Janelee Li

Assistant Editor

Cosmetics

Dear Janelee Li,

I would like to thank you and the reviewers for helping us improve our manuscript entitled “Facial Skin Lifting and Brightening following Sleep on Copper Oxide Containing Pillowcases”.

We have carefully revised the manuscript according to the Reviewers comments. The revisions in the manuscript are highlighted in red. Below are the responses, point by point, to the Reviewer comments. For ease, the Reviewer comments are in black and our responses are in blue.

We hope very much that you will now find the manuscript appropriate for publication in Cosmetics.

Sincerely,

Dr. Gadi Borkow and Dr. Adriana del Carmen Elías

Reviewer 2:

Overall, this is a well written, albeit limited, study on a novel topic.

For the reader not familiar with the concepts of measuring skin tightening and brightening, a brief review of the F Ray 3D measurement and the Image pro plus systems would be helpful. How do statistically significant changes correlate with clinically evident findings? In the original manuscript, the skin tightening measurement were described and the manuscript describing very detailed the methodology was given (now, in the revised manuscript, lines 106 to 113). In the revised manuscript another sentence (lines 113-116) was added to help the explain how the skin movement over time (sagging) is measured. In addition, a sentence further explaining the measurement of skin brightness was added to the revised manuscript (lines 122-124).

The authors should address how sleeping habits may impact the results, ie individuals often predominantly sleep on one side of their face. How was this accounted for in the analysis of the results? The following new sentences were added to the Discussion: “Sleeping habits may influence how the pillowcase may affect the facial skin, as some individuals sleep more on one side than the other. During sleep individuals do change positions and sides, but overall some skin areas may be more in contact with the pillowcase than other parts and thus be affected more than the areas not in contact with the pillowcase. This study did not analyze the effect of the sleeping habits.”. (lines 212-216).

A few additional questions for the authors to consider addressing: How was the length of the study chosen? The length of the study was chosen based on the previous referenced studies with the pillowcases that found reduction of facial wrinkles and fine lines already after 2 and 4 weeks of using the pillowcases. This is now mentioned in lines 99-101 of the revised manuscript. How would the duration of exposure be expected to impact the effects? What is the natural course of the skin changes following cessation of exposure? The following sentences were added to the Discussion section in reference to the above mentioned issues: “In addition, this study did not study skin changes following cessation of exposure to the pillowcase. Finally, this study only examined the effects on the skin for a period of one month. What would be the effect for longer periods, the effect of sleeping habits and what happens after cessation of use, are questions that should be examined in subsequent studies.”. (lines 216-219)