?
- 162 “As part of the CoG Kit van Laszewski...” → “As part of the CoG Kit, van Laszewski...”
- 170 “Google, and Azure, OpenStack...” → “Google, Azure, and OpenStack...”
- 171 Spell out “e.g.” to be consistent
- 211 Confusing sentence. Can the framework or Frontier dynamically schedule system workloads? Also, “, predict power...” → “, predicts power...”
- 222-224 Split the sentences. “...scaled pipeline, each individual...” → “...scaled pipeline. Each individual...”
- 299 “Scientific Workflows must...” → “Scientific workflows must...”
- 312-313 “...heterogeneous loosely coupled resources.” → “heterogeneous, loosely-coupled resources.”
- 317-318 Last sentence in the paragraph does not make sense
- 323-327 If 100% of the system are Linux based then why discuss Windows?
- 329 (summary box) “...workflows utilizing the. The same is...” is missing words
- 346 “When using HPC systems users typically...” → “When using HPC systems, users typically...”
- 361 “for large-scale HPC but it is...” → “for large-scale HPC, but it is...”

- 369 "...resources for experiments dedicated support..." → "...resource for experiments, dedicated support..."
- 378 "While for example, the application..." → "While, for example, the application..."
Can even drop "for example"
- 379 "interface an application developer..." → "interface, an application developer..."
- 418 Missing reference?
- 419-426 Should be one paragraph
- 428 "backends we can flexibly..." → "back ends we can flexibly..."
- 430 Delete "for example"
- 433 "API, for our work." → "API for our work."
- 434 "Obviously we also can leverage..." → "Obviously, we can also leverage..."
- 443 Where does Windows come from?
- 445 "Unfortunately MongoDB changed in 2018 the license and..." → "Unfortunately, in 2018 MongoDB changed its license and..."
- 452 Missing reference?
- 453 "...nonpublic domain software that provides license" → "...nonpublic domain software with license"
- 454 "annonced" → "announced"
- 457-460 Explain the reasons for using Apache and BSD licenses
- 463 "This for example" → "This" In general, "for example" is used too much in the paper
- 467-476 These all seem to be "divide and conquer" examples. A single example would be sufficient to make your point. How do the frameworks support "divide and conquer"?
- 475 "GPUS" → "GPUs"
- 512-515 Why is splitVPN a security requirement? As the paper states, it was just an obstacle that had to be overcome
- 520 What are the storage requirements? Are objects, files, and/or blocks required? How much storage is required?
- 521 "In order to support data benchmark requirements we need to..." → "In order to support data benchmark requirements, we need to..."
- 522-523 Reword the sentence. Cannot understand the point you are trying to make. I believe you are talking about ephemeral data that is generated in training runs.
- 582 Missing reference?
- 584 Missing reference?
- 601 "...the FAIR Principles call..." → "...the FAIR principles call..." Be consistent with your capitalization
- 603 "...the FAIR Principles varies..." → "...the FAIR principles varies..." Be consistent with your capitalization
- 637 "...to deploy long-running." → "...to deploy long-running jobs."
- 642 "...long-term storage, however by its nature..." → "...long-term storage, however, by its nature..."
- 644-647 Disagree. First, containers run on bare metal. They just include a software environment "snapshot". While HPC systems do not change hardware and software frequently, containers help with portability ACROSS HPC systems which is a big issue that I think Cloudmesh and SmartSim should address.

- 692 “Thus we can support...” → “Thus, we can support...”
- 712 “Hence we have provided...” → “Hence, we have provided...”
- 715-718 What are the expected runtimes?
- 732 “...features describing Smartsim and then...” → “...features describing SmartSim and then...”
- 816 Missing reference to figure?
- 819-825 Not necessary to explain HPC systems
- 869-874 Should be one paragraph
- 876 “...the compute coordinator (CC) is to...” → “...the Compute Coordinator (CC) is to...” Be consistent with your capitalization
- 877 “...LSF, SLURm, and” → “...LSF, SLURM, and”
- 881 Delete “for example”
- 894 What is meant by “where it results from”?
- 911-913 Do not understand this sentence
- 916 “provided in 9 a view...” → “provided in Figure 9 a view...”
- 929 Is “cloudmesh-ee framework” the same as EE? If so, then use EE instead of “cloudmesh-ee framework” throughout the paper
- 935 “Thus the EE supports...” → “Thus, EE supports...”
- 964 What is “gridsearches”?
- 970 Delete “for example”
- 971-973 Need commas after each item
- 1014, 1022 Why are there quotes in the paragraph? If the paragraph is being quoted from documentation elsewhere, then the usual style is to indent the paragraph
- 1045-1046 Is this redundant after explaining StopWatch.event above?
- 1060 Missing reference?
- 1067 “Using cloudmesh create a fully...” → “Using the Cloudmesh create plugin, a fully...”
- 1086 Is a detailed pricing discussion relevant? What does it contribute to the understanding of Cloudmesh and SmartSim?