

**Subject:** RE: Meta-queries!  
**From:** Kelley Slimon <kfslimon@alumni.ubc.ca>  
**Date:** 10/21/19, 2:38 PM  
**To:** "Wolkovich, Elizabeth" <e.wolkovich@ubc.ca>

Hi Lizzy,

That paper seems to have slipped under the radar. It is one of those multi-species studies done like a single species study, so I entered it in data\_overview and just a single quick line about it in data\_detailed like we were doing with others like that. It shouldn't add anything new to our conclusions. One weird thing about it is that it is that they don't link tracking to temperature or any other environmental variable - just year. If that makes it no-good I can remove what I entered. I hope everything is going well!

Thank you,  
Kelley Slimon

---

From: Wolkovich, Elizabeth  
Sent: Saturday, October 19, 2019 11:53 PM  
To: Kelley Slimon  
Subject: Re: Meta-queries!

Dear Kelley,

Thanks! I think we're close. But I noticed we only have 29 files entered in phentrack and 30 entered as "Y" in accept\_reject for done. The missing one is first-author Szilvia. Can you look into this ASAP and let me know what is up?

I don't think I need another Bibtex file containing all 30.

Thanks for all your work on this!

All the best,  
Lizzie

On 10/17/19 8:24 PM, Kelley Slimon wrote:

Hi Lizzy,

Here is a summary of the solutions to your questions.

1. The paper without a rejected reason was rejected because the study is 1 species only (the study is centered on mule deer phenology (1 species) and includes some plant phenology stuff over multiple species to talk about how the deer advance with food sources but there is no trait data associated with the plants, only the deer)
2. Jing2016, and Sherwood2017 were put as 'N' in the done column of accept/reject but actually entered. This solves this and the citation problems (there should be 30 in total with these additions).
3. Brooks2016 missing info was added. Trackingtrait relationships for early/late species were opposite for spring and summer temperatures.
4. Zu2009 is actually Xu2009.
5. Vegvari2014 and Vegvari2015 are the same paper, all changed to Vegvari2015.
6. Jing2016 is spelled correctly, but the citation is missing from the list of done citations I gave to you.

I have updated everything in our shared folder, and also added a new spreadsheet for the next meta analysis in that folder. For the missing citations would you like me to make another BibTex file containing all 30?

Thank you and have a great trip!

-Kelley Slimon

---

From: Wolkovich, Elizabeth  
Sent: Sunday, October 13, 2019 10:33 PM  
To: Kelley Slimon  
Subject: Meta-queries!

Hi Kelley,

Before I forget -- I will plan to look for you in the lab around 4pm  
Thursday! Now, onto meta-questions ...

Do we have a reason for why this paper was not included:

Monteith, KL; Bleich, VC; Stephenson, TR; Pierce, BM; Conner, MM;  
Klaver, RW; Bowyer, RT  
143 Timing of seasonal migration in mule deer: effects of climate, plant  
phenology, and life-history characteristics

Can you also check the 'Done' column? It has only 28 Y values, but it  
looks like 29 or maybe 30 papers were entered. Can you also triple-check  
that a reason was given for all studies not included?

Should Zu2009 in data\_detailed be Xu2009?

I think we have some missing citations, you have 28 citations in USED,  
but 29 citations in data\_overview and 30 citations listed in the  
data\_detailed (both of phentrack\_meta). I think Sherwood2017 and one I  
think Vegvari2014 and Vegvari2015 are actually the same paper, can you  
confirm this?

For Brooks2016, could you describe the relationship between the trait  
and tracking?

Can you check there is a reference for Jing2016 (in data\_detailed)? I  
could not find it but maybe the spelling is wrong in the xls file?

I think that is it! Next up, a draft of the paper and then we post the  
data online.

All the best,

Lizzie

--

Elizabeth M Wolkovich  
Forest and Conservation Sciences  
University of British Columbia  
3041 - 2424 Main Mall  
Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z4  
Office: 604-827-5246  
[www.temporalecology.org](http://www.temporalecology.org)

--

Elizabeth M Wolkovich  
Forest and Conservation Sciences  
University of British Columbia  
3041 - 2424 Main Mall  
Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z4  
Office: 604-827-5246  
[www.temporalecology.org](http://www.temporalecology.org)