

[ACCV 2009](#)**The Ninth Asian Conference on Computer Vision**

2009-9-23~2009-9-27

Xi'an

P. R. China

Consolidation Report For Paper**Paper ID** 432**Title** Lightweight 3D Reconstruction of Urban Buildings From Range Data**Masked Area Chair ID:** Area Chair 1**Consolidation Report:**

Question	
Decision	Reject
Consolidation Report	<p>The paper received mixed reviews. On the positive side, I agree with the first and third reviewers that the paper presents a simple method and shows examples where it works. However, the main problem of the paper, which was pointed out by the second reviewer, is that the method is too ad hoc and no comparison to more general methods is provided. See, for instance, M. Kazhdan, M. Bolitho, and H. Hoppe. Poisson surface reconstruction. In Symposium on Geometry Processing, pp. 61–70, 2006. The paper has also elements of data coding based on segmentation using non-parametric models. This is an interesting idea and it would be useful to relate it to previous work on segmenting and explaining 3D data by parametric models as developed in 90's by A. Leonardis et al, or later also in Fusion of Feature- and Area-Based Information for Urban Buildings Modeling from Aerial Imagery L. Zebedin, J. Bauer, K. Karner, and H. Bischof LNCS 5305, p. 873 ff. ECCV 2008. After extended discussion, the area chairs had to conclude that the paper is yet premature for publication.</p>