Estimation of parameter importance and interaction with Random Forests

Leslie Pérez Cáceres

In this document we are testing how to use Random Forest to assess importance and interactions of parameters based on the data gathered by irace.

For the analysis below we use as example ACOTSP (long):

- 20 secs cut off time (long)
- 11 parameters
- 400 instances sizes (1000,1500,2000,2500,3000,3500,4000,4500)
- 5000 experiments configuration budget

1. Importance by iterations

Iteration 1:

| | variable | mean min depth | no of nodes | mse increase | node_purity_increase | no of trees | times a root | p_value |
|----|-------------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------|--------------|-----------|
| | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | alpha | 1.816667 | 7950 | 579.02164 | 239019.38 | 300 | 34 | 0.0000000 |
| 9 | localsearch | 1.840000 | 2384 | 816.10954 | 338744.58 | 300 | 67 | 1.0000000 |
| 8 | instance | 2.180000 | 15346 | 589.31632 | 327768.74 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 10 | nnls | 2.343333 | 5537 | 641.34674 | 287970.16 | 300 | 79 | 0.3369522 |
| 1 | algorithm | 2.470000 | 3541 | 358.85479 | 129132.45 | 300 | 17 | 1.0000000 |
| 4 | beta | 2.700000 | 7808 | 179.44065 | 79559.21 | 300 | 3 | 0.0000000 |
| 7 | elitistants | 2.883333 | 2019 | 195.15145 | 79343.36 | 300 | 14 | 1.0000000 |
| 13 | rho | 2.936667 | 7198 | 138.56366 | 59061.65 | 300 | 4 | 0.0000000 |
| 5 | dlb | 3.307467 | 1928 | 575.36654 | 242043.01 | 299 | 72 | 1.0000000 |
| 3 | ants | 3.316667 | 7102 | 116.72382 | 51027.76 | 300 | 1 | 0.0000000 |
| 11 | q0 | 3.453333 | 2730 | 105.42029 | 44777.97 | 300 | 9 | 1.0000000 |
| 6 | dummy | 3.513333 | 5974 | 65.49320 | 30917.12 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 12 | rasrank | 5.040000 | 2069 | 19.67783 | 12495.60 | 300 | 0 | 1.0000000 |

Iteration 2:

| | | . 1 .1 | C 1 | | 1 | c . | | , |
|----|-------------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------|--------------|---------|
| | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | mse_increase | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | times_a_root | p_value |
| 9 | localsearch | 1.910000 | 1835 | 459.98740 | 159663.643 | 300 | 73 | 1 |
| 8 | instance | 2.000000 | 14049 | 356.85610 | 191489.815 | 300 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | algorithm | 2.416667 | 2341 | 282.05808 | 89777.785 | 300 | 32 | 1 |
| 2 | alpha | 2.416667 | 6804 | 260.66572 | 100297.535 | 300 | 4 | 0 |
| 10 | nnls | 2.586667 | 5222 | 295.99198 | 124105.230 | 300 | 76 | 0 |
| 3 | ants | 2.693333 | 6663 | 188.19179 | 74521.411 | 300 | 3 | 0 |
| 7 | elitistants | 2.704867 | 1593 | 167.16038 | 62511.916 | 299 | 24 | 1 |
| 13 | rho | 3.066667 | 6253 | 100.84219 | 38970.719 | 300 | 1 | 0 |
| 4 | beta | 3.096667 | 6445 | 59.84469 | 29930.291 | 300 | 0 | 0 |
| 5 | dlb | 3.273333 | 1517 | 260.68287 | 97505.161 | 300 | 65 | 1 |
| 11 | q0 | 3.370000 | 2830 | 170.71023 | 57873.144 | 300 | 18 | 1 |
| 6 | dummy | 3.380000 | 5209 | 57.14056 | 22998.029 | 300 | 4 | 0 |
| 12 | rasrank | 5.250000 | 1743 | 15.92067 | 7439.316 | 300 | 0 | 1 |

Iteration 3:

| | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | mse_increase | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | times_a_root | p_value |
|----|-------------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------|--------------|-----------|
| 9 | localsearch | 1.406667 | 1313 | 545.19564 | 266017.234 | 300 | 94 | 1.0000000 |
| 5 | dlb | 1.730000 | 979 | 397.59013 | 182313.549 | 300 | 83 | 1.0000000 |
| 10 | nnls | 2.090000 | 6394 | 338.76438 | 150586.009 | 300 | 40 | 0.0000000 |
| 11 | q0 | 2.156667 | 5067 | 333.25243 | 141953.707 | 300 | 31 | 0.9999786 |
| 8 | instance | 2.286667 | 17794 | 206.33843 | 190000.490 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 1 | algorithm | 2.636667 | 1987 | 202.36751 | 73036.479 | 300 | 19 | 1.0000000 |
| 4 | beta | 2.863333 | 7253 | 153.09677 | 78372.417 | 300 | 14 | 0.0000000 |
| 2 | alpha | 2.920000 | 7358 | 112.46777 | 61591.520 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 13 | rho | 3.120000 | 6864 | 101.79529 | 52342.158 | 300 | 5 | 0.0000000 |
| 3 | ants | 3.213333 | 6813 | 107.20464 | 56919.624 | 300 | 1 | 0.0000000 |
| 6 | dummy | 3.390000 | 5886 | 97.99187 | 39768.468 | 300 | 2 | 0.0000000 |
| 7 | elitistants | 4.014267 | 654 | 32.17029 | 18504.235 | 276 | 11 | 1.0000000 |
| 12 | rasrank | 4.910889 | 1212 | 10.44417 | 8726.568 | 295 | 0 | 1.0000000 |

Iteration 4:

| | . 11 | . 1 .1 | C 1 | | 1 | C . | | |
|----|-------------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-----------------|--------------|-----------|
| | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | mse_increase | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | times_a_root | p_value |
| 9 | localsearch | 1.806667 | 1101 | 291.527826 | 159854.089 | 300 | 60 | 1.0000000 |
| 8 | instance | 2.063333 | 19602 | 133.936001 | 223541.550 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 11 | q0 | 2.213333 | 6092 | 344.708999 | 182533.643 | 300 | 83 | 0.0000000 |
| 10 | nnls | 2.436667 | 6975 | 265.924272 | 140855.976 | 300 | 14 | 0.0000000 |
| 1 | algorithm | 2.460000 | 912 | 228.180314 | 112580.511 | 292 | 76 | 1.0000000 |
| 3 | ants | 2.566667 | 7152 | 348.674748 | 146519.656 | 300 | 13 | 0.0000000 |
| 5 | dlb | 2.600000 | 1015 | 211.497903 | 112547.080 | 300 | 31 | 1.0000000 |
| 2 | alpha | 2.990000 | 7490 | 279.046088 | 137727.225 | 300 | 5 | 0.0000000 |
| 4 | beta | 3.020000 | 7491 | 143.553084 | 84901.974 | 300 | 1 | 0.0000000 |
| 13 | rho | 3.293333 | 6958 | 106.601592 | 59394.786 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 6 | dummy | 3.446667 | 5621 | 98.268972 | 42588.431 | 300 | 3 | 0.0844534 |
| 7 | elitistants | 3.470000 | 794 | 46.733525 | 23985.936 | 292 | 14 | 1.0000000 |
| 12 | rasrank | 5.132500 | 585 | 7.443385 | 6630.966 | 265 | 0 | 1.0000000 |

Iteration 5:

| | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | $mse_increase$ | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | times_a_root | p_value |
|----|-------------|----------------|-------------|-----------------|----------------------|-----------------|--------------|-----------|
| 2 | alpha | 1.306667 | 9689 | 796.473686 | 482560.650 | 300 | 86 | 0.0000000 |
| 3 | ants | 1.433333 | 8780 | 808.820337 | 391578.356 | 300 | 82 | 0.0000000 |
| 10 | nnls | 2.176667 | 8313 | 531.103247 | 310765.248 | 300 | 10 | 0.0000000 |
| 11 | q0 | 2.236667 | 8784 | 381.888064 | 254350.367 | 300 | 54 | 0.0000000 |
| 8 | instance | 2.473333 | 27473 | 67.631619 | 396629.223 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 12 | rho | 2.773333 | 8657 | 328.399675 | 208774.537 | 300 | 21 | 0.0000000 |
| 4 | beta | 2.826667 | 9298 | 319.784186 | 224320.125 | 300 | 0 | 0.0000000 |
| 6 | dummy | 3.166667 | 7320 | 256.041124 | 153672.199 | 300 | 0 | 0.9888505 |
| 1 | algorithm | 4.135333 | 501 | 47.200602 | 28164.332 | 260 | 31 | 1.0000000 |
| 9 | localsearch | 4.304033 | 520 | 39.004017 | 36213.649 | 281 | 8 | 1.0000000 |
| 5 | dlb | 4.776000 | 575 | 37.758168 | 36473.687 | 280 | 8 | 1.0000000 |
| 7 | elitistants | 6.264067 | 192 | 1.321074 | 1653.337 | 142 | 0 | 1.0000000 |

Iteration 6:

| - | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | mse_increase | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | times_a_root | p_value |
|---|----------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------|--------------|---------|
| 7 | q0 | 1.810000 | 4840 | 94.24916 | 37084.24 | 300 | 58 | 1 |
| 6 | nnls | 1.860000 | 4394 | 99.25089 | 31967.32 | 300 | 73 | 1 |
| 4 | dummy | 1.876667 | 4064 | 82.21553 | 27554.09 | 300 | 68 | 1 |
| 3 | beta | 2.260000 | 5294 | 86.80981 | 31574.13 | 300 | 37 | 1 |
| 2 | ants | 2.310000 | 4552 | 52.64727 | 23579.16 | 300 | 29 | 1 |
| 1 | alpha | 2.336667 | 4989 | 67.25469 | 27152.13 | 300 | 20 | 1 |
| 5 | instance | 2.403333 | 13024 | -12.13454 | 69154.13 | 300 | 4 | 0 |
| 8 | rho | 2.570000 | 4894 | 55.58617 | 24049.89 | 300 | 11 | 1 |

Iteration 7:

| | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | mse_increase | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | times_a_root | p_value |
|---|----------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------|--------------|---------|
| 4 | dummy | 2.025922 | 1030 | 10.213676 | 1545.2265 | 293 | 70 | 1 |
| 6 | nnls | 2.179256 | 1005 | 5.297680 | 843.8250 | 293 | 60 | 1 |
| 5 | instance | 2.313333 | 3340 | -1.277253 | 1044.8231 | 300 | 0 | 0 |
| 2 | ants | 2.564544 | 970 | 4.671665 | 662.2813 | 289 | 46 | 1 |
| 8 | rho | 2.661900 | 1036 | 3.901766 | 537.1403 | 291 | 46 | 1 |
| 7 | q0 | 2.678511 | 1027 | 3.678020 | 551.6137 | 286 | 40 | 1 |
| 1 | alpha | 2.899200 | 951 | 2.402613 | 394.9327 | 288 | 16 | 1 |
| 3 | beta | 2.909944 | 1071 | 2.855522 | 448.4815 | 295 | 22 | 1 |

Iteration 8:

| | variable | mean_min_depth | no_of_nodes | mse_increase | node_purity_increase | no_of_trees | $times_a_root$ | p_value |
|---|----------|----------------|-------------|--------------|----------------------|-------------|------------------|-----------|
| 5 | instance | 1.431507 | 1696 | -0.1556767 | 175.848108 | 292 | 73 | 0.0000000 |
| 7 | q0 | 2.436415 | 509 | 0.1650302 | 14.128630 | 245 | 45 | 0.9999679 |
| 4 | dummy | 2.565069 | 476 | 0.1064153 | 11.993353 | 232 | 42 | 1.0000000 |
| 8 | rho | 2.609817 | 479 | 0.0507708 | 12.077270 | 234 | 39 | 1.0000000 |
| 2 | ants | 2.654338 | 423 | 0.0273686 | 11.129151 | 234 | 39 | 1.0000000 |
| 1 | alpha | 2.742580 | 474 | 0.0762815 | 10.997649 | 227 | 20 | 1.0000000 |
| 3 | beta | 2.807877 | 439 | 0.0831447 | 9.994890 | 229 | 33 | 1.0000000 |
| 6 | nnls | 3.518721 | 288 | 0.0771947 | 5.615506 | 186 | 9 | 1.0000000 |

The 5 most important parameters per iteration are :

```
## [[1]]
## [1] "alpha" "localsearch" "instance"
                                    "algorithm"
## [[2]]
"alpha"
## [[3]]
## [1] "localsearch" "dlb"
                         "instance"
##
## [[4]]
"ants"
## [[5]]
## [1] "alpha" "ants"
                     "nnls"
                              "instance"
##
## [[6]]
## [1] "q0" "nnls" "beta" "ants"
## [[7]]
## [1] "instance" "nnls"
                     "ants"
                              "rho"
##
## [[8]]
## [1] "instance" "q0"
                      "rho"
                              "ants"
```

Parameter relevant interactions:

Iteration 1:

| variable | root_variable | mean_min_depth | occurrences | interaction | uncond_mean_min_depth |
|----------|---------------|----------------|-------------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| alpha | localsearch | 1.039007 | 531 | localsearch:alpha | 1.573333 |

Iteration 2:

| variable | root_variable | mean_min_depth | occurrences | interaction | uncond_mean_min_depth |
|----------|---------------|----------------|-------------|-----------------|-----------------------|
| alpha | algorithm | 1.136364 | 527 | algorithm:alpha | 1.59 |
| | | | | | |

Iteration 3:

| . 11 | | . 1 .1 | | • | |
|----------|-----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------------------|
| verieble | l root variable | l mean min depth | occurrences | interaction | l uncond mean min depth |
| variable | 1000 variable | mean mm acpm | Occurrences | mocracuon | uncond mean min depun |
| | | | | | |

Iteration 4:

| variable root_variable mean_ | min_depth occurr | rences interaction | uncond_mean_min_depth |
|------------------------------|------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|
|------------------------------|------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|

Iteration 5:

| variable | root_variable | mean_min_depth | occurrences | interaction | uncond_mean_min_depth |
|----------|---------------|----------------|-------------|-------------|-----------------------|
| ants | nnls | 0.975945 | 556 | nnls:ants | 1.620000 |
| alpha | nnls | 1.253700 | 559 | nnls:alpha | 1.493333 |

Iteration 6:

Iteration 7:

| variable root variable | mean min depth | occurrences interaction | uncond mean min depth |
|------------------------|----------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| | | | |

Iteration 8:

| variable | root | variable | mean | min | depth | occurrences | interaction | uncond | mean | min | depth |
|----------|------|----------|------|-----|-------|-------------|-------------|--------|------|-----|-------|