

MA5251 Homework 2

Li Xuanguang, A0154735B

April 5, 2023

Q1. From lecture notes, we have the three-term recurrence relation

$$(n+1)L_{n+1}(x) = (2n+1)xL_n(x) - nL_{n-1}(x)$$

Differentiating once and by chain rule, we get

$$(n+1)L_{n+1}^{(1)}(x) = (2n+1)L_n(x) + (2n+1)xL_n^{(1)}(x) - nL_{n-1}^{(1)}(x)$$

Differentiating again, we get

$$\begin{aligned}(n+1)L_{n+1}^{(2)}(x) &= (2n+1)L_n^{(1)}(x) + (2n+1)L_n^{(1)}(x) + (2n+1)xL_n^{(2)}(x) - nL_{n-1}^{(2)}(x) \\ &= 2(2n+1)L_n^{(1)}(x) + (2n+1)xL_n^{(2)}(x) - nL_{n-1}^{(2)}(x)\end{aligned}$$

Hence, by the m -th differentiation, we get

$$(n+1)L_{n+1}^{(m)}(x) = m(2n+1)L_n^{(m-1)}(x) + (2n+1)xL_n^{(m)}(x) - nL_{n-1}^{(m)}(x)$$

From the second Proposition in Properties of Derivatives, Lecture 14 Slide 10, we can see that

$$L_{n+1}^{(1)}(x) - L_{n-1}^{(1)}(x) = (2n+1)L_n(x)$$

Differentiating $m-1$ times, this implies

$$L_{n+1}^{(m)}(x) - L_{n-1}^{(m)}(x) = (2n+1)L_n^{(m-1)}(x)$$

Substituting into the differentiated three-term recurrence relation, we get

$$(n+1)L_{n+1}^{(m)}(x) = m[L_{n+1}^{(m)}(x) - L_{n-1}^{(m)}(x)] + (2n+1)xL_n^{(m)}(x) - nL_{n-1}^{(m)}(x)$$

Thus we get the three-term recurrence relation

$$\begin{aligned}(n-m+1)L_{n+1}^{(m)}(x) &= (2n+1)xL_n^{(m)}(x) - (n+m)L_{n-1}^{(m)}(x) \\ L_{n+1}^{(m)}(x) &= \frac{2n+1}{n-m+1}xL_n^{(m)}(x) - \frac{n+m}{n-m+1}L_{n-1}^{(m)}(x)\end{aligned}$$

where $\alpha_n^{(m)} = \frac{2n+1}{n-m+1}$ and $\beta_n^{(m)} = \frac{n+m}{n-m+1}$

For the initial condition, if $n < m$, then $L_n^{(m)} = 0$.

The first term is where $n = m$, then $L_m^{(m)} = (2m)!a_m = \frac{(2m)!}{2^m m!}$.

The next term is where $n = m+1$, then $L_{m+1}^{(m)} = a_{m+1}[(2m+2)!x - (2m+1)!(m+1)] = \frac{(2m+1)!}{2^m m!}x - \frac{(2m+1)!}{2^{m+1} m!}$.

Q2. We prove both relations with induction.

From Lecture 14 Chebyshev Polynomials, we have the recurrence relation $T_{n+1}(x) = 2xT_n(x) - T_{n-1}(x)$. Let $\theta = \arccos(x)$. Then $T_n(x) = \cos(n\theta)$, and this implies $\cos((n+1)\theta) = 2\cos(\theta)\cos(n\theta) - \cos((n-1)\theta)$

Taking the derivative of $T_{n+1}(x)$ and $T_{n-1}(x)$,

$$\begin{aligned} T_{n+1}^{(1)}(x) &= -\theta^{(1)}(n+1)\sin((n+1)\theta) \\ T_{n-1}^{(1)}(x) &= -\theta^{(1)}(n-1)\sin((n-1)\theta) \end{aligned}$$

Hence we can prove the relation

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{n+1}T_{n+1}^{(1)}(x) - \frac{1}{n-1}T_{n-1}^{(1)}(x) &= -\theta^{(1)}[\sin((n+1)\theta) - \sin((n-1)\theta)] \\ &= -\theta^{(1)}[2\cos(n\theta)\sin(\theta)] \\ &= \frac{\sin \theta}{\sqrt{1 - (\cos \theta)^2}} 2\cos(n\theta) \\ &= 2T_n(x) \end{aligned}$$

From Lecture 14 Chebyshev Polynomials, we have the inner product

$$(T_n(x), T_m(x)) = \int_{-1}^1 T_m(x)T_n(x)\omega(x) dx = \frac{\pi}{2}c_n\delta_{mn}$$

where $c_n = 1 + \delta_{n0}$. Hence, we can derive the following results:

$$\begin{aligned} (T_n(x), T_0(x)) &= \frac{\pi}{2}(1 + \delta_{n0})\delta_{n0}, \quad n \geq 1 \\ (T_0(x), T_0(x)) &= \frac{\pi}{2}(1 + \delta_{00})\delta_{00}, \quad n \geq 1 \end{aligned}$$

For the first differential relation, we prove by induction.

$$T_2^{(1)} = 2 \times 2T_1 = 2 \cdot 2 \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^1 \frac{1}{c_k} T_k(x)$$

Assume $n = N \geq 2$. Then

$$T_N^{(1)}(x) = 2N \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{c_k} T_k(x)$$

For $n = N + 1$, we use the result from the relation proved earlier.

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{N+1}T_{N+1}^{(1)}(x) &= 2T_N(x) + \frac{1}{N-1}T_{N-1}^{(1)}(x) \\ &= 2T_N(x) + 2 \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N-1 \text{ odd}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{c_k} T_k(x) \\ &= 2T_N(x) + 2 \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N+1 \text{ odd}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{c_k} T_k(x) \quad , \quad k+N-1 \text{ odd} \Rightarrow k+N+1 \text{ odd} \\ &= 2 \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N+1 \text{ odd}}}^N \frac{1}{c_k} T_k(x) \end{aligned}$$

Hence by induction,

$$T_n^{(1)}(x) = 2n \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{1 + \delta_{k0}} T_k(x)$$

For the second differential relation, we prove by induction.

$$T_2^{(2)} = 4 = \frac{1}{2} \cdot 2 \cdot (4 - 0)T_0 = \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ even}}}^0 \frac{n}{c_k} (n^2 - k^2) T_k(x)$$

Assume $n = N \geq 2$. Then

$$T_N^{(2)}(x) = \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ even}}}^{N-2} \frac{n}{c_k} (n^2 - k^2) T_k(x)$$

For $n = N + 1$, we use the result from the relation proved earlier.

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{N+1} T_{N+1}^{(2)}(x) &= \left(2T_N(x) + \frac{1}{N-1} T_{N-1}^{(1)}(x) \right)^{(1)} \\ &= 2T_N^{(1)}(x) + \frac{1}{N-1} T_{N-1}^{(2)}(x) \\ &= 4N \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N \text{ odd}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{1 + \delta_{k0}} T_k(x) + \frac{1}{N-1} \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N-1 \text{ even}}}^{N-3} \frac{N-1}{c_k} ((N-1)^2 - k^2) T_k(x) \\ &= \frac{1}{c_{N-1}} T_{N-1}(x) \cdot 4N + \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N-3 \text{ even}}}^{N-3} \frac{1}{c_k} ((N-1)^2 - k^2 + 4N) T_k(x) \\ &= \frac{1}{c_{N-1}} T_{N-1}(x) \cdot [(N+1)^2 - (N-1)^2] + \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N+1 \text{ even}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{c_k} ((N+1)^2 - k^2) T_k(x) \\ &= \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+N+1 \text{ even}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{c_k} ((N+1)^2 - k^2) T_k(x) \end{aligned}$$

Hence by induction,

$$T_n^{(2)}(x) = \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ even}}}^{n-2} \frac{1}{1 + \delta_{k0}} n(n^2 - k^2) T_k(x)$$

Q3. (a) Define the Sturm-Liouville operator

$$\mathcal{L}f(x) = -\sqrt{1-x^2} \frac{d}{dx} [\sqrt{1-x^2} f'(x)]$$

According to Sturm-Liouville equation, we have

$$\mathcal{L}T_n(x) = n^2 T_n(x)$$

We also have

$$(\mathcal{L}f, g) = (f, \mathcal{L}g)$$

By completeness of basis $\{T_n(x)\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ in $L_\omega^2(-1, 1)$ space, we can expand any function $f \in L_\omega^2(-1, 1)$:

$$f(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \hat{f}_n T_n(x)$$

Note

$$\begin{aligned} \|f - \pi_N f\|_{0,\omega}^2 &= \left\| \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \hat{f}_n T_n(x) \right\|_{0,\omega}^2 \\ &= \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \frac{\pi}{2} |\hat{f}_n|^2 \quad (\text{as } \|T_n(x)\|_{0,\omega}^2 = \frac{\pi}{2}(1 + \delta_{k0})) \\ &= \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \frac{2}{\pi} \left| \int_{-1}^1 f(x) T_n(x) \omega(x) dx \right|^2 \\ &= \frac{2}{\pi} \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} |(f, T_n)_\omega|^2 \\ &= \frac{2}{\pi} \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \left| \frac{1}{n^2} (f, \mathcal{L}T_n)_\omega \right|^2 \\ &= \frac{2}{\pi} \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \left| -\frac{1}{n^2} (\mathcal{L}f, T_n)_\omega \right|^2 \\ &= \frac{2}{\pi} \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \left| \frac{1}{n^r} (\mathcal{L}^{r/2} f, T_n)_\omega \right|^2 \quad (\text{Assume } r \text{ is even}) \\ &\leq \frac{2}{\pi} \frac{1}{N^{2r}} \sum_{n=N+1}^{+\infty} \left| (\mathcal{L}^{r/2} f, T_n)_\omega \right|^2 \\ &\leq \frac{1}{N^{2r}} \left[\frac{1}{\pi} \left| (\mathcal{L}^{r/2} f, T_n)_\omega \right|^2 + \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{2}{\pi} \left| (\mathcal{L}^{r/2} f, T_n)_\omega \right|^2 \right] \\ &\leq \frac{1}{N^{2r}} \left\| \mathcal{L}^{r/2} f \right\|_{0,\omega}^2 \\ &\lesssim N^{-2r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2 \end{aligned}$$

Hence, $\|f - \pi_N f\|_{0,\omega} \lesssim N^{-r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}$.

Q3. (b) $\forall p \in P_N$, the projection on Chebyshev Polynomial is $p(x) = \sum_{n=0}^N \hat{p}_n T_n(x)$.

The derivative is then $p^{(1)}(x) = \sum_{n=0}^N \hat{p}_n^{(1)} T_n^{(1)}(x)$, where $\hat{p}_n^{(1)} = \frac{2}{\pi(1+\delta_{0n})} \int_{-1}^1 p^{(1)}(x) T_n(x) \omega(x) dx$.

The seminorm of $p(x)$ is defined as $|p|_1^2 = \sum_{n=0}^N \left| \hat{p}_n^{(1)} \right|^2 \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2$.

From the derivative $p^{(1)}(x)$ and differential relation of $T_n^{(1)}(x)$ from Q2, we can see that

$$\hat{p}_n^{(1)} = \frac{2}{\pi(1+\delta_{0n})} \int_{-1}^1 \left(\sum_{j=0}^N \hat{p}_j \right) \left(2j \sum_{\substack{i=0 \\ i+j \text{ odd}}}^{j-1} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{i0}} T_i(x) \right) T_n(x) \omega(x) dx$$

As $\{T_i(x)\}_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$ are orthogonal in $L_\omega^2(-1, 1)$, if $i = n$, then the integral will be nonzero, thus $j \geq n+1$ and $j+n$ is odd. Thus

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{p}_n^{(1)} &= \frac{2}{\pi(1+\delta_{0n})} \left(\sum_{\substack{j=n+1 \\ j+n \text{ odd}}}^N \hat{p}_j \cdot 2j \cdot \frac{1}{1+\delta_{n0}} \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \right) \\ &= \frac{4}{\pi(1+\delta_{0n})^2} \left(\sum_{\substack{j=n+1 \\ j+n \text{ odd}}}^N \hat{p}_j \cdot j \right) \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \end{aligned}$$

Thus we can see

$$\begin{aligned} |p|_1^2 &= \sum_{n=0}^N \left| \hat{p}_n^{(1)} \right|^2 \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\ &= \sum_{n=0}^N \left(\frac{4}{\pi(1+\delta_{0n})^2} \right)^2 \left(\sum_{\substack{j=n+1 \\ j+n \text{ odd}}}^N \hat{p}_j \cdot j \right)^2 \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^6 \quad \text{by earlier calculation} \\ &= \sum_{n=0}^N \left(\sum_{\substack{j=n+1 \\ j+n \text{ odd}}}^N \hat{p}_j \cdot j \right)^2 \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \quad (\text{as } \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 = \frac{\pi}{2}(1+\delta_{0n})) \\ &\leq \sum_{n=0}^N \left(\sum_{j=0}^N \hat{p}_j \cdot j \right)^2 \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\ &\leq \sum_{n=0}^N \left(\sum_{j=0}^N \hat{p}_j^2 \right) \left(\sum_{j=0}^N j \right) \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \quad \text{by Cauchy-Schwarz} \\ &\leq N^4 \sum_{n=0}^N \left(\sum_{j=0}^N \hat{p}_j^2 \right) \cdot \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \quad \text{by Cauchy-Schwarz} \\ &\lesssim N^4 \|p\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \end{aligned}$$

Hence, $|p|_1 \lesssim N^2 \|p\|_{L_\omega^2}$.

Note that for $n \in \mathbb{N}$,

$$\begin{aligned} |p|_n &= \left| p^{(1)} \right|_n - 1 = \left| p^{(2)} \right|_n - 2 = \dots = \left| p^{(n-1)} \right|_1 \lesssim N^2 \|p^{(n-1)}\|_{L_\omega^2} \\ \|p^{(n-1)}\|_{L_\omega^2} &= \left| p^{(n-2)} \right|_1 \lesssim N^2 \|p^{(n-2)}\|_{L_\omega^2} \end{aligned}$$

Thus by these relations, we would have the error estimate

$$\|p\|_{r,\omega} \lesssim N^{2r} \|p\|_{L_\omega^2} = N^{2r} \|p\|_{0,\omega\omega} \quad \forall p \in P_N$$

Q3. (c) From Q2, we have that $T_n^{(1)}(x) = 2n \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{N-1} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} T_k(x)$.

From part (a), we also have the expansion of f as $f(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \hat{f}_n T_n(x)$. Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \partial_x f &= \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \hat{f}_n T_n^{(1)}(x) \\ &= \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \hat{f}_n \cdot 2n \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{n-1} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} T_k(x) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right) T_k(x) \end{aligned}$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} \pi_N(\partial_x f) &= \sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right) T_k(x) \\ \partial_x(\pi_N f) &= \sum_{n=1}^N \hat{f}_n T_n^{(1)}(x) \\ &= \sum_{n=1}^N \hat{f}_n \cdot 2n \sum_{\substack{k=0 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{n-1} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} T_k(x) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^N 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right) T_k(x) \end{aligned}$$

Thus we can see that

$$\begin{aligned} \pi_N(\partial_x f) - \partial_x(\pi_N f) &= \sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right) T_k(x) - \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^N 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right) T_k(x) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=N+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right) T_k(x) \end{aligned}$$

Note that

$$\begin{cases} \sum_{\substack{n=N+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n = \sum_{\substack{n=N+1 \\ N+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n = \hat{f}_N^{(1)} & \text{if } N+n \text{ is even} \\ \sum_{\substack{n=N+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n = \sum_{\substack{n=N+2 \\ N+1+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n = \hat{f}_{N+1}^{(1)} & \text{if } N+n \text{ is odd} \end{cases}$$

Thus,

$$\begin{aligned}
\|\pi_N(\partial_x f) - \partial_x(\pi_N f)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 &= \sum_{k=0}^N \left(\frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right)^2 \cdot \frac{\pi}{2} (1+\delta_{k0}) \\
&= \frac{\pi}{2} \sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\sum_{\substack{n=k+1 \\ k+n \text{ odd}}}^{+\infty} 2n \cdot \hat{f}_n \right)^2 \\
&= \begin{cases} \frac{\pi}{2} \sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\hat{f}_N^{(1)} \right)^2 & \text{if } k+n \text{ is even} \\ \frac{\pi}{2} \sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \left(\hat{f}_{N+1}^{(1)} \right)^2 & \text{if } k+n \text{ is odd} \end{cases}
\end{aligned}$$

To estimate the sum, note that

$$\begin{aligned}
\left| \hat{f}_N^{(1)} \right|^2 &= \left[\left(\frac{\pi}{2} (1+\delta_{N0}) \right)^{-1} \int_{-1}^1 \partial_x f \cdot T_N(x) \, dx \right]^2 \\
&= \frac{4}{\pi^2} \|(\partial_x f, T_N)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\
&= \frac{4}{\pi^2} \left\| -\frac{1}{N^2} (\partial_x f, \mathcal{L}T_N) \right\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \quad (\text{By Sturm-Liouville Operator}) \\
&\lesssim N^{-4} \|(\mathcal{L}(\partial_x f), T_n)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\
&\lesssim N^{-4(r-1)/2} \left\| (\mathcal{L}^{(r-1)/2}(\partial_x f), T_n) \right\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\
&\lesssim N^{-4(r-1)/2} \left\| \mathcal{L}^{(r-1)/2}(\partial_x f) \right\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \|T_n\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \quad (\text{By Cauchy-Schwarz Inequality}) \\
&\lesssim N^{-4(r-1)/2} \left\| \mathcal{L}^{(r-1)/2}(\partial_x f) \right\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \left(\frac{\pi}{2} \right)^2 \\
&\lesssim N^{-2r+2} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2
\end{aligned}$$

Similarly,

$$\left| \hat{f}_{N+1}^{(1)} \right|^2 \lesssim N^{-2r+2} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2$$

Thus,

$$\begin{aligned}
\|\pi_N(\partial_x f) - \partial_x(\pi_N f)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 &\lesssim \frac{\pi}{2} \left(\sum_{k=0}^N \frac{1}{1+\delta_{k0}} \right) N^{-2r+2} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2 \\
&\lesssim N^{3-2r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\|\pi_N(\partial_x f) - \partial_x(\pi_N f)\|_{L_\omega^2} \lesssim N^{3/2-r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}$$

Q3. (d) Note that

$$\begin{aligned}
\|f - \pi_N f\|_{1,\omega}^2 &= \|f - \pi_N f\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 + |f - \pi_N f|_1^2 \\
&= \|f - \pi_N f\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 + \|\partial_x f - \partial_x(\pi_N f)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\
&\leq \|f - \pi_N f\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 + \|\partial_x f - \pi_N(\partial_x f)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 + \|\pi_N(\partial_x f) - \partial_x(\pi_N f)\|_{L_\omega^2}^2 \\
&\lesssim N^{-2r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2 + N^{-2(r-1)} \|\partial_x f\|_{(r-1),\omega}^2 + N^{3-2r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2 \\
&\lesssim N^{3-2r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}^2
\end{aligned}$$

Hence,

$$\|f - \pi_N f\|_{1,\omega} \lesssim N^{3/2-r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}$$

Q4. Note that

$$\begin{aligned}
p^*(-1) &= \int_{-1}^{-1} \pi_N u' - \frac{1}{2} p(1) \, dy = 0 \\
p^*(1) &= \int_1^{-1} \pi_N u' - \frac{1}{2} p(1) \, dy \\
&= \int_{-1}^1 \pi_N u' \, dy = 0
\end{aligned}$$

Hence, $p^*(-1) = p^*(1) = 0$.
Note that

$$\begin{aligned}
(u' - p^*)' &= u' - \pi_N u' - \frac{1}{2} p(1) \\
&= u' - \pi_N u' - \frac{1}{2} \int_{-1}^1 \pi_N u' - u' \, dy
\end{aligned}$$

As $u(-1) = u(1) = 0$, then $\int_{-1}^1 u' \, dy = 0$. Thus,

$$\begin{aligned}
|u - p^*|_{1,\omega} &\lesssim \|u' - \pi_N u'\|_{0,\omega} \\
&\lesssim N^{-r} \|u'\|_{r,\omega}
\end{aligned}$$

From Q3(a) result, where $\|f - \pi_N f\|_{0,\omega} \lesssim N^{-r} \|f\|_{r,\omega}$, r is even, we can then show that

$$|u - p^*|_{1,\omega} \lesssim N^{1-r} \|u\|_{r,\omega}$$

where r is odd.