

Solutions to Topology by Conover

niceguy

July 4, 2022

1 Some Familiar Topological Spaces and Basic Topological Concepts

1.1 Exercises 1.2

1. Let $A = (0, 1) \cup (1, 3)$. For the given $x \in A$, give a value of $r > 0$ such that $(x - r, x + r) \subseteq A$.

(a) $x = \frac{3}{4}$

(b) $x = 2$

(c) $x = \frac{9}{8}$

Solution: $\frac{1}{16}$

2. Prove that $A = (0, 1) \cup (1, 3)$ is an open subset of \mathbb{R} .

Solution:

Case 1: $x \in (0, 1)$

Let $d = \min\{1 - x, x\}$. $(x - \frac{d}{2}, x + \frac{d}{2}) \subseteq A$ is an open set.

Case 2: $x \in (1, 3)$

Let $d = \min\{3 - x, x - 1\}$. The proof proceeds similarly as Case 1.

As $\forall x \in A \exists$ an open interval $\subseteq A$ which contains x , A is an open set by definition.

3. Prove that an ordinary open interval is an open subset of \mathbb{R} but that an open set need *not* be an open interval.

Solution:

All open intervals are open subsets:

Replace 0 with $x - r$ and 1 with $x + r$ as in Case 1 from the question above.

Open sets need not be an open interval:

The empty set is an open set, but no open interval is empty, as it contains x (open intervals are in the form $(x - r, x + r)$).

4. State precisely what it means when a subset A of \mathbb{R} is *not* open.

Solution: $\exists x \in A$ such that $(x - r, x + r) - A \neq \emptyset \forall r > 0$

5. Prove that the following subsets of \mathbb{R} are not open.

(a) The set of rational numbers

Solution:

An open interval is nonempty. As it is an open set, it cannot contain a single point only (next question) so it must contain at least 2 points. WLOG, let the 2 points be $p < q$. Using limits, $\exists n \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $r = p + \frac{\sqrt{2}}{n} < q$. Since all open intervals contain an irrational r , no open intervals can be a subset of the rationals, hence it is not open.

(b) A set consisting of a single point

Solution:

\forall open intervals $(x - r, x + r)$, it contains the distinct points x and $x + \frac{r}{2}$. Therefore, $\{x\}$ cannot be open.

(c) An interval of the form $[a, b)$, where $a < b$

Solution:

\forall open intervals $(a - r, a + r)$, $b = a - \frac{r}{2}$ is a point in that interval which is outside of $[a, b)$.

(d) The set $A = \{x \in \mathbb{R} : x \neq \frac{1}{n}, \text{ for } n \in \mathbb{Z}^+\}$

Solution:

$\frac{1}{n}$ tends to 0. Therefore $\forall r > 0 \exists n \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $r > \frac{1}{n}$. Therefore all open intervals $(0 - r, 0 + r)$ contains a point outside of A .

1.2 Theorem 1.3

6. (a) The union of any collection of open subsets of the real line is also an open subset of the line

Solution:

Let $\bigcup A$ denote the union of subsets A . Then

$$x \in \bigcup A \Rightarrow x \in A \Rightarrow x \in (x - r, x + r) \subseteq A \subseteq \bigcup A$$

for some $r > 0$.

As all points in $\bigcup A$ are in open intervals which are subsets of $\bigcup A$, the union is open by definition.

(b) The intersection of any finite collection of open subsets of the real line is also an open subset of the line.

Solution:

This can be proven with induction.

Let A and B be open sets. $x \in A \cap B \Rightarrow x \in A$. Since A is open, $\exists r_A > 0$ such that

$$x \in (x - r_A, x + r_A) \subseteq A$$

The same holds for B . Letting $r = \min\{r_A, r_B\}$,

$$x \in (x - r, x + r) \subseteq A \cap B \forall x \in A \cap B$$

The same proof is used for the base case and the induction step.

- (c) Both the empty set and \mathbb{R} itself are open subsets of the real line.

Solution:

Empty set:

$$a \Rightarrow b$$

is defined to be true when a is false. The definition of an open set A involves the assumption $x \in A$, which is false, so it is vacuously true for the empty set.

\mathbb{R} :

$$\forall x \in \mathbb{R}, (x - 1, x + 1) \subseteq \mathbb{R}$$

1.3 Exercise 1.4

7. Give an example of an infinite collection of open subsets of the real line whose intersection is not open, thus showing that the finiteness condition in Theorem 1.3(b) is necessary.

Solution:

$$\bigcap A \text{ where } A = \{(-r, r) | r > 0\}$$

Obviously $0 \in (-r, r) \forall r > 0$. However, the intersection does not contain any nonzero element, because $\forall x \neq 0$,

$$x \notin \left\{-\frac{|x|}{2}, \frac{|x|}{2}\right\}$$

The open intervals that form the intersection are open sets, but the intersection contains only 1 element, so it is not open.

1.4 Theorem 1.6

8. (a) The intersection of any collection of closed sets is closed.

Solution:

Let C_i be a closed set, and the corresponding open set be defined as $O_i = \mathbb{R} - C_i$.

$$\bigcap_{i \in I} C_i = \bigcap_{i \in I} \mathbb{R} - O_i = \mathbb{R} - \bigcup_{i \in I} O_i$$

$\bigcup_{i \in I} O_i$ is a union of open sets, so it is open. Hence its complement (intersection of closed sets) is closed.

- (b) The union of any finite collection of closed sets is closed.

Solution:

$$\bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} C_n = \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \mathbb{R} - O_n = \mathbb{R} - \bigcap_{n \in \mathbb{N}} O_n$$

And the proof follows similar to the case above.

- (c) \emptyset and \mathbb{R} itself are both closed

Solution: Their complements are each other, which are open.

1.5 Exercise 1.7

9. State precisely what it means when a subset of \mathbb{R} is not closed. (Do this in term of points; saying that a set is not closed if its complement is not open is true, but is not what we want here.

Solution:

Let that subset be A . It is not closed when there is a point outside of it whose every open interval intersects with A .

$$\exists x \in \mathbb{R} - A \text{ such that } (x - r, x + r) \cap A \neq \emptyset \forall r > 0$$

10. Which of the following subsets of \mathbb{R} are closed? Which are open?

- (a) The set \mathbb{Z} of integers.
- (b) The set of rational numbers.
- (c) A set consisting of a single point.
- (d) An interval of the form $[a, b)$, where $a < b$.
- (e) The set $A = \{x \in \mathbb{R} : x \neq \frac{1}{n} \text{ for } n \in \mathbb{Z}^+\}$.
- (f) The set $A = \{x \in \mathbb{R} : x \neq \frac{1}{n} \text{ for } n \in \mathbb{Z}^+ \text{ and } x \neq 0\}$.

Solution:

Closed: a, c

Open: f

11. Prove that an ordinary closed interval is a closed subset of \mathbb{R} , but a closed set need not be a closed interval.

Solution:

Let the closed interval be $[a, b]$, where $a < b$. We want to prove that its complement is open. Let $x < a$ be in its complement. Then

$$(x - r, x + r) \text{ where } r = \frac{a - x}{2}$$

is an open interval in its complement. A similar open interval can be deduced for $x > b$. Therefore, the complement is open, and the closed interval is closed.

For the second part of the question, note that \mathbb{R} is closed, but is not a closed interval. (Or else, let $\mathbb{R} = [a, b]$, and $\mathbb{R} - [a, b] \neq \emptyset$ forms a contradiction.)

12. Give an example of an infinite collection of closed subsets of whose union is not closed, thus showing that the finiteness condition in theorem 1.6(b) is not necessary.

Solution:

Let the collection be

$$A = \{[-r, r] | 0 < r < 1\}$$

It is obvious that $\bigcup A = (-1, 1)$. The complement of $(-1, 1)$ contains 1, whose every open interval intersects with $(-1, 1)$. Hence the complement is not open, so $\bigcup A$ is not closed.

1.6 Exercise 2.3

13. Show that the absolute value formula, $d(x, y) = |x - y|$ is indeed a metric on the real line. Describe the **1-ball** centered at 0 in the topology induced by this metric.

Solution: Trivial.

$$1. |x - y| \geq 0 \forall \{x, y\} \subset \mathbb{R}$$

$$2. |x - y| = 0 \text{ iff } x = y$$

$$3. |x - z| + |y - z| = |x - z| + |z - y| \geq |x - z + z - y| = |x - y|$$

The 1-ball is ordinary closed interval $(-1, 1)$.

14. Show that the distance formula is a metric on the Euclidean plane. Describe the 1-ball centered at $(0, 0)$ in the topology induced by this metric.

Solution:

In fact, this can be proven for all finite Euclidean spaces \mathbb{R}^n , where

$$d(x, y) = \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - y_i)^2}$$

$d(x, y) \geq 0 \forall \{x, y\} \subset \mathbb{R}^n$, $d(x, y) = 0$ iff $x = y$, $d(x, y) = d(y, x) \forall \{x, y\} \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ are all trivial. What remains is the triangle inequality. Let $a_i = x_i - z_i$ and $b_i = z_i - y_i$. Therefore $a_i + b_i = x_i - y_i$.

$$d(x, z) + d(y, z) = \sqrt{\sum_i a_i^2} + \sqrt{\sum_i b_i^2}$$

$$(d(x, z) + d(y, z))^2 = \sum_i (a_i^2 + b_i^2) + 2\sqrt{\left(\sum_i a_i^2\right)\left(\sum_i b_i^2\right)}$$

$$(d(x, z) + d(y, z))^2 - (d(x, y))^2 = 2\left(\sqrt{\left(\sum_i a_i^2\right)\left(\sum_i b_i^2\right)} - \sum_i a_i b_i\right)$$

This is greater than 0 (from the Cauchy-Schwarz Inequality). Rearranging and taking the square root of both sides (we can do this because the distance formula is always positive) yields the desired inequality.

The 1-ball is the open disk with a radius of 1.

15. Define the obvious metric for Euclidean 3-space, $E^3 = \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} = \{(x, y, z) : x, y, z \in \mathbb{R}\}$. Describe the 1-ball centered at the point $(0, 0, 0)$ in the topology induced by this metric. (In this topology, an r ball really is a ball - hence the name " r -ball.")

Solution: The metric is defined in the question above, and the 1-ball is an open sphere with a radius of 1.

16. Show that for any metric space (X, d) ,
- (a) The union of any collection of open sets is open.

Solution:

Let O_i be open. Then

$$x \in \bigcup_i O_i \Rightarrow x \in O_i \Rightarrow x \in S_r(x) \subseteq O_i$$

Since $O_i \subseteq \bigcup O_i$, we have

$$x \in \bigcup_i O_i \Rightarrow x \in S_r(x) \subseteq \bigcup_i O_i$$

- (b) The intersection of any finite collection of open sets is open.

Solution:

Similar to the metric case, this can be proven using induction.

Let A and B be open sets.

$$x \in A \cap B \Rightarrow x \in A \Rightarrow x \in S_{r_A}(x) \subseteq A$$

Similarly,

$$x \in S_{r_B}(x) \subseteq B$$

Letting $r = \min\{r_A, r_B\}$, we have

$$x \in A \cap B \Rightarrow x \in S_r(x) \subseteq A \cap B$$

- (c) The empty set and X itself are open.

Solution:

The fact that the empty set is open is vacuously true, and the definition of $S_r(x)$ implies $S_r(x) \subseteq X$, so X is also open.

17. A set can have more than one metric defined on it, and different metrics may give rise to different topologies.

- (a) Let $X = \mathbb{R}$ and define a metric on X by $d(x, y) = 1$ if $x \neq y$, $d(x, y) = 0$ if $x = y$. Prove that d is a metric on X . What is $S_{\frac{1}{2}}(0)$ in this metric? Is (X, d) the same space as \mathbb{R} with its usual metric topology? In other words, does this metric give rise to the same topology on \mathbb{R} as the usual metric does?

Solution:

The fact that d is a metric is trivial. $S_{\frac{1}{2}}(0) = \{0\}$. This metric gives rise to a different topology, as $\{0\}$ is open in this topology, but not the usual topology.

- (b) Let X be the Euclidean plane and define a metric on X by $d((x_1, x_2), (y_1, y_2)) = |x_1 - y_1| + |x_2 - y_2|$. Prove that d is a metric on the plane, and describe the r -balls in this metric. Does this metric give rise to the same topology as the usual metric on this plane?

Solution:

$d(x, y) \geq 0 \forall \{x, y\} \subset \mathbb{R}^n$, $d(x, y) = 0$ iff $x = y$, $d(x, y) = d(y, x) \forall \{x, y\} \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ are all trivial. What remains is the triangle inequality.

$$\begin{aligned} d(x, z) + d(y, z) &= |x_1 - z_1| + |x_2 - z_2| + |y_1 - z_1| + |y_2 - z_2| \\ &= |x_1 - z_1| + |z_1 - y_1| + |x_2 - z_2| + |z_2 - y_2| \\ &> |x_1 - y_1| + |x_2 - y_2| \\ &= d(x, y) \end{aligned}$$

The r -balls of x are open squares centered at x with sides of length r . It is obvious that all open disks D centered at x contain open squares S also centered at x , (such that $x \in S \subset D$) and vice versa. If A is an open set under the usual topology, then

$$x \in A \Rightarrow x \in D$$

Combining this with

$$x \in S \subset D$$

we have

$$x \in A \Rightarrow x \in S$$

so A is an open set under this metric. Similarly, if B is an open set under this metric, B is also an open set under the usual metric. Therefore, both topologies are the same.

1.7 Exercise 3.3

18. Let (\mathbb{Q}, d) be the space of rational numbers with the metric topology induced by the absolute value metric d .

- (a) Show that the set $\{y \in \mathbb{Q} : 1 < y < 2\}$ is open in (\mathbb{Q}, d) .

Solution:

Denote the set as A . Let $r = \min\{\frac{2-y}{2}, \frac{y-1}{2}\}$. Then

$$y \in (y-r, y+r) \cap A \subseteq A \forall y \in A$$

- (b) Show that the set $[\sqrt{2}, \sqrt{3}] \cap \mathbb{Q}$ is open in (\mathbb{Q}, d) .

Solution: Noting that both $\sqrt{2}$ and $\sqrt{3}$ are not in the set, the proof can be obtained by replacing the rationals 1 and 2 in the solution above.

19. Let $S = [1, 2]$ be given the topology induced by the absolute value metric. Show that $[1, \frac{3}{2})$, $(\frac{3}{2}, 2]$ and $[1, 2]$ are all open in (S, d) .

Solution:

For the first set, if $x \neq 1$, let $r = \min\{\frac{3}{2} - x, x - 1\}$. Then $S_r(x) \cap [1, \frac{3}{2}) = S_r(x)$, and so

$$x \in [1, \frac{3}{2}) \Rightarrow x \in S_r(x) \subset [1, \frac{3}{2})$$

If $x = 1$, then $r = \frac{5}{4}$ suffices.

A similar approach is used for the second and third set, noting the special cases for $x = 1$ and $x = 2$.

20. Let (\mathbb{Z}, d) be the space of integers with the metric topology induced by the absolute value metric. Show that *every* subset of \mathbb{Z} is open in (\mathbb{Z}, d) . In particular, any set consisting of a single point is open in (\mathbb{Z}, d) .

Solution:

Let A be a subset, and let $r = \frac{1}{2}$. Then $\forall x \in A$,

$$x \in S_r(x) \cap A = \{x\} \subseteq A$$

21. Let (X, d) be a discrete space. Show that every subset of X is open in (X, d) .

Solution:

Let A be a subset. Then

$$A = \bigcup \{\{x\} | x \in A\}$$

which is the union of open sets, so A is also open.

1.8 Theorem 4.1

22. A subset A of \mathbb{R} is open in the metric topology induced by the absolute value metric if and only if for each point $x \in A$, there exist real numbers a and b with $a < x < b$, such that $x \in (a, b) \subseteq A$.

Solution: \Leftarrow :

Let $r = \min\{x - a, b - x\}$. Then $\forall x \in A$,

$$x \in (x - r, x + r) \subseteq (a, b) \subseteq A$$

 \Rightarrow :

As A is open,

$$x \in A \Rightarrow x \in S_r(x)$$

so $a = x - r$ and $b = x + r$ suffices.

1.9 Exercise 4.3

23. Convince yourself that the real line is a totally ordered set. Give an example of a set with an order relation that satisfies (1), (2), and (3) of Definition 4.2, but does *not* satisfy (4). Such an ordered set is called **partially ordered** since not every pair of elements can be compared. [*Hint*: Consider $\mathcal{P}(X)$ with " \leq " thought as "subset of"].

Solution:

Intuitively, real numbers satisfy (1) through (4). A rigorous proof involves Dedekind cuts, which is (probably) out of the scope of this book.

\subseteq in $\mathcal{P}(X)$ is one such example. (1) and (3) are trivial, and (2) is true by definition. However, $\{1, 2\}$ and $\{3, 4\}$ are elements of $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ where both elements cannot be compared.

1.10 Exercise 4.5

24. Every open subset of \mathbb{R} has cardinality c

Solution:

Let A be an open subset. $\forall x \in A$,

$$x \in (x - r, x + r) \subseteq A$$

The function

$$f(y) = \frac{y - x}{r} \times \frac{\pi}{2}$$

is a bijection from $(x - r, x + r)$ to \mathbb{R} , so they share the same cardinality c . As

$$(x - r, x + r) \subseteq A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$$

$|A| = c$ by the Cantor-Bernstein Theorem.

25. For any positive integer n , there are open subsets of $[0, \Omega)$ with cardinality n . In particular, there are points x in $[0, \Omega)$ such that the singleton set $\{x\}$ is an open set. But $[0, \Omega)$ is not discrete - not every singleton set is open.

Solution:

$[1, n]$ is a set with cardinality n . To show that it is open, $\forall x \in [1, n]$,

$$0 < x < n + 1 \text{ such that } x \in (0, n + 1) \subseteq A$$

Putting $n = 1$ gives us a singleton set that is open. However, not all singleton sets are open, e.g. $\{\omega\}$. For it to be open, $a < \omega < b$ such that

$$\omega \in (a, b) \subseteq \{\omega\}$$

Since ω is a limit ordinal, $a < a + 1 < \omega < b$, so

$$a + 1 \in (a, b) - \{\omega\}$$

which is a contradiction.

26. There are open subsets of $[0, \Omega)$ of cardinality \aleph_0 and there are open subsets of $[0, \Omega)$ of cardinality \aleph_1 .

Solution:

$\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$, $[n + 1, \omega)$ is a subset of cardinality \aleph_0 . To show that it is open, $\forall x \in [n + 1, \omega)$,

$$n < x < \omega \text{ such that } x \in (n, \omega) \subseteq [n + 1, \omega)$$

Similarly, $[n + 1, \Omega)$ is a subset of cardinality \aleph_1 . The bijective function from $[0, \Omega)$ to $[n + 1, \Omega)$ is given by

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} x + n + 1 & x \in \mathbb{N} \\ x & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

To show that it is open, $\forall x \in [n + 1, \Omega)$,

$$n < x < \Omega \text{ such that } x \in (n, \Omega) \subseteq [n + 1, \Omega)$$

27. Supplementary: No countable collection of subsets of $[0, \Omega]$ intersect at $\{\Omega\}$ only.

Solution:

Let A_n be an open set in the collection. Since $\Omega \in A$,

$$\Omega \in (a_n, \Omega] \subseteq A$$

Where $(a_n, \Omega] = [a_n + 1, \Omega]$. Let $b_n = a_n + 1$, and consider

$$b = \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} b_n$$

The union of ordinals (b) is an ordinal that is greater than all of the ordinals in the union ($b > b_n$). Since we have subsets of A_n ,

$$\bigcap_{n \in \mathbb{N}} [b_n, \Omega] \subseteq \bigcap_{n \in \mathbb{N}} A_n$$

Since $b > b_n \forall n \in \mathbb{N}$, b is an element of the set in the left, meaning the countable ordinal b is an element of the intersection, which is a contradiction.

1.11 Exercise 4.6

28. Show that $\omega = [0, \omega)$ with the order topology is a discrete space, so is the same as $\mathbb{Z}^+ \cap \{0\}$ when given the metric topology induced by the absolute value metric on \mathbb{R} .

Solution:

First we prove that all singleton sets $\{x\}$ are open.

$$x = 0 \Rightarrow x \in [0, 1) \subseteq \{0\}$$

$$x \neq 0 \Rightarrow x \in (x - 1, x + 1) \subseteq \{x\}$$

Note that $x - 1$ exists $\forall x \neq 0$, as x is a nonzero natural number.

Since

$$\omega = \mathbb{Z}^+ \cup \{0\}$$

and both are discrete, they are the same.

29. The definition of the order topology is given in terms of open intervals. Let (X, \leq) be a totally ordered set and give it the order topology. Show that a subset of x is open in the order topology if and only if it is a union of open intervals. Because of this, we say that the collection of open intervals is a *basis* for the order topology on a totally ordered set.

Solution:

Let A be an open subset. Since A is open, $\forall x \in A$,

$$x \in O_x \subseteq A$$

where O_x denotes an open interval containing x that is a subset of A . Then

$$A = \bigcup_{x \in A} O_x$$

So all open sets are unions of open intervals O_x . Since open intervals are open sets (this can easily be observed), any union of open intervals are open sets.

1.12 Exercise 5.3

30. State precisely what it means when a sequence in (X, d) does not converge to the point $x \in X$.

Solution: $\forall N \in \mathbb{N} > 0, r > 0, \exists r > 0, n > N$ such that $x_n \notin S_r(x)$

31. Let $\{x_n : n \in \mathbb{Z}^+\}$ be the sequence in \mathbb{R} defined by $x_n = \frac{1}{n}$. Does this sequence converge? To what? Prove it.

Solution:

It converges to 0. We take for granted that natural numbers are unbounded above, i.e. $\forall r \in \mathbb{R} \exists n \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $n > r$. Then $\forall r > 0, \exists N \in \mathbb{N} > \frac{1}{r}$, so $r > x_n \forall n \in \mathbb{N} > N$, which is equivalent to $x_n \in S_r(0) \forall n \in \mathbb{N} > N$.

32. Let $\{x_n : n \in \mathbb{Z}^+\}$ be the sequence in \mathbb{R} defined by $x_n = (-1)^n(\frac{1}{n})$. Does this sequence converge? To what? Prove it.

Solution: It converges to 0. Note that $|x_n| \in S_r(0) \Rightarrow x_n \in S_r(0)$. Since $|x_n|$ converges by the previous question, so does x_n .

33. Let $\{x_n : n \in \mathbb{Z}^+\}$ be the sequence in \mathbb{R} defined by $x_n = (-1)^n$. Does this sequence converge? To what? Prove it.

Solution:

It does not converge to $a \forall a \in \mathbb{R}$.

If $a > 1$, let $r = a - 1$, then x_n never enters $S_r(a)$.

If $a < -1$, let $r = -1 - a$, then x_n never enters $S_r(a)$.

If $a = 1$ or $a = -1$, let $r = 1$, then x_n never enters $S_r(a)$.

Else, let $r = \min\{1 - a, a + 1\}$, then x_n never enters $S_r(a)$.

1.13 Theorem 5.4

34. A sequence in a metric space can converge to at most one point.

Solution:

Proof by contradiction. Let it converge to two distinct points a and b . Let $r = \frac{d(a,b)}{2}$, so $S_r(a)$ and $S_r(b)$ are disjoint by the triangle inequality.

Since the sequence converges to both points, $\exists \{N_a, N_b\} \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ such that

$$n \in \mathbb{N} > N_a \Rightarrow x_n \in S_r(a)$$

and similarly for b .

Let $N = \max\{N_a, N_b\}$. Then $x_{N+1} \in S_r(a)$ and $x_{N+1} \in S_r(b)$ which is a contradiction.

1.14 Theorem 5.5

35. A subset S of a metric space X is closed if and only if whenever a sequence of point of S converges to a point $x \in X$, then $x \in S$.

Solution:

\Rightarrow :

Assume the opposite. Then $x \in X - S$ but $S_r(x)$ intersects with $S \forall r > 0$. Then $X - S$ is not open (it has no open subset containing x), so S is not closed, which is a contradiction.

\Leftarrow :

Assume the opposite. Then $X - S$ is not open, so $\exists x \in X - S$ such that $S_r(x)$ intersects with $S \forall r > 0$. Let $y_n \in S_{\frac{1}{n}}(x) \cap S$. Then y is a sequence in S that tends to a point x outside of S . This is a contradiction.